

MUSIC EDUCATION FOR SEMINARIANS IN TORONTO'S
CHRISTIAN THEOLOGICAL COLLEGES AND SEMINARIES

SEBASTIAN MORENO

A MAJOR RESEARCH PAPER TO
THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES
IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE OF
MASTER OF ARTS

GRADUATE PROGRAM IN MUSIC
YORK UNIVERSITY
TORONTO, ONTARIO

December 2020

© Sebastian Moreno, 2020

Abstract

Despite music's importance during Christian worship and the responsibility of ordained ministers to organize and implement worship, limited research has been conducted on music education in Canadian seminaries. This study examines music education at nine Catholic and Protestant theological colleges and seminaries in Toronto. In-classroom education and education as part of the formation process is analysed to determine: 1) the structure of seminarian music education curricula, 2) the qualifications of seminary music educators, 3) the quantity of music education as it relates to key skills relevant to ordained ministry, and 4) the perceived effectiveness of seminarians' education in those key skills. Interviews, using a mixed method set of questions, were conducted with informants from each institution. Analysis indicates that most seminaries provide an insufficient quantity and quality of music education. Differences between ecclesiastical traditions revealed a greater emphasis on performance skills at Catholic seminaries and a greater emphasis on the understanding of congregational song at Protestant seminaries. Quantity of education was also determined to be a significant indicator of educational quality. These results suggest that most seminaries should provide a greater quantity of music education during the formation process that focuses on the skills most relevant to its ecclesiastical tradition.

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	ii
Table of Contents.....	iii
List of Tables	v
Introduction	1
Research Goals.....	3
Literature Review	4
Introduction	4
Historical Overview of Music in Christian Worship	4
Early Christianity (0 – 5 th Century).....	4
Medieval Christianity (5 th – 15 th Century).....	7
Protestant Reform and Early European Colonialism (16 th –18 th Century)	9
Religious Formation in Canada (19 th – 21 st Century)	13
Seminary Education Review.....	19
Methodology.....	23
Informants.....	23
Data Collection.....	24
Results.....	26
Data Analysis.....	26
Personal Data and Institutional Background	27
Formal and Informal Music Education at the Seminary	33
Music Beyond the Seminary	45
Discussions	51
Personal Data and Institutional Background	51
Formal and Informal Music Education at the Seminary	54
Music Beyond the Seminary	63
Conclusion.....	64
Benefits and Future Research	65
Appendices.....	69
Appendix A: <i>Formula missae</i> and <i>Deutsche Messe</i>	69
Appendix B: Interview Questions for Educators and Staff at Seminaries in Relation to Musical Training	70

Appendix C: Interview Questions for Students at Seminaries in Relation to Musical Training	74
Appendix D: Interview Questions for Master of Sacred Music Students in Relation to Musical Training at Seminaries	78
Appendix E: St. Augustine's Music Education Curriculum	82
Appendix F: Data Collection from Section 2, Questions 4 and 5	83
Appendix G: Descriptive Statistics for Question 4	84
Appendix H: Correlations for Question 4	85
Appendix I: Descriptive Statistics for Question 5	86
Appendix J: Correlations for Question 5	87
Appendix K: Correlations between Questions 4 and 5	88
Bibliography	89

List of Tables

Table 1: <i>Comparisons of Music Education Based on Qualitative Case Studies</i>	54
Table 2: <i>Descriptive Statistics for Question 4</i>	84
Table 3: <i>Correlations for Question 4</i>	85
Table 4: <i>Descriptive Statistics for Question 5</i>	86
Table 5: <i>Correlations for Question 5</i>	87
Table 6: <i>Correlations between Questions 4 and 5</i>	88

Introduction

Music as an expression and act of faith is central to Christian worship. Since the Apostolic Age, an abundance of diverse worship traditions have reflected the followings of Christ through words, songs, and all manners of human expression. Christianity has evolved into a multitude of denominations, each with their own musical traditions, that require ordained leaders of the faith - priests, ministers, etc. - who understand and have the skills necessary to lead congregations. Education of these future leaders, therefore, must address all forms of worship in order to prepare worship leaders for the vocation of ministry.

Music Education for Seminarians in Toronto's Christian Theological Colleges and Seminaries will study music education during in-classroom¹ and formation process² instruction at nine theological colleges and seminaries in Toronto, Canada. The seminaries included in the study are Emmanuel College (United Church of Canada), Knox College (Presbyterian Church in Canada), Regis College (Roman Catholic: Jesuit), St. Augustine's Seminary (Roman Catholic: Diocesan), University of St. Michael's College (Roman Catholic: Basilian), University of Trinity College (Anglican), Wycliffe College (Anglican: Evangelical), St. Philip's Seminary (Roman Catholic), and Tyndale University and Seminary (Bible College: Evangelical). With the exclusion of St. Philip's Seminary and Tyndale University and Seminary, seven of Toronto's theological colleges and seminaries belong to the Toronto School of Theology (TST), a consortium of

¹ In-classroom: education that is associated with a structured course where curriculum is defined, and students are graded towards the completion of their program. This education can take place within a physical classroom or multi location practicum.

² Formation Process: a method of practicum education at seminaries that addresses practical skills relating to the performance of worship and prayer.

theological schools within the University of Toronto. Colleges within the TST are joined through shared educational resources, collaborative instruction, common minimum academic standards, and many common policies and procedures. The scope of this research is multid denominational in nature and focuses on academic programs that prepare students for ordained ministry. Lay ministry programs, despite their current popularity within academia, have been excluded for three reasons: 1) ordained ministers, as hired professional clergy, are responsible for the structure of worship that informs the use of music, 2) historically, ordained ministers have received musical training due to their musical involvement during worship, and 3) the role of lay ministers often does not explicitly involve music. This differentiation between ordained ministers and lay ministers became evident as research indicated that no lay ministry programs in Toronto are providing mandatory music education during either in-classroom instruction or as part of the formation process.

Finally, the information presented in this paper reflects the intended 2019-2020 academic year. This research is therefore not reflective of the 2020-2021 academic year as the academic impact due to the COVID-19 pandemic has altered the normal structure and presentation of academic programs, with the potential for unforeseen consequences to seminarian education in the future.

Research Goals

The purpose of this study is to primarily examine the quantity and not quality of music education provided to seminarians in Toronto's theological colleges and seminaries. First, the research will demonstrate the music education curriculum for seminarians in both their weighted course instructions and non-weighted practicums. Second, the research will identify the presence and effectiveness of a broad set of musical skills that ordained ministers across a variety of denominations will benefit from receiving instruction in.

Literature Review

Introduction

To understand the role of liturgical music and music education in theological colleges and seminaries, literature will focus on two differing categories. First, a historical overview will trace the corresponding liturgical and musical development for Christian traditions that are relevant to this study - Early Christian, Roman Catholic, Lutheran Reformation, Anglican, Jesuit, Presbyterian, United Church of Canada, and Evangelical Bible College. This overview will provide context to this study's research as it examines the musical traditions that seminarians are ecclesiastically inheriting. Second, literature will trace contemporary research on music education in theological colleges and seminaries in North America during the twentieth and twenty-first centuries. Both categories of literature, though topically different, will provide context and comparatives for the research discussed in this paper.

Historical Overview of Music in Christian Worship

Early Christianity (0 – 5th Century)

Early Christian musicology began in the Apostolic Age³ to the mid-fifth century CE, according to musicologist James McKinnon, with the first notable evidence appearing in the

³ I.e. first century CE following the death of Jesus and his disciples.

second and third centuries.⁴ Christian apologists Justin Martyr and Carthaginian Tertullian⁵ provided the first writings on Christian eucharistic worship. These outlined the details of, as well as the growing distinctions between, Christian and Judeo practices. The role of the church leader also developed, as first Bishops and then elders, or “presbyters,” began to exercise priestly functions, mainly in connection with the celebration of the Eucharist.

By the fourth and fifth centuries, Patristic literature⁶ began to detail the uses of hymnody, psalmody, declamations and acclamations in Christian worship practices (McKinnon 2001a). These musical developments began to appear in three distinct forms of worship. First, psalmody became central to the development of the Office⁷ as desert monasticism began to influence early Christian leaders such as Augustine, Jerome, Basil, John Chrysostom, Gregory of Nyssa and Ambrose. John Chrysostom wrote, “as soon as [desert monastics] are up, they stand and sing the prophetic hymns... Neither cithara, nor syrinx, nor any other musical instrument emits such sound as is to be heard in the deep silence and solitude of those holy men as they sing” (McKinnon 1987). By the late fourth and early fifth centuries, lay Christians had developed

⁴ Opinions regarding first century Christian musicology differs among scholars. Musicologists, such as McKinnon, believe that the New Testament provides evidence for Christian hymns, acclamations and responses, and psalms. Alternatively, scholars such as Erik Routley warn against the New Testament as a source of accurate musical description. Routley states that, “apart from the...singing of the heavenly hosts [in the book of Revelations] and a stray remark in two of the Epistles about the singing of hymns and spiritual songs (Col. 3:16; Eph. 5:19)” music is not mentioned in the New Testament (Routley 1978, 15).

⁵ Tertullian description of a woman seeing visions during worship, “whether it be in the reading of the Scriptures, or in the chanting of psalms, or in the offering up of prayers...” is the first account of music during Christian Sunday worship (Roberts and Donaldson 1870, 428).

⁶ Patristic literature: a body of literature that comprises those works, excluding the New Testament, written by Christians before the 8th century.

⁷ Early reference to what would develop into the monastic Liturgy of the Hours and Breviary.

an Office of prayer that was independent from the monastic Office, which, according to Egeria⁸, was celebrated both independently and jointly with the monastic community. Second, the evening Vigil became an established practice on Sunday mornings before dawn as “hymns are sung and also antiphons, and there are prayers with each hymn and antiphon” (ibid, 114). Lastly, by the fourth century, psalmody was used in the Mass that became a precursor to the structure of the Mass Proper. Patristic literature, including works by Augustine and John Chrysostom, described the use of a single or an indeterminate number of gradual and communion psalms; however, sufficient evidence for entrance or offertory chants did not exist until the Medieval Ages.

Following the establishment of the early Christian Church, Christendom’s Western Church continued to develop the Mass and Office as the two main forms of liturgy during the Medieval Ages. By the seventh century, according to McKinnon, the Mass began to develop its own musical structure, or “properization”, whereby each feast and Sunday received its own chant formulary. This development led to the eighth century musical structure of the Mass, which was detailed in the *Ordo romanus I*. The Pontifical Mass described in the first Catholic Ordo outlined the foundation for the Latin Mass, which described the placement of both Ordinary, Proper, and subsidiary chants. These chants included the introit and introit antiphon, Kyrie, Gloria, Epistle, responsum or gradual, alleluia or tract, gospel, offertory chant, Preface, Sanctus, Angus Dei, communion chant, and final responses. This collection of chants involved both the clergy, including the Pope, deacon, and subdeacon, and members of the Schola for

⁸ Egeria’s writings are commonly attributed to a late fourth to an early fifth century Spanish nun on pilgrimage in Palestine. Her writings give extensive detail of the music and overall structure of liturgy in the region, most significantly in Jerusalem.

solo and group chants (McKinnon 2001b). Andreas Pfisterer further notes in *Origins and Transmission of Franco-Roman Chant* (2018) that by 750 CE “148 Introits, 117 Graduals, about 40–50 Alleluias, 15 Tracts, 93 offertories, and 146 communions” are known to have existed in the Roman Mass (Pfisterer 2018, 69). Important to note, however, is that written neumatic sources of Mass chants did not appear until around 900 CE, despite the introduction of standardizing liturgical text, such as the *Hadrianum*⁹, by the eighth century.

Medieval Christianity (5th – 15th Century)

Medieval Christendom ushered in a series of musical and liturgical developments. First, by the end of the tenth century, prayers, readings, and chants of the Mass began to be compiled into missals for use by clergy. Examples, such as the Echternach missal (ca.1030) and an unpublished French missal (mid-12th c.), demonstrated the combined use of text and music notation for use during Mass (Dyer 2018, 103). Second, antiphonal psalmody became an established practice in cathedrals as clerics and parishioners exchanged psalm verses, while monasteries developed the practice of double-choir psalmody. Third, the first professional institution for Christian liturgical music was founded in Rome at the Schola Cantorum. Though doubt has been cast on the origins of the schola and its supposed founder, Pope Gregory I, the institution became a centre for musical and liturgical education for deacons and choristers, as well as for the collection of chants.¹⁰ Fourth, the Mass Proper was established with the inclusion of the Credo alongside the Kyrie, Gloria, Sanctus and Agnus Dei. Lastly, the Ordinary of

⁹ *Hadrianum*: a Gregorian sacramentary that was designed to be used throughout the Carolingian Empire.

¹⁰ The Schola Cantorum’s earliest chant compilations date to their twelfth century gradual and antiphoner (Pfisterer 2018, 85).

the Mass began to grow to include the Sequence and independent chants, such as the Gospel and Agnus Dei antiphons, as well as the Asperges me and Vidi aquam.

Non-Roman and Frankish Christian music also developed during the Medieval period. With the Papacy moved from Rome to Avignon between 1309-1376, France's musical influence during the Ars Antiqua and Ars Nova movements corresponded with the rise of the liturgical motet and polyphonic mass setting. The motet began to develop in the Kingdoms of France, England, and Italy during the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. Based predominantly on chant melodies, these motets were performed often by clergy during liturgy. Fourteenth century French Ars Nova manuscripts also represented a significant repertoire, according to Maricarmen Gómez, of 40 Mass Ordinary movements that were widely disseminated. Ars Nova motets, however, began to be written for secular occasions, demonstrating the genre's popularity beyond liturgical use.

By the Renaissance, liturgical music reform was introduced as a response to the perceived opulence of late medieval Christianity. Motets, according to Perkins and Macey, began "to return to the liturgical and devotional contexts in which the genre had originated" (Perkins and Macey 2001). Guillaume Dufay and his contemporaries returned to composed music, including mass settings, motets, antiphons, Magnificat, hymns, and more, which almost exclusively used liturgical chant as the cantus firmus. This tradition carried through with Josquin des Prez and his contemporaries, with regional developments occurring throughout Europe. The more significant long-term reform, however, was enacted by the thirteenth century Papal Curia, who "sought to pare down the liturgy to a form not far removed from that of the earlier 9th century" (McKinnon 2001b). Musically, the reform removed standardised subsidiary chants

for each diocese and attempted to provide regional independence for the celebration of local saints and other festal observances.

Protestant Reform and Early European Colonialism (16th–18th Century)

Sixteenth century Protestant Reform created a distinctly different attitude towards liturgical music. Luther's first mass reform, *Formula missae* (1523), was rooted in Franco-Flemish polyphony and retained the Mass structure of the Proper and Ordinary, which was sung in pre-existing, or in some cases, new polyphony and chant. Theologically, however, the Mass began to change with alterations to the Eucharist and the desired inclusion of "congregational German hymns to be sung after the gradual, Sanctus and Agnus Dei" (Leaver 2001). By 1526, Luther's *Deutsche Messe* (1526) aimed to simplify the Mass and intentionally used music as part of the reform.¹¹ The Latin Mass alleluia, gradual, sequence, Sursum corda and Preface were omitted. Other significant changes to the Mass Ordinary and Proper took place with structural alterations to the Mass, the inclusion of German text, and substitutions for German chorales. Schooling reform also took place as pre-existing Latin schools introduced reform theology through the theoretical and practical education of music.

Following Germany's reform, Switzerland under Ulrich Zwingli sought a different approach to liturgy that abandoned the structure of the Mass and instead adopted a sermon-based service that either banned or limited the use of music. John Calvin, however, embraced the metrical psalm tradition from Germany and began compiling the first collection of metrical psalms: *Aulcuns pseumes et cantiques mys en chant* (1539). The first Genevan Psalter was

¹¹ See Appendix A for Leaver's comparison of the *Formula missae* and *Deutsche Messe*.

printed in 1542 and included the order of service and prayers, psalms for the service, and Calvin's ideas on the purpose of liturgical music. Throughout the remainder of the decade, the psalter evolved to include a greater number of psalms, and the practice of congregational psalm singing was established.

Protestant Reform began to spread in Europe, and in England, Henry VIII's separation from Rome in 1534 marked the beginning of the Church of England. Liturgical music prior to England's reformation emphasized choral polyphony and regionalism that was ushered in by Rome's thirteenth century Papal reform. With the accession of Edward VI in 1547 and the creation of the *Book of Common Prayer* (1549), "many of the texts of the pre-Reformation polyphony – graduals, alleluias, tracts, sequences, antiphons, responsories – disappeared almost without trace" (Temperley 2001a). The remainder of Edward VI's reign was characterized by radical reform, including a second *Book of Common Prayer* (1552), which removed the Kyrie, Benedictus, Agnus Dei, and various rubrics that instructed clergy to sing.

Following Mary I's anti-reform stance, the Church of England experienced significant growth during the reign of Elizabeth I (1559 -1603). The *Book of Common Prayer* was mostly restored to the 1552 form and Elizabeth desired a national Church that was inclusive to the country's diverse population. This led to a wide observance of musical traditions from extreme Puritan to ultramontane Catholic. A distinction was made between choral foundations¹² that preserved the sung liturgy with professional choirs, and parish choirs where said liturgy and metric psalmody were used. The *Book of Common Prayer* also reiterated this musical diversity

¹² Choral Foundations: a term for cathedrals and royal chapels that promoted larger liturgical choral programs.

by providing options for services, which could either be spoken, sung with simple chant without a choir, or sung with responsorial chant and polyphony with a choir. Growing divisions within the church, however, led to Elizabeth I's Royal Injunctions Act of 1559. Psalmody, canticles, short services, and anthems all became part of her plan to regulate the co-existence of simplified and elaborated liturgical music traditions in England. By the later Elizabethan and early Jacobean period, England's support for music grew and composers such as Byrd, Morley, Tomkins, Weelkes, and Gibbons flourished.

Under James I (reigned 1603-25), and Charles I (reigned 1625-49), high church Anglicanism re-emphasized the Church's Catholic and Apostolic Roots. A return to ritual practices and elaborate music was encouraged despite its lack of support from local parishes and congregations. However, great attention was given to music during this period, with repairs to organs, increased support to choirs, and a restored use of music during liturgy (ibid).

Following the English Civil War, Presbyterianism became England's state religion between 1647-52. With the abolishment of the *Book of Common Prayer* and the introduction of Presbyterian worship, choral services ceased to exist once the Genevan Psalter was introduced. With the restoration of Charles II in 1660, the Church of England was re-established in the United Kingdom; however, Presbyterianism continued without state sponsorship. The divide between music in England's cathedrals and local parishes grew in the eighteenth century. The Office and Proper of the Mass, anthems, and the new Anglican Chant were maintained at cathedrals while local parishes adopted the short service and hymns in replacement of more elaborate liturgical music.

Rome's response to the Protestant Reformation was the Council of Trent (1545–63). The conciliar reforms addressed the perceived opulence of late medieval Mass with first “distinctly ‘Roman Catholic’ musical tradition” by recentralizing papal authority and worship practices (Dyer 2001). The 1570 revised missal retained the polyphonic Ordinary of the Mass and a newly commissioned chant gradual that reduced the melismatic nature of the Propers. Italian composers, chiefly Palestrina, and other composers at major princely and cathedral chapels in Rome, Venice, and Mantua, were part of the Counter-Reformation that produced new polyphonic works. These works were influenced by both Gregorian chant and the polyphony of northern Europe (Lockwood 2001).

The Society of Jesus also became an important force in the Counter-Reformation after its inauguration in 1540. Musical involvement within the order, according to T. Frank Kennedy, was most significant between 1540 to 1773.¹³ Initially, music was shaped by the Order's missionary ideals. Communal singing of the liturgical hours was not stipulated by Ignatius of Loyola and his followers, who believed its members should “be out in the world at the service of the gospel, ministering to the people, rather than bound together in the common recitation of the psalms” (Kennedy 2001). Following this initial period, a proliferation of Jesuit colleges took place in the late sixteenth century. Music became part of Jesuit college curriculum and ministry in four principal contexts: “in liturgical and paraliturgical services within the order's churches and colleges; in college dramatic productions; in college academic assemblies and public disputations; and in the Marian Congregations (pious societies of students dedicated to

¹³ 1773 marks the beginning of Pope Clement XIV's suppression of the Jesuit order, which brought on reform within the order even after its reinstated papal support in 1814.

the Blessed Virgin) within the colleges” (ibid 2001). Music was also used substantially during missionary work in the Americas, including in Quebec, and Asia. According to T. Frank Kennedy, a definitive style of music, “missionary music”, was created that combined European and indigenous music in Jesuit territories (Kennedy 2001).

Religious Formation in Canada (19th – 21st Century)

Protestantism in Canada

Colonialism and globalist expansion brought both Protestant and Catholic Churches to Canada. The Church of England was officially established in Canada, first in Nova Scotia, in 1758, and eventually in Upper Canada in 1791. Unaccompanied congregational psalmody was common in most town churches due to financial restraints. Meanwhile, in England, the Oxford Movement (1830s) aimed at returning the Church of England to a ritualistic foundation that would support a pre-Reformation guided form of liturgy and a new system of governance. Anglo-Catholic and high church Anglicanism took aim at the Pray Book’s lack of musical guidance and wished to revive polyphonic choral music, portions of the Mass Proper and Office, “plainchant (often in Marbeck’s adaptation), the Gregorian psalm tones, and both medieval and post-Tridentine Catholic hymns in translation” (Temperley 2001a). The nineteenth century, however, was not characterized by Tractarianism, but by a larger reform of the Church of England that saw a return to financial stability and greater musical participation. Parishes began to take interest in both congregational and choral singing, with new anthems and mass services being published for parish choirs. However, it is not until after 1900 that a substantial Canadian Anglican tradition emerged through English-born Canadian composers Healey Willan and Alfred

Whitehead. These composers drew, “international attention to the existence of a Canadian school of Anglican church music” (ibid). By the 1900s, however, the Church of England in both Canada and England was not immune to increasing societal secularization. Searching for ways to engage with the larger population, a series of commissions were established in England, of which one, *Music in Worship* (1922), stated that “the ideal in all parish churches is congregational singing”. Congregational participation became central, and a new evangelical charismatic movement began in the 1960s. *Alternative Service Book* (1980) became the first Anglican Service Book that allowed for a variety of languages and liturgies, depending on the individual church; while Cathedrals continued to uphold the choral tradition despite increasing financial difficulties and a growing societal disinterest in sacred music.¹⁴

By the mid-eighteenth century, Presbyterianism had reached Nova Scotia and “gained momentum through continuing immigration from the British Isles (especially by members of the Church of Scotland) and the United States” (Marti and Polman 2001). The union between the English, Scottish, Irish, and Welsh Presbyterian Churches in the nineteenth century led to a series of music reforms that included the use of hymnody and the publication of hymnals, which was counter to Presbyterianism’s prior exclusive use of psalmody. The Presbyterian Church in Canada was established in 1875 and used the Scottish Psalter and reform hymnody. The Presbyterian Church of Canada by the end of the nineteenth century began to reshape congregational participation during a period of liturgical renewal. With the introduction of choirs, congregations were divided as services began to include psalms, hymns, anthems, and

¹⁴ Further readings on the history of Canadian Christian music includes John Beckwith’s *Sing Out the Glad News: Hymn Tunes in Canada* (1987) and *Psalmody in British North America: Humbert, Daulé, Jenkins, Burnham* (2002) and Helmut Kallmann’s *A History of Music in Canada 1534–1914* (1960).

solo singing (Hansen 1998). Membership had again declined in the twentieth century when two-thirds of Presbyterian Canadians joined in forming The United Church of Canada.

The United Church of Canada was founded in 1925 by members of the Presbyterian, Methodist, and Congregationalist Churches of Canada. Theological and institutional reform became the basis for the union, while unfixed liturgy and hymnody became the structure of worship. Presbyterianism's contributions to the music of the United Church included its tradition of psalmody and hymnody. Methodism's hymnody also became central to the formation of the United Church. During the Methodist Church's early formation, Charles Wesley used hymnody as the Church's "most effective weapon" for developing community and congregational participation (Temperley 2001b). Canadian Methodism continued using hymnody in frontier communities, and by the twentieth century, Methodists used a variety of congregational, choral, and instrumental music during worship.¹⁵ Lastly, Congregationalism, which originated in late sixteenth century England, primarily used metrical psalmody until the influence of hymnist Isaac Watts in the 1700s. Watts introduced a new style of English hymnody that encouraged congregational participation. Daniel Hansen, in *The Role of the Church Musician: A Study of Perception of the Identity of the Ideal and Actual Church Musician in the United Church of Canada* (1998), believed that the Congregationalist approach to non-liturgical forms and the "prioritization of leadership at the local or congregational level" greatly impacted United Church polity towards the adoption of psalmody and hymnody (Hansen 1998).

¹⁵ Hansen describes a 1907 order of service in Toronto, which included solo organ music, hymns, and choral anthems (Hansen 1998, 69).

Through the influences of the Presbyterian, Methodist, and Congregationalist Churches, the first liturgical texts were published by the United Church. *The Hymnary* (1930), which incorporated hymns from all three traditions, became a primary liturgical source for the Church (Kervin 2011). *The Book of Common Order* (1932) acknowledged music from each denomination and included rubrics that indicated the use of psalms and hymns, as well as liturgical resources (Kyrie, Gloria, Benedictus, Gloria Patri) and choral anthems. A second series of liturgical documents were created during a failed union with the Anglican Church of Canada, and included *The Service Book* (1969), which included few musical reforms, and *The Hymn Book* (1971), which attempted to combine the hymn traditions of the Anglican Church and the United Church. The latest form of liturgical renewal led to the creation of *Voices United* (1996) and *Celebrate God's Presence: A Book of Services* (2000). *Voices United* included an expanded psalter and music for prayers and creeds (Kervin 2011). However, the hymnal disregarded previous worship forms with the removal of liturgical resources. *Celebrate God's Presence: A Book of Services* emphasized the United Church's desired inclusivity by providing a multitude of worship forms. Celebrants were directed to conduct services either said or sung with musical settings indicated in *Voices United*.

Finally, the Protestant evangelical Bible College movement developed in late nineteenth century North America in response to a growing interest in domestic and global missionary work. Bible College education emphasized biblical studies, theological education, and practical missionary training for those not interested in, or able,¹⁶ to become ordained ministers. In

¹⁶ Bible colleges were inclusive to those who could not meet seminary requirements, such as women and those without university pre-requisites.

Ontario, Canada, interest in missionary work grew with 1) new outreach missions, such as the Yonge Street Mission and Toronto Mission, 2) support for missionary groups, such as the Upper Canada Bible Society and Upper Canada Tract Society, and 3) support for international mission work, such as James Hudson Taylor's China Inland Mission and the Sudan Interior Mission. An increased training for missionary work led to the establishment of the Toronto Bible Training School (TBTS) in 1894. TBTS was a multid denominational evangelical missionary school with a broad theological approach,¹⁷ whose founder Elmore Harris had envisioned the college as a means to train laypeople as "Sunday School teachers, Pastors' Assistants, and as City, Home and Foreign Missionaries" (Stackhouse 1993). Between 1908 – 1946 the school developed in several ways under principal John McNicol. TBTS was renamed the Toronto Bible College in 1912 and in 1929 became the first Bible College in Canada with an independent permanent building. The academic program was also lengthened from two to three years and an attempt was made to provide a higher quality of education that could be considered comparable to university theological programs. The school was once again renamed as the Ontario Bible College (OBC) in 1968 after merging with the London College of Bible and Missions. In 1976, OBC formed a graduate school, the Ontario Theological Seminary (OTS), and, following financial difficulties in the 1990s, OBC and OTS were renamed Tyndale College and Seminary. Throughout the later twentieth century, the increase in bachelor's degrees on offer, and the inclusion of a graduate level seminary program, meant a cultural shift at Tyndale away from the traditional Bible College to a more mainstream academic institution. Tyndale University and Seminary, renamed

¹⁷ This approach was rooted in predominately Baptist and Presbyterian theology with secondary Anglican, Methodist, and theological influences from other denominations.

again as of 2020, is the largest seminary in Canada with over eight hundred students in the seminary program. The theological scope has broadened to include a predominance of students from Pentecostal and Charismatic ministries.

Catholicism in Canada

Roman Catholicism came to Canada first through Jesuit missionaries as part of the expansion of New France in the 1600s. Significant musical reform was initiated in the twentieth century before and after the Second Vatican Council. Pope Pius X (1903-1914) was an advocate of musical reform and emphasized in *Tra le sollecitudini* (1903) the use of Gregorian chant, renaissance polyphony, and an avoidance of secular influences in liturgical music. Subsequently, a new *Kyriale* (1905), *Graduale* (1908) and *Antiphonarium pro diurnis horis* (1912) were created in conjunction with the chant renewal movement in France. Involvement by laity was also promoted through education at new choir schools in Europe and North America,¹⁸ and through the composition of mass settings for congregational use.

The Second Vatican Council (1962-1965) restructured Catholic worship around a core principle of congregational participation. New Mass Office settings and Propers were composed in vernacular languages to a distinct Post Vatican II aesthetic that polarized Catholics. Meanwhile, the Council's stance on music in seminaries emphasized that, "great importance is to be attached to the teaching and practice of music in seminaries..." (Second Vatican Ecumenical Council 1967). Despite the attempts for inclusivity, Catholic Churches in Europe and North America continued to experience a low level of musical participation by congregations

¹⁸ An example of which is St. Michael's Choir School, founded in 1926 by John E. Ronan in Toronto.

into the twenty-first century. Joseph Dyer concludes his survey of post-Vatican II music in *Roman Catholic Church Music* (2001) by acknowledging that leadership remains a critical factor in the progression of Catholic music into the twenty-first century.

Seminary Education Review

A variety of literature on seminary education exists in the twentieth and twenty-first centuries. Most of the scholarship is not exclusively focused on music education; however, there are a select number of studies dedicated to music education, as well as studies that include music as a portion of a broader seminary education review. In particular, the 1970s and 1980s produced several papers in Catholic seminary reform, following the Second Vatican Council, and Protestant seminary reform.

Twentieth century literature on seminary music education includes Anthony Sorgie's *Music Education in the Major Free-Standing Roman Catholic Seminaries in the United States* (1989). Though Sorgie's study was limited to Roman Catholic seminaries, it provided a comprehensive study in six key areas: 1) the place of liturgical music education in the thirty-five major seminaries involved in the study, 2) the qualifications of those who teach liturgical music in these seminaries, 3) the relationship of liturgy studies to music studies, 4) the place of vocal training, 5) choral training, and 6) appreciation of the treasury of Catholic liturgical music.

Sorgie found that:

Thirty-two percent of the seminaries surveyed do not have any formal music education in their curricula. Thirty-seven percent of the seminary music education are full-time members of the faculty, and twenty-six percent are students. There seems to be a growing complementarity between the discipline of liturgy and music. Most of the vocal

and choral training is part of the informal liturgical education accomplished in the liturgical ceremonies in the seminaries. Very few use a wide repertoire of sacred music or offer courses in appreciation of the music treasury of the Roman Catholic Tradition (Sorgie 1989).

Sorgie identified crowded curricula and a lack of adequately trained music educators as the main causes for the lack of formal and informal music education in the thirty-five major seminaries.

The State of Church Music Education for Ministerial Students in Protestant Seminaries in the United States (1975) by Jack Wayne Schwarz highlighted music education at forty-six Protestant theological seminaries and colleges in the United States. However, the statistical data included a larger number of respondents, including schools ($N=125$), administrators ($n=109$), students ($n=207$), and seminary graduates ($n=201$). Schwarz's research found that despite the interest in music education by administrators, students, and seminary graduates, little emphasis was placed on musical training. Statistics showed that 17.3% of schools had music in the required curriculum, 65% provided optional electives in music education, 65% acknowledged the presence of qualified music educators, 90% of administrators believed that the curriculum was not too full to include church music courses, and 40%-50% stated that music education was received outside of the classroom.¹⁹ Schwarz, however, ultimately believed that the perceived decline in the quality of church music in the United States was related to the insufficient training of liturgical musicians. This conclusion did not emphasize the importance of musical education for clergy as a root cause towards the declining quality of church music.

¹⁹ Schwarz objectively believed that the music education was insufficient for ministerial use in the 40%-50% of schools that acknowledged music education outside of the classroom.

Further surveys were conducted in the 1970s and 1980s to ascertain the teaching and celebration practices in Roman Catholic seminaries. A survey jointly conducted by the Center for Applied Research in the Apostolate,²⁰ *A survey report on the teaching and celebration of liturgy* (1974) by Thomas Krosnicki, concluded that seminary music education was deficient in teaching practical performance skills and providing a sufficient education in music appreciation. Nathan Mitchell's article *Liturgical Education in Roman Catholic Seminaries: A Report and an Appraisal* (1980), which was in response to Krosnicki's, came to similar conclusions, but stated that some seminaries had begun "to require courses in music (e.g. sight-singing, vocal training), while others include pastoral music among the electives" (ibid).

Twenty-first century literature included Daniel Aleshire's article *The Role of Music in the Seminary: Where are We?* (2005). In his presentation to the American Guild of Organists, Aleshire described the state of music education for seminary students at schools within The Association of Theological Schools (ATS) in the United States and Canada. Nine ATS schools in Texas were used to illustrate the diversity and difficulties of music education for seminary programs. Aleshire found that the distinction between "mainline and evangelical" institutions did not affect the presence of music in seminary education. Institutions who provided music education, however, did so either "through chapel and choirs" or "through instruction in sacred music, worship, and liturgy" (Aleshire 2005). Five out of nine schools demonstrated formal instruction in music performance, music history, and/or music appreciation. The remaining three schools provided either informal instruction or provided no instruction.

²⁰ CARA is a national, non-profit, Georgetown University-affiliated research centre that conducts social science studies about the Catholic Church.

Twenty-first century literature on seminary music education, however, is relatively limited in North America compared to the research conducted during the 1970s and 1980s. Furthermore, the majority of research was conducted in the United States and similar extensive research such as Sorgie's and Schwarz could not be found on Canadian theological colleges or seminaries.

Methodology

Informants

Prior to commencing this research, ethical clearance from the Delegated Research Ethics Review Committee at the Graduate Program in Music was obtained on April 07, 2020. Once ethical approval was given, informants were recruited through email communications and were selected from nine seminaries and theological colleges in Toronto: Emmanuel College, Knox College, Regis College, St. Augustine's Seminary, University of St. Michael's College, University of Trinity College, Wycliffe College, St. Philip's Seminary, and Tyndale University and Seminary. Two primary informant demographics were established: faculty/staff ($n=9$) and seminarians ($n=11$). Faculty and staff were interviewed at each institution to establish the degree to which music education is being provided to Master of Divinity (MDiv) students. In the programs where music was acknowledged as part of the in-classroom curriculum and/or student formation process, a minimum of one faculty/staff member and one seminarian were interviewed. Lastly, students of the Master of Sacred Music (MSMus) program at Emmanuel College were established as a third secondary demographic, of which one informant was interviewed. This demographic was included as research indicated that the MSMus program had a direct impact on the seminarian's music education at Emmanuel College. In total, twenty-one informants were interviewed during this research. Of those informants, eighteen participated in full interviews where the relevant questionnaire (see Appendices B, C, and D) was completed. The remaining three informants did not complete the full questionnaire but did provide important information relevant to the collection of data.

Data Collection

The research involved a structured interview with a mixed method set of questions (see Appendices B, C, and D). Questions for each informant demographic are nearly identical and are divided into three categories. First, “Personal Data and Institutional Background” is a demographics survey that identifies that informant’s role at the seminary and their musical education background before involvement at the seminary.²¹ Second, “Formal and Informal Music Education at the Seminary” primarily establishes the quantity of music education at each institution, with a minor focus on quality. This provides both a qualitative and quantitative analysis of 1) the ways in which students receive music education, and 2) the effectiveness of that education to meet the expectations of ordained ministry in various denominations. Lastly, “Music Beyond the Seminary” provides informants the opportunity to reflect on their awareness of music within their denominational tradition in comparison to others, as well as any opinions regarding the future implementation of music education at their institution.

Once informants agreed to be interviewed, the questionnaire and a consent form relevant to the informant’s demographic were sent digitally for approval. Interviews were conducted either through secured video conference software or by telephone. These interviews lasted between forty-five minutes to an hour and a half. Informants were instructed that the interview would follow the pre-approved set of questions and were encouraged to elaborate on

²¹ Probing questions were selected for the first portion of the interview to contextualize the informant’s knowledge of music, as it may potentially affect their musical participation at the seminary.

questions, whether presented as dichotomies or open-ended responses. With informants' consent, video and/or audio was recorded during each interview for later data analysis.

Results

Data Analysis

Data from informant interviews is organized into either quantitative or qualitative information. Qualitative questions, which comprised the majority of the questionnaires, are used under “Results” as either descriptive comparatives or in Section 2, Question 3, as individual case studies on each institution. Quantitative questions, Section 2, Questions 4 and 5, are analysed using SPSS Statistics software to provide descriptive statistics and Pearson correlation coefficients on the musical skills deemed relevant to seminarian music education. This secondary data is used to support the predominantly quantitative data analysis in “Discussions.”

The presentation of the data analysis will correspond with the three question categories used during the interview process: Personal Data and Institutional Background, Formal and Informal Music Education at the Seminary, and Music Beyond the Seminary. Results are compiled from twenty-one informants and nine institutions that represent students, teachers, and staff demographics.

Personal Data and Institutional Background

Employment of Music Educators

Formally trained musicians²² are employed at seven out of nine institutions in the study. Emmanuel College employs a full-time musician to coordinate music education for MDiv, MSMus, and non-Emmanuel affiliated TST students and volunteers. St. Augustine's employs a full-time musician to coordinate practical music education for seminarians and provide music for chapel services. St. Augustine's Vice-Rector & Director of Liturgy, as part of their employment, also currently provides a separate music education on music history, appreciation, and connection to liturgy. St. Philip's employs a full-time musician to coordinate music education for seminarians and coordinate music for worship services. Trinity employs a part-time musician to coordinate music for multiple weekly services and provide musical advisement to MDiv students. Knox and Wycliffe employ a contract musician to coordinate music for single or multiple weekly services. Informant 21 indicates that at Knox College, between 1976-2009, a musician was employed to teach music, coordinate music during chapel services, and direct Knox's extra-curricular choir. Tyndale employs a full-time musician to coordinate music for multiple weekly services and provide music education for the university's undergraduate music program. The remaining colleges, Regis and St. Michael's, do not employ a musician or faculty member to implement music education or coordinate music during worship services.

²² Formally trained musicians in this instance denotes a professional liturgical musician who has received university qualification in music.

Programs Offered and Degree Requirements

Among the nine institutions, seven provide a Master of Divinity program for ordained ministry with a full-time degree length of three years. The exceptions include St. Augustine's, which provides a seven-year full-time MDiv program that combines two years of philosophical study, one year of spiritual study, and four years of theological study, and St. Philip's, which provides a three-year full time Master of Theology degree and Bachelor of Philosophy degrees that when combined are considered MDiv equivalencies for diocesan ordination.

MDiv programs at the four Catholic seminaries, as the closest comparable within the same denomination, differ significantly. St. Augustine's provides the most "mainstream" diocesan seminary program, according to Informant 18, which attracts the majority of Catholic seminarians seeking diocesan ordination. Comparatively, the St. Philip's philosophy and theology programs are specialized to meet a variety of ordination requirements by various dioceses and religious orders. Both institutions, however, are linked through their degree programs. St. Philip's provides a two- to three-year philosophy degree that is regularly acquired by St. Augustine's seminarians to fulfill their two-year philosophy study requirement.

Mandatory residency requirements, as part of degree requirements, is indicated at all four Catholic seminaries: St. Augustine's, St. Philip's, Regis, and St. Michael's. Informant 8 indicates that St. Augustine's degree length and residency during the entirety of the degree leads to a formation process wherein musical and liturgical learning takes place in the context of the seminarians' general living experience. However, Informant 9 indicates that availability of music education during students' philosophy years can differ based on residency options at St. Augustine's. During the two years of philosophical study, seminarians can either reside at the

primary Scarborough campus or at Serra House (a Pre-Theology Residence operated by St. Augustine's).²³ At Serra House, Informant 9 indicates that philosophical study takes place at St. Philip's seminary, where regular exposure to music does not occur. Alternatively, residency for seminarians attending Regis College is not technically part of the degree requirements as all Jesuits are required to live communally. Unlike other Catholic clergy, Jesuits who are studying at a seminary define themselves not as seminarians but as "scholastics" due to their continuous academic and residential practices both before, during, and after seminary study. Lastly, residency is mandatory at St. Michael's for a minimum of one year of full-time study. St. Michael's College offers an MDiv program, but according to Informant 18, the college's main enrollment exists in its undergraduate theology and lay ministry programs. Informant 18 also indicates that there is a tendency for students to attend St. Augustine's for their MDiv program.

Protestant MDiv programs at Emmanuel, Trinity, Wycliffe, Knox, and Tyndale are three-year full-time programs with no required residency. Emmanuel College's MDiv degree requirements indicate a mandatory hymnody course, *Songs of the Church*, which is taken in conjunction with MSMus students. The Master of Sacred Music (MSMus) program, which is a full-time two-year program, focuses on a balance of performance and theological studies. In 2012, with the appointment of Dr. Lim Swee Hong as the Deer Park Professor of Church Music, engagement between MSMus and MDiv students increased with joint courses and greater MSMus student involvement in chapel services. Alternatively, informants do not indicate that music is a degree requirement at Trinity, Wycliffe, Knox, and Tyndale. Informants at Knox

²³ Serra House is designated as a "house of discernment" for men discerning a call to diocesan priesthood and completing studies in philosophy in preparation for applying to St. Augustine's Seminary.

College, however, indicate that music education was mandatory for seminarians until recently. Informant 21 indicates that between the 1980s and early 2000s, music education was offered in a mandatory music course, elective music courses, and a Knox College-run extra-curricular choir.

Lastly, Tyndale University and Seminary does not offer a single MDiv degree, but instead their Master of Divinity Program includes a series of three-year professional degrees for ordained ministry or for general pastoral and religious leadership in congregations and other settings. Tyndale's Pastoral Ministry degree is offered for students pursuing ordained ministry and represents the majority of MDiv student enrolment. The seminary's other MDiv degrees offer alternative forms of Christian leadership for lay ministry that include Counselling, Biblical Studies, Interdisciplinary, Pastoral Ministry: New Generation Multicultural Church, Church in the City, Spiritual Formation, Christian Education and Discipleship, Global Mission and Intercultural Studies, Studies in Mandarin (CCST), Theological Studies, and Youth and Family Ministry.²⁴ Informant 20 indicates that the MDiv Program's inclusion of both ordained and layperson degrees is indicative of the evangelical movement's diverse views on ecclesiastical hierarchy. However, for the purposes of this research, references to Tyndale's MDiv program will hereafter refer to the seminary's Pastoral Ministry degree.

Establishment of Program Curriculum

Each institution requires that programs meet the diocesan or regional requirements for ordained ministry as determined by each denomination. The majority of institutions consult

²⁴ The non-traditional definition in Tyndale's MDiv program indicates the institution's origins as an educator of laypersons during the Bible College movement.

with an external institution or organization in order to determine guidelines for ordination requirements. Program curriculum at University of Toronto affiliated MDiv programs, for example, requires approval from the Toronto School of Theology. Seminaries that represent Protestant denominations also have individual governing bodies in Canada, which outline requirements for ordination. These governing bodies range in their involvement regarding curriculum. For example, the Presbyterian Church in Canada's Committee on Education and Reception determines general MDiv program acceptance requirements and general program completion requirements. However, the committee does not determine specific curriculum or other degree requirements at Canada's Presbyterian theological colleges in Toronto, Montreal, and Vancouver. These colleges each establish their own, "admission requirements, procedures and timelines, and make decisions about the admission of students on those terms, quite apart from the application process through the Committee on Education and Reception" (Committee on Education and Reception 2019).

Catholic seminaries, in addition to any association with TST, are responsible for upholding Papal educational directives. First, Catholic seminary degree requirements receive oversight from the Roman Congregation for the Clergy, which was established in 1967 by Pope Paul VI.²⁵ Directives produced by Rome's Congregation for the Clergy are then interpreted by each Episcopal Conference, in this case the Canadian Conference of Catholic Bishops, which produces local documents for seminaries. St. Augustine's, for example, then uses these locally

²⁵ Catholic seminary education was formerly determined by the Congregation for Catholic Education. However, the transition occurred following the Second Vatican Council as Rome determined that seminaries must not only provide academic education but also training of the whole person.

produced educational directives to shape their MDiv program in consultation with the Toronto School of Theology.

Finally, Tyndale is unique, as the seminary's curriculum is not accountable to other ecclesiastical entities such as local diocesan leadership, the Toronto School of Theology, or the Vatican. Instead, Tyndale's faculty-led academic planning committee, which is representative of the school's multiple denominations and ethnicities, determines curriculum based on the observation of other seminary programs and the needs of its evangelical student population.

Informants' Musical Knowledge

Informants were asked to "Complete this sentence: music during religious worship is..." (Appendices B, C, and D) as a way of establishing bias towards music and to detect trends across various denominational perspectives. From the eighteen informants who completed the relevant questionnaire, four common themes emerged: essentiality, prayerfulness, communal engagement, and liturgical comparatives. Examples of informants with elaborated answers include: Informant 7, who indicates that music is how worship finds its most solemn expression and that spoken forms of worship derive their solemnity from that of musical worship; Informant 9, who suggests that music is instrumental towards the purpose of elevating worship, but who only discovered the benefits of music during their seminary parish placement; Informant 13, who indicates that music derives its content and meaning from the Church's liturgical action (it is not secondary but instead liturgical music, i.e. Mass Propers and Office, flows as part of liturgical action in a way that is not independent); Informant 3, who indicates that music during worship is essential as a prayerful and communal activity; and Informant 21,

who indicates that music is inevitable or persistent, referring to the early Zwingli Reform tradition where music was removed from worship practices and subsequently reintroduced less than a century later.

Musical Background

Questions under “Personal Data and Institutional Background” conclude with data on informants’ musical education prior to seminary. Results indicate that of the seven faculty/staff informants who completed the full interview questionnaire, six have received formal professional training in music, and one has received limited informal training. Of the eleven student informants who completed the full interview questionnaire, two indicate formal-professional music education and nine indicate formal-amateur music education. The formal-amateur education includes private instruction during youth, and participation in curricular and noncurricular ensembles. This data suggests a basic to advanced understanding of music for all eighteen informants and a potential bias towards a willingness to provide or seek out music education.

Formal and Informal Music Education at the Seminary

“Formal and Informal Music Education at the Seminary” provides both qualitative and quantitative data from twenty-one informants at nine seminary programs in Toronto. Introductory questions establish that all twenty-one informants indicate that music is part of the seminary experience in their affiliated programs.

In-classroom Education vs the Formation Process

Section 2, Question 3, establishes whether music education is offered at each seminary's MDiv program, and if so, determines how the education is structured. These results are presented in a series of individual case studies for each seminary program.

- 3) Is music education part of formal (i.e. in class) training? Yes_____
- No_____ Yes/No_____ **(if 'No' go to questions 10)**
- a. Are these course(s) optional _____or required_____?
 - b. Are they separate from Liturgical Courses? Yes_____ No_____
 - c. If separate, is the liturgical application of music discussed in the course?
Yes_____ No_____
 - d. In what year(s) are they offered?
i. 1__ 2__ 3__ 4__

Initially the establishing question, "Is music education part of formal (i.e. in class) training?" provided informants with a dichotomous response that was predicated on the assumption that music education could only exist during in-classroom instruction. However, in initial interviews, informants indicated that music education can take place outside of in-classroom instruction. This instruction occurs during what informants described as the "formation process," a traditional form of seminary education that addresses practical skills relating to the performance of worship and prayer. These skills are developed through regular seminarian participation in activities such as chapel services, residency, and in some cases music instruction and performance opportunities. Subsequently a 'Yes/No' response was included to indicate the presence of music education during the formation process.

In response to the establishing question in Section 2, Question 3: two seminaries – St. Augustine's and Trinity – indicate that music education is part of both in-classroom education

and the formation process, three seminaries – Emmanuel, Wycliffe, and Tyndale – indicate that music is only part of in-classroom education, one seminary – St. Philip’s – indicates that music education is only part of the formation process, and three seminaries – Knox, Regis, and St. Michael’s – indicate that music is not part of either in-classroom education or the formation process.

St. Augustine’s

St. Augustine’s Seminary offers in-classroom music education and music education as part of the formation process. Faculty/staff informant, Informant 7, indicates that the seminary openly distinguishes between the program’s “theology program” (in-classroom academic education) and the “formation program” (formation process education) where seminarians obtain the practical skills required for ordained ministry. Music curriculum, outlined in Appendix E, includes an education in music history, performance, and theory. This education is provided to seminarians across the designated seven-year MDiv program, and the practical application of music in liturgy is addressed during both the in-classroom and formation programs. The seminary does not offer a weighted independent music course, but instead the majority of music education is dispersed over a series of required seminars and performance practicums during the formation process. The exception to this is a single lecture of sacred music that takes place during St. Augustine’s mandatory twelve-week liturgy course.

Student informants at St. Augustine’s indicate that there are additional ways, both required and optional, in which music education is offered. Seminarian residency, for example, requires participation in both weekly sung Offices and sung Masses five days of the week, as

well as weekly chant practices following Sunday morning prayer.²⁶ According to Informant 8, seminarians' participation in weekly sung Offices and sung Masses, as both cantores and congregants, instills confidence as students sing a variety of mass settings, hymns, and other forms of liturgical music. Furthermore, the required Sunday chant practice is a formal music rehearsal where upcoming music is sung, and the historical and liturgical application of music is discussed. Informant 9 indicates that this weekly participation in chapel helped to dramatically improve their singing ability through regular performance.

Lastly, Informant 7, a faculty/staff member at St. Augustine's, indicates that the seminary is constructing a set of principles, currently titled "Principles of Liturgical Music in Seminary Liturgies," that will inform decisions made towards music education for the seminary. These principles are guided by a variety of Church documents, including: the Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy *Sacrosanctum Concilium* (1963), the post-Conciliar instruction *Musicam Sacram* (1967), the General Instruction on the Roman Missal, the *Catechism of the Catholic Church* (Vatican 1993), directives of the Canadian Conference of Catholic Bishops (primarily the *Ordo* and instructions from the National Liturgy Office), and periodic instructions from the Congregation for Divine Worship and Discipline of the Sacraments (*Redemptionis Sacramentum* (2004); *Varietates Legitimize* (2004); *Liturgiam Authenticam* (2001)). Informant 7 recognizes that there is often a disconnect between theory and practice as Catholic seminaries are theoretically directed to provide music education. However, in practice this music education is often reduced once an institution tailors those directives to the school's circumstances.

²⁶ This requirement, however, is closer to an expectation, according to Informant 9, as a student's absence from the formation process's music education is not weighted against degree completion.

Trinity College

The seminary at Trinity College offers in-classroom music education and music education as part of the formation process. The seminary's designated mandatory first-year course *The History, Theology, and Practice of Anglican Liturgy* is offered in conjunction with Wycliffe College and includes a single session practicum "Sing the Offices" (Wycliffe College 2018). This practicum is instructed by a revolving series of guest lecturers who are professional liturgical musicians. Musical responses, psalm tones, and incipits for clergy are some of the musical topics that informants indicate are discussed and practiced during the practicum. However, informants indicate that the majority of music education and training at Trinity occurs during the formation process. Seminarians are required to organize music for weekly chapel services and chant on a rotational basis with the assistance of Trinity's Chaplain and Music Director. Informants also indicate that students are encouraged to approach Trinity's Chaplain or Music Director if they desire independent vocal instruction. Lastly, Informant 11 emphasizes that participation in chapel services is only theoretically mandatory given that it is not a requirement for degree completion. Informant 11 further indicates that students can be exempt from chapel participation, and therefore musical participation in chapel, in circumstances such as when a seminarian's commuting distance is deemed significant. However, these circumstances are the exception and most seminarians do engage in the planning and execution of chapel services.

Emmanuel College

The seminary at Emmanuel College offers in-classroom music education through mandatory and elective courses. The seminary's music course, *Songs of the Church*, is a

designated second-year mandatory course for all MDiv and MSMus students and is the only weighted independent music course for seminarians in Toronto. According to the course syllabus, “the course seeks to raise the awareness of song as a vital congregational worship act. We will examine the theology and practices of congregational song through a historical lens. Students will have the opportunity to create new song text and develop song leadership skills. Particular attention is given to the congregational song repertoire of the United Church in Canada” (Toronto School of Theology 2019). Informants 3 and 4 indicate that *Songs of the Church* is separate from a liturgical course; however, the practical use of music during liturgy is often addressed. For example, the course’s final project requires students to theoretically design and lead a hymn festival, or alternative worship service, with the intention of blending liturgy and hymnody. Informant 6, a faculty/staff informant, indicates that Emmanuel promotes song leading and lyric writing as invaluable skills that MDiv students will require at either internships or at pastoral appointments, especially where congregations are unable to afford professional musicians. Emmanuel also offers the *Toronto School of Theology Choir*, an elective course that can be taken by seminarians during any year of study or on a voluntary basis by all TST students, faculty, and staff. According to Informants 6 and 17, seminarians from Emmanuel represent the choir’s base demographic, which is significant enough to allow the choir to be a viable performing entity. Lastly, Emmanuel’s course *Ministry of Governance and Administration* offers one lecture that discusses a minister’s administrative relationship with music ministers. In the lecture, according to Informant 3, guest liturgical musicians discuss their working experience with ministers.

The coexistence of the MDiv and MSMus degrees at Emmanuel offers musical opportunities to seminaries that, according to informants, are designed to foster interdisciplinary relations. MMus students, according to Informant 6, are often approached by seminarians to help select music for chapel worship and to musically accompany them as they lead or write songs during classroom assignments. In turn, MSMus students regularly join MDiv student study groups in the various theological courses that are mandatory for both degrees. Informant 6 also indicates that seminarians have approached MSMus students to assist in pastoral internships as interim musicians, sometimes leading to a formal employment relationship.

Lastly, student informants indicate that *Songs of the Church* is not the only course that promotes musical engagement between MDiv and MSMus students. Three key courses are identified by informants: 1) *Worship I: Foundations of Christian Public Worship*, 2) *Toronto School of Theology Choir*, and 3) *Worship Team Practicum*. First, *Worship I: Foundations of Christian Public Worship* is a mandatory designated first-year liturgy course for both MDiv and MSMus programs. Music is incorporated into the course through practical training and participation in worship. Second, the *Toronto School of Theology Choir* is mandatory for MSMus students during any one year of study but is not mandatory for MDiv students at Emmanuel. The choir performs at TST chapel services and other community events at the University of Toronto and in the broader community. According to Informant 17, the application of music during liturgy is often discussed during weekly rehearsals, through course assignments, or during performances at Emmanuel's chapel. Lastly, *Worship Team Practicum* allows students from both programs to engage with music during the preparation for weekly chapel services.

According to the course's syllabus, students work with the "other student members of the Worship Team, the Director of Chapel, and the Faculty Advisor to the Worship Team," in order to, "engage in collaborative oversight, planning, leadership and evaluation of Tuesday and Thursday Midday Prayer services, Wednesday services of worship, and other occasional services, using United Church of Canada, ecumenical, intercultural and interfaith liturgical and music resources" (Toronto School of Theology 2020).

Wycliffe College

The seminary at Wycliffe College offers in-classroom music education in conjunction with Trinity College. A single session practicum "Sing the Offices," is mandatory for Wycliffe's MDiv students as part of the designated second-year mandatory course *The History, Theology, and Practice of Anglican Liturgy* (Wycliffe College 2018). This practicum is instructed by a revolving series of guest lecturers who are professional liturgical musicians. Musical responses, psalm tones, and incipits for clergy are some of the musical topics that informants indicate are discussed and practiced during the practicum. Prior to 2017, Wycliffe's liturgical instruction was distributed over a three-year course titled *Principles and Practices of Liturgy* (PPOL). However, PPOL provided the same single sacred music practicum that is currently offered. Some Wycliffe chapel services are accompanied by music, including worship bands, weekly morning worship services accompanied by a non-seminarian organist, and solo singing for evening services. However, aside from morning services, which are led by a professional or non-seminarian student organist, music at Wycliffe's chapel is organized through student-led initiatives.

Tyndale University and Seminary

Tyndale University and Seminary offers in-classroom music education as part of its MDiv program. The seminary's mandatory liturgy course, *Worship and Liturgy*, includes lectures that fully or partially involve music. These lectures, which are instructed by the primary non-music faculty course instructor, encourage engagement between music and worship through: 1) a historical overview of traditional Protestant and contemporary evangelical music traditions and 2) discussions on music appreciation as part of worship. Lastly, the seminary, according to Informant 20, intentionally does not provide practical musical training in a particular liturgical tradition because of the diverse denominational background of its seminarians.

St. Philip's Seminary

St. Philip's Seminary offers music education as part of the formation process. Music education at the seminary is determined on an individualized basis and upon entry to the program, seminarians meet with St. Philip's Director of Music to determine their course of musical instruction. This instruction takes into consideration the student's musical interests and musical abilities within the context of their ordination requirements. Informant 1 indicates that the seminary does not outline a single course of musical instruction since the seminary represents a variety of dioceses and religious orders. However, St. Philip's music education, adhering to the Pre-Vatican II Roman Rite, emphasizes the preparation of seminarians to become "singing celebrants."²⁷ This education, which is received either through private instruction with the seminary's music director or through participation in the seminary's Schola,

²⁷ Singing Celebrants: Leaders of worship who are participating in the performance of music during liturgy either as an independent singer or as a leader of music with congregational participation.

emphasizes students' ability to understand and perform chant notation during the liturgy's sung Graduals, Epistles, Intonations, etc.

Despite the diversity of student enrollment, however, three main student demographics emerge that impact the form of music education that is widely received. First, seminarians who are intended for diocesan ordination receive basic vocal instruction, i.e. solfège training and other rudimentary singing skills, which will prepare them as singing celebrants within their respective diocese. Second, seminarians who seek to become members of the Toronto Oratory, or any other Oratory around the world, receive a more advanced private vocal instruction during their novitiate.²⁸ Informant 1 further indicates that seminarians who are intending to join an external Oratory outside of Toronto, in addition to the academic and formation requirements of Toronto's Oratory, might receive additional music education requirements from their Oratory's Novice Master or Mistress.²⁹ The third and final primary seminarian demographic at St. Philip's are the Norbertines of St. Michael's Abbey, California. These seminarians, who are seeking entry into the Order of Canons Regular of Prémontré, engage in the regular performance of chant as part of the formation process. These seminarians participate in two main forms of chant performance: 1) as part of daily chapel services that are intended only for Norbertine's and 2) through participation in St. Philip's Schola. St. Philip's

²⁸ Novitiate: a period of training and preparation that a Christian prospective monastic, apostolic, or member of a religious order undergoes prior to taking vows. The canonical time of the novitiate is one year with a possible one-year extension. During this time, these individuals known as novices often undergo intense study and prayer, live in community, and deepen their relationship with God and awareness of themselves.

²⁹ Novice Master or Mistress: a member of a monastic, apostolic, or religious order community responsible for the training of all novices.

Schola is the primary performance opportunity for seminarians through weekly rehearsals and performances at Holy Family Catholic Church. The Schola is an auditioned ensemble that is comprised predominantly of Norbertines due to their education at St. Michael's Abbey, which emphasizes the performance of chant. During Schola rehearsals, according to Informant 1, the Director of Music regularly discusses the role of music in liturgy and the historical development of chant in relation to the development of Catholic liturgical practices.

Lastly, diocesan and Oratorian seminarians become sub-deacons towards the end of their degrees, which involves chanting during services at Holy Family Catholic Church. Seminarians who have progressed to becoming sub-deacons often only receive private vocal instruction when complex chants, such as the Good Friday Intercessions or the Sung Passion, require additional training from what is provided during previous private instruction, Schola rehearsals, or experienced through congregational participation.

Knox College

The seminary at Knox College does not offer in-classroom music education or music education as part of the formation process. Two second-year elective music courses appear in Knox's course syllabus: 1) *Music and Spirituality* – a musical survey with an emphasis on congregational song, and 2) *Worship Practicum* – an instructor-led practicum that covers various forms of worship that combine liturgy and music. Both courses are currently not offered, which according to Informant 15, is due to financial constraints and a drop in course enrollment. Music education, however, was mandatory for seminarians and experienced growth from 1976-2009 during Associate Professor John Derksen's tenure. During this time,

Knox offered a mandatory second-year music course for seminarians on hymnology. The course provided a historical overview of hymnody, as well as instruction on how to select hymns, navigate hymnals, and foster professional relations with musicians. During the 1990s, the course was attempted as a joint music and liturgy course; however, the attempt was unsuccessful and ended after one year. Eventually the course was given the title *Music and Spirituality* and began to incorporate music from the Presbyterian Church's growing evangelical movement. Following Derksen's retirement, *Music and Spirituality* became an elective and the interdisciplinary *Worship Practicum* was introduced.

Musical participation is currently limited at Knox to chapel services and does not include regular seminarian involvement in either musical planning or performance. Instead, music at services is led by the seminary's Director of Music. Informant 15 indicates that, despite the current lack of music education and performance opportunities, students still demonstrate an interest in music at Knox.

Regis College

The seminary at Regis College does not offer in-classroom music education or music education as part of the formation process. Students are given the opportunity to musically perform during Wednesday chapel services; however, this is a student-led initiative that incorporates both Regis seminarians and other members of the community. Informant 5 indicates that music for Wednesday chapel is coordinated by students and includes either a small student choir or student soloist(s). Hymns, Mass Offertory and Proper, and occasionally

solo motets are some examples of music that is performed by the choir when they are present during services.

St. Michael's College

The seminary at St. Michael's College does not offer in-classroom music education or music education as part of the formation process. Informant 18 indicates that music is present in weekly chapel services through student-led initiatives and through a Schola that is made available to students but is not exclusively for seminarians. The informant also indicates that students who are interested in receiving a music education are encouraged to enrol in courses at Emmanuel College.

Musical Skills in Seminary Education (Quantity)

Section 2, Question 4, establishes five practical skills that are deemed relevant to an effective understanding and use of music during ordained ministry.

- 4) Does the seminary program prepare students in the following areas? Please answer 'Yes' or 'No' for each and provide examples where applicable.
- a) Becoming a singing celebrant Yes_____ No_____
 - b) The theory (or role) of music in the liturgy Yes_____ No_____
 - c) Historical awareness of music in the Church Yes_____ No_____
 - d) Music literacy (i.e. ability to read and communicate in either Western Classical, plainchant or other musical notation systems) Yes_____ No_____
 - e) The training of the future priest to interact with musicians and the parish music program Yes_____ No_____

This list of skills is informed by a survey on musical training in US Catholic seminaries by Fr. Virgil Funk (Sorgie 1989). For this multid denominational study, however, Fr. Funk's survey has been adapted to include skills that are relevant to both Catholic and Protestant ecclesiastical

traditions. The data includes responses from the eighteen informants who participated in interviews where the relevant questionnaire was completed (see Appendices B, C, and D). Tables 1 and 3 provide descriptive statistics for the frequency of 'Yes' and 'No' responses from Questions 4 and 5 (see Appendices G and I). Pearson correlation analyses (Tables 2, 4 and 5, see Appendices H, J, and K) are also used to determine any positively related correlation coefficients between variables. Simply stated, these tests are used in the study to determine whether the variables (i.e. responses to Questions 4 and 5) have any statistical association, whereby as one variable increases, the other increases by a proportionate amount.³⁰ For example, Table 2 (see Appendix H) states that as 'Yes' responses increase for Question 4a, so too do 'Yes' responses increase for Question 4d.

Responses to Section 2, Question 4, indicate that 61% of seminary music programs educate their students as singing celebrants, in the theory (or role) of music in the context of liturgy, and in the musical history of the Church. Only 39% of informants acknowledge that their seminary provides training in music literacy and an equal 50% acknowledge that seminarians are prepared to interact with musicians and parish music programs once ordained. Correlation analysis also determines that there is a relationship among the different musical skills present in a seminarian's education. First, seminaries that train students as singing celebrants statistically also provide an education in music literacy. Second, seminaries that provide an education on the theory (or role) of music in the context of liturgy also educate their

³⁰ The Pearson correlation coefficient, r , can take a range of values from +1 to -1. A value of 0 indicates that there is no association between the two variables. A value greater than 0 indicates a positive association; that is, as the value of one variable increases, so does the value of the other variable. A value less than 0 indicates a negative association; that is, as the value of one variable increases, the value of the other variable decreases (Field 2013).

seminarians on the musical history of the Church. Lastly, the education of a seminarian to interact with musicians once ordained does not have a significant correlation between any other musical skill included in this study.

Musical Skills in Seminary Education (Quality)

Section 2, Question 5, re-establishes the five practical skills from Question 4 to determine the perceived effectiveness of those skills in seminarians' music education.

5) Rate the effectiveness of each of the areas discussed in Question 4.

	Not effective	Somewhat effective	Effective	Very effective
a) Becoming a singing celebrant	1	2	3	4
b) The theory (or role) of music in the liturgy	1	2	3	4
c) Historical awareness of music in the Church	1	2	3	4
d) Music literacy (i.e. ability to read and communicate in either Western Classical, plainchant or other musical notation systems)	1	2	3	4
e) The training of the future priest to interact with musicians and the parish music program	1	2	3	4

Responses can be generally categorized into greater effectiveness (Effective or Very effective) and lesser effectiveness (Somewhat effective or Not effective). Approximately 56% of informants indicated a lesser effectiveness for Questions 5a, 5b and 5c, 72% indicated a lesser effectiveness for Question 5d, and 61% indicated a lesser effectiveness for Question 5e. Overall, informants indicated that the education of musical skills at their seminary is either somewhat effective or not effective. Correlations from Question 5 (Table 5, see Appendix J) once again

state that there is a significant correlation between seminaries that provide both an effective education on the theory (or role) of music in the context of liturgy, and also educate their seminarians on the musical history of the Church. Statistics did not indicate a correlation between the training of seminarians as singing celebrants and an education in music literacy; however, a new correlation emerges between seminaries that provide an effective liturgical music history education and the provision of an effective education that prepares seminarians to interact with musicians and parish music programs.

The final Pearson correlation compares responses to Questions 4 and 5 (see Appendix K). There are significant correlations between corresponding skills in both questions (i.e. the presence, or lack thereof, of each skill corresponds to its effectiveness). Correlations continue between seminaries that train students as singing celebrants and the provision of an education in music literacy, as well as seminaries that provide an education on the theory (or role) of music in the context of liturgy and the provision of an education on the musical history of the Church.

Music Beyond the Seminary

Interviews concluded with three questions that addressed cross institutional and denominational awareness of music practices, as well as suggestions for the future of music education. Of the eighteen informants who completed the full interview questionnaire, ten indicated some awareness of music education practices at other seminaries, while eight indicated no awareness or a significantly limited awareness. Informants associated with Catholic seminaries acknowledged a greater awareness of music education practices at other

Catholic seminaries, including St. Peter's Seminary in London, Ontario. Of the informants representing TST affiliated seminaries, five informants indicated an awareness of music education practices at other TST seminaries, with all including Emmanuel College as an available source of music education.

Informants, when asked if musical practices in other denominations differ from their denomination's, all responded 'Yes'. Two themes emerge in informant responses. First, a difference between the nature and practice of music in worship between Catholic and Protestant traditions was indicated by nine out of eighteen informants. This differentiates the nature of music in Catholic worship as a function of liturgy, and an extension of liturgical text in sung form, and the nature of music in Protestant worship as a tradition of participatory congregational music. Informant 7 indicates that this difference is due to the inherently non-liturgical worship traditions of contemporary Protestantism, except for the Anglican Oxford Movement tradition, according to Informant 19. Second, four informants indicate similarities in denominations either because of the universal existence of a music tradition in all denominations, with Informant 14 indicating the universal presence of congregational song, or because of similarities in music practices in "high or low church"³¹ liturgical traditions across differing denominations.

Finally, informants were asked to indicate if they believe that musical training at their seminary should change in future, and if so, how. Fifteen informants indicate 'Yes' and three

³¹ Terms used predominantly in the Anglican Church to denote the adherence to traditional church government, the sacraments, and liturgical worship – High Church – or deemphasis on traditional church government, the sacraments, and liturgical worship – Low Church.

indicate 'No'. Of the fifteen informants who indicate 'Yes', all suggested an increase in the quantity of education with the majority indicating that increased education should take place during the formation process. Two common suggestions for improved education emerge among the responses. First, informants suggest that a greater education focused on the role of music and liturgy could be included. Second, informants expressed the potential benefits of a systematic approach to music education across all years of study, beginning with the theoretical and historical role of music and ending with specialized practical training. Lastly, of the three informants who indicate No, each who represent different seminaries, all give differing reasons why their seminary either provides an effective music education, or that any necessary music education can be obtained from other TST programs.

Discussions

Personal Data and Institutional Background

Employment of Music Educators

Music Directors, or equivalent music faculty/staff, are employed at six out of nine seminaries, which corresponds with the majority of MDiv programs that offer music education either in-classroom and/or as part of the formation process.³² The responsibilities of the music educator do not seem to be determined by their institution's denominational affiliation or any other single determining factor. Instead, each institution employs a music educator(s) that provides a unique music education based on the perceived needs of its seminarians. St. Augustine's, for example, employs a director of music, who in conjunction with other faculty members, is involved in the development and implementation of music curriculum, and provides musical performances for chapel services. Alternatively, St. Philip's, a Catholic seminary equally intent on training seminarians as "singing celebrants," employs a director of music who is primarily responsible for providing musical performances for the seminary's affiliated church services. The director of music at St. Philip's does provide musical training for the seminarians, however, the extent of this education does not seem to be determined by the liturgical tradition that is represented.

Trinity and Wycliffe also represent a comparison of the same denomination, which in this case differs as either a mainline or evangelical tradition. This difference in tradition appears

³² Wycliffe College has been omitted, as their chapel musician, who is contract staff, is not mandated to provide music education or coordinate music beyond their solo performances.

to have resulted in the increased presence of music education at Trinity, with an emphasis on the “singing celebrant”; however, the lack of music education at Wycliffe cannot be attributed solely to its evangelical tradition. Tyndale College, as the largest evangelical seminary in Toronto by student population, does offer in-classroom music education to a greater extent than Wycliffe. In addition, the seminary’s chapel services are interconnected with their undergraduate music program that, despite not implicitly involving seminarians, is a significant musical resource at the seminary. This conclusion corresponds with Aleshire’s research, which determined that institutional adherence to mainline or evangelical traditions was not a determining factor in the presence of music education at nine American and Canadian seminaries (Aleshire 2005).

Lastly, the employment of a music educator, all of whom are professionally trained liturgical musicians, is significant when compared to other studies on seminary music education. This contrasts with Sorgie’s findings that music educators in most seminaries were not trained in the field of liturgical music (Sorgie 1989, 93). Sorgie’s results supported his assumption that music was not being trained by experts, and therefore there was a lack of quality in music education despite a high quantity of music educators. This study, however, has determined that the qualifications of seminarian music educators does not impact the quality of music education being provided in Toronto. Instead, this study shows that it is the quantity of music education, i.e. the extent to which faculty/staff are mandated to provide music education, that is the most significant indicator of quality. Statistics from Table 6 (see Appendix K) demonstrate that there is a correlation between the presence of a musical skill in a seminarian’s education and the effectiveness of that skill’s education. Furthermore, indications

from faculty/staff and student informants at Trinity, Wycliffe, and Tyndale support these statistics as informants acknowledge that the overall time afforded to music education impacts the presence of a musical skill's education and its effectiveness, i.e. quality.

Programs Offered and Degree Requirements

Two unexpected results, relating to mandatory residency and the coexistence of music degrees within the seminary, were found when comparing programs' academic structures and degree requirements. Comparisons between course structures, degree lengths, and residency requirements demonstrated a potential effect on music education, but ultimately did not provide a universal correlation between these factors and the quantity of music education for seminarians.

Mandatory residency, which was anticipated to be a potential indicator of increased music education and performance opportunities, does not seem to be a determining factor in seminarians' music education. Of the four seminaries that require residency, those being the four Catholic seminaries, each institution has varying degrees in the quantity of music education that is offered. St. Augustine's and St. Philip's, for example, do offer a more comprehensive music education, which informants indicate is partly due to mandatory residency and daily participation in chapel services - either as choristers, cantors, or congregants. However, Regis' and St. Michael's mandatory residency is not seen by informants as a significant factor in music education. Furthermore, informants from Emmanuel and Trinity College acknowledge that music education is present during in-classroom and/or formation process instruction despite a lack of mandatory residency.

The co-existence of both an MDiv and separate liturgical music degree was also an unanticipated factor in the music education provided to seminarians. Emmanuel College, which houses both its MDiv and MMus programs, integrates the two graduate programs in both musical and liturgical studies. The extent to which seminarians and MSMus students musically engaged was unanticipated in both the in-classroom education and the overall camaraderie that is fostered by Emmanuel College. Comparatively, Tyndale offers both an MDiv and undergraduate liturgical music program; however, the two programs do not appear to be integrated. The difference between Emmanuel and Tyndale could be caused by the distinction between graduate and undergraduate program compatibility. However, the presence of a liturgical music degree at the same institution does not seem to universally inform seminarian music education.

Formal and Informal Music Education at the Seminary

In-classroom Education vs Formation Process

Information for “Results” has been compiled into Table 1, demonstrating characteristics of seminarian music education at each seminary either during in-classroom or formation process education.

Table 1: *Comparisons of Music Education Based on Qualitative Case Studies*

	St. Augustine's	Trinity	Emmanuel	Wycliffe	Tyndale	St. Philip's	Knox	Regis	St. Michael's
Lectures on Music	FP & IC*	IC*	IC*	IC*	IC*				
Private Music Instruction	FP*	FP**				FP*			

Organization and/or Performance of Music in Worship Services	FP*	FP*	IC**			FP*
Intentional Inclusion of Seminarians in a Musical Ensemble (Choir, Schola, Worship band, etc.) not Including Student Initiatives	FP (Choir)*		IC ** (Choir)			FP ** (Schola)
Music Training as a Performance Skill	FP*	FP*				FP*
Musical Training not as a Performance Skill	FP*	FP*	IC*	IC*	IC*	FP*
Engagement with an External Music Program			IC*			

FP = Formation Process, IC = In-classroom

* Mandatory

**Optional

When comparing the characteristics of seminarian music education at each seminary, four main results emerged as significant. First, the approach to music education is clearly defined by each institution as either predominantly in-classroom or formation process education. Of the twenty-six instances of music education that are indicated in Table 1, 58% were formation process education and 42% were in-classroom education. Second, private music instruction, seminarians' organization and/or performance of music in worship services, music training as a performance skill, and music training not as a performance skill are all characteristics in the three seminaries where the formation process is the predominant or exclusive means of music education. Comparatively, lectures on music and musical training not as a performance skill are all characteristics of seminarian music education in the three seminaries where music education is exclusively in-classroom. Third, when comparing the denominational tradition of the seminaries that displayed any characteristics of music

education, there is a distinction between Catholic, or Catholic influenced seminaries (St. Augustine's, St. Philip's, and Trinity), and evangelical or ecumenical Protestant seminaries (Emmanuel, Wycliffe, and Tyndale). The latter predominantly uses formation process education, while the former exclusively uses in-classroom education. Lastly, the formation process is most prominent in three out of the four seminaries that demonstrate the most comprehensive music education. St. Augustine's, Trinity, and St. Philip's, who all provide a music education that is predominantly or exclusively in the formation process, all represent denominations where the ecclesiastical tradition involves singing by Eucharistic celebrants and liturgical form(s) that incorporate both liturgical and congregational music. The exception, Emmanuel, has a comparable, and in certain instances more comprehensive, music education that emphasizes the historical, theoretical, and administrative responsibilities of ordained ministers through in-classroom education.

There also appears to be inherent benefits and drawbacks from the use of either in-classroom or formation process music education in the context of an ecclesiastical tradition. The Catholic formation process displays a greater benefit to seminarians who require regular music performance training and performance opportunities. Alternatively, in-classroom education seems to provide greater benefits to seminarians whose ecclesiastical tradition acknowledges the importance of music during worship but does not require them to sing. The in-classroom music education method also appears to benefit seminarians who are associated with the TST. According to informants, students from multiple TST seminaries are made aware and enroll in Emmanuel's music courses when their seminary offers a limited or non-existent music education. However, as music courses in the TST are limited to Emmanuel, it could be

suggested that if multiple seminaries, representing both Catholic and Protestant traditions, were to provide weighted courses in music education, then the joint benefits of the TST's consortium could provide a network of music education that would benefit a wider demographic of seminarians.

Drawbacks of either in-classroom or formation process music education were limited, but in some instances, informants did acknowledge the potential for a lessened music education. First, in response to Section 2, Questions 4 and 5, Informant 9 (St. Augustine's Seminary) and Informant 12 (Trinity College Seminary) both addressed the inherent lack of participatory enforcement that can be afforded during the formation process. In both instances, the informants indicated that student involvement in the formation process can be omitted given that, unlike mandatory courses and practicums, the formation process is not a prerequisite towards degree completion. In comparison, Emmanuel's *Worship Team* regulates student participation in music education pertaining to chapel services. *Worship Team*, however, as an elective, does not ensure student participation for all students. Therefore, St. Augustine's and Trinity's approach, which requires students to opt-out of chapel participation, does not seem to include or exclude student participation in chapel relative to Emmanuel's approach, which requires students to opt-in to the same participation.

Finally, Tyndale, which is neither associated with the TST nor affiliated with a particular denomination, is a unique example of the seminary model that originated as a bible college. With its continuing growth as a mainline university, Tyndale now offers two liturgical music programs at the undergraduate level. The programs, Bachelor of Arts in Music Performance and Bachelor of Arts in Worship Arts, are designed for students interested in worship music with

core courses both in music and religious studies. However, unlike Emmanuel's MSMus program, students from Tyndale's music programs do not engage with seminarians in joint courses or in the formation process. Tyndale's separate seminarian and university-wide chapel services also offer music; however, seminarians' participation is not required. Instead, chapel services are planned by the chapel planning committee, which includes students, in consultation with the Dean of Students and Tyndale's music faculty, Dr. Melissa Davis and Ken Michell. Finally, the music education that is offered during the liturgy course *Worship and Liturgy*, is not instructed by the seminary's music staff.

Musical Skills in Seminary Education (Quantity)

Responses to the five practical skills that are deemed relevant to an effective understanding and use of music during ordained ministry produced connecting results between the Descriptive and Comparative Analyses. The predominantly 'Yes' responses to Section 2, Question 4, demonstrated that seminarians, in the context of their denomination's musical tradition, acknowledged the presence of most musical skills that they require. The skill of becoming a "singing celebrant" was responded to as 'Yes' by most informants; however, Protestant seminarians, with the exclusion of seminarians from Trinity, tended to respond 'No'. Informants 3 and 4, for example, indicated that becoming a singing celebrant is not a component of the United Church tradition. Ministers might be expected to instruct and lead congregations in song, which is briefly addressed in *Songs of the Church*; however, ministers are not expected to perform individually as, for example, is part of the Catholic tradition. Comparatively, the predominantly 'No' responses to Question 4d were unexpected given the question's significant correlation to Question 4a (Table 2, see Appendix H). In analysis,

Questions 4a and 4d had a significant correlation despite the opposing frequency of responses. It could be anticipated that both questions would receive a similar response in Section 2, Question 4, as the education of ecclesiastical singing has historically been provided through written notation. However, informants at Protestant seminaries where singing does occur in their music education – Trinity and Emmanuel³³ – elaborated that a minimum prior knowledge of music literacy is assumed in the music education of those seminaries, despite a lack of education on music literacy. This could, therefore, account for the different frequency of responses to Section 2, Questions 4a and 4d, despite their statistical correlation.

The second significant correlation in Section 2, Question 4, occurred between Questions 4b and 4c. This correlation does not appear to hold any relationship to the descriptive analysis in Table 1; however, informant elaborations acknowledged that when Questions 4b and 4c are both present in a seminarian's music education, it is either because of the lack of an ecclesiastical singing tradition, or because of an ecclesiastical singing tradition that is informed by liturgical and historical implications. Lastly, Question 4e produced an equal frequency of 'Yes' or 'No' responses and a significant correlation with Question 4b. Besides Emmanuel, which is the only institution to include Question 4e in their intended music education, the correlation present between Questions 4b and 4e does not appear to have an apparent association with any particular denomination or approach to music education, according to informants' responses.

³³ Student informants at Emmanuel acknowledge that singing is not a significant component of their music education, however, it is still encountered during their in-classroom education.

Musical Skills in Seminary Education (Quality)

The overall lack of effectiveness in seminarian music education appears to be counter to the overall positive responses that were indicated in Section 2, Question 4. However, this perceived lack of effectiveness is not unfounded. For example, Informants 3 and 4, who indicated that clergy are not often expected to sing in the United Church, describe a situation where informants could indicate the presence of a musical skill, but would rate its minimum presence in their education as less effective. Informant 19, who indicated the presence of vocal training in their seminary's education, but rated it as 'not effective', is another example of both a positive and negative response to the same musical skill. According to the informant, seminarians at Trinity receive extensive musical training as Officiants of the Office, but do not receive training as celebrants of Eucharistic worship. Therefore, the informant provided a 'not effective' response because, in the context of this study, seminarians are not prepared to become singing celebrants as a distinguishing characteristic of ordained ministry.³⁴

Pearson correlations between Section 2, Questions 4 and 5, also provide further evidence of a connection between the quantity of music education provided and its perceived quality. Comparisons between responses in Section 2, Questions 4 and 5 (Appendix F), demonstrate that 'No' responses from Section 2, Question 4, often elicited a 'not effective' response from informants, while a 'Yes' response often elicited a 'somewhat effective', 'effective', or 'very effective' response. Informants, both faculty/staff and seminarians, therefore, perceived a higher effectiveness of music education when a musical skill was present

³⁴ The Anglican Church does not require an Officiant of the Office to be ordained.

in students' curriculum. Furthermore, a music curriculum – particularly at Emmanuel and St. Augustine's – that addressed a skill over an extended period (i.e. for greater than one lecture or more regularly in the formation process), ranked greater in effectiveness overall. A comparative example is found at Trinity, where three out of five informants responded 'Yes' to multiple skills in Section 2, Question 4, but ranked the effectiveness of those same skills as relatively low. Informants from Trinity indicated that multiple skills are addressed in the lecture "Sing the Offices"; however, aside from becoming a singing celebrant, the education of other musical skills is relatively limited in the seminary's formation processes.

Catholic and High Anglican Seminaries

Similarities in the method of music education became apparent between the two Catholic seminaries, St. Augustine's and St. Philip's, and the Protestant seminary, Trinity. Music education as part of the formation process was most present in these three institutions through multiple music educators, regular musical involvement by seminarians in chapel services, and the intention to train seminarians as singing celebrants. Trinity, as a representation of the High Anglican tradition, does not unexpectedly demonstrate Catholic tendencies towards music education, given the historically Catholic influence in the Anglican Church. This influence in Trinity's High Anglican and Anglo-Catholic traditions emphasizes both Catholic liturgical and Protestant congregational mindsets towards music in worship.

Multiple music educators are employed at the three seminaries; however, each institution has a different academic structure and mandate for its music educators. Responses to Section 2, Question 7, acknowledge that the seminaries employ a primary director of music

and a secondary faculty member who provides music instruction among other responsibilities. Music performances for worship services are the primary mandate for Music Directors at all three seminaries. Music Directors at St. Augustine's and Trinity are responsible for providing music at multiple weekly seminary chapel services, while St. Philip's Music Director is responsible for music at multiple weekly services that are not seminary chapel services. The role of St. Philip's director of music differs from the others, perhaps because of the institutional structure to which the seminary belongs. St. Philip's Seminary, which is not an independent diocesan seminary, is part of The Oratory of St. Philip (a global collective of autonomous communities that are self governing and guided by the principles of their founding patron, St. Philip Neri). Members of the Oratory, Oratorians, are subsequently administrators of St. Philip's Seminary and its two affiliate parishes. For this reason, St. Philip's does not have an independent Music Director, but instead the director of music for the Oratory is responsible for music at the Oratory, Seminary, and its main affiliate parish, Holy Family Catholic Church. According to Informant 1, only 25% of the Music Director's employment at the Oratory is therefore allocated towards seminary education. Comparatively, St. Augustine's director of music is employed for the primary purposes of providing music for seminarian chapel services and seminarian music education. Secondary music educators, comparatively, differ at each seminary in their mandates to provide music education in relation to their primary employment. St. Augustine's Vice-Rector & Director of Liturgy provides music lectures that address numerous musical topics over a series of years; Brothers of the Oratory provide musical instruction to seminarians at St. Philip's, including the Academic Dean, who trains seminarians in the singing of Compline; and Trinity's Chaplain provides musical instruction in the singing and

organization of the Offices, which some informants describe as the most significant music education at the seminary. The musical skills addressed by these secondary music educators, therefore, differs depending on whether they provide practical or theoretical music education as part of chapel instruction, lectures, or elsewhere in the formation process.

Music Beyond the Seminary

Awareness of music education at other seminaries was limited among informants. Catholic seminaries, whether TST-affiliated or not, described some awareness of education at other Catholic seminaries even beyond Toronto. Informants at Protestant seminaries acknowledged a limited or non-existent awareness of music education in other seminaries. Emmanuel College's music education, especially the course *Songs of the Church* and the TST Choir, was the only music education acknowledged by multiple informants. Music education is therefore promoted successfully in the TST in courses that are available for seminarians who seek further music education. What the TST is not particularly successful in is promoting an awareness of formation process music education and music as part of worship practices at other seminaries.

All informants agreed that in practice, and in most instances theory, music is different in each denomination. However, two student informants from Trinity considered potential similarities across denominations. These similarities recognized the generalized inclusion of singing celebrants, the use of organ, piano, and/or choir and the use of song forms such as hymnody, psalmody, and liturgical music in High Church traditions. Comparatively, Low Church liturgical traditions, most often referred to as evangelical traditions, can share similarities in the

lack of musical participation by ministers, the use of worship bands in the place of more traditional instrumentation, and the use of contemporary song styles. This further emphasizes that if music resources were to be shared among seminaries, then curricula could be developed that address similarities in music traditions among differing denominations.

Finally, a consensus by informants indicated that an increased quantity of music education would benefit seminarians. A desire to better understand the purpose and practical use of music during worship was apparent from student informants. However, most informants did not suggest that a weighted course in music should be created, instead suggesting that the formation process should provide a more substantial music education. Given that several informants referred to the success of Emmanuel's music education, it is curious that most were not interested in replicating the weighted course approach in their seminary.

Conclusion

Results conclude that the majority of informants believe that a greater quantity, and therefore quality, of music education should be provided to seminarians seeking ordination. Despite the current presence of both in-classroom music education and music education as part of the formation process, the majority of informants indicated that music education would be most effective as part of the formation process. Currently, however, the quantity and method of education at each seminary differs between institutions, with music programs either predominantly or exclusively using either in-classroom or formation process education. The seven seminaries that belong to the Toronto School of Theology also appear to benefit from the collaborative system that allows all seminarians to enroll in music courses that are offered at any seminary. This course offering, however, is limited to Emmanuel College, which is the only seminary to offer weighted courses on liturgical music for ordained ministers.

Catholic and Protestant seminaries also represent a well-defined difference between the content and method of music education that supports their musical and liturgical traditions. St. Augustine's, St. Philip's, and Trinity College Seminary all offer a music education that focuses on music as a function of liturgical action and congregational participation. Therefore, Catholic and High Anglican seminaries in Toronto provide an education, predominantly as part of the formation process, that incorporates both a historical awareness and an ability to perform music of the liturgy (i.e. graduals, responses, incipits, etc.), as well as music for congregational participation (i.e. hymns and psalms). This education, to varying extents, is accompanied by lectures and discussions on music appreciation as historical significance, the function of music during worship for practical purposes, and the regular training and performance of sung music.

Alternatively, the historical and practical use of hymnody and psalmody are the primary foci of Protestant seminaries. This again corresponds with each seminary's Protestant ecclesiastical and worship tradition. Emmanuel, as the Protestant seminary with the most comprehensive music education, emphasizes the history and role of congregational song, as well as the administrative responsibility that ministers have for music. This entire education, which is provided exclusively through in-classroom instruction, is structured to provide a more complete understanding of ministerial leadership in all its musical and non-musical forms.

Emmanuel's attitude towards music as a fundamental component of a seminarian's education is unique among Toronto's Protestant seminaries.³⁵ The majority of Protestant seminaries in this study either provide a limited or non-existent music education that is acknowledged both by informants and supporting secondary research. Daniel Hansen's research, paradoxically on the United Church, is indicative of a common Protestant perspective that church musicians exist as the sole authorities on liturgical music. Joseph Dyer also makes similar claims that the education of liturgical musicians, with no mention of clergy, is the key to increasing the quality of music that is produced during worship. Lastly, informants also expressed that Protestants, especially in evangelical traditions, believe that preachers and musicians are separate entities within worship. Informant 20, for example, described how seminarians at Tyndale often do not acknowledge the necessity for music in their studies because of the common belief that music during worship is the responsibility of the church's

³⁵ Though Emmanuel demonstrates progress in the music education of ministers, the United Church, despite including musicians as ministers in *Congregational Designated Ministers* (2020), currently does not make mention in governance documents, such as *The Manual* (2020), or the documents, such as *Admission to the Order of Ministry Policy and Procedures* (2019), of the music training and procedures of clergy.

music leadership. These opinions, though not entirely inaccurate, fail to recognize the necessity for musical leadership in clergy as they are the administrators of churches and primary authorities on worship.

St. Augustine's, Emmanuel, Trinity, and St. Philip's exemplify the implementation of a seminary music education that is attempting to provide students with the skills necessary for ordained ministry. These seminaries all demonstrated the highest quantity of music education provided to their seminarians. Furthermore, qualitative and quantitative analyses drew correlations between the presence of music education at all nine seminaries and the perceived effectiveness of that education among seminarians and faculty/staff members. Significant correlations were drawn between the education of seminarians as singing celebrants and the training of music literacy. Alternatively, the role of music in liturgy and historical awareness of music in the Church had significant correlations in their presence and effectiveness within seminarians' music education. These correlations conclude that the increased quantity of music education provided to seminarians is an indicator of a perceived quality of educational effectiveness across a series of musical skills that ordained ministers utilize in Protestant and Catholic ecclesiastical traditions.

Improving the effectiveness of music education for seminarians by increasing the quantity of time afforded to music education might seem overly commonsensical. However, in the current academic environment of budgetary constraints and overly crowded seminary curricula, the time afforded for a musical skill's basic education could produce significant results in the overall perception of a seminarian's education. This is not to suggest that seminaries should strive for the bare minimum of time afforded to musical instruction. Instead, it suggests

that the mere presence of these skills, often addressed by informants as necessary for the work of an ordained minister, can lead to an increased perception of a student's education that only improves when greater time is afforded.

Benefits and Future Research

Conclusions from this research can benefit: 1) legislators of seminarian development, 2) head administrators of seminaries and their assistants in the creation of a liturgical music program in their seminaries, 3) music educators presently working in seminaries, and 4) ordained ministers and directors of church music programs. The fourth beneficiary group is perhaps the most forgotten among pre-existing research; this despite the obvious need for ordained ministers and liturgical musicians to work together in the pursuit of an effective worship practice. Therefore, this research, as the first extensive research on music education in Canadian seminaries, can be used as a model to understand national trends in musical education. And finally, this research has the potential to become an introduction to subsequent studies on the impact that seminarian music education is having on musical practices during Christian worship across North America.

Appendices

Appendix A: *Formula missae* and *Deutsche Messe*

TABLE 1: Luther's Liturgies in Outline

<i>Formula missae</i> (1523)	<i>Deutsche Messe</i> (1526)
Introit	German hymn or psalm
Kyrie (ninefold)	Kyrie (threefold)
Gloria in excelsis Deo	(<i>Allein Gott in der Höh sei Ehr</i>)
Collect	Collect
Epistle	Epistle
Alleluia	
Gradual	
Sequence (but only on major feasts such as Christmas and Pentecost)	
German hymn (Graduallied)	Graduallied: <i>Nun bitten wir</i> or another hymn
Gospel	Gospel
Credo	German hymn: <i>Wir glauben all</i>
Sermon	Sermon
<i>Sursum corda</i>	
Preface	Paraphrase of the Lord's Prayer
<i>Verba testamenti</i>	<i>Verba testamenti</i>
Sanctus and Benedictus	
German hymn	
Lord's Prayer	
Communion	Communion
Agnus Dei	German hymns during Communion, including the German Sanctus (<i>Jesajah dem Propheten das gesachah</i>) and German Agnus Dei (<i>Christe, du Lamm Gottes</i>)
German hymn	
Communion verse	
Collect	Collect
<i>Benedicamus</i>	
Benediction (3 forms)	Benediction (<i>Numbers vi</i>)

Appendix B: Interview Questions for Educators and Staff at Seminaries in Relation to Musical Training

Interviewer: Sebastian Moreno

The goal of this interview is to provide an analysis of music training at seminaries belonging to a variety of Christian denominations in Toronto and the Greater Toronto Area. In this interview, questions will be separated into 3 categories: personal data and institutional background, formal (i.e. classroom) and informal music training at the seminary, and music beyond the seminary. Please answer the following questions as honestly as possible, in the level of detail that you see fit. You are free to skip any question, at any time, without any repercussion.

Personal Data and Institutional Background

Name: _____ Name of Seminary: _____

- 1) Describe your role at the seminary (title or position).
- 2) List the degree programs that are offered at the seminary.
- 3) What are the overall educational requirements for completing each degree program? (i.e. years of study, overall purpose of degree)
- 4) Who outlines curriculum requirements at the seminary? (ex. Council of Bishops, Diocese, Seminary)
- 5) Complete this sentence: music during religious worship is_____.
- 6) Had you received musical training before your involvement at the seminary?
Yes _____ No_____
- 7) If you have received musical training, would you describe this training as:
 - a. Formal
 - b. Informal
 - c. Both formal and informal
- 8) Where did you receive your musical training?
 - a. Private instruction
 - b. Elementary or Secondary School education
 - c. College or University education

- d. Church Choir
- e. Community Choir
- f. Personal study
- g. Other

Formal and informal music education at the seminary

(If a curriculum can be provided for music training, please provide if willing)

6) Is music part of the seminary experience? Yes____ No____

7) Rate the majority of incoming seminarians' interest for musical training.

not interested somewhat interested interested very interested

8) Is music education part of formal (i.e. in class) training? Yes____

No____ Yes/No____ **(if 'No' go to Question 10)**

a. Are these course(s) optional ____or required____?

b. Are they separate from Liturgical Courses? Yes____ No____

c. If separate, is the liturgical application of music discussed in the course?

Yes____ No____

d. In what year(s) are they offered?

ii. 1__ 2__ 3__ 4__

9) Does the seminary program prepare students in the following areas? Please answer 'Yes' or 'No' for each and provide examples where applicable.

f) Becoming a singing celebrant Yes____ No____

g) The theory (or role) of music in the liturgy Yes____ No____

h) Historical awareness of music in the Church Yes____ No____

i) Music literacy (i.e. ability to read and communicate in either Western Classical, plainchant or other musical notation systems) Yes____ No____

j) The training of the future priest to interact with musicians and the parish music program³⁶ Yes____ No____

10) Rate the effectiveness of each of the areas discussed in Question 4.

³⁶ This list is an adaptation on a survey conducted by Fr. Virgil Funk on the topic of musical training in US Catholic seminaries. (Sorgie, Anthony Domenic. 1989. "Music Education in the Major Free-Standing Roman Catholic Seminaries in the United States." Ed.D., United States -- New York: Teachers College, Columbia University.

	Not effective	Somewhat effective	Effective	Very effective
f) Becoming a singing celebrant	1	2	3	4
g) The theory (or role) of music in the liturgy	1	2	3	4
h) Historical awareness of music in the Church	1	2	3	4
i) Music literacy (i.e. ability to read and communicate in either Western Classical, plainchant or other musical notation systems)	1	2	3	4
j) The training of the future priest to interact with musicians and the parish music program	1	2	3	4

11) Is musical training expected or encouraged as part of placement or internship?

Yes____ No____

12) Is there a person(s) responsible for music education at the seminary? Yes____ No____

a. Is the person(s) a trained musician, describe if possible? Yes____ No____

b. Is the person(s) contract staff____, part time faculty____, full time faculty____, or other_____.

13) Does the musical education of seminarians differ depending on different degree streams or associations with orders/other religious affiliations? Yes____ No____

14) What informal musical opportunities are available for students at the seminary?

- a. Choir____
 - b. Schola ____
 - c. Worship band____
 - d. Solo singing as part of liturgy____
 - e. Other____
 - f. N/A____
- 15) Has music training ever been a part of the seminary curriculum? **(If Question 2 was answered 'YES', skip questions 8 -10)**
- YES: When was it removed?
 - NO: What is the history behind this decision?
- 16) Are their educational resources and/or performance opportunities available for seminarians who are independently interested in music training?
- 17) What informal musical opportunities are available for students at the seminary?
- a. Choir____
 - b. Schola ____
 - c. Worship band____
 - d. Solo singing as part of liturgy____
 - e. Other____
 - f. N/A____

Music beyond the seminary

- 1) Are you aware of the music education practices at other seminaries, if so please elaborate?
- 2) Do you believe musical practices in other denominations differs from your denomination's?
- 3) Do you believe music training at your seminary should change in the future, if so how?

Appendix C: Interview Questions for Students at Seminaries in Relation to Musical Training

Interviewer: Sebastian Moreno

The goal of this interview is to provide an analysis of music training at seminaries belonging to a variety of Christian denominations in Toronto and the Greater Toronto Area. In this interview, questions will be separated into 3 categories: personal data and institutional background, formal (i.e. classroom) and informal music training at the seminary, and music beyond the seminary. Please answer the following questions as honestly as possible, in the level of detail that you see fit. You are free to skip any question, at any time, without any repercussion.

Personal Data and Institutional Background

Name: _____ Name of Seminary: _____

- 1) Describe your role at the seminary (title or position).
- 2) List your degree program _____ and your year of study _____.
- 3) What are the overall educational requirements for completing your degree program? (i.e. years of study, overall purpose of degree)
- 4) What motivated you to enter seminary?
- 5) What are the career goals that this degree is helping you to achieve?
- 6) Complete this sentence: music during religious worship is _____.
- 7) Had you received musical training before entering seminary? Yes ____ No ____
- 8) If you have received musical training, would you describe this training as:
 - a. Formal
 - b. Informal
 - c. Both formal and informal
- 9) Where did you receive your musical training?
 - a. Private instruction
 - b. Elementary or Secondary School education
 - c. College or University education
 - d. Church Choir
 - e. Community Choir
 - f. Personal study
 - g. Other

Formal and informal music education at the seminary

(If a curriculum can be provided for music training, please provide if willing)

- 1) Is music part of the seminary experience? Yes____ No____
- 2) Rate the majority of incoming seminarians' interest for musical training.
not interested somewhat interested interested very interested
- 3) Is music education part of formal (i.e. in class) training? Yes____ No____ Yes/No
(if 'No' go to Question 10)
 - a. Are these course(s) optional ____or required____?
 - b. Are they separate from Liturgical Courses? Yes____ No____
 - c. If separate, is the liturgical application of music discussed in the course?
Yes____ No____
 - d. In what year(s) are they offered?
i. 1__ 2__ 3__ 4__
- 4) Does the seminary program prepare students in the following areas? Please answer 'Yes' or 'No' for each and provide examples where applicable.
 - a) Becoming a singing celebrant Yes____ No____
 - b) The theory (or role) of music in the liturgy Yes____ No____
 - c) Historical awareness of music in the Church Yes____ No____
 - d) Music literacy (i.e. ability to read and communicate in either Western Classical, plainchant or other musical notation systems) Yes____ No____
 - e) The training of the future priest to interact with musicians and the parish music program³⁷ Yes____ No____
- 5) Rate the effectiveness of each of the areas discussed in Question 4.

	Not effective	Somewhat effective	Effective	Very effective
a) Becoming a singing celebrant	1	2	3	4

³⁷ This list is an adaptation on a survey conducted by Fr. Virgil Funk on the topic of musical training in US Catholic seminaries. (Sorgie, Anthony Domenic. 1989. "Music Education in the Major Free-Standing Roman Catholic Seminaries in the United States." Ed.D., United States -- New York: Teachers College, Columbia University.

- | | | | | |
|--|---|---|---|---|
| b) The theory (or role) of music in the liturgy | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| c) Historical awareness of music in the Church | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| d) Music literacy (i.e. ability to read and communicate in either Western Classical, plainchant or other musical notation systems) | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| e) The training of the future priest to interact with musicians and the parish music program | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
- 6) Is musical training expected or encouraged as part of placement or internship?
Yes____ No____
- 7) Is there a person(s) responsible for music education at the seminary? Yes____ No____
- a. Is the person(s) a trained musician, describe if possible? Yes____ No____
- b. Is the person(s) contract staff____, part time faculty____, full time faculty____, or other_____.
- 8) Does the musical education of seminarians differ depending on different degree streams or associations with orders/other religious affiliations? Yes____ No____
- 9) What informal musical opportunities are available for students at the seminary?
- | | |
|---------------------|--|
| a. Choir____ | d. Solo singing as part of liturgy____ |
| b. Schola ____ | e. Other____ |
| c. Worship band____ | f. N/A____ |
- 10) Has music training ever been a part of the seminary curriculum? **(If Question 2 was answered 'YES', skip questions 8 -10)**
- YES: When was it removed?
 - NO: What is the history behind this decision?
- 11) Are their educational resources and/or performance opportunities available for seminarians who are independently interested in music training?
- 12) What informal musical opportunities are available for students at the seminary?

- a. Choir____
- b. Schola ____
- c. Worship band____
- d. Solo singing as part of liturgy____
- e. Other____
- f. N/A ____

Music beyond the seminary

- 1) Are you aware of the music education practices at other seminaries, if so please elaborate?
- 2) Do you believe musical practices in other denominations differs from your denomination?
- 3) Do you believe music training at your seminary should change in the future, if so how?

Appendix D: Interview Questions for Master of Sacred Music Students in Relation to Musical Training at Seminaries

Interviewer: Sebastian Moreno

The goal of this interview is to provide an analysis of music training at seminaries belonging to a variety of Christian denominations in Toronto and the Greater Toronto Area. In this interview, questions will be separated into 3 categories: personal data and institutional background, formal (i.e. classroom) and informal music training at the seminary, and music beyond the seminary. Please answer the following questions as honestly as possible, in the level of detail that you see fit. You are free to skip any question, at any time, without any repercussion.

Personal Data and Institutional Background

Name: _____ Name of Seminary: _____

- 1) Describe your role at the seminary (title or position).
- 2) List your degree program _____ and your year of study _____.
- 3) What are the overall educational requirements for completing your degree program? (i.e. years of study, overall purpose of degree)
- 4) What motivated you to enter the Master of Sacred Music program?
- 5) What are the career goals that this degree is helping you to achieve?
- 6) Complete this sentence: music during religious worship is_____.
- 7) Had you received musical training before entering seminary? Yes ____ No____
- 8) If you have received musical training, would you describe this training as:
 - a. Formal
 - b. Informal
 - c. Both formal and informal
- 9) Where did you receive your musical training?
 - a. Private instruction
 - b. Elementary or Secondary School education
 - c. College or University education
 - d. Church Choir
 - e. Community Choir

- f. Personal study
- g. Other

Formal and informal music education at the seminary

(If a curriculum can be provided for music training, please provide if willing)

- 1) Is music part of the seminary experience? Yes____ No____
- 2) Rate the majority of seminarians' interest for musical participation with MSMus students.

not interested somewhat interested interested very interested
- 3) Is joint music education with seminarians' part of formal (i.e. in class) training?
Yes____ No____ Yes/No ____
(if 'No' go to Question 10)
 - a. Are these course(s) optional ____or required____?
 - b. Are they separate from Liturgical Courses? Yes____ No____
 - c. If separate, is the liturgical application of music discussed in the course?
Yes____ No____
 - d. In what year(s) are they offered?
i. 1__ 2__ 3__ 4__
- 4) Does the seminary program prepare students in the following areas? Please answer 'Yes' or 'No' for each and provide examples where applicable.
 - a) Becoming a singing celebrant Yes____ No____
 - b) The theory (or role) of music in the liturgy Yes____ No____
 - c) Historical awareness of music in the Church Yes____ No____
 - d) Music literacy (i.e. ability to read and communicate in either Western Classical, plainchant or other musical notation systems) Yes____ No____
 - e) The training of the future priest to interact with musicians and the parish music program³⁸ Yes____ No____
- 5) Rate the effectiveness of each of the areas discussed in Question 4.

³⁸ This list is an adaptation on a survey conducted by Fr. Virgil Funk on the topic of musical training in US Catholic seminaries. (Sorgie, Anthony Domenic. 1989. "Music Education in the Major Free-Standing Roman Catholic Seminaries in the United States." Ed.D., United States -- New York: Teachers College, Columbia University.

	Not effective	Somewhat effective	Effective	Very effective
a) Becoming a singing celebrant	1	2	3	4
b) The theory (or role) of music in the liturgy	1	2	3	4
c) Historical awareness of music in the Church	1	2	3	4
d) Music literacy (i.e. ability to read and communicate in either Western Classical, plainchant or other musical notation systems)	1	2	3	4
e) The training of the future priest to interact with musicians and the parish music program	1	2	3	4

6) Is musical training expected or encouraged as part of placement or internship?
Yes____ No____

7) Is there a person(s) responsible for music education at the seminary? Yes____ No____

a. Is the person(s) a trained musician, describe if possible? Yes____ No____

b. Is the person(s) contract staff____, part time faculty____, full time faculty____, or other_____.

8) Does the musical education of seminarians differ depending on different degree streams or associations with orders/other religious affiliations? Yes____ No____

9) What informal musical opportunities are available for students at the seminary?

a. Choir____

b. Schola ____

c. Worship band____

d. Solo singing as part of liturgy____

e. Other____

f. N/A____

10) Has music training ever been a part of the seminary curriculum? **(If Question 2 was answered 'YES', skip questions 8 -10)**

- YES: When was it removed?
- NO: What is the history behind this decision?

11) Are their educational resources and/or performance opportunities available for seminarians who are independently interested in music training?

12) What informal musical opportunities are available for students at the seminary?

- a. Choir____
- b. Schola ____
- c. Worship band____
- d. Solo singing as part of liturgy____
- e. Other____
- f. N/A____

Music beyond the seminary

- 1) Are you aware of the music education practices at other seminaries, if so please elaborate?
- 2) Do you believe musical practices in other denominations differs from your denomination's?
- 3) Do you believe music training at your seminary should change in the future, if so how?

Appendix E: St. Augustine's Music Education Curriculum

This is an unofficial summary of the music education curriculum that is currently in place during the formation process at St. Augustine's Seminary. The outline has been provided by Fr. John-Mark Missio, Vice-Rector & Director of Liturgy.

Philosophy years:

- Monthly practical/experiential group training for the seminarians as well as individual cantor coaching. Some general liturgical context of repertoire is discussed in rehearsals.
- 2-hour seminar: introduction to music at RCM Toronto (general history, introduction to the orchestra).

Propaedeutic year:

(Same as above, with addition of)

- 6-hour seminar on history of sacred music (in house).
- Seminar on Catechism of the Catholic Church, which includes c. 30-minute section on sacred music.

Theology years:

- Further practical/experiential group training, now weekly, with individual cantor coaching. General liturgical context of repertoire is discussed in some rehearsals.
- One academic course on liturgy (12 weeks) includes discussion of sacred music in one of the lectures.
- In all years, seminarians learn to chant the liturgy of the hours, as leaders and assistants, as a first step in learning to be singing presiders. Solemn/simple tone for the dialogues, collects, intercessions, etc. are learned and used.
- 4th-year theology: 1-hour seminar on the pastor's role as custodian of sacred art in the parish deals with fostering sacred music from a practical perspective.
- 4th-year theology: 30-minutes practicum in both semesters on all presider chants for priests and deacons. Tones for every part of the liturgy are included (both simple and solemn tones), enabling the priest (deacon) to participate in a full Missa Cantata in English (using the ICEL tones of the Roman Missal). Deacons concentrate on greetings, penitential act, chanted Gospel and Easter Exsultet, and devotions. Includes Christmas & Epiphany proclamations. 2nd semester includes prefaces, the Eucharistic Prayers, and blessings for baptismal and nuptial rites.

At least once a year, and sometimes once a semester, the Mass is chanted in English from beginning to end, and on another occasion in Latin from beginning to end (including readings, prayers of the faithful etc.)

Appendix F: Data Collection from Section 2, Questions 4 and 5

Data collected from responses to Section 2, Questions 4 and 5, from the eighteen informants who completed the entire interview questionnaire.

Institution	4a*	4b*	4c*	4d*	4e*	5a**	5b**	5c**	5d**	5e**
St. Philip's	1	1	1	1	1	4	3	3	3	2
St. Philip's	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Emmanuel	1	1	1	0	1	2	3	4	1	3
Emmanuel	1	1	1	0	1	3	2	4	1	4
Regis	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	1	1	1
Emmanuel	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
St. Augustine's	1	1	1	1	1	4	3	3	1	3
St. Augustine's	1	1	1	1	0	4	3	2	2	2
St. Augustine's	1	1	1	1	0	4	3	3	2	2
Wycliffe	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	1	1	1
Trinity	0	1	1	0	0	2	3	3	1	1
Trinity	1	0	0	1	0	4	2	2	2	1
Trinity	1	0	1	0	0	2	1	2	3	3
Trinity	0	0	0	0	0	1	2	1	2	1
Knox	1	0	0	0	1	2	1	1	1	2
Trinity	1	1	0	1	1	3	2	2	3	3
Emmanuel	1	1	1	1	1	3	4	3	2	3
St. Michael's	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Trinity	0	0	0	0	0	2	1	1	1	2
Tyndale	0	1	1	0	1	1	2	2	1	2
Knox	0	1	1	0	1	1	3	3	1	3

* 0 = No, 1 = Yes

** 1 = Not Effective, 2 = Somewhat effective, 3 = Effective, and 4 = Very Effective

Appendix G: Descriptive Statistics for Question 4

Table 2: *Descriptive Statistics for Question 4*

Question 4	Response	Frequency	Percentage
A	No	7	39
	Yes	11	61
B	No	7	39
	Yes	11	61
C	No	7	39
	Yes	11	61
D	No	11	61
	Yes	7	39
E	No	9	50
	Yes	9	50

Appendix H: Correlations for Question 4

Table 3: *Correlations for Question 4*

	A	B	C	D	E
A	--				
B	.299	--			
C	.299	.766**	--		
D	.636**	.403	.169	--	
E	.342	.570*	.342	.114	--

*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Appendix I: Descriptive Statistics for Question 5

Table 4: *Descriptive Statistics for Question 5*

Question	Response	Frequency	Percentage
A	Not Effective	5	28
	Somewhat Effective	5	28
	Effective	3	17
	Very Effective	5	28
B	Not Effective	5	28
	Somewhat Effective	5	28
	Effective	7	39
	Very Effective	1	6
C	Not Effective	5	28
	Somewhat Effective	5	28
	Effective	6	33
	Very Effective	2	11
D	Not Effective	10	48
	Somewhat Effective	5	24
	Effective	3	14
	Very Effective	0	0
E	Not Effective	5	28
	Somewhat Effective	6	33
	Effective	6	33
	Very Effective	1	6

Appendix J: Correlations for Question 5

Table 5: *Correlations for Question 5*

	A	B	C	D	E
A	--				
B	.480*	--			
C	.423	.729**	--		
D	.449	.125	-.004	--	
E	.248	.293	.636**	.096	--

*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Appendix K: Correlations between Questions 4 and 5

Table 6: *Correlations between Questions 4 and 5*

	4A	4B	4C	4D	4E
5A	.793**	.402	.304	.869**	.095
5B	.318	.815**	.691**	.553*	.364
5C	.454	.800**	.800**	.237	.505*
5D	.494*	.042	.042	.561*	-.074
5E	.529*	.529*	.529*	.106	.681**

*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Bibliography

- Aleshire, Daniel. 2005. "The Role of Music in the Seminary: Where are We?" *The American Organist Magazine*, October 10, 2005. <https://www.agohq.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/07/CareersMusicintheSeminaries.pdf>
- Beckwith, John. 1987. "Sing Out the Glad News: Hymn Tunes in Canada." Toronto: Institute for Canadian Music.
- Beckwith, John. 2002. "Psalmody in British North America: Humbert, Daulé, Jenkins, Burnham." Toronto: Institute for Canadian Music.
- Committee on Education and Reception. 2019. "Entry into The Ministry Of Word And Sacrament In The Presbyterian Church In Canada For Ordained Ministers."
- Congregation for Divine Worship and the Discipline of the Sacraments. 2001. "Liturgiam Authenticam." https://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/congregations/ccdds/documents/rc_con_ccdds_doc_20010507_liturgiam-authenticam_en.html
- Congregation for Divine Worship and the Discipline of the Sacraments. 2004a. "Redemptionis Sacramentum." http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/congregations/ccdds/documents/rc_con_ccdds_doc_20040423_redemptionis-sacramentum_en.html#Preamble
- Congregation for Divine Worship and the Discipline of the Sacraments. 2004b. "Varietates Legitimae."
- Dyer, Joseph. "Roman Catholic church music." *Grove Music Online*; Accessed 17 Jul. 2020. <https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000046758>.
- Dyer, Joseph. 2018. "Sources of Romano-Frankish Liturgy and Music." Chapter In *The Cambridge History of Medieval Music*, edited by Mark Everist and Thomas Forrest Kelly, 92–122. The Cambridge History of Music. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Field, Andy P. 2013. "Discovering Statistics Using IBM SPSS Statistics: and Sex and Drugs and Rock 'n' Roll." 4th edition. Los Angeles: Sage.
- Gómez, Maricarmen. "Mass." *Grove Music Online*. 2001; Accessed 15 Jul. 2020. <https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000045872>.
- Greene, Donna. 1999. "Q&A/The Rev. Anthony D. Sorgie; Sacred Music Helps Define Religious Life," New York Times, July 4, 1999.
- Hansen, Daniel Albert. 1998. "The Role of the Church Musician: A Study of Perception of the Identity of the Ideal and Actual Church Musician in the United Church of Canada."

Order No. 9828123, Boston University School of Theology.
<http://ezproxy.library.yorku.ca/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.library.yorku.ca/docview/304478654?accountid=15182>.

- Kennedy, T. Frank. "Jesuits." *Grove Music Online*. 2001; Accessed 17 Jul. 2020.
<https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000040380>.
- Kervin, William S. 2011. *Ordered liberty: readings in the history of United Church worship*. Toronto: United Church Pub. House.
- Krosnicki, Thomas. 1974. "A survey report on the teaching and celebration of liturgy." CARA seminary forum, pg. 1-8.
- Leaver, Robin A. "Lutheran church music." *Grove Music Online*. 2001; Accessed 16 Jul. 2020.
<https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000046760>.
- Lockwood, Lewis. "The Counter-Reformation; Palestrina" in *Mass*, edited by Andrew Kirkman. *Grove Music Online*. 2001; Accessed 17 Jul. 2020.
<https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000045872>.
- Marti, Andreas, and Polman, Bert. "Reformed and Presbyterian church music." *Grove Music Online*. 2001; Accessed 29 Jul. 2020.
<https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000048535>.
- McKinnon, James W., ed. 1987. "Music in Early Christian Literature." Cambridge Readings in the Literature of Music. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- McKinnon, James W. "Christian Church, music of the early." *Grove Music Online*. 2001a; Accessed 29 Jul. 2020.
<https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000005705>.
- McKinnon, James W., Theodor Göllner, Maricarmen Gómez, Lewis Lockwood, Andrew Kirkman, Denis Arnold, and John Harper. "Mass." *Grove Music Online*. 2001b; Accessed 15 Jul. 2020.
<https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000045872>.
- Perkins, Leeman L. and Macey, Patrick. "Renaissance". Chapter in *Motet*. *Grove Music Online*. 2001; Accessed 14 Jul. 2020.
<https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000040086>.

- Pfisterer, Andreas. 2018. "Origins and Transmission of Franco-Roman Chant." Chapter. In *The Cambridge History of Medieval Music*, edited by Mark Everist and Thomas Forrest Kelly, 69–91. The Cambridge History of Music. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Pope Paul VI. 1963. "Sacrosanctum Concilium." Libreria Editrice Vaticana.
https://www.vatican.va/archive/hist_councils/ii_vatican_council/documents/vat-ii_const_19631204_sacrosanctum-concilium_en.html
- Pope Pius X. 1903. "Tra le Sollecitudini." Libreria Editrice Vaticana.
http://w2.vatican.va/content/pius-x/es/motu_proprio/documents/hf_p-x_motu-proprio_19031122_sollecitudini.html
- Roberts, Alexander and Donaldson, James, eds. *Ante- Nicene Christian Library: Vol XV. The Writings of Tertullian, Vol II: ; T&T Clark 1870*
<http://archive.org/details/antenicenechris15donagoog>.
- Routley, Erik. 1978. *Church Music and the Christian Faith*. Carol Stream, Illinois: Agape.
- Seroussi, Edwin, Joachim Braun, Eliyahu Schleifer, Uri Sharvit, Sara Manasseh, Theodore Levin, Tang Yating, Kay Kaufman Shelemay, Jehoash Hirshberg, Philip V. Bohlman, Israel J. Katz, Bret Werb, Walter Zev Feldman, Don Harrán, Alexander Knapp, David Bloch, and Emily Thwaite. "Jewish music." *Grove Music Online*. 2001; Accessed 9 Jun. 2020.
<https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000041322>.
- Schwarz, Jack Wayne. 1975. "The State Of Church Music Education For Ministerial Students In Protestant Seminaries In The United States." Order No. 7519034, University of Southern California. <http://ezproxy.library.yorku.ca/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.library.yorku.ca/docview/302803853?accountid=15182>.
- Sorgie, Anthony Domenic. 1989. "Music Education in the Major Free-Standing Roman Catholic Seminaries in the United States". Ed.D., United States -- New York: Teachers College, Columbia University.
<http://search.proquest.com/docview/303742485/abstract/75B655C4A83D41B1PQ/4>.
- Stackhouse, John G. 1993. "Canadian Evangelicalism in the Twentieth Century: An Introduction to its Character." University of Toronto Press.
- Temperley, Nicholas. "Anglican and Episcopalian church music." *Grove Music Online*. 2001a; Accessed 17 Jul. 2020.
<https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000046765>.
- Temperley, Nicholas. "Methodist church music." *Grove Music Online*. 2001b; Accessed 31 Jul. 2020.
<https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000047533>.

- Toronto School of Theology. 2019. "Course Syllabus EMP2861HF - *Songs of the Church*." Emmanuel College, Fall 2019.
- Toronto School of Theology. 2020. "Worship Team Practicum." Emmanuel College, Fall 2020. <https://www.tst.edu/academic/course/worship-team-practicum-0>
- Second Vatican Ecumenical Council. 1967. "Musicam Sacram: Instruction on Music in the Liturgy." http://www.vatican.va/archive/hist_councils/ii_vatican_council/documents/vat-ii_instr_19670305_musicam-sacram_en.html.
- Church of England, Edward, and William Pickering. 1844. "The Book of common prayer: printed by Whitchurch, March 1549; commonly called The First Book of Edward VI." London: William Pickering.
- The United Church of Canada. 1926. "Forms of Service for the Offices of the Church." Toronto: United Church.
- The United Church of Canada. 1930. "The Hymnary of The United Church of Canada." Toronto: United Church.
- The United Church of Canada. 1932. "Book of Common Order of the United Church of Canada." Toronto: United Church.
- The United Church of Canada. 1996. "Voices United: The Hymn and Worship Book of the United Church of Canada." Toronto: United Church.
- The United Church of Canada. 2000. "Celebrate God's Presence: A Book of Services." United Church Publishing House, Toronto.
- The United Church of Canada. 2019. "Admission to the Order of Ministry Policy and Procedures." Toronto: United Church. https://www.united-church.ca/sites/default/files/resources/handbook_admission_order-of-ministry.pdf
- The United Church of Canada. 2020. "Congregational Designated Ministers." Toronto: United Church. https://www.united-church.ca/sites/default/files/pastoral-relations_congregational-designated-ministers.pdf
- The United Church of Canada. 2020. "The Manual." Toronto: United Church. https://www.united-church.ca/sites/default/files/the-manual-2019_0.pdf
- The United Church of Canada and the Anglican Church of Canada. 1971. "The Hymn Book of the Anglican Church of Canada and the United Church of Canada." Toronto: The Anglican Church of Canada and the United Church of Canada.
- Vatican. 1993. "Catechism of the Catholic Church." Libreria Editrice Vaticana, Citta del Vaticano. <https://www.vatican.va/archive/ENG0015/INDEX.HTM#fonte>
- Wellesz, Egon. 1990. *New Oxford History of Music*. Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press.

Wycliffe College. 2018. "The History, Theology and Practice of Anglican Liturgy". Wycliffe College. 17 May 2018. <https://www.wycliffecollege.ca/programs-and-courses/courses/history-theology-and-practice-anglican-liturgy>.