Planning Exclusion: The Filipino Community and the Lawrence Heights Social Development Plan

By: Benjamin Bongolan

Supervisor: Abidin Kusno

A Major Paper Submitted to the Faculty of Environmental Studies

in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Master in Environmental Studies

York University, Toronto, Ontario, Canada

2020

ABSTRACT

The Lawrence Heights neighbourhood in Toronto has faced significant challenges throughout its history. This history is intertwined with elements of migration, urban development, socio-spatial inequalities, revitalization and grassroots activism. Over the past 10 years, a number of key reference documents outlining the revitalization and redevelopment of Lawrence Heights have been published, which include the *Lawrence Allen Secondary Plan*, the *Lawrence Heights District Public Art Plan*, and the *Lawrence Heights Social Development Plan* (LHSDP)- the key focus of this Major Paper. Although much has been documented on youth violence, crime, and the economic marginalization of Lawrence Heights residents, there is virtually no existing scholarship or literature that speaks to the plight or experiences of the Filipino community, which in 2011 was listed as the largest immigrant community in Lawrence Heights by both foreign country of birth and language outside of English (City of Toronto, 2011). For this reason, this paper aims analyze the LHSDP to determine how and if the Filipino community was included throughout the development of the LHSDP. The research questions in this paper are:

> *What are the ways in which the LHSDP could have been exclusionary to Filipino newcomer communities? And how can we improve Filipino newcomer inclusion in neighbourhood revitalization efforts and in the development of future social development plans?*

This research question will guide the paper through several stages of analysis from an examination of the key reference document itself, to unpacking and identifying barriers that the Filipino community experience through research on the Filipino diaspora and participant interviews. This research shall contribute both to the spheres of urban planning and Filipino Canadian studies, and aims to help shape the direction of how immigrant communities can be engaged in revitalization and other city building processes.

FOREWORD

This major paper is a culmination of two years in the Master in Environmental Studies program where my area of specialization was urban and regional planning, with additional courses and training Filipino Canadian Studies and social development. The goal of this research is to contribute to the expansion of Filipino Canadian scholarship, and to compel urban planners and future urban planning scholarship to include, amplify, and uplift Filipino voices and experiences into the broader academic discourse of urban planning studies.

The purpose of this major paper is to create strategies that can be used by urban planners when conducting community engagement and community consultations in immigrant dense communities with high populations of Filipino migrants. This research aims to set the groundwork for the broader realm of Filipino urbanism studies in Canada, with a focus on the specific site of the Lawrence Heights neighbourhood in northwest Toronto. From a community development perspective, this research can also be used to support those supporting Filipino newcomer communities within the immigration and social development sectors who seek to form a stronger understanding of the lived experiences of Filipino migrants within the City of Toronto.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would first like to thank the Faculty of Environmental Studies, the Faculty of Graduate Studies, the York University Fellowship, the York Centre for Asian Research, the David Wurfel Award for Philippine Studies, and the Graduate Environmental Students Association for financially supporting my master's program at York University. I never thought I would be so fortunate to have such a supportive environment to pursue this scholarship. Thank you.

Thank you to my advisor/supervisor professor Abidin Kusno, my field education supervisors Jay Pitter and Abigail Moriah, FES professors Stefan Kipfer, Luisa Sotomayor, and Laura Taylor, my Philippine studies professor Philip Kelly, and C4 professors Bridget Cauthery, Danielle Robinson, and Franz Newland for your endless support throughout my graduate education and experience at York. Thank you for generously sharing the vastness of your knowledge and constant encouragement- I couldn't have asked for better mentors and academic inspiration.

To my FSAT and UofT Family: Luigi Garde, Vanessa Ibe, Lei-Ley Hull, Edward Lamson, Vhil Castillejos, Benedicto San Juan, Amber Duplechain, Chris Kimberly, Jennilee Santican, Mark Cusi, Jon Ortega and Valene Cardoso- we've been through it all together!

To Adam, thank you for every phone call and for being a constant source of support for me throughout my masters program- I appreciate you always.

To my York U Family, the MES Cohort of 2020, what a year! I can't wait to see all of the amazing things you'll do in the future. So grateful to have spent the past two years with you.

And lastly, to the Filipino Community that changes my life everyday. I never could have imagined that my passion for this work would lead to a master's degree but here I am. Thank you for helping me find my passion and for teaching me the true meaning of *kababayan* and *bayanihan*. *Maraming Salamat*.

DEDICATION

To my ancestors, my grandfathers, Judge Benjamin Bongolan Senior, Dr. Tobias Y Enverga
Senior, my aunt Resurrection (Susan) C. Enverga Gamit and uncle
Senator Tobias C. Enverga Jr.

To my parents, Benjamin Bongolan Jr. and Myra C. Enverga Bongolan.

The credentials and accolades that I now hold are because of your unwavering support
throughout my life.

I dedicate this work to you.

Table of Contents

LIST OF ACRONYMS

IRCC: Immigrants, Refugees, and Citizenship Canada

JPCI: John Polanyi Collegiate Institute

COTOP: City of Toronto Official Plan

GPGGH: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe

LHCC: Lawrence Heights Community Centre

LHION: Lawrence Heights Inter Organizational Network

LHSDP: Lawrence Heights Social Development Plan

LIC: Live-In-Caregiver Program

LIP: Local Immigration Partnership

OFW: Overseas Foreign Worker

POS: Plan of Study

PSI: Priority Schools Initiative

SEPT: Settlement and Education Partnerships in Toronto

SPO: Service Provider Organization

SWIS: Settlement Workers in Schools Program

TCHC: Toronto Community Housing Corporation

TCDSB: Toronto Catholic District School Board

TDSB: Toronto District School Board

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

This major paper is focused on Filipino inclusion in urban development processes, and seeks to create recommendations for city planners to ensure that the needs and concerns of Filipinos are reflected and addressed in the formation of a social development plan (and future city planning documents). Filipino's are a rapidly growing community in Canada with migration reaching high peaks due to Canada's federal live-in-caregiver program and the phenomenon of family reunification. Planning is a powerful force that can be all encompassing, spanning the spheres of transportation, social development, housing, economic development, and environmental planning, all of which contributes greatly to one's health and well-being throughout the life-course. For this reason, it is imperative that the Filipino community be intentionally included within the planning process due to the breadth of implications that it would have on their lives.

Research Question and Purpose of Major Paper

The research question aims to address the ways in which the LHDSP could have been exclusionary to the needs of Filipino newcomers in Lawrence Heights, and how to include them in future social development plans. Pursuing this research required an understanding of migration, urban planning, social development, and the lived experiences of key informants that are engaged with the Filipino community in Lawrence Heights. This site was selected because of the layers of complexity that exist within it; a high Filipino newcomer population, the contestation of land between local residents and developers, and the saturation of social development services situated in Lawrence Heights. Through this analysis and over the course of the Plan of Study (POS), several problematics have been identified. These barriers are prevalent across several aspects of urban life and have enduring implications on the lives of Filipino migrants. Among them include the growing

urban divide between higher income residents and those who are on the lower levels of social and economic strata in Toronto, and the challenges that arise in the immigration and settlement experience to Canada.

Research on the growing urban inequalities within the Toronto context helps situate the current socio-spatial climate of Filipino newcomers. In the study of Toronto's urban divide, the City is described as "three distinct cities" (Hulchanski, 2009). These cities include a "shrinking middle class", a "growing low-income population", and "city of the rich" (Hulchanski 2009). The "three distinct cities" concept is relevant because of the way in which Filipino migrants are situated and geographically located within Toronto. When examining neighbourhoods that Filipino migrants (and Live-In-Caregivers specifically) work in, this includes the affluent neighbourhoods of Wilson Heights, Forest Hill, Yonge and Eglinton, and Yorkville, the urban divide becomes clear when we look the spaces that Filipino migrants are often systematically relegated to. On the opposite side of these areas are the Filipino newcomer dense communities of Bathurst and Wilson, Eglinton Avenue West, Thorncliffe, and St. Jamestown. This paper will take into account the experiences of Filipino newcomers and insights into Filipino urban life through the informant interviews in Chapter 5.

Ulf Hannerz who writes about the impact of urban inequalities within Black communities in America states that when researching the "impact of poverty on Black life in urban communities" the implications extend beyond "sheer material deprivation" and has a significant bearing on behavior and social interactions (Hannerz, 1974). This concept is further explored in Chapter 2, as urban inequalities are observed from the framework that Hannerz sets forth are thrice examined from the built form, economic, and social development levels of analysis.

The City of Toronto is undergoing significant growth, well beyond the downtown core and into peripheral neighbourhoods such as Lawrence Heights. While the focus of this paper is on a specific site's revitalization process, this research lays the groundwork for future research on creating a Filipino sense of place within the City of Toronto, and to think critically about equitable participation barriers in planning. This paper encourages research to approach community engagement from a lens that is deeply informed of the nuances, diasporas, and histories of the immigrants that are situated within the urban centres of host cultures.

Organization of Major Paper

The first chapter provides an overview of the papers connection to the Plan of Study (POS). The synergy and interconnectedness between the major paper and POS is relevant in both the content and arguments set forth in this paper. The POS, by its design, has played a larger role throughout the course of the MES program, and has helped situate this paper within the realm of urban planning, Filipino Canadian, and social development planning studies. The first chapter concludes with an outline of the methodology and discourse analyzers- critical discourse analysis and qualitative research methods, used to examine the LHSDP, documentation of the Lawrence Heights revitalization, and participant interviews. The second chapter is an overview of urban inequalities that have persisted throughout the history of planning and development,and have enduring and global implications that often relegate and redirect racialized communities through spatial segregation. Both chapters two and four will draw from research based in North America as well as research within a broader global context. The third chapter is an analysis of the Lawrence Heights Social Development Plan. Through an examination of key reference documents, this chapter will unpack and reveal ways in which the LHSDP may have been exclusionary to

immigrant communities. The fourth chapter focuses on Filipino Canadian Studies, with an emphasis on the plight of Filipino migrants in Toronto who undergo deprofessionalization, economic marginalization, and impacts from the federal Live-in-Caregiver Program (LIC). The fifth chapter features participant interviews from professionals with backgrounds spanning urban planning, architecture, and immigration & settlement services within Toronto. The sixth chapter outlines recommendations informed by the research and analysis presented in chapters 2, 3 and 4, and the participant interviews on equitable participation barriers and community-based consultations presented in chapter 5. The seventh chapter concludes this paper and offers insights into the future of Filipino urbanism studies.

Connection to the Plan of Study

The Plan of Study and Major Paper are foregrounded in three clusters of knowledge; urban and regional planning, Filipino Canadian Studies, and Social Development. Through the lens of urban and regional planning studies, the case study of the LHSDP and the Filipino community is seen as being deeply connected to Canada's legacy of urban inequalities. The built environment that Lawrence Heights residents are situated in is reflective of the spatial segregation found throughout cities in the global north that suppress, limit, and contain racialized communities. In addition, I undertook a Filipino Canadian Studies Individual Directed Study, where I engaged with the existing canon of Filipino scholarship in Canada covering the topics of Filipino community roots and histories of migration, and an examination of the effects of the LIC program on the lives of Filipino migrant families. Central to the Plan of Study was the Summer Experiential Learning opportunity where I worked on a Social Development Plan with a developer in an underserved

neighbourhood in Toronto. This experience revealed the deep inequities that persist when land is being put into the hands of the private sector, and the vulnerability of racialized communities in such settings who are at risk of displacement due to the gentrification and "revitalization" of spaces that are deemed to be underutilized and not reaching their full potential with regards to density and economic development contributions. The social development component is reflected in this major paper through interviews with key informants whose professional backgrounds span urban planning, stakeholder engagement, immigration and settlement, and youth capacity building in Lawrence Heights.

Methodology

Document Review and Analysis

This paper is situated across the fields of migration, urban planning, and social development studies. The intersections between these areas of knowledge propel one to consider the political, social, and spatial aspects of Filipino life in urban centres. As a racialized group of migrants that is systematically relegated into a low-income neighbourhood where there is a dearth of accessible supports, the Filipino Community in Lawrence Heights are subject and deeply vulnerable to immigration and urban development policies set forth by all levels of government. For certain aspects of this research, critical discourse analysis is appropriate because it allows the researcher to challenge the prevailing "social conditions of domination" (Billig, 2003, 39). By examining these systems with document review and analysis, one would be able to challenge and disrupt these long-standing established practices, and help shape new dialogue in immigrant inclusion within the context of urban development and revitalization. This analysis will begin with an examination of newspaper articles documenting the Lawrence Heights redevelopment, the Lawrence Allen

Secondary Plan, and the Lawrence Heights Public Art Plan, all of which informed and contributed to the creation of the LHSDP. When examining these documents, this paper will draw on the practice of Carmen Coulthard who uses a "critical and interdisciplinary approach" when critiquing news reports, and stated that news is something which is "socially and culturally determined" (Coulthard, 2003, 276). Coulthard draws on a news analyzer framework developed by Johan Galtung and Mari Ruge known as "general news values". This framework is utilized by Coulthard to critique news reports from a lens of discourse analysis, and encompasses "frequency, threshold, reference to elite persons, reference to elite nations, personalization" and "negativity" among others (Galtung & Ruge, 1965). Drawing from this framework this paper will analyze these articles to determine if aspects or practices of the LHDSP could have resulted in or contributed to the exclusion, erasure, or undermining of immigrant needs.

Qualitative Research Methods

This research engages in **purposive sampling**, because research participants have a specific connection to urban planning or the Filipino community. These participants have been recruited through outreach within the professional worlds of urban planning and immigration and settlement services. Purposive sampling resonates greatly with this paper, because it involves a process in which the selection of participants would be based on their inherent characteristics and lived experiences (Ritchie et. al. 2014, 113). Furthermore, purposive sampling considers important concepts such as diversity, representation, and heterogeneous samples (Ritchie et. al. 2014, 113). Interview participants were key informants who had professional experience in the field of planning or community development work with Filipino newcomers. The decision for this

sampling framework for the research participants was because this paper required the insights from both of these professional sectors to help answer the research question, and draw from the knowledge bases of planning, immigration, and the Philippine diaspora. A series of questions were administered to the key informants, and focused on immigrant inclusion in urban revitalization processes.

Throughout the course of this paper, research participants were limited to key informants and professionals within the fields of planning and community development services. This inherent limitation impacted the diversity of voices and experiences captured exclusively to those who are working on the frontlines with the Filipino community and those engaged in the planning process. However, the findings from they key informants are still valid because of their unique vantage points and perspectives, and will be used to inform the recommendations of this paper.

Interview Technique:

These interviews are structured for the purpose of thoroughly capturing the personal and professional insights on Filipino and immigrant inclusion in city planning and urban revitalization. The interview process was critical in addressing the research question which comprises of many intersecting experiences. This structured interview process with clear direction contributes greatly to the researcher in attaining meaningful data that helps answer the major paper research question. The research uses a set of pre-determined questions to draw out the participant's insights and experiences in planning, inclusive city building, and knowledge of the Filipino community and diaspora in Toronto. The sampling framework in participant selection is based on professional and lived experiences, with a focus on planners and those with personal and professional connections to Filipino community work in Lawrence Heights. Three

interviews were conducted on a one-on-one format, and documented through note taking. One interview was conducted in a group format with three participants and documented through note taking by the researcher.

CHAPTER 2: URBAN INEQUALITIES AND PLANNING

Planning sustainable, resilient cities in a world where development and urban growth is deeply connected to the colonial, political, and economic interests of emerging nations has direct and enduring implications on the way land is utilized. From North America, to Europe, to Asia, to Africa, and the Global South, the plight of marginalized and Indigenous communities is often a by-product of a city's built form. Ultimately, the strength, grandeur, and advancement of urbanization often results in urban inequities and spatial segregation. This chapter is critical in forming an understanding of urban inequalities from a local (North American) and global context, and to see how the disparities that exist in Lawrence Heights are directly related to the inequalities that have existed and continue to persist across the world. Correspondingly, this chapter of the paper will explore how these inequities occur by examining the scholarly work and theoretical frameworks of urban planners, architects, and government officials from across the world to provide a local and global context to urban inequalities.

Chapter Two will first proceed to discuss the history of urban development within the context of socio-spatial inequality with examples from Canadian and American history. This section will look at American and Canadian case law to demonstrate how planning tools such

as zoning, city planning, licensing, and land use planning were used by the state to limit, contain, and subjugate marginalized communities in California, New York, Vancouver, and Halifax. Secondly, this chapter provides an analysis of urban inequalities on a global scale, with examples of spatial segregation, state control, and the erasure of communities through insurgent urban planning in Havana, Tel Aviv, and Algeria.

Local Context: North American Case Law and Historical Background of Urban Inequality

Spatial segregation and social fragmentation resulted from state endorsed zoning regulations and has been prevalent throughout the United States from California to Chicago (Mumford, 2018, 114). At the 1909 National City Planning Conference in Washington DC, land-use zoning was presented as a way for "development to be controlled" (Mumford, 2018, 114). Correspondingly, zoning ordinances were implemented by the Los Angeles Realty Board to "restrict businesses associated with ethnic groups" through "anti-Chinese laundry laws". This zoning ordinance was upheld by the California Supreme Court in recognition that the mixing of ethnic mixing in certain areas would result in devaluing real estate (Mumford, 2018, 114).

Mumford notes that racial segregation in housing intensified through national development standards that were endorsed by the National Association of Real Estate Board (Mumford, 2018, 117). Restrictive covenants and zoning regulations prevented members of African, Chinese, and Jewish Americans from purchasing land in designated areas (Mumford, 2018, 117). Upheld by the 1896 Supreme Court decision *Plessy v. Ferguson*, planners at the time had the ability to legally exclude people from purchasing property based on their race (Mumford, 2018, 117), and by 1948 in the *Shelly v. Kramer* case, the Supreme

Court "ruled that racially restrictive covenants were unenforceable" (Mumford, 2018, 117). Based on Mumford's analysis of spatial segregation, it isclear that land use, urban planning, and housing developments in the United States are rooted in prejudice against people from ethnic backgrounds, and how these oppressive actions are warranted based on the argument that land would lose its value if associated with people from specific ethnicities.

Canadian case law presents a history of discrimination and segregation in planning, land ownership, and the governance of space. Noble v. Alley is considered to be an important case that reached the Supreme Court of Canada and is defined as a "prominent step in the legal struggle against discrimination" (Canada, Government of, 2015). Taking place in 1951, this case involved a property seller, Mrs. Noble, who wanted to sell her property to a buyer of Jewish descent; however the restrictive covenants on the property indicated that it cannot be sold to people who are Jewish, black or of racialized blood (Canada, 2015). In their landmark decision, the court "erected significant barriers" and protections that would prevent the "enforcement of racial and religious restrictive covenants" (Canada, 2015). Roncarelli v. Duplessis is revered as another landmark case in which a business owner in Montreal, who was a member of the Jehovah's Witness church, had a liquor license cancelled in an attempt to limit and contain the economic success of this faith-based community in Montreal, and to prevent the spread of a pamphlet titled "*Quebec's burning hate for God, Christ, and Freedom Is the Shame of All Canada*" which resulted in Quebec Premier Maurice Duplessis to actively pursue the cancellation of Roncarelli's liquor licence (Cartier, 2009). In 1959 the court ruled in favour of Roncarelli, and based on Genevive Cartier's analysis, Roncarelli v. Duplessis left a considerable impact within the realm of constitutional and administrative law, and the invocation of this case often occurs when arguing that "there is no such thing as untrammelled

discretionary authority and to assert that a person with public authority cannot refuse to exercise it" (Cartier, 2010). Ultimately, Noble v. Alley and Roncarelli v. Duplessis are two cases that represent the history of discriminatory practices set forth by local residents and government officials that demonstrate the ways in which land and spaces were governed with prejudicial intentions against people based on religious beliefs and race.

We can see how in New York, socio-spatial inequality and spatial segregation occurred in the Bronx, which was turned into an "urban nightmare" that was comprised of "murder, terror, abandoned buildings, and neighbourhoods turned into garbage" (Berman, 1982, 290). At first, racialized communities with families of African and Hispanic origin formed ethnic enclaves across the Bronx. New York City developer and planner Robert Moses initiated several high-level projects that dismantled these communities and displaced them into areas which Berman describes as "even worse slums" leaving these communities at the care of the U.S. Welfare department (Berman, 1982, 293).

Based on what has occurred in the United States, it is clear that planning tools and urban development processes contributed to the erasure of Black, Asian, Jewish, and Hispanic migrant communities. As revitalization and planning processes have now reached the immigrant dense community of Lawrence Heights, it is critical to make reference this legacy of racism within planning in order to make informed decisions on how to help create inclusive and engaged spaces for racialized people.

In Jean Barman's *Erasing Indigenous Indigeneity in Vancouver*, it is revealed how in 1886, the plight of Vancouver's Indigenous communities occurred as a result of expansive urbanization, and how policy and land use planning were used to facilitate this growth. Indigenous communities were forced out of Vancouver's growing urban centre, and these

actions were endorsed in 1911 by Prime Minister Wilfrid Laurier who stated "Where a reserve is in the vicinity of a growing town, it becomes a source of nuisance and an impediment to progress" (Barman, 2007, 2). Barman maintains that the goal to procure land was for transportation and urban expansion (Barman, 2007, 9). This included the redevelopment of the Kitslano Reserve, False Creek, and Brockton Point, and was based on an ideology that "Vancouverites should see themselves as distinct from, and superior to Indigenous presence" (Barman, 2007, 9).

The chapter *"Planning the Town White"* of Ted Rutland's text *Displacing Blackness* paints an elaborate picture of the spatial segregation of the black community in Halifax, and how land use planning systematically excluded them from settling in sanitary and livable environments (Rutland, 2018, 84). Rutland's text explicates that following the urbanization of Halifax, the formation of Africville was deliberately designed to be a "poor community with infertile land" (Rutland, 2018, 82). By the early 1800's, while the pavement of new streets and roads in Halifax were underway, in addition to a comprehensive sewage system was being implemented, Africville, however was excluded from this particular urban development initiative, which ultimately led to challenges in the Black community accessing clean drinking water (Rutland, 2018, 88). Rutland's account of the spatial segregation in Halifax demonstrate how intentional and discriminatory planning practices have directly and detrimental effects on the well-being of the Black community.

As planners in Toronto pursue development projects and proceed with revitalization efforts in neighbourhoods such as Lawrence Heights, it is important that they be informed of this history and Canada's legacy of discrimination and anti-black racism through the tools of planning. Furthermore, the research question is focused on inclusion, and one must not

propose and develop inclusion practices in the Canadian and Toronto context without being informed and aware of Black and Indigenous experiences. The continued efforts and resistance of Black and Indigenous activism, and the histories that they hold in Canada, have helped manifest further research on inclusion to include immigrant communities.

Revitalization efforts in Toronto are problematic because development applications are typically approved if they conform to key reference documents outline specific density targets in land use planning, (GPGGH, COTOP, and Secondary Plans, among others). Planning rationales (often created by planning consulting firms) have components that look at community services and local supports that are available to the community, but often don't extend beyond standard services such as recreational and well-known community supports. Grassroots community groups, faith-based organizations, peer and cultural community groups, and the breadth of services offered by non-profit organizations are often excluded, for reasons that will be further discussed in Chapter 5 of this paper.

Based on the compelling narratives of spatial segregation in New York and Vancouver, it is clear that urban development in various cities was often achieved at the cost of communities being dismantled, uprooted, and redirected. Implicit in understanding the impact of displacement is that these processes most often affect members of marginalized communities. The desire for urban expansion required government and state intervention, which thereby led to a small elite having control over the masses.

Urban Inequalities: Global Context

In order to form a comprehensive and thorough understanding of urban planning, one must also be aware of the history of cities from a global perspective. Based on the research provided in this chapter thus far, it is clear that the impact of urban planning practices have

a significant impact on national scales. Historically, adopting city planning initiatives from one city to another can lead to fruitful outcomes that result in economic and urban prosperity. However, challenges arise when certain methodologies are adopted to perpetuate practices that subjugate Indigenous and marginalized people. Through the work of Josef Gugler, Charles Rutheiser, and Joseph Scarpaci, we see the impact of urban development on Havana, and how global pressure steered Havana towards a direction of divide and economic decline.

Providing context to Havana's urban development, *Josef Gugler's A Minimum of Urbanism and Maximum of Ruralism* paint's an elaborate picture of the urban and rural divide in Havana. Gugler states that the Cuban government relegated almost 300,000 people into agricultural work during the period of 1965-1970 (Gugler, 1980, 32). What came forth from this was a large working class being directed to the outer rural areas, focusing on planting and sugar harvesting (Gugler, 1980, 32). Gulger asserts that as a result of residents of Havana being directed to rural work, the slowdown of growth of Havana and the weakening of its position" ensued (Gugler, 1980, 33). Charles Rutheiser's *Capitalizing on Havana: The Return of the Repressed in a Late Socialist City* discusses the evolution of the built environment of Havana and how tourism and foreign investment resulted in areas being designated as "socioeconomic specialization districts" (Rutheiser, 2003, 224). The "transformation on the use of urban space" in Havana has been concentrated on rural areas and sites for tourism, ultimately leading to greater disparity and economic decline (Rutheiser, 2003, 231). Similar to what has happened in Havana, a similar comparison of socio-spatial division can be seen with the current situation of the Filipino community. As is the case in Lawrence Heights, a peripheral neighbourhood, Filipino migrants have been systematically

redirected into lower-income communities that are often adjacent to higher income communities.

Here we can see how the goal of economic development ultimately resulted in exacerbating the urban-rural inequities in Havana, in what has been described as a city that represented "everything that was wrong in Cuban society" because of how the allocation of state investments were made (Rutheiser, 2003, 227). The contradictions that are prevalent within the context of Global Implications for Havana are rooted in the land use planning of Havana's built form to become more suitable for agricultural production and tourism, and ultimately leads to a lack of investment on cities' infrastructure and local urban development. Havana may have benefited greatly had the Government of Cuba placed higher emphasis on urban revitalization projects that would encompass educational, transportation, and local-based infrastructure.

State control of land and spatial segregation in Tel Aviv was presented in *Mark Levine's Ceci Ne'st Pas Jaffa (This is Not Jaffa)*. Through the emergence of Tel Aviv's changing architectural landscape, Levine states how urban development was heading towards a direction of state led Zionist design which "conveyed a strong rejection of the existing Indigenous Palestinian Arab Culture" and how the government wanted to develop land in a way that would result in the "physical and spatial separation from the existing Arab" (Levine, 2006, 157). Levine maintains that spatial segregation occurred out of necessity, from the government's desire to "bring order out of chaos in the city" (Levine, 2006, 158). Based on Levine's analysis, the built form of the City was developed in a way that prevented Arabic narratives and histories from thriving, and without considering the urban life and cultural preservation for the existing Indigenous cultures. Tel Aviv sets forth an example of how

urban design can be used as a way to erase cultural value. In the Toronto context, a challenge within urban planning is that development applications must adhere to intensification and density targets that are generally in conformity with land use planning law regulations and expectations set forth in GPGGH and COTOP key reference documents. Therefore, the LHSDP must be cognizant of the rich cultural fabric that is located within the neighbourhood and seek to preserve it, a recommendation which will appear in Chapter 6 of this paper.

In the article "*On the Spaces of Guerre Moderne: The French Army in Northern Algeria*," Samia Henni provides a detailed narrative on spatial segregation, militarized subjugation and forced displacement of the Algerian people (Henni, 2016, 41). According to Henni, through military and police force "territorial and spatial operations" were conducted which resulted in Algerians being "forcibly displaced" (Henni, 2016, 41). Colonial officials used military force to "monitor every movement and activity of the colonised population", and land use zoning established a set of militarized zones that would be used for surveillance and control by the French army in Northern Algeria (Henni, 2016, 41-2). Henni states that "the planned politico-military objectives" led to the displacement and "uprooting of millions of civilians" (Henni, 2016, 53). This example in Northern Algeria presents the concept of the securitization and surveillance of space, a prevailing issue that is pertinent to the City of Toronto's neighbourhood improvement areas, and an issue that is relevant Lawrence Heights.

Racial profiling, policing in neighbourhoods and schools, carding, and the misuse of force have created an often contentious relationship between communities and the police in Toronto. These forms of subjugation under the guise of surveillance and securitization often exacerbates and manifests into further forms of violence amongst racialized people and must be taken into account when addressing the issue of safety in Lawrence Heights.

The Potential for Social Development Planning to Improve Urban Inequities

By understanding the history of urban planning it is clear that there was often a great cost in the creation of a global city, and how there is often an imbalance between political, economic, Indigenous, and institutional interests. Canadian planning at face value can often be reduced to official plans, minor variance applications, master plans, and environmental impact assessments. However, a comprehensive understanding of how policies were formed within a historical context can provide planners with a better idea of the type of planner they want to be, and the type of world that they want to create. Infrastructure, and the way a city is built, when reflective of community needs and interests can lead to public services and spaces that are inclusive and foster the sustainability of a city.

The contradictions that existed through this analysis was that African, Chinese, Indigenous, and Arabic histories and identities were subject to colonial and state oppression, and how the built form was often achieved through cultural genocide based on the political will and colonial forces. Ultimately the advancement of urban development in a city resulted in the inequities and erasure of ethnic identities and space. When economic interests are placed at the forefront of city planning, and when there is hyper focus on foreign and colonial interests, the use of the land is likely to be a conduit in facilitating commercial and private sector revenue generation. However, when planning is led from local and community needs, the potential for planning in addressing urban and social inequities become clear. When we take into consideration the prevailing challenges of urban planning in society today; transportation, access to affordable housing, the walkability of neighbourhoods, and the quality of life in underserved areas, planners must question or take into consideration how much of these inequities are a result of actions, policies, and historical events that ultimately

led to this urban setting. This research aims to influence the current professional world of planning by including the voices of immigrant communities in higher level conversations related to land use, marginalization of ethnic enclaves, and community-based participatory planning.

A primary focus for many of the cities discussed throughout this paper should be on infrastructure revitalization that is centred on black, Indigenous, and marginalized communities that have experienced spatial segregation and discrimination as a result of oppressive planning practices. This would encompass inclusive planning practices that is rooted in community engagement principles and could be applied when thinking critically about immigrant inclusion in urban development processes in Lawrence Heights.

CHAPTER 3: SITE CONTEXT AND PLANNING ANALYSIS

Contemporary planning of Lawrence Heights occurred in the 1950's and was completed in 1962 (TCHC & Toronto, City of, 2012).   The design of Lawrence Heights was based on the location of the Allen Expressway (The Allen), which creates a physical barrier between community services and the local residents (TCHC, & Toronto, City of, 2012). West of The Allen is the Lawrence Allen Centre, a mixed use building which contains retail stores and social service providers that include North York Community House, a non-profit immigrant serving organization, Toronto Employment and Social Services, and Service Canada branch. To the east of The Allen are Toronto Community Housing Corporation (TCHC) buildings, John Polanyi Collegiate Institute (JPCI), the local high school, and the Lawrence Heights Community Centre (LHCC). The access points between TCHC buildings, JPCI , LHCC, and the Lawrence Heights neighbourhood are impeded by the location of The Allen. A resident would have to traverse across

two sets of arterial roads (Lawrence Avenue West and The Allen) if they were to arrive from Lawrence West TTC Station in the south, go to the TCHC buildings, JPCI or LHCC in the east, and access the Lawrence Allen Centre in the west. For reference, a majority of the private dwelling typologies are single detached houses at 4,190, followed by 5+ storey apartments at 3,975 and apartments under 5 storeys at 3,315 (City of Toronto, 2011).

Labeled a priority neighbourhood in 2005, Lawrence Heights was identified as having a significant dearth of affordable and accessible services to residents, and being in need of "social and physical infrastructure investment" (Toronto North Local Immigration Partnership, 2011). The average household income of Lawrence Heights residents is $56,440, compared against the City of Toronto average of $63,870, and the top country of origin for recent immigrants is the Philippines at 35% (Toronto North Local Immigration Partnership, 2011). With regards to educational attainment, 53% of Lawrence Heights Residents obtain post-secondary education, compared against the City of Toronto's average of 69% (City of Toronto, 2017).

Lawrence Heights and North Toronto: An Arrival Point for the Filipino Community and a By-Product of Filipino Migration through Family Reunification

Census data in 2011 shows how the Filipino community is the largest immigrant community group placed at #1 in the "top birth country for all immigrants" and "top-10 birth country for recent immigrants" (City of Toronto, 2011). The City of Toronto 2016 Neighbourhood Profile of Yorkdale Glen-Park (which is comprises the Lawrence Heights community) lists the Philippines as the top country for recent immigrants. (Toronto 2016). Furthermore, Lawrence Heights is located south of the Bathurst and Wilson intersection known as "Little Manila" where

many Filipino commercial, food, and retail businesses are located. Schools within the Toronto District School Board (TDSB) and Toronto Catholic District School Board (TCDSB) that are based in North Toronto have increasingly growing Filipino newcomer populations. Among them include Forest Hill Collegiate Institute, John Polanyi Secondary School, James Cardinal McGuigan Catholic Secondary School, Northview Heights Secondary School, and Newtonbrook Secondary School, all of which have designated School Settlement Workers under Canada's federal funded Settlement Workers in Schools (SWIS) program and operate under the cluster of Settlement and Education Partnerships in Toronto (SEPT) programme. Three professionals who work with the Filipino community in Lawrence Heights and in North Toronto are interviewed in this paper, and will provide deeper insights beyond this data on the lived experiences of Filipino migrants within Lawrence Heights. Despite this data, very few initiatives have been developed to support the Filipino community at-large across the social service sector in Lawrence Heights.

The process of revitalization in Lawrence Heights commenced in 2008, and was framed as a partnership between the TCHC, grassroots community groups, and local residents (Heights Development, 2015). What was propelled from this was the creation of the Lawrence-Allen Secondary Plan, a Public Art Plan, several community-based anti-violence initiatives, and the Social Development & Action Plan for Lawrence Heights (Heights Development, 2015).

The Final Report of the Lawrence-Allen Secondary Plan requires that the redevelopment and revitalization of Lawrence Heights must align with Section 2 of the *Planning Act* and be "consistent with the Provincial Policy Statement" (Toronto, 2011). The report states that key aspects of the provincial policy statement which are satisfied through the plan are the "efficient use of land and public service facilities", "intensification in the context of existing and planned

development and infrastructure", and "ensuring sufficient land availability for an appropriate range and mix of employment, residential, recreational, and open spaces" (Toronto, 2011).

The LHSDP begins with outlining the challenges that local residents experience which include "chronic underemployment, physical barriers and fencing that segregate and isolate the community, the design of streets and buildings that do not reflect safe urban design principles, and the stigmatization of Lawrence Heights" (Toronto, 2012). The social development aspect of the LHSDP is rooted in its six core values that it strives to uphold, which are community connections, community services, safety, housing, green space, and employment (Toronto, 2012).

The main organizational network and communication channel that facilitates these connections amongst community members is the Lawrence Heights Inter-organizational Network (LHION), which manages service coordination amongst social service providers, community consultations, and community safety planning (Toronto, 2012). Upon reviewing member agencies and grassroots groups represented within the LHION, only one newcomer agency, North York Community House, was included. In addition, no grassroots Filipino community groups were visible participants at the date of this review. This leads back to the research question on Filipino inclusion within social development planning and urban revitalization efforts. Critical questions must be asked by key informants on how and if social development planning practices are exclusionary of Filipino migrant voices and opinions.

During the early stages of revitalization, local residents expressed mixed feelings on the project itself. "For the city, it's good, the plan. But I don't know if they're thinking about the city, or private owners, or us. Who are they doing it for? I don't know" said one local resident. The same resident also expressed that "In these community meetings, the residents, they don't come"

(Dale. D, 2010). Fears that were expressed during these early stages were displacement, and growing fears of the socio-economic tensions that could arise amongst local residents when people from mixed levels of income move in, and how "the poor will lose any political battle against the rich who move in" (Dale D., Toronto Star, 2010). On the other side of the argument, residents have expressed that income diversity is welcome as well as opportunities to improve employment outcomes (Kane.L., 2013).

Throughout the course of the *Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (GPGGH)*, areas that are determined underused and within close proximity to a transportation node (such as a TTC subway or GO Transit station) are subject intensification. **Section 1.2.1** of the provincial Growth Plan defines intensification as the "development of a property, site or area at a higher density that currently exists" through development, re-development, infill development, or through the "expansion or conversion of existing buildings" (Ontario, *2017*). Correspondingly, under the provincial Growth Plan, intensification is highlighted as a guiding principle where the Government of Ontario will "prioritize intensification and higher densities to make efficient use of land and infrastructure and support transit viability" (Ontario, 2017). Under **Section 3.1.2** of the City of Toronto Official Plan (COTOP), intensification will occur "over the next several decades" in areas that are "appropriate", which includes the downtown areas and city centres (Toronto, 2015). Furthermore, **Section 3.1.2** presents the process of intensification as an "extraordinary opportunity" to both "build the next generation of buildings" and as an opportunity for Toronto to elevate its status as a major North American city (City of Toronto, 2015). Ultimately, these regulatory processes and planning rationales serve as justifications for development applications, and enable investors, stakeholders, and developers in securing permits and approvals from city planning. While understood by those who are trained in urban planning, this language is often

inaccessible and exclusionary to those who are not familiar with key reference documents and land use policy. The GPGGH, COP, and Secondary Plans feature convoluted language and can serve as a barrier to those who want to counter, challenge, and effect change within these systems.

With many competing responsibilities, community expectations, timelines, target benchmarks, and planning deliverables layered upon one another; from the land use planning of Lawrence Heights, to the alignment the revitalization efforts to the broader GPGGH and COTOP, it is easy to see how the needs of the Filipino community may be overlooked throughout these processes. Through this paper's analysis and consideration for the lived experiences and needs of the Filipino community, much will be revealed as to how the Filipino community is often excluded from important conversations and opportunities in urban renewal, the experiences they go through from the systemic and interpersonal levels, and how they can be thoroughly engaged in a city planning process that would place high value on immigrant needs.

CHAPTER 4: UNDERSTANDING THE PLIGHT OF THE FILIPINO PEOPLE

Local Context

In order to fully understand the plight of the Filipino people, and the challenges they experience, it is important to have a strong understanding of the Live-In-Caregiver program and the phenomenon of long-term family separation and reunification. A vast majority of caregivers in Canada are Filipino women from the Philippines (Tungohan, 2013). For this reason, this section of the paper will focus on Filipina feminisms and draw on the work on scholarship within these field. From the 1950's to the 1980's, a majority of caregivers in Canada were West Indian Women,

however by the early 1990's Filipino women made up the majority of all caregivers around the world (Macklin, 1992, 692). Macklin maintained that "Canadians typically choose to hire live-in caregivers in order to pursue their professional careers" and stresses that the need for such a program was a result of Canada's lack of child care support services (Macklin, 1992, 684).

Ethel Tungohan, a professor of political studies at York University pursues research on the caregiver program within the lens of Filipina Feminisms studies, and has produced important research on the implications of the caregiver programs within the Canadian context. Tungohan's analysis of the caregiver program is critical in this paper because of the analyzers she employs and how she situates herself in migration, feminist, and political science studies. Tungohan maintains that Canada's immigration system comes from a legacy of systemic racial bias, and her work explicates how "low-status of carework" is viewed as "unskilled" (Tungohan, 2012). To mitigate these challenges of Filipina migrant workers, Tungohan argues that caregivers should assume the role of "political actors" and be given the ability to have control over the decisions and outcomes of their lives (Tungohan, 2012).

Glenda Bonifacio's text *Pinay in the Prairies* presents an analysis of Filipino women's experiences in Alberta, Saskatchewan, and Manitoba. Bonifacio focused on uncovering the lived experiences of Filipino migrant women navigating Canada's labour market. Bonifacio states that Filipino migrant women have a tendency to "set aside their own personal career aspirations and work for the benefit of their children" (Bonifacio, 2013). This lack of personal advancement ultimately causes Filipino women to remain in care work even after their term has completed, however because of the opportunity to contribute remittances, and the appeal of earning a salary in Canadian dollars during a time when the Philippine's peso in in decline, Filipino caregivers in Canada continue to be subjected to this cycle.

Understanding Tungohan and Bonifacio's work helps uncover, at a local level, the direct implications of Canada's LIC program and Philippine migration to Canada on the lives of Filipino families based in Lawrence Heights, which will be discussed throughout the participant interviews with Filipino community development professionals in Chapter 5. The deprofessionalization of Filipinos in Canada is a theme that resonated with key informant participants who were interviewed, and the recommendation of Filipinos being empowered as "political actors" as Tungohan mentions will influence the recommendations in Chapter 6.

Economic and Social Marginalization

Extensive research has been conducted by academic institutions and grassroots community groups on the implications of the LIC on the lives of Filipino families in Canada (with a majority of this work conducted in Ontario). Among these challenges include the power imbalance between employers and the possibility of exploitation in the workplace with such precarious working conditions (Banerjee et al., 2017, 5). With regards to addressing the challenges and barriers that caregivers experience, three recommendations were made to address these issues, which include: 1) "giving caregivers open work permits that are not tied to their employers", 2) "eliminating quotas limiting the numbers of caregivers who can be granted permanent residency", and 3) "give all caregivers landed status upon arrival" (Banerjee et al., 2017). Research on Philippine-Canadian migration has suggested that Filipinos are "indoctrinated into work culture", and are often "appeased and conditioned to appreciate their employers" (Polanco, 2005). Correspondingly, it has been suggested that Canadian employers "increasingly relied on new incentives- like the

prospect of Canadian citizenship- to recruit motivated and disciplined migrant subjects at domestically low wages" (Polanco, 2005).

One of the prevailing issues of the live-in-caregiver program is the experience of long-term family separation and reunification. These impacts include undergoing the trauma from initial separation, the overall stress of immigration, the transitional period from adolescence to adulthood, and the dearth of affordable and accessible services to support these issues (Toronto Public Health, 2011). Furthermore, Filipino youth are often particularly vulnerable during this process and in the past ten years have been subjected to high levels of violence. Referred to as the "scales of violence", Filipino youth undergo "racial violence in public spaces, narrations of grief through immigrant stories, activist responses from community organizations and a public amplification of private anxieties about racialized bodies and transnational processes" (Catungal, 2012). Catungal (2012) concludes that in order to be effective in addressing these scales of violence, one must also understand the lived experiences of Filipino youth, as well as the existing policies that often impact their life course (Catungal, 2012).

The concept of being indoctrinated into low-skilled work as discussed by Banerjee et.al, the effects of Long-Term Family Separation and Reunification, and the "scales of youth violence" by Catungal, are additional themes that continued to be addressed in the key informant interviews. Drawing from this research and understanding of the challenges that Filipino youth experience supports the understanding of why Filipino's face barriers in civic engagement and urban development processes, as they undergo an immigration experience that is unique and compounded by additional factors that impede on their settlement and integration into their new host culture in Canada. In addition, for those who wish to engage with the Filipino community in

the future, understanding this literature is crucial to contextualize and develop a comprehensive knowledge base of the challenges that Filipino newcomers experience.

Global Context: "Ethnoscapes", "Global Commodity Chains" and the "World City Hypothesis"

Through a theoretical analysis we are able to understand the caregiver phenomenon within a global and socio-spatial context. With Filipino migration reaching high peaks in over 37 cities across the world (Government of the Philippines, 2020), Filipino overseas foreign workers (OFW's) have made a considerable impact as on migration policy and practices. Canada's Live-In-Caregiver program has undergone many iterations and amendments in the past ten years as a result of the rising demand for Filipino OFW's. These movements and impacts on immigration and labor policy thrusts the diaspora of Filipino migrants into the category of "ethnoscapes" (Appadurai, 1990) within the global context. Ethnoscapes is a concept that encompasses the levels of reality that are transformed by diasporic movements, and how ones migration eventually forms a bicultural identity consciousness that transforms both the landscape and perception of spaces (Appadurai, 1990). Ethnoscapes in the Filipino-Canadian context corroborates the idea that this community has impacted issues of labor and migration policy at a national scale, sparking fierce debate with each new government struggling to manage the growth of Filipino migration patterns through family reunification, while at the same time addressing Canada's need for care for the elderly and childcare support services.

Relevant components of John Friedman's World City Hypothesis include a section he writes on "national policies whose aim is to protect the national economic sub-system from outside competition through partial closure to immigration, commodity imports and operation of international capital" (Friedmann, 1986, 71). Using this particular hypothesis that Friedmann sets

forth, the caregiver phenomenon can be seen as a way in which immigration, in this case the federally operated Live-In-Caregiver program, can be used as a tool to direct a flow of much needed labour into Canada. This new "spatial division of labor" that is created is one where Live-In-Caregivers who were previously situated in the Global South are now integrated into a realm of labour within the Global North which systematically subjugate and marginalize them (Friedmann, 1986, 70).

There are four aspects of the World City Hypothesis that apply specifically to the caregiver phenomenon, especially in the Manila-Toronto context. These theoretical components include the "integration with the world capitalist system", the "new spatial division of labour", "structural changes", and how "key cities throughout the world are used by global capital as 'basing points' in the spatial organization and articulation of production and markets" (Friedmann, 1986, 71). By utilizing this level of analysis, the exportation of labour from the Philippines to Canada can be viewed as "integration into the world capitalist system", with over 5000 Filipinos leaving the Philippines every day, and a majority of whom are likely to contribute to the Philippine economy through remittances (Polanco, 2005). This then creates a "spatial division of labour" wrought with deficiencies within two "key cities" that can be considered as "basing points", which in this instance would be the Global Cities of Manila and Toronto.

These movements of migration from one sphere of the world to another create a contentious relationship between the global north and developing countries in the global south. Migrating to Canada is seen as an opportunity for economic advancement and makes the Live-In-Caregiver program appealing because of the available pathway to permanent residency. However, this opportunity is structurally flawed and results in precarious working conditions, low-wages, de-

skilling, and systemic economic marginalization that is often overlooked and continues to perpetuate.

In order to pursue a study of the Filipino community in Lawrence Heights within the context of inclusion in urban development processes, it was crucial to engage with this literature to develop a broader, global understanding of the caregiver phenomenon, and where the Philippine diaspora in Toronto fits in with the broader network of global cities.

The commodification of Filipino labor across the world and the demand for cheap domestic labor in Canada, feeds into this ever expanding cycle of migration between the two cities with results that can be seen within the Lawrence Heights community and the urban inequalities that the Filipino community is now situated in.

CHAPTER 5: KEY INFORMANT PARTICIPANT INTERVIEWS

The key informant interviews revealed many critical insights into why and how the LHSDP was exclusionary of Filipino immigrant concerns. The insights provided from these professionals and key informants were diverse and resulted in compelling explanations and considerations for future urban revitalization efforts. Drawing from a purposive sampling framework, interview questions focused on the lived and professional experiences of the key informants. With backgrounds spanning the different spheres of planning, the data collected throughout this process was informative and comprehensive.

The first participant was Dani Saad, a Coordinator of Stakeholder Engagement and Special Projects at the Office of the Chief Planner's Office in the City of Toronto. When asked about the barriers that planners experience when engaging with newcomer Filipinos, and immigrant

communities within the development of the LHDSP, Saad expressed that biggest among them were "barriers in the planning process" which included the "cultural competency of staff, and a lack of resource in public engagement" (Saad, 2020). Saad makes note of the existing equity lenses that are located within the City that can be seen as a resource, which includes the development of a public equity tool-kit being developed with the Wellesley Institute that will focus on inclusion in planning practices.

Equity lenses within the City of Toronto are available across various divisions through the tool-kits, resources, and reports they produce. Among them include the Toronto Newcomer Strategy, from the Toronto Newcomer Office, the Toronto Youth Equity Strategy, from the Youth Development Unit, and the Equity and Diversity Plan, from the Equity, Diversity, and Human Rights Office. "We have more data than we can ever need, and what we need to focus on now is to create the housing we need and address the affordability crisis over the past 30 years" (Saad, 2020). Saad suggests that action, not consultation, are necessary when addressing broader urban issues are necessary in improving the LHDSP consultation process. When engaging in public consultation in revitalization processes, one challenge is determining if you are connecting with the people who are representative of the communities in the specific site. "In the case of Lawrence Heights, the situation was a bit more of a grass tops versus grassroots situation. The City might think they are engaging with the right people there is no mechanism of knowing if you meet with a community leader" (Saad, 2020). This challenge is compounded by the fact that for big revitalization, there is a timeline and a pace that you need to move, and people get left behind."

This interview was concluded by discussing the role of the Toronto Planning Review Panel, which is a representative mix of city residents who are brought in as a representative of different demographics. "Within the room, this panel is effective because we have a mix of people that don't

typically go to meetings. These people share their knowledge and lived experience" (Saad, 2020). Solutions recommended include developing a connective tissue to ensure that engagement is rigorous and to be mindful that engagement requires financial and considerable staffing to achieve.

Saad's interview was significant because it addresses the lacking of cultural competency that exists among planning staff that are often focused on project timelines, and the targets and deliverables set forth from land use planning and official plan requirements. This interview is valuable because it provides a high level perspective of municipal planning, coming from the vantage point of the Chief Planner's Office in the City of Toronto. Saad's comments on cultural competency will greatly inform the first recommendation presented in Chapter 6 of this paper.

Naama Blonder is a Principal Planner at Smart Density, a full-service architecture and planning firm that is housed within the Centre for Social Innovation. With an immigration background and a passion for creating inclusive communities, Blonder infuses her personal values and professional experiences in her urban planning work. When asked about the challenges immigrants experience in urban planning processes, Blonder (2020) shared that "Based on the cultures we are coming from it is not common for the public to have a voice". Strategies in empowering newcomers in urban development processes and helping them exercise that "voice" is an important goal in addressing the research question of this paper. "For immigrants they want to know that they are going to make it; finding a place to live and having a place to work." Blonder (2020) states that there are two aspects to consider when creating space for newcomers:
"first is the physical space, which is a space that a community belongs to; before you integrate into a society; know that you are a part of a community, and second it's to keep newcomers informed about urban development processes. Newcomers should understand what is going on in the city, and voice their concerns about development whether it is a park, a street or residential

neighbourhood, understanding how the city works is key. This starts with awareness; to let them know what is going on and to let them know that they have a say I this process; to let them know that someone on the other side is listening".

Drawing on her background as an urban planner who has engaged with many master planning projects, Blonder maintains that inclusion must also extend to the way planning firms are managed. "To make sure that practices see the value in working with newcomers" and that for visible minorities it starts as social change to make sure we are aware of the planning process. Overall, it starts with early awareness and to make sure that companies are not only aware but see the merit in getting newcomers involved." (Blonder, 2020).

Blonder's interview provided important insights into the work culture in planning firms, and suggests that planners, architects, and city builders must place high value in immigrant input during the consultation and community engagement stages of development. In addition, Blonder's recommendation of education and training for immigrants on the planning processes is also critical in developing strategies for immigrant inclusion in city building processes. These points that Blonder suggests will greatly inform the recommendations presented in Chapter 6 of this paper.

The first key informant from the Filipino community is Edward Lamson, an urban planner and land use lawyer based in New York who has over a decade of experience doing community development work for the Filipino community in Toronto, bringing with him both knowledge of planning and the Philippine diaspora. With regards to immigrant inclusion, Lamson made note that English is often a barrier in the planning process, and how at his practice "a lot of effort is made to include immigrant groups through community postings, grassroots efforts, community board system; approvals go through neighbourhood boards made up of appointees at the sub-council level so representation is really important to get community buy in as well at these meetings."

Within his planning practice "there is always a requirement that community engagement be connected with translation services, and we know that many immigrants have variable work hours; there is always an effort to include childcare and family resources, and we understand that there are residents that do not have as flexible schedules; a lot of things beyond language that make outreach more accessible." (Lamson, 2020).

A key element of community engagement that involves diverse people is the "Community Board" which is comprised of local residents who have a say in planning decisions. These boards are comprised of local residents in each borough of New York who "have a say in land use decisions that affect the local neighbourhood, and the community board is the first point of reference for community members about rezoning or improvement of property." Furthermore, Lamson states "Community boards weigh in on rezonings, on permits on development applications, and other land use issues. These development applications have to go through the Community Board first before it goes to the Department of City Planning; if it's a contentious issue they would likely hold public hearings and have recommendations to the Department of City Planning. In some cases, the findings may be non-binding (applies to specific zoning cases), and some may have final determinations (certain approvals, special use permit). Lastly, your community board can issue opinions on variances and special use permits, rezoning, and improvements of real property." (Lamson, 2020).

Lamson's interview presents several strong suggestions for immigrant inclusion in city planning. First is the way in which consultations are conducted, making them accessible through child-minding services and supports thereby improving accessibility for immigrant families. Drawing from the example that Lamson shared about land governance in New York, the concept of adapting a "Community Board" that holds significant power in land governance is a compelling

model that would greatly empower local residents and new migrants within the planning process. These best practices from New York that Lamson has shared informs the recommendations section in Chapter 6.

During the group interview with service providers who support newcomer Filipinos in Lawrence Heights, many important insights were shared. Key informants include Maria Espina a Caseworker at Children's Services, City of Toronto based in Lawrence Heights, Vhil Castillejos, a Program Coordinator at Yorktown Family Services who runs Filipino youth programming at John Polanyi Collegiate Institute- a local high school in the Lawrence Heights Community, and Kim Nguyen, a resident of Lawrence Heights, and a School Settlement Worker at North York Community House, a newcomer serving agency based in Lawrence Heights. When asked about barriers that Filipino newcomers may experience during community engagement processes for urban development, Espina shared that "For adults, Filipinos work a lot, if you attend a community meeting you are giving up time and sleep and time with your family; most Filipinos don't have that schedule and have to rush into a second job." Espina also mentions the phenomenon of family reunification for Filipino families and states that "for Filipino newcomer youth, the separation from home hard for them to find community again". (Espina, 2020).

As a Filipino newcomer youth, and service provider, Castillejos was drawing on his lived and professional experiences throughout the course of the interview. When it came to community engagement in urban development processes, Castillejos states that he "never felt like I wanted to be here. And a lot of Filipino youth that he works with feel like no matter what we do it will be the same outcome anyway" with the feeling that "nothing will ever really happen any way so why bother trying" (Castillejos, 2020). Espina agreed with a similar sense of powerlessness, and stated

that for Filipino newcomers, "the power dynamics of urban planning are challenging because they feel like they can't make a difference because they're not white." (Espina, 2020).

Kim Nguyen had several insights to share on the built form of Lawrence Heights:

"There is no light outside. Behind the subway there is no light which is concerning because it's dark when there's a lot of things going on. Filipinos mostly go to the malls, basketball courts; libraries, the gym, and the local community centre, improving these areas should be of focus for redevelopment and impact the Filipino community the most". (Nguyen 2020).

Espina added a key point on the formation of temporary space for Filipino communities in Lawrence Heights, and how many service providers often turn to short-term permit contracts to rent out rooms and gyms in the Lawrence Heights mall, community centre and school, with no sense of permanency when it comes to space. Espina shares that one example of such example "temporary space" that community workers use to support Filipino newcomers is a program known as the Priority Schools Initiative (PSI).

"This program enables non-proft and grassroots community groups to temporarily book space in local schools such as gyms and classrooms, and is administered by the Toronto District School Board (TDSB) and Toronto Catholic District School Board (TCDSB). Most recently the PSI was defunded by the government of Ontario, the TCDSB now charges organizations for space use and the TDSB created a temporary source of funds so certain community-based programs can still be free" (Espina, 2020).

Based on these key informant interviews with service providers, much of what was studied and examined throughout this paper continue to be relevant. This includes the elements of

economic marginalization of the Filipino community, the phenomenon of long-term family separation and renunciation having an impact on Filipino community engagement in urban revitalization efforts, and the interplay of permanent and impermanent space that the Filipino community has in Lawrence Height

CHAPTER 6: RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on an analysis of the participant interviews, which involved participants from the diverse fields of immigration & settlement, planning, architecture, and community engagement this section presents three recommendations of how essential services and wrap-around supports could be provided to newcomer communities, such as the formation of a network of service providers which include the Local Immigration Partnership (LIP), as well as local newcomer settlement support agencies.

Recommendation 1: Increasing the cultural competency of planners

Drawing from the interview with Dani Saad, planners are often in situations where they are engaging in a development project in an immigrant dense community, would meet with a community leader during a neighbourhood consultation, and would assume holds this individual holds the knowledge and lived experiences of an entire community. To form a deeper understanding and to increase a planners cultural competency in understanding immigrant communities, planning staff should meet with local School Settlement Workers (social service workers who work closely with newcomer youth and families) in the nearby schools, which in this

case would be John Polanyi Secondary School, a high school that is known to have a very large Filipino population. Furthermore, it would be imperative that urban planners seek out the opinions of Live-In-Caregivers, who often work outside of a typical 9-5 work schedule, and are mostly available on weekends. Through this community consultation process an urban planner would then begin to develop an understanding of the challenges that new Filipino migrants face, directly from a front-line informant.

Recommendation 2: Engage in meaningful community engagement

Planners must ask questions related to the production of space, and develop a list of the types of spaces that Filipino migrants would like to see in their neighbourhood. This consultation should also be comprehensive and include an opportunity for Filipino migrants to share what types of social, recreational, and local services they feel would benefit their everyday lives. Implicit in these community consultations is to unpack and define key urban planning terminology that can often be convoluted and inaccessible to those who do not possess an urban planning education. Ultimately, bridging the gap between urban planning and the immigration and settlement is key in improving urban inequalities within the context of the LHSDP.

Recommendation 3: Using a Social Impact & Assessment Lens (Parkins & Mitchell, 2016)

A final recommendation is that the revitalization and intensification of the plan should move forward using a social impact and assessment lens. John R. Parkins and Ross E. Mitchell, in their study of social impact assessment, state that planners should take into consideration aspects of peoples' lives that range from social capital assessment, economic capital, natural capital, and human capital (Parkins & Mitchell 2016). By using a social capital assessment approach over the remaining course of the intensification process, project staff would have a framework that would

support them in creating "stronger linkages" between intensification development and the sustainability of the surrounding community (Parkins & Mitchell, 2016).

Recommendation 4: Pursue Planning with an equity lens that is informed by critical urban theory and the right to the city (Marcuse, 2010).

Planners should pursue their work with an equity lens that would help shape and inform their understanding of planning. The goal of this recommendation is to help planners look beyond the policy and land development aspects of their work (which is the typical focus of planners who work within the consultancy and developer context), and think critically about city planning processes and how it can be used to support those who are "directly oppressed due to race, ethnicity, gender, and class" (Marcuse 2009), and be critical about how this growing urban divide is perpetuated by those who currently have control on "the right to the city" which include the "financial powers, the real estate owners, and the political hierarchy", among others (Marcuse 2009). Through this equity lens, planners would be better equipped to make equity considerations when pursuing their work, and go beyond what is expected of them from a land use policy level.

Recommendation 5: Drawing from relevant geographical and demographic data of a planning site, ensure representation in the planning process.

The final recommendation is to ensure that geographical and demographic data is used in a way that is thoughtfully considered when proceeding with the planning, revitalization, or redevelopment of a community (especially within sites that are ethnically diverse and immigrant dense). Applying this recommendation towards the Lawrence Heights revitalization process would result in having Filipinos overseeing and being a part of the formation of the LHSDP, ensure that Filipinos are more involved in the community consultations process, and would

ultimately result in having their concerns, desires, and needs attended to in a way that was not considered in the LHDSP's current state. Correspondingly, recommendation 5 can be applied to other communities that are being redeveloped, and would ultimately result in a more ethnically and culturally diverse planning sector.

CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSION

Ultimately, by learning about the deep colonial histories of oppression, and the plight that marginalized communities underwent will help future planners uphold social justice values that is greatly needed in this current political climate. Based on the research provided in this paper, it is clear that the erasure of communities, spatial divide, and the economic and social decline of marginalized people often followed urban growth in a city. Limitations within this paper are that it is hyper focused on a specific site and a specific community, and should be seen as an early attempt to lay the groundwork for further studies on Filipino diasporas and urbanisms in Toronto. Should this research be pursued in future scholarship, it should take into account the Filipino diasporic "ethnoscapes" (Appadurai, 1990) across the City of Toronto and continue the discourse of Filipino inclusion in urban revitalization processes in other sites that have large Filipino populations such as Thorncliffe Park, Bathurst and Wilson, Scarborough, and St. Jamestown.

With the impending rise of condominium developments, to the ever changing landscape of urban centres, the world is constantly evolving and planners still remain to be at the forefront of this transformative change- all of which has permanent and enduring implications. From the erasure of Arabic cultures, to the racism and spatial segregation experienced by the African American communities in the United States, to learning about

how the tools of planning have been implemented to limit, subjugate, control, and colonize communities, it is clear how powerful and influential urban planning is, and how the many spheres of planning (environmental, social and community policy, and urban and regional) often intersect within industry, the private sector, and governmental bodies. This comprehensive understanding of planning will thereby help inform future planners on the type of city they want to create, which would hopefully lead to the formation of a better world.

What is often missing from the existing canon of Philippine Canadian scholarship is the need to think critically about the production of space for the Filipino community. Urban planners are often hyper focused on urbanization within the context of aligning with density targets, growth plan mandates, and development projects are often only warranted based on the financial return that a specific project would bring to the municipality or region. For this reason, the incorporation of comprehensive social plans that take into consideration the immigrant and newcomer experience would be vital to addressing many of the challenges that have been addressed in this paper.

The deficiencies in the plan, however, is rooted in the fact that these plans have not gone through the due diligence in outlining a comprehensive social development plan that takes into consideration the diversity and emerging needs of the Filipino community in this area. LIP's are formations of newcomer settlement service providers that make quarterly and annual reports on the needs and trends that immigrant communities are experiencing. These concerns are then brought forward to a regional LIP network and feeds into a national report that is produced annually. LIP's are considered to be at the higher level of communication channel. **Oftentimes, critical newcomer services staff are typically not involved in a local LIP, which often creates**

a disconnect between the lived experiences of newcomers and information that LIP's receive. Therefore, the inclusionary aspect of the Lawrence Heights must be improved in a way that encompasses and encapsulates the experiences of its local residents, a majority of whom are immigrants from the Philippines (City of Toronto, 2011). A key recommendation is that those involved in the urban planning processes (especially the development of key reference documents) must understand the deep nuances and intricacies of the immigration and settlement process through the establishment of a learning initiative for urban planners that would inform their work on social development and revitalization planning projects in immigrant dense and diverse sites/communities.

Future Filipino Canadian Scholarship Activities

The continuity of this research would include an analysis of the Manila-Toronto ethnoscapes, and expand further on the concept of Filipino urbanisms within a broader city-wide context. As a starting point for Filipino urbanism studies, this initial case study of Lawrence Heights sets forth a framework and urban planning site analysis that would be advantageous when applying it to other Filipino newcomer dense communities. In addition, future research activities shall include a comparative analysis between urban inequalities of the urbanization of Metro Manila, and how the existing oligarchy and elite Filipino families engage in a planning process that does little to mitigate or address the housing and displacement of economically marginalized Filipinos, and instead engages in an aggressive urban development process spanning housing and commercial development across the nation.

Bibliography

Appadurai, Arjun. (1990). "Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy." In *Theory and Culture Society 7; 295*. Sage Publications.

Banerjee, Rupa, Philip Kelly, Ethel Tungohan, Gabriela Ontario, Migrante Canada, and the Community Alliance for Social Justice. (2017). "Assessing the Changes to Canada's Live-in Caregiver Program: Improving Security or Deepening Precariousness?" *Pathways to Prosperity: Canada.* http://p2pcanada.ca/files/2017/12/Assessing-the-Changes-to-Canadas-Live-In-Caregiver-Program.pdf.

Barman, Jean (2007) "Erasing Indigenous Indigeneity in Vancouver", *BC Studies* 155
Billig, Michael. 2003. "Critical Discourse Analysis and the Rhetoric of Critque". In *Critical Discourse Analysis: Theory and Interdisciplinarity*, pg. 39. Palgrave MacMillan.

Berman, Marshall. 1982. "In the Forest of Symbols: Some Notes on Modernism in New York".*All That is Solid Melts into Air: The experience of Modernity* (London: Penguin) 287-348.

Bonifacio, Glenda. (2013). *Pinay in the Prairies*. UBC Press

Canada, Government of. 2015. "Noble and Wolf v. Alley". In News Archive section of Government of Canada Website. Retrieved from: https://www.canada.ca/en/news/archive/2015/04/noble-wolf-v-alley.html

Cartier, Genevieve. 2010. "The Legacy of Roncarelli v. Duplessis." In McGill Law Journal. Retrieved from: https://lawjournal.mcgill.ca/wp-content/uploads/pdf/902154-Cartier.pdf

Catungal, J. (2012) "Scales of Violence from the Body to the Globe: Slain Filipino Youth In Canadian Cities". In *Filipinos in Canada: Disturbing Invisibility*, edited by Roland Sintos Coloma, Bonnie McElhinny, Ethel Tungohan, John Paul C. Catungal, and Lisa M. Davidson. University of Toronto Press. pp. 321-340.

Coulthard, Carmen. "Cross-Cultural Representation of 'Otherness' in Media Discourse". In Otherness' In *Critical Discourse Analysis: Theory and Interdisciplinarity*, *pp. 276*. Palgrave MacMillan.

Dale, Daniel. "Mixed Feelings on Revitalizing Lawrence Heights." In Toronto Star. Retrieved from: https://www.thestar.com/news/gta/2010/02/25/mixed_feelings_on_revitalizing_lawrence_heights.html

Galtung, Johan and Ruge, Mari. 1965. "The Structure of Foreign News." In *Journal of Peace Research, Vol. 2, No. 1 (1965), pp. 64-91*. Sage Publications.

Gugler, Joseph. 1980. "'A maximum of ruralism, a minimum of urbanism': The Cuban Experience", *Studies in Comparative International Development* Summer. *Metropolis.* 2nd ed. (Chichester: John Wiley) 131-167; 196-233.

Hannerz, Ulf. 1974. "Research in the Black Ghetto: A Review of the Sixties." In *Journal of Asian and African Studies.* 9 (3-4); 139-159.

Henni, Samia (2016) "On the Spaces of *Guerre Moderne*: The French Army in Northern Algeria (1954-1962)" *Footprint* 10:12

Hulchanski, David. (2011). "Three Cities Within Toronto: Income Polarization Among Toronto's Neighbourhoods", 1970-2005. Cities Centre, University of Toronto.

Kane, Laura. (2013). "Heights Developer Named for Lawrence Heights". In *Toronto Star.* Retrieved from: https://www.thestar.com/news/gta/2013/04/29/lawrence_park_developer_named_for_revitalizati on.html

Levine, Mark. (2006) "Ceci n'est Pas Jaffa (This is not Jaffa): Architecture, Planning and the Evolution of National Identities in Jaffa and Tel Aviv: 1880-1948", in *Overthrowing Geography: Jaffa, Tel Aviv, and the Struggle for Palestine: 1880-1948* (Berkeley: University of California Press).

Macklin, A. (1992) "Foreign domestic worker: surrogate housewife or mail order servant?" *McGill Law Journal*, 37: 681-800.

Marcuse, Peter. 2009. "From Critical Urban Theory to the Right to The City". *In City, Volume 13.* Routledge.

Mumford, Eric. 2018."Designing The Modern City*." Urbanism Since 1850*. Yale University Press.

Ontario, Government of. 2017. "Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horshoe". In *PlacesToGrow.ca* website. Retrieved from http://placestogrow.ca/images/pdfs/ggh2017/en/growth%20plan%20%282017%29.pdf

Parkins, J. & Mitchell, R. 2016. "Social Impact Assessment: A Review of Academic and Practitioner Perspectives and Emerging Approaches." In *Environmental Impact Assessment: Practice and Participation.* Oxford University Press.

Philippines, Government Of. Directory of Labor Attaches. Philippines Overseas Employment Administration Website. Retrieved from: http://www.poea.gov.ph/files/POLO%20Directory%20(15%20January2020).pdf

Ritchie et. al. 2014. "In-Depth Interviews". In *Qualitative Research Practice*. Sage Publications.

Rutland, Ted (2018) "Planning the Town White: Comprehensive Planning, Scientific Racism and the Destruction of Africville" *Displacing Blackness: Planning, Power and Race in 20th century Halifax* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press)

Rutheiser, Charles (2003) "Capitalizing on Havana: The Return of the Repressed". *The Companion to the City*. Eds. Gary Bridge and Sophie Watson (London: Blackwell).

Toronto, City of. (2011). Lawrence Heights Profile. City of Toronto Website. Retrieved from: https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/8fc0-2011-NIA-LawrenceHeights.pdf

Toronto, City of. (2016). Yorkdale-Glen Park Neighbourhood Profile. City of Toronto Website. Retrieved from: https://www.toronto.ca/ext/sdfa/Neighbourhood%20Profiles/pdf/2016/pdf1/cpa31.pdf

Toronto, City of. (2017). 2016 Census: education, labour, journey to work, language of work, mobility and migration. City of Toronto Website. Retrieved from: https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/94ce-2016-Census-Backgrounder-Education-Labour-Journey-to-work-Language-Mobility-Migration.pdf

Toronto, City of. 2018. North York Centre Secondary Plan. In City of Toronto website. Retrieved from https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/8fe9-cp-official-plan-SP-8-North-York-Centre.pdf

Tungohan, Ethel. (2013). "Debunking Notions of Victimhood". In *Filipinos in Canada: Disturbing Invisibility* 161-180. University of Toronto Press.