

BOOK REVIEWS

Migration Theory: Talking Across Disciplines. Edited by Caroline B. Brettell and James F. Hollifield. New York and London: Routledge, 2000. vii + 239 pp. £13.99. ISBN 0 415 92611 4.

International Migration into the 21st Century: Essays in Honour of Reginald Appleyard. Edited by M. A. B. Siddique. Cheltenham, U.K. and Northampton, MA: Edward Elgar, 2001. xxi + 321 pp. £59.95. ISBN 1 84064 531 8.

On Immigration and Refugees. By Michael Dummett. London and New York: Routledge, 2001. xiii + 160 pp. £7.99. ISBN 0 415 227089.

Impelled by increasing concern, expressed by politicians, the press and the public, about globalization and its consequences, the study of international migration and refugees has become a growth industry, spawning a confusing mix of theoretical perspectives, research methods, hypotheses and conclusions. In their introduction to *Migration Theory*, Brettell and Hollifield set out a table of migration theories across disciplines, indicating differences in the type of research questions, levels of analysis, dominant theories and a sample hypothesis for each discipline represented in the book: history, demography, economics, sociology, anthropology, politics and law. Omitted from the book are philosophy, psychology, geography and environmental studies, even though researchers in these fields have made important contributions, including questions of human rights, motivation for emigration, adaptation, mental health of refugees, residential distribution of migrants, and migration induced by natural and man-made disasters.

The authors contributing to *Migration Theory* make only passing references to refugees. Charles Keeley's chapter on demography maintains the distinction between 'voluntary' and 'forced' migration, while recognizing that this dichotomy over-simplifies the complex processes that induce people to move. Caroline Brettell examines the contribution of anthropology to migration studies and uses the concept 'conflict migration'. In a chapter on politics, James Hollifield discusses the role of various agencies, such as the UNHCR and the European Union, in the context of international political economy theories, and the question of regulation. Most of the authors confine their review to what sociologist Barbara Schmitter Heisler calls an 'American-centric context'. Her own research, comparing citizenship requirements in Germany and Switzerland, is an exception and this chapter provides an excellent summary of current developments in the sociology of migration. The author favours dialogue between sociologists, anthropologists and political scientists with global and post-national perspectives. She concludes that

because recent work on transnationalism emerged from different theoretical roots than the more traditional approaches associated with models of immigrant incorporation and ethnic communities, so far there have been few attempts to use the theoretical and empirical insights of the former to elucidate and inform the latter, to develop a more comprehensive model of immigrant incorporation (p. 91).

Heisler then makes a strong case for more comparative research.

The latter approach is well represented in the volume of essays in honour of Reginald Appleyard, who co-authors the opening chapter with the editor, M. A. B. Siddique. Drawn from a conference held in 1999, the essays pay particular attention to refugee migration, as well as to illegal migration and return movements. Based on informal workshop discussions at the conference, the opening chapter highlights many of the policy dilemmas experienced by governments faced with the problem of trafficking, as well as the need to recognize the claims of refugees seeking asylum. The need for more empirical research and sophisticated theorizing is emphasized. The following chapters review the experience of Europe, sub-Saharan Africa, Asia, Australia and the Americas. Although Canada is mentioned in passing by several of the authors, no Canadian social scientist is represented in this collection. This is a pity because, not only does that country have a unique history of immigration and multiculturalism, but its universities have pioneered migration and refugee studies. Fifteen leading social scientists specializing in migration and refugee research contribute to this volume, representing disciplines ranging from politics and economics to sociology, demography, geography and public health. Again, the perspectives of philosophy and social psychology are missing. Nevertheless, there is a wealth of statistical data and detailed accounts of the global migration experience at the end of the twentieth century, with some worrying scenarios for the future.

Given the growing concern at the ageing of the population in Europe, and the possible need to encourage selective immigration in the future, a chapter by McDonald and Kippen on the impact of immigration on the ageing of Australia's population is illuminating. They note that the effects upon ageing of a younger immigrant intake, or higher migrant fertility, are very small. However, they state

Given current trends in fertility and mortality, annual net migration to Australia of at least 80,000 persons is necessary to avoid spiralling population decline and substantial falls in the size of the labour force. This level of annual net migration also makes a worthwhile and efficient contribution to the retardation of population ageing. Levels of annual net migration above 80,000 become increasingly ineffective and inefficient in the retardation of ageing (p. 174).

In estimating the effects of immigration on any population, account must also be taken of emigration and resulting net gains and losses to specific age cohorts. As other contributors to this volume show, older immigrants sometimes return to their former country on retirement. Furthermore, global migration patterns involve transient professionals, as well as temporary and seasonal workers. As John Salt points out in a chapter titled 'The Business of International Migration', European migration includes categories variously described as 'transit migration', 'incomplete migration', 'migrant trafficking', 'petty trading', 'labour tourism' etc. (p. 86). He then examines the factors which have led to a growth in migrant trafficking and the efforts to control it. He concludes

these movements, including those which we have always assumed to be international migration, can be considered as the component parts of a world-wide industry, consisting of a series of businesses where it is possible to identify vested interests which seek to develop, manage and promote migration flows (p. 106).

Particularly important are the chapters in this book which deal with Africa and Asia. Whether examined from a demographic, economic or social perspective, much research on immigration and refugee movements has been undertaken from the point of view of wealthy advanced industrial countries. Some chapters in this book deal with international migration and the impact of globalization on Asia. For example, Stephen Castles discusses international migration and the nation-state, while Allan Findlay examines migration systems with reference to Hong Kong, noting that the 'dragon economies' of the Pacific require high level skill exchanges while, at the same time, the wealth generated has created a demand for low wage service labour in global city regions (p. 148). Sally Findley examines the rise of forced migration in sub-Saharan Africa, in addition to the already large numbers of economic migrants moving within and between countries, both seasonally and permanently. The author notes that governments may have wanted to discourage or repatriate migrants who came to the cities in the past but were unable to do so. The migrants eventually solved their problems and established themselves. So, she suggests 'we will learn much from the forced migrants as they rebuild community and recapture lives for themselves' (p. 305). Altogether, this book is an important contribution to refugee studies, although it highlights the need for much more sophisticated multivariate models of the migration process.

Michael Dummett, author of *On Immigration and Refugees*, is an Emeritus Professor of Logic as well as an activist engaged in anti-racism and human rights issues. This book is addressed to the general reader and avoids jargon, as well as omitting bibliographic citations. Nevertheless, it brings a rigorous philosophical perspective to an analysis of the principles which should govern the treatment of asylum seekers and other immigrants. The author draws on secular and Christian traditions to provide a framework of moral imperatives concerning the duties of a state toward refugees and immigrants. He examines questions concerning the identity of a state. He is particularly critical of those who fear being 'swamped' by alien cultures. He recognizes the right of a people to self-determination while rejecting the view that this must always mean an exclusive right to a particular territory.

The truth within the principle of national self-determination is that everyone has the right to live in a country in which he and others of a group to which he belongs are not persecuted, oppressed or discriminated against, in which his religion, language, race and culture are not reviled or held up to contempt and in which he can fully identify himself with the state under whose sovereignty that country falls (p. 10).

After setting out general principles, the author goes on to review international law and conventions concerning human rights and responsibilities toward refugees. Dummett recognizes that these may be anachronistic in today's global context. He draws attention to the enormous differences between countries in their treatment of particular categories of asylum seekers, such as those from Sri Lanka and Somalia, the majority of whom are regarded as satisfying the UN Convention criteria when they apply in Canada, but not in Britain. The author is particularly critical of those who use

deterrent measures against asylum seekers, and incite prejudice against them. He insists that the first requirement for an immigration policy to be just is that it should not be racially discriminatory (p.61). He goes on to show that, in the case of Britain and Europe, racism has prevailed.

Part Two of the book provides a brief history of immigration and refugee policies, in the UK and the European Union, from the 1960s to the present day. From Enoch Powell's polemical forecast of 'rivers of blood', in 1968, to New Labour's more recent 'constant stream of propaganda flowing against bogus asylum-seekers' (p. 127-8), the author shows how the government and the press have fostered racism among the white British public. In the light of violent clashes that have occurred in some northern English cities since the publication of this book, it would be appropriate to add that the effects of de-industrialization, and consequent high unemployment among young males of all races, has provided fertile ground for right-wing extremist organizations to stir up racist hostility. The ultra-nationalist propaganda of such groups has gained a spurious legitimacy from the government's anti-immigration measures. Dummett concludes with the following stark warning:

Diverse currents swirl about Europe: currents of panic, cruelty and hatred; a strong current of obtuse selfishness, oblivious to its likely consequences, and a current of sanity and humanity. Only if the last predominates will there be hope of averting disaster for the world outside Europe and within it (pp. 152-3).

Of the three books reviewed here, *International Migration into the 21st Century* is the most scholarly and original in its contribution to migration and refugee studies. *Migration Theory* is a good introduction to the field of migration studies and will be useful to students, despite its limited review of refugee questions, and its somewhat myopic geographic coverage. *On Immigration and Refugees* is also limited in the countries it deals with but, as an inexpensive paper-back designed for a wide readership, it may have a greater educational value, and eventually influence policy-makers more than any academic research.

Anthony H. Richmond *York University, Toronto*