REANIMATING DISSONANCE:
CULTIVATING THE ANTECEDENTS OF BARRY HARRIS’ CONCEPT OF
MOVEMENT AS A MULTIDIMENSIONAL PEDAGOGICAL TOOL FOR ONTARIO
POST-SECONDARY JAZZ CURRICULA

BRIAN JUDE DE LIMA

A DISSERTATION SUBMITTED TO
THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES
IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE OF
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

GRADUATE PROGRAM IN MUSIC
YORK UNIVERSITY
TORONTO, ONTARIO

April 2017

© Brian Jude de Lima, 2017
Abstract

One of the challenges faced in post-secondary jazz education across the GTA is finding qualified instructors who are familiar with dialogical methods for teaching African American jazz histories. More specifically, finding and hiring African American instructors whose musical genealogy can be delineated from “black” oral/aural histories and can draw from these historicities. Unless the narratives of this music are unpacked, analyzed and taught from its internal elements, which embodies the symbiosis and synthesis of African American dance, theatrics, poetics and American black English that encapsulates the “African American-ness” in jazz, then there remains a risk that this folk music will become more and more diluted. Consequently, it is my belief that current music educators across the Greater Toronto Area (GTA) should consider alternative methods of pedagogy if students are to understand the historicity— the historical authenticity of this African American folk music. The idea for this study originated from my observation of a lack of “African American-ness”—African American narratives not being used as a pedagogical tool in post-secondary jazz curricula across the GTA. Therefore, this multi-case study will lead to the creation of an alternative curriculum that incorporates new teaching methods based on African American narratives. Dr. Barry Harris is one such educator who incorporates new teaching methods based on African American narratives. Therefore, I seek to unpack and analyze the musical and social upbringing that contributed to African American jazz pianist and educator Dr. Barry Harris’ primary contribution to jazz education, which is his concept of movement, while also expanding upon it. When these antecedents of Harris’ concept of movement have been analyzed, they will use them as a compliance for the cultivation and filling in of gaps in post-secondary jazz curricula across the GTA.
Dedication

To my “Holy Trinity”: The Father—Earl Rudolph “Bud” Powell, The Son—Dr. Barry Doyle Harris and the Holy Spirit—Sydney Francis de Lima. Your unsurmountable pool of knowledge will live forever within, and after me…
Acknowledgements

First, I would like to thank my supervisor, Professor Sundar Viswanathan PhD, and dissertation committee members, Professors Mark Chambers PhD and Ron Westray, for supporting me on this most galactic of endeavours. I would also like to thank my professors at York University, who were very gracious in sharing their insights: Professor Christina Petrowska Quilico, Professor Dorothy DeVal PhD, Professor James Rahn PhD, Professor Michael Coghlan, Professor Michael Marcuzzi PhD, and Professor Robert Witmer. I would also like to thank the outside members of my dissertation committee Professor Jeff Packman PhD and Professor Mary Fogarty PhD for their contributions to this manuscript. I especially would like to thank Tere Tilban-Rios for always helping me to stay alert to my graduate requirements.

Next, I would like to acknowledge that this venture would not have been possible if it were not for the generous funding provided by York University, CUPE 3903 bursary/scholarship fund, and the KMB internship provided by the Faculty of Graduate Studies.

I want to thank family members, specifically the Krosel family for helping me on so many levels, lending me their constant assistance and support throughout my graduate studies; my brothers Vivian, Flavian, and Ian for being astute role models; the best man—Martino Lozej, my children Scarlett and Jude de Lima for their patience, and my parents Sydney and Angela de Lima for giving me life and their unconditional love.

Finally, and most importantly, I wish to acknowledge my incredible and supportive wife Tanya de Lima, who displayed her brilliant editorial skills throughout both my Master’s thesis and PhD dissertation. Tanya, thank you for having copious amounts of patience in putting up with all my nonsense. I share this with you, as this accomplishment is every bit as much yours as it is mine.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract .................................................................................................................................................. ii

Dedication ............................................................................................................................................. iii

Acknowledgements ............................................................................................................................... iv

List of Figures ........................................................................................................................................ xii

List of Examples .................................................................................................................................... xiii

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION OF THE STUDY .............................................................................. 1

Background of the Study ....................................................................................................................... 3

Barry Harris: Keeper of the Bebop Flame .............................................................................................. 10

Analyzing Harris’ Concept of Movement .............................................................................................. 10

Statement of the Problem ..................................................................................................................... 13

Purpose of the Study ............................................................................................................................... 15

Research Questions ............................................................................................................................... 19

Rationale and Significance of the Study ............................................................................................... 19

Organization of the Remainder of the Study ....................................................................................... 22

Delimitations ......................................................................................................................................... 23

Limitations ............................................................................................................................................. 27

Definition of Terms ............................................................................................................................... 30

CHAPTER 2: REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE ..................................................................................... 39

Delimitations of the Review of the Literature ....................................................................................... 39

Discussion of Frameworks .................................................................................................................... 40

Jazz Methodologies ............................................................................................................................... 41
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Part I: Barry Harris</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Answering Research Question 1</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music as Sound</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coleman Hawkin’s Influence on Harris</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hine’s Influence on Harris</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music as Culture</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Black Church and the Blues</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Hermeneutics of Movement</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harris’s Hermeneutic Interpretation</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socio-Cultural Dissonances</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dance and Music as Co-dependents</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Body Movement and Sexuality</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poetics and the Visual Arts</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Answering Research Question 2</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expanding Barry Harris’ Concept of Movement</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhythmical Dissonance</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Re-interpreting the “Parker ‘6’” as a Tool for Musical Phrasing and Prolongation</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmonic Reductions of Chord Types</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmonic Reductions for Improvisation</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juxtaposition of Binary Oppositions for Improvisation</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Synthesizing Thesis and Antithesis as an Expansion of Harris’ Harmonic Concept</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. Sources of Data for the Antecedents of Movement ........................................ 110
Table 2. Content Analysis of “Music as Sound.” .......................................................... 111
Table 3. Early Influences .............................................................................................. 112
Table 4. Major Influences ........................................................................................... 114
Table 5. Content Analysis of “Music as Culture” for the Antecedents of Movement ..... 118
Table 6. Baptist Church ............................................................................................... 120
Table 7. Detroit and New York .................................................................................... 123
Table 8. Rhythm ........................................................................................................... 124
Table 9. Poetics and Slang ......................................................................................... 126
Table 10. Interrelated Arts .......................................................................................... 127
Table 11. Interpretation of Harris as a Religious Figure ........................................... 134
Table 12. Pedagogy ..................................................................................................... 135
Table 13. Criticism of New Generation of Jazz Players ............................................ 140
Table 14. Criticism of Post-Secondary Jazz Education ............................................ 143
Table 15. Demographic Characteristics of Participants (N=37) .............................. 146
Table 16. Responses to Questionnaire Part 2: Questions 1 to 3 (Music as Sound) ...... 147
Table 17. Responses to Questionnaire Part 2: Questions 4 to 7 (Music as Sound) ...... 149
Table 18. Responses to Questionnaire Part 2: Questions 8 to 9 (Music as Sound) ...... 151
Table 19. Responses to Questionnaire: Questions 10 to 14 ....................................... 152
Table 20. Responses to Questionnaire Section C: Questions 15 to 20 ..................... 154
Table 21. Responses to Questionnaire Section C: Questions 21 to 26 ..................... 156
Table 22. Responses to Questionnaire Section C: Questions 27 to 33 ..................... 159
Table 23. Responses to Questionnaire Section D: Questions 33 to 44 ..................... 163
Table 24. Responses to Questionnaire Part D: Questions 44 to 55 (Classroom instruction).
...........................................................................................................................................164

Table 25. Responses to Questionnaire Part D: Questions 56-57 (Classroom instruction). ..165

Table 26. Characteristics of 23 Interviewed Participants. ..........................................................167

Table 27. Primary Themes..............................................................................................................168

Table 28. Content Analysis of Primary Theme: “Music as Sound.” ..............................................169

Table 29. Content Analysis of Primary Theme: “Music as Culture.” ............................................176

Table 30. Content Analysis of Primary Theme: “Knowledge in other Non-musical Arts.” .180

Table 31. Content Analysis of Primary Theme: “GTA jazz curricula.” ........................................182

Table 32. Triangulation of Part II (Questionnaire) and Part III (Interviews). .............................185

Table 33. Triangulation of Parts I, II, and III. Barry Harris versus GTA Participants. .............186
List of Figures

Figure 1: Four-part method of inquiry (McCracken 1988, 30) ........................................98

Figure 2: Choice of important artists by administrators and instructors ....................162

Figure 3: Twilight Sounds by Norman Lewis (1947) .......................................................216
List of Examples

Example 1: Barry Harris’ concept of movement ................................................................. 11
Example 2: Coleman Hawkins tritone substitution in the opening melody ....................... 194
Example 3: Harris refers to the chromatic scale as the “universe” .................................... 203
Example 4: The two whole-tone scales—“man,” and “woman” ........................................ 203
Example 5: The three diminished 7th chords (children) ..................................................... 203
Example 6: My depiction of Harris’s “Major 6 diminished scale” ..................................... 204
Example 7: Harris’ Major diminished scale that forms the Tonic and Dominant ............ 204
Example 8: Harris’ Major 6 diminished scale ................................................................. 204
Example 9: Howard Rees’s explanation of “6 over 4” ...................................................... 220
Example 10: The author’s initial interpretation of Parker’s “6 over 4” ............................. 221
Example 11: Retrograde of Figure 10 .............................................................................. 225
Example 12: Harris’ Major 6 bebop scale that is a synthesis of a Major 6 chord .......... 227
Example 13 My depiction of Harris’s “major 6 diminished scale” ................................... 227
Example 14: Harris’ “Major 6 diminished” scale ............................................................. 228
Example 15: Allie Wrubel’s 1937 composition “Gone with the Wind” ......................... 230
Example 16: Chords that are a synthesis of tonic and dominant function ....................... 233
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION OF THE STUDY

This study is situated with ongoing debates surrounding the institutionalization of jazz (Ake 2001; Prouty 2005; Wilf 2014). Its focus is on the teaching of jazz performance in post-secondary programs across the greater Toronto area, and in particular, how these pedagogical practices diverge from jazz understood as a practice inseparable from its history in African American culture. I base many of my critiques and suggestions for approaching jazz in and as culture on the work of renowned jazz pianist and educator, Barry Harris. This study is an important contribution for a number of reasons, including the attention provided to local context, while also offering a departure from recent critiques on Canadian jazz education, such as Kearns (2011) and Hepner (2013) that operate on a more general level.

Despite my attention to a very particular local setting, the issues I raise within this study should be asked of jazz programs in other places. This is because of my concern (one that has been voiced by other scholars) that university jazz programs have become de facto authorities on what “jazz is” and how “it should be taught,” in the wake of any number of events including the demise of active jazz club scene not only in Toronto, but also much of the world (Wilf 2014). In the Canadian context specifically, with Toronto being the nation-state’s largest city and home to several elite institutions, the power of local jazz programs to shape notions of Canadian jazz is immense and demands careful and critical attention.

Within this study, I refer to “music as sound” as representative of pedagogies that limit their concept of jazz to codified chords, scales, rhythms, motifs and the like. In contrast, drawing on a common understanding in ethnomusicology, I posit an approach to jazz that understands it through the lens “music as culture.” This emphasizes jazz as a social practice, informed by other culturally and historically performed practices. In other words, this study is based on the idea of jazz as an intertextual (or to borrow from musicologist Ingrid Monson, “intermusical”) practice that, while certainly a hybrid and informed by a
range of histories and cultures, is inseparable from its history as practiced by African Americans, and informed by their particular cultural sensibilities and historical experiences.

My research has shown that, even as African American history and culture might be acknowledged in some programs, there is a prevalent tendency within post-secondary institutions across the Greater Toronto Area (GTA) to focus on playing techniques and reduce jazz to playing techniques while abstracting them away from the people, places, and experiences in which many of these techniques emerged. Ultimately, these programs miss their mark in delivering what anthropologist Sara Cohen refers to as “the challenge to treat music as social practice and process,” while striving for an approach that is “comparative,” “holistic,” and “dialogical” (Cohen 1993, 123).

Consequently, I argue that within post-secondary jazz curricula in the GTA, at issue is a removal of “African American-ness.” And more importantly, what is an issue in the teaching of jazz within the GTA is not the removal of “blackness” (as an essential quality of the people who created jazz and the practice itself), but rather, the erasure of “African American-ness.” This may seem as a small point of semantical difference, but it has broad implications. Instead, professor Paul Gilroy stresses “routes”—a circulation of people practices, and ideas to emphasize multiplicity within a shared experience of forced migration and historical and ongoing racial othering (Gilroy 1993).

Although this leaves claims of “authenticity” open to debate, it does provide a solid footing for emphasizing history and specific context when engaging with jazz as a particularly “black” mapped practice, which is central to Dr. Harris’s pedagogy and my proposed curricula.
Background of the Study

After performing with numerous graduates and professors from post-secondary institutions across Ontario, I have found that a high majority of these individuals do not play from the compliance of how African American musicians themselves developed the music.¹ The institutionalization of jazz education has transformed what was originally an African American folk music, learned through aural/oral histories (DeVeaux 1991, 551), into a commodity that can be bought and assembled from a “big box” store. It is this transformation from the locus of folk to the conventional mainstream that has resulted in what I argue to be a dilution and removal of “African American-ness” from the music. Consequently, the current methodologies used to teach this music do not stem from this music’s original compliance (Berliner 1994; K. Prouty 2013; E. Y. Wilf 2014). Thus, students are left to their own devices in trying to understand this music by way of “how to” textbooks, or instruction by professors whose original musical upbringing/education lie in genres other than “African American music.”

Upon reflection, my jazz education had a different path. I was born in Nairobi, Kenya and was the product of a multi artist father who specialized in painting and traditional jazz guitar. Some of my father’s musical influences were the modern swing and bebop players such Count Basie, Errol Garner, Dizzy Gillespie, Wes Montgomery, and Oscar Peterson. When our family migrated over to Canada and moved into the GTA, my father wanted to find a jazz teacher for me who would embody the “feel” (phrasing and rhythm) of the African musicians he was accustomed to playing with nightly on the bandstand—especially the great African American artists he was listening to growing up. After a long search to find my first

¹ This study will use Barry Harris’ musical upbringing as a compliance class.
piano teacher (Alf Coward—an African Canadian jazz pianist from Nova Scotia who played in a style like Oscar Peterson and swing pianists of that era), I was led in the direction of what some might label as non-conventional piano curricula. Instead of learning classical piano repertoire first, as I suspect most beginner students do, my father requested that I learn to play boogie-woogie as well as to learn to improvise over the blues and jazz standards—all by ear. I was 5 years old, a poor sight-reader, and yet my father and Mr. Coward did not seem to mind. Upon further reflection, I realize that I was learning in a more aural/oral style and that this was a more authentic way of learning because it was similar to the way African American Jazz music was originally learned (DeVeaux 1991).

In my late teenage years, I started to get interested in dance and went out 3 to 4 nights a week to informal (and most of the time illegal) non-licensed afterhours establishments known to my colleagues and myself as “warehouse.” Like the Jook Joint that was an informal establishment featuring music, dancing, gambling, and drinking, primarily operated by African American people in the southeastern United States (Floyd 1995, 66–67), “warehouse” were parties held at warehouse lofts or basements of industrial buildings—embracing a community of marginalized African American subculture (Lozej 2015)—playing music deeply rooted in West African tribal rhythms—“tribal house.” Although I was still practicing and transcribing jazz daily, I found great pleasure in going to these warehouse parties because it gave me an opportunity to not only “feel” the music, but rather, physically express what I was feeling with my body movements. The act of dance—moving one’s body,

---

2 “Tribal house” music is akin to West African music in that it makes use of Interlocking (Lozej 2015)—different instrumentation playing different rhythms in different time signatures—utilizing ostinatos and having a cyclical form (Nettl 2008, 196). An example of this rhythm would be the time signature 3/4 played over the time signature 4/4 that is also known as a Hemiola.
while listening (or not listening) to music—would prove invaluable for my comprehension of rhythm, as I believe it contributed to the genesis of my jazz phrasing and improvisation.

In my early twenties, and after 20 years of studying with Alf Coward, I decided to fulfill my post-secondary jazz education requirements at Humber College in Etobicoke Ontario from 1994-1999, and this is unfortunately where I first encountered the dilemma that I consider to be the seed for this study.

As a student at Humber College, I was exposed to music that was quite modern compared to the traditional jazz that I would have expected to be the foundation of any post-secondary jazz curricula. This exposure to modern jazz genres, with a heavy emphasis on modal and post-modal genres, plus the lack of exposure to traditional genres and its musical innovators, set a precedent for what I believe to be a consistent disregard for the foundations in jazz education—traditional jazz.  

There are many examples in the jazz cannon that elucidate a building upon structure. To start, one could make the argument that swing music is built from the rhythmic structures of early ragtime and stride, but its melodies are the offspring of the “whitened” 1920s big band (S. K. DeVeaux 1999, 23). Another example that illustrates a building upon structure is the transition of the small band swing music into the controversially named bebop genre. Players such as Art Tatum, Coleman Hawkins, Lester Young and Earl Hines began to deviate upon the components of swing and helped influence the younger generation to aspire and build bebop (DeVeaux 1999, 7, 29, 438). A final, and possibly the most important example of

---

3 Also reflected in the answers by some study participants. For example, a concern that was expressed from some of the study’s participants was that if the foundations of jazz were addressed thoroughly at the genesis of a curriculum, this would foster a more thorough understanding of the “building blocks”—enabling students to assimilate and build a vocabulary based on a grounded fundamental structure (study participants M-HD, H-RD, T-RD, T-BD, H-LB and H-LP).
building upon structure emanates from early African slaves who were brought over to the United States and learned the English language after being forced to convert to Christianity (Jernegan 1916, 507–15). Although these individuals learned the English vocabulary, they, and the generations after them, started to deviate and build upon the English vernacular though phrases (syntax) and words (morphology) giving rise to slang (Jernegan 1916).

By having a traditional curriculum that covers the “foundations,” and presented early in a student’s education, would also enable students to avoid what musicologist Leonard Meyer refers to as successive deviation—the non-established norms, rhythmic figures and harmonic progressions that are not indigenous to a musical context (Meyer 1954, 246). More specifically, and in relation to the structure of jazz, Meyer states, “real jazz is folk music involving a basic ground plan and that its structure should be coherent to a formal pattern that would restrain it from complete chaos” (Meyer, 253). Meyer’s requirements are crucial as they outline the delimitations of the musical structure of jazz when viewed from its early genesis—how it cannot have any deviations within it that would infer a different structure.

Therefore, based on Meyer’s definition of successive deviation, my previous first-hand knowledge as jazz student exposed to post-secondary curricula in the GTA, combined with the experiences of performing with students and educators who teach at post-secondary institutions across the GTA, have led me to form the following concerns.

It is my argument that current music educators in the GTA are teaching jazz from a synchronic⁴ axis that cultivates the erasure of “African American-ness.” From my experience, these individuals fail to encapsulate what Meyer purports to be “musical language based on

---

structural principals” (Meyer, 63) and a “complex system$^5$ of relationships understood and used by a common group of individuals” (Meyer, 45). Thus, if these complex systems are not mandated in jazz pedagogy, then the music is never really being taught from the compliance of its genesis and genealogy. Furthermore, educators must challenge and revamp the current jazz curricula, otherwise there may be a disintegration of musical literacy over time, and jazz institutions will be creating students who do not have a thorough understanding of jazz from its roots. Even more concerning is the possibility that these students may go on to become instructors themselves at the post-secondary level, thus contributing to the creation of an ongoing feedback system created by ignorance in epistemology—from teacher to pupil.$^6$

Since I have left my studies at Humber College, I have spoken to many jazz artists and post-secondary educators around the GTA who have also raised this concern and see it as an unspoken roadblock in Canadian jazz education (study participants H-RD, T-RD, T-BD and H-LP). Unfortunately, they have also offered minimal solutions towards fixing this troubling issue. Subsequently, and after performing with countless of these graduates and professors from across the GTA, I have found that a large majority of these individuals do not play from the compliance of how African American musicians themselves learned the music (Berliner 1996, DeVeaux 1991).

My realization that there may be many jazz educators who are not fluent in early jazz music came about not only from his experiences within the Humber College environment, but also as a result of performing with students and educators from other universities and colleges

$^5$ Meyer refers to these as “complex systems,” this study will refer to them as African American “narratives” giving rise to dissonances in the music’s phrasing and rhythm.

$^6$ Since my firsthand experience at Humber College had exposed me to a curriculum that placed a musical emphasis on modern jazz from the modal and post-modal eras, this has led me to believe there would possibly be a “disconnect” if any students went on to teach from this trajectory as a result of being exposed to that environment.
around the GTA—raising his concern that certain aggregates,\(^7\) delineated from the African American historiography of this music, were most likely never learned by these individuals, and as a result, are not being passed on to students. Because of this possible gap in learning, I cannot help but wonder if ethnicity plays a factor in this dilemma—the lack of African American educators teaching or constructing jazz curricula in post-secondary institutions across the GTA might be contributing to the dilution of jazz curricula and causing a deviation from the original source and message or, what I also refers to as a void of demographic “African American-ness.”

Furthermore, within the post-secondary curricula across the GTA, some of the study participants have also raised the concerns that there are missing links to the roots of African American jazz pertaining to what I refer to within this study as African American narratives (study participants H-RD, T-RD, T-BD, H-LB and H-BS). I argue that it is these narratives or “texts” that are acting as vessels for expressing the socio-historical dissonances in African American jazz. I also argue that these “dissonances” are coping mechanisms that act twofold, elucidating a juxtaposition of two binaries—a mode of signifyn\(^{(g)}\)\(^8\) an enslaved racial past (dissonance), while also acting as a coping mechanism in overcoming that enslavement (consonance).\(^9\) Furthermore, I argue that dance, poetics (African American English—slang) and theatrics are not only the vessels for expressing these juxtaposed dissonances (Coleman

\(^7\) In this study, I refer to certain aggregates as akin to African American “dissonances” in the historicity of their music and will further explain how each of these “dissonances” further give rise to a gestalt—forming Harris’ concept of “movement.”

\(^8\) For more on signification and signifyn\(^{(g)}\), see historian Henry Lois Gates Jr.’s work *The Signifying Monkey* (1988).

2016), but also give rise to the formation of a gestalt—“African American-ness.” Thus, and as we shall see from the various supporting literature, it is this taxonomy of “African American-ness” that cultivates the prosody (slang), jazz phrasing and, most importantly, rhythm in African American music. It is also, this taxonomy of “African American-ness” that has been overlooked in post-secondary jazz curricula across the GTA (study participants T-RD, H-RD, T-BD, H-LB, and H-BS). Thus, I share in these participants views that post-secondary jazz institutions have become stagnant and complacent enterprises that neglect to offer any tangible solutions towards addressing the erasure of “African American-ness” (socio-cultural narratives that should be associated with the pedagogy of this music).

Subsequently, I argue that jazz would be better assimilated as a language if it were taught from an all-encompassing diachronic axis that places an emphasis on a vocabulary’s genesis. However, I do express a concern that even if post-secondary teachers across the GTA began to teach jazz from a diachronic axis as suggested, there would exist a dichotomy—the existence of professors that have not been exposed to various African American “narratives”\textsuperscript{10} during their musical education and therefore cannot teach from an authentic compliance.

Consequently, to overcome these barriers, I have proposed that post-secondary jazz curricula across the GTA should not just follow the musical roots of African American jazz artists and pedagogues, but rather, should go beyond and flesh out the seeds of their racial ancestry that may have contributed to the rise of certain elements within their musical output and pedagogy. As an aid to this issue, it is the focus of this study to seek the requisition of an African American jazz musician whose musical upbringing and jazz pedagogy was being

\textsuperscript{10} I refer to and explain further in this study how “narratives” give rise to African American “dissonances.”
developed during the post-Harlem Renaissance and would embody the many holistic forms of African American artistic expressions in “dissonance”\(^\text{11}\) that this study refers to as “missing African American narratives” in post-secondary jazz curricula across the GTA. Therefore, it is my proposal that Dr. Barry Doyle Harris should fulfill this role; the epistemology from his musical upbringing\(^\text{12}\) and the pedagogy he created as a young adult (Graves 2010) would contribute to, and fill any voids that are present in post-secondary education across the GTA.

**Barry Harris: Keeper of the Bebop Flame**

As an African American born in 1929, and as one of the last living jazz pedagogues who has played with the “who’s who” of jazz royalty, Dr. Barry Doyle Harris, known to his peers as the “keeper of the bebop flame,” (Bicket 2001, 3) created a methodology that gives students a fresh and more authentic approach for learning jazz. It is more authentic in that it encourages the learning of jazz using an aural/oral approach; similar to how the music was originally developed (Berliner 1996, DeVeaux 1991).

**Analyzing Harris’ Concept of Movement**

Harris, an internationally renowned jazz pianist, composer and educator, who boasts John Coltrane, Donald Byrd, Paul Chambers, Joe Henderson and a host of other greats as former students, began playing jazz in Detroit in the 1940’s (Bicket 2001). As a pedagogue, Harris has cultivated and imparted a unique approach to teaching the music of Coleman Hawkins, Charlie Parker, Earl ‘Bud’ Powell, Dizzy Gillespie and Thelonious Monk based on his unrelenting inquiry into the nature of traditional jazz and bebop. In his workshops, Harris

---

\(^{11}\) Further in this study, I explicate the multi dimensions of “dissonance” such as dance, poetics (slang) and theatrics.

\(^{12}\) Harris upbringing consists of “social” African American narratives (my personal workshop interviews from 1994-2010) that this study will glean, and be used as architectonic structures to build upon new jazz curricula in post-secondary education in the GTA.
promotes a unique harmonic palette that features the oscillation of specific chord structures constructed from what he terms “diminished” scales. His theory of moving these chord structures along various scale degrees is similar to jazz saxophonist Coleman Hawkins’ declaration, “I don’t play chords, I play movements” (Rees 1998, 60). Perhaps inspired by this notion, Harris has developed a framework for moving his chord structures along scales in much the same way that one might develop single-note improvisations from scale practice. The diminished scales, such as in the case of the major bebop scale, consists of a combination of two binaries—tonic and dominant functioning chords. When these two binary oppositions move up or down a scale in a linear fashion, they become interdependent of one another—propelling the music with forward motion by way of dissonant and consonant oscillation. Thus, the goal is to keep the chord structures moving and to create tension and resolution; this is what he calls “movement” (Example 1).

Example 1. Barry Harris’ concept of movement resulting in the modulation of concord and discord binary oppositions.

Conversely, Harris makes use of another approach in creating movement by way of negotiation—an intertwining of binary oppositions—notes borrowed from tonic and

---

13 Different from the jazz definition of a diminished scale, which is also known as the Octatonic scale.

14 Harris views the Major bebop scale as a Major 6th chord, plus a diminished 7th chord that is functioning as a dominant 7th with a b9—created from the seventh degree of the tonic (there is no root in this dominant functioning chord—thus its internal movement is created by the 2 pairs of tritones and their need for resolution).

15 Harris’ concept of movement could be viewed as a literal representation. For example, the voice-leading of concord and discord harmonies are a harmonic movement. Conversely, Harris’ concept could also be viewed as a figurative representation of a political movement—his mandate to eradicate conventional modern jazz pedagogy that he sees happening globally (Graves 2010; Panken 2013; Shermer 2015).
dominant functioning structures played simultaneously. Although these chords are originally independent functioning structures, Harris’ negotiation of them explicates them not only as independent chord qualities, but in this manner, are vitally interdependent of one another.

It is within this approach where chordal movement becomes quite colourful as notes are borrowed from the opposite functioning chord family. For example, when voice leading with both tonic and dominant functioning chordal structures, the tonic functioning chord may have dominant functioning notes in its structure and the dominant functioning chord may have tonic functioning notes in its structure—giving the music an erratic and non-resolute sound. In this manner, the chord structures can become incestual—tonic and dominant functioning notes intertwined within one another—giving nuance and originality to voice leading.  

Although Harris’ concept of movement has been taught quite extensively by the late bebop pianist Frans Elsen at the Koninklijk Conservatorium in Den Hague, the Netherlands from 1992-2008 (Harris interview 2014), the concept seems to be among an exhaustive list of supposedly credible “how to play jazz” methods—similar to what countless primary (collegiate level institutions) and secondary (publications) resources may infer to as “traditional” jazz pedagogy. Thus, I argue that the true nature of movement—its historicity, can only be deconstructed and analyzed from a palette of resources drawn from Harris’ musical youth and what I have referred to within this study as “music as sound” and “music as culture.” Both of these lenses will be explicated further in this study.

---

16 I will go into greater depth of the union of binary oppositions in Harris concept of movement further in this study.
Statement of the Problem

One of the challenges faced by post-secondary jazz education across the GTA is finding qualified instructors who are familiar with dialogical methods for teaching African American jazz histories and more specifically, hiring African American instructors whose musical genealogy can be traced back to African American oral/aural histories, and therefore, can draw from these historicities.\(^{17}\)

I suspect that, among the many African Americans or African Canadians who were raised in an environment that nurtured jazz as its contemporary music, there may not be many of these individuals who are still alive or have the proper accreditation and designation to teach in post-secondary institutions. This presents a pedagogical dichotomy—that is, although these individuals hold authentic life experiences from oral/aural histories passed on by proxy (their socio-cultural environment), they may never get a position in academia because they have not obtained the proper academic accreditation and designation.

Next, pilot study participants Y-WR and Y-VS share the belief that the trajectory and the urbanization of jazz may have just evolved into modern trends in “underground” music cultures such as rap and hip-hop. By “underground,” I am suggesting music that transcends the highly formulaic commercial and conventional mainstream by offering its listeners sincere and intimate lens into creative expression. For example, artists such as beat poet and musician Gil Scott Heron, known primarily for his work as a “spoken word” performer in the 1970s and 1980s, featured musical works that were a fusion of jazz, blues, and soul—as well as lyrical content concerning social and political issues of the time in the form of rapping. Heron also coined the term “bluesologist,” which he used to refer to himself, and which he

\(^{17}\) For example, according to my research data, there was a high number of Caucasian teachers teaching jazz in post-secondary institutions across the GTA as compared to African American or African Canadians.
defined as a “scientist who is concerned with the origin of the blues” (The Associated Press AP 2011).

Known in underground culture as the “Godfather” of rap (The Associated Press AP 2011), Heron claimed he was just making “black music” or “black American music” and further stated that black Americans are now a tremendously diverse essence of all the places they have come from and the music and rhythms they brought (The Associated Press AP 2011). Heron at the Black Wax Club in Washington, D.C. in 1982, cited writers Langston Hughes, Sterling Brown, Jean Toomer, Countee Cullen and Claude McKay as among those who had taken the blues as a poetry form in the 1920s and fine-tuned it into a “remarkable art form” (The Associated Press AP 2011). Heron’s claim that “the blues was first expressed as Harlem Renaissance poetry” is crucial as it also provides an explanation of how the diachronic trajectory of traditional Jazz evolved into rap and hip-hop (Schonfeld 2012). Given this type of scenario, African American baby boomers who were born after 1955 (called “Generation Jones”) may have been acculturated into an environment that saw jazz music as a social and political revulsion—a result of the fight for freedoms and black civil rights (Sullivan 2016, 36-37).

If Heron’s pontification serves true, it is inevitable that jazz could never remain static because of its ever-evolving nature—a reflection of the social and political narratives of the time. It is these social and political narratives that may have marginalized African Americans from teaching in academia, as well as the diachronic trajectory that jazz has taken in its manifestation of new genres (rap and hip-hop) that have left a gap in GTA pedagogy—resulting in what this study has previously mentioned as a void of “African American-ness.”

Unless the narratives of this music are unpacked and taught from an insider lens, that is—the embodiment of African American historicity—the symbiosis and synthesis of African
American dance, poetics, that encapsulates prosody, phrasing and rhythm—there remains a risk that this music will be forever lost as it becomes increasingly diluted.

**Purpose of the Study**

The purpose of this study is to develop a treatise that will explicate and expand upon the antecedents of Dr. Barry Harris’ concept of movement while showing its crucial need for application across GTA post-secondary jazz curricula.

The primary goal of this study is to show dissonance as a multi-dimensional enterprise—acting as a precursor to and the catalyst for the inception of the development of Barry Harris’ concept of movement. Therefore, I aim to show two philosophical lenses that offer different treatises on the possible inception of “dissonance” found in Harris’ concept of movement, and how their applications may lead to a more sustainable architecture in understanding movement’s genealogy. To fulfill such a requisite, it is necessary to explicate both philosophical lenses.

Thus, to grasp the essences of what I have labelled “music as sound,” and “music as culture,” I offer the reader Johnson and Christensen’s quote that embodies both these lenses attributes.

Individuals are born into social/cultural structures that strongly influence what they will become and also what they view as real, important, and good…Individuals are seen as becoming what the larger social, cultural, and linguistic [music] structures provide. People follow accepted rules and practices as defined through their socialization and based in their day-to-day lives. (Johnson and Christensen 2007, 390–91)

The significance of the quote to this study is that it insinuates that individuals, such as in the case of Harris and jazz educators across the GTA, are products of their environment, influenced by the larger social and cultural music structures around them; thus,

---

18 According to Statistics Canada, the population of the GTA in 2017 was 6,242,300 (Government of Canada 2017).
19 As indicated by Johnson and Christensen (Johnson and Christensen 2007, 390–91).
promulgating and disseminating musical discourse from this inherent compliance. For example, and as this study will show, Harris’ musical trajectory emanated from an African American culture in which he participated musically by playing and socializing with some of most prominent jazz musicians of that time. By interacting both musically and socially with individuals such as Coleman Hawkins, Charlie Parker, Dizzy Gillespie, Thelonious Monk, and Earl “Bud” Powell; Harris, whether he knew it or not, was building an architectonic blueprint for what would become his future pedagogy and methodologies.

Conversely, according to study participants T-RD, H-RD, T-BD, H-LB, jazz educators across the GTA, who did not have the privilege to play or socialize consistently with this calibre of African American musicians, built their own architectonic blueprints of what they believed constituted jazz pedagogy and methodology. Adding to this dilemma (and not trying to be polemic), the possibility that the GTA is a musical environment that has less prominent African American jazz musicians than Caucasian Canadian musicians, would be one reason post-secondary jazz curricula across the GTA is devoid of what I also label as “African American-ness.” For example, on the topic of jazz and globalization, notoriety is given to non-African American talents such as Bickert, Kauffman, McConnell, Thompson, and McDonald (to name but a few), but other than Oscar Peterson, Oliver Jones, Wray Downes, Renee Lee (all musicians from Montreal, Canada) and possibly a few others, African Americans struggled to maintain non-marginalization in the GTA (study participant H-LB 2015). Realizing that there was a lack of African Americans carrying on the “black” oral/aural tradition around the GTA caused some African Canadian musicians such Archie

\[20\] As indicated in *The Canadian Encyclopedia* (Hale 2015).
Alleyne and Doug Richardson to form their own collective and take action—placing focus back on the music’s originators—African Americans (King 2015).

In an article written by Jabbari Weekes (2015), Alleyne speaks of how the Toronto jazz scene has totally diminished from the socio-cultural roots of the music that it once originally had, stating that “jazz is as much about music as it is the origin of why you play…it’s black music, and now, all the musicians sound the same” (Weekes 2015).

…the music itself has changed drastically. In my time, jazz was very much a social exchange. We would play till 4 A.M. and if there were no gigs we would just go have lunch together. That really affected the music too because you could just feel the compatibility. Those types of things don’t happen anymore. Now, music is just a sheet of music that looks like fly shit; just notes scattered all over the damn place. The whole groove is gone. At one time, I could identify every musician on a record by year because you could single out their styles and musical expressions. But now everyone sounds the same. You got to put a name underneath the single to be able to tell who they are. (Weekes 2015)

This quote by Alleyne is an excellent example of a musician that has witnessed the socio-cultural aspect that was originally a part of the Toronto jazz scene, but has now been eradicated by the formulaic and esoteric modern sounds that stem from institutionalization and consumerism of jazz.

Thus, moving forward within this study, I seek to understand how my two contrasting subjects experienced music, not just by their artistic influences, but rather by the hidden and deeper socio-cultural elements that I refer to as “narratives”—the juxtaposition of expressing racial dissonance and freedom through various forms of expression. 21 Thus, the purpose here is to explicate how artistic expression through the various epochs such as The New Negro Renaissance (Harris was a born near the end of the Renaissance22), the swing era (Harris

21 Duke Ellington promulgates “dissonance as the negro’s way of life” exemplified through African American artistic expression (Tucker 1995, 150).
22 Although Harris was born in Detroit in 1929, author Maryemma Graham purports the New Negro renaissance was comprised of cities such as Detroit, Chicago, and Philadelphia. This era benefitted from “young artists who built upon creativity and expressive
grew up in) and the bebop era (Harris participated in) gave rise to socio-political attitudes and discourses that in part contributed to dissonances within Harris musical output. Consequently, whether Harris was aware of it or not, the union of these “dissonances” from the various eras in jazz’s history contributed to, and shaped the development of his concept of movement.

In this study’s findings, I explicate the results from the GTA participant questionnaire and long interviews. My purpose here is to show the inconsistencies and educational gaps that may be apparent in present post-secondary jazz curricula and offer suggestions for a new jazz curricula based on my findings.

Another important purpose of this study is to build upon Harris’ concept of movement while adding to the current axiom of literature. By first showing that Harris’ unique harmonic palette can be reduced to an oscillation of concord and discord\(^{23}\) structures over a single harmonic chord structure, and that it is a combination of two binaries—tonic and dominant functioning chords, I aim to show that harmonic reductions of any chord can be made, belonging to one of these two families resulting in a deeper epistemology of the language.\(^{24}\)

Finally, by showing the concept of movement as a multidimensional tool for improvisation, and the expansion of harmonic and rhythmic prolongation, my purpose is to offer musicians an interdisciplinary approach to harmonic and rhythmic “dissonance” not considered or taught in any current post-secondary jazz curricula across the GTA—enabling

\(^{23}\) Consonance and dissonance are properties of successive notes. Concord and discord are notes played simultaneously such as a chord (Van Der Mere 2004, 106).

\(^{24}\) In chapter 5 of this study, I will evince how I perceive Harris’ approach to harmony and will also use this for the basis for my expansion of his theory of movement.
musicians to cultivate a broader scope of expression during improvisation and
accompaniment. Therefore, to achieve these goals, I aim to move forward with the guidance
of the following research questions.

**Research Questions**

1. In analyzing the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of “movement,” what are its
   sources, structures, and limits?

2. To what extent can the scope of current harmonic and improvisational literatures on
   movement be expanded upon—showing the concept of movement as a
   multidimensional tool for improvisation, and as an aid for the expansion of harmonic
   and rhythmic prolongation?

3. To what extent can qualitative research analysis of the data obtained from the
   participants in this study (educators in post-secondary jazz institutions across the
   GTA) reveal a lack of “African American-ness” in their own learning of jazz and,
   subsequently, their pedagogy, as compared to Harris’ learning of the music and his
   pedagogy?

4. To what extent should the sources and structures of the antecedents of Barry Harris’
   concept of movement, be developed into future post-secondary jazz curricula across
   the GTA and what are the limitations in implementing it?

**Rationale and Significance of the Study**

The rationale for this study emanates from the notion that although several colleges
and universities across the Greater Toronto Area (GTA) now offer jazz instruction at the
undergraduate, MA, DMA, and PhD level, rightly encouraging students to gain competency
with music notation, sight reading, and other formalized educational initiatives, it is my belief
along with several of the participants in this study that current music educators should not
ignore alternative methods of pedagogy if students are to understand the historicity—the
historical authenticity\textsuperscript{25} of this African American folk music.

Consequently, after attending several of Barry Harris’ jazz workshops over the past
two decades, I have heard Dr. Harris on many occasions express his belief that jazz education
is being taught incorrectly: “Young people should be taught from where the teachers came
from, not where the teachers are” (Bicket 2001, 4). Harris proposes that the current
generation of teachers and professors are doing the younger generations of students more
harm than good because they, the educators, have not themselves learned or assimilated the
historicity—the historical authenticity of the music (Collins Dictionary 2009).

In a recent interview entitled ‘Jazz Conversations’ with Portland State University’s Darrell
Grant, Harris further expresses his frustration with the current state of jazz education:

I have been travelling a lot, quite a bit in the world, and there is something we have to
straighten out…There is so much that people don’t know. What I really should be doing is
teaching the teachers, not the students. There is a thing that the teachers should be teaching
you about the music…that’s the only way you’re going to learn about the music. We got to
straighten it out because it has gotten really, really bad because all over the world, people
think wrong. (Grant 2013)

It is these exact words expressed by Harris that led me to seek out the reasons for the
way in which our jazz educational system across the GTA may have possibly failed in its
mandate to “pass the torch” on to students. In addition to a jazz educational system that is
possibly defunct, I argue there lies a bigger problem with how some current publications may
be promoting overly simple, even incomplete methods of ‘how to learn jazz,’ that do not
follow the same trajectory that I argue is necessary to assimilate and learn this music as an
aural/oral tradition.

Even more importantly, Harris’ concept of movement, which he teaches in workshops

\textsuperscript{25} Dictionary.com Unabridged 2016.
around the world, may have been “lost in translation” in the various literatures that have published his harmonic and improvisatory concepts and methodologies. I argue that there may be a disconnect when these literatures begin to explicate Harris’ core message behind “movement.” By neglecting to delve deeper to delineate the historicity from which movement arose, readers may be left with a simplified and formulaic version of movement from literatures that also make no attempt to build or expand upon Harris’ concept.

Therefore, a key precept and concern driving this study forward is that the current literatures on movement risk reducing Harris’ concept to a trope—a taxonomical metaphor for promulgating movement as a formulaic equation that empowers its users to play in a rote manner, and neglects to take into consideration the multidimensional and socio-cultural practices from which it may have originated. Assistant Professor Meagan Winget, from the University of Texas, speaks of missing elements in music that should also be considered when attributing to a performance’s validity or authenticity:

\[ \text{Listening to music is not necessarily a passive act: while it’s possible to let music wash over oneself, many people actively and intellectually listen to music, and recognize elements that are not specifically in the score. Some of those elements might be contextual/historical; some might be emotional or even theoretical. Once one is able to instinctively perceive those extra-musical elements, and can innately recognize correct or incorrect performative interpretations of them, those properties become additional means by which authenticity or validity is attributed. (Winget 2005, 21)} \]

With these factors in mind, I want to delve deeper into the socio-cultural roots of where and how Harris’ ‘movement’ could have come into fruition. Firstly, I postulate that the current literatures on Harris’ methodologies are only a synchronic representation—a current analysis of the methodology of Harris’ concept of “movement,” showing no diachronic traces of genealogy—the lineage and trajectory from which “movement” may have been delineated.

I further posit that the current literatures purporting the methodologies of Harris’ concept of movement only touch lightly upon the “truths” that Harris posits necessary to
comprehend his concepts. It is also my argument that these truths cannot possibly be reduced to diminished scales and chords, nor can they be viewed as merely the oscillation of certain harmonic chord structures upon which Harris and the current literatures seem to solely focus. As the literature will show, there lies a deeper epistemology of “movement” that may have germinated from the seeds of socio-historical circumstances, of which even Harris himself may not have been aware.

In the documented interviews, recorded media, and the many workshops that I have attended over the past 20 years, Harris sometimes veered off topic with his lessons and spoke of his childhood memories and of his musical upbringing. It is these little kernels of insight, disclosed by Harris himself, which made me want to delve deeper into finding the seeds of how movement may have come into fruition. By trying to flesh out the antecedents of Harris’ “movement,” and considering what Meagan Winget refers to as contextual, historical, emotional, and theoretical elements not recognizable in the performance or score (Winget 2005, 21). I especially would like to focus on the diversity and the many dimensions that movement entails— the challenge to treat music as “social practice and process,” that is “comparative,” “holistic,” and “dialogical” (Cohen 1993, 123) while also showing it to be both performance and story—realized as cultural activity through its performance and participation (Hall and Du Gay 1996).

Organisation of the Remainder of the Study

The remainder of the study is organized into five chapters, a bibliography, and appendices. Chapter 2, “Review of the Literature,” presents a review of related literature dealing with jazz methodologies, curriculum development within the context of post-secondary education, all literatures on Barry Harris’ concept of movement. Chapter 3,

---

26 I also refer to these as African American “narratives.”
“Methodology,” delineates the research design and methodology of the study. Chapter 3 further describes the instrument used to gather the data, the procedures followed, and the sample selected for the study. Chapter 4 displays the findings and analysis from the data pertaining to the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of movement and the participants of this study. Chapter 5, discusses how these findings fit into a broader scheme of reference by contrasting it with the literature reviewed. Finally, in Chapter 6, “Recommendations and Conclusions,” I offer conclusions that are based on the results of the findings. Additionally, I will also present a “reflections-on-action,” otherwise known as a cognitive post-mortem—reflexively reviewing this study post completion.

**Delimitations**

Although I had a very brief telephone interview with Barry Harris at his residence in October 2014, subsequent attempts at further interviews have all failed as a result of Harris’ administration staff stating “he is very busy doing workshops around the world and has many people weekly asking for his limited time.” Because of this setback, the lengthy interview that I had envisioned for this study will be limited to the accumulated “fieldwork” of recorded materials that he has attained from workshops over a twenty-year span. It will also draw from the many published interviews that are well documented online such as the Aaron Graves *Smithsonian* interview (Graves 2010), and possibly even more important than the latter, the candid videos of Harris speaking “uncensored” on *YouTube* of how he “learned” the music, his opinions on certain famous jazz musicians and his thoughts on institutionalized jazz education. Since Harris’ answers are all similar within these separate interviews, I am confident by using them in his research that “quality control” has been adhered. Thus, it is my belief that his body of field work, that is comprised of personal recordings from workshops, his limited telephone interview, the published interviews, and secondary sources such as
published literature, are all invaluable to this study. Therefore, I am extremely confident that these materials acquired will fulfill this study’s research requisite.

Chapter 2, Review of the Literature, I will not touch on published materials that promote “free jazz” as he believes this genre requires a great need of detail to deconstruct its sources and structures, and as such, would exceed this study’s limit.

Chapter 4, Part 1 of this study is limited to the artistic expressions of music, dance, poetry and theatrics that I refer to as “dissonances” in the context of historiographies from the Harlem renaissance, swing era and the bebop movement. Of note, although Harris was not born in Harlem New York (he was born in Detroit). Author Maryemma Graham purports that the “influence of the great migration” into cities such as Detroit, Chicago, New York and Philadelphia saw a “New Negro” renaissance of African American artists built upon a foundation of creativity and expressive culture—for the most part in isolation, apart from the mainstream and adapting the very culture that sought to suppress it (Graham 2016). Thus, I use this lens for viewing Detroit as another city of artistic influence and “Renaissance.” Furthermore, Harris was a product of enculturation by being born in 1929, an era that saw the “New Negro” renaissance (renaissances from American cities such as Detroit, Chicago, New York, St. Louis and Philadelphia) and the birth of swing music flourish. Enculturation is the natural development of music schemata—rule-based frameworks within which an individual interprets what he or she perceives—through the shaping influences of the environment (Morrison et al 2008, 119). Alan Merriam (1923-1980) noted, “Concepts and behaviors must be learned, for culture as a whole is learned behavior, and each culture shapes the learning process to accord with its own ideals and values” (Merriam 1964, 165). Ethnomusicologists stress the importance of examining music within its cultural context because the “proper approach to a musical subject includes sociological issues of human behavior, values, taste,
historical perspective and language of the discipline” (Hood 1971, 287).

Consequently, as a young adult in Detroit, Harris was exposed to, and participated in the subcultures that would enable him to assimilate and become fluent in the music he now teaches to his students. Being an active participant in an era when this music first percolated, presents a natural advantage over present day individuals trying to adapt to the “essences” of movement.

Conversely, present day jazz students have no access to Harris’ specific culture, since it no longer exists. These students try to adopt the core values, or ‘essences’ (*acculturation*) of “movement,” and try to make those essences fit within their present musical culture (*ethnocentrism*), but I believe their message may never be as convincing or authentic (the result of not being able to directly participate in those cultures and subcultures when they originally existed).

Next, the study participants across the GTA will be measured using different independent variables such as ethnicity, gender, informal vs. formal education, musical upbringing, exposure to different African American musics such as—gospel, spirituals, ragtime, stride, swing and bebop, to name a few. Participants of this study will be selected by Facebook solicitation or by email. For example, although Toronto has a small jazz community, I do not know all the study participants interviewed on a friend to friend basis, but I am aware of who they are. Thus, I purposely tried to interview participants that I did not have any close relationship with to eschew potential biases. The data collected, such as the measurement of their age, years of jazz study, the methods they used to learn jazz, their musical upbringing in their childhood, their familiarity with the history of African American slave culture and the music that was developed thereafter, will all be used as independent variables in the data analysis. Furthermore, the type of jazz that the study participants
participated in, and, the amount of knowledge and participation in African American culture ("African American-ness") is co-dependent on this study’s dependant variables—that is, all the of the study participant’s musical upbringing, if it adhered to non-African American narratives in their upbringing, such as not playing in the church, not dancing to jazz in an African American establishment or not getting acculturated in “African American-ness” yields a dependant variable as indicated—and may foster other non-traditional jazz forms or deviations such as ECM jazz, pop or rock to be assimilated in their musical jazz output.

Some of the participants were educators at more than one institution, and thus, these individuals have been added accordingly to the study’s total sample size, but coded slightly differently. For example, “Y-FA” also teaches at another post-secondary jazz institution. In this regard, this individual’s data has been duplicated, added to the analysis and he has received a new coding of “M-FA” for the second institution where he also teaches.

In the scope of Chapter 6 of this study, I will only use the artistic expressions in that he has referred to as dissonances of music, dance and poetics (scat) to build and expand upon Harris’ concept of movement. It will not cover the visual or theatrical arts as their need for development into a jazz curricula would exceed the limits of this study.

Finally, the qualitative research collected from the participant study will only be limited to Humber College, Mohawk College, The University of Toronto and York University. Other Ontario Universities and Colleges that do not specialize in jazz education will not be considered.

---

27 According to Creswell (2014), this data can be calculated and used in the sample size when dealing with mixed methodologies (Creswell 2014, 222).
Limitations

The limitations of this study are factors, usually beyond the researcher's control, that may affect the results of the study, or how the results are interpreted. Stating limitations of this study may be very useful for readers because they provide a method to acknowledge possible errors or difficulties in interpreting results of this study. They are simply factors or conditions that help the reader get a truer sense of what this study results mean and how widely they can be generalized. While I argue that all studies have some inherent limitations, he will only address those that may have a significant effect on his study.

1. Even though third party statistician Dr. Ron Fisher from FisherConsulting.com along with literature from Creswell (2014) have suggested that unique sample sizes can be generalized for the prospective, I still suggest that for future studies, a bigger sample size would be favorable as to eliminating the possible margin of error.

2. Due to the failure of sample respondents to answer with candour, results might not accurately reflect the opinions of all members of the included population. For example, the interviews of the participants may have credibility issues as some participants already seemed in fear of losing their jobs and/or reputation—if the criticisms of their colleagues and the institutions were to be published, and therefore may have skewed their answers accordingly.

3. Due to the length of the study, a significant number of respondents available in the preliminary testing may be unavailable or unwilling to participate in the final stage of testing.

4. The possibility of not getting all the present jazz directors of the targeted institutions to go on record and honestly speak about their curriculum’s weaknesses.

5. I am not an African American and by proxy cannot totally disseminate the “African American experience” that have led to original musical expressions related to social, political, and cultural factors. Furthermore, my musical upbringing that was heavily rooted by African
American influences (teachers and social establishments) remain as institutions in my musical education, but from this axis of experience, I argue that there will be a limitation for my new jazz curricula to make students become as proficient as the African American originators of this music—a result of not being exposed to narratives that are deeply rooted in African American social, political and cultural experiences from history.

6. The accuracy of the qualitative software MAX QDA 12 may not accurately capture, decode, and translate the true nature of the data.

7. Although this study focuses on Barry Harris’ experience on how he learned the music, Harris has on many occasions gone on record to refer how he and his contemporaries learned the music by stating “we used to dance to the music, we used to play daily at jam sessions” (Graves 2010; Panken 2013). Other African American musicians have also gone on record stating they and their contemporaries learned jazz in a similar style such as pianist Randy Weston (JALC 2010) and drummer Billy Higgins (JALC 1992). For example, drummer Billy Higgins has stated that African American musicians danced to the music and all the arts were combined when they were learning the music (JALC 1992). Thus, although I cannot overly generalize about how most African Americans learned the music, I can only take Harris and his colleagues’ comments to be the truth on how they learned the music. Thus, it is my belief that the harmonic dissonances within Harris’ concept of movement are a reflection of specific socio-political dissonances reflected by dissonances within socio-cultural narratives (dance, poetics, theatrics, visual arts, etc.) and may be impossible for non-African Americans, the newer generation of African Americans, and students of jazz to fully assimilate. Its antecedents are the by-product of racial injustices (such slavery, and the minstrel stage), and they are also rooted in a seeking of and praying for God’s salvation through field hollers, the ring shout and the Baptist church (Caponi 1999; Nelson 1999, 11).
After examining the literature on the topic of Harris’ underprivileged upbringing, and after reading the ground breaking literature on African American “rhythm” by author Angela Nelson entitled *This Is How We flow* (1999), it is my belief that the challenging economic conditions endured by Harris and other African Americans are another type of dissonance\(^\text{28}\) that would be channeled into their artistic expression (through social dance, after hours “rent parties,” “cutting contests”—musical jam sessions), and adds yet another dimension that would be difficult for students to reproduce.\(^\text{29}\)

Although non-African Americans may never be able to understand the challenges\(^\text{30}\) faced by African Americans that led to the creation of this music, I argue that they can still use the many useful methods (derived from African American “texts” and narratives) to learn how to play jazz from its core roots with greater authenticity.

---

\(^{28}\) Author Angela Nelson iterates that “rhythm” was the instigator propelling African American dances, competitions and slang expressions—encapsulating “black style” (Nelson 1999, 10). It is however my belief that the marginalization and socio-economic conditions experienced by African Americans—before and after the turn of the century (Nelson 1999) was influential in acting as a precursor to the rhythms being expressed. To this end, and throughout this study, I make a case for, and view “dissonance” as an instigator of “rhythm”—produced not only as a result of social-economic conditions, but also contributing to socio-cultural conditions (dance, cutting contests and signifiyn(g)).

\(^{29}\) Of course, Caucasians also experienced the effects of poverty and may have expressed their hardships through music, however, their musical expression, at that time, tended to occur in other musical genres such as hillbilly music, folk music, and country music (Billings, Norman, and Ledford 2013).

\(^{30}\) For more, see W.E.B Dubois’ definition of “Double Consciousness.”
Definition of Terms

The following definitions have been provided to ensure uniformity and understanding of these terms throughout the study.

African American-ness. I use this term as a way of denoting the socio-cultural attitudes and discourses that African Americans participated in. The ramifications of slavery, minstrelsy and political repression become the seeds for an architectural blueprint in African American artistic expression, giving rise to “blackness.” Throughout this study, examples will be explicated between the interrelationships of dance, theatre, linguistics and slang—all contributing to this study’s taxonomy of “blackness.”

African American narratives. These Narratives, or “texts,” are products of the environment, comprised of the social, economic, political factors and the philosophies they generate (Brindle 1975, 182). Within this study’s focus of Barry Harris, these narratives or texts were labelled as various art forms (music, dance, poetics/slang, visual arts and theatrics) that express social, economic and political “dissonances.”

Aggregates. These are individual masses or entities that contribute to a unified whole. (Dictionary.com Unabridged. 2016). In this study, I use the term “African American narratives” as an example of aggregates. I further posit that these aggregates contributed to a “unified whole” that I refer to as “dissonances” in African American music.

Anthropomorphism. This is the attribution of human characteristics or behavior to an object. In this study, I use this term to show the potential for jazz phrasing to take on the characteristics of the ebb and flow of human speech.

Antithesis. Within the context of this study, I frame this as the hardships, marginalization and racist attitudes experienced by African Americans as denoted in their discord harmonies and dominant functioning chords. For more, see Synthesis.

**Compliance class.** This is an object referred to by a symbol scheme. A system is ambiguous if a sign within the system could refer to *more than one* “compliance class” (Goodman 1968). In the case of this study, Goodman’s definition of “system” is represented here as the music of African American jazz. The symbol scheme of this system “African American jazz” is represented within this study as the various interdisciplinary African American forms of artistic expression such as music, dance, theatre, linguistics, slang and the socio-cultural narratives. I argue that there is a disconnect in GTA post-secondary jazz curricula because the African American forms of artistic expression such as music, dance, theatre, linguistics, slang and the socio-cultural narratives were most likely never learned by the Caucasian educators.

**Conceptual framework.** The conceptual framework consists of a system of concepts, assumptions, expectations, beliefs, and theories that supports and informs your research. The conceptual framework is a key part of your design that “explains, either graphically or in narrative form, the main things to be studied—the key factors, concepts, or variables—and the presumed relationships among them.” The conceptual framework can be a visual or written product (Maxwell 2010).

**Concord.** A stable, harmonious combination of tones; a chord requiring no resolution (Dictionary.com Unabridged. 2016).

**Dependant variable.** A variable that is presumed to be influenced by one or more independent variables (Johnson and Christensen 2007, 39). For example, the harmonies, phrasing, rhythm and improvisational styles of musicians, such as in the case of Barry Harris and the GTA participants, are influenced by non-musical “texts” (such as socio-cultural and socio-political narratives) acting as independent variables. These independent variables are
antecedent variables, as they are a direct influence on the dependant variable (Johnson and Christensen 2007, 39). Another example of an independent variable acting as influences on a direct variable would be taking into consideration the first musical influence of the study participants. As a result of the racial demographics in post-secondary jazz education across the GTA, the high majority of the study participants are of Caucasian decent, and as such will not have gone through the same socio-cultural and socio-political conditions that African Americans experienced who participated in creating this music.

**Diachronic.** An approach that considers the development and evolution of a language through history (Saussure et al. 1986). For example, within this study, I argue that jazz should be taught from its beginnings or roots (preferably post slavery, that includes—minstrelsy, spirituals, gospel, folk blues, swing and the transition from swing to bebop) and not from any specific or later era (post bop or modal) in this music’s developmental trajectory.


**Dissonances.** A term that I use to reflect the socio-political and socio-cultural ramifications of African Americans post slavery. As in the case of this study, I do not believe that dissonances in Barry Harris’ concept of “movement” can only be attributed to discord pitches that the human ear cannot accept as non-congruent. In my opinion, as in the opinion of musicologist Norman Cazden, music should be also be deconstructed from social, cultural
and political factors that would give rise to “dissonances” in African American music (Cazden 1945, 3-5).

**Double consciousness.** This is a concept that W.E.B Du Bois (1903) first explored in the 1903 publication, “The Souls of Black Folk.” Double consciousness describes the individual sensation of feeling as though your identity is divided into several parts, making it difficult or impossible to have one unified identity.

**Ethnocentrism.** Evaluation of other cultures according to preconceptions originating in the standards and customs of one's own culture.


**Exploratory descriptive research design.** This design addresses social phenomena, issues, and problems that have not yet been clearly explained or defined, and to gain broader insights and familiarity with that phenomenon. Exploratory research generally involves collecting and analyzing qualitative and quantitative data using a variety of methodologies, including phenomenology, case studies, and surveys (Babbie, 2010)

**Foundational jazz.** I coin this term within this study to be African American music that has a diachronic trajectory starting from post slavery. This type of music would therefore include minstrelsy, spirituals, gospel, folk blues, swing and the transition from swing to bebop.

**Gestalt.** When the sum of parts (aggregates), combine together, they form a unified whole—a gestalt (*Dictionary.com Unabridged*. 1916). In this study, I refer to “African
American narratives” as aggregates, and the sum of these aggregates make up a unified whole (the gestalt) that I refer to as “dissonance.”

**G.T.A (The Greater Toronto Area)** ("OECD Territorial Reviews OECD Territorial Reviews: Toronto, Canada 2009" OECD Publishing, ISBN 92-64-07940-8, 37). This study’s delimitations are set as the analysis of post-secondary jazz education across the GTA. Interviews of study participants are only limited to the institutions of Humber College in Etobicoke, Mohawk College in Hamilton, The University of Toronto in Toronto and York University in York region.

**Hermeneutic Phenomenology.** An interpretation of text or religious text by the reader to find meaning. Texts include communication, visual arts and music(Kvale 1996).


**Historiography.** The patterns of meaning and deep structures that exist and operate within a cultural system (Bloomberg and Volpe 2012, 35).

**Independent variable.** This would be a variable that is presumed to cause a change in another variable (Johnson and Christensen 2007, 39). Within this study, I argue that the harmonies, phrasing, rhythm and improvisational styles of musicians, such as in the case of Barry Harris and the GTA participants, are influenced by non-musical “texts” (such as socio-cultural and socio-political narratives) acting as independent variables. These independent variables are antecedent variables, as they are a direct influence on the dependant variable—his concept of movement. Another example of an independent variable acting as influences on a direct variable would be taking into consideration the first musical influence of the study participants. As a result of the racial demographics in post-secondary jazz education across
the GTA, the high majority of the study participants are of Caucasian decent, and as such will not have gone through the same socio-cultural and socio-political conditions that African Americans experienced who participated in creating this music. It is my belief that the individuals in this study and their perception of reality (because of their surroundings) has an proportionally inverse effect—that is, the less participation of these study participants in African American “narratives,” the more the probability that they will have gaps in their fluency of traditional jazz and thus have an alternative view of it.

**Jook joint.** This is an informal establishment featuring music, dancing, gambling, and drinking, primarily operated by African American people in the southeastern United States (Hazard-Gordon 1990, 24–29).

**Movement.** This is a musical term that African American jazz pianist and pedagogue Barry Harris uses in is workshops. He promulgates that chord families, such as in the case of functional harmony—\(I-IV-V\), should not only be approached by the use of oscillating concord and discord structures, such as in the tonic functioning \(I6\) chord and dominant functioning \(V7b9\) chord, but rather, both functions can be synthesized to add colourful tension. For example, Harris’ further promulgates that since both concord and discord structures are from one parent scale (in this case, the major bebop scale), notes from both harmonic structures may be synthesized for colourful dissonance to make chords that have never been used before in the conventional jazz cannon (Harris literature and interviews collated from 1993-2014). I argue that Harris’ conception of movement has a deeper socio-political and socio-cultural past, that is, the dissonances within chord structures are elucidated as a substratum of “dissonances” in an African American racially driven history.

**Morphic Resonance.** The current systems inherit the memories and habits from previous and similar systems (Nelson 1999; Sheldrake 2009).
**New Negro renaissance.** Within cities such as St. Louis, Detroit, Chicago, New York and Philadelphia, young artists began to express themselves artistically and set themselves apart from the mainstream—transforming and adapting to the very culture that sought to suppress them (Graham 2016). Although Barry Harris was born in Detroit, I use Maryemma Graham's research that depicts other cities (such as Harris’ Detroit) also saw a new “artistic growth” from the African Americans who migrated from the south (Graham 2016).

**Qualitative research.** This research involves a methodology that is particularly suitable for gaining an in-depth understanding of underlying reasons and motivations. This allows generalizations of results from a sample to an entire population of interest and the measurement of the incidence of various views and opinions in a given sample. Qualitative research is non-statistical; the concrete material at hand primarily guides its methodological approach and generates reliable population-based generalizable data that is suited to establishing cause-and-effect relationships. (Atlas 2015)

**Quantitative research.** This research involves a methodology that is considered to be suitable for the main purpose of the quantification of data. This allows generalizations of results from a sample to an entire population of interest and the measurement of the incidence of various views and opinions in a given sample. (Atlas 2015)

**Successive deviation.** This is an amalgamation of non-established norms, rhythmic figures and harmonic progressions that is not indigenous to a musical context (Meyer 1954, 246). In the participant study (questionnaire and interviews), I look at each individual’s musical upbringing—the age they learned jazz, the type of jazz they first learned, if other forms of music were bigger influences earlier in their musical education, and if they actually spent a great deal of time learning the “roots” of jazz, that is to say, the foundational jazz music such as ragtime, stride, swing and transitional swing into bebop styles.
Synchronic. This is an approach that considers a language without taking its history into account—aiming at describing language rules at a specific point of time, even though they may have been different at an earlier stage of the language. For example, a concern of this study is that post-secondary jazz curricula across the GTA are being taught from a specific era and not from its beginnings (Saussure et al. 1986).

Synthesis. I borrow Estelle Jorgensen’s definition of synthesis that crucial to this study. Jorgensen explains that synthesis is comprised of two binaries—thesis and antithesis (Jorgensen 2003, 52). Applying her theory here, I would describe African music as a synthesis of what Jorgensen refers to as thesis—an amalgamation of art forms representing everyday life (Chernoff 1979, 23) and antithesis, as the music is constantly reaching back and paying homage to its ancestry as well as its origins in slavery (Nettl 2008, 192–224); genres, such as gospel, free jazz and rap music embody this.

Taxonomy. This term refers to the classification of structures into categories (Dictionary.com Unabridged. 1916). An example of taxonomy would be the classification of musical instruments by their structure, purpose, sound and use also known as Organology. Another example would be within this study. I argue that post-secondary jazz education across the GTA is failing in its mandate to educate students because the components within its model are not of the same taxonomy of the African American originator’s model. That is, they do not predicate the aggregates such as African American narratives and “texts” that help built the structure of jazz music.

Texts. “Texts” or narratives are products of the environment, comprised of the social, economic, political factors and the philosophies they generate (Brindle 1975,182). For more, see definition for “African American Narratives.”
Thesis. Within the context of this study, I frame this as the overcoming of the marginalization and racism as experienced by African Americans, and as denoted in the concord and tonic functioning harmonies. For more, see Synthesis.

Triangulation. This is a mixed method approach of quantitative and qualitative methodologies used for a more accurate analysis of data collected from the oral histories and questionnaires of study’s participants. In doing so, the ultimate objective of triangulation is to better understand the environment and nature of the proposed problem by having a more holistic and accurate instrument that would yield a more accurate result. The purpose of triangulation in qualitative research is to increase the credibility and validity of the results; it can be used in both quantitative validation and qualitative studies (Rothbauer 2008, pp. 892-894).

Tribal house. This is a percussive form of electronic dance music that draws influence from the rhythms and instrumentations of West African and gospel music (Lozej 2015). West African music, such as the Shona people of Zimbabwe, incorporate different instrumentation playing different rhythms in different time signatures—utilizing ostinatos and having a cyclical form (Nettl 2008, 196). An example of this rhythm would be the time signature $3/4$ played over the time signature $4/4$ that is also known as a Hemiola.
CHAPTER 2: REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

To understand better this study’s research challenges, the Review of Literature will be framed by what authors Linda Dale Bloomberg and Marie Volpe refer to as a “systemic identification, location, and analysis of material related to the research problem” (Bloomberg and Volpe 2012, 74). To meet these criteria, I will be preparing a systemic and comprehensive method of critical analysis by way of explicating and synthesizing various historiographies, oral histories, discourses and treatises. This comprehensive synthesis will include books, journals, conference papers, reviews, articles, abstracts, research reports, dissertations, and electronic media.

**Delimitations of the Review of the Literature**

Although there is vast literature that focuses on the methodologies of “how to play jazz,” I have chosen to focus on authors whom I argue to have made the biggest contributions to jazz education, in addition to those who have cited Harris’ methodologies. All research cited is either related to the topic of Barry Harris, or it has, in my opinion, merit in the field of jazz education and curricula. Therefore, I purposely do not deviate from my parameters to include literature that states otherwise. For example, I will not touch on published materials that promote “free jazz” as he believes this genre requires a great need of detail to deconstruct its sources and structures, and as such, would exceed this study’s limit. Therefore, published materials such as Derek Baily’s *Improvisation: Its Nature And Practice In Music* (1993) would not be reviewed.

To make sure “quality control” was adhered to, a preliminary thesis/ dissertation search was conducted on JSTOR, Google Scholar, ProQuest and WorldCat and found only one published masters thesis written by Dan Faulk that is partially related to Barry Harris. I contacted Rutgers University Library to gain access to Faulk’s thesis, and unfortunately, was
told that I would need his personal permission for the thesis to be released to me. I attempted to contact Faulk several times via email, but did not receive any response. By reading Faulk’s abstract online, I was able to deduce that Faulk’s thesis only expounds upon the subjects of Harris’ life, music and methodologies. Conversely, I feel that my study is entirely a separate enterprise as I am fleshing out the socio-cultural “texts” and narratives that gave rise to the dissonances within his music and methodologies. Essentially, these “dissonances” are what I purport to be the antecedents of his concept of “movement.” My study is also separate from Faulk’s in that I illuminate how the application of “movement” would contribute in the formation of new curricula within post-secondary jazz education across the GTA, while Faulk’s entry is strictly biographical. Because of these differences, I feel confident that my topic has an important merit, and as such, this study should be pursued even further to bridge the proposed scholarship gap.

**Discussion of Frameworks**

To set the tone for, and to provide contextualizing information about the research topic, this *Review of Literature* will address various historical and topical issues pertaining to this study’s research problem. By following a schema that consists of several sections, I will proceed with *Review of Literature* in the following manner:

First, in the section labelled under the sub-heading *Jazz Methodologies*, I examine publications that explicate methods of “how to play jazz”—drawing upon the philosophies of mostly non-African Americans. From there, I transition into the section labelled *Literature That is Specific to Harris’ Concept of Movement*—examining publications about Barry Harris’ methodologies—once again, delineating philosophies written by the culturally *etic*—non-enculturated individuals promulgating “how to play jazz.” I then transition into *Socio-Cultural Studies on Jazz*, delineating literature that illuminates jazz as an African American
institution—drawing similarities to its Western African ancestry. After a Summary of the previous sections, I begin a section entitled Analyzing Dissonance. This section evinces the methodology I have construed for quantifying “dissonance.” Next, I transition to more literature that demonstrates my reasoning for, and the quantification of Text and Narrative as Symbol Systems, in addition to what I refer to as Signifier and Symbol Systems. From here I look at the multidimensional meaning of “dissonance” in the subheading entitled Interrelated Arts Demonstrating Dissonance—drawing comparisons from different authors on the symbiotic relationships between the arts. Next, I transition into the subheading Music Education and the Interrelated Arts, citing ground-breaking authors who necessitate its requirement within music education. From here, I transition into a section entitled Post-Secondary Scholarship Across Canada and within the GTA that examines works by authors who speak about Canadian jazz scholarship and, specifically, post-secondary jazz scholarship across the GTA. Within this section, I examine how jazz as an African American institution is currently being taught at the post-secondary level as well as how it is being viewed by other authors who write about it. Next, I tackle a polemic and somewhat controversial topic entitled Jazz Education: A Paradox for Dichotomy? In this section, I examine literature that elucidates how “jazz education” can be viewed as a paradox—that is, it cannot be realized within the “walls” of a corporate bureaucracy. Finally, I conclude this chapter with a section entitled Summary and Scholarship that elucidates how the literature I reviewed will make a positive contribution to future academic scholarship. Following the Review of Literature, I present the Conceptual Framework, which is based on the literature reviewed and my own personal experience and insights for the design and conduct of the study.

**Jazz Methodologies**

Even though jazz scholarship is relatively a new field (Prouty 2012) (elucidating a
significant amount of literature on the topics of harmony and improvisation), there seems to be a lack of pedagogical documentation within the current jazz oeuvre regarding the socio-historical conditions that might have fostered a multidimensional meaning of musical “dissonance” (within the context of harmony and improvisation). For example, the current and broader literature such as (Aebersold 1992; Bergonzi 2000; Liebman 1991) attempts to address the idea of harmony and improvisation as more formulaic, calculated and rote vehicle. While scholars have long been aware of the employment of musical concept and theory as a means to teach jazz education, its coherence does not always take precedent or even rise to fruition (Scott 2009).

Even with a well-laid out dialogue within a book’s contents, there often remains a risk that students still will not understand or have similar musical competency as the musical individuals they idolize. Furthermore, studies that only focus on “technique” and “modern harmony,” run a further risk of segregating the music from, what I purport “to be” its “roots” (its socio-cultural and socio-political ancestry).

For example, Dave Liebman’s *A Chromatic Approach to Jazz Harmony and Melody* (1991) incorporates chromaticism (using notes outside the stated tonality to enhance a phrase) as an aid to help the artist develop his or her own voice when trying to improvise chromatically. Although Liebman cites examples from Bach, Scriabin, Coltrane, Shorter, Hancock, and Beirach, the aspiring musician who reads about these examples may not be able to make a connection to swing and the bebop that made a use of chromaticism, and overlooked by Liebman. By failing to first draw a lineage from Louis Armstrong and his use of chromaticism within the swing era (*Louis Armstrong: An American Genius* 1983, 58) to the bebop pioneers such as Dizzy Gillespie who began pushing the boundaries of swing music’s diatonic vocabulary by way of chromaticism (DeVeaux 1999, 185), Liebman offers a
pedagogy that is never grounded from an early jazz trajectory and has similar overtones to his contemporary Jerry Bergonzi and his published offerings on Pentatonic and Hexatonic approaches to improvisation (2000-2012). Both authors do not offer a socio-cultural perspective.

Pianist Mark Levine’s *The Jazz Piano Book* (1989) is a literature more grounded in tradition, and offers a well-documented array of different styles and lineages of jazz piano history. Levine also does a fine job of touching on some of Harris’ methodologies and gives musical examples from other famous musicians in the bebop tradition. Consequently, Levine also neglects to show any socio-cultural antecedent or genealogical connection from which Harris’ ideas may have developed. Levine’s second book, *The Drop 2 Book* (2006) is an extended offering from his *The Jazz Piano Book* (1989) publication. Levine does not add or build upon his original offering, but just offers more musical examples from different pianists and briefly credits Harris for his contributions to the field of study.

Similar to Levine’s published works, Jerry Coker *Elements of the Jazz Language for the Developing Improvisor* (1997) is a well-written comprehensive jazz analysis of harmony and improvisation. Coker refers to the building blocks of the jazz language as “elements” in jazz improvisation because they have been meticulously analyzed from countless solos of great jazz musicians and are isolated for study. Coker’s analysis consists of an examination of recorded solos, with suggestions made for using each element in the jazz language, and contains specific exercises provided for practicing the element. In my opinion, this literature has a decent breakdown of the elements one would look for learning jazz, such as: tritone substitution, playing “outside,” cadences, bebop scales and chord sequences. Where Coker starts to deviate from traditional practices is when he begins to promote the use of patterns and “digital sequences” that, in my opinion, would only foster a mechanical vocabulary for
any aspiring student. The biggest limitation may be that the musical examples Coker transcribed are predominantly from contemporary jazz musicians from the last fifty years and does not delve deeply enough into musicians from the stride or swing era, when I argue the inception of the language to have germinated.

There has been some promising material from arranger and educator David Baker, the author of *How to Play Bebop vol. 1-3* (2006). For example, Baker has been credited for coining the term “Bebop scale” in his books before most authors began to disseminate them as such. In this three-volume series that includes the scales, chords and modes necessary to play bebop music, the first volume exposes scales, chords and modes most commonly used in bebop and other musical styles. The second volume covers the bebop language, patterns, formulas and other linking exercises necessary to play bebop music. The third volume deals with the internalization of compositions that is useful in a broader sense than just in the bebop genre. Baker covers techniques such as creating guide tone lines, playing chord tones, and learning contrafacts\(^\text{31}\) with the steps written out in detail from several examples. Baker also explains the steps to which one should adhere in order to learn a new song—positing that individuals can save a lot of effort by realizing that many jazz tunes are contrafacts or partial contrafacts, and gives many examples of these. Baker’s books are more of a cursory documentation of bebop at an aesthetic level.\(^\text{32}\) He makes no references to the history how the music evolved. It is a book of bebop examples and patterns that I argue would not help a musician learn to absorb the core meaning behind the music’s original intent. Furthermore,

\(^{31}\) A contrafact is a composition with a different melody based on the original chord changes of another composition.

\(^{32}\) I am referring to compositions that are not included in the Great American Songbook or written during “Tin-Pan Alley.” Some examples of such compositions would be “Ornithology” that is based on “How High the Moon,” or “Lullaby of Birdland” that is based on “Love Me Or Leave Me.”
another Baker publication entitled *A Legacy in Music* (2011) is limited in scope as it does not provide the non-musical histories of the musicians cited. In this dialogue, Baker resorts to delegating the writing of certain chapters of his publication to different authors who themselves have not followed in the cultural trajectory of the men and women that they cite—giving the reader a false sense of factual “legitimacy.”

Along similar lines of the Baker, Coker and Levine literature, saxophonist and jazz educator Jamey Aebersold’s (1992) *How to Play Jazz and Improvise* vol.1 is a method book aimed at beginners in some respects, but is full of useful information to any level of musician. This book would aid individuals new to jazz who may need a gentler introduction to jazz theory and approach some of the “meatier” subjects such as scale or mode choices with assistance from a teacher. My opinion on the “play along” disc is twofold. I do believe that it has merit in that the more inexperienced player will get a chance to play with a rhythm section. Thus, since it is a pre-recorded rhythm section, I also believe this does not benefit most musicians who look to feed off the nuances of live interplay. Another limitation of this book, similarly to the books previously mentioned, is that it offers a wealth of information with no diachronic and historical reference to where and how the music was developed. This book also seems to be a synchronic representation of a final product of specific jazz genres—it neglects to refer to its antecedent history.

If the aforementioned authors had spent more energy delving into the historiographies and oral histories of the musicians they cited, I argue that their texts would have better constructed a clearer path for students following in the steps of these narratives—causing their musical output to become more nuanced and emotionally cohesive (study participant H-)

---

33 What I argue to be the essence of socio-cultural dialogues expressed through visual art, poetics, dance and theatre.
LB interviewed September 2015).

Thankfully, there are some musicians that have done wonderful work as authors in espousing the marriage of cultural narrative with musical technique. For example, pianist Hal Galper, author of *Forward Motion* (2003), whose career has spanned over 50 years, and who has shared the stage and recorded with colleagues such as Chet Baker, Anita O’Day, Stan Getz and Julian ‘Cannonball’ Adderly, does a fine job of explaining to the reader the following:

A good jazz instruction book adheres to five to [sic] rigid standards that validates its concepts…its concepts must be historically validated by their previous use in the tradition of the music. The chain of how a concept grew and was modified through the passage of time should be clear and unassailable. What worked in Bach’s time in Germany must also work in Armstrong’s time in New Orleans…it’s [sic] concepts are based upon sound scientific principles, i.e., how the mind, body and emotions function in the process of learning and making music. (Galper 2003, 10-11)

Galper’s quote is important because he is stating that new concepts or theories must adhere to a lineage derived from musical ancestry and can only be validated or expanded upon by the proven theories that came before it (Taruskin and Butt 1996). His view about learning jazz is similar to my own in terms of how I argue Harris’ concept of movement should be learned. Unfortunately, Galper slightly hints at being antithetical by stating that “jazz cannot be learn[ed] from a book” and “is a self-taught process” (Galper 2003, 11-12), even though he has written chapters within his book on the topics of melody and embellishment, arpeggios, intervals, pentatonic cells and superimposition and how to approach all of these in a jazz context (Galper 2003, 20-21). Perhaps Galper has realized the reality of the so-called learning practice in jazz today?

Similarly, to Galper’s fine work from *Forward Motion*, his musical colleague, Mike Longo, who prides himself on learning the secrets of “feeling” jazz rhythm (as shown by him from Dizzy Gillespie) has written several volumes on *The Rhythmic Nature of Jazz* (2012).
Within these volumes, Longo posits a very similar position to Galper. Longo, who claims to be a student of Oscar Peterson and served for many years as Dizzy Gillespie's pianist and musical director, has stated "although we have some great jazz educators and wonderful jazz departments across the country, there is a certain ingredient that, in my estimation, needs to be added to the curriculum" (Longo 2010). Longo is referring to the apprenticeship system that differentiates between “experiential knowledge” and “intellectual knowledge (Longo 2010).

The majority of Longo’s points tie in with some of my views on jazz education. For example, if I were given a full scholarship to study at the most prestigious jazz institution in the world that has mostly a “popular” and Caucasian jazz faculty34 vs. studying with an elderly African American master who had been exposed to the oral histories and historiographies of jazz, and had played with landmark players—the “who’s who” of jazz—I would not hesitate to choose the latter scenario as it is the closest to the “source.”

Longo clearly and concretely advises aspiring jazz musician how to be successful.

---

34 I would equate “popular” in this case with musicians such as Dave Liebman, Jerry Bergonzi, John Scofield and Kenny Wheeler (to name a few). Although we don’t know if these musicians did or did not delve into the “roots” of the music from an African American lens, it is my belief that these musicians aurally sound as if they have not delved deep enough into the history of the music within their playing. It is my belief that their tendency to play patterns and permutations has stripped the music of its spontaneity. At least John Coltrane had immersed himself in the jazz language by studying the great African American musicians that had come before him before he started working from Nicholas Slonimsky’s *Thesaurus of Scales and Melodic Patterns* (“Slonimsky and Coltrane” 2014). In the later years of his musical oeuvre, the Eastern spirituality that he drew upon, regardless of its deviations from his original work, always sounded grounded in the African American tradition.” Conversely, I find that the other popular musicians I mentioned rarely link any genealogy to “tradition” within their music, and as such, are not as “black” sounding compared to Earl Hines, Barry Harris, Nat Cole, Coleman Hawkins, or Lester Young who played more from a “conversational” axis and were therefore not formulaic players. The bigger concern to me is that the younger crop of musicians seem to gravitate towards the European sounds of ECM based recordings or the fusion sounds of GRP and miss the “African American-ness” from this music’s antecedents—a concern that will be further addressed in Chapter 5.
What young jazz musicians need now, and more than ever before, is jazz apprenticeship with ‘elder statesmen,’ outside of the context of the four walls of the collegiate corporate empire and its connected political machine. Apprenticeship is a wise and frugal way to learn this great music. Young jazz musicians must seek out wiser and older musicians who will teach them the trade of being a jazz musician as well as the fundamentals of their respective instrument in relation to the tradition, while encouraging individuality in the entire process. Although it was intended as a spoof, it nevertheless brought some very thought-provoking insights into the open. There is no question about it, the breakdown of the apprenticeship system that occurred in jazz around the 80s has impacted it in such a way that jazz, as an art form, has virtually lost its audience. This comes in the wake of jazz clubs around the world going under at an alarming rate due to lack of attendance, while so called ‘jazz festivals’ have resorted to booking acts that more or less resemble rock and roll or hip hop music rather than jazz in the traditional sense, and publications like the Wall Street Journal releasing articles proclaiming jazz to be dead. There are those of course who will argue ‘the face of jazz has changed…get used to it!’ This, however, fails to take into account the idea that if you are going to replace something, it should be replaced by something that is better. ‘Not as good’ is unacceptable! As the late Igor Stravinsky once stated, ‘No new music comes from anything but the tradition.’ His point being that music moves forward by musicians digesting the ‘tradition’ while allowing the music to evolve on its own to the next level. The false prophet can always be distinguished from the true prophecy by the fruits produced by their position. (Longo 2010)

This powerful quote by Longo touches on some excellent points such as petitioning for the need of the “apprenticeship” system, as well as reinforcing the opinion held by Stravinsky, Harris, Galper and myself that in order for music to move forward, musicians must first adhere to and learn from “tradition.” The apprentice system is an excellent example for how individuals absorb the traditions of an artisan. For example, how could players such as Evgeny Kissin reach unsurmountable heights if it were not for his only piano teacher Anna Pavlovna Kantor? As noted, Kantor is credited for leading the young Kissin in the footsteps of the great generation of classical piano virtuosos such as Rubinstein and Horowitz (Solomon 1996). Thus, with the apprentice system, comes a direct linkage to tradition without the interference of multiple pedagogical views and influences.

Additionally, there is also excellent material that espouses the socio-cultural and
socio-political landscape that musicians have had to negotiate in order just to “survive.”

Some examples of these materials might be Peter Pullman’s exhaustive biography on Earl “Bud” Powell (Pullman 2012), Francis Paudras’ personal account with Earl Powell—delineating a first-hand account of not only Powell as a musical genius, but also his socio-cultural upbringing (Paudras 1998) and finally, Robin Kelly’s offering of a different side of Thelonious Monk that we rarely hear about in conventional dialogues and discourses (Kelley 2009, 19–24).

**Literature That Is Specific to Harris’ Concept of Movement**

Pianist and educator Fiona Bicket, who has been a student of Barry Harris for over twenty years, has written an online 26-page method book entitled, *The Barry Harris Approach to Improvised Lines & Harmony: An Introduction* (2001). This tutorial introduces the reader to the practical and theoretical concepts taught by Harris. Topics include: scale runs, basic chord movement with sixth & diminished chords and sixth diminished scale concepts. Many examples supplement the concepts presented. Bicket understands how to get her message across in a clear and concise manner for beginners or novices to grasp the basic theoretical building blocks more easily. Unfortunately, these “building blocks” are only of an aesthetic nature. Bicket neglects to show the lineage from where Harris may have developed his ideas. Furthermore, I argue that there is a disconnect with how Bicket may be promulgating “movement.” In her online biography, Bicket claims that she uses the Greek modes to teach jazz (http://www.abbywhiteside.org/site/teachers.php). However, Harris is disbeliever of modes, and has claimed at the countless workshops that I have attended, to “not even know what they [modes] are about,” stating that musicians like Coleman Hawkins,

---

35 My definition here of survival is polysemous—as in “survival of the fittest” (on and off the bandstand) or “survival to make ‘ends’ meet.”
Lester Young, Bud Powell and Monk “just play, they don’t overanalyze as a classical musician would” (Harris workshops 1996-2010).

Roni Ben Hur, guitarist, educator and long time student of Barry Harris, has written a book using the teachings of Harris entitled Talk Jazz (2004). It is a collection of musical excerpts, exercises and ideas incorporating jazz motifs and improvisational concepts. It is designed to familiarize students and music professionals, at any level, with jazz vocabulary and music theory. This book is laid out well and is very concise and clear about how to approach Harris methodologies. Subsequently, I argue Ben-Hur may have strayed away from Harris’ teaching method, as he often relies upon worked out patterns and he essentially turns Talk Jazz into a “lick” book. By this I mean that by using Harris methodologies, Ben-Hur has constructed a sizeable amount of musical stock pattern phrases consisting of a short series of notes used in the context of improvisation and accompaniment. Learning a “lick” is often considered a form of imitation undertaken to better understand and analyze what others have done, and this may lead a novice musician to building a musical vocabulary of their own. However, I argue that the methodologies of Harris’ concept of “movement” were never supposed to be turned into patterns such as one might find in Nicolas Slonimsky’s Thesaurus of Scales and Melodic Patterns (1975), but rather should be used to play spontaneously, communicating new ideas instead of monotonously repeating the same old ones.

Howard Rees, originally from Toronto, apprenticed with Barry Harris in New York from 1979-84. Upon returning to Toronto, he founded the Howard Rees Jazz workshops that offer classes based on Harris’ methodologies (Rees 2005, 156). Having collected a wealth of information from workshops and by apprenticing with Harris, Rees is the definitive author on the subject of Harris’ methodologies. He breaks down Harris’ concepts in his books, The Barry Harris Workshop (1994), The Barry Harris Vocal Workshop (2004) and The Barry
These books provide an excellent starting point for musicians at all levels to use and comprehend the importance of Harris’ concept of movement. Rees’ account of movement is limited (showing no diachronic trajectory of the genealogy of movement). Had Rees included this vital information on Harris’ socio-cultural upbringing this would have allowed the user a better foundation to approach, analyze and assimilate Harris’ concepts.

Guitarist Alan Kingstone’s The Barry Harris Harmonic Method for Guitar (2006) is very similar to Howard Rees’ account of Harris’ methodologies. Rees’ company, “Jazz Workshop Productions” was the publisher for Kingstone’s book and the similarities are very strong. Like Rees’ publications, Kingstone covers the same topics of Harris’ various sixth diminished scales. He could have been more thorough, however, by demonstrating the proper application of the sixth diminished scales within the context of a song. During the workshops that I attended, Harris always taught various concepts within the context of actual songs. Also, the fact that his book is written for guitarists using guitar tablature may make this body of work more accessible for this demographic of musician, but it does not expand or build upon Harris’ concept of movement.

Socio-Cultural Studies on Jazz

I can recommend William Kenney’s Chicago Jazz: A Cultural History, 1904-1930 (1993), Burton Peretti’s The Creation of Jazz Music, Race, and Culture in Urban America (1994), Scott DeVeaux’s The Birth of Bebop: A Social and Musical History (1999) and Paul F. Berliner’s Thinking in Jazz (1994). I consider all four of these volumes to be treatises because they surpass conventional literature on jazz pedagogy by delving into the socio-cultural and socio-political conditions that fuelled the music. Where Kenney, Peretti and DeVeaux’s books touch upon the transitional artists who have commonly been credited for
contributing to swing and bebop’s inception, Berliner negotiates narratives within the African American jazz community through his discourse.

For example, William Kenney’s *Chicago Jazz: A Cultural History, 1904-1930* (1993) provides a well-documented account of Chicago jazz in the Roaring Twenties. Although this subject matter has been previously addressed (ad nauseam) (Henderson 2016; Schaal 2013), this is one of the first discourses to emphasize the music's social context. In doing so, Kenney describes dance halls and cabarets—explaining the popularity of dancing and why Caucasian musicians found African American jazz so attractive (Kenney 1993). By analyzing recordings by King Oliver, Louis Armstrong, Earl Hines, and Jelly Roll Morton, Kenney describes the structure of their musical arrangements and their importance within socio-cultural contexts (Kenney 1993). Similar to Kenney’s account about the importance of socio-cultural factors that played out in jazz music, Burton Peretti’s *The Creation of Jazz Music, Race, and Culture in Urban America* (1994) is a well-researched sociocultural study of the development of jazz between 1900 and 1940 (Peretti 1994, 2–8). Peretti argues that jazz was an urban music—created between 1915 and 1930 when Southern African Americans migrated north to cities such as Detroit (Harris’ place of birth), New York, Philadelphia, St. Louis, Kansas City and Chicago (Reed 1992; Peretti, 1994). According to the author, jazz rose as a cultural triumph, acquiring "its expressive social meaning" (Peretti 1994). Peretti, relying heavily on oral history and newspaper accounts, examines such topics as differences between blues and jazz, as well as the influence of Western art music and Caucasian musicians on early jazz (Reed, 1992; Peretti 1994). Furthermore, author and critic Paul Baker praises Peretti’s discourse for building upon works such as Sidney Finkelstein (*Jazz: A People's Music*, 1948) and Neil Leonard (*Jazz: Myth and Religion*, 1987; *Jazz and the White Americans*, 1962).
Tapping even deeper into the socio-cultural and socio-political constructs of African American jazz, author Paul Berliner clearly delineates the journeys of his African American subjects by delving into their (sub)culture and getting an uncensored, face-to-face account of what I purport to be “African American-ness.” Berliner’s ground-breaking study is a realization of interviews with some of the last remaining African American jazzmen and women—giving his readers an insider view of the socio-cultural narratives that germinated this music.

Berliner’s conviction about the intricate process to learn jazz could only be realized by individuals who immerged themselves within the (sub)culture to get an insider perspective. Of note—Berliner’s interviews throughout Thinking in Jazz that are heavily indebted to Barry Harris—crediting Harris’ methods as unique in both its emphasis and detail—“…teaching students precisely how to transform ‘elements’ into credible phrases…effectively clarifying the relationship between theory and performance practice—within the jazz tradition” (Berliner 1994, 166). What is most significant about Berliner’s treatise is that the African American jazz community has responded with “eagerness to participate in his study, expressing their frustration that their skills are poorly understood, even downright misunderstood, and their knowledge undervalued by outsiders” (Marin 2014, 98; Berliner 1994, 5). Thus, Berliner’s goal was to make “available to outsiders what has largely remained knowledge privileged within a close-knit community” (Marin 2014, 99; Berliner 1994, 6). Berliner further promulgates that “the explicitness of Harris’ method provides students with a language and an analytical key that enables them to ‘unlock the mysteries of jazz’ themselves” (Berliner 1994, 166). Berliner also draws to that fact the numerous jazz masters such as Joe Henderson, John Coltrane, Paul Chambers, Curtis Fuller,

---

36 For more on “African American-ness,” see Chapters 1 and 5 of this study.
Yusef Lateef, Sonny Clark, Pepper Adams, Donald Byrd and Charles McPherson (to name a few) have all “investigated his method” by coming to Detroit and studying with him (Berliner 1994, 38).

Summary

All of the volumes I have reviewed are excellent works in their own right (with Kenney, Peretti, DeVeaux and Berliner’s being exceptional). More importantly, these works provide an important framework for my study. My work differs in scholarship in that I make a case for African American “text” and narratives as being the most crucial sources for learning jazz (Baraka 1968; Cook 1985; Crease 2008; Stearns and Stearns 1994). It also sets the precedent that “African American-ness” should preside over “the erasure of African American-ness” in any sort of jazz education. By “African American-ness,” I mean pedagogy that would promote the methods that African Americans were participating in when this music was being created. Body movement, competition from jam sessions and using the human ear as a means to learn jazz are first and foremost. I also equate “African American-ness” to the musicians that created this music and how their musical oeuvre should be at the forefront for absorbing this music’s vocabulary. Conversely, I would equate “the erasure of African American-ness” within post-secondary schools to the bureaucratic powers that have possibly mandated pedagogy on what should or what should not be taught to students (Laver 2014; Heble and Laver 2016). Also, “the erasure of African American-ness” could also be viewed as schools that have adopted an Western art music model in the classroom to learn jazz. It is my belief that students should be playing as much as possible, and spending as little as possible time learning from “fakebooks,” “leadsheets,” or learning theory in a non-applied
The aforementioned authors do not make this explicit. Even when some of these authors have fleshed out African American “texts” and narratives, they do not take a definitive stand that these texts and narratives should form the basis of the educational system. For example, even though Kenney, Peretti, DeVeaux and Berliner explore and expand upon the “socio-cultural” aspects that were integral to the inception of this music, they fail to eschew learning materials that do not offer a diachronic trajectory of jazz’s inception. I first became aware of this issue while attending Humber College. There, I had three separate professors who constantly drew from authors Liebman, Bergonzi and Slonimsky and their published works but made no correlation to the antecedental foundation from those works—leaving myself (and I suspect others) helpless in its application within the jazz language. The subsequent volumes that I reviewed by Baker, Coker, and Levine do touch upon early works of jazz as a means for students to understand and apply their learning of the foundations of jazz, but lack the socio-cultural or even socio-political antecedents that, in my opinion, (and in the opinion of other authors, as we shall see) gave rise to the harmonies and rhythms within the pieces of music cited in their books.

The basis of this study is not meant to be polemic, even though that may be inevitable. It anchors its position upon the historiographies and oral histories of African American origins, and encourages educators to teach jazz from this compliance. To further address concerns I have for promoting “African American-ness” over the “erasure of African

---

37 In chapter 5, I will further address this troubling issue (“African American-ness” versus “the erasure of African American-ness” within the GTA) that I argue many professionals witness but may be reluctant to speak about. For example, study participant H-LB, a professor from Humber College, believes this was one of the most prevalent reasons why students are sounding “white”- this is a result of their own teachers having a similar musical upbringing, and thus, their approach to phrasing and rhythm is very European (study participant H-LB 2015).
American-ness” in jazz education, the next section entitled “Deconstructing Dissonance” will aim to contextualize and negotiate the socio-cultural and socio-political meaning of dissonance within the music. This is an important juncture for not only understanding Harris concept of “movement,” but more importantly, the “dissonances” within everyday African American way of life that I argue led to the conception of his concept.

**Analyzing Dissonance**

To understand Barry Harris’ concept of movement, there must first be an understanding of the term “dissonance,” which I argue is a multidimensional agent of “movement.” In order to meet this requirement, I first examine Dr. Angela Nelson’s groundbreaking work on the topic of “rhythm,” entitled *This Is How We Flow* (1999). In this work, Nelson argues that “all expressive products are guided by the principles of rhythm” and are key in the development and expression of the visual arts, architecture, theatre, literature and film (Nelson 1999, 3). Nelson further purports that “rhythm” is the science of coordinated movement in sound that includes all creative works, thought, and performance that comes with “black art,” and this also extends to music, poetry, mythology, dance, painting and sculpture (Nelson 1999, 33). Nelson further posits that the idea of artistic polysemy extends into forms of rebellion and “culture creation” that are inseparable in the “black arts” (Nelson 1999), a position also taken by author Dr. Ajay Heble (Heble 2000). Although I agree with Nelson’s definition of “rhythm,” as being multi-faceted, I also think that “dissonance” is the precursor involved in the expression of rhythm. For example, Frank Kofsky, author of *Black Nationalism and the Revolution of Music* (1970) purports that the racial dissonances experienced by marginalized African Americans contributed to the formation of a codified dialect (slang) and was adopted into the rhythms and utterances of jazz phrasing—replicating the sound patterns of Negro speech (Kofsky 1970, 135). Similarly, saxophonist Steve
Coleman in his analysis of Charlie Parker’s phrasing and rhythms reiterates the point made by Kofsky on the nucleolus of African American jazz:

Indeed, all of Parker's compositions are also explanations, and that they are all telling stories. And as mentioned before, they contain the same kinds of exclamations, dialog, linguistic phraseology, and common sense structure that is contained in everyday conversation, with the exception that this linguistic structure is based on the sub-culture of the African-American community of that time, what most people would call slang. This is particularly evident in the rhythm of the musical phrases. (Coleman 2016)

The points made by Coleman and Kofsky are crucial as they indicate the seldom approached topic of jazz music as being related to the rhythmical nature of human speech. Perhaps, schools might now consider the use of iambic pentameter in jazz discourse as a means to study phrasing?

To further unpack why African Americans may have a different taxonomy of jazz expression vs. their Caucasian counterparts, I looked at various literature that focused on how African Americans are constantly in a state of signifyn(g) and synthesizing two binaries within their music—slavery (dissonance), and the methods of overcoming that slavery and negotiating freedom (consonance). For example, when examining “dissonance” from a socio-cultural lens, Henry Louis Gates’ The Signifying Monkey (1988) defines the term double-voiced as the expressions within African American arts that are polysemous in meaning (Gates 1988, 143–258).

Another way I purport of how binaries such as consonance and dissonances are negotiated in the lives of African Americans is through W.E.B Dubois’ definition of double consciousness. Dubois’ theory hints (figuratively) at how African Americans are always in a state of turbulence as they are always conscious of how they are viewed in a Caucasian-dominated society (Bell, Grosholz, and Stewart 1996). To this end, I argue that before “rhythm” can be expressed artistically, an unconscious level of sociocultural regression takes
place within the African American mind.\textsuperscript{38} To further clarify my point, I argue that within the African American state of consciousness, “dissonances” are viewed and then expressed throughout the arts by way of “negotiation”—a juxtaposition of concord and discord binaries—African Americans “working through” a Caucasian-dominant society while trying to manage and overcome barriers of marginalization.\textsuperscript{39} To further explicate my point, I will examine Dr. Ajay Heble’s seminal work entitled *Landing on the Wrong Note: Jazz, Dissonance, and Critical Practice*, (2000) which demonstrates that the multidimensional aspect of musical dissonance that is replete with socio-cultural and political ties.

In this literature, Dr. Heble posits that certain choices of harmonies and pitches performed by African Americans in a jazz context elucidate socio-cultural and socio-political ties (Heble 2000, 9). In this manner, Heble has construed a gripping position that also echoes my own belief about Harris’ concept of “movement”—its antecedents—are what I argue to be socio-cultural constructs (“texts” and narratives) acting as agents of “dissonance” within the music. Similar to this study’s position on socio-cultural dissonance expressed through artistic expression, Heble takes a *poststructuralist* approach—negotiating the term “dissonance” as “identities being constructed, mobilized, and taken up in practices of representation.” The significance and meaning behind Heble’s citation is that musicians (and possibly all artists)—whether aware of it or not, express and negotiate their lives—through their art (Zausner 2006, 11).

\textsuperscript{38} What I am referring to here is African Americans coming to terms with having been persecuted in the past due to racism, while also acknowledging any current marginalization.

\textsuperscript{39} In this manner, I relate the concord and discord binaries within Barry Harris’ concept of movement as a negotiation of repression (dissonance expressed through the dominant functioning chord) and freedom (consonance expressed through the tonic functioning chord). I will expand on this point further in Chapter 5 (*Findings*) of this study by way of Rupert Sheldrake’s holistic explanation of *morphic resonance*. 
Tobi Zausner purports that after confronting societal obstacles or experiencing a mental setback, artists choose to be creative with their challenges, and as a result of that creativity, a transformation is incurred not just within the work, but also of the self (Zausner 2006, 14). Zausner further posits that not only do these beliefs inspire motivation and determine our behavior; they foster an individual’s mastery in performing a task in a difficult situation—as a result of the uncontrollable circumstances at hand (Zausner 2006, 14).

Zausner also states that whenever one is stressed, one is in a state of chaos—a state of turbulence in which things appear disordered, but actually have an inherent structure that can produce new order” (Zausner 2006, 10). Additionally, Zausner’s transformation of the “work and self” is also a precursor to what psychologist Albert Bandura calls “self-efficacy—the way we perceive ourselves and our belief that the things we do make a difference” (Zausner 2006, 14). Zausner’s claims are crucial to this study in that they contextualize what I argue to be the modus operandi for “dissonances” within the African American arts. Thus, by way of Heble and Zausner, I purport that African Americans expressed their anguish subconsciously by creating artistic works that denoted their deplorable conditions while negotiating innovative and enduring responses to those conditions (Heble 2000, 20). Like Heble and Zausner, I also believe that these negotiated responses were manifested through “dissonance”—that is, methods of “signification” acting through socio-cultural “texts, narratives and symbols—played out through artistic expression. Some examples of these artistic negotiations might be: the cakewalk—a staple of 19\textsuperscript{th} and 20\textsuperscript{th} century minstrel song and dance that was originally a Sunday African American burlesque—mocking the stiff-bodied Caucasian society (Caponi 1999, 28; Nelson 1999, 10) or the dissonant chord structures by African American jazz artists that were originally misunderstood by their
Caucasian public (Baraka 1968, 11–20). The next section further clarifies what constitutes “text, narrative, and symbols” within this study.

**Text and Narrative as Symbol Systems**

In order to explicate and review literature that is relevant to the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of movement, I feel it necessary to first consider what authors Johnson and Christensen refer to as “text” and narrative (Johnson and Christensen 2007, 391) while also taking into consideration literature that frames what I argue to be a loaded term — “dissonance.” Through the lens labelled “music as culture,” I frame “dissonance” as social constructs based on primary sources—garnered from: 1.) Harris’ lectures given at workshops I have personally attended, 2.) the personal interviews conducted by myself and others on the topic of Harris’ musical upbringing, and finally, 3.) secondary sources—publications and documented media. Since Harris has made references to music, dance, poetics and theatrics in his musical upbringing (Harris workshops 1996-2010), it is my belief that these arts are not only interrelated aggregates of dissonance (acting as a single multidimensional vessel of artistic expression), but from this compliance, should be taught within jazz curricula as a composite.

Within his workshops, Harris has often referred to the importance of rhythm from a West African lens—especially when referring to warriors of an African tribe who would jump to the polyrhythms of African instruments (Harris Workshops 1996-2010). Therefore, I feel it necessary to look first at the influence of West Africa upon African American music as well as the interrelationships between dance, music, poetry and theatrics. Thus, in the first section entitled “Deconstructing Dissonance” and its following sub-sections, I explain my philosophy for the negotiating of the term “dissonance” while teasing at the interrelationships
within West African music and African American folk music. From here, I further synthesize literature that clarifies the polysemous term “dissonance”—tracing the socio-cultural narratives (“texts”) of African Americans—while also framing Harris’s own musical upbringing.

In her 1996 seminal work, *Deconstructive Variations: Music and Reason in Western Society*, musicologist Rose Rosengard Subotnik posits that “virtually all critical theories depend fundamentally on verbal methods of interpreting the world” (Subotnik 1996, 40). Conversely, Subtonik also purports that non-verbal methods of interpretation, or, what I argue to be non-verbal signifiers, have unfortunately become lost in the translation of music (Subotnik 1996 40). The latter comment by Subtonik is of most importance to this study as this I seek to examine and expand upon the possible “texts”, narratives and symbols that are acting as “signifiers” of dissonance within Barry Harris’s concept of movement.

The question arises—what are these “signifiers” of dissonance and how does one identify and deconstruct them within the context of a (sub)culture? To address this issue, I first turn to African American professor and historian of black culture Sterling Stuckey and his 1994 book entitled *Going Through the Storm*. In this collection of essays, Stuckey purports that “black art” is an amalgamation of poetry, music and dance that evinced the blues, Negro spiritual and jazz (Stuckey 1994, 1). Stuckey further states that the “negro entertainer” is an individual who encapsulates the multi-level interplay between societal

---

40 A view that is also promulgated in several published texts such as Bruno Nettl’s *Excursions In World Music* and Gunther Sculler’s *Early Jazz: Its Roots and Musical Development* (Evans 2016; Nettl 2008, 203; Schuller 1986, 32).

41 For more information, see Chapter 1. Harris’ musical upbringing was a composite of artistic interrelations during the Harlem Renaissance, swing era and bebop era (Harris workshops 1996-2010; Harris interview 2014).
“appearances.”

Stuckey clarifies that the African American artist is a metaphor for a “poet” who symbolically “employs” the blues, jazz, the “corruptions” of Tin Pan Alley and the “perversions” of genuine “Negro music,”—all set against the tragedy of “the terrible flood”—slavery (Stuckey 1994, 149). Stuckey’s citation is important in that it is representational of the many jazz artists who grew up after the turn of the century (such as Barry Harris). Stuckey’s citation is also crucial to this study in that it frames the multi-dimensional aspect of African American music that I argue should be taught within post-secondary jazz curricula. To further this point, I turn to the work by co-authors Kariamu Welsh, Jacques D’Amboise and Elizabeth A. Hanley from their ground-breaking research entitled African Dance (2010). According to these authors, in the eyes of Africans, the “arts,” such as music, dance, poetics and theatrics, are inseparable, and as such, are an amalgamation of “culture”—a view that is also strongly supported by author Gena Dagel Caponi in her inventive work about African American expressive culture entitled Signifyn(g), Sanctifyin,’ and Slam Dunking (1999) and Amiri Baraka’s Blues People (1963) (Welsh, D’Amboise, and Hanley 2010, 33). This opinion of Welsh and her co-authors, (also echoed by Caponi and Baraka) is crucial in that it frames how I argue Barry Harris’ concept of movement should be first be analyzed—from the compliance of his socio-cultural upbringing. Just as in West African culture, Harris’ concept of movement and the amalgamation of the arts to which he was exposed during his musical upbringing (Harris workshops 1996-2010) should be seen as cultural signifiers or constructs (aggregates)—“texts,” narratives and symbols contributing to the gestalt (movement). Since Harris has on many occasions referenced the contributions of

---

42 For an in depth analysis on signification, see Henry Louis Gates Jr.’s The Signifying Monkey (1988). He clearly explains the multidimensional meanings behind African American gestures. By making the “monkey” out to be the trickster, Gates Jr. has cleverly insinuated that there is always more than one meaning not only behind language, but within all the arts in which African Americans participate (Gates 1988).
West African to African American music (Harris workshops 1996-2010), I argue this to be a solid starting point to examine the layers\(^{43}\) of “dissonance” expressed within “movement.”

I purport that these “dissonances” within Harris’s concept of movement—the socio-cultural signifiers—“texts,” narratives and symbols, should be demonstrated by the literature taken from West African\(^ {44}\) and African American narratives. Thus, to address literature that explicates “dissonances” within Harris’ concept of movement, I will first review works that explore the influence of West African music upon African American musical culture as a means of signification and symbol system. The reason for starting from this point of view is to draw attention to what Wilfried Raussert, author of *Negotiating Temporal Differences: Blues Jazz and Narrativity in African American Culture* (2000), purports as “a remaining gap in critical methodology of jazz from a socio-cultural lens” (Raussert 2000, 1). In this manner, the review of literature will explicate the negotiation of “dissonance” as a socio-cultural expression—exhibited through “text” and “narrative”—symbols within the African and African American (sub)culture. For example, and according to Raussert, if jazz (and, as we will see of Harris’ concept of movement) is to be viewed as a representation of intercultural art developed by African Americans within American culture (Raussert 2000, 1), then I argue that the literature reviewed must also explicate “intercultural art” as text and narrative—functioning as symbols. To commence, I necessitate the use of author Nelson Goodman and his seminal treatise—*Languages of Art* (1976) and author Alessandro Giovannelli’s work on the deconstruction of Goodman’s “aesthetics” within art (2015). By using Goodman and

\(^{43}\) I use the term “layers” as a result of the many facets of dissonance (harmonic, rhythmic, socio-cultural and socio-political) that I argue are intertwined within Harris’ concept of movement.

\(^{44}\) Harris, along with numerous authors such as Gena Dagel Caponi, have cited West Africa as the inception for the rhythms, dances and harmonic treatments within African American Jazz (Caponi 1999, 9-30; Harris workshops 1996-2010).
Giovannelli’s requirements for a “symbol system,” the reviewed literature will define what constitutes “text” and “narrative,” that is—the analysis of socio-cultural “dissonances” within Harris’ concept of movement by way of West African and African American culture.

**Signifiers and Symbol Systems**

In his 1976 treatise, Nelson Goodman treats “artworks” as symbols that refer to the world, requiring an interpretation that largely depends on what is customary within a certain cultural, artistic, or linguistic community (Giovannelli 2015). Furthermore, Goodman and Giovannelli have constituted that artworks, such as in the case of dance, music, poetry and theatrics, evince a schematic system that could be governed by cultural and linguistic constructs (Giovannelli 2015). Thus, I have adopted this approach by Goodman to evince and review literature that has relevancy to the antecedents of movement—utilizing what Giovannelli and Goodman refer to as “worlds” and the symbols that construct those worlds as a branch of epistemology (1976, 262-265; 2015).

Goodman and Giovannelli propose that paintings, sculptures, music and dance are all entities composed of symbols—possessing different functions and relate differently to the worlds to which they refer (Giovannelli 2015). Furthermore, these authors purport that artworks would require interpretation in order to understand to what they refer, in which way, and within which systems of rules (Giovannelli 2015). I am not fully in agreement with the latter part of this comment because I believe that the various forms of artistic expression, or in this case, “symbols,” are one and the same, as they denote the world they are referring to, through their art. For example, and as previously mentioned, authors Welsh, D’Amboise and Hanley make an excellent point of teasing out this argument in their 2010 treatise *African Dance*, stating that Africans view music, dance and poetry as one and the same, and as such, are inseparable (Welsh, D’Amboise, and Hanley 2010, 30). It is this universal and
interrelation of the arts that might have influenced authors such as Caponi and Baraka to insist that the “black aesthetic” should be examined in the context of the culture that gave rise to it (Baraka 1968; Caponi 1999, 21) and what author Albert Murray states from his 1976 *Stompin the Blues*—an interconnectedness between social expression within the arts of literature, dance and music (Murray 1976, 96-109). In his 1994 account of Africa’s influence upon African American artistic culture entitled *Going Through the Storm* (1994) author Sterling Stuckey cites African American civil rights actor, singer and poet, Paul Robeson and states, “African American music is directly tied to African music—the dances, songs and the religion of the black man in America is the same as those of his cousins from Africa that he has never seen—especially the peculiar sense of rhythm being his ‘rhythm-consciousness’—stamping him as an ‘African’” (Stuckey 1994, 198). Robeson’s quote is pivotal to this study in that it demonstrates what I argue to be necessary if one was to learn jazz from its “foundation.”

It is also my belief that Estelle Jorgensen’s definition of *synthesis* is a very important concept. Jorgensen explains that *synthesis* is comprised of two binaries—*thesis* and *antithesis* (Jorgensen 2003, 52). Applying her theory here, I would describe African music as what Jorgensen refers to as *thesis*—an amalgamation of art forms representing everyday life (Chernoff 1979, 23). I also believe that African music (past and present genres, for example, current gospel and rap music) also embodies what Jorgenson describes as *antithesis* because it is constantly reaching back and paying homage to its ancestry as well as its origins in slavery (Nettl 2008, 192–224) similar to the ring shout (Caponi 1999). Author W.E.B Dubois’ concept of *double consciousness* applies here—that is, the feeling that the artistic output of African Americans will always be permeated by two binaries—the pain and suffering of their enslaved ancestors (tension), and the joy of freedom (resolution) (Bell,
Grosholz, and Stewart 1996, 89–90). By seeing the outside world through the juxtaposed lens of *double consciousness*, Dubois purports that African Americans will “always [unconsciously] see one's self through the eyes of a racist white society as well as reconciling an African heritage with an upbringing in a European-dominated society” (synthesis) (Wamba 1999, 82).

I purport that African American artistic performances are always in a constant state of *synthesis*. The works they create are a composite of *thesis* and *antithesis* binaries. An example of this type of artistic performance that utilizes Jorgensen’s concept of *synthesis* is Billy Holliday’s vocal rendition of the 1937 Abel Meeropol poem “Strange fruit” (1939), which was itself inspired by a Lawrence Beitler photograph of the 1930 African American lynchings. The “strange fruit” in the title of the work refers to the hanging bodies of African Americans from a tree.

Holliday’s rendition of “Strange Fruit” is a synthesis of beauty and torment. Holliday’s vocal gestures beautifully but hauntingly accent certain lyrics that depict the lynching of African Americans. By way of Dubois’ figurative *double consciousness*, Holliday has transferred to the listener her musical vision of a tainted American past while drawing inspiration from poetry—Abel Meeropol poem “Strange fruit” (1939) and the visualization that was originally inspired by the Lawrence Beitler 1930 photograph. In this sense, Holliday has drawn from the dissonances of other artistic forms to form gestalt—where music, paintings, theatre and poetics all share what neuroscientist Daniel J. Levin refers to as “elements coming together to form whole objects (Gestalt) that are qualitatively different than the sum of their parts but cannot be understood (if separated) in terms of their parts” (Levitin 2007, 17).
The significance of this statement to this study is that in order to understand Harris’ concept of movement (the gestalt), its “parts,” that is, the antecedents—the socio-cultural “texts” and narratives such as music, dance, paintings, theatre and poetics—cannot be separated or discounted when studied.

Similar to Goodman’s use of “symbol,” and Levin’s use of the term “gestalt,” Gena Dagel Caponi, author of *Signifyin(g), Sanctifyin’, and Slam Dunking* explains that the term “African American aesthetic” is a conglomeration of symbols and style embedded within and structured by cultural values that have evolved over time in relation to their social function (Caponi 1999, 8). The significance of Caponi’s comment to this study is that it displays how African American “aesthetics” can be viewed not only as day-to-day cultural activity, but also as semiotic gestures or signifiers that may be polysemous—multidimensional in that it cannot be separated from its social and cultural context (Chernoff 1979, 33). Caponi’s comment is also significant in that it demonstrates how African Americans (as we will in see in the case of Barry Harris) drew upon socio-cultural activities in their upbringing (dance, music, poetics and theatre) not only for social purposes, but also as a means of signification (Nelson 1999, 3)—expressing what musicologist Norman Cazden refers to as “functional associations of musical meaning” (Cazden 1945, 10).

**Interrelated Arts Demonstrating Dissonance**

Similar to Gena Dagel Caponi’s work on signification, Dr. Estelle Jorgensen states that music—whether conceived principally as an aural art, or existing as one of several interrelated arts—is a by-product of culture and cannot be a separate entity from its social constructs and context (Jorgensen 2003, 30). In her book *Transforming Music Education* (2003), Jorgensen uses the example that jazz was originally understood by its early creators and performers to be an interrelated art form—interconnected with spiritual and political life.
Echoing Jorgensen’s viewpoint, authors Harrison, Brand and Hailey also promulgate that jazz was expressed through “dissonances”—artistic expression by way of music, dance, poetics and theatre (Brand and Hailey 1997, 24–33; Harrison 1996, 220; Nelson 1999, 3); unfortunately, the tradition that began as an informal music was transformed into a classical tradition and became formalized in the school system (Jorgensen, 33). John Miller Chernoff, author of African Rhythm and African Sensibility (1979) builds upon Jorgenson’s comments of jazz as originally understood to be an “interrelated art form.” Chernoff first contextualizes jazz as an offspring of African music that can only really be understood through the action of body movement. Next, Chernoff suggests that there is a predominant connection that not only links dance to the body, but that there is also a rhythmic linking of music and language (Chernoff 1979, 21). Similarly, author Samuel A. Floyd Jr. draws a relationship that unifies dance, music and song as interrelationships through the African American ritual known as the “ring shout,” a sentiment that is also echoed by authors Sterling Stuckey and Gena Dagel Caponi (Caponi 1999, 135; Floyd 1995, 6; Stuckey 1987, 16).

On the topic of rhythm and body movement, renowned pianist and pedagogue Abby Whiteside echoes Chernoff’s message to all classical musicians—stating that they should learn to glide as jazz musicians in order to “feel” the rhythm when they play (Whiteside 1997, 170). Whiteside’s reference to “gliding” as being essential for classical musicians is significant in that it can be traced to the body movements of African dancers who “glided” when they danced (Welsh, D’Amboise, and Hanley 2010, 92) and the American tap dancers such as Harris’s colleague—Jimmy Slyde—that Harris used regularly in his musical performances (Rocco 2008). Thus, for the contextualization of “dissonance” within Harris’ concept of movement, Chernoff’s comments are crucial as they support the idea that the body
is a multidimensional vessel of expression—bridging artistic forms of expression (aggregates) into one unified form (gestalt). Most importantly, and in accordance with what authors Goodman, Giovannelli and Prouty refer to as “symbol” and “narrative” as a means of interrelated arts between music, dance, poetics, visual and theatrics arts (Giovannelli 2015; Goodman 1976, 5-40; Prouty 2012, 36-37), I argue these elements are the crux for what is missing in post-secondary jazz education across the GTA.

**Music Education and the Interrelated Arts**

In her 1999 criticism of African American expressive culture, author Gina Caponi purports that although the fields of African American studies, “black” studies, and diasporic studies exemplify interdisciplinary and comparative cultural studies in the Americas, scholars are “still perplexed on the grounds of which the various arguments might engage each other” (Caponi 1999, 9). The importance of Caponi’s statement to this study is that it makes a case for recognizing two major points that I argue are problematic within GTA post-secondary jazz curricula—the lack of an interdisciplinary, socio-cultural jazz curriculum and the gap in academia that would be required to teach these interdisciplinary arts as a polysemous vessel.

For example, in speaking of interdisciplinary art as an “aesthetic,” author Albert Murray uses the phrase “technology of stylization” to describe the interrelation of the arts as a “self-supporting ensemble of techniques and practices that make up the “black aesthetic” (Caponi 1999, 8; Murray 1976, 90). Ethnomusicologist Steven Feld refers to “aesthetics” as a the “iconicity of style,” stating that even if forms of cultural expression develop and evolve, the underlying structure changes but mostly stays the same—adding to the foundation of an art form (Keil and Feld 2005, 132). The significance of this statement to this study is that it makes a case for recognizing that even if jazz music changes stylistically (which is inevitable
[Caponi 1999, 8]), there must be “foundational structures” such as musical syntax and semantics (garnered from African and African American narratives) that give way to meaning in the music (Meyer 2008, 68).

To add to this dilemma—and acting as one of the central points of this study—I argue (and as we shall see from the GTA participant interviews) that post-secondary curricula across the GTA remain “in the dark” because they do not recognize that jazz is comprised of interrelated arts within their curricula. If post-secondary institutions do not place a heavier emphasis on jazz from its early, foundational roots, and if they do not foster understanding of the sociocultural factors that negotiated “dissonances” within the music, this will create what I argue to be a recipe for jazz illiteracy. Author Carl Van Vechten illustrates this point in the magazine *Vanity Fair* in which he states that:

> Unless “whites” are willing and prepared to learn the music from its proper compliance that involves both its origin and history, and make an attempt to get in touch with the ‘feel’ and the ‘experiences’ of the people that created them instead of treating them as a musical ‘technique’ or ‘exotic art form,’ then they are destined for failure (Bernard 2012; Caponi 1999, 60).

Therefore, educators must infuse what Author Amiri Baraka purports to be as socio-cultural “texts” and narratives within jazz’s message (Baraka 1968, 11–34).

Next, in her 2003 *Transforming Music Education* and 2008 *The Art Of Teaching Music*—both seminal studies that demonstrate that the important aspects of musical education begin from the historical axis between the intersection of various arts —author Estelle Ruth Jorgenson posits that art should be viewed as an interrelation between *philosophy, politics, visual art, drama, dance literature and music* (Jorgenson 2003, 82-86), and as such, all are by-products of what she labels “agency”—social, political, religious and economic factors (Jorgensen 2003, 90; Jorgensen 2008, 107). Echoing Jorgenson’s sentiments, Ken Prouty’s *Knowing Jazz: Community, Pedagogy, And Canon In The Information Age* (2012) is
analogous to Jorgensen’s position in that it promulgates the need to for students to learn jazz from a “canon” that is comprised of “social and cultural currents, relationships to adjunct histories, and alternative ways of looking at the world” (Prouty 2012, 9). Author Randy Snyder devotes an entire chapter of his dissertation to the “cultural aspects” in which he highlights the importance of jazz education through the lens of civil rights (Prouty 2012, 56; Snyder and University of Houston 1999, 49). Along with Prouty, author Keith Javors makes the claim that if jazz education is supposed to have credibility at the highest standard, “it must be accountable to and inclusive of not just the historical narratives within the institution, but to the historical traditions as well” (Prouty 2012; Javors 2001, 161–62). Prouty does an excellent job of constructing and negotiating “historical narratives and traditions” as what has come to be known as “culture,” taking into account that the educational system has done quite the opposite at the collegiate level (Prouty 2012, 69). For example, Prouty refers to Anne Shaw Falkner’s polemic writings of 1921—contextualizing “jazz” as weird syncopated rhythms for the “accompaniment of the voodoo dancer—stimulating the half-crazed African American barbarian to the vilest deeds”—used to stimulate brutality and sensuality (Prouty, 69). This comment of Falkner is twofold and is what I argue to be a dichotomy: it is first a racist comment based on ignorance and a zeitgeist (sign of the times)—painting the African American as a “brute.” Conversely, Falkner’s statement, although of a galvanizing rhetoric, does seem to have some merit. For example, and according to author Kariamu Welsh-Asante, if African and African American music has an underpinning sense of sensuality that inspires the movement of one’s body (Welsh-Asante 1996, 178), then it can be said that there was no shortage of African American jazz musicians that refrained from exemplifying these actions on the bandstand. Musicians such as Cab Calloway, Dizzy Gillespie and Thelonious Monk infused semiotic gestures in they way they moved and acted on stage (Baraka 1968, 32;
Wilfried Raussert makes an excellent argument that the “polycentric movement of the body—head, shoulders, arms, legs, chest, and pelvis find their musical equivalent in the jazz musicians handling of the beat—manifesting in the burial ceremonies of New Orleans” (Raussert 2000, 6–7). The influence of African dance patterns within jazz music can perhaps be best exemplified by Thelonious Monk’s onstage antics. According to author Amiri Baraka, Thelonious Monk in particular captured the essence of African dancing in his musical performances by utilizing quick dips, half-whirls and deep pivoting jerks (Baraka 1968, 32). What I argue to be even more significant to this study is that Monk’s band members and audience members claimed they could get “further into the music by watching Monk dance by following the jerks” (Baraka 1968, 32). Thus, the influence of body movement upon music contributes to the influence of the African upon African American art—on the bandstand. It is this union of African dance and African American music that can be viewed as a composite, and what Jorgenson refers to as a blending of opposites 45—fusing “thesis” with “antithesis” and resulting in the formation of a new entity—synthesis (Jorgenson 2003, 52). It can also be viewed as what neuroscientist Daniel J. Levitin refers to as a spandrel or “by-product,” which is formulated after a composition of materials (Levitin 2007, 252). An example of synthesis may be two different musical meters such as 4/4 and 3/4 being played at the same time resulting in a rhythmic Hemiola—constantly used in West African ceremonies (Nettl 2008, 180–201). Jorgenson’s synthesis is also apparent in Barry Harris’ concept of movement. For example, in Chapter 5 of this study’s Analysis, I will present the marriage of

45 I view these only as opposites in the sense as being different modes of artistic expression. To me, their function is equal in the way they express contour, rhythmic movement and nuance.
what author Rose Rosengard Subotnik refers to as “hierarchal binary oppositions,” that is, opposing entities that can be thought of as related, and more importantly, one entity can provisionally assume to have priority over the other (Subotnik 1996, 62). In relation to this study, I frame “hierarchal binary oppositions” as the union and intersection between concord and discord harmonies within Barry Harris’ concept of movement. However, it is also this marriage of Jorgenson’s aforementioned definition of “thesis” with “antithesis”—resulting in the formation of a new entity—synthesis.46

Post-Secondary Scholarship Across Canada and Within the GTA

Musician and pedagogue Brian Lilos has compiled a substantive encyclopedic work on Canadian Jazz pedagogy and curricula entitled Pedagogy: A Canadian Perspective (2006). This is an ambitious work and may even propel Lilos to be realized as a world-class teacher and scholar. For example, within this work, Lilos has managed to collaborate a dais of jazz pedagogues—forming a synergistic approach to the understanding of jazz. Some of these contributors include Dave Restivo, Steve Mancuso, Michael Coghlan and Sundar Viswanathan. Thus, the collective experience and wisdom of these authors are seamlessly disseminated throughout every chapter. Lilos has also done a commendable job of making this body of work a “definitive text” for any music educator as the articles found within offer insight into every aspect of jazz education, from basic fundamentals for a middle-school rhythm section, to administrating a top-level university program (O’Mahoney 2016). The scope of the text, both in content and authorship, is no doubt an exhaustive work and Lilos has clearly spent a great deal of time trying to devise this comprehensive treatise.

Commenting on Lilos’ publication, author and Professor Terry O’Mahoney of St.

46 From this axis, and in Chapter 6 of this study (Recommendations), I will evince a new method for improvisation and phrasing that will elucidate how two separate opposing entities, once synthesized—can be garnered for musical nuance and originality.
Francis Xavier University purports that for students who may not have access to a comprehensive jazz program, Lilos’ book then has the potential to open the doors to an area of music where jazz is rarely, or at best superficially, taught (O’Mahoney 2016). In this respect, Lilos’ work will aid curriculums that are poorly developed or have generic “band” instructors as it covers a broad spectrum of topics of interest to the high school/college educator. For example, Lilos does a wonderful job of including many perspectives on educational philosophies, jazz program infrastructure, jazz harmonic and rhythmic materials, composition approaches, teaching strategies, repertoire considerations, rhythm section issues and remedies, rehearsal techniques, graduate jazz degree programs in Canada, and important Canadian organizations (e.g. Musicfest Canada) (O’Mahoney 2016). Lilos has even included sections for jazz professionals—citing such topics as adjudicating a jazz performance, presenting a jazz clinic, and information on professional jazz organizations (IAJE, IASJ) (O’Mahoney 2016).

My only criticism towards Lilos’ work is that there is no African American perspective within it. For example, we see great offerings in breadth of scope from mainly Caucasian pedagogues, and yet we don’t have any offerings from the great African American educators such as Oscar Peterson, Ranee Lee and Wray Downes, nor do we see the role and contributions of the signified church within Canadian jazz from the likes of York University professor Karen Burke. Moreover, Lilos could have also tapped into the wealth of information from two legendary African American drummers who resided in the GTA and have played with the “who’s who” of jazz royalty—Archie Alleyne and Norman Villeneuve. Although Lilos has complied an exhaustive manual, I argue that by not including an African American perspective, the aspiring student will only get half the “picture” of how this music was negotiated and carried out from its socio-cultural compliance.
Alternative to Lilos’ published offering, scholar Jeremy Hepner’s dissertation study that focuses on Canadian Jazz Education (2013) is a well-blended array of insights and observations about Canadian jazz scholars. Hepner has done substantial work by making correlations between American and Canadian scholarship. For example, Hepner states that Canadian post-secondary education is the offspring of its American counterpart, and as such, it shadows its every move (Hepner 2013). Hepner writes, “Like the music itself that flowed north, so too did trends in jazz education, and the changes seen in instructional delivery in the U.S. were also adopted in Canada” (Hepner 2013). In my opinion, this last citation by Hepner is somewhat complex because even though Canadian Universities adopted American educational models, I highly suspect that Canadian Universities did not employ nearly as many African Americans as did their American counterparts in teaching this folk music.

More importantly, while Canadian scholarship adopted the American jazz model of curricula (Hepner 2013), it does not automatically follow that the men and women who teach it are in any position to be referred to as “experts” on the music. For example, in his dissertation on the topic of post-secondary jazz education entitled Thinking About Jazz Education in Canada (2011), author Michael J. Kearns creates a case study that focuses on the pedagogical methods used by four different instructors across Canada.  

In his study, Kearns explores the pedagogy, administration, and the future of jazz education as seen through the lens of these educators. In my opinion, Kearns’ choice of study participants is somewhat questionable if any of them are to be labelled authorities or specialists. Although Kearns has chosen to study the pedagogical methods of these four Canadian jazz educators who, although may be very competent as musicians, some of them have invested more of their careers into being

\[47\] The names of these instructors have been withheld as a result of one of them participating in my study.
pedagogues versus investing more of their time applying their teachings to the bandstand

In the case of Kearn’s study, even though I see no harm in extracting information from these academic individuals, I would rather have seen a case study of African American scholars such as Ranee Lee or Wray Downes whose conceptions of jazz pedagogy seems closer to “the source,” as a result of having played, studied and socialized with the “who’s who” of jazz (“Ranee Lee Bio – Ranee Lee” 2016; “Wray Downes” 2016). For example, Ranee Lee, a professor at McGill University in Montréal, has played with Clark Terry, Bill Mayes, Herb Ellis, Red Mitchell, Milt Hinton, Oliver Jones, and, of course, Oscar Peterson (“Ranee Lee Bio – Ranee Lee” 2016). Wray Downes, a professor at Concordia University, also in Montréal, has been credited for studying harmony with Dizzy Gillespie, piano with Mary-Lou Williams, and has played with leading American musicians such as Sidney Bechet, Buck Clayton, and Bill Coleman (“Wray Downes” 2016). Downes later studied piano with Oscar Peterson, composition with Neil Chotem in Montréal, and attended Peterson's Advanced School of Contemporary Music in Toronto (“Wray Downes” 2016). To me, this calibre of musician, whose foundational knowledge has been acquired from authentic sources, should be the type of instructor sought after by post-secondary jazz institutions. However, as educational theorist Michael Apple states, “School curricula are more accurately a reflection of who has power in society—and those with this power are responsible for the current paradigm of jazz education—one that manifests itself in the practice of dubious ‘swinging concert bands’ that pass for education” (Mantie 2008, 7).

A crucial reason why some jazz graduates and instructors are musically illiterate in this music’s “language.” Consequently, I also echo authors Eitan Wilf, Reva Marin’s concern stated by Paul F. Berliner—“Jazz scholarship has imposed outsider perspectives on jazz that are alien to the music and unsympathetic to the original artist’s intent” (Berliner 1994, 5–6).
Herein lies the paradox: the individuals who are versed fluently in this music may not have the proper designation or curriculum vitae to be hired at the university and college levels, and the individuals who do possess such credentials are not necessarily musically literate in an “authentic” way. Kearns’s study has referred to certain individuals as jazz specialists. This is where I argue the concern arises, as the term “jazz specialist” seems to be somewhat of a sweeping generalization and a loaded term, as one can be a jazz specialist in traditional, modern, avant-garde, fusion and several other jazz genres. To this end, I would expect any “jazz expert,” who specializes in non-traditional genres, to have a solid grounding in the roots of the music before they deviate into specializing in more modern and contemporary idioms.48 One of the objectives of this study is to make some of the foundational aspects of traditional jazz (socio-cultural narratives of African American jazz artists such as Barry Harris) more pronounced in current jazz curricula within post-secondary institutions across the GTA and as a foundation for all jazz students to build their musical individuality. The individuals that Kearns believes to be “jazz specialists” may in fact be more focused type of jazz specialist, such as a Canadian “jazz specialist”—where the phrasing, rhythms and approaches to jazz are non-representational or indigenous of African American jazz musicians who had different socio-cultural upbringings (black/ sanctified

48 From my own personal experiences, I have played with certain GTA professors who may be playing the wrong chord changes in common jazz standards, use patterns in their improvisations or improvise in a style that is non-representational of the feel of a song or the style in which the band is playing. For example, if the band is playing the Jimmy Van Heusen’s composition “It Could Happen to You,” in a swing feel, in my opinion, improvisation that is modal or playing “outside” of the chord changes are not appropriate choices. To this end, I also feel that it is more challenging for educators and students to play “inside” the changes since they have to be more melodic in their harmonic choices when improvising. Thus, tender ballads such as “My Funny Valentine,” “September Song,” or “Moonlight in Vermont” are at a risk of losing their emotional impact if individuals decide to improvise “outside” of the chord changes for the sake of being “hip.”
church, dancing to jazz, jook-joint, rent parties and cutting sessions). In my professional opinion (and I mean absolutely no disrespect to the musicians Kearns has mentioned in his study), after hearing some of these instructors perform, I am convinced they do not embody the internal elements that are indigenous to this music (especially if one is to be referred to and taken seriously as a “jazz specialist”). Additionally, it is also my professional opinion that the playing of some these professors within the GTA is similar to that of some of the students that graduate from these universities and colleges within the GTA—that is, these individuals tend to play in a rote manner with formulaic phrasing and a “ mechanical” sense of time. 

Conversely, Barry Harris, Lee Konitz, and deceased artists such as Clark Terry, Mary-Lou Williams, Mulgrew Miller, Lennie Tristano, or Oscar Peterson would be my definition of a “jazz specialist” in terms of their pedagogical contributions. Since universities

49 The findings from Chapter 4 of this study will illuminate if there is a difference in socio-cultural narratives from African Americans such as Barry Harris and the GTA post-secondary jazz educators.

50 Another reason for which I do not consider these instructors to be “jazz specialists,” is that they have invested a sizeable amount of their careers into becoming “academics,” and therefore have not played nearly as much as they should on the bandstand— “the jazzman’s true academy” (DeVeaux 1999, 202). A dying and sparse jazz club scene is also a significant cause for the under-developed skills of both academics and students—causing academics to reconfigure post-secondary institutions as ad-hoc jazz clubs (Wilf 2014, 48). This substitution of academia for the “bandstand” is in my opinion not comparable. The bandstand tends to be a “take no prisoners” and competitive “sink or swim” environment that is essential for pushing musicians out of their comfort zones. I argue that the academic environment is too “supportive” and does not prepare students realistically for the challenges and turbulent unpredictability of the bandstand.

51 For more on “mechanical time,” see Eitan Wilf’s concerning study on the dangers of institutionalized jazz entitled Swinging Within the Iron Cage (2010). In this study, Wilf examines the dangers of training the body to play in daily “factory machine” manner of scales and pattern playing. Wilf believes that there a paradox arises when students train the body and muscles by implementing scales, patterns and “licks,” thereby exonerating the body of liberation (Wilf 2010).
in the GTA cannot hire these individuals, I argue it is necessary to hire individuals that embody the same musical beliefs and caliber, not only as instructors, but also as practicing performers. If this is still not feasible, then we must learn from the pedagogical devices that these previously mentioned musicians have developed. Ironically, some of the more “non-conventional” ways to learn jazz have been already evinced by musicians such as Barry Harris and Randy Weston. For example, according to Randy Weston, Thelonious Monk was one the best teachers he ever had—Monk would just play for hours while the young Weston would observe and assimilate—using only his eyes and ears (Zwerin 2006). Weston further states that “there is a lot to be gained from the ‘oral tradition’ of ‘looking over one’s shoulder’” (Zwerin 2006). Barry Harris also echoes’ Weston’s beliefs stating that “looking over the shoulders” was one of the main methods he used to copy and assimilate the more experienced player’s body movements and harmonies (Barry Harris interviewed by Aaron Graves 2010). Throughout this dissertation, it may seem as if I am essentially of the opinion that Caucasian musicians can never play jazz authentically, or be considered a jazz “specialist,” but in this manner of learning, it is possible.

Author Roger Mantie proposes another reason for the concerning lack of musical proficiency in Canadian jazz education, which is the extent of playing written music such as big band or orchestral music. Constantly playing written music negates the development of “reactive” and interplay skills within improvisation (Mantie 2007, 1-8). I wonder if certain instructors within GTA post-secondary academia are unsuccessful in helping their students to

---

52 Non-conventional in terms of current modes of teaching and learning—according to Berliner, DeVeaux, Ake and Prouty, this was the oral tradition, “looking over one’s shoulders” grabbing visual and aural cues along with body gestures (Ake 2001; Berliner 1994; DeVeaux 1999; Prouty 2012).
assimilate this African American art form is because they may be placing too much emphasis on the big band model that relies mostly upon set arrangements.

To shed light on this concern, Hepner, Mantie, and Ake’s studies found that Canadian jazz education has its limits—classes were sometimes only limited to big ensembles such as a classical orchestra—and sometimes run by individuals who were not originally trained in jazz (Ake 2001 116-118; Hepner 2013; Mantie 2007). Speaking from my own experience, I argue that the big band scenario does not help students develop spontaneous rhythmical interplay, as would a small jazz unit. Echoing my concerns, Mantie, in his dissertation study, along with esteemed ethnomusicologist, Bruno Nettl and author David Ake, expand further upon the detriment of big band music upon a student’s ability to develop improvisational skills (Ake 2001, 114; Mantie 2007, 2; Nettl 1995, 107). Mantie’s study also advances one of my concerns addressed in Chapter 1 of this study—that is, not only do post-secondary students have an incomplete knowledge of jazz vocabulary by playing in a formulaic manner, they also use incorrect chord qualities as a result of using “fake books” (Mantie 2007).

The results of Mantie’s study of post-secondary jazz education in Manitoba are, in his opinion, a reflection of jazz education across Canada (Mantie 2007, 6). Mantie builds on one of this study’s arguments while also echoing Eitan Wilf’s study on the paradox of institutional jazz and creativity (Wilf 2014, 4-24). Thus, Mantie purports that one cannot solely place the blame on students’ inability to comprehend jazz when the teachers themselves are also incompetent in the comprehension of this music’s genealogy and historiographies (Mantie 2007, 6-8).

53 As a researcher, I cannot help but agree with Mantie’s findings of jazz illiteracy across Canada, but for this study, I can only comment on my personal experiences with students and instructors within the GTA, as well as the findings from this study.
Mantie (2007, 6-8) states, “The teachers are a product of the school system… they don’t know about keys, form, changes, functional analysis, chord scales… the students don’t have a chance.” In my opinion, here Mantie makes an over-generalization, as I do believe there are many wonderful teachers who do embody these musical skills but may not know how to complement their music teaching with the other art forms (dance, poetry, etc) derived from African American socio-cultural narratives. To teach in this more inclusive manner, would in my opinion, foster a deeper understanding of this music.

**Jazz Education: A Paradox For Creativity?**

According to authors Wilf (2010, 564), Bryant (2005, 228), Adler (1979), and Elkins (2001), the rise of post-secondary jazz education programs is part of a broader social trend that is unfortunately entwined with bureaucracy. The blending of the creative arts with bureaucracy problematizes and worsens the dichotomy that exists within the institutionalization of art education (Wilf). Thus, many scholars such as Bryant, Wilf, Adler, and Elkins have argued that creative thinking cannot be cultivated within the “institution.” These powerful statements are unfortunately the challenges that jazz scholarship faces. But how did jazz education become so removed from its traditional “source” in the first place?

In his landmark study on jazz education and tradition entitled *Knowing Jazz* (2012), Ken Prouty warns of the challenges faced by academia when they are “too far removed from the traditions of jazz” (Prouty 2012, 47). Prouty offers valuable insights into the relationship between jazz communities, education and history by way of exploring many well-trodden jazz mythologies. Prouty raises a crucial point that there must be a synthesis in discourse that marries “the street and the school” (Prouty 2012, 51). I whole-heartedly agree with Prouty about the inclusion of “the street” into jazz curricula, as it would be neither feasible nor desirable to balance “the school “with” the street. Personally (and as we shall see in Chapter
of this study from my own curriculum development), I would pledge to keep jazz curricula as urban\textsuperscript{54} as possible—echoing Prouty’s claims that “the institutional narrative excludes many of the important processes by which the techniques of jazz were transformed and formalized into a viable academic process” (Prouty 2012, 52). To further my point, and keeping within the same compliance of DeVeaux and Berliner’s lens (DeVeaux 1999, 202-235; Berliner 1994, 36-62), author James Lincoln Collier criticizes teaching and learning jazz in higher education—stating, “With students all over the United States being taught more or less the same harmonic principles, it is hardly surprising that their solos tend to sound much the same” (Collier 1993, 155). Similarly, author Stuart Nicholson’s *Jazz and Culture in a Global Age* (2014) posits, “Hundreds of thousands of students and thousands of teachers study jazz as a narrow repository of stylistic inspiration resulting in both a similarity and concept” (Nicholson 2014, 36; Prouty 2012, 73). This last citation by Nicholson evinces that not only do many students sound similar from studying similar concepts and techniques, so do their teachers. Furthermore, Prouty cites author Peter Townsend, who quotes jazz saxophonist great Joe Henderson: “through academic study, everybody is doing the same thing, you don’t get the individual fingerprint like you used to among players” (Prouty 2012, 74; Townsend 2000, 179). Adding to Henderson’s comment on the topic of the frailty of jazz scholarship, noted jazz authoritarian Lewis Porter purports in the 1988 article of *Black Music Research Journal*, “the issue in jazz education is grounded in its insensitivity to a black perspective on jazz history and practice thereby lacking in a deep and critical understanding of the jazz tradition” (Porter 1988, 204; Prouty 2012, 78). This argument by Porter is an excellent example that draws attention to one of the concerns of this study—the need for reconstructing post-secondary jazz curricula across the GTA.

\textsuperscript{54} This will be shown in Chapter 6 by my own construction for a jazz curriculum.
Outspoken jazz trumpeter and blogger Nicholas Payton takes a firm position on the teaching of jazz. He states that the word “jazz” has already become a “whitened” vehicle for mass assumption within commercial enterprise. What was once a “black” music (Dunkel 2012), has nothing to do with “African American-ness” anymore, and as such, this “whitened” commodity has corrupted the intention behind the music. I argue that Payton is referring to “jazz” as a bureaucratic enterprise that has suppressed African Americans. Payton’s criticism that Caucasians have only extracted a minute “layer” from the breadth of African American music is akin to what I argue he is referring to as “AfricanAmerican-ness.” Although it is lengthy, the citation is worth quoting as it makes for a polemic case:

There is no such thing as jazz, and any idea of what that might be is false. It’s impossible to build a tradition upon something that was never a designed to be a true expression of a community. The very existence of jazz is predicated upon a lie, just like racism. To speak of “jazz tradition” is like to speak of “racial justice.” It’s not possible to have justice within the confines of race because race was specifically designed to subjugate certain people to an underclass so that the “majority” thrives. Injustice is inherently built within the racial construct. There has never been any tradition within jazz other than to ensure Black cultural expression is depreciated and undervalued. What’s made clear from the very first recorded jazz, à la The Original New Orleans Jass Band, is that it doesn’t have to adhere to the common standards that makes Black music what it is. Genealogy and lineage don’t matter within jazz and who’s who and what’s what is based primarily on the corporate and critical establishments. It used to be that masters like your Ray Brown or Art Blakey decided who the next cats in line were. Now the media or institutions like Downbeat, Billboard, or NARAS are the arbiters—all of which are controlled by the supremacist structures. Tradition is based on politics in the European aesthetic… So far, the furthest back historians been able to go with “jazz” is on a business card by a Creole musician by the name of Jimmy Palao. I don’t think that the selling of the art is the issue. It’s the forces that control the system under which it’s sold that creates conflict. Calling it Black music can solve most of which. Not only because that’s what it is, but because then it becomes apparent what tradition we’re talking about. The same goes for Hip-hop. The Black community doesn’t own or control it anymore. One problem with jazz is that there will always be an argument as to what is and what is not jazz, which prevents an authentic analysis of the art. Once someone gets past whether or not they like someone’s music, the jazz tradition always becomes a distraction. Even if artists say that their music is not jazz, any association with the word will subjugate an artist to an argument, which can never be solved because it’s faulty at its root. From a genealogical standpoint, it becomes very clear to a knowledgeable listener whose music has been informed by the Black tradition and whose hasn’t. That will never happen with jazz because it’s a bastardized tradition that has no foundation outside of a commercial structure. It’s not a communal language; it’s a capitalist one. In Black music, there are no fields, per se, there are territories and lineages.
It’s very clear who is a master drummer in the tribe and who is not. There is also a rhythmic lilt to how you phrase that is encoded in your DNA that gives a sign as to where you are from. I’m not vehemently opposed to the existence of jazz; I’m opposed to the true spirit of Black music being labeled as such. I’m fine with Jazz continuing its journey, just not at the expense of Black music. I’m not trying to change the name “Jazz” to “#BAM” or “Black American Music,” as the misguided and uninformed seem to believe. Jazz is doing just fine, dead on its own. This idea of how personal views and individual preferences factor in artistically comes from a Western perspective. I’m not saying Western thought is intrinsically bad, but there’s an entirely different system of judgment in Black arts. Black arts have been so affected by the Western aesthetic that they appear at times to be no difference between the two, but fundamentally they serve a different function and there are another set of rules at play. Black music can coexist along with the Western aesthetic, as far as I see it. The fact that we have yet to formally establish that there is a thing as Black music is the basis of the confusion. Black arts have been brought over here for a reason. I want to learn from the experience and my desire is to marry the worlds in some way that will be beneficial to everyone involved. It matters not to me if it works out or it doesn’t. All that matters is that we do the work and create value. Whatever happens as a result isn’t up to us. (Payton 2014)

The importance of this brash comment by Payton is that it gives a first-hand account from an African American Jazz artist who believes that the bureaucracy of a corporate America has stripped away layers of “African American-ness” leaving behind a “whitened” version of jazz music. Of course, since the educational system is predominantly structured from a Caucasian standpoint, the music is now replete with “whiteness” (Dunkel 2012), or, can be viewed as to having an “erasure of African American-ness.”

Deceased jazz historian and member of the National Association of the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP) Marshall W. Stearns also made a case to preserve “African American-ness” in jazz music. In his 1949 letter to the NAACP’s executive director Walter Francis White, he petitioned for the urgency to teach jazz in educational systems from an African American lens (Dunkel 2012). Stearns labelled his plan of action “operation jazz” with emphasis upon the scholarly study of the origins of African American music. For

---

55 I also argue that one might even hold Paul Whiteman as one of its chief instigators as he, “behind the scenes,” used African American writers and arrangers such as Duke Ellington, Fletcher Henderson and Don Redman, but still received all the accolades as the “King of Jazz” (Rayno 2012, 111).
Stearns, jazz historiography functioned less as a neutral report of African American historical facts than as an inherently political practice—“whiteness” (Dunkel 2012). Stearns further stated that “African Americans were the music’s originators while white musicians subsequently refined it” (Dunkel 2012). This last citation is vexing because I argue it ties into the notion of the more culturally distant the music is, the more inescapably aware we become of its style as a barrier to understanding it (Subotnik 1996, 169). This is a major concern of this study because I also believe that the African American aspect of jazz has been eschewed for some time within jazz discourses and dialogues within jazz scholarship. As the music becomes corrupted and deviates into a more “European” sound with labels such as ECM, Payton’s point begins to hold more credence that this is a “whitened” by-product of an original “black” commodity.

Finally, Eitan Wilf’s landmark School for Cool: The Academic Jazz Program and the Paradox of Institutionalized Creativity (2014) is possibly one of the most comprehensive dialogues written about the fallacy of “jazz education.” In this in-depth breakdown of the ramifications of post-secondary jazz education, Wilf clearly explains the dangers faced by students because of the blending of educational bureaucracy and jazz pedagogy. At the core of Wilf’s thesis is the troublesome and perplexing paradox—can creativity survive institutionalization? Scholars such as Alex Stein (2015), Donald Brenneis (2014) and Alessandro Durant (2015) have reprised Wilf’s efforts in comprising an eye-opening account of the “disconnect” not only within bureaucratic “walls,” but also from the uninformed (and sometimes incompetent) professors that pontificate about “authenticity.” For example, Wilf cites Stanley Dance’s 1958 interview with tenor saxophonist Lester Young, in which Young is asked about his opinions about the caliber of the musicians who graduated from “upper-brow” collegiate institutions such as Julliard. Young states, “I’ll say I like them all. They all
sound the same to me, because almost all of them went to Julliard and whoever that teacher was, he taught them all the same thing” (Dance 1980, 31; Wilf 2014, 10).

Lester Young’s comment may seem like an over-generalization of jazz students and their instructors, but as I have already mentioned in Chapter 1 of this study, I also share a similar opinion. As previously mentioned, I argue that most of the students or teachers with whom I have played from post-secondary institutions around the GTA, have a very similar sound, play somewhat “mechanically” and have a predictable sense of phrasing and rhythm. After having conducted several interviews with participants from the GTA, I have already noticed that a vast number of the participants also expressed a similar opinion to my own, acknowledging that their close peers and the “whitened” Toronto jazz scene too have adversely influenced them. (GTA interviews 2015-2016).^{56}

Eitan Wilf decided to make a case study of two of the most popular schools that specialized in jazz education within the United States in hopes of discovering why jazz students and their educators seemed so far “removed” from this music’s original vocabulary and syntax.

By focusing on The Berklee School of Music (Boston) and the New School of Music (New York), Wilf could elucidate the contrasting curricula from both schools. For example, Wilf noted that Berklee students are exposed to a highly “formalized” method of education that includes theory books, videos and printed materials (Wilf 2014, 54). Conversely, Wilf found that the New School of Music in New York hired more African American musicians who had already played with famous jazz “greats” and as such, were hired to transfer authentic oral histories—that is, the history of the music rendered through stories and

---

^{56} When asked, the majority of participants named musicians such as Rob McConnell and band members from the Boss Brass as influences in developing their sound.
anecdotes (Wilf 2014, 85). Wilf also purports that *The New School’s* way of teaching jazz was much more similar to the traditional methods used by African Americans in an urban setting (Wilf 2014). By using a much less formulaic way of teaching—one that does not rely on pattern books, “fake books” or “lick” books, the New School has successfully “reproduced long-held modes of training that have become endangered with the decline of extracurricular jazz scenes” (Wilf 2014, 85). Once again, Wilf’s comments have validated one of my earlier points from Chapter 1 of this study—from my experiences of playing with some graduates and teachers from within the GTA jazz educational system (on and off the bandstand), their playing was mostly reminiscent of outer-layered aesthetics and never quite reached the “grittiness” and spontaneity of playing in a reactive manner. Wilf attests to this issue by stating,

> The academic environment of the jazz program often leads to modes of training that are at odds with key aesthetic principles of the cultural order of jazz…many programs’ heavy reliance on formalized, abstract, and easily testable knowledge mediated in print form hinders students from mastering crucial skills such as participating in group creativity, developing a distinct voice or stylistic identity and swinging. (Wilf 2014, 14)

Unfortunately, there was another significant problem on the rise that worked symbiotically with formalized jazz education—the death of the jazz club.

Since jazz clubs were not surviving as a result of jazz’s dying popularity (Wilf 2014), the “jazz scene” survived by shifting from “street” to classroom (Wilf 2014).

Through his two case studies on jazz education at Berklee and *The New School*, Wilf could interview many students and teachers from both institutions who acknowledged major concerns not only for the lack of a “jazz scene,” but also for the shift that has happened—enabling the “jazz institution” to become a poor substitution for an actual jazz scene.

---

57 The results of Wilf’s two-year studies from both these institutions have evinced a major concern that there are not enough playing venues or “gigs” for students and teachers in which
Wilf has also cleverly noted that because students and teachers now being confined to the jazz institution as a new means of participating in “the scene,” this brings with it the fallacy of passed-down knowledge from (musically illiterate) teachers to their pupils (Wilf 2014, 11). This fallacy of passed-down knowledge becomes a feedback loop—students learn to play patterns and licks from their teachers who have already adopted this mechanical way of playing and go on to become teachers themselves—maintaining the “cookie cutter” persona—all graduates and their teachers sounding the same (Wilf 2014, 11).

This information cited by Wilf also validates one of my concerns for GTA post-secondary jazz education that I have already voiced in Chapter 1 of this study. With the “sanctions” placed on institutionalized jazz education from within bureaucratic walls, (Wilf 2014), students are victims of mechanical pedagogy that becomes the antithesis to “real jazz training” (Wilf 2014, 15). More specifically, I argue that jazz education has become a victim of institutionalized bureaucracy. By using oppositional binaries to illuminate the constant struggle when learning jazz through educational/ bureaucratic walls versus. the “street,” Wilf has demonstrated that within these institutions there exists an ongoing juxtaposition of oppositional categories—informal/ formal learning, aurality/ literacy, intuition/ theory and “blackness/ whiteness” that are constantly in flux with one another (Wilf 2014, 14). It is my
to participate, and as such, the academic programs at collegiate institutions become appointed as the reconfigured jazz scene and marketplace (Wilf 2014).

I use the term “sanctions” here, as I argue students are sanctioned to what Wilf considers to be the mimetic vs. the creative. In this scenario, Wilf purports that institutionalized jazz under the governing hands of bureaucracy renders a curriculum that fosters accurate articulation of sound vs. the “street” sense of creative imagination (Wilf 2014, 9).

Wilf doesn't explicitly offer the reader alternative methodologies or practices for learning but does tease at how this music should be learned by giving the reader a host of comments made by African American musicians that he interviewed.
belief that the students who possess patience and foresight to “see” beyond the mechanical and pattern-based pedagogy of their instructors, are the ones that will have sustainability and who will have an original “voice” in this industry.

Musicologist Ingrid Monson also cites Wilf in her work The Problem with White Hipness: Race, Gender, and Cultural Conceptions in Jazz Historical Discourse (1995) on the altering of the jazz “landscape.” Both Monson and Wilf purport that although jazz is flourishing as a topic of study across academia, there is a major decline in its popularity—and as such, a subsequent disappearance of performance venues (Monson 1995; Wilf 2014, 3). Wilf and Monson have also named the jazz musicians and scholars who have strongly expressed that jazz cannot be taught within institutionalized walls. For example, Wilf includes an excerpt from Monsoon’s work, in which she cites legendary bebop drummer Max Roach and his opinions on jazz academia:

We wouldn’t have the Duke Ellingtons and the Charlie Parkers if we had gone to universities and got[sic] doctorates because our minds would have been locked into something else… [Academia is] okay if you want to get a job and be like everybody else. But if you want to go outside and above all that and be like Charlie Parker, Bud Powell, Chick Webb, and these people, academia can’t teach you. (Wilf 2014, 5)

Similarly, author Paul Berliner quotes jazz pianist Walter Bishop Jr., who stated, “I was a high school dropout, but I graduated from Art Blakey College, the Miles Davis Conservatory of Music, and Charlie Parker University” (Berliner 1994, 36). Bishop Jr.’s quote invokes the marginalization and opposition of bureaucratic institutionalization in favor of the apprentice system with jazz masters. Scholar Alice Marquis’ article Jazz Goes to College: Has Academic Status Served the Art? (1998) also warns of the dangerous effects of institutionalization on jazz. In this article Marquis states, “The gravest danger facing jazz may lie in…comfortable acclimation to the academic world…it will leach the individuality out of the art…swaddled inside the velvet cage of academic music” (Marquis 1998, 122).
Of course, as mentioned in Chapter 1, there lies a responsibility with other agencies to do their part in fostering traditional jazz as a means of learning the foundations of the music. For example, with my experiences from Humber College, and from the other collegiate institutions in the GTA,\(^6^0\) It is my belief that since jazz has changed over the years to accommodate and include different styles such as classical (ECM artists), pop (Michael Bublé), rock fusion (Chick Corea’s Electric Band), smooth jazz (Yellowjackets), and big band funk (Tower of Power), the field of jazz education has also reflected students’ desires to learn these other styles. This has further led to changes in programming at jazz clubs and radio stations (also noted by study participants H-LB, Y-EM, H-RD, H-DB, T-BD).

To further illustrate my point, professor Alessandro Duranti from The University of California echoes my argument that since programming of jazz has been altered, asserting, “One cannot understand the paradoxes of jazz higher education unless one understands the changes in the club scenes and the types of young people who are, today, attracted to jazz as a profession” (Duranti 2015). This quote validates my earlier argument from Chapter 1, where I stated that the responsibility of jazz education lies not only within the post-secondary educational institutions, but also within the “ecosystem”—that is to say, within community music schools, radio stations and jazz clubs.

Unfortunately, given the dying popularity of jazz in this era, it is a daunting task to keep jazz clubs operational, let alone profitable (Wilf 2014). There is a higher demand for “accessible” and “friendly” jazz such as classical, pop, rock and funk.

Wilf has raised numerous provocative issues for which there are no straightforward resolutions. His contributions to jazz scholarship illuminate the problems that contemporary

\(^6^0\) For anonymity reasons, they must remain nameless - I have already interviewed educators from Humber College, The University of Toronto, York University, and Mohawk College that have led me to this conclusion.
educators have created\textsuperscript{61} by teaching jazz using licks, patterns, and by encouraging reading scores instead of playing by ear. Clearly, not enough emphasis is being placed on early African American traditional jazz models. This results in a “whitened”\textsuperscript{62} sound that is far-removed from the roots of jazz (within this study, I refer to whiteness as being the “erasure of African American-ness”).

\textbf{Summary and Scholarship}

Within this review of literature, I focused on material that exposed Harris’ socio-cultural upbringing—the antecedents for his concept of “movement.” More importantly, by having fleshed out the layers that comprised his concept—that is, its “texts” and narratives, this study’s research will proceed to expand upon scholarship and the knowledge gap in several important ways: 1.) the assimilation of students’ understanding of the socio-cultural nature underlining jazz. 2.) changing their approach to one that is grounded in tradition.\textsuperscript{63} 3.) focusing on the diachronic trajectory of the language. 4.) it will expand upon the current literature that is documented on Harris’ methodologies. 5.) target the socio-cultural narratives of African Americans. 6.) addresses data that has yet to be documented within any of Harris’ methodologies.

Authors Kenney, Peretti, Berliner, DeVeaux, Shipton, Gates Jr., Floyd, Stuckey, Jorgensen, Prouty, Heble, Chernoff, Caponi, Murray, Baraka, Rausert, Welsh, D’Amboise, \textsuperscript{61}For more, see the published works I have reviewed from authors Liebman, Bergonzi, Abersold within this chapter.

\textsuperscript{62}This study will address the concerns of \textit{Blackness vs. Whiteness} in GTA post-secondary jazz education within the Chapter 5 (African American-ness vs. the “erasure of African American-ness).

\textsuperscript{63}As an educator, I argue it is important is to know where the music “came from” before one would want to learn a more modernized approach. Thus, I am not discounting the necessity to play in a modern fashion entirely, just petitioning for aspiring students to comprehend the “roots” of the music as a requisite.
Mantie, Ake, Marin, Wilf, and Hanley (as mentioned in the review of literature), support one of my main points of this study. These authors promulgate that the socio-cultural and socio-political meanings within African American music can’t be ignored if one is to look at “black art” as a unified form—a gestalt. The aggregates that comprise this gestalt, or what this study also has referred to as “texts” and narratives, are as important, and in many ways, possibly even more important than the artistic expression that was its result (Berliner 1994; DeVeaux 2010; Wilf 2014). To discount such narratives from education would be only giving an incomplete picture of history within a culture’s artistic expression. To this end, if there are pedagogical gaps in Canadian post-secondary education such as from this study’s focus of the GTA, then appropriate action must be implemented to reinstate a curriculum that is not only is grounded in the genealogy of the jazz tradition, but also builds upon its axiom.
CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY

This chapter describes and justifies the methods used to collect and analyze quantitative and qualitative data. The information is provided systematically in the following nine sections: (1) Research Design; (2) Part I: Barry Harris and the Antecedents of Movement; (3) Part II: Questionnaire Survey; (4) Part III: Interviews with GTA Instructors and Administrators; (5) Selection of Participants for Part II and Part III; (6) Data Analysis Procedures; (7) Triangulation; (8) Ethical Considerations; (9) Reflections-in-Action.

Research Design

An exploratory descriptive research design was implemented to develop a treatise that has not been documented in past literature, as well as to explain and expand upon the antecedents of Dr. Barry Harris’ concept of movement, while showing its crucial need for application across GTA post-secondary jazz curricula. The justification for implementing exploratory descriptive research is that this design is appropriate to address social phenomena, issues, and problems that have not yet been clearly explained or defined, and to gain broader insights and familiarity with that phenomenon. Exploratory research generally involves collecting and analyzing qualitative and quantitative data using a variety of methodologies, including phenomenology, case studies, and surveys (Babbie 2010). The following research questions guided my exploratory research design:

Following the tradition of an exploratory descriptive design, this study did not apply any type of confirmatory data analysis, requiring the formal testing of pre-defined hypotheses (Babbie 2010). Exploratory research may be applied to generate hypotheses which try to capture the “essences” of a phenomenon; however, it is not possible to prove or disprove hypotheses using “essences” (Merriam 2014). Therefore, the description of the methods provided in the second and third part of this chapter does not consider any of my pre-
conceived ideas or expectations about what an exploration of the available data might ultimately reveal. Because the research design was exploratory and not confirmatory, I attempted to avoid biasing the results by putting aside his own prejudices, theories, and philosophies, so that his personal perspective was detached from the research process and findings. Nevertheless, as emphasized by Denzin and Lincoln (2008) researchers using exploratory research designs must not pretend to be faceless, invisible, neutral, and unbiased, particularly if, as in the case of myself, they have a social or professional involvement with the phenomenon under study.

I realized that I needed to be reflexive, meaning that I needed to be aware of the need to “negotiate the swamp” by reflecting upon and explaining his own personal role in the construction of knowledge (Finlay 2002, 209). The importance of reflexivity in exploratory research has been emphasized by several other authors (Alvesson and Skoldberg 2000; Holland 1999; Finlay 2002; Johnson and Duberley 2003; Johns 2004). Consequently, at the end of this chapter, I present my personal “reflections-in-action,” focusing on the reasons I chose to use certain methods to conduct the research. Subsequently, in the Discussion chapter, I present my reflections-on-action, otherwise known as a cognitive post-mortem, in which I present my own conscious review of my past experiences, after the data was collected and analyzed.

The exploratory descriptive research design was implemented in three parts. Part I was a qualitative study to explore the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of “movement,” through the analysis of personal recordings acquired from workshops and published qualitative data. Part II was a cross-sectional survey, in which I administered a questionnaire to a sample of GTA instructors and administrators to explore their self-reported responses to closed ended questions. In Part III, I interviewed a sample of instructors and administrators in
the GTA, using open-ended questions to explore their knowledge and perceptions of the issues in greater detail than could be obtained using a questionnaire. To collect the data for the interviews, I combined various methods of data storage that included Call Recorder (an Internet video recorder for all video and phone interviews conducted over Skype and FaceTime), field notes from those interviews and field notes from all telephone interviews. Next, all of the data from these interviews was coded and stored in my computer with password protection.

**Part I: Barry Harris and the Antecedents of Movement**

The antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of movement were explored from a socio-cultural context. Qualitative methods were used to examine materials such as field texts, stories, autobiographies, journals, field notes, conversations, interviews, family stories and photos were analyzed using both narrative and hermeneutic phenomenological analysis. To collect the data for the purpose of analyzing the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of movement, I also amalgamated a collection of recorded media from the workshops in which I had participated during the years 1994-2010. This media was captured on mini-disk, cassette tapes, videotape, DVD and field notes (see Image 1).

I also collated videos from the last 20 years on the Internet posted by other participants who had videotaped Harris’ workshops. What was invaluable to this study were the transcribed recordings of Harris at the Royal Conservatory in The Hague between 1989 and 1998 captured by Dutch jazz pianist and pedagogue Frans Elsen.

Part II: Questionnaire Survey

The questionnaire was developed by way of examining the results from the initial pilot study that was developed by in 2014. I used my first hand experiences drawn from performances with jazz educators and graduates from the GTA, and my experiences with post-secondary curricula at Humber College and the 2014 pilot study done with post-secondary jazz educators. Thus, from these three separate circumstances, I followed McCracken’s protocol for discovering “cultural” and “analytic” categories (McCracken 1988, 34-42) while also following Bloomberg and Volpe’s protocol (Bloomberg and Volpe 2012) for examining and coding survey data.
Several themes emerged from my experiences to form the participant questionnaire. First, it was clear that the participants were more comfortable with and preferred teaching “non-African American” genres of jazz. For example, the data from the pilot study participants H-LB, T-RD, H-RD, T-DB, and Y-WR yielded a response that European jazz music is highly popular around the GTA, both within academia and on the bandstand (the latter was demonstrated in my pilot study conducted in 2014). My measuring instrument sought to collect data that would expose the educators’ preference for European styles of jazz versus earlier foundational styles of jazz such as ragtime, blues, New Orleans style, swing and bebop.

**Part III: Interviews with GTA Instructors and Administrators**

By implementing an entirely qualitative research method, based on interviewing the participants, I explored how a sample of GTA instructors and administrators “experience, interpret and understand the complexities of their socio-cultural ‘world’ at a particular point in time.” This method allowed me to examine a social situation by way of “entering the world of others to achieve a holistic understanding” (Bloomberg and Volpe 2012, 118). In this manner, I focused on extracting and interpreting an in-depth meaning of the study participant’s experiences.

The interview questions (Appendix A) were developed after I reflected upon my own observations from personal experiences playing with students and professors around the GTA over the course of twenty years. The questions were also developed from an insider perspective as I reflected upon the methodologies, pedagogy and curricula from my post-secondary education at Humber College. To this end, preliminary interviews were originally conducted in 2015 with four jazz educators H-LB, T-RD, H-RD, T-DB, and Y-WR that taught at The University of Toronto, York University, Humber College and Mohawk College.
After analysing the qualitative data from these jazz instructors’ preliminary interviews, along with the observations from playing on the bandstand with educators in the GTA and, finally, reflecting on my own post-secondary education, I was able to design and develop the measuring instrument and instrumentation.

To conduct the open-ended interviews in a logical manner, I followed the “four-step method of inquiry” designed by McCracken from his 1988 literature—*The Long Interview* (see Figure 2).

During step one, the “review of analytic categories and interview design,” I completed an exhaustive review of the literature that preceded this study, thus “enabling me to ‘define’ problems and assess data” (McCracken 1988, 29–31).

![Four-part method of inquiry](image)

**Figure 1.** Four-part method of inquiry (McCracken 1988, 30).

Step two involved a “review of cultural categories,” which required a thorough evaluation of one's personal and intimate experience with the topic of research as a way of developing sensitivity to the subject (McCracken 1988, 32). The purpose of this step is three-fold: (a) to formulate questions that will be used in the construction of the questionnaire; (b) to “prepare for the ‘rummaging’ that will occur during data analysis”; and (c) to distance
oneself emotionally from the interview topic through a more complete awareness of the subject matter.

Step three involved the “discovery of cultural categories.” This step involves the formulation of the questionnaire in a way that makes the subject feel comfortable when commencing the interview (McCracken 1988, 34).

Step four involved the “discovery of analytic categories;” that is the analysis of data accumulated from the interview. It is also a determination of “the categories, relationships, and assumptions that informs the respondent's view of the world in general and the topic in particular” (McCracken 1988, 41- 42). Researchers must be “prepared to separate themselves from the literature that they have previously reviewed and be open to the respondents and their world” (McCracken 1988, 42-43).

Selection of Participants for Part II and Part III

A criterion sampling procedure was used to select the participants in order to yield the most information about the phenomenon under study. Criterion sampling was used as a result of its direct relationship to narrative and hermeneutic phenomenological methods (Bloomberg and Volpe 2012, 104). In criterion sampling all participants within a study must meet at least one criterion as specified by the researcher (Bloomberg and Volpe 2012, p.248). Criterion sampling works well when individuals studied represent people who have experienced the same phenomenon (Bloomberg and Volpe 2012, 104). Thus, the following delimitations were set as criteria for all participants.

Participants must be educators in a post-secondary jazz institution limited to The University of Toronto, York University, Humber College and Mohawk College. If participants are educators at more than one of the previously mentioned post-secondary institutions, their data will be added twice as separate participants. They must have some
post-secondary jazz education or exposure to pedagogy and curricula from one or more of the following post-secondary jazz institutions: The University of Toronto, York University, Humber College or Mohawk College. Participants must have had at least two years of experience as a post-secondary jazz educator at The University of Toronto, York University, Humber College or Mohawk College (two years was chosen as a minimum variable in order to give the benefit of the doubt to new educators who may have had only one year of experience within the aforementioned institutions and are still in the process of establishing their pedagogy). Participants must be non-African American (I chose non-African American participants to flesh out the possibility that alternative socio-cultural narratives may have been experienced by these non-African American individuals in their musical upbringing, and as such, differed from African American musicians such as Harris).

**Data Analysis Procedures**

The results of the questionnaire survey, collected in Part II of this study were stored and analyzed with SPSS software. The frequency distributions of the questionnaire responses were categorized in four parts, in order to summarize (1) the demographic characteristics of participants; (2) the responses to Part 1, exploring the jazz influence(s) of the participants when younger; and (3) the responses to Part 2, exploring the current jazz influence(s) of the participants when older; and (4) Responses to Part 3, exploring the participants’ use of jazz in the classroom.

Content analysis was the strategy used to process the qualitative data collected in Part II and Part III of this study. Content analysis is a general term for any form of qualitative data analysis applied to interpret text, speech, or images, that includes categorizing and counting various defined aspects of the content. Thematic analysis (i.e., the extraction of themes from qualitative data) is a component of content analysis (Krippendorf, 2004). The content
analysis involved horizontalization followed by extraction of themes (thematic analysis); and computing the frequencies of the themes. Horizontalization involved laying out the transcription of all the interview data in one document, and assuming that all of the statements provided by all of the respondents had equal value. All significant statements (i.e., words, phrases or sentences) provided by each participant were used as the communication units for the thematic analysis. Communication units which represented a common theme were grouped together to collectively identify a single construct, or issue of importance. Consequently, the evidence to identify each theme consisted of a cluster of significant statements, each of which defined a specific issue, opinion, belief, or experience. This strategy is widely used for the analysis of qualitative data (Creswell 2014; Merriam 2009; Steinar 1996; Stake 2005). The thematic analysis was initially conducted using MaxQDA 12 software. The use of qualitative data analysis software facilitated the objective coding and clustering of the unstructured interview statements into structured categories, and to output the results into an Excel spreadsheet. I discovered, however, that the software did not live up to his expectations. As emphasized by Burnard et al. (2008), “Analyzing and presenting qualitative data is one of the most confusing aspects of qualitative research.” As also emphasized, “The process of qualitative data analysis is labor intensive and time consuming.” My difficulties in using MaxQDA confirmed the criticisms presented in the research literature concerning the deficiencies of qualitative data analysis software (e.g., Baugh, Hallcom, and Harris 2010; Rodik and Primorak 2015; Shonfelder 2011; Zamawe 2015). These criticisms include (1) the software invites the user to exceed the limits of the valid conclusions that can be drawn from qualitative analysis; (2) the software involves too many mechanistic and rigid processes, and puts pressure on me to focus on volume and breadth, rather than on true depth of meaning; (3) the software is not powerful enough to resolve the
very fine nuances, subtleties, and narrow degrees of meaning which can only be
differentiated, after a long period of reflection, in my mind; (4) a much higher degree of
resolution, requiring my intervention and subjective interpretation, is required to discriminate
between closely related themes.

Consequently, after reviewing the themes extracted by MaxQDA, I modified these
themes to take into account the deficiencies in the software. Categories of qualitative data
were initially coded into primary themes. The primary themes were then classified into
several coded sub-themes, each of which represented a mutually exclusive manifestation of a
primary theme. The evidence for the identification of each sub-theme was supported by
quoting a selection of verbatim statements extracted directly from the interview transcript
without editing or distortion by myself, to enhance the credibility, dependability, and
authenticity of the findings (Lincoln and Guba 1985). The final stage of the content analysis
was to compute and tabulate the coverage (counts and percentages) of the significant
statements within each sub-theme. The data was imported from Excel into SPSS 20.0
software for this purpose.

As commonly practiced, the relative frequencies of the significant statements within
each theme and sub-theme were interpreted as indicators of the perceived relative importance
of the information identified by each theme (Krippendorf 2004; Stake 2005); however, as
pointed out by Yin (2014) when conducting thematic analysis, a high frequency of coverage
of a particular theme does not always imply that this theme has a high level of importance.
Ultimately, the interpretation of the relative importance of each theme and sub-theme
depended not on a quantitative analysis, but on my judgement and reflexivity (Finlay 2002).
Triangulation

Triangulation involves comparing and contrasting data obtained from different sources that diverse viewpoints or standpoints cast light on a phenomenon (Olsen 2004). By mixing different approaches and synthesizing survey data and interview, audio or video data, a better understanding of the phenomenon under study may arise (Bloomberg and Volpe 2012). Through triangulation, I attempted to compare (a) the socio-cultural narratives to which Harris was exposed and in which he participated during his childhood and young adulthood which were the germs of his concept of movement against (b) the data from the participants of the GTA post-secondary jazz study. Triangulation could potentially reveal the gaps in GTA post-secondary education by clarifying these contrasting scenarios.

Creswell (2014) defined several different forms of triangulation (e.g., by source, by method, by time, by researcher). In this mixed methods study, the data were collected by different methods (i.e., questionnaires, interviews, and narratives) and from different sources (i.e. administrators, instructors) but not across time, and not by different researchers. Triangulation was used in this study to compare and contrast the key findings using different methods and sources. The expectation was that the findings from different sources would complement each other; however, consistency is not necessarily the outcome of triangulation, since (a) what respondents say in response to open ended interview questions or how they respond to closed ended items in a questionnaire is not necessarily the same as what they actually believe and do in reality; and (b) different sources of data often tap into different perceptions of reality, and may therefore invite tension by providing different perspectives on the same phenomenon.
Ethical Considerations

The following steps were taken for quality control that enabled this study to adhere to confidentiality and ethical considerations. 1.) The participants were informed about the purpose of the study so that their informed consent could be obtained before pursuing the study. 2.) Each participant’s informed consent was obtained, and a detailed explanation of the study was distributed (Appendix B). 3.) The privacy and confidentiality of the participants was ensured by not requiring them to reveal their names or department to ensure anonymity of their responses and to protect them from any retributive action, as well as to ensure that the data collected was not disclosed to unauthorized persons. 4.) Care was taken to minimize any harm caused to the respondents, by ascertaining at the outset whether they had any objections to participating in the study or whether they foresaw any negative impact being caused to them by participating in it. 5.) The participants were also informed that the study was voluntary, and that they could withdraw from the study at any time without risk to the participant. 6.) Many opportunities were given to the participants to ask questions related to the construction and procedures of the research study. 7.) My email was provided to each participant and the participants were allowed to contact me for any concerns about the study at any time. 8.) All the participants received an identical questionnaire and an identical set of open-ended questions, allowing them to expand their responses as appropriate. 9.) The “informed consent” form communicated to the prospective research subject the purpose, procedures including time commitment of the subject, risks and benefits of the study, and the confidentiality of their information. 10.) The participants had the right to participate in the research, and the freedom to decline at any time. 11.) The participants were informed via email and Facebook about the interview date. 12.) Data collection was conducted during the interview through Skype, FaceTime, Call Recorder and field notes. 13.) Data reviewed after
each interview was analyzed, and interpreted into themes and meanings to lay the foundation of codification with the aid of MaxQDA 12 software combined with my personal interpretation of the data.

14.) The respondents signed an informed consent form after the interview via email or by written consent, which gave full assurance of the confidentiality of their responses. 15.) The informed consent forms from the respondents who were willing to provide their views and insights about the topic of the study will be retained for a maximum of two years. 16.) The collected information was stored in a file maintained on a password protected flash memory data storage device. 17.) The hardcopies of the transcripts including signed consent forms were stored on a password protected flash memory data storage device. 18.) After two years have elapsed, all files containing study participant information will be erased from the password protected flash memory data storage device—protecting the participants’ identity information. 19.) The participants were given the opportunity to obtain further information and answers to questions related to the study before, during, or even after the study.

**Reflections-in-Action**

I was inspired to conduct this research by three catalysts: First, in Winter of 2012 at York University, I developed an independent course entitled “The Bebop Workshop.” In this course, I rented a musical studio at Array Studios in Toronto, and held weekly workshops on bebop improvisation and harmony—using the methodologies from Barry Harris. With the permission from certain students, the workshops were videotaped and used for course evaluation.

Secondly, in summer of 2013 at York University, I carried out an independent course that briefly dealt with the musical theory that comprised Barry Harris’ concept of
“movement.” This course was delimited to musical theory and did not touch upon any socio-cultural contexts.

Thirdly, after finding success with the aforementioned independent courses, I then began a pilot study in 2013, examining Barry Harris’ methodologies from a socio-cultural lens. The results from the data revealed a different “perspective” of the “makings of jazz” that I had not previous encountered in my post-secondary jazz education within the GTA. Thus, I wanted to delve deeper into the socio-cultural practices of certain African American jazz artists who were not only performers, but also pedagogues such as Barry Harris. To this end, I wanted to adopt these African American narratives (dance, scat poetry, literature and theatrics) and cultivate them in order to fill gaps in post-secondary jazz education across the GTA.

I exercised a pilot study in 2014 as a means of delving deeper into uncovering the “building blocks” of African American jazz from its roots—using Barry Harris’ concept of “movement” as a case study. The result of that study brought forth the idea that there are certain socio-cultural activities (narratives) that African Americans used, or negotiated, to combat (and overcome) the marginalization of their race—and was expressed unconsciously through “dissonances” within those cultural activities. By examining the musical and cultural upbringing of African American jazz musician Dr. Barry Harris and the antecedents of his concept of movement, I attained a glimpse into a world of interrelated arts that were negotiated within a social context.

Thus, the locus for the study described in this dissertation builds on the original pilot study I conducted in 2014—choosing an African American jazz pedagogue who has been revered as not only a consummate jazz pianist, but also one of the most important jazz pedagogues that has ever lived (Berliner 1994; Bjorn and Gallert 2001). Dr. Barry Harris and
his methodologies have been noted by some of the biggest names in jazz. Additionally, there are a host of disciples that follow him around the globe to attend his workshops. Harris has designed a methodology to build a jazz vocabulary that pays homage to the “forefathers” of jazz. For this study, it was my belief that the “information” within some past and present day jazz literature did not begin to mention the socio-cultural narratives as important aids in learning jazz.

By delving further into the socio-cultural conditions of Dr. Barry Harris’ upbringing, I argue that students would begin to “visualize” jazz using a different perspective, one that places more emphasis on “risk taking,” playing in the moment and using the body as one’s “first” instrument to feel and express rhythm. To this end, even the current literature that has been published about Harris’ methodologies fail to tap into the core of “movement” from a socio-cultural compliance. I argue that these “narratives” are deeply rooted in semiotic information—signs and symbols and are expressed through Harris’ use of “dissonance.” I argue that garnering African American “narratives,” which are an amalgamation of interdisciplinary arts, (dance, scat poetry, literature and theatrics) adds a dimension of spontaneity and rhythmic nuance to the aspiring jazz musician. This interdisciplinary approach has yet to be offered in post-secondary institutions across the GTA.

I argue that Dr. Harris was a perfect candidate for this study for many reasons: he was born during the “golden age” of jazz—the “new negro renaissance,” played jazz as a youth during the swing era and participated musically as a young adult in the bebop era (Barry Harris interviewed by Aaron Graves 2010; Panken 2013). Harris has also taught his methodologies to some of the biggest names in jazz history such as John Coltrane, Joe Henderson and Miles Davis. It is my belief that an individual such as Harris, who has a wealth of experience as a result of playing with some of the biggest names in jazz history—
Coleman Hawkins, Lester Young, Charlie Parker, Dizzy Gillespie, Bud Powell, Dexter Gordon and Thelonious Monk, should be the standard against which all teachers, professors and jazz curricula should be measured in the development of post-secondary jazz curricula across the GTA. Furthermore, the methodologies that Harris and other African American jazz musicians used should be adopted and cultivated for future jazz education.

In this study, I set my compass to analyze the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of movement while comparing them to the socio-cultural musical upbringing of educators that teach jazz at post-secondary institutions within the GTA. The purpose of this comparison was to fill in any possible educational gaps with the “narratives” from an African American jazz master who has had considerable pedagogical success by teaching some of the biggest names in the history of jazz.

In this study, I decided to examine the socio-cultural narratives in which Barry Harris participated. Through the use of narrative inquiry and hermeneutic phenomenology — both disciplines from the broader field of qualitative research. I also made use of two critical lenses— “music as sound” and “music as culture” in the analysis of Barry Harris’ concept of “movement.” By examining and coding data from Harris’ socio-cultural upbringing into units of analysis—“texts” and “narratives,” I examined how African American historical jazz artists learned their craft. The results of this coding could be used as criteria in the measurement of possible educational gaps in post-secondary jazz curricula.

For the analysis of the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of movement, I followed the protocol of Creswell (2014) along with Denzin and Lincoln (2003) by becoming the primary measuring instrument. In doing so, I designed and developed the instrumentation for analyzing the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of movement by collating recorded media from all the workshops he had participated in from 1994-2010. I also looked to the many
videos that have surfaced in the last fifteen years on the Internet from other participants who had videotaped Harris. Within these videos, Harris spoke candidly about his socio-cultural environment and musical upbringing—explaining how his colleagues and himself learned the music. Also within these videos, Harris warns his audience that the “state” of jazz music is in danger because of current institutionalized jazz methodologies (Shermer 2015). From here, I then cross-referenced the video data of Harris candidly speaking about his musical beliefs and socio-cultural “environment” with the lengthy interviews done by Victor Schermer (2015), Ted Panken (2011), Aaron Graves (2010), and the landmark publication co-written by Lars Bjorn and Jim Gallert (2001) Before Motown: A History of Jazz in Detroit, 1920-1960.

Finally, I used triangulation to explore my opinion that post-secondary jazz educators across the GTA who have not followed the socio-cultural trajectory of learning jazz as that of African American jazz pianist Barry Harris and his contemporaries, and as such, these educator’s experiences, pedagogy and curricula is the product of what Prouty (2013) and Wilf (2014) refers to as forms of “whiteness”—the compartmentalization and institutionalization of jazz. In this light, I adopted Creswell’s (2014) protocol for triangulating different data sources of information by examining evidence from various sources, while using it to build a coherent justification of themes. Thus, if themes are established based on the convergence of several sources of data or perspectives, then this process helps to validate the findings.
CHAPTER 4: RESULTS

Part I: The Antecedents of Movement

The purpose of Part I of this study was to develop a treatise that has not been documented in past literature by (a) expanding upon the antecedents of Dr. Barry Harris’ concept of movement; and (b) identifying the need to apply this concept across GTA post-secondary jazz curricula. Emergent themes were extracted from the qualitative data obtained from all the sources listed in Table 1, including workshop recordings, videos, articles, pictures, advertisements and interviews. Section A explores the data for the “music as sound” lens and Section B explores the data for the “music as culture” lens. Section C explores the data concerned with the teaching of jazz. Finally, at the end of this chapter, a triangulation of various themes is examined to illuminate differences between Barry Harris and the GTA post-secondary jazz instructors.

Table 1. Sources of Data for the Antecedents of Movement.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/JIVIN’ IN BE-BOP 1946 Dizzy Gillespie Jazz Film Uncut</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Brother Bones Minstrel Show Performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Calloway Boogie - Cab Calloway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Baby Scruggs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Feeling the &quot;and&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Gela incontra Barry Harris</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry Harris profile - 1985</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry Harris- Jazz Master, Educator, Saint</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry Harris’ speech in Almeria - Spain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry talking about small chords versus big chords</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry talking about the importance of rhythm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry's Speech in Rome!!! Lovely</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Artists House Master Class Interview with Barry Harris</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Stella By Starlight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/JS Podcast Harris Higgins Podcast 1 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Great Advice from Musicians for Musicians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Mentors-barry harris trk3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Mulgrew Miller: Advice for Young Jazz Musicians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Improvisation Can Be Taught –Jazz Legend Mulgrew Miller</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/triplets needed in jazz- barry harris trk2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Spirituals and gospel Hank Jones</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/JS Podcast Randy Weston 1 0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 1. Content Analysis of “Music as Sound.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary theme</th>
<th>Sub-themes</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Number of sources</th>
<th>Coverage within primary theme</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Early influence</td>
<td>Learning jazz at a young age</td>
<td>Boogie-woogie, Shuffle</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Oral tradition</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Playing by ear</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detroit</td>
<td></td>
<td>Harris’ earliest musical influences in Detroit</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>14.8%</td>
<td>14.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The purpose of Part I Section A was to examine the structural influences that Harris was exposed to in his childhood, youth and young adulthood. Table 2 presents a content analysis of the emergent themes extracted from 27 significant statements recorded by Harris and his interviewers.

### Table 2. Content Analysis of “Music as Sound.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary theme</th>
<th>Sub-themes</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Number of sources</th>
<th>Coverage within primary theme</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Early influence</td>
<td>Learning jazz at a young age</td>
<td>Boogie-woogie, Shuffle</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Oral tradition</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Playing by ear</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detroit</td>
<td></td>
<td>Harris’ earliest musical influences in Detroit</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>14.8%</td>
<td>14.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The frequencies of the sources in the primary themes, revealed that Harris had numerous eclectic “Early influences” when learning jazz at a young age (11.1%); and during his early performances in Detroit (14.8%). The sub-theme “Major Influences” representing 74.1% of the sources, revealed that Harris received tuition from many teachers (25.9%) and had many musical idols (25.9%) and peers (11.1%) who he was privileged to play with. Harris also asserted that the jazz tradition was influenced by classical composers (11.1%).

Table 3 presents the thematic analysis of the data for the primary theme “Early Influences.”

Table 3. Early Influences.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>PrimaryTheme</th>
<th>Sub-theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1</strong> <strong>Harris:</strong> “I didn’t start out playing jazz; I started out playing boogie-woogie and other things, too, I guess. We probably played some shuffle rhythm, too, and stuff like that. But we played some jazz tunes, too, because it’s all sort of related.** [Barry Harris Interviews: Today Is the Question - Panken 2013; Interviewer: Ted Panken]</td>
<td>Early influences</td>
<td>Boogie-woogie, shuffle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2</strong> <strong>Panken:</strong> “Oh, you had a felicitous blend of the oral tradition at its most practical plus quality pedagogical education. Harris: And plus, this was the Golden Era of the music. We had Lester Young, we had Coleman Hawkins, we had Ben Webster, we had Charlie Parker, we had all these good musicians. Panken: Now, when you were a teenager, were you listening to all the latest records by each of them and memorizing…Harris: “Yes.** [Barry Harris Interviews: Today Is the Question - Panken 2013; Interviewer: Ted Panken]</td>
<td>Early influences</td>
<td>Oral tradition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3. (continued).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th><strong>Panken</strong>: &quot;When you were listening to Bud Powell and “Webb City,” were you transcribing at that time, or was that more trying to correlate by ear what was happening and put that on the piano. <strong>Harris</strong>: It was by ear. That’s the way you did it. You had to learn by ear. [Barry Harris Interviews: Today Is the Question - Panken 2013; Interviewer Ted Panken]</th>
<th>Early influences</th>
<th>Playing by ear</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td><strong>Harris</strong>: “We had an alto player named “Cokie” who we felt was just as good as Bird (Charlie Parker) almost. We had so many musicians. We had Abe Woodley the vibe player. There were so many musicians…and good musicians too that would “straighten you out” too in a minute.”[Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video: Artists House Master Class Interview with Gary Giddins and Barry Harris]</td>
<td>Early influences</td>
<td>Detroit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td><strong>Harris</strong>: “Well the musicians in Detroit that influenced me. Well you know, I’m what they…they call me …they call me… “The keeper of the bebop flame”…see I’m a “bebopper.” I’m a Charlie Parker, Dizzy Gillespie, Bud Powell, Coleman Hawkins, “Prez” (Lester Young), they(‘re) all beboppers for me. Coleman Hawkins was a “bebopper,” “Prez” was a bebopper—to me…. Most people say they weren’t beboppers but I say they were.”[Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video: Artists House Master Class Interview with Gary Giddins and Barry Harris]</td>
<td>Early influences</td>
<td>Detroit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td><strong>Giddins</strong>: “When you were coming up, where you aware that there was a “Detroit” sound?” <strong>Harris</strong>: “I wasn’t aware of it. I’ve heard people say it. There is similarity. There is a similarity between Tommy’s (Flanagan) sound and Hank ones sound…there’s something with us. We come from Will Davis. All these people could play, so we learn something proper you know—so we learn to play ght. There is a Detroit sound but I try to get away from it.”[Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video: Artists House Master Class Interview with Gary Giddins and Barry Harris]</td>
<td>Early influences</td>
<td>Detroit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td><strong>Harris</strong>: “Now, one of the best things that happened to us in Detroit was that rank Foster came to Detroit. See, Frank Foster taught us… Pepper Adams, Bess yourself, all of the Detroit musicians, we learned a lot from Frank Foster, because rank Foster could really play. Frank Foster really knew a lot. &quot;[Barry Harris Interviews: Today Is the Question - Panken 2013; Interviewer Ted Panken]</td>
<td>Early influences</td>
<td>Detroit</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Harris admitted that he “didn’t start out playing jazz,” but started out playing “boogie-woogie and other things too,” including “shuffle,” and suggested that “it’s all sort of related” (1). When Harris was a teenager, he agreed with interviewer Ted Panken that he learned jazz through the oral tradition by “listening to all the latest records by each of them and memorizing…” (2). Harris also confirmed that “You had to learn by ear."(3). Harris talked nostalgically about his early influences playing jazz in Detroit (4-7). He named several musicians that influenced his musical development at this time, including “Charlie Parker, Abe Woodley, Dizzy Gillespie, Bud Powell, Coleman Hawkins, Lester Young, Tommy
Flanagan, Hank Jones, Will Davis, and Frank Foster. Harris suggested that he was not aware of a distinct “Detroit” sound, and “I try to get away from it.”

Table 4 presents the thematic analysis of the data for the primary theme “Major Influences.”

**Table 4. Major Influences.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Harris: “My mother was a pianist, so I got started through my mother. So, I say that I was closer to her, you know, because of the piano. ”[[Barry Harris Interviews/Smithsonian Jazz Oral History Program NEA Jazz Master interview; Interviewer: Aaron Graves]]</th>
<th>Major influences</th>
<th>Teachers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Harris: “I had different teachers, you know. I had a teacher named Mrs. Lipscomb. Really, but the first teacher for us in Detroit like Harold McKinney and, Dorothy Ashby – our first teacher was a preacher. His name was Neptune Holloway. Had a heck of a name – Neptune Holloway. I remember, maybe in the ’80s, I found out he was in Indianapolis, and I called him, and I said, “do you remember me?” I was – you know – “my mother, Bessie Harris?” or something like that. He didn’t remember, because he was of that age, you know. He taught a lot of us in Detroit. Then Mrs. Lipscomb, and then, um… The one that Tommy and I took from together. We took from Mrs. Dillard, that’s right, Mrs. Dillard. ”[[Barry Harris Interviews/Smithsonian Jazz Oral History Program NEA Jazz Master interview; Interviewer: Aaron Graves]]</td>
<td>Major influences</td>
<td>Teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Interviewer: “I was wondering if you could talk about a meaningful educational experience and someone who you considered at one time to be your mentor?” Harris: “Well you see, I’d have to say my mentors would be… well there were so many good musicians around Detroit. I’d have to say the best of the young would be Kenny Burrell and Tommy Flanagan. But then you start naming the ones no one has ever heard—Abraham Woodley, Will Davis, Phil Hill, Art Mardigan. Art Mardigan was one of the best white drummers, but he was also one of the biggest junkies… but these cats could play man… We had a cat named Cokie, a trumpeter player named Cleorphus Curtis—junkies… but they could play… we were lucky. I had mentors like that. I would go to the dances; I was like one of the dancers and I would lean over and watch Tommy Flanagan play chords and I’d take me a few chords home with me and play them in every key… that’s the way I learned… Will Davis—the same thing. I learned to play from these people. [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Mentors-barry_harris_trk]</td>
<td>Major influences</td>
<td>Teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Harris: I heard Chris Anderson, he was a blind pianist from Chicago. I hung with him and he changed me a little bit.”[[Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Mentors-barry_harris_trk3]]</td>
<td>Major influences</td>
<td>Teachers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4. (continued).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Major influences</th>
<th>Teachers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td><strong>Harris</strong>: &quot;We had a lot of older musicians, and they were good. That’s how we learned. We had older musicians who were good musicians. We had Cokie, we had Warren Hickey, we had Billy Mitchell, we had a whole lot of cats who could play. Thad Jones was around there. Frank Foster was there. I learned more from Frank Foster than anybody. I still have a sheet here… When Frank Foster got ready to go in the Army, I said, “Frank, can you write me out a sheet where I can know how to maybe arrange for a band?” I’ve still got the sheet. I would never part from that little sheet where he told me how to arrange for a band. So there are a lot of things.” [Barry Harris Interviews: Today Is the Question -Panken 2013; Interviewer]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td><strong>Schermer</strong>: &quot;I understand that at age 85, you still take piano lessons! Is that true? <strong>Harris</strong>: Yes, my teacher is Sophia Rosoff. She's 95 years old. She's a classical pianist, and I'm always trying to learn and develop. A real jazz musician practices and learns every day. You never know what you can learn and what you are capable of doing unless you work very hard at it. We have to stay alert. Taking lessons keeps me sharp. [Barry Harris Interviews: Schermer interview with Harris - All About Jazz. Interviewer Victor Schermer]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td><strong>Harris</strong>: “Oh yeah…Louis Jordan and Nat King Cole, they were the majors. See the drag about Nat King Cole was everybody fell in love with the singers. See, all over the world they fell in love with the singers. They didn’t fall in love with the piano playing, which was brilliant. He was a brilliant pianist, you know. So, we had a lot to listen to, you know, you had all them good musicians to listen to.” [Barry Harris Interviews: Smithsonian Jazz Oral History Program NEA Jazz Master interview; Interviewer Aaron Graves]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td><strong>Gilbert</strong>: &quot;Harris experienced the birth of bebop first hand. But he absorbed the idiom directly from Bird. His sound is a combination of Bud Powell’s steeplechase effusions and Monk’s percussive attack and chiaroscuro harmonies.&quot; [Barry Harris Interviews: JAZZ TIMES interview Harris 2011; Interviewer Andrew Gilbert.]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td><strong>Carla and Jason Rupp</strong>: &quot;We’ve read a lot of interviews with you, and there’s been so much written. We know that many people have influenced you. I’m going to give you a chance to mention the people. <strong>Harris</strong>: Well, being a bebopper, of course I’m influenced by Bird, Diz, Bud, and Coleman Hawkins, Prez, also there are a lot I’m influenced by. Then you’re influenced by the unknowns at home. The unknowns are the ones who really make you. They’re the ones that nobody will ever know their names, you know. Then we start talking about oh, I might say influenced by Will Davis, and you might say, &quot;Who the hell is Will Davis?&quot; There was a Will Davis [Chuckle], a piano player. I’m just saying that to say there are a lot of people who influence you. But, you know, you’re influenced by a lot of people.” [Barry Harris Interviews: Carla and Jason Rupp interview Barry. Interviewers Carla and Jason Rupp]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 17 | **Harris**: "But we learned from each other, and we learned from records. See, I’m more a Charlie Parker disciple. Bud Powell is important to me. Charlie Parker became very important to me. Even more so now… Coleman Hawkins was very important to me. I was very lucky; I played with him. That really was a lucky period. I played with Lester Young for a week in Detroit at the Rouge Lounge ["Barry Harris Interviews: Today Is the Question -Panken 2013; Ted Panken."]
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Major influences</th>
<th>Role models</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td><strong>Panken:</strong> &quot;Other than Monk and Bud Powell, who were the pianists who struck you? <strong>Harris:</strong> It’s hard to say. Art Tatum struck everybody!&quot; [Barry Harris Interviews: Today Is the Question - Panken 2013; Interviewer Ted Panken.]</td>
<td>Major influences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td><strong>Harris:</strong> &quot;Art Tatum and everybody. Whereas when we came up, when we became teenagers, we heard Al Haig, Bud Powell, George Shearing.&quot; [Barry Harris Interviews: Today Is the Question - Panken 2013; Interviewer Ted Panken]</td>
<td>Major influences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td><strong>Panken:</strong> (Charlie Parker) was giving you the language that you wanted… <strong>Harris:</strong> Whatever it was, it was the language we wanted to hear at that time. So we learned from it. Sonny Stitt learned from it. All of us learned from it. Sonny Stitt learned from Bird, same thing, and then he became Sonny Stitt. Fortunately, Bird and them were very correct playing people. Correct changes. Correct movements, I’ll say. Because Coleman Hawkins would say, “I play movements; I don’t play chords.” [Barry Harris Interviews: Today Is the Question - Panken 2013; Interviewer Ted Panken]</td>
<td>Major influences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td><strong>Giddins:</strong> &quot;How do you transcend your “influences”?&quot; <strong>Harris:</strong> Well, I tell you. You try to get away from it. You know, you think of the East coast and you think of the West coast and you think of Bud and Monk on the East coast and then you think of some of the cats on the West coast…I don’t know too many. It’s like I want to be more attached to the East than the West. I want to be like Monk. Monk played like (Harris demonstrates with vigour in his voice). that’s the way he played. Most of you are to young so you have never seen Monk in person. To see Monk in person was the deal because Monk would play the theme and then get up and dance. When Charlie Rouse stopped playing, he would be right at the piano and “bam” right in and wouldn’t skip a beat.&quot; [Barry Harris and Contemporaries - Audio and Video: Artists House Master Class Interview with Barry Harris; Interviewer Gary Giddins]</td>
<td>Major influences</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Harris revealed that he was influenced by many teachers. His earliest teacher was his mother, Bessie Harris, who taught him how to play the piano (8). In his early years, Harris received tuition from several music teachers, including Mrs. Lipscomb, Harold McKinney, Dorothy Ashby, Neptune Holloway, and Mrs. Dillard (9). In Detroit, Harris continued to have several mentors, including Kenny Burrell, Tommy Flanagan, Abraham Woodley, Will Davis, Phil Hill, Art Mardigan, and Cleorphus Curtis (10). Other musicians who taught Harris (11-12) included Chris Anderson, a blind pianist from Chicago, and other teachers who were described as “good musicians” including Warren Hickey, Billy Mitchell, Thad Jones, and Frank Foster. Even as a veteran, at the of age 85, Harris revealed that he was still
taking piano lessons. Harris stated that “My teacher is Sophia Rosoff. She's 95 years old” (13).

Harris talked a lot about his role models (14-21). He often listened to Louis Jordan and Nat King Cole. Harris experienced the birth of bebop first hand, absorbing the idiom directly from Charlie Parker (Bird) whose sound he described as a combination of “Bud Powell’s steeplechase effusions and [Thelonious] Monk’s percussive attack and chiaroscuro.” Harris suggested that being a bebopper, he was influenced mainly by Dizzy Gillespie (Diz), Coleman Hawkins, and Lester Young (Prez) as well as unknown musicians “who are the ones who really make you,” especially Will Davis. Other musicians who had an influence on Harris included Art Tatum, Sonny Stitt, Al Haig, and George Shearing.

When asked “How do you transcend your ‘influences?’” Harris replied “You try to get away from it. You know, you think of the East coast and you think of the West coast and you think of Bud and Monk on the East coast and then you think of some of the cats on the West coast…I don’t know too many. It’s like I want to be more attached to the East than the West.”

Harris reported that he played with many peers or bandstand contemporaries (22-24), and suggested that “I've played with many of the greatest musicians and always tried to pick up ideas from them.” His peers included Charles Davis, “who knows about improvisation,” Tommy Flanagan, because “I like to watch his hands;” Coleman Hawkins, who “added a lot to my playing;” as well as Donald Byrd, Sonny Red, Yusef Lateef, Kiane Zawadi, with whom he “jammed all day, man. We had a ball.”

Finally, Harris admitted that his major influences included classical composers (25-27) including Chopin, Bach, and Beethoven. He argued that “we are not only jazz musicians.
We are the continuation of improvisation that has been going on for years – centuries. We are the continuation of classical theory, classical improvisation. We are classical musicians.”

**Part I Section B: “Music as Culture.”**

The purpose of Part 1 section B of this study was to flesh out the practices that Harris participated in that may have acted as missing aggregates in the formation of his concept of movement. Thus, this lens looked for external influences upon Harris’s creative work. These influences were outside of the obvious musical influences that Harris experienced as structure, as described in Part 1 Section A.

Table 5 presents the results of the content analysis of the themes extracted from 80 sources (interviews, narratives, and images) that I collected to examine the antecedents of movement. I argue Harris negotiated these themes as dissonances, meaning that they represented the repercussions of socio-cultural and socio-political circumstances that were seminal to his music’s existence.

**Table 5. Content Analysis of “Music as Culture” for the Antecedents of Movement.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary theme</th>
<th>Sub-themes</th>
<th>Coverage within primary theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number of sources</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baptist church</td>
<td>Mother was a Baptist church pianist</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Harris was a Baptist church piano player</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spirituals</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Blues and ballads</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sanctified rhythms</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detroit and New York</td>
<td>Poor neighbourhood (Detroit)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Drugs (Brooklyn)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Black audience (New York)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>African rhythms</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rhythmic symmetry</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Language of rhythm</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poetics/ Slang</td>
<td>African American slang</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>African American poetics</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Emotional prosody</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 5. (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interrelated arts</th>
<th>Dancing (to hear Charlie Parker)</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>3.8%</th>
<th>24.1%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Playing in dance halls (Detroit)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jazz separated from dancing</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tap dancing</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Shake dancing</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Theatrics (Dancing, singing, and jazz)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Body movement</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpretation of Harris as a religious figure</td>
<td>Jazz according to tradition</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Music is religious’</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>One of the few</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pedagogy</td>
<td>Teaching the basics</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td>16.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sounding like yourself</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Learning bebop</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Music is not chordal but scalar</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Blending chords with melody</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Triplets</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chord progression</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Diminished chords</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Silences</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criticism of new generation of jazz players</td>
<td>Don’t know about movement</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td>7.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Don’t know about scale of chords</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Do not play jazz</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bass should be beside piano player’s left hand</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No dancing to jazz</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Patting on the 2 and 4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criticism of post-secondary jazz education</td>
<td>Harris does not agree with what is taught</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td>10.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Some schools are terrible</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students don’t know the basics</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Harris not liked at Berklee</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students learn songs that don’t have movement</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students don’t have jam sessions</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Can’t play major arpeggios/ diminished chord</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Harris wants meeting with teachers</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>80</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The frequencies of the sources revealed that Harris experienced numerous dissonances when learning to play music as a child in the Baptist church (10.2%) and during his early life in Detroit and New York (8.9%). Subsequently, Harris was strongly influenced by the sensuality generated by African rhythms, rhythmic symmetry, and the language of rhythm (12.6%) as well as the poetics (slang), and emotional prosody used on and off the
bandstand (8.8%). The drama of everyday life was carried over onto the bandstand in the form of interrelated arts, including a combination of theatrics associated with playing jazz, dancing, body movement, and singing (21.4%). The hermeneutical interpretation of Harris as a religious figure was identified by references to him being one of the few who perceived that music has religious connotations, and that jazz should be played according to tradition (5.1%). As an international teacher of music, Harris made an important contribution to pedagogy, by expressing his dissonant views about how jazz should be taught (16.6%). In line with these dissonant views, Harris heavily criticizes the modern generation of jazz players (6.5%) and disagrees with much of what is currently taught in institutions of post-secondary jazz education (10.4%).

Table 6 presents the thematic analysis of the data for the primary theme “Baptist Church”.

### Table 6. Baptist Church.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Primary Theme</th>
<th>Sub-theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Barry Harris born in 1929 made his mark in his home of Detroit long before going to New York. His mother, the pianist at Zion Hill Baptist Church, taught her son to play the piano at age four. Harris later played in church as an adolescent. [Barry Harris Articles/Barry Harris Article 2]</td>
<td>Church music</td>
<td>Mother was a church pianist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Graves: “So the music in the house when you were – you know, your first ten years. The music that you heard, what was some of the music that you heard? Harris: Church music. Nothing but church music. Most of us grew up playing in church, where my mother started me. You began at four and you played church. Most of us were church piano players. We grew up going to church. We grew up playing in church.” [Barry Harris Interviews:Smithsonian Jazz Oral History Program NEA Jazz Master interview]</td>
<td>Church music</td>
<td>Harris was a church piano player</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 6. (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3</th>
<th>Hank Jones: &quot;I think the experiences of playing religious music, especially spirituals had a great deal to shape my perception of what jazz was all about because if you listen carefully in some of the early singers such as Sister Rosetta Thorpe, Sister Rosetta Thorpe—anything she sang could have been transposed into the church and become a “spiritual” but she did it in a night club setting and it became the blues… but it’s the same style.&quot; [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Spirituals and Gospel Hank Jones; Jazz stories]</th>
<th>Church music</th>
<th>Spirituals (Hank Jones)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Hank Jones: I think a lot of the music I played and heard in the church had a bearing on how I interpret the blues today or maybe it might have some bearing on how I compose ballads because some of that is bound to crossover into your present and current thinking. You can’t discard your earlier thinking some of it has to permeate yours and my thinking today—it’s inevitable.&quot; [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Spirituals and Gospel Hank Jones; Jazz stories]</td>
<td>Church music</td>
<td>Blues and ballads (Hank Jones)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Steve Coleman: &quot;What he is referring to is the ability to preach while simultaneously being able to interject very sophisticated melodic voice-leading. This performance by Parker is a clear example, although there are many. The preaching begins right from the outset, complete with exclamations and repeated gestures for emphasis. His musical connects to what Dizzy called Parker’s Sanctified Rhythms.&quot; [Barry Harris Articles/Steve Coleman analysis of Charlie Parker’s Music]</td>
<td>Church music</td>
<td>Sanctified rhythms (Charlie Parker)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Steve Coleman: &quot;there are also the linguistic aspects of Parker’s music and the emotional and spiritual content. In studying the history of how this music was developed. The implications of Parker’s phrasing helped to catalyze the rhythmic responses that eventually would come from players such as Max Roach, Bud Powell, Fats Navarro, etc. [Barry Harris Articles/Steve Coleman analysis of Charlie Parker’s Music]</td>
<td>Church music</td>
<td>Sanctified rhythms (Charlie Parker)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Steve Coleman: &quot;The last eight continues the conversational style established in the first chorus, a strong melodic statement that is answered by one of those &quot;do you know what I mean&quot; or &quot;understand what I'm saying&quot; phrases (2:14). The last closing statement of this chorus sounds like a rhetorical question, which Yard leaves open for the interjections and constant commentary of the musicians to become part of the conversation, just as if in church.&quot; [Barry Harris Articles/Steve Coleman analysis of Charlie Parker’s Music]</td>
<td>Church music</td>
<td>Sanctified rhythms (Charlie Parker)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Gillespie: &quot;I haven't heard that since I left South Carolina what he did with the bass drum, except possibly a little bit in the black. A dancing kind of sound, I suppose. It danced all over the drums. You played the bass drum with your hand, and your knee was up against it, to. So, you had several rhythms going at once.&quot; [Barry Harris Articles/Dizzy Gillespie Interviews on Rhythm and Dancing]</td>
<td>Church music</td>
<td>Sanctified rhythms (Dizzy Gillespie)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This theme emphasized the influences of African Americans in the Baptist church on the development of jazz. Harris’s mother, was a pianist at Zion Hill Baptist Church, and taught her son to play the piano at age four. Harris later played in church as an adolescent (1). Harris stated in an interview that “Most of us grew up playing in church, where my mother started me. You began at four and you played church” (2). Further references to the influence of the church on jazz musicians were obtained from other sources. Hank Jones suggested that “I think the experiences of playing religious music, especially spirituals had a great deal to
shape my perception of what jazz was all about” (3) and “I think a lot of the music I played and heard in the church had a bearing on how I interpret the blues today or maybe it might have some bearing on how I compose ballads (4). Steve Coleman’s analysis of Charlie Parker’s music referred to “the ability to preach while simultaneously being able to interject very sophisticated melodic voice-leading” (5); as well as its “emotional and spiritual content” (6); and “the constant commentary of the musicians to become part of the conversation, just as if in church.” (7). Dizzy Gillespie talked about “A dancing kind of sound, I suppose. It danced all over the drums. You played the bass drum with your hand, and your knee was up against it, to. So, you had several rhythms going at once.” (8). Gillespie referred to this type of sound as “Parker's Sanctified Rhythms” (5).

Table 7 presents the thematic analysis of the data for the primary theme “Detroit and New York.” In various interviews, Harris’s identified his poor neighbourhood, drugs, and black audiences as socio-cultural dissonances. Harris grew up in a poor neighbourhood in Detroit (9-10) where “Most of us were too poor to have instruments of our own” (11). Harris jokingly referred to himself as a “poor son of a gun” (12). Panken suggested that Harris “developed his sagacious, homegrown philosophy and spot-on hip persona in the take-care-of-business atmosphere of post-Depression Detroit” (13). The socio-cultural dissonances associated with living and working in a poor neighbourhood also continued when Harris moved to New York. Randy Weston talked about Brooklyn, where “it was difficult for African Americans to get work and all of a sudden, they decided to put the drugs into the community. And when that decision was made, they gave it to the artists of course because the artists influenced the people” (14). Furthermore, Harris referred to the difficulties of playing in front of Black audiences in New York, where “if you weren’t playing well, you were in trouble” (15).
Table 7. Detroit and New York.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Primary Theme</th>
<th>Sub-theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9  Graves: &quot;What was your neighborhood like? Harris: My neighborhood was poor. Graves: It was a poor neighborhood. Harris: Yeah, very poor.&quot; [Barry Harris Interviews: Smithsonian Jazz Oral History Program NEA Jazz Master interview]</td>
<td>Detroit and New York</td>
<td>Poor neighbourhood (Detroit)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Harris: &quot;I grew up in Detroit in a very poor neighborhood,&quot; he says. “never called it a ghetto, it never was called a slum. It was a poor neighborhood and a mixed poor neighborhood at that.&quot; [Barry Harris Interviews:Jazz Times Interview with Harris]</td>
<td>Detroit and New York</td>
<td>Poor neighbourhood (Detroit)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Harris: &quot;Most of us were too poor to have instruments of our own&quot; [Barry Harris Interviews Today Is the Question -Panken 2013]</td>
<td>Detroit and New York</td>
<td>Drugs (Brooklyn)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Harris: &quot;I was a poor son-of-a-gun! [LAUGHS] I was so poor I just sat on my foot! No, I was very poor in Detroit. Then I had a little daughter. I was the cat who went to the supermarket when they had sales.&quot; [Barry Harris Interviews:Today Is the Question -Panken 2013]</td>
<td>Detroit and New York</td>
<td>Poor neighbourhood (Detroit)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 Panken: &quot;Harris developed his sagacious, homegrown philosophy and spot-on hip persona in the take-care-of-business atmosphere of post-Depression Detroit&quot; [Barry Harris Interviews: Article from downbeat-Panken (2011) originally 2000]</td>
<td>Detroit and New York</td>
<td>Poor neighbourhood (Detroit)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 Randy Weston: “When we came home (African Americans after World War Two), things had not changed. It was difficult for African Americans to get work and all of a sudden, they decided to put the drugs into the community. And when that decision was made, they gave it to the artists of course because the artists influenced the people. And all of a sudden there was this devastation that hit everybody. So everything happened in the African American community—the music, the church—we had our own village. It was an African village in Brooklyn, and everybody would come from every playhouse to see the way we play music, to see the way we danced, to see the way we cooked our food…when the drugs hit, it was a very depressing time.”[Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video Podcast Randy Weston]</td>
<td>Detroit and New York</td>
<td>Drugs (Brooklyn)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 Harris: You didn’t look at the New York Times to see whether you were playing well or not, you had to deal with that Black audience, and if you weren’t playing well, you were in trouble. People were very serious about that music. You could mess around with something else, but be real about that music. [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video:JS_Podcast_Barry_Harris_1_0]</td>
<td>Detroit and New York</td>
<td>Black Audience (New York)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8 presents the thematic analysis of the primary theme “Rhythm.” Five sources referred to the African roots of Harris’s perception of movement, stating “So we had to make music with our hands, our feet, with a bone, but we had to make music because to African people, music is functional—everything is music you see!” (16). Steve Coleman’s analysis of Charlie Parker’s music referred to how “Parker was also someone whose function would be
analogous to the role of a master drummer in traditional West African societies” (17); “many of his phrases contain the same kinds of rhythmic structures found in the phrasing of the master drummers of West Africa” (18); and “The types of rhythms that Parker plays are similar to things that I've heard drummers from the African Diaspora execute (19). Coleman suggested that “By far the most dramatic feature of Bird’s musical language is the rhythmic aspect” (20); and that “the resultant dynamic rhythmic symmetry, are reminiscent of the phrases that tap dancers and drummers use (21). Coleman suggested that the connection between language and rhythm was “like the oral storytelling traditions, but hear the information is encoded in musical symbolism (22).

Table 8. Rhythm.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Primary theme</th>
<th>Sub-theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16  <strong>Harris:</strong> So we had to make music with our hands, our feet, with a bone, but we had to make music because to African people, music is functional—everything is music you see!</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>African</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17  <strong>Steve Coleman:</strong> &quot;Rhythm was something that was constantly stressed in the African American communities; as Dizzy mentions, it was associated with the way and the how something was done&quot;</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>African</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18  <strong>Steve Coleman:</strong> &quot;Parker was also someone whose function would be analogous to the role of a master drummer in traditional West African societies. “</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>African</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19  <strong>Steve Coleman:</strong> &quot;It would be instructive to listen to Bird's spontaneous compositions only for their rhythmic content without regard for the pitches. Then it would be revealed that many of his phrases contain the same kinds of rhythmic structures found in the phrasing of the master drummers of West Africa, with the exception of the pitch conception. An investigation of the starting and ending points of Parker's phrases reveals a kinship to these Sub-Saharan drum masters.&quot;</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>African</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20  <strong>Steve Coleman:</strong> “The types of rhythms that Parker plays at 1:05 are similar to things that I've heard drummers from the African Diaspora execute. If you listen to it purely as rhythm, you can imagine a drummer playing exactly the same kind of phrasing fact, Blakey does play parts of the phrase with Bird, and you can hear Bud stressing the same rhythmic weights, what I call pushing the beat”.</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>African</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 8. (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Steve Coleman: “By far the most dramatic feature of Bird’s musical language is the rhythmic aspect, in particular his phrasing and timing,” [Barry Harris Articles/Steve Coleman analysis of Charlie Parker’s Music]</th>
<th>Rhythm</th>
<th>Rhythmic symmetry</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Steve Coleman: “This approach to balancing rhythmic phrases and the resultant dynamic rhythmic symmetry, are reminiscent of the phrases that tap dancers and drummers use. [Barry Harris Articles/Steve Coleman analysis of Charlie Parker’s Music]</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>Rhythmic symmetry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Steve Coleman: “The expression of rhythms and modes is so precise that repeated detailed listening is like reading an advanced music theory text, only a text that reveals more on each reading, and the words are in motion on top of it! In this sense, it's like the oral storytelling traditions, but hear the information is encoded in musical symbolism. For this reason, I've always felt that this music really was telling stories, on many different levels. [Barry Harris Articles/Steve Coleman analysis of Charlie Parker’s Music]</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>Language of rhythm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Steve Coleman: “Bird seemed to have an intuitive grasp for the connection between musical and non-musical expressions. Parker once mentioned the connection between music and the utterances of various animals to his band mates in the Jay McShann band on a tour through the Ozarks. [Barry Harris Articles/Steve Coleman analysis of Charlie Parker’s Music]</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>Language of rhythm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Steve Coleman: Not a lot has been written about the rhythmic aspects of this language, and for good reason—there are no words and developed descriptive concepts for it in most Western languages. Western music theory has developed primarily in directions that are great for describing the tonal aspects of music, particularly harmony. However, the language to describe rhythm is not very well developed, apart from descriptions of time signatures and other notation-related devices. [Barry Harris Articles/Steve Coleman analysis of Charlie Parker’s Music]</td>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>Language of rhythm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Coleman also suggested that Charlie Parker’s music reflected “the connection between musical and non-musical expressions” (23); and “the connection between music and the utterances of various animals” (24); however, “the language to describe rhythm is not very well developed, apart from descriptions of time signatures and other notation-related devices” (25).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9 presents the thematic analysis of the data for the primary theme “Poetics and Slang.” Further to the language of rhythm, identified by the themes in Table 8, Coleman referred to “the sub-culture of the African-American community of that time, what most people would call slang” (26) as a socio-cultural dissonance. Examples of the slang used by Harris and his contemporaries included “slave,” meaning a job (27-28) and “hittin’ it man” (meaning intense dancing). Coleman also referred to the poetics (i.e., the rhetorical or
affections perspective of the music, which was “the one most stressed in the African-American community” (29). Talking about Charlie Parker, Coleman reported that “His music was full of oblique coded references that could be understood by his colleagues on the bandstand and those musicians in the audience who were privy to this way of communicating” (30). Coleman also talked about “Emotional prosody” referring to the sounds that represent pleasure, surprise, anger, happiness, sadness, etc. (31) and how “Parker's melody right after this exhortation seems to rhythmically answer the woman's voice” (32).

Table 9. Poetics and Slang.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Primary theme</th>
<th>Sub-theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>26 Steve Coleman: “The linguistic structure is based on the sub-culture of</td>
<td>Poetics</td>
<td>African American slang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the African-American community of that time, what most people would call slang. [Barry Harris Articles/Steve Coleman analysis of Charlie Parker’s Music]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27 Roy Haynes: “Lester Young came by to get me and we had to play at the Town Hall and accompany Billy Holliday and I was really into that man… Lester Young says too Roy Haynes, ” if you have eyes the slave is yours stated two years” … See some people don’t know how he meant that or how he spoke… When people go to dances, some are just going to stand around and listen to Bird…but them “other” people? Them other people hittin’ it! They were hittin’ it man” [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Lingo in jazz. Roy Haynes]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28 Roy Haynes: A lot of the black musicians, they started the lingo that’s still is around now that is used on TV… A lot of the lingo came from the “musician” ….” Heaven Eyes” …you say that to someone you like… say it to anyone else, they don’t know what the hell you are talking about. A job was a “slave.”” [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Lingo in jazz. Roy Haynes]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29 Steve Coleman: &quot;My analysis here comes mostly from a rhetorical and affections perspective which deals with the poetics of the music. This perspective is the one most stressed in the African-American community.”[Barry Harris Articles/Steve Coleman analysis of Charlie Parker’s Music]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 Steve Coleman: His music was full of oblique coded references that could be understood by his colleagues on the bandstand and those musicians in the audience who were privy to this way of communicating”[Barry Harris Articles/Steve Coleman analysis of Charlie Parker’s Music]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31 Steve Coleman: There is little doubt that emotional prosody (sounds that represent pleasure, surprise, anger, happiness, sadness, etc.) predated the modern concept of languages. In any case, there is plenty of precedent for the exclusive use of tones as language.”[Barry Harris Articles/Steve Coleman analysis of Charlie Parker’s Music]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32 Steve Coleman: &quot;Parker's melody right after this exhortation seems to rhythmically answer the woman's voice. [Barry Harris Articles/Steve Coleman analysis of Charlie Parker’s Music]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 10 presents the thematic analysis of the data for the primary theme “Interrelated Arts” referring to a combination of theatrics associated with playing jazz, dancing, singing, and body movement.

**Table 10. Interrelated Arts.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Primary theme</th>
<th>Sub-theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>33 Harris: &quot;When we went to hear Charlie Parker we went to a dance hall. When we went to hear one of the big bands we went to a dance hall. When we went to hear Stan Kenton, we went to a dance hall—people danced to the music. When you hear Duke Ellington you go to the dance hall, Count Basie—dance hall, Charlie Parker—dance hall, Dizzy Gillespie—dance hall. See we DANCED to the music!&quot; [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Feeling]</td>
<td>Interrelated Arts</td>
<td>Dancing (to hear Charlie Parker)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34 Harris: “We went to hear Charlie Parker and people like that at dances, when we were teenagers. We didn’t go to clubs to hear that; we went to dances. We went to a dance to hear jazz, you know. You didn’t go to a club to hear jazz. That might have happened – that happened later. I – one of the last times I heard Bird was at a club. But before that I heard him at the Mirror Ballroom, the Greystone Ballroom, the Grand Ballroom. [Barry Harris Interviews/Smithsonian Jazz Oral History Program NEA Jazz Master interview]</td>
<td>Interrelated Arts</td>
<td>Dancing (to hear Charlie Parker)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 Harris: We went to go see Bird at dances, we did NOT go to see Bird at concerts. We didn’t go to concerts man; we went to dances. [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video JS Podcast Harris Higgins Podcast_1_2]</td>
<td>Interrelated Arts</td>
<td>Dancing (to hear Charlie Parker)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36 Harris: &quot;When we played a little gig, it was at the little dance place—so all our friends came to that gig because they liked to dance. [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/triplets needed in jazz-barry_harris_trk2]</td>
<td>Interrelated Arts</td>
<td>Playing in dance halls (Detroit)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37 Harris: &quot;See, the music came out of the ballrooms. It came out of the dance halls. It didn’t come out of bars, it came out of dance halls. It probably came out of bars too but people danced to jazz. See in Detroit, if you played fast they (the dancers) they cut the time. If you played slow they doubled the time. Most people don’t know about cutting the time or doubling the time…they don’t know about that. But the dancers didn’t stop no matter what you played or how fast you played. The dancers did not stop dancing. They danced! [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Artists House Master Class Interview with Barry Harris. Interviewer: Gary Giddins.]</td>
<td>Interrelated Arts</td>
<td>Playing in dance halls (Detroit)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 10. (continued)

<p>| 38 | <strong>Harris</strong>: Another funny thing…let me tell you something… the dancers in Detroit…I’m going to tell you. You know what, if the drummer turned the beat around, they stopped dancing. They say, “what’s wrong with that drummer?” Now the drummer could not get away. <strong>Billy Higgins</strong>: You couldn’t get away with nothing) no you couldn’t get away…You would NOT get away with messing up the beat like we do sometimes like we do in these clubs when the beat turns around…NO SIR! you couldn’t get away with that with those dancers, they stop you in a minute. | Interrelated Arts | Playing in dance halls (Detroit) |
| 39 | <strong>Harris</strong>: “That’s the only way I learned about jazz—was dancing. I know a lot of you never heard of dancing to jazz”. | Interrelated Arts | Playing in dance halls (Detroit) |
| 40 | <strong>Harris</strong>: Probably the biggest drag is that we disassociated jazz from dancing. We should never have done that. See, people dance to jazz, you know. And um, that’s how people can relate to – you know people also | Interrelated Arts | Jazz separated from dancing |
| 41 | <strong>Harris</strong>: You see I think one of our biggest mistakes as far as jazz is that we separated it from dance… we shouldn’t have never have done that. You see that way we stay with the people. Otherwise people have to come and sit and listen and that’s sorta’ funny to just sit and listen” | Interrelated Arts | Jazz separated from dancing |
| 42 | <strong>Giddins</strong>: Was that distracting or inspiring? <strong>Harris</strong>: No, it wasn’t distracting…I think it was sort of inspiring! Really our biggest mistake was taking jazz away from dance. Because dancing is where people come in. Not the people who know how to play the instruments but people come in, and then there are certain songs…you see most people knew songs. | Interrelated Arts | Jazz separated from dancing |
| 43 | <strong>Harris</strong>: &quot;The tap dancers, you know what they do? They be tapping and they don’t know songs... See you got to know Jimmy Slyde (famous swing and bebop tap dancer) or someone like that. Like I couldn’t even play a song without him (Jimmy Slyde) knowing it. He tapped to the music. The best tap dancers tapped to the songs. These cats don’t know songs…they know esoteric, or whatever kind of stuff you call it (Harris starts to mimic the new generation of tap dancers with his body). They be tapping (loud) and all of a sudden everybody goes crazy in the joint… it’s all messed up... All I do is try to correct it.” | Interrelated Arts | Tap dancing |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Quote</th>
<th>Context</th>
<th>Interrelated Arts</th>
<th>Body movement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td><strong>Harris:</strong> I really do think about that sometime when I’m playing the piano—I think that I’m a tap dancer and so my fingers are the things (feet tap dancing) and I try to play the piano like that—I try to syncopate like that…. Dancing is part of the music! Dancing is jazz!!”[Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video JS Podcast Harris_Higgins_Podcast_1_2]</td>
<td></td>
<td>Interrelated Arts</td>
<td>Body movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td><strong>Harris:</strong> They play fast (the musicians) but you know, the “shake dancers” shake fast. We played for everything. I used to tell my class about “baby scrubs” (shake dancer). Boy if you had seen “Baby Scrubs,” she was fine and you know what she would do? She would come out on the stage with this cape on and say “play ‘Cherokee’ as fast as you can play it.” and boy you start playing “Cherokee” as fast as you can play it, and boy you’ve never seen anything like this in your life. One tassel at a time…right side…left side…tassels in the back. And then maybe…almost like she could make them move in opposite directions and stuff. She had tassels on her front and had tassels on her back…these tassels were the most beautiful things in the world. The shake dancers were something to see!</td>
<td></td>
<td>Interrelated Arts</td>
<td>Shake dancing and sexuality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td><strong>Billy Higgins:</strong> “You see, we had to play with all these people. How do you think we started out playing? — “shuffle” rhythm (Harris sings a walking bass line ascending in the formation of a dominant chord) …we played with shows, cause most of the places where you played, they had to have a singer, they had to have a shake dancer, that’s the way we grew up….so everyplace had shows. You went to see a show—Pearl Bailey— the first time I saw Pearl Bailey was in the show at the Paradise theatre…and she was a fine woman…fine… <strong>Barry Harris:</strong> Then there was a lady called “Little Mrs. Cornshucks.”” [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video Artists House Master Class Interview with Barry Harris, Interviewer: Gary Giddins]</td>
<td></td>
<td>Interrelated Arts</td>
<td>Shake dancing and sexuality</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 10. (continued).

| 47 | **Harris**: So you know the dancers and all that stuff (theatrics and sensuality/sexuality) is part of the music. **Billy Higgins**: It was a thing at one time where ALL of the arts were combined. You understand what I’m saying? All of the arts were combined—it was dance, it was singing, it was like—it wasn’t something that was like one thing was just set on the side and with the same level! See…the dance went with Bird and them, they had a dance when we went there. | Interrelated Arts | Theatrics (Dancing, singing, and jazz) |

**Image 3.** Barry Harris Concert poster from 1982 featuring dancers.

**Image 4.** Barry Harris concert poster from 1996 featuring dancers.
Table 10. (continued).

|   | Gillespie: "Showmanship has always been a part of your performance. Obviously, you were exposed to it right away. All my life, yeah—from the beginning. And I've always been a dancer myself. I dance very well, with or without a partner. I can dance all kinds, to—Afro Cuban, Samba; if necessary, I can do the St. Bernard waltz—I learned that in 1937. Then the Lindy Hop—I'm an expert at that. I was a member of the 400 Club in the Savoy Ballroom. That was a club for dancers; I was the only musician who belonged to it. Members could get in the Savoy free. Tuesday night was exhibition night. I'd play one set with Teddy Hill's band, and dance the next set with the Savoy Sultans. I'd be tired sometimes.[Barry harris articles/Dizzy Gillespie interviews on rhythm and dancing] |
|---|---|---|---|
|   | Harris: "Lester Young—the way he would count the tempos with his shoulders, that was a knockout. All he would do is move his shoulder like that [Harris demonstrates by shrugging his shoulders up and down] and that would be the tempo."[Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry Harris- Jazz Master, Educator, Saint] |
|   | Interrelated Arts | Theatrics (Dancing, singing, and jazz) |

At several interviews, Harris talked about his teenage years, going to hear Charlie Parker and contemporary musicians; however, he did not just go to hear, reflected by “When we went to hear Charlie Parker we went to a dance hall… see we danced to the music (33); “We went to a dance to hear jazz, you know” (34) and “We went to go see Bird at dances, we did NOT go to see Bird at concerts” (35). Later, when he started playing gigs in Detroit, Harris played “at the little dance place” (36). “The music came out of the ballrooms. It came out of the dancehalls. It didn’t come out of bars, it came out of dancehalls” (37). Harris also referred to how the dancers complained if the “drummer turned the beat around, they stopped dancing” (38) and confirmed by Billy Higgins stating “NO SIR! you couldn’t get away with that with those dancers, they stop you in a minute” (39).

Although Harris asserted that “That’s the only way I learned about jazz—was dancing” (39) he also suggested ironically that “Probably the biggest drag is that we disassociated jazz from dancing” (40). He stated that “You see I think one of our biggest mistakes as far as jazz is that we separated it from dance… we shouldn’t have never have
done that… Otherwise people have to come and sit and listen and that’s sorta funny to just sit and listen” (41). Harris suggested that “I think it was sort of inspiring! Because dancing is where people come in (42). Harris talked about the association between jazz and tap dancing (43). He referred to how “the best tap dancers tapped to the songs” including Jimmy Slyde (swing and bebop tap dancer). This is a contradiction to past literature that claimed “bebop was not danceable” (Starr 2011). Harris also suggested that “When I’m playing the piano—I think that I’m a tap dancer and so my fingers are the things (feet tap dancing) and I try to play the piano like that—I try to syncopate like that… Dancing is part of the music! Dancing is jazz!” (44). Harris and his contemporaries playing jazz on the bandstand were accompanied by female singers and shake dancers, confirmed by Billy Higgins stating that “we played with shows, cause most of the places where you played, they had to have a singer, they had to have a shake dancer, that’s the way we grew up” (46). Harris extolled a shake dancer called Baby Scrubs, exclaiming “She would come out on the stage with this cape on and say “play ‘Cherokee’ as fast as you can play it.” and boy you start playing “Cherokee” as fast as you can play it, and boy you’ve never seen anything like this in your life” (45). This is an example of a female dancing in a somewhat sexual manner to an up-tempo bebop composition, and also contradicts what past literature has claimed of bebop not being danceable.

Harris and his contemporaries talked about the theatrics associated with playing jazz, dancing, body movement, and singing. Harris argued that “So you know the tap dancers and all that stuff (theatrics and sensuality/ sexuality) is part of the music.” Billy Higgins confirmed that “It was a thing at one time where ALL of the arts were combined. You understand what I’m saying? All of the arts were combined” (47). When Dizzy Gillespie conducted his band, he was also dancing and singing, stating “Showmanship has always been
a part of your performance” (48). Body movement was also part of the performance, as exemplified by Harris describing Lester Young who “would count the tempos with his shoulders, that was a knockout.” (49).

Table 11 presents a thematic analysis of the data for the primary theme “Interpretation of Harris as a Religious Figure.” In this respect, Harris was very assertive about how, when playing in a jazz club “its going to be jazz. It’s going to be jazz according to tradition” and that “this is going to be a jazz house—bebop—because I starve to pay the rent here and I’m not going to tolerate one thing in here I don’t dig.” Harris clearly has a religious attitude towards jazz, stating that “I can tell where it all came from. It’s all religious; see everything is from religion” (51) and that “The more you find out about music, the more you believe in God” (52). Harris also talked about the writer James Weldon Johnson, who wrote the Negro national anthem, “Lift Every Voice and Sing” and “The Creation.” that “turned me onto how the music started and how everything does this” (51). Religion was the basis of Harris’s assertion that “I think by knowing that the music is not chordal, but scalar, changes the whole thing” and why in his workshops, Harris teaches the creation of diminished 7th chords and other chords as being the product of “man and woman”—the two whole tone scales. Both these whole tone scales are derived from the “Universe”—the chromatic scale (52). The interpretation of Harris as a sacred figure also comes from his assertion that “I’d rather be one of the few than one of the many… you see… That’s my philosophy. If I was suddenly to become popular, I would think something was wrong with me… then I would have to change my style because I would know something is wrong (53).
Table 11. Interpretation of Harris as a Religious Figure.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Primary theme</th>
<th>Sub-theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>50</strong> Harris: &quot;you people cannot play if you are going to call this music, (slamming his hand on a table in disgust) I’m going to insist it’s not jazz… Its going to be jazz. It’s going to be jazz according to tradition… that’s what it’s going to be… other places… there are a lot of places for you to go play that kind of music—you go to those places— (Harris furious and animated now raising his voice) this is going to be a jazz house—bebop—because I starve to pay the rent here and I’m not going to tolerate one thing in here I don’t dig.” [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry Harris profile - 1985; Position: 2 - 2. Weight score: 90]</td>
<td>Religious figure</td>
<td>Jazz according to tradition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>51</strong> Harris: “See, I can tell where it all came from. It’s all religious, see everything is from religion. There was a writer named James Weldon Johnson, he wrote the Negro national anthem, Lift Every Voice and Sing. And he, let me tell you this, he wrote a thing called The Creation, and that turned me onto how the music started and how everything does this. Everything is in order, everything is order. The two whole tone scales are man and woman… they go to bed and make babies—so the whole tone scale make 3 diminished 7ths (the holy trinity)… that’s the way it is. Then proved that the diminished 7ths came from the 2 whole tone scales. Y [Barry Harris Interviews/Smithsonian Jazz Oral History Program NEA Jazz Master interview]</td>
<td>Religious figure</td>
<td>Music is religious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>52</strong> Harris: “The more you find out about music, the more you believe in God, too. This isn’t haphazardly put together. This stuff is exact. It’s a science, and part of the music is science. But we think there’s something above the science part; there’s something above the logic. There’s a freedom at both ends of the barrel, man. There’s a freedom in anarchy, but there’s another freedom that comes from knowledge, then there’s another freedom that comes that really is the freedom we seek. That’s what all of us want, is this freedom. I think by knowing that the music is not chordal, but scalar, changes the whole thing.” [Barry Harris Interviews/Article from downbeat-Panken (2011) originally 2000]</td>
<td>Religious figure</td>
<td>Music is religious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>53</strong> Harris: I’d rather be one of the few than one of the many…you see…That’s my philosophy. If I was suddenly to become popular, I would think something was wrong with me…then I would have to change my style because I would know something is wrong. [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry talking about small chords versus big chords]</td>
<td>Religious figure</td>
<td>One of the few</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Part 1 Section C: Teaching of Jazz

Table 12 presents a thematic analysis of the data for the primary theme “Pedagogy” based on Harris’s experiences as an international music teacher.
Table 12. Pedagogy.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Primary theme</th>
<th>Sub-theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>54</strong> Harris: ”To teach improvisation, to teach a person how to play, you have to know all the basic stuff. “Basics”—the things you hate the most—triads, arpeggios. All that stuff that you hate—playing the major scale. But you got to know that stuff in order to create.” [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry Harris' speech in Almeria - Spain]</td>
<td>Pedagogy</td>
<td>Teaching the basics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>55</strong> Harris: ”See the way I teach, you aren’t supposed to come out sounding like me, you’re really supposed to come out sounding like yourself because I teach in such a way that there is a all kind of room for you to sound like yourself. [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/triplets needed in jazz- barry_harris_trk2]</td>
<td>Pedagogy</td>
<td>Sounding like yourself</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>56</strong> George Coleman: [advice to students].” Learn the bebop…that’s what I want to first tell them…learn the bebop…because if you learn how to play bebop, you can play anything after that. Because those guys that were playing bebop—they could play everything. Lee Morgan he’d play classic … you know… If you can play bebop you can play anything as far as jazz is concerned… You don’t want to start out saying “I want to do my own thing and I want to be ‘free’ and I want to play the free jazz” … First of all, you need to get a good sound and learn the harmony [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/George Coleman advice]</td>
<td>Pedagogy</td>
<td>Learning bebop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>57</strong> Harris: “There are 4 scales you should know and you should really know them because nobody else is going to tell you…because they don’t know… and you should play them like you know… You see when you learn the scale of chords, your instrument becomes connected all up. It’s not a ‘chord’ then ‘chord.’” [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry Harris' speech in Almeria - Spain]</td>
<td>Pedagogy</td>
<td>Music is not chordal but scalar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>58</strong> Harris: “I proved that the diminished 7ths came from the 2 whole tone scales. You realize that 2 notes belong to one whole tone scale and two notes belong to the other. So you realize the DNA is perfect (each tritone within the diminished seventh chord are derived from both whole tone scales… the “DNA”). [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry Harris' speech in Almeria - Spain]</td>
<td>Pedagogy</td>
<td>Music is not chordal but scalar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>59</strong> I’ve told you what a diminished scale was, I’ve told you stuff you’ve never known before and you don’t believe in me…you got to believe in somebody…you’ve got to believe …it’s hard people don’t believe you can show them different stuff and they still don’t believe—now you know that aint right! You’re supposed to believe not because I’m telling you, but because it’s right!&quot;[Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry Harris' speech in Almeria - Spain]</td>
<td>Pedagogy</td>
<td>Music is not chordal but scalar</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 12. (continued).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>60</th>
<th><strong>Harris:</strong> &quot;There’s a cat that wrote in to downbeat I’ll never forget this... he said “I’m tired of playing the major scale.” Now you know he’s an idiot. If he thinks for one minute that he’s played all the ways to play the major scale, he’s a stupid fool... there’s too many ways... Drummers you supposed to know about syncopation. you’re supposed to know about the “ands”... piano players don’t know how to chord on the “and” of the 4... they always chord on the “one”... most of them... what you supposed to know is the “6” (Harris demonstrates counting quarter note triplets against a student counting out in 4/4 time) ... you gotta know that ... as a drummer you gotta know the “6.” I’ll tell you that’s the difference between a cat like Sonny Stitt and “Bird” (Charlie Parker). Bird knew the “6,” I could tell it by his ballads. Sonny Stitt didn’t know the “6.” You see, he could fool you—make you think of Bird when he played fast, but when he played a ballad, forget about it... he didn’t have the feeling... he didn’t know that “6.” So as you’re playing you should be thinking “6” over 4/4.&quot; [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry Harris’ speech in Almeria – Spain]</th>
<th><strong>Pedagogy</strong></th>
<th><strong>Music is not chordal but scalar</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>61</td>
<td><strong>Harris:</strong> (Harris asks a student what his favorite composition he likes to play and the student responds “There Will Never Be Another You”) I tell yeah... I’ve watched piano players they always say...(Harris demonstrates by playing only one note in the left hand for the melody)... but then I listen to Bud Powell and he said (Harris demonstrates by playing two handed chords with the melody)...see he played chords (not a single line melody)!...See, I’d make you play a chord for each thing (melody note)... <strong>Harris:</strong> (after demonstrating how Bud Powell played “There Will Never Be another You)...just with little moves. Just with little moves... you got to know all the “moves.” (Harris congratulates the student for stating that at bar 12 the chordal harmonies should be G7/B moving to Cm.&quot; [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry Harris’ speech in Almeria – Spain]</td>
<td><strong>Pedagogy</strong></td>
<td><strong>Blending chords with melody</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62</td>
<td><strong>Harris:</strong> &quot;There should be nobody here who plays one note melodies with his right hand. Your chords must be blended in together with the melody. You know, really the way I learned about it, I'll tell yah...I was teaching a class and there was a lady almost as old as me. She played a song one day and then I suddenly saw &quot;this is the way we're supposed to it.&quot; It's a blend of the hands together—chords with melody. Art Tatum did not play that left hand up this high (demonstrates on the piano) all the time...he did not do it. Bud Powell didn’t do it—Monk didn’t do it. Dave Brubeck didn’t do it—a lot of people didn’t do it. Al Haig didn’t do—a lot of people didn’t do it. The only person(s) I know who did it was Erroll Garner—Red Garland...Now why should that be the rule of the world today?...I don’t know...Every piano player...every piano player... and it’s not right...you people are supposed to know...I'm playing some little old small stuff, you're supposed to rip this off if you know all those “big chords,” all the small chords are in your hand already...now why can’t you just rip this stuff off? You can’t because you don’t even know the “little things.” So we have to learn the little things. You have to learn how to play a '6' chord. Most important, a '6' chord for a Major chord. Just to say (Harris demonstrates by playing G13(b9) resolving to C6...Harris starts to sing “We’ll Be Together Again”—showing how the pickup chord to the song and the first chord of the song can be played as a dominant 13(b9) resolving to a Major6 chord.&quot;  [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video]</td>
<td>Pedagogy</td>
<td>Blending chords with melody</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63</td>
<td><strong>Interviewer:</strong> I’ve heard people talk about the triplet thing in that it makes the music “roll” forward, and that’s an important aspect of the triplets. Is that what you are thinking about or not so much? <strong>Harris:</strong> Not so much when you are descending (on a musical phrase), you just throw these things in. What they will do—it will make you have to make changes. See if you play straight eighth notes and throw a triplet in, it changes the thing (the rhythmical output of the phrase) of those eighth notes sometimes. I think that it’s important for people to throw these things in. <strong>Interviewer:</strong> So it’s a tool to make you do variations. <strong>Harris:</strong> yes, it’s a tool to make you do variations—right!&quot;  [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video]</td>
<td>Pedagogy</td>
<td>Triplets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64</td>
<td><strong>Interviewer:</strong> “So regarding that triplet thing, is that a sound that you like to hear that’s missing or is it a style or is it something that has an effect on the music? <strong>Harris:</strong> I think it has an effect on the music. I think it is very important for us to bring it back in...you know...very important. See with the eighth notes. Well, I guess they could do the same thing with the triplets—they run continuously. They don’t leave in the silences...or I should say, they leave silence as silence and they shouldn’t. It’s like us talking—we pause, we breathe.  [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video]</td>
<td>Pedagogy</td>
<td>Triplets</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Harris asserted that “To teach improvisation, to teach a person how to play, you have to know all the basic stuff. “Basics”—the things you hate the most—triads, arpeggios. All that stuff that you hate—playing the major scale. But you got to know that stuff in order to create.” (54). He also asserted that “You aren’t supposed to come out sounding like me, you’re really supposed to come out sounding like yourself because I teach in such a way that there is an all kind of room for you to sound like yourself” (55).

Similar to Harris’ advice for learning jazz, saxophonist George Coleman advised students to “Learn the bebop… that’s what I want to first tell them… learn the bebop… because if you learn how to play bebop, you can play anything after that … You don’t want to start out saying “I want to do my own thing and I want to be ‘free’ and I want to play the free jazz” … First of all, you need to get a good sound and learn the harmony (56).
Harris’s teaching of movement emphasized how music is not chordal but scalar. He argued that “There are four scales you should know and you should really know them because nobody else is going to tell you…because they don’t know… and you should play them like you know…. You see when you learn the scale of chords, your instrument becomes connected all up” (57). He taught that “the diminished 7ths came from the two whole tone scales;” that “notes belong to one whole tone scale and two notes belong to the other” and that “the DNA is perfect” because each tritone within the diminished 7th chord are derived from both whole tone scales (58). Harris taught about the diminished scale, and that “You’re supposed to believe not because I’m telling you, but because it’s right!” (59). Harris taught students to play a musical progression using a scale of chords that is derived from his bebop scales—the Major 6 bebop scale, the Minor 6 bebop scale, the dominant 7 bebop scale and the dominant 7b5 bebop scale (60).

Harris taught students how to blend chords with melody, demonstrating by playing two handed chords with a melody (61). He asserted that “there should be nobody here who plays one note melodies with his right hand. Your chords must be blended in together with the melody” (62).

Harris also taught about playing straight eighth notes and throwing a triplet in, to change the rhythmical output of the phrase of the eighth notes, because “I think that it’s important for people to throw these things in” and “It’s a tool to make you do variations” (63). Harris taught that “I think it has an effect on the music. I think it is very important for us to bring it back in… you know… very important. See with the eighth notes… well, I guess they could do the same thing with the triplets—they run continuously. They don’t leave in the silences… or I should say, they leave silence as ‘silence’ and they shouldn’t. It’s like us talking—we pause, we breathe” (64).
When teaching chord progression, Harris refers to how, in measure 30 of “All the Things You Are,” the Db minor is really acting as an Eb7b9 sus4 which then resolves to Ab/C. If a student plays C minor 9, and puts a D natural in there then “that’s wrong!” (65).

On the topic of half diminished chords, Harris taught that “Monk would never have called it a half diminished… and he would have never have called it a minor7 with the b5; he called it a minor with the ‘6’ in the bass… because you find a minor IV goes to V and then to I, it’s not II to V… it’s the minor IV… just like D minor7 is really F Major 6—Major IV to V to I (66).

Table 13 presents the thematic analysis of the data for the primary theme “Criticism of New Generation of Jazz Players.”

**Table 13. Criticism of New Generation of Jazz Players.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Primary theme</th>
<th>Sub-theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>67</strong> Harris: These cats don’t know about movement man—these cats now days just play a lot of notes. They get loud and everybody claps (Harris begins to mimic with his voice the squealing sounds of the new generation of saxophone players and then makes fun of the audience clapping to it). It’s the dumbest thing I’ve ever seen in my life and I know it happened last night. The cats played and then they get loud and then everybody claps.”[Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry Harris’ speech in Almeria - Spain]</td>
<td>Criticism of new generation of jazz players</td>
<td>Don’t’ know about movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>68</strong> Harris: “You listen to those other guitar players and you see if you can find one of them that sounds like he knows about the scale of chords…try to find one….I’m telling you they don’t know… [Harris plays up the Major 6 bebop scale in chords—the tonic functioning Major 6 and the dominant functioning chord….next Harris starts to play a dominant chord with alterations and begins to “move” it]….He (jazz musicians) doesn’t know that man…he doesn’t know that….YOU HAVE TO KNOW !! [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry Harris' speech in Almeria - Spain]</td>
<td>Criticism of new generation of jazz players</td>
<td>Do not know about scale of chords</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>69</strong> Harris: ” They think Miles Davis, John Coltrane, Wayne Shorter and Herbie Hancock—they think that’s “jazz.” I don’t quite agree with that at all… I don’t consider it jazz… so I know a lot of people at your festival will be playing like that, they played like that last night (jam session).”[Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry Harris' speech in Almeria - Spain]</td>
<td>Criticism of new generation of jazz players</td>
<td>Do not play jazz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Paragraph</td>
<td>Criticism of new generation of jazz musicians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70</td>
<td>Harris: &quot;See jazz musicians have been getting away with murder—they ain’t got no people dancing to the music - they do just anything they want to do and you couldn’t dance to it if you wanted to… then they go “out” on you “Avant-garde” … you all better realize right now we are in the “dark ages.” The golden age passed, it’s time for a renaissance.” [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Feeling]</td>
<td>Criticism of new generation of jazz musicians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71</td>
<td>Harris starts to pat his foot on beats 1 and 3 while singing “Rhythm-A-Ning”) ….one …three…one…three…cats don’t do that no more… Harris: “I say, now where in the hell did they come up with that? I had never saw anybody pat on ’2’ and ‘4’ when I was a kid….’2’ and ‘4’ is in your “heart” (Harris referring to the pulse of the music that is within the body) and all of a sudden, you are going to want to put ‘2’ and ‘4’ down there on the ground near the hell…hell is down there…the devil….’2’ and ‘4’ is up there near the ether….God…. see we don’t even pat the foot right! I watched one of the most… he is supposed to be the most famous (jazz) musician—but I won’t mention his name and he is patting on the ‘2’ and the ‘4’ so I know he ‘aint right…. and he’s the most famous…”[Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry Harris’ speech in Almeria - Spain]</td>
<td>Patting on the 1 and 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72</td>
<td>Harris: “The bass should be right here beside the piano player’s left hand. That’s where it was all through history—all through music—you’ll find that the bass player was beside the piano player’s left hand because the piano player knows about movement—how to go from one place to another. They don’t know…sometimes they play a II-V... they don’t know if it’s a D minor7 or a D minor7b5… how they gonna know…they don’t know man… see Monk would say, “play the minor with the 6 in the bass….First chord in “Round Midnight.” Now, I said… the way I learned it was minor7b5. The way you learned it is “half diminished.” But Monk would say “A minor with the 6 in the bass” and that’s all it took…and there’s “Round Midnight” right there….that means you could play any C minor notes and play a 6th in the bass and you have a half diminished….see the bass players don’t know man… get outta here…. they don’t know (Harris looking very disgusted). You have to play the Major [Harris means a Major triad a tritone away—voice leading down to the minor7b5] … certain things lead to certain things…How would i get to A half diminished? [Harris demonstrates by first playing Eb major then D diminished 7th then C minor then B diminished 7th and finally A minor7b5]. You think the bass players know that stuff? Nah man get outta here [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video/Barry Harris’ speech in Almeria - Spain]</td>
<td>Criticism of new generation of jazz players</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Harris is very critical of the new generation of jazz players. He argues that “These cats don’t know about movement man—these cats now days just play a lot of notes” and that “It’s the dumbest thing I’ve ever seen in my life” (67). Harris asserts that “You listen to those other guitar players and you see if you can find one of them that sounds like he knows about the scale of chords… try to find one… I’m telling you they don’t know…” (68). Harris complains that “They think Miles Davis, John Coltrane, Wayne Shorter and Herbie
Hancock—they think that’s “jazz.” I don’t quite agree with that at all... I don’t consider it jazz... “(69). Harris suggested that “Jazz musicians have been getting away with murder-they ain’t got no people dancing to the music—they do just anything they want to do and you couldn’t dance to it if you wanted to... then they go ‘out’ on you avant-garde ... you all better realize right now we are in the dark ages. The golden age passed, it’s time for a renaissance.” (70). Harris complained about “the most famous (jazz) musician—but I won’t mention his name” who is “patting on the ‘2’ and the ‘4’ so I know he aint right” because “I say, now where in the hell did they come up with that? I had never saw anybody pat on ‘2’ and ‘4’ when I was a kid” (71).

Table 14 presents the thematic analysis of the data for the primary theme “Criticism of Post-Secondary Jazz Education.” In addition to being very critical of the new generation of jazz players, Harris is also very critical of jazz education. Harris does not like what is currently taught because “I don’t agree with what the music is” (73). He suggests that “Some of the schools are terrible” (74). He complains that the students do not learn the basics, stating, “If the people don’t know the ABC’s of the music, then how are they going to learn the music?” (75). Harris explained why the teachers at Berklee don’t like him “… because I go and mess them up. The students be talking ‘why didn’t they teach us this?’ … I’ve had people come to me who’ve graduated from Berklee and they say ‘dammn... we never learned this in Berklee?’ Never!” (76). He also talked about his experience at the University of Michigan where he demonstrates on the piano a Db13 chord voiced as Eb/ Db7) but “the graduating piano class had never played this chord in their lives.” He also complains that “all they (bass players) know is tonics, you think they know about movement and how to go? ... get out of here man, they don’t know that” (76).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Primary theme</th>
<th>Sub-theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>73</strong> <strong>Harris:</strong> &quot;I prefer teaching… just to teach people…you get them away from what the music has become…I don’t agree with what the music is… so I teach everywhere…” [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video; Barry Harris’ speech in Almeria - Spain]</td>
<td>Criticism of education</td>
<td>Harris does not agree with what is taught</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>74</strong> <strong>Harris:</strong> Some of the schools are terrible. See, that’s why I don’t go back to these schools that often, because once I go, the kids know. [Barry Harris Interviews; Today is the Question - Panken 2013. Interviewer: Ted Panken.]</td>
<td>Criticism of education</td>
<td>Some schools are terrible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>75</strong> <strong>Harris:</strong> I mean, if the people don’t know the ABC’s of the music, then how are they going to learn the music? We’d be funny walking around here not knowing our ABC’s. It would be a funny thing. You have to know the ABC’s of the music, and a lot of people don’t. [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video; Barry Harris’ speech in Almeria - Spain]</td>
<td>Criticism of education</td>
<td>Students don’t know the basics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>76</strong> <strong>Harris:</strong> &quot; The teachers at Berklee don’t like me because—they know why they don’t like me to… because I go and mess them up. The students be talking “why didn’t they teach us this?” … I’ve had people come to me who’ve graduated from Berklee and they say “dammn…we never learned this in Berklee ?!” One girl came to me from Berklee and she graduated to. She could barely play a diminished 7th dig that!… I went to the university of Michigan and the graduating piano class had never played this chord in their lives (Harris demonstrates on the piano a Db13 chord voiced as Eb/Db7) … Never! And I said, how could they play music? Why? because their thinking is that the left hand chord placement shouldn’t be so low on the piano where the bass player plays. (Harris starts to criticize bass players stating that no bass players of the new generation are qualified to have a bass) …. all they (bass players) know is tonicics, you think they know about movement and how to go? Get outta here man…The bass player stands on the left side and that’s where he used to stand and watch the piano players left hand and that’s really the truth. These bass players don’t know anything—they don’t know enough to have a bass. I had a young girl (Harris begins to imitate young girl’s whiny voice) “oh they always playing the bass.” I said “shut your mouth, I’ve played with George Duvivier, I’ve played with Ray Brown, I’ve played with all the bass players and I’ve never had a bass player say “You playin…you playin to low in the bass.” I’ve never had any of them say that…. never… dig that …. NEVER!” [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video; Barry Harris’ speech in Almeria – Spain]</td>
<td>Criticism of education</td>
<td>Harris not liked at Berklee</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 14. (continued).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th><strong>Harris:</strong> “I don’t know if there are too many teachers on the right track…what it takes to be a jazz musician—well it takes “street savvy.” I grew up in the streets of New York, there was no such a thing as a “jazz school.” The only reason why they came up with a jazz school is because they found out they could make money—so now we have all these jazz schools all over the world and what’s so wrong with them is this…When they first started, they didn’t come to the jazz musician and say “what should we teach?” They didn’t do that. They have our young now learning these funny songs that don’t have movement, so young people all over the world aren’t even getting a chance to learn to play.” [Barry Harris Interviews: Article from downbeat-Panken (2011) originally 2000; Interviewer: Ted Panken]</th>
<th>Criticism of education</th>
<th>Students learn songs that don’t have movement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>77</td>
<td><strong>Harris:</strong> Everybody is writing their original stuff mostly nowadays. The reason they’re doing that, of course, is because that’s one way for us to make some money. Record companies aren’t the most trustworthy things in the world, so the only way for you to really make something is to have your original music. But because people are playing their original music, we can’t have the jam session thing too much. Young people nowadays don’t even have a chance to go to a jam session. That’s why when I had my place, I tried to keep a jam session going every Wednesday night, even though it never was anything.”[Barry Harris Interviews: Article from downbeat-Panken (2011) originally 2000; Interviewer: Ted Panken]</td>
<td>Criticism of education</td>
<td>Students don’t have jam sessions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>78</td>
<td><strong>Harris:</strong> I hate to go to a college and find students that can’t even play a major arpeggio, can’t even play a diminished 7th, can’t even play diminished 7ths all over their instrument, or play major arpeggios all over their instruments, all inversions. [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video: Barry Harris’ speech in Almeria - Spain]</td>
<td>Criticism of education</td>
<td>Students can’t play major arpeggios or diminished chords</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>79</td>
<td><strong>Harris:</strong> &quot;I wish that I could have a meeting with the teachers who are supposed to be teaching this music, so we could have a little discussion about how you teach this music.&quot; [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video: Barry Harris’ speech in Almeria - Spain]</td>
<td>Criticism of education</td>
<td>Harris wants meeting with teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80</td>
<td><strong>Harris:</strong> “I wish that I could have a meeting with the teachers who are supposed to be teaching this music, so we could have a little discussion about how you teach this music.” [Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video: Barry Harris’ speech in Almeria - Spain]</td>
<td>Criticism of education</td>
<td>Harris wants meeting with teachers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Harris suggested that “I don’t know if there are too many teachers on the right track” in relation to what it takes to be a jazz musician—stating “well it takes street savvy.” I grew up in the streets of New York, there was no such a thing as a “jazz school.” Harris complained that “When they (the teachers) first started, they didn’t come to the jazz musician and say ‘what should we teach?’ They didn’t do that. They have our young now learning these funny songs that don’t have movement, so young people all over the world aren’t even getting a chance to learn to play” (77).

Harris was concerned that “Everybody is writing their original stuff mostly nowadays… But because people are playing their original music, we can’t have the jam
session thing too much. Young people nowadays don’t even have a chance to go to a jam session.” (78). He was also concerned that “I find students that can’t even play a major arpeggio, can’t even play a diminished 7th, can’t even play diminished 7ths all over their instrument, or play major arpeggios all over their instruments, all inversions” (79).

Finally, Harris asserted that “I wish that I could have a meeting with the teachers who are supposed to be teaching this music, so we could have a little discussion about how you teach this music” (80).

**Possible Limitations of Max QDA 12 Software Analysis**

According to this study’s statistician Dr. Ron Fisher of Fisher Statistical Consulting, along with his previous long experience in qualitative data analysis, the criticisms presented in the research literature concerning the use of qualitative data analysis software may have its limitations. These limitations include (1) the software invites the user to exceed the limits of the valid conclusions that can be drawn from qualitative analysis; (2) the software involves too many mechanistic and rigid processes, and puts pressure on me to focus on volume and breadth, rather than on true depth of meaning; (3) the software is not powerful enough to resolve the very fine nuances, subtleties, and narrow degrees of meaning which can only be differentiated, after a long period of reflection, by my mind; (4) a much higher degree of resolution, requiring researcher intervention and subjective interpretation, is required to discriminate between closely related themes and sub-themes; and (5) in other words, qualitative data analysis software does not always properly analyze qualitative data unless I have a vast knowledge in my subject—then the software acts as a complimentary tool for analysis. To this end, I am more than confident with his personal knowledge of the subject and feel that I have overcome the software’s limitation in analysis but unfortunately at the expense of possible biases.
Part II: GTA Questionnaire Survey Results

The purpose of the questionnaire survey was to elicit quantitative data from administrators and instructors working at post-secondary jazz institutions (see Appendix A). The results are presented in five sections as follows: (A) Demographic characteristics of participants; (B) Responses to Part 1 of the questionnaire, exploring the jazz influence(s) of the participants when younger, using a structuralist lens; (C) Responses to Part 2 of the questionnaire, exploring the jazz influence(s) of the participants when older, using a poststructuralist lens; and (D) Responses to Part 3 of the questionnaire, exploring the participants’ use of jazz in the classroom; and (E) Summary.

Part II Section A: Demographic Characteristics of Participants

Table 15 summarizes the demographic characteristics of the 37 participants, of which 7 were administrators and 30 were instructors.

Table 15. Demographic Characteristics of Participants (N=37).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demographic Characteristic</th>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Administrators</th>
<th>Instructors</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Origin</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institution</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humber College</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>57.1</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>43.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohawk College</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>13.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Toronto</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>26.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>York University</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>13.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>90.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age (Years)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>16.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41-50</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>46.7</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>37.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51-60</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>26.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61-70</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>42.9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;70</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Canada was the origin of all the participants. They worked at Humber College, Mohawk College, University of Toronto, and York University. The highest proportions (57.1% of administrators and 43.3% of instructors) worked at Humber College. 100% of the administrators and 90% of the instructors were men. The age of the administrators was 55 to 76 years with an average of 65 years. The age of the instructors was 34 to 61 years with an
average of 47 years. The largest age group among the instructors was 61 to 70 years (42.9%) while the largest age group among the administrators was 41 to 50 years (46.7%). The administrators were, on average older than the instructors.

**Part II Section B: “Music as Sound.”**

Table 16 presents the frequencies of the responses to Part 2: Questions 1 to 3. The first genre of music that the majority of the administrators (57.1%) were exposed to as children (all styles and decades) was Jazz, followed by Pop music (28.6%). In contrast, Pop music was the first genre to which 50.0% of the instructors were exposed, and only 3.0% of the instructors were exposed to jazz when children. 42.9% of the administrators and 73.3% started listening to non-jazz genres before the age of ten years. When they finally listened to Jazz, most frequently between the ages of 11 to 20 years, the administrators listed to three genres and the instructors to nine genres. Swing/Big Band was the most frequently listened to jazz genre among both the administrators (42.9%) and instructors (36.7%) followed by Westcoast/Cool by 28.6% of the administrators and 23.3% of the instructors. None of the participants listened to Black church/Gospel/ Spirituals, Free/Avant-garde, Third Stream, Post-bop/Modern, Funk jazz, ECM, or Smooth jazz.

**Table 16. Responses to Questionnaire Part 2: Questions 1 to 3 (Music as Sound).**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Administrators</th>
<th>Instructors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>What was the first type of music you were exposed to as a kid? (choices include all styles and decades)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Jazz</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>57.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Classical</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Popular</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Soul/RnB</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>Funk</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>Rock</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H</td>
<td>Electronic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>Urban Black</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J</td>
<td>20th century minimalist</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K</td>
<td>Black church/ Gospel/Spirituals</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 16. (continued).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>If you chose a non-jazz genre, at what age did you start listening to this type of music</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>&lt;10</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>42.9</th>
<th>22</th>
<th>73.3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>11-20</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>13.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>&gt;20</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>57.1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

|   | If jazz was or was not the first music you listened to, when you finally listened to jazz, what kind of jazz music was it stylistically/genre? | A | Ragtime/Stride | 2 | 6.7 |
|   |                                                                                         | B | Swing/Big-band | 3 | 42.9 | 11 | 36.7 |
|   |                                                                                         | C | New Orleans | 1 | 14.3 |
|   |                                                                                         | D | Bebop | 2 | 6.7 |
|   |                                                                                         | E | Westcoast/Cool | 2 | 28.6 | 7 | 23.3 |
|   |                                                                                         | F | Hard-bop | 2 | 6.7 |
|   |                                                                                         | G | Modal | 1 | 14.3 | 1 | 3.3 |
|   |                                                                                         | H | Free/Avant-garde |
|   |                                                                                         | I | Folk Blues | 2 | 6.7 |
|   |                                                                                         | J | Black church Gospel/ Spirituals |
|   |                                                                                         | K | Third Stream |
|   |                                                                                         | L | Post-bop/Modern |
|   |                                                                                         | M | Funk jazz |
|   |                                                                                         | N | Fusion | 3 | 10.0 |
|   |                                                                                         | O | ECM |
|   |                                                                                         | P | Smooth jazz |
Table 17 presents the frequencies of the responses to Part 2: Questions 4 to 7.

Table 17. Responses to Questionnaire Part 2: Questions 4 to 7 (Music as Sound).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Administrators</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Instructors</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4  At what age did you start listening to this type of jazz music?</td>
<td>A  &lt;10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>B  11-20</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C  &gt;20</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5  At what age did you start learning jazz on your instrument?</td>
<td>A  &lt;10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B  11-20</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C  &gt;20</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6  What kind of jazz were you learning and playing on your instrument?</td>
<td>A  Ragtime/Stride</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B  Swing/Big-band</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>42.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C  New Orleans</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D  Bebop</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E  Westcoast/Cool</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>26.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F  Hard-bop</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G  Modal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>H  Free/Avant-garde</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I  Folk Blues</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>J  Black church</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Gospel/ Spirituals</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>K  Third Stream</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>L  Post-bop/Modern</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M  Funk jazz</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N  Fusion</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>O  ECM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P  Smooth jazz</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7  Do you have any post-secondary education in jazz, and if so, where?</td>
<td>A  Within GTA</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>93.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B  Not GTA but within Canada</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C  Different country</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D  No post-secondary jazz education</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>42.9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
100.0% of the administrators and 83.3% of the instructors started listening to this type of jazz music when they were 11 to 20 years old. 85.7% of the administrators and 80.0% of the instructors also started to learn jazz on their instrument when they were 11 to 20 years old. The administrators listed four genres and the instructors eight genres of jazz that they learned and played on their instruments. Swing/Big Band was the most frequently played jazz genre by the administrators (42.9%) compared to 20.0% of the instructors. Westcoast/Cool was frequently played by 28.6% of the administrators and 26.7% of the instructors. None of the participants played Black church Gospel/ Spirituals, Modal, Free/Avant-garde, Third Stream, Post-bop/Modern, Funk jazz, ECM, or Smooth jazz. The majority of the instructors (93.3%) but fewer administrators (28.6%) had post-secondary education in jazz within the GTA. Only 3% of the instructors had no post-secondary education in jazz, compared to 42.9% of the administrators.

Table 18 presents the frequencies of the responses to Part 2: Questions 8 and 9. For question 9, the participants were asked “Please choose from any of the following: When you started to learn jazz, which method(s) were implemented?” The majority of the administrators (57.1%) replied “Just listened, no transcribing” followed by “Method books” with “Some lifting/transcribing (28.6%) or “Lifted/transcribed” (28.6%). In contrast, the instructors replied that they used 13 combinations of methods, the most frequent of which were “Some oral tradition” with “Some method books “(20.0%); “Some oral tradition” with “Method books” (13.3%); “Lifted/transcribed” (13.3%) or “Some oral tradition” with “Some lifting/transcription” (10.0%). None of the participants chose “No method books” or “No lifting/transcription.”

For question 9, the participants were asked “In thinking of your favorite jazz artist(s) when you first started to learn jazz, choose where you would place this artist’s style and era.” The most frequent replies of the administrators were Westcoast/Cool (57.1%) followed by
Swing/Big-band, Bebop, and Hard-bop (14.3% each). The most frequent replies of the instructors were Westcoast/Cool (33.3%) followed by Swing/Big-band and Bebop (16.7% each). None of the participants chose Black church Gospel/ Spirituals, New Orleans, Modal, Free/Avant-garde, Gospel, Third Stream, Funk jazz, ECM, or Smooth jazz.

Table 18. Responses to Questionnaire Part 2: Questions 8 to 9 (Music as Sound).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Administrators</th>
<th>Instructors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8  Please choose from any of the following: When you started to learn jazz, which method(s) were implemented?</td>
<td></td>
<td>n   %</td>
<td>n    %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A  Oral tradition</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>1   14.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B  Some oral tradition</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>4   6.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C  No oral tradition</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2   6.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D  Method books</td>
<td>A, J</td>
<td>2   6.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E  Some method books</td>
<td>B, D</td>
<td>4   13.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F  No method books</td>
<td>B, E</td>
<td>6   20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G  “Lifted”/transcribed</td>
<td>B, E, H</td>
<td>2   6.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H  Some</td>
<td>B, E, H, J</td>
<td>2  6.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I  No lifting/transcribing</td>
<td>B, H</td>
<td>3   10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C, E, H</td>
<td>1   3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td>1   3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D, J</td>
<td>1   3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G</td>
<td>4   13.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>H</td>
<td>1   3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>H, J</td>
<td>1   3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9  In thinking of your favorite jazz artist(s) when you first started to learn jazz, choose where you would place this artist’s style and era:</td>
<td></td>
<td>n   %</td>
<td>n    %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A  Ragtime/Stride</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B  Swing/Big-band</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C  New Orleans</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D  Bebop</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E  Westcoast/Cool</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>57.1</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F  Hard-bop</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G  Modal</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H  Free/Avant-garde</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I  Folk Blues</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J  Black church Gospel/ Spirituals</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K  Third Stream</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L  Post-bop/Modern</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M  Funk jazz</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N  Fusion</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O  ECM</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P  Smooth jazz</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 19 presents the frequencies of the responses to Part 2: Questions 10 to 14.

**Table 19. Responses to Questionnaire: Questions 10 to 14.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Administrators</th>
<th>Instructors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Did you transcribe this artist’s solos or phrasing when you first started to learn jazz?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Yes, a lot</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Yes, a little bit</td>
<td>57.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Just listened</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Did your musical taste deviate from this artist’s style/genre as you began to become more interested in jazz music?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>If ‘Yes,’ please name artistic deviations in style/genre:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Ragtime/Stride</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Swing/Big-band</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>New Orleans</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Bebop</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E</td>
<td>Westcoast/Cool</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Hard-bop</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G</td>
<td>Modal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>H</td>
<td>Free/Avant-garde</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Folk Blues</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>J</td>
<td>Black church/Gospel/</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>K</td>
<td>Third Stream</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>L</td>
<td>Post-bop/Modern</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Funk jazz</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Fusion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>O</td>
<td>ECM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>Smooth jazz</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q</td>
<td>Pop/Rock</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F, M</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G, H, O</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G, O</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M, O, Q</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N, O</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B, D, O, Q</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B, I</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E, F, G, K,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G, H, O, Q</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G, N, O</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>H, L, O</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>H, O</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>H, O, Q</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>L, O, Q</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M, O, Q</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M, P</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N, O, Q</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>O</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Were your original jazz influence(s) artists from the pre-bebop era?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>If not, at what age in your education (formal/ non-formal) did you familiarize yourself with early jazz from the pre-bebop era?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>&lt;10</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>11-20</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>&gt;20</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The majority of the administrators (71.4%) and instructors (83.3%) replied “Yes” or “Yes a little bit” to the question “Did you transcribe this artist’s solos or phrasing when you first started to learn jazz?” All the participants agreed that their musical taste deviated from this artist’s style/genre as they began to become more interested in jazz music. When asked to name the artistic deviations in style/genre, the most frequent replies of the administrators were Modal with ECM (28.6%) and Fusion with ECM (28.6%). In contrast, the most frequent replies of the instructors were Post-bop/Modern, ECM, with Pop/Rock (20.0%) followed by Westcoast/Cool, Hard-bop, Modal, with Third Stream (13.3%).

Part II Section C: “Music as Culture.”

Table 20 presents the frequencies of the responses to Part 2: Questions 15 to 20. When asked “If you currently do not play in the style of early jazz, do you see any relevance in studying and playing it?” none of the participants replied “Yes” while 42.9% of the administrators and 70.0% of the instructors replied “No.” The participants were asked “Since you are an educator in jazz music, do you teach it extensively from a diachronic trajectory, that is, its inception from slave music hollers, spirituals, early folk blues, ragtime and stride with your students?” The majority of the administrators (85.7%) and instructors (63.3%) replied “No” and only 10.0% of the instructors replied “Yes.” 42.9% of the administrators and 43.3% of the instructors replied “No” to the question “Did you ever familiarize yourself with other arts as a youth such as Dance, Poetics, Theatre or visual arts?” 57.1% of the administrators and 16.7% of the instructors replied “No” to this question.

When asked, “Do you think any of these other non-musical arts are an essential tool to learn jazz?”, the majority of the administrators (85.7%) and instructors (90.0%) replied “Yes” or “Yes, but only a bit.” 57.1% of the administrators and 63.3% of the instructors admitted that they “Sometimes, but rarely” use any of these other non-musical arts as a teaching
method in the classroom? In response to the question “Do you think vocal scat is an essential tool for students to learn phrasing and if so, are you using it in your classroom as a teaching method?” most of the administrators (57.7%) replied “Sometimes, but rarely” compared to 36.7% of the instructors. The most frequent reply of the instructors to this question (50.0%) was “Yes” (50.0%) compared to only 28.6% of the administrators.

Table 20. Responses to Questionnaire Section C: Questions 15 to 20.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Administrators</th>
<th>Instructors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 If you currently do not play in the style of early jazz, do you see any relevance in studying and playing it?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Yes, but only a bit</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C No</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>42.9</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D Not sure</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 Since you are an educator in jazz music, do you teach it extensively from a diachronic trajectory, that is, its inception from slave music hollers, spirituals, early folk blues, ragtime and stride with your students?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Yes, but only a bit</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C No</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>85.7</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D Not sure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 20. (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Administrators</th>
<th>Instructors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 Did you ever familiarize yourself with other arts as a youth such as</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dance (etc.)</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Yes, but only a bit</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Not sure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 Do you think any of these “other” non-musical arts are an essential</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tool to learn jazz?</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Yes, but only a bit</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Not sure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19 Do you use any of these “other” non-musical arts as a teaching method</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in your classroom?</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Sometimes, rarely</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Not sure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 Do you think vocal scat is an essential tool for students to learn</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>phrasing and if so, are you using it in your classroom as a teaching</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Sometimes, rarely</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>method?</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Not sure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 21 presents the frequencies of the responses to Part 2: Questions 21 to 26. In response to the question “Please choose the group below that best describes how you would classify yourself stylistically as a jazz artist as of right now” the majority of the administrators (71.4%) and instructors (66.7%) replied “Mostly modern;” while only 14.3% of the administrators and 10.0% of the instructors replied “Mostly traditional.” 42.9% of the administrators and 36.7% of the instructors replied “Yes” or “Yes, but only a little bit” to the question “Would this be the type of music you primarily teach new jazz students?” 50.0% of the instructors replied “No, I ask them what they want” while 57.1% replied “I don’t recall… as it always changes”.

100.0% of the administrators and 76.7% of the instructors had familiarized themselves with the narrative of how jazz music had been created, starting with the “great migration” of African Americans and the slave trade that gave rise to minstrel music, the blues, spirituals, early gospel, New Orleans style, Ragtime and Stride? Only 3.3% of the administrators replied “No” and 6.7% replied “Not sure.”

Table 21. Responses to Questionnaire Section C: Questions 21 to 26.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Administrators</th>
<th>Instructors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Please choose the group below that best describes how you would you classify yourself stylistically as a jazz artist as of right now.</td>
<td>Administrators</td>
<td>Instructors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Traditional</td>
<td>1 14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Modern</td>
<td>5 16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Mostly traditional</td>
<td>1 14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Mostly modern</td>
<td>5 71.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 21. (continued).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Administrators</th>
<th>Instructors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Would this be the type of music you primarily teach new jazz students?</td>
<td>A    Yes</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B    Yes, but only a bit</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C    No, I ask them what they want</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D    I don’t recall…as it always changes</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>57.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>As an artist, have you familiarized yourself with the narrative of how jazz music had been created, starting with the “great migration” of African Americans and the slave trade that gave rise to minstrel music, the blues, spirituals, early gospel, New Orleans style, Ragtime and Stride?</td>
<td>A    Yes</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>13.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B    Yes, but only a bit</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C    No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D    Not sure</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 21. (continued).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Administrators</th>
<th>Instructors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Do you think it is important to teach jazz from the trajectory mentioned in the previous question</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Yes, but only a bit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Not sure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Do you think it is an essential tool at post-Secondary Schools to have daily jam sessions run by students and if so, is this taking place at your institution?</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Yes, I strongly agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Yes, I somewhat agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Not sure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>If so, are daily jam sessions taking place at your institution?</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Sometimes, but not daily</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Not sure</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The majority (57.2% of the administrators and 93.4% of the instructors) replied that “Yes,” or “Yes, but only a little bit” to “Do you think it is important to teach jazz from the trajectory mentioned in the previous question. 42.9% of the administrators and 53.3% of the instructors strongly agreed that it was an essential tool at post-Secondary Schools to have daily jam sessions run by students and if so, it was taking place at their institution… 42.9% of the administrators and 46.7% of the instructors somewhat agreed with this statement. 100.0% of the administrators and 86.7% of the instructors confirmed that daily jam sessions were sometimes, but not daily, taking place at their institution. None of the administrators and only 6.7% of the instructors did not have daily jam sessions at their institution.

Table 22 presents the frequencies of the responses to Part 2: Questions 27 to 33.
**Table 22.** Responses to Questionnaire Section C: Questions 27 to 33.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Administrators</th>
<th>Instructors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>27</strong> Please choose one or more from the following list. As an artist and educator, what would you like to see implemented in GTA post-secondary Jazz curricula?</td>
<td>A, B</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>57.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A- Teach jazz as African American oral/aural tradition that should be learned from its roots</td>
<td>A,B,C,D,F,G</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B- More performance mandated vehicles...where professors and students play together, not just the students</td>
<td>A,B,F</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C- Have more African American instructors on staff</td>
<td>A,B,E</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D- Less emphasis on reading as to develop a musician’s aurality</td>
<td>A,D,E,F</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E- I don’t place such a deep emphasis on learning the history</td>
<td>A,B,C,D</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F- All students should have mandatory African drumming</td>
<td>A,B,C,D,G</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G- Jazz should not be viewed and taught as a codified European classical music aesthetic</td>
<td>A,B,D</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>20.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A,B,D,F,G</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>28</strong> In a traditional jazz context, what is the first chord in “Stella By Starlight?”</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>71.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#4 m7b5</td>
<td></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>46.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B II7</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C I diminished Major 7</td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>26.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D No idea</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>20.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>29</strong> What is the second chord in “The Song Is You?”</td>
<td>A vi minor</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B VI7</td>
<td></td>
<td>22</td>
<td>73.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C bIII diminished 7</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D No idea</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>57.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>30</strong> What are the chords at bars 17 and 21 of “All the Things You Are?”</td>
<td>A IIm</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>13.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>71.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B IIm7</td>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>40.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C IIm7b5</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D No idea</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>20.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 22. (continued).

| 31 | What is the first chord in “But Not For Me?” | A   | II7 | 4   | 57.1 | 13 | 43.3 |
|    |                                             | B   | #4m7b5 | 1   | 14.3 | 11 | 36.7 |
|    |                                             | C   | I    | 2   | 28.6 | 6  | 20.0 |
|    |                                             | D   | No idea | 2   | 28.6 | 6  | 20.0 |

| 32 | What is the second chord in “Embraceable You?” | A   | vi minor | 3   | 42.9 | 24 | 80.0 |
|    |                                             | B   | #4m7b5-VII7b9 | 3   | 42.9 | 24 | 80.0 |
|    |                                             | C   | bIII diminished 7 | 3   | 42.9 | 24 | 80.0 |
|    |                                             | D   | No idea | 4   | 57.1 | 6  | 20.0 |

For question 27, the participants were asked “Please choose one or more from the following list. As an artist and educator, what would you like to see implemented in GTA post-secondary Jazz curricula?”. The majority of the administrators (57.1%) chose to “Teach jazz as African American oral/aural tradition that should be learned from its roots” and to include “More performance mandated vehicles such as mandated jam sessions where professors and students play together, not just the students”. The most frequent reply of the instructors (43.3%) was the same items as the instructors, with the addition of “Have more African American instructors on staff,” “Less emphasis on reading as to develop a musician’s Aurality,” “All students should have mandatory African drumming, and “Jazz should not be viewed and taught as a codified European classical music aesthetic.” 20.0% of the instructors replied the same as the administrators with the addition of “Less emphasis on reading as to develop a musician’s Aurality.”

Questions 28 to 32 required the participants to identify chords in jazz standards, revealing an inconsistent variety of responses, over 20% of which were consistently “No idea.” The most frequent responses recorded in Table 8 were as follows: (Q28) #4 m7b5 in “Stella by Starlight” (administrators, 71.4%; instructors 46.7%); (Q29) “No idea” or “VI7” respectively in the “The Song Is You?” (administrators, 57.1%, instructors, 73.3%
respectively); (Q30) IIm7 in “All the Things You Are” (administrators, 71.4%; instructors, 40.0%); (Q31) II7 in “But Not For Me? (administrators, 57.1%; instructors, 43.3%); (Q32) “No idea” or bIII diminished 7th respectively in the “Embraceable You?” (administrators, 57.1%, instructors, 80.0% respectively).

**Part II Section D: Use of Jazz in the Classroom**

The responses to questions 33 to 55 required the participants to choose ONE of the choices that they had interest in, or would use as an artist of importance in the classroom (the choices were artist A = “traditional”; artist B = “non-traditional” or C = “Don’t know). A total of 23 pairs of artists could be chosen. The frequencies of the responses are presented in Tables 23 and 24. The responses were summarized by computing the total numbers (cumulative frequencies) of traditional or non-traditional artists chosen by the administrators and the instructors. The cumulative frequency distributions were 40 traditional and 119 non-traditional artists chosen by the administrators; and 224 traditional artists, 419 non-traditional artists by the instructors. The percentages of traditional, non-traditional, artists, including the “Don’t know” responses, classified by administrators and instructors are illustrated using a pie chart in Figure 3.
Figure 2. Choice of important artists by administrators and instructors.

Non-traditional artists were the most frequent choices of both the administrators (74.8%) and the instructors (60.7%). The administrators knew all the artists listed in Tables 23 and 24, whereas 6.8% of the choices of the instructors stated “Don’t know.”
Table 23. Responses to Questionnaire Section D: Questions 33 to 44.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Administrators</th>
<th>Instructors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Please choose only ONE of the choices that you have interest in and would use as an artist of importance in the classroom (A = “traditional”; B = “non-traditional”)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33 A Buddy Bolden</td>
<td>0 0.0</td>
<td>4 13.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Freddie Hubbard (hard bop, funk, fusion)</td>
<td>7 100.0</td>
<td>24 80.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Don’t know</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34 A Louis Armstrong</td>
<td>1 14.3</td>
<td>13 43.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Miles Davis (modal, cool, rock-jazz)</td>
<td>6 85.7</td>
<td>15 50.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Don’t know</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 A Bix Beiderbecke</td>
<td>1 14.3</td>
<td>6 20.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Chet Baker (cool)</td>
<td>6 85.7</td>
<td>19 63.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Don’t know</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36 A Roy Eldridge</td>
<td>1 14.3</td>
<td>5 16.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Kenny Wheeler (ECM)</td>
<td>6 85.7</td>
<td>22 73.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Don’t know</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37 A Lester Young</td>
<td>1 14.3</td>
<td>9 30.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B John Coltrane (modal, free)</td>
<td>6 85.7</td>
<td>21 70.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Don’t know</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38 A Don Byas</td>
<td>3 42.9</td>
<td>19 63.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Dave Liebman (modal, free)</td>
<td>4 57.1</td>
<td>9 30.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Don’t know</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39 A Charlie Parker</td>
<td>4 57.1</td>
<td>24 80.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Chris Potter (modal, post modern)</td>
<td>3 42.9</td>
<td>6 20.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40 A James P. Johnson</td>
<td>2 28.6</td>
<td>9 30.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Keith Jarrett (free, ECM)</td>
<td>5 71.4</td>
<td>19 63.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Don’t know</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41 A Teddy Wilson</td>
<td>2 28.6</td>
<td>9 30.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B John Taylor (ECM)</td>
<td>5 71.4</td>
<td>21 70.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42 A Bud Powell</td>
<td>4 57.1</td>
<td>18 60.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Chick Corea (hard bop, funk, free, ECM, fusion)</td>
<td>3 42.9</td>
<td>12 40.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43 A Nat Cole (Piano)</td>
<td>4 57.1</td>
<td>15 50.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Brad Mehldau (post-bop/ modern)</td>
<td>3 42.9</td>
<td>15 50.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44 A Thelonious Monk</td>
<td>1 14.3</td>
<td>9 30.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Bill Evans (modern, cool)</td>
<td>6 85.7</td>
<td>21 70.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 24. Responses to Questionnaire Part D: Questions 44 to 55 (Classroom instruction).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Administrators</th>
<th>Instructors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Please choose only ONE of the choices that you have interest in and would use as an artist of importance in the classroom (A = “traditional”; B = “non-traditional”)</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45 A</td>
<td>Art Tatum</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Herbie Hancock (hard bop, funk, free, fusion)</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Don’t know</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 A</td>
<td>J.J. Johnson</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Bob Brookmeyer (cool)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Don’t know</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47 A</td>
<td>Chick Webb</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Tony Williams (hard bop, funk, fusion)</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Don’t know</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48 A</td>
<td>Kenny Clarke</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Paul Motion (modern)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Don’t know</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49 A</td>
<td>Oscar Moore</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Jim Hall (modern)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Don’t know</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50 A</td>
<td>Jimmy Rainey</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Bill Frisell (free, ECM)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Don’t know</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51 A</td>
<td>Oscar Pettiford</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Scott La Faro (modern)</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Don’t know</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52 A</td>
<td>Slam Stewart</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Eddie Gomez (modern)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Don’t know</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53 A</td>
<td>Billie Holiday</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Norma Winston (ECM)</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54 A</td>
<td>Erroll Garner</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>McCoy Tyner (modal)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55 A</td>
<td>Barry Harris</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Kenny Kirkland (post-bop/modern)</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Don’t know</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 25 presents the responses to the question “Did you ever study jazz with an African American at any point in your classroom or private education.”
Table 25. Responses to Questionnaire Part D: Questions 56-57 (Classroom instruction).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Administrators</th>
<th>Instructors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Did you ever study jazz with an African American at any point in your classroom or private education?</td>
<td>A Yes</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B Yes, but only a bit</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C No</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D Not sure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you think having African American instructors teaching jazz would give students a greater ability to assimilate and understand the breadth of the music’s “DNA” by way of these individuals own experiences and learned oral traditions?</td>
<td>A Yes</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B Yes, but will still be limited as a result of “historical circumstances”</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C No</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D Not sure</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Among the administrators, 14.3% replied “Yes”; 14.3% replied “Yes, but only a little bit”, and the majority (71.4%) replied “No.” Table 25 also presents the responses to the question “Do you think having African American instructors teaching jazz would give students a greater ability to assimilate and understand the breadth of the music’s “DNA” by way of these individuals own experiences and learned oral traditions?” Among the administrators, 28.6% replied “Yes”; 28.6% replied “Yes, but will still be limited as a result of “historical circumstances”; 14.3% replied “No” while 28.6% were “Not sure.” In contrast, among the instructors, the majority (76.7%) replied “Yes” while 16.7% replied “Yes, but will still be limited as a result of “historical circumstances”; none replied “No” and 6.7%
Part II Section E: Summary

The participants were selected from a variety of institutions, and included both men and women, with wide range of ages. Additionally, Dr. Ronald Fisher from Fisher Statistics Consulting who acted as the primary statistician and verified the questionnaire results, the broad range of participant characteristics helped to ensure external validity (i.e., that the results could potentially be generalized from the sample to the population).

There were differences in the responses of the administrators and the instructors. Ideally these differences should be quantified using inferential statistics based on categorical variables classified by cross-tabulation (e.g., chi-square tests); however, chi-square tests are very sensitive to the sample size. The magnitude of chi-square is sensitive to small frequencies in one or more of the cells of the cross-tabulation, and the results are invalid if the cross-tabulation contain any frequencies below five (Agresti, 2007). Because the tables contained frequencies below five, it was not statistically justifiable to quantify the differences in the responses of the administrators vs. instructors using chi-square tests.

Part III: Results of GTA Long Interviews

The purpose of Part III was to elicit qualitative information from the instructors and administrators at post-secondary jazz institutions. The results of the content analysis of the transcripts of the long interviews are presented in seven sections (A) Demographic characteristics of participants; (B) Template of primary themes; (C), Content analysis of the first primary theme: “music as sound,” exploring the jazz influence(s) of the participants when younger; (D) Content analysis of the second primary theme “music as culture,” exploring the jazz influence(s) of the participants when older; (E) Content analysis of the third primary Knowledge in other non-musical arts exploring the participants’ use of dance, theatre, poetry, visual arts in the classroom; (F) Content analysis of the fourth primary theme
“GTA jazz curricula and suggestions” exploring the participants’ views about the GTA jazz curricula; and (G) Triangulation.

**Part III Section A: Characteristics of Participants**

Out of the 37 participants who agreed to answer the questionnaire, a total of 23 of those participants were further available for an in-depth interview. These participants were interviewed, working as administrators and instructors at the four institutions listed in Table 26. The interviews provided a total of 720 statements, all of which were entered into the content analysis. The number of statements provided by each participant ranged widely from a minimum of 23 to a maximum of 69.

**Table 26. Characteristics of 23 Interviewed Participants.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant (Code name)</th>
<th>Institution(s)</th>
<th>Number of statements</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H-BS</td>
<td>Humber college</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>9.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H-HN</td>
<td>Humber college</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>7.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H-LB (pt.1)</td>
<td>Humber college</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H-LB (pt.2)</td>
<td>Humber college</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>6.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H-T-DB</td>
<td>Humber college &amp; University of Toronto</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>7.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H-T-RD (pt.1)</td>
<td>Humber college &amp; University of Toronto</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H-T-RD (pt.2)</td>
<td>Humber college &amp; University of Toronto</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H-T-RD (pt.3)</td>
<td>Humber college &amp; University of Toronto</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H-T-RP</td>
<td>Humber college &amp; University of Toronto</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M-H-Y-FA</td>
<td>Mohawk college, Humber college &amp; York University</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M-HD</td>
<td>Mohawk college</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>6.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M-Y-EM</td>
<td>Mohawk college &amp; York University</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T-H-CW</td>
<td>University of Toronto &amp; Humber college</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>7.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T-H-DC</td>
<td>University of Toronto &amp; Humber college</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>6.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T-H-DT</td>
<td>University of Toronto &amp; Humber college</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>7.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T-Y-JK</td>
<td>University of Toronto &amp; York University</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>721</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Part III Section B: Template of Primary Themes**

The template outlined in Table 27, was structured to define the five primary themes that emerged from a total of 720 significant statements. Over half of the statements (55.8%)
applied to the “music as culture” lens, while about one third (33.3%) applied to the “music as sound” lens. Relative few statements referred to the GTA jazz curricula (9.7%) and knowledge non-musical arts (1.2%)

**Table 27. Primary Themes.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary theme</th>
<th>Number of statements</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Music as Sound” lens</td>
<td>239</td>
<td>33.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Music as Culture” lens</td>
<td>402</td>
<td>55.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge in other non-musical arts</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GTA jazz curricula</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>9.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>720</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Four tables were constructed to present the frequency distributions of the units of communication reflecting the relative coverages (counts and percentage) of the five primary themes: “Music as Sound” (Table 28); “Music as Culture” (Table 29); “Knowledge in other non-musical arts” (Table 30); and “GTA jazz curricula” (Table 31).

After each table presenting the frequencies of statements in each primary theme, the evidence for the identification of each sub-theme is supported by quoting a selection of verbatim statements extracted directly from the interview transcript without editing or distortion by myself.

**Part III Section C: Music as Sound.**

Table 28 presents the results of the content analysis of the primary theme: “Music as Sound.” In response to the question “At what age did you start listening to jazz? Eight of the respondents replied between 10 and 18 years, four at less than 10 years, and two at 18 years or above. In response to the question “At what age did you start playing jazz on your instrument?” eight replied between 10 and 18 years, and three at 18 years or above. The early influences of the participants were very variable.
Table 28. Content Analysis of Primary Theme: “Music as Sound.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-theme</th>
<th>Sub-theme categories</th>
<th>Coverage within primary theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Number of statements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At what age did you start listening to jazz?</td>
<td>Greater than or equal to 10 years old but less than 18 years old</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Greater than or equal to 18 years old</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Less than 10 years old</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At what age did you start playing jazz on your instrument?</td>
<td>Greater than or equal to 10 years old but less than 18 years old</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Greater than or equal to 18 years old</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Less than 10 years old</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early influences</td>
<td>20th century classical influences</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>African American jazz: bebop-swing-big band-stride and early blues</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>African American jazz: post bebop-modal-Free jazz-soul jazz</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cool and West Coast Jazz</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>European Jazz- non-swing based with classical elements ECM</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GTA or Canadian artists as influence</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pop and Rock/ fusion music as first influences</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Video Game/ Electronic and computer music</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning by way of the &quot;oral&quot; tradition</td>
<td>Not classified</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning to play jazz in GTA institutions</td>
<td>Learning jazz from a book</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not fully learning the antecedents of the music</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not learning jazz by ear</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matured influences</td>
<td>African American: bebop-swing, big band, stride, ragtime-early blues</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>African American jazz: post bebop-MODAL-Free-soul jazz</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>European Jazz- non-swing based with classical elements ECM</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GTA or Canadian artists as major influence</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pop and Rock/ fusion music as major influences</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 28. (continued).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Matured influences (cont.)</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>Video game/ electronic and computer music</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>0.4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participant concerns of GTA jazz, eco-system</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>“African American-ness” vs GTA Jazz instructors</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>European classical model used to codify jazz in academia</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Neo-liberalism/ government cutbacks</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Radio stations NOT programming traditional jazz-daily</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant not being honest—reputation and/or job security</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Not classified</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transcribing to learn the language</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Not classified</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total number of statements</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>239</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The highest frequency of statements (20) referred to African American jazz-post bebop-Modal-Free-soul jazz, exemplified by H-HN: Mainly bebop and Early John Coltrane; H-HN: John Coltrane - Blue Trane up to the Atlantic label- modal era Coltrane; H-T-DB: Chick Corea; and H-T-RD: I gravitated towards certain artists and certain styles. Bud Powell early on was a big influence and then that morphed into a McCoy Tyner phase that went on for quite a while…you know...then Bill Evans and Chick Corea and Herbie Hancock at various points became influences—piano wise. Of course I had influences that were not piano, as well including people such as Woody Shaw and Coltrane, Dexter Gordan, Wayne Shorter…. Clifford Brown was huge for me… Donald Byrd … a lot of different people influenced and inspired me as I don’t like to get locked into “genres” or style really.”

The next most frequent early influences were pop and rock/ fusion music (18 statements), reflected by H-BS: Yes—Yellowjackets, Michael Brecker and Chick Corea, Keith Jarrett; T-Y-JK: Exposed to lots of country music, lots of pop music—things that were
just on the radio”; T-H-DT: Antonio Carlos Jobim compilation and then I started taking lessons with Toronto saxophonist Mike Murley. Then I started listening a lot to recordings of Mike Murley and Paul Desmond.”


The early influences of European Jazz- non-swing based with classical elements, ECM, were indicated by 11 statements, e.g., T-H-CW: “I think because I was listening to so much ECM, I started to flip (check out more) that catalog of artists… I was also hooked on (Michael) Brecker”; T-H-CW: “Yeah Absolutely. I listened to Bill Evans that led me to Tom Harell and that led me to Joe Lovano and then Kenny Wheeler popped up in there and then I started to listen to Kenny Wheeler and Dave Holland”; and H-T-RD: “Bud Powell, Keith Jarrett, Coltrane.” Other early influences were represented by less frequent statements, represented by the following sub-themes: GTA or Canadian artists (9 statements); Cool and West Coast Jazz (8 statements); 20th century classical (5 statements); and videogame/electronic and computer music (2 statements).

The sub-theme Learning by way of the “oral” tradition was represented by 8 statements, including M-Y-EM: Aural tradition (ears), Oral tradition (with John Giddings); M-H-Y-FA: “Hmmm... for me I’d say, at the time, the one which had the most weight was the oral tradition… one on one with Mark and having him demonstrate concepts on the piano”; H-T-RD: “I remember reading this—guys would go over to Thelonious Monk’s
place, players such as Sonny Rollins, John Coltrane and Randy Weston and Monk would make them learn his compositions only by ear even though he had them all written out… but that was his thing… he said you got to learn this stuff by ear” and H-T-RD: “Oral Tradition—around teachers such as Steven Hornstein and David Bineman and indirectly through the free artists such as Bill Dixon and Arthur Brooks.”

The most frequent statements describing the sub-theme of Matured influences were (a) African American -Bebop-swing, big band, stride, ragtime-early blues (8 statements) and (b) African American jazz-post bebop-MODAL-Free-soul jazz (8 statements) Influence (a) was reflected by H-LB: “straight ahead swing…”; H-LB: Yah… that whole Barry (Harris) thing … especially when you start to blow on things… it becomes Barry and a Monkish thing…” H-HN: “artists like Les Paul, Charlie Christian, Chet Atkins” Influence (b) was reflected by M-HD: “I listened to all of John Coltrane’s music from the early to late periods of his career”; M-H-Y-FA: “After Bud, there was Bill Evans for a very significant period. also around the time of Bud there was Phineous Newborn… some Hank Jones… But yah—Bill Evans and out of Bill Evans came a huge Keith Jarrett phase”; M-HD: “I just followed my ears—Stanely Turentine and Joe Farrell.”

Pop and Rock/ fusion music as major matured influences were represented by five statements, including H-BS: “The Yellowjackets—smooth jazz and funky with roots in pop and RnB; and H-BS: “soul, funk, mainstream contemporary, bebop.” The matured influences of European Jazz- non-swing based with classical elements, ECM, were represented by four statements, including H-HN: “Yes… I tried to copy Bill Evans and Keith Jarrett” (ECM); H-T-RD: “You could say McCoy’s approach was a more Africanized approach, where Bill Evans was more of an Europeanized approach if you want to put it into those terms. To me reconciling those two aesthetics has been my life’s work”… GTA or Canadian artists as a
major influence was represented by four statements including T-H-DT: “Mike Murley”; H-T-RD: “I think it’s overly simplistic to paint the entire scene with a single brush… but I felt like if we are talking about the old guard—Rob McConell, Moe Koffman, Ed Bickert, Guido Basso and the Boss Brass type of sensibility, it always felt to me that there was a direct lineage and connection with the California “Cool” West Coast kind of thing—Gerry Mulligan, Chet Baker. Shorty Rodgers kind of sound which was great music but its definitely NOT connected to the Gospel and Blues influences.” Only one statement represented the influence of video game/ electronic and computer music.

The participant concerns with the GTA jazz pedagogues were mainly reflected by 15 statements concerned with the Western art classical model being used to codify jazz in academia, e.g., H-T-RD: “I think there was definitely a lot of teachers at Humber especially at that time who were real pedagogues—guys who had gotten degrees but weren’t necessarily musicians”; H-T-RD: “I don’t feel that it directly impacted me personally because I had already learned how to play… So the stuff you’re talking about—like the mechanical side of things is something I observed and saw to be a potential problem”; and Researcher Observation: The participant was told to purchase the “Charlie Parker Omni Book” by his teacher after he completed high school. This of course is detrimental to learning the language. One should use their ears to learn solos from transcriptions, not reading in a wrote manner (Berliner 1994; S. DeVeaux 1991; K. E. Prouty 2005; E. Wilf 2010).

The sub-theme “African American-ness vs the erasure of African American-ness” was represented by five statements, exemplified by H-T-RD: “I think it’s important, but I don’t always touch on it… I certainly emphasize that this a tradition that does come from African American culture. Perhaps since we live in Canada we are a little less disconnected from American social realities… I want to endeavor to learn about the history and trajectory of
African American experience—I think it is crucial to taking on this music in a deep way!”: H-T-RD: “Look at Jewish music has that melancholy reflected in it. The Jews were able to bridge the gap between European and African American musical culture. So you get people like Gershwin who really got it”; H-T-RD: “What I don’t hear in players now is a sense of ‘urgency’ in their playing that was evident with these great African American players and creators—that the notes they play may very well be their last” and H-T-RD: “(Toronto jazz musicians) are going to be influenced by all the great African American players because the roots of the music are there.”

The sub-theme “Neo-liberalism/government cutbacks” was represented by three statements, highlighted by H-LB: “Well I think that you’ll find that most of the guys that teach… don’t play. And that for me is the whole system in a nut shell. It’s like we’ve made a decision to teach for profit. You go to University and it’s bizarre because they want to teach you… history, and they want you to know the theoretical components of music and they want you to learn English so you can write, and an Arts elective and maybe a language. So the actual part of playing the music and the private lesson and keyboard harmony—they are way off in the corner for low credits.”

The sub-theme “Radio stations NOT programming traditional jazz daily” was indicated by two statements, highlighted by Researcher: “But what about the radio stations?” H-LB: “Oh that’s like the “horse’s ass”; and Researcher: “I have a problem with the state of jazz. The clubs and the programming on Jazz FM—I turn on the station and they are playing music that sounds like rock or pop.” M-Y-EM: “I hear you man.”

The sub-theme “Participant not being honest—reputation and /or job security” was reflected by ten statements, highlighted by Researcher: “Do you think that jazz education in post-secondary schools have stripped away the rawness of trying to do the work by yourself
and turned it into something that is mechanical, wrote and like a “square?” H-BS: “I don’t know”; Researcher: “Without naming any names, do you think there are instructors at universities and colleges in the GTA who take a backwards wrote or mechanical approach to learning jazz?” H-BS: “I don’t know?” … Researcher: Since you are an educator in jazz, do you teach from a diachronic trajectory of starting from slave music, Minstrel music, ragtime, blues and gospel? H-BS: “I have.” (Researcher Observation: After the participant described what he teaches to students—it is somewhat clear that he is NOT teaching from the roots of slave and minstrel jazz) So the answer is changed to “No.”

The relatively low occurrence of “Transcribing to learn the language” was reflected by 11 statements, exemplified by H-BS: “I learned 20% method books, 40% oral tradition and 40% transcribing; Researcher: “Do you think that’s missing from the jazz curriculums? H-LB: We (post-secondary schools) don’t touch that!”; H-LB: “I’ve transcribed things I liked before I knew what they were. I used to listen to Coltrane ballads as warmups… I transcribed a lot of the Miles (Davis) stuff … his rhythm section laid out so much… I would say contemporary players… NO”; Researcher: What about “lifting,” did you do a lot of “lifting” on your own? H-T-RP: “Oh Yes, I’ve listened to a lot of music for as long as I can remember.” (Researcher observation: The participant has only stated he has listened to a lot of music but makes no indication of actually trying to transcribe the music).

Part III Section D: “Music as Culture.”

Table 29 presents the results of the content analysis of the primary theme: “Music as Culture.” None of the participants stated that they currently had a good knowledge of traditional jazz; however, 12 statements reflected some knowledge of traditional jazz, reflected by Researcher: “Are you familiar with the great African American migration that brought on the slave trade, slave music, minstrel music, gospel, the blues and New Orleans?”
H-HN: “Uh huh, I am aware”; H-LB: “Yup (Yes)”; Researcher: “At what point in your musical upbringing did you familiarize yourself with bebop?” H-T-DB: “I was listening to Charlie Parker at 16 or so, but then I was trying to figure it out at the piano by ear… I didn’t run into bebop scales—you know that Barry Harris stuff… I took a lesson with Pat Labarbera when I was 18 and he took some lessons from Joe Henderson and Joe Henderson laid all that stuff (bebop foundation) on him”; and Researcher: “As a jazz artist, have you familiarized yourself with the narrative of how jazz music had been created with the “great migration of African Americans from the slave trade that resulted in the Blues, Spirituals, Gospel, New Orleans-New Orleans, ragtime and stride?” M-H-Y-FA: “I’ve checked out some of that history. I’d say I’ve done a pretty “surface” study of it though.” T-H-DT: “I have familiarized myself with it but could never speak on the topic with any great detail.”

Some knowledge of traditional jazz was also reflected by the responses when I asked the participants about their musical choices, based on the names of artists selected by myself. The participants provided 278 statements (69.2% of the total) categorized mainly as Modern (154, 38.3%); with fewer Traditional (102, 25.4%) or non-cognizant of artists (22, 5.5%).

Limited knowledge of traditional jazz was also reflected by the sub-theme “Participants' traditional jazz pedagogy” in which only two participants stated that they “taught jazz from its traditional roots.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 29. Content Analysis of Primary Theme: “Music as Culture.”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sub-theme</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>traditional jazz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>musical choices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 29. (continued).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants' traditional jazz pedagogy</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>Does not teach jazz from its traditional roots</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>0.7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Teaches jazz from its traditional roots</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pedagogical style</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Pedagogy focuses on modern styles-modal up to present</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Pedagogy is a combination of all styles but is Eurocentric</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Pedagogy that lets student choose their own &quot;destination&quot;</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant's use of non-musical arts in the classroom</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Does NOT use non-musical arts as teaching aids in classroom</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Uses a little bit of non-musical arts in classroom</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Uses non-musical arts as a teaching aid in the classroom</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philosophy of non-musical arts as aid in the classroom</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Indifferent to non-musical arts as an aid in learning jazz</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Non-musical arts would be an aid in learning jazz</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaire on correct chords in jazz standards</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Correct Answer</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Possible answer, but not the best choice according to Barry Harris</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Wrong answer</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Does not know</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional jazz philosophy</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Need to learn traditional roots of jazz</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Criticism of other professors’ knowledge of traditional jazz</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>No need to learn traditional roots of jazz</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>402</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the sub-theme “Pedagogical style,” three statements were categorized as “Pedagogy focuses on modern styles-modal up to present,” reflected by Researcher: “How would you classify yourself stylistically as a jazz artist right now?” T-H-DT: “modern contemporary… I’m influenced presently by David Binney.” Researcher: “Would this style be what you try to teach your students?” T-H-DT: Yes”. Two statements referred to Pedagogy that lets student choose their own “destination” including M-H-Y-FA: “ahhh, I think I’m more of ‘take a backseat,’ and let them find their path and give them the tools that they need to do that.” Only one statement was categorized as Pedagogy is a combination of all styles but is Eurocentric, specifically H-HN: “I start with the electric guitar of Charlie
Christian and move from pre-John McLaughlin and post John McLaughlin—Mahavishnu Orchestra—John Scofield.”

The sub-theme Participant’s use of non-musical arts in the classroom consisted of five statements reflecting little use of non-musical arts as teaching aids, four reflecting no use of non-musical arts as teaching aids, and three reflecting use of musical arts as teaching aids.

The sub-theme of Philosophy of non-musical arts as teaching aids was represented by 18 statements endorsing the use of non-musical arts, and only one participant who was indifferent. Examples of the use of musical arts included: Researcher: “Do you think poetry could affect phrasing when you improvise?” H-HN: “Yeah… maybe—it’s very rhythmic.”; Researcher: “Do you think that any of those none musical arts such as dance, poetry, theatre, visual arts, would be good to have as a tool in the classroom… maybe to learn rhythm or phrasing?” H-HN: “Oh yeah-absolutely… The Dalcroze method—that’s happening shit for sure;” and Researcher: “Do you think it could work?” H-T-DB: “Well Sure, why not? I know there was a big connection in tap and that was born in Harlem too when Ireland met African American dance.”

The limited knowledge of the participants was indicated by the sub-theme “Questionnaire on correct chords in jazz standards.” The majority (14) of the answers were incorrect. Only 11 were correct, with 12 possible answers (not correct) and three did not know.

The sub-theme “Traditional jazz philosophy” consisted of three categories: Need to learn traditional roots of jazz (23 statements); Criticism of other professors’ knowledge of traditional jazz (6 statements); and No need to learn traditional roots of jazz (1 statement). The need to learn the traditional roots of jazz was highlighted by the following statements:
Researcher: As an educator, what would you change in GTA post-secondary curricula? “H-BS: A greater emphasis on traditional styles compared to the modern styles”; Researcher: “If you do not play in the style of early jazz, do you see any relevance in studying and playing it?” H-HN: “I play early jazz and I see relevance in studying and playing it”; H-LB: “Yes …music and art are sequential and they’re mastery skill sets. You can’t just start in the middle and expect the ‘end’ to show up” (Researcher Observation: the participant is referring to that he believes jazz must be learned from its inception to individuals to assimilate its nomenclature (rules that govern its vocabulary and syntax. Researcher: “Do you think it’s important to teach jazz from this trajectory in post-secondary schools?” H-LB: “I think it’s absolutely the most important piece of it.” H-T-RD: “I feel that if you ignore the pre-bebop stuff, especially Louis Armstrong and especially people like Lester Young and Coleman Hawkins, then you’re missing a huge part of the equation. You have to go back with Armstrong and check out the Hot 5 and Hot 7 recordings. You got to go back and check out Bix Beiderbecke and Frankie Trambauer to understand where cool jazz came from…”; H-T-RP: “I absolutely do…To me that dove tails in the notion of immersing yourselves in as many artistic things as you can do. African music, whether it’s African music or African American music…you can feel so much.” Criticism of other professors’ knowledge of traditional jazz was reflected by six statements, including Researcher: “Do you think that there are other professors not teaching in this manner of utilizing vocal scat?” H-BS: “Yes” and Researcher: “Don’t name any names…do you think that there are any professors that teach in post-secondary institutions around the GTA that are not teaching from this trajectory? That is—knowing the history of the music. They may start at a later point in history and then move forward?” H-T-RD: “Yah…I do think that, but I don’t judge them for that either…but I do think it’s a gap.”
Part III Section E: Knowledge in Other Non-Musical Arts.

Table 30 presents the results of the content analysis of the primary theme “Knowledge in other non-musical arts” based on my question “Did you ever familiarize yourself with other arts such as dance, poetry, theatre, or visual arts? Over half of the nine statements (55.6%) implied that the participants did not learn dance, theatre, poetry, or visual arts e.g., H-HN: “No, I haven’t studied any of those things”; and M-H-Y-FA: “Not really”. The remainder (44.4%) implied limited knowledge and participation in non-musical arts (e.g., T-H-DC: “No, just video games as a visual art”; T-H-DT: “Yes, I was into fashion, dance troupes in New York and art galleries”; and T-H-CW: “Yes, I went to the art gallery, musical theatre and modern dance.”

Table 30. Content Analysis of Primary Theme: “Knowledge in other Non-musical Arts.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-themes</th>
<th>Coverage within primary theme</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Did not learn dance, theatre, poetry, or visual arts</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>55.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited knowledge and participation in non-musical arts</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>44.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total number of statements</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Part III Section F: GTA Jazz Curricula

Table 31 presents the results of the content analysis of the primary theme ‘GTA jazz curricula”. Most of the 70 statements (28.6%) referred to rhythm-dance, body movement-(Dalcroze method), scat (poetry) and mandatory African or Jazz drumming for all students in year one. For example, in response to the question “Do you think that any of those methods of dance, poetry, visual arts and theatre are important for students to learn jazz?” the replies included T-H-DC: “Yes…looking for the similarities between the arts makes them compatible and therefore they can be seen as one entity”; H-T-RD: “I think “dance” especially if it is related to the African, or Afro-Cuban or Brazilian tradition…ultimately, I think all the arts are related and I think that you shouldn’t exist in a “bubble” as artist. You
should read literature and you should look at paintings… but I think it is beyond the scope of a jazz studies program… You can be encouraged by an individual teacher—like I would tell my students to go out to the art gallery and study some paintings…”; M-Y-EM: “I use physical aids with body movements. In terms of body movement—telling students to walk (count your feet walking in ‘3’ and ‘4’)”. One response to my question “Do you think it would help if schools made it mandatory for all non-percussion jazz students to double on drums for first year? was H-T-RD: “Everybody is expected to know piano, but having a similar thing for drums makes so much of sense in a jazz context because everything comes from the drums… not everything, but that’s the “African” element in the music. Not only the African element, it’s these two great traditions coming together. The European military marching rhythm coming together with African polyrhythmic language and that’s sort of where jazz drumming comes from. Definitely that sense of the percussive tradition is the essence of the music.”

Twelve statements (17.1%) referred to the benefits of mandatory jam sessions with instructors participating, highlighted by H-LB: “I think that how are you gonna learn the music if you don’t play the music? … that makes no sense to me and why not bring out a couple of faculty, not to show off… like a drummer and a little bit later, have a (faculty) bass player sit in…and always keep a horn player” and H-T-DB: “Oh Yah, I think it’s a great idea… I’ve always said in meetings, make sure that there are 6-8 hours where someone can actually practice (playing).”
Table 31. Content Analysis of Primary Theme: “GTA jazz curricula.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-themes</th>
<th>Coverage within primary theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number of statements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhythm-dance, body movement- (Dalcroze method), scat (poetry) and mandatory African or Jazz drumming for all students in year one</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandatory jam sessions with instructors participating</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus more on the African American roots of traditional jazz</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need for African American instructors to pass on the oral tradition</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learn to play jazz by ear only</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scat-African American Slang and poetry-phrasing development</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on the social/psychological/emotion aspects of the music</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus on the basics of Jazz-Blues, Rhythm changes, Standards—</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More jazz clubs instead of schools being the new jazz clubs</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A good idea for an educational system of music—examining its social context</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I show my students electronic production, video games, pop music, weird music</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not necessary to have daily mandated jam sessions as part of the curriculum?</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage theatrics-feeling “care free”- free jazz</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They look to the computer or watch live music from the computer.</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total number of statements</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Eight statements referred to the benefits of focusing more on the African American roots of traditional jazz, exemplified by M-HD: “I’ll answer this with a quote from what McCoy Tyner said at a clinic: “The deeper the roots, the taller the tree.” So, if you’re a bass player, you have to listen to Robert Johnson or how will you expect to get any depth in your playing if it only goes back to the generation before you?” and H-T-RD: “You have to go back with Armstrong and check out the Hot 5 and Hot 7 recordings. You got to go back and
check out Bix Beiderbecke and Frankie Trambauer to understand where cool jazz came from…”

Seven statements (10.0%) referred to the need for African American instructors to pass on the oral tradition, reflected by H-LB: “I think yes because it’s their music. but you are treading on very… that’s like me going to a first nation’s group singing and dancing... I could study it all day and night but it’s not my… I didn’t grow up with it. Now, having said that, we have a way for guys like Archie to have a major impact in this community—and if it is like a community, it’s like a village raises a child.”

The sub-theme reflecting a limited ability to “Learn to play jazz by ear only” was represented by five statements (7.1%) highlighted by M-HD: “Oral tradition to me is something that I feel is missing and I don’t hear young players do it”; and M-HD: “So to me, the ‘oral tradition’ is getting from the music the ‘rhythm’ that is inherited… because they can learn scales and all that stuff, but they won’t have no sense of how to handle it.”

The sub-theme supporting Scat-African American (slang) and poetry-phrasing development included five statements (7.1%) reflected by T-H-DT: “Yes, I get students to do transcriptions, I get them to sing it first… also getting them to try to sing a solo over the changes of a song.”

The sub-theme emphasizing the social/psychological/emotion aspects of the music, represented by 3 statements, 4.3% of the statements, was endorsed by M-H-Y-FA: “I would like to see the emphasis on the psychological and the emotional aspects that need to be developed as an improviser brought from 0% to at least 30% of what they are spending their time learning.” The sub-theme emphasizing the need to focus on the basics of jazz-blues, rhythm changes, standards, represented by 2 statements, 2.9% of the statements, including H-T-DB: “I find that a lot of the times when I teach improvisation, you through a whole bunch
of stuff at students in the first year, some of them get it, some of them get a bit and some of them don’t get it all and then in the next year you throw more stuff at them but they still didn’t get what happened the before. So, I still think that we need to work on specifics—simple things—the blues or rhythm changes.”

Schools being the new jazz clubs as a lack of actual jazz clubs around the GTA was a sub-theme endorsed by 2 statements, 4.3% of the statements, including M-HD: “It’s a completely different environment the ‘entertainment’ thing. It’s public ideas, but they would immediately be able to use it in shown and things. It’s a relevancy that we don’t really have, let alone our students —we don’t have the means of having 6 nights or 7 nights a week to play gigs that go on and you move around.”

The remaining four subthemes were only represented by single statements, and may therefore may not be reliable or important suggestions to improve the GFA curriculum, including T-H-DC: “A good idea for an educational system of music—examining it’s social context”; T-H-DC: “I show my students electronic production, video games, pop music, weird music… and “They look to the computer or live music from the computer”; T-H-DC: “No, it’s not necessary” (to have daily mandated jam sessions as part of the curriculum); and “Stage theatrics-feeling ‘care free’- free jazz” represented by H-T-RD: “But the ‘play’ aspect you know… well I think… nobody ever in the school system really deals with ‘free improvisation.’”

Part IV Section A: Triangulation Part II (Questionnaire) and Part III (Interviews)

Table 32 summarizes answers that were consistent across the questionnaire and interview responses. The triangulation revealed that the responses to the questionnaire and the interviews were consistent with respect to the participants’ (a) musical choices; (b)
traditional jazz pedagogy /philosophy; (c) use of non-musical arts in the classroom; and (d) limited knowledge of traditional jazz.

**Table 32.** Triangulation of Part II (Questionnaire) and Part III (Interviews).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Questionnaire</th>
<th>Interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participants’ musical choices</td>
<td>Non-traditional artists were the most frequent choices of both the administrators (74.8%) and the instructors (60.7%). The administrators knew all the artists, whereas 6.8% of the choices of the instructors were “Don’t know”.</td>
<td>The participants provided 278 statements (69.2% of the total) categorized mainly as Modern (154, 38.3%); with fewer Traditional (102, 25.4%) or non-cognizant of artists (22, 5.5%).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants' traditional jazz pedagogy /philosophy</td>
<td>The participants were asked, “Since you are an educator in jazz music, do you teach it extensively from a diachronic trajectory, that is, its inception from slave music hollers, spirituals, early folk blues, ragtime and stride with your students?” The majority of the administrators (85.7%) and instructors (63.3%) replied “No” and only 10.0% of the instructors replied “Yes”.</td>
<td>The sub-theme “Traditional jazz philosophy” consisted of three categories: Need to learn traditional roots of jazz (23 statements); Criticism of other professors’ knowledge of traditional jazz (6 statements); and No need to learn traditional roots of jazz (1 statement).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant's use of non-musical arts in the classroom</td>
<td>When asked, “Do you think any of these other non-musical arts are an essential tool to learn jazz?”, the majority of the administrators (85.7%) and instructors (90.0%) replied “Yes” or “Yes, but only a bit”. 57.1% of the administrators and 63.3% of the instructors admitted that they “Sometimes, but rarely” use any of these other non-musical arts as a teaching method in the classroom?</td>
<td>The sub-theme Participant's use of non-musical arts in the classroom consisted of five statements reflecting no use of non-musical arts as teaching aids, four reflecting no use of non-musical arts, and three reflecting use of musical arts. The sub-theme of Philosophy of non-musical arts as teaching aids was represented by 18 statements endorsing the use of non-musical arts, and only one participant who was indifferent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited knowledge of traditional jazz</td>
<td>The majority of the administrators (71.4%) and instructors (66.7%) replied “Mostly modern”; while only 14.3% of the administrators and 10.0% of the instructors replied “Mostly traditional”.</td>
<td>None of the participants stated that they currently had a good knowledge of traditional jazz, but 12 statements reflected some knowledge of traditional jazz,</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Part IV Section B: Triangulation of Contrasted Themes**

Table 33 summarizes the triangulation of the data collected in Part I, Part II, and Part III.
Table 33. Triangulation of Parts I, II, and III. Barry Harris versus GTA Participants.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Barry Harris (Part I)</th>
<th>GTA Participants (Part II and III)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Learning of jazz</td>
<td>Did not learn jazz in an institution. Learned to play with African American musicians.</td>
<td>Learned jazz in an institution. Did not learn to play with African American musicians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge of jazz</td>
<td>Knowledge is extensively rooted in playing traditional jazz with a large number of other musicians. Highly critical of the new generation of jazz players</td>
<td>None of the participants stated that they currently have a good knowledge of traditional jazz. Their knowledge of jazz is “Mostly modern”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philosophy of jazz</td>
<td>Philosophy is based on African American narratives, including playing in the black church as child, dancing to jazz, slang, poetics, theatrics, learning jazz by ear, and the religious facets of music.</td>
<td>None of the participants perceived jazz extensively from a diachronic trajectory (e.g., its inception from African rhythms, slave music, spirituals, early folk blues, ragtime and stride, etc.) None of the participants had experiences or exposure in the black church.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interrelated arts</td>
<td>Believes that the use of interrelated arts is essential to jazz, because “the dancers and all that ‘stuff’— ‘blackness’ or ‘African American-ness’ (theatrics and sensuality/sexuality) is part of the music.”</td>
<td>Most of the participants “Sometimes, but rarely” believe in the use of interrelated arts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jazz education</td>
<td>Highly critical of current post-secondary jazz education</td>
<td>Only a few participants are critical of current post-secondary jazz education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GTA curricula</td>
<td>Suggests extensive improvements to jazz curricula, based on traditional styles, including the learning of basics, songs with movement, the scale of chords, chord progression, and the need for jam sessions.</td>
<td>Only a few participants suggest improving the curricula by putting greater emphasis on traditional styles compared to the modern styles</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Summary

The purpose of Part I of this study was to develop a treatise that has not been documented in past literature by (a) expanding upon the antecedents of Dr. Barry Harris’ concept of movement; and (b) identifying the need to apply this concept across GTA post-secondary jazz curricula. Emergent themes were extracted from the qualitative data obtained from all the sources including workshop recordings, videos, articles, pictures, advertisements and interviews.
Next, in Parts 2 and 3 of this study, I used a mixed methodology of qualitative and quantitative to analyze the GTA participant interviews that consisted of interviews and close ended questions. With the help of a third-party firm—Fisher Statistics Consulting, both sets of data from the interviews and close ended questions were then statistically analyzed and triangulated to find commonalities between them. From here, the data was compared to that of Barry Harris’ data to illuminate contrasting sociocultural and sociopolitical themes, while also the possible gaps in the study participant’s comprehension, learning and pedagogy of traditional jazz.

After all the data was verified by Dr. Fisher, he further verified my conclusion that the triangulated data and analysis demonstrates very clearly that Barry Harris’s learning, knowledge, philosophy, and teaching of jazz, his emphasis on the importance of interrelated arts, and his recommendations for post-secondary jazz curricula, are the opposite of the GTA instructors and administrators.

Thus, moving forward in this study’s discussion and recommendations, I will answer this study’s research questions while also utilizing its findings in the development of new post-secondary jazz curricula for the GTA.
CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION AND ANSWERS TO RESEARCH QUESTIONS

Part I: Barry Harris

While the purpose of Chapter 4 was to present the findings by way of a mixture of lenses—organizing data from various sources into categories to produce a readable narrative, the aim of Chapter 5 is to provide interpretive insights into those findings. Whereas Chapter 4’s findings split apart and separated out pieces and chunks of data to tell the “story of the research,” this chapter is an attempt to reconstruct, analyze and discuss a more holistic understanding of the data (Bloomberg and Volpe 2012, 187). Thus, I used the research questions of this study as a methodological guideline and as a barometer. From here, I interpreted the findings from the data using a synthesis of structuralist and poststructuralist lenses while using “narrative inquiry” derived from qualitative methodology. All data has been triangulated for validity as a result of using several sources and methodologies.

To begin, I used a qualitative methodology to elucidate the many musical influences that Barry Harris had as a youth and young adult that contributed to his conception of “movement.” By using a structuralist lens, all the data documented by I had been compiled from a variety of interviews, published articles, advertisements, pictures, video transcripts, audio transcripts and a brief telephone interview conducted between Harris and in 2014. For example, I was able to document how Harris had “borrowed” melodic material—musical passages such as improvisations and harmonic progressions from the musicians that taught him and the one’s he idolized—and turned them into “motifs” within his concept. Thus, I focused on how Harris has managed to “structure” what author Peter Dunbar–Hall defines structuralism to be—a tabulation of “melodic material into motifs,” while also implementing these motifs into his musical vocabulary and pedagogy (Dunbar-Hall 1994).

Conversely, I also used a compilation of interviews, published articles, advertisements, pictures, video transcripts, audio transcripts and a brief telephone interview
conducted between Harris and in 2014 to deconstruct Harris’ concept of movement by way of African American narratives—analyzing the socio-cultural practices that Harris participated in as a youth. In this regard, I negotiated the unpacking and analysis of what he posits to be a loaded term—“dissonance.” In order to unpack this multi-layered term of “dissonance,” I analyzed Harris’ and some of his colleagues’ African American cultural norms—the codification of what I purport to be Harris’ musical enculturation—drawing upon literature (interviews, recorded workshops, advertisements, performances by colleagues) that examines the empirical and dialogical discourses of how African Americans expressed dissonances by way of texts and narratives. But in order to fulfill this requisite, I turned to the ground-breaking work by professor Rose Rosengard Subotnik and her seminal study Deconstructive Variations: Music and Reason in Western Society (1996). In this study, Subotnik posits that originally “all critical theories depended on verbal modes of interpreting the world”—a method of interpretation that is skewed, as it only explicates a myopic view—not taking into account the aforementioned terms “text” and “narrative” that are the embodiment of socio-cultural constructs (Subotnik 1996, 40). Thus, I aimed to move forward in this section by providing answers to the research questions that moved beyond “verbal modes of interpreting the world”64 and delineated what he believed to be the text and narratives that embody the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of movement.

64 “Verbal modes of interpreting the world” would be related to the previous authors who have published literature on Harris’ methodologies. As I have pointed out in Chapter 2, these authors only touch on “movement” as an outer-layered aesthetic and never flesh out a deeper socio-cultural meaning (such as African American “narratives”) that I purport to be movement’s true antecedents.
Answering Research Question 1

In analyzing the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of “movement,” what are its sources, structures, and limits?

By analyzing the data collected for this study, the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of movement, although noted in the data to be the by-product of an amalgamation of influences that would include Charlie Parker, Dizzy Gillespie, Earl “Bud” Powell and Thelonious Monk, are also rooted in the exposure Harris had as a youth to the earlier swing and bebop musicians that reside in his hometown within Detroit. This fact is important to this study because none of the previous literature specific to Harris’ methodologies have credited the “Detroit” sound created by the elder generation of musicians as the starting point for Harris’ own methodologies. For example, from the literature reviewed, Ben-Hur (2004), Bicket (2001), Kingstone (2009), Marijt (2014), and Rees (1994-2005), neglect to give the readers an in-depth background of Harris’s musical upbringing. Thus, I argue that the previously mentioned authors should have acknowledged the architectural environment in which Harris learned music as a youth. From the data, we can also see that although Harris’ first teacher was his mother—a church pianist (Bjorn and Galert 200; Brian Pace 2010; Panken 2013; Christopher Pitts 2011; Shermer 2015), it was in his early impressionable teenage years that Detroit musical idols Phil Hill, Art Mardigan, Kenny Burrell, Harold McKinney, Frank Foster, Wil Davis, Dorothy Ashby, Terry Pollard, Neptune Holloway, Clerophus Curtis, Cokie, and Tommy Flanagan became significant influences (Panken 2013; Graves 2010); also not mentioned by the authors in the reviewed literature.

The following citation taken from an audio interview with Barry Harris illuminates to the reader who Harris considers to be as early influences and mentors:

Well you see, I’d have to say my mentors would be…well there were so many good musicians around Detroit. I’d have to say the best of the young would be Kenny Burrell
and Tommy Flanagan. But then you start naming the ones no one has ever heard—Abraham Woodley, Will Davis, Phil Hill, Art Mardigan. Art Mardigan was one of the best white drummers. but he was also one of the biggest junkies…but these cats could play man…We had a cat named Cokie, a trumpeter player named Cleorphus Curtis—junkies…but they could play…we were lucky. I had mentors like that. I would go to the dances; I was like one of the dancers and I would lean over and watch Tommy Flanagan play chords and I’d take me a few chords home with me and play them in every key…that’s the way I learned…Will Davis—the same thing. I learned to play from these people. (Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video\Mentors-Barry Harris trk. N.D)

Although the authors in the reviewed literature acknowledge Harris’ main influences eventually became Charlie Parker, Dizzy Gillespie, Bud Powell and Thelonious Monk (Gilbert 2011), Paul Berliner’s (1994) ground breaking research Thinking in Jazz, along with Bjorn and Gallert's (2001) documented history of the Detroit jazz scene confirms my findings that Detroit musicians were the original sources of inspiration and provided structure for his concepts—that is, these individuals laid the groundwork and foundation for his playing and pedagogy at the onset of his musical youth (Berliner 1994; Panken 2013; Rupp 2016).

Music as Sound

Although musicians such as Dizzy Gillespie, Charlie Parker, Charlie Christian, Thelonious Monk, Bud Powell and Kenny Clarke were seen as the progenitors of the bebop movement (Burns 2001), and have been cited as influences by Harris throughout his workshops (Harris workshops 1994-2010), and within this study’s findings (Elie Afif 2010; Graves 2010; Milkowski 1998; The New School 2010; Brian Pace 2010; Panken 2013; Rupp 2016; Shermer 2015). There remain some enigmatic and structures of influence in musicians that history (and perhaps even Harris) may not have considered to the pioneers of the bebop movement (indirectly shaping his concept of movement). In this manner, I looked beyond the findings to offer the reader insight into the individuals that have influenced Harris’ musical idols: Charlie Parker, Dizzy Gillespie, Thelonious Monk, and Bud Powell.
From the video data, Harris refers to the older guard of musicians such as Lester Young, Coleman Hawkins and Ben Webster as “beboppers,” stating, “Coleman Hawkins, ‘Prez’ (Lester Young), they(‘re) all beboppers for me…Coleman Hawkins was a bebopper, ‘Prez’ was a bebopper—to me…most people say they weren’t beboppers but I say they were” (Barry Harris and Contemporaries-Audio and Video\Mentors-Barry Harris trk. N.D).

Although Harris does make reference to these older guard of musicians who have influenced him, authors (Ben-Hur 2004), Bicket (2001), Kingstone (2009) or Marijt (2014)—all critiqued within this study’s reviewed literature, do not make any attempt to thread these other jazz artists into their own published works as instigators in shaping Harris’ concept of movement. Conversely, Rees (1994-2005) has quoted Harris in his own published literature on the philosophies on Coleman Hawkins but never expands upon how Hawkins’ contribution was pivotal for the development of bebop’s lexicon; thus, the following section aims to fill this void in awareness.

**Coleman Hawkins’ Influence on Harris**

From the interviews, videos, and workshop data retrieved, Harris has stated that after playing with Coleman Hawkins as young adult, it gave him guidance on how to approach the piano. For example, Hawkins asserted that pianists should always play in the lower register for piano accompaniment because that is where all the “sweet harmonies” ring out (Clasijazz TV 2014; Elie Afif 2010) a suggestion that to this day that Harris enforces with all his students. More importantly, when the young Harris asked Coleman Hawkins how he

---

65 A possible explanation to why Hawkins might have found the lower notes on the piano to have sounded ‘sweeter’ than the higher register notes is because they have a longer decay time and therefore ring longer after the note(s) have been played. Another possible explanation is that it was a ‘sound’ accustomed to Hawkins ear that he may have gravitated towards by listening to certain players who played in this fashion.
made chord choices when improvising, Hawkins replied, “I don’t play chords, I play movements.” It is perhaps this very response of Hawkins that set compass and inspiration for Harris to develop a framework for moving his chord structures. Within the reviewed literature, Rees (1998), although cites the previous quotation by Hawkins in his volume, he unfortunately neglects to inform his audience how Harris would consider Hawkins is to be considered a “bebopper.” To answer how Hawkins may be considered a bebopper, I turned to Scott DeVeux’s groundbreaking work on the history of bebop (1997) also covered in this study’s reviewed literature.

In DeVeux’s publication, tenor saxophonist Coleman Hawkins, a member of the Fletcher Henderson swing band, was a visionary who facilitated the transition of swing to bebop (DeVeaux 1997, 35). Even in the Fletcher Henderson band of 1934, Hawkins was hinting at (and possibly even unconsciously developing) the groundwork for the beboppers’ new vocabulary that was to follow. Hawkins’s harmonic language anticipated many innovations later associated with bebop, including the so-called “flatted fifths” (DeVeaux 1997, 36). In early 1944, Hawkins began to take a mentorship role in hiring the young modernists that would go on to receive accolades and notoriety from the public as the inventors of “bebop” (DeVeaux 1997, 38). Hawkins’s young brood of disciples consisted of Dizzy Gillespie, Thelonious Monk, Kenny Clarke, “Little” Benny Harris, Howard McGhee and Oscar Pettiford, to name a few. For his early encouragement of the younger up and coming generation, and the championing of bebop, Hawkins was honored by them with the composition, “Bean and the Boys” (1946), based on the harmonic progression of the Sigmund Romberg and Oscar Hammerstein 1928 composition, “Lover Come Back To Me.” In this sense, I argue that Hawkins could be viewed as a founding father of bebop through his proactive contributions to the genre. DeVeaux further explains Hawkins’s significance, “For
the bop musicians, Hawkins had a special relevance. As keen-eared aspiring artists, they paid close attention to Hawkins musical legacy, appropriating some elements while rejecting others” (DeVeaux 1997, 39). One needs only to listen to Hawkins’s 1939 recording of “Body and Soul” to realize how Hawkins influenced the landscape of the new bebop music. For starters, Hawkins does not explicitly play the melody. He merely hints at it, but more importantly, he is actually improvising off the chord changes right from the beginning of the song. What becomes even more evident in Hawkins’s version of “Body and Soul” is that it was one of the earliest recordings that made use of the “tritone substitution,” as seen in Example 2.

Example 2. Coleman Hawkins tritone substitution in the opening melody of the Johnny Green standard “Body and Soul.” The red highlighted chords are the Tritone substitutions. In my opinion, the Fm7#5 in bar 4 beat 2 is acting as a tonic function. (Music courtesy of Carter 2010)

---

66 This technique was a staple for musicians like Charlie Parker who championed playing an improvisation from the beginning of a song. In return, these improvisations became accepted as a contrafact of the original composition.
In the example above, I argue that the Fm7#5 is acting as a IMaj9/ III and may be a possible influence to why Harris has stated in his workshops that he insists that certain chord progressions, such as measure 31 in the Jerome Kern composition, “All the Things You Are” must be viewed and played accordingly (Clasijazz TV 2014).

In commenting on the reception of Hawkins’s version of “Body and Soul,” Author Scott DeVeaux states,

Musicians came away deeply impressed by Hawkins’ erudite use of chromaticism. “Body and Soul” was, if not the first, then certainly the most famous jazz solo to use the device now known as a tritone substitution the replacement of a chord (usually the dominant) by a chord with a root a tritone distant from the original. Most musicians in 1939 would have expected the tonic chord (Db Major) of the opening bars of “Body and Soul” to have been preceded by a V7 (Ab7) chord. Instead, Hawkins strongly suggests a chord with its root on the lowered second degree of the scale—technically, an E-double flat, but sounding the same as a D. (DeVeaux 1997, 104)

Hawkins also went on record stating that his contemporaries were not hip to his new progressive plethora of harmonies, even though it fascinated them. Hawkins explains how he tried to push the boundaries in jazz harmony at this time, but received questionable accolades:

I started to play, and a lot of them used to say I was playing ‘wrong’ notes. And it used to be funny to me; I used to laugh about it. I couldn’t understand that. Like, the first time I played ‘Body and Soul’—when the record first came out? [sic] Well everybody, including [tenor saxophonist] Chu [Berry] and everybody said I was playing wrong notes… At that time, you make some type of a D change, or anything, going into a Db—that was wrong. Mm-mmmm. At that time, you had to make an Ab7 go into Db. If you didn’t make Ab7—strictly Ab7, now they don’t know that that’s a relative chord to D anyway. But I mean, they just didn’t know these things, and they couldn’t see it any other way. They heard that D, it had to be—“Oooh that’s terrible.” [Chuckles] You know? Which is nothing but a flattened fifth form, and things like that, hear it. But I mean, of course, that’s extremely common now, you know. But that just became common after that. It certainly wasn’t common before I made ‘Body and Soul,’ I can tell you that now! No, Mm-mmm. (DeVeaux 1997, 104)

Where authors such as Rees come up short, is in explicating the genesis of where Hawkins or other jazz musicians from the older guard may have developed a need for playing movements as opposed to static playing (that only focuses on playing or improvising over the
indicated chord of a certain measure). An example of this might be playing a typical 12 bar blues and maintaining the ‘I’ chord for the first 4 bars without any harmonic movement that would lead to different chords for voice leading purposes. Conversely, movement of the ‘I’ chord in the blues would be akin to letting the Improvisor or comping instrument’s harmonic palate modulate between what I have referred to within this study as forms of binary oppositions—consonance and dissonance that is propelling the music with forward motion until it is finally resolved at measure 5—the IV chord in the blues. Saxophonist Charlie Parker has composed several blues with this such thematic material. One particular example would be the composition “Blues for Alice” that moves in a descending cycle of 5ths (with tritone substitutions).

Harris’ affinity for Charlie Parker’s playing is undeniable and is recounted within Berliner’s expose *Thinking in Jazz* (Berliner 1994). Where Berliner could have delved deeper was trying to get the reader to understand how Parker himself may have gained his jazz vocabulary. To this end, I propose to the reader that even though literature has been published to illuminate how Coleman Hawkins and Lester Young were major influences upon Charlie Parker (Berliner 1994; DeVeaux 1999; Haydon 2004), an important, and not so recognized instigator to Parker’s sound (and by virtue, Barry Harris) would come from Earl Hines.

**Hine’s Influence on Harris**

To understand Barry Harris’s concept of movement, in the context of bebop, I propose to deconstruct another part of my 2014 interview with Harris on the topic of “biggest influences.” In our phone conversation, Harris made it quite clear: “I am a ‘Bird’ man before I am a ‘Bud’ man” (Harris Interview 2014). This statement clearly places Charlie “Bird” Parker at the pinnacle of influence, relative to other influences, including the great pianist Earl “Bud” Powell, with whom I argue many people associate Harris (sometimes to the point
of not being able to distinguish them from one another). Thus, to understand why Charlie Parker would be the greatest influence on Harris, I looked to Parker’s early band tenure with the innovator Earl “Fatha” Hines.

By the 1940s, swing musicians encountered the newer, “hip” musicians outfitted in the nonchalant style known as bebop (Jenoh 2002, 96). Ironically, the older musicians found that swing’s cohering harmonic continuities and rhythmic extensions of harmony and dissonance found in the bebop of Charlie Parker, Dizzy Gillespie and Thelonious Monk were initially found in the bandstands of the men who came before them (Jenoh 2002). These men included Jay McShann, Billy Eckstine and most importantly, Art Tatum, Lester Young, Coleman Hawkins and Earl “Fatha” Hines (Jenoh 2002).

It was from Hines that saxophonist Charlie Parker gained a big break (Russell 1972, 164), and it was during this time (and especially during the 1942-44 musicians' strike recording ban) that members of the Hines band's late-night jam-sessions planted the seeds for the emerging new style in jazz, bebop. Duke Ellington was later to say that "the seeds of bop were in Earl Hines's piano style" (Dance 1983, 90), while Charlie Parker’s biographer Ross Russell, wrote, “The Earl Hines Orchestra of 1942 had been infiltrated by the jazz revolutionaries. Each section had its cell of insurgents. The band's sonority bristled with flatted fifths, off triplets and other material of the new sound scheme. Fellow bandleaders of a more conservative bent warned Hines that he had recruited much too well and was sitting on a powder keg” (Russell 1972, 146).

As early as 1940, saxophone player and arranger Budd Johnson had “re-written the book” for the Hines band in a more modern style. Johnson and Billy Eckstine, Hines’s vocalist between 1939 and 1943, have been credited with helping to bring modern players into the Hines band during the transition between swing and bebop (Dance 1983, 298). Apart
from Charlie Parker and Dizzy Gillespie, other Hines “modernists” included Gene Ammons, Gail Brockman, Scoops Carry, Goon Gardner, Wardell Gray, Bennie Green, Benny Harris, Harry “Pee-Wee” Jackson, Shorty McConnell, Cliff Smalls, Shadow Wilson, and Sarah Vaughan, who replaced Eckstine as the band singer in 1943 and stayed for a year. Composer Gunther Schuller states, “In 1943 I heard the great Earl Hines band that had Bird in it and all those other great musicians. They were playing all the flatted fifth chords and all the modern harmonies and substitutions and Dizzy Gillespie runs in the trumpet section work. Two years later I read that that was “bop” and the beginning of modern jazz ... but the band never made recordings” (Dance 1983, 290).

The links to bebop remained close. Charlie Parker’s discographer, (among others) argued that "Yardbird Suite," which Parker recorded with Miles Davis in March 1946, was in fact based on Hines's "Rosetta," which nightly served as the Hines band theme-tune (Williams, 203). Dizzy Gillespie also said of that Hines band, “We had a beautiful, beautiful band with Earl Hines. He's a master and you learn a lot from him” (Gillespie 2009, 175-176). Conversely, Gillespie also said of the Hines band at the time, that although the people talked about the Hines band as being “the incubator of bop” (since the leading members of bebop, Gillespie and Parker, played in the Hines band), they had the erroneous impression that the music was new. It was not. Said Gillespie, “The music evolved from what went before. It was the same basic music. The difference was in how you got from here to here to here ... naturally each age has got its own shit” (Dance 1983, 260).

Music as Culture

The Black Church and the Blues

From the data retrieved, I noted that along with fellow pianists such Tommy Flanagan and Hank Jones, Barry Harris was exposed to the teachings of Detroit musicians
such as Charles Davis, Will Davis, Harold McKinney, Dorothy Ashby, Terry Pollard, Neptune Holloway and Frank Foster—all of whom were instigators of the “Detroit” sound that also has its DNA deeply rooted in the black church (Panken 2013; Rupp 2016). Harris also notes that although his musical roots were first started out in the church at the hands of his mother—a church pianist, he then moved on to playing shuffle rhythms of boogie-woogie and the blues because “in the eyes of Detroit musicians, the music from the black church and boogie-woogie were all related to jazz music” (JALC 2011; Panken 2013)—once again, a vital aggregate to his concept of movement that with the exceptions of Berliner (1994) along with Bjorn and Gallert (2001), have never been cited by the likes of (Ben-Hur 2004), Bicket (2001), Kingstone (2009), Marijt (2014), and Rees (1994-2005) in the literature reviewed.

Also noted in the data, Harris’ colleague and fellow pianist Hank Jones makes an excellent point of the indirect contributions of the black church to the blues and jazz music’s DNA (JALC 2011) while saxophonist Steve Coleman relates the “rhythms of the black church” to be an agent in Harris’ main influence—Charlie Parker (Coleman 2016). Thus, I examined the data that elucidated Harris’ exposure in the church as an influence to his concept of movement. The reason why I view Harris’ humble church beginnings as being influential is because it is a metaphor he uses when teaching his concept of movement in his workshops. The next section deals with the how Harris’ own beginnings in the church as a youth has now transcended into his adult pedagogy, and thus, has shaped his concept of movement through the use of metaphors.
The Hermeneutics of Movement

Since hermeneutics is an interpretation of texts (Harper Collins 2009), I would argue that the Harlem Renaissance poem “The Creation,”67 (1927) written by James Weldon Johnson and that Harris uses in his pedagogy to teach his concept of movement, must have also acted as a form of African American scripture that he related back to his youth in the Baptist church.

Harris’s hermeneutic interpretation is an excellent example of how the art of poetry has influenced the art of music (and how one epoch, The Harlem Renaissance has crossed over to influence Harris’s epoch—the bebop movement). From the literature reviewed, this type of influence could also be the result of what authors Rupert Sheldrake and Angela Nelson (1999) have referred to as morphic resonance—that is, current systems inherit the memories and habits from previous and similar systems (Nelson 1999; Sheldrake 2009). The significance of this theory is that it gives support to how Harris may have been influenced, not just by music, but also by all forms of artistic endeavours that came before him. Thus, the following example will demonstrate how Harris’s concept of movement is a hermeneutic interpretation influenced by James Weldon Johnson’s literary poem “The Creation.”

AND God stepped out on space,
And He looked around and said,
"I'm lonely --
I'll make me a world."

And far as the eye of God could see
Darkness covered everything,
Blacker than a hundred midnights
Down in a cypress swamp.

Then God smiled,
And the light broke,
And the darkness rolled up on one side,

67 Both James Wheldon Johnson’s “The Creation” and Barry Harris’ use of metaphors for teaching “Movement” are based off the Book of Genesis 1:1.
And the light stood shining on the other,  
And God said, "That's good!"

Then God reached out and took the light in His hands,  
And God rolled the light around in His hands  
Until He made the sun;  
And He set that sun a-blazing in the heavens.  
And the light that was left from making the sun  
God gathered it up in a shining ball  
And flung it against the darkness,  
Spangling the night with the moon and stars.  
Then down between  
The darkness and the light  
He hurled the world;  
And God said, "That's good!"

Then God himself stepped down --  
And the sun was on His right hand,  
And the moon was on His left;  
The stars were clustered about His head,  
And the earth was under His feet.  
And God walked, and where He trod  
His footsteps hollowed the valleys out  
And bulged the mountains up.  

Then He stopped and looked and saw  
That the earth was hot and barren.  
So God stepped over to the edge of the world  
And He spat out the seven seas;  
He batted His eyes, and the lightnings flashed;  
He clapped His hands, and the thunders rolled;  
And the waters above the earth came down,  
The cooling waters came down.

Then the green grass sprouted,  
And the little red flowers blossomed,  
The pine tree pointed his finger to the sky,  
And the oak spread out his arms,  
The lakes cuddled down in the hollows of the ground,  
And the rivers ran down to the sea;  
And God smiled again,  
And the rainbow appeared,  
And curled itself around His shoulder.

Then God raised His arm and He waved His hand  
Over the sea and over the land,  
And He said, "Bring forth! Bring forth!"  
And quicker than God could drop His hand, Fishes and fowls
And beasts and birds
Swam the rivers and the seas,
Roamed the forests and the woods,
And split the air with their wings.
And God said, "That's good!"

Then God walked around,
And God looked around
On all that He had made.
He looked at His sun,
And He looked at His moon,
And He looked at His little stars;
He looked on His world
With all its living things,
And God said, "I'm lonely still."

Then God sat down
On the side of a hill where He could think;
By a deep, wide river He sat down;
With His head in His hands,
God thought and thought,
Till He thought, "I'll make me a man!"

Up from the bed of the river
God scooped the clay;
And by the bank of the river
He kneeled Him down;
And there the great God Almighty
Who lit the sun and fixed it in the sky,
Who flung the stars to the most far corner of the night,
Who rounded the earth in the middle of His hand;
This Great God,
Like a mammy bending over her baby,
Kneeded down in the dust
Toiling over a lump of clay
Till He shaped it in His own image;

Then into it He blew the breath of life,
and man became a living soul.
(James Weldon Johnson)

**Harris’s Hermeneutic Interpretation**

To understand Barry Harris’s view of chord structures (crucial to his theory of movement), one needs to understand how such structures developed. By using James Weldon
Johnson’s poem “The Creation” and the Book of Genesis 1:1 as metaphors, Harris negotiates
the use of poetry to teach his musical concept of movement. For example, Harris, like a
church minister, preaches that all chords come from scales that are grounded in what he calls
“the universe”—the chromatic scale (Example 3). Harris paraphrases Weldon-Johnson’s
poem by stating, “In the beginning, God created the universe, for us, this equates to the
chromatic scale” (Rees 2001, 47).

Example 3. Harris refers to the chromatic scale as the “universe” (Rees 2001, 47).

```
\begin{music}
\note{G} & \note{A}_b & \note{B}_b & \note{C} & \note{D} & \note{E}_b & \note{F}_b & \note{G}
\end{music}
```

“Then, God created man and woman (Example 4), for us this equates to the two whole tone
scales” (Rees 2001). Harris further pontificates,

Example 4. The two whole-tone scales—“man,” and “woman” (Rees 2001).

```
\begin{music}
\note{G} & \note{A} & \note{B} & \note{C}\#
\end{music} \quad \begin{music}
\note{D} & \note{E}\# & \note{F} & \note{G}_b
\end{music}
```

“Then, Man and Woman got’ together, procreated and developed children. The whole-tone
scales gave birth to three diminished 7th chords, each one built from two pairs of genes—
tritones (Example 5). How do we know the three diminished chords are brothers and sisters?
You look at the DNA. All diminished seventh chords contain two tritones, one from each of
the two whole tone parents” (Rees 2001).

Example 5. The three diminished 7th chords (children) derived from the two whole-tone
scales (Rees 2001).

```
\begin{music}
\note{G} & \note{A}\# & \note{B}\# & \note{C} & \note{D} & \note{E}\# & \note{F}\# & \note{G}_b
\end{music} \quad \begin{music}
\note{D} & \note{E}\# & \note{F} & \note{G}_b
\end{music} \quad \begin{music}
\note{E}\# & \note{F} & \note{G}_b & \note{A} & \note{B}_b & \note{C} & \note{D} & \note{E}\# & \note{F}\# & \note{G}_b
\end{music}
```
In Examples 6 and 7 of Harris’s Major 6 diminished scale, it is possible to have harmonic movement between the tonic and dominant functioning chords. If one wants to move these two harmonic structures, then one must first extract the notes under the odd numbers C E G A, which will yield the tonic functioning C6 chord (Example 6).

**Example 6.** My depiction of Harris’s “Major 6 diminished scale.”

```
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 1
C D E F G Ab A B C
```

Similarly, extracting the notes under the even numbers D F Ab B yields the dominant functioning diminished 7th chord (Example 7).

**Example 7.** Harris’ Major diminished scale that forms the Tonic and Dominant functioning chords C6 and B diminished 7 that is acting as a G7(b9) chord (Rees 2001).

By using the facile movement of these two simple structures’ tonic and dominant functioning chords, and moving them up and down Harris’s “Major 6 diminished” scale (Example 8), a sense of tension or dissonance will oscillate with a consonance or sense of resolution. This is what Barry Harris refers to as, and what I argue to be, one facet of movement.

**Example 8.** Harris’ Major 6 diminished scale.
Socio-Cultural Dissonances

Another important contribution that cannot be discounted when taking into consideration the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of movement would be socio-cultural “dissonance.” By socio-cultural dissonance, and within the aforementioned framework of Sheldrake and Nelson’s quantification for morphic resonance (Sheldrake 2009; Nelson 1999), I am referring to the pain, struggles and bitter memories that African Americans had to withstand after they migrated north from the racist Southern states (“Great Migration - Blackchurch History” 2016). As noted in the findings, Harris, like many African Americans was subjected to racism along with several economic factors (Graves 2010; Panken 2013) that this researcher believes to be acting as an unconscious indirect influence on his harmonic treatments. For example, a lot of Harris’ harmonic treatments are the result of a composite of binary oppositions—thesis (tonic functioning chords) blended with antithesis (dominant functioning chords) giving the listener a juxtaposition of harmonies—synthesis—as noted in the reviewed literature by Jorgensen (2003). Jorgensen’s synthesis is also noted as a metaphor in this chapter’s findings by way of Jazz pianist Randy Weston—a colleague of Harris, and student of Thelonious Monk (JALC 2010).

In his recount of African Americans living in the north after the great migration, Weston makes an important socio-cultural point that after World War 2, African Americans were having difficulty finding work and ‘they (I argue Weston is possibly referring here to the government) decided to put drugs into the Black ghettos to contain the African American masses’ (JALC 2010). Weston further purports that ghettos such as Brooklyn and Harlem became hot pockets that led African Americans to build a ‘village’ that had its own closed unit of communication that encompassed food, dance, music, and poetics, and was solidified every Sunday within the black Baptist Church (JALC 2010). This comment by Weston is
quite crucial because I argue it exemplifies that Harris, along with the many other African Americans who were quite poor growing up, lived in these deplorable conditions (Panken 2013), and as such, built a emic system of communication that was closed off to etic non-participants.

As indicated in the findings, Barry Harris stated that he and his colleagues used to attend dances to not only watch jazz, but to dance to it (Clasijazz TV 2014; Graves 2010; JALC 1992; Panken 2013). Furthermore, Harris recounts how he and his colleagues also hosted dances with live jazz music (JALC 1992), thus in Harris’ opinion, dancing and jazz are synonymous, and as such, should have never been separated as jazz developed away from being a popular music (JALC 1992).

One of the most important findings within this study, in relation to all the arts as being interrelated, comes from the JP podcast interview between Barry Harris and drummer Billy Higgins (JALC 1992). In this interview, Higgins and Harris have gone on record in stating that “there was a time when all the arts where connected—music, dance, poetry, theatrics,” and as such, must be viewed and presented in such a manner of being interrelated (JALC 1992)—a sentiment that is also positively reflected in the reviewed literature from authors (Caponi 1999; Heble 2000; Nelson 1999; Raussert 2000; Stuckey 1994; Welsh, D’Amboise, and Hanley 2010).

In this manner, I argue that Higgins and Harris’ comments should then be a “wakeup call” for institutions that have yet to teach arts as an interdisciplinary aesthetic. To further break down the importance of viewing all the arts as being interdependent, I present the following scenarios:
Dance and Music as Co-dependents

In the context of traditional jazz and bebop, the importance of maintaining a marriage between dance and music is most important as they are both art forms that were crucially symbiotic to one another. By this, I mean that musicians and dancers fed off one another for inspiration of phrasing and rhythms (Crease 2008; JALC 1992; Haskins 2000; Malone 1996; Stearns and Stearns 1994). From the findings, an excellent example of how dance is crucial to the sustainability of jazz music may lie in Harris’ 1992 podcast interview with Jazz at The Lincoln Center (JALC 1992). In this interview, Harris has stated that he views his fingers while playing the piano as being the feet of a tap dancer and he tries to make his fingers dance to different rhythms (JALC 1992). Reflecting further within the findings, one need only examine the advertisements for Harris’ concerts to note that there are several references to dancers and tap dancers such as Jimmy Slyde and the Wonder twins, that Harris and other bebop musicians have used in their musical performances. On a personal note, I had visited the Jazz Mobile several times in Harlem/New York between 1998-2012 and always noticed how Harris made it a point to have tap and ‘glide’ dancers on the stage or just below the stage while the band was playing traditional bebop. As an observer, it was obvious that both types of artists—dancers and musicians—were adding to the experience of the show while they fed off one another’s motion and rhythms.

Not only is dance an art that “materializes” and personifies music (Hill 2010, 176), in my opinion, it is also a crucial prerequisite in understanding music’s rhythmical ebb and flow. Thus, the rhythm generated from dancing can be transformed into a musician’s expressive playing (Hill 2010, 176). For example, even though it has been reported that musicians had problems dancing to bebop (Hill 2010, 159), from the findings, Harris has stated that this was simply not the truth (Bjorn and Gallert 2001; Elie Afif 2010; Gale and
Hightowner 2004; Graves 2010; JALC 1992; Milkowski 1998; The New School 2010; Panken 2013; Shermer 2015), a testament that is also echoed in the literature by Crease (2008), Haskins (2000), Hill (2011) and Stearns and Stearns (1994). I assume this is the case because, according to musicologist Guthrie Ramsey Jr., bebop encapsulated the dance impulse of earlier forms of jazz, while adding fresh rhythmic, melodic and harmonic innovations (Ramsey, Jr. 2013, 54). The emphasis was on the drummer’s rhythmic component that influenced melodic instruments to phrase in a disjointed and syncopated manner (Ramsey, Jr. 2013, 55). Also, from the findings, this next quote from Harris signifies how he views dance and music as being interdependent.

Man, it was beautiful... you see, the Jazz musicians came in playing their songs, they played some standards too but they played their music. Bird played fast, there used to be a shake dancer named Baby Scruggs, Baby Scruggs would shake dance to Cherokee as fast as you could play it, you had to see that, knock you out! Boy, she was fine, you had to dig it... It was like a whole thing, we danced to Cherokee, we danced fast tunes and slow tunes, it didn’t have to be a slow tune you knew to dance. Jazz musicians made their own blues and stuff so you danced their blues like you danced anybody else blues...the biggest mistake we did was to divorce Jazz from dancing. (Fedele 1994)

Even the tap dancers became involved in the interpretation of bebop music. For example, tap dancer “Baby” Laurence matched the speed of bop with taps that were like explosions, machine gun rattles, and jarring thumps (Hill 2011, 59), emulating what I argue to be drummer Kenny Clarke’s dropping of “bombs” on the bass drum. Baby Laurence “moved” these rhythms from the feet up, playing his body like a percussion instrument (Hill 2011). While on the concert stage, the sinuous upper-body movements of dancer Asadata Dafora soared free over the strict drum rhythms accompanying his own rapid feet (Hill 2011). Author Valis Hill explains that there were a multitude of musicians who found solace in the “modern” rhythms that they encountered, without encountering the roadblocks to expressing themselves as suggested in past literature.
The following quotation exemplifies how dance was morphed into a full body experience. I argue that such an experience would have an impact on musicians, who themselves, like Harris were also regular dancers. If the full body expressed the rhythms that were originally reserved for the feet, I argue that musicians such as Harris would have been influenced by their own body movements when they improvised and in their phrasing.

These dancers were the progenitors of a ‘modern’ style of jazz dance, in which jazz rhythms, previously reserved for the feet, were absorbed into and reshaped in the body. [Jack] Cole’s ‘Sing, Sing, Sing’ number is an early example of this modern jazz dance. “I remember him at the Rainbow Room,” says dance critic Walter Terry, “doing not only the oriental dances to jazz, but also Harlem dances, in brown chinos with bare torso. He must have been the first to use Harlem rhythms that weren’t done in terms of old fashioned style of Tap” (Hill 2011, 159)

Bebop also inspired many dancers to abandon the early swing, “4 to the floor” bass drumming that made Chick Webb, Jo Jones, and Gene Krupa famous. Now the dancers, as well as the musicians, were taking note of Kenny Clarke and Max Roach’s rhythmic inventions that had percussive accents only “implied,” but not bound to the beat (Hill 2011, 174). Dance scholar Thomas DeFrantz confirms an important observation about the dancers at this time internalizing bebop’s radical displacement of the beat: On one level, bebop replaced the primacy of the beat that had been so evident in swing music, with its virtuosic renderings of harmonic and melodic structure. Bop assumed the presence of the beat, whether it was barely implied or clearly defined, expressing “an expanded experience of blackness, in which rhythmic structures, even when submerged, are presumed to be eternal…bebop taught dancers that we don’t have to hear the beat to know it is there.” (DeFrantz 2002, 17-28)

As bebop progressed and started to develop its sound, dancers such as Honi Coles began to experiment and try to mix interplay with the drummers. Dancer Buster Brown states that the tap dancers were like twins with the drummers. They duelled on stage and played off of one another (Hill 2011, 174). Even the young bebop tap dancer “little” Teddy Hale began
to get into the rhythmical displacements of Charlie Parker (Hill 2011, 175). The influence of bebop became so prominent that tap dancers such as Leon Collins began to try to tap like a trumpet player or a saxophonist, trying to emulate Charlie Parker and Dizzy Gillespie, for whom Collins jammed informally on many occasions (Hill 2011, 176).

Tap dancer Jimmy Slyde was a key figure in keeping the relationship between tap dancing and bebop music alive, when he arrived in New York in 1949. Slyde is credited for developing the bebop style of tap right up to the end of his life. As a side note, I was privileged to see Jimmy Slyde tap dance with the Barry Harris trio on several different occasions, the last time being in Toronto, Canada, in 2007. On this occasion, I witnessed Harris and his trio playing a repertoire full of Parker, Gillespie, Powell, Monk and Dameron compositions, while Slyde “phrased” his body movements over the bar lines, emphasizing his tap rhythms in a heavy triplet and syncopated fashion.

Sarah Vaughan witnessed bebop’s impact on audiences when it came to dance: Black audiences paid their highest compliments by dancing. “We tried to educate people. We used to play dances, and there were just a very few who ‘understood’ who would be in a corner, moving forever, while the rest just stood starring at us” (Gillespie and Fraser 1985, 192).

Mary Lou Williams recalls her feelings about dancing to bop, stating, “Right from the start, musical reactionaries have said the worst about Bop. But after seeing the Savoy Ballroom kids fit dances to this kind of music, I felt it was destined to become the new era of music” (Shapiro and Hentoff 1966, 146).

Perhaps one of the biggest mysteries behind Barry Harris and his fellow comrades phrasing may have come indirectly from the influence of Charlie Parker’s own father who was also a tap dancer (Cook 1985). According to an interview with trumpeter and one time
band mate of Parker—Miles Davis—it was the senior Parker’s tap dance rhythms that gave
the young Parker his bebop phrasing. The following quote by Davis exposes this account:

That was one of Charlie Parker's styles, because his father was a tap dancer. Ba-ba-bip da-
dah-d'n-da dee-da-dee-deh – like tap dancers dance! That rhythm, you hadn't heard no shit
like that! Hey, you got it on that tape! Give it to me so I can put something to that rhythm.
And Bird played like that… Nobody wrote like that before. The first time they saw the
music to Moose the Mooche – before that Stravinsky and Alban Berg was the hardest
thing. Lucky Thompson was saying – what? What is – ? The notation! Everybody had to
learn that. (Cook 1985)

On a personal note, I have had the pleasure of attending the Banff school of the arts in
1997 and taught by a West African percussionist named Abraham Adzenyah, who taught the
students and myself the importance of the rhythm before musical note choices. For one week,
we worked with Abraham, and I argue to this date, this has to be one of the most important
lessons I have ever received as a musician as it totally reshaped my outlook for musical
phrasing and approach to rhythmical comping. Furthermore, study participant T-H-RD
recounted a story of how when he studied with the saxophonist Lee Konitz, that all they did
for a week was learning how to feel the music by way of body movements (Participant T-H-
RD interview 2016). In the next section I look at the importance of sexuality and how it may
have influenced Harris’ concept of movement.

**Body Movement and Sexuality**

What is also present in the findings is the sexual nature that this researcher believes to
be fueling how African Americans feel and express all forms of dance music. For example,
the sexual movements that were pervasive in group dancing for African Americans during
rent parties and jook joints, had been adopted into partner dancing and “cemented the
relationship between sexuality and black social dancing” (Robinson 2015, 43). But since
musicians also played at these rent parties and jook joints, I argue that they too must have
been influenced by this wave of sexuality. Thus, reflecting upon the findings, one can see that
Harris has often made reference to sharing the stage with the sensual bebop shake dancer, Baby Scruggs (Bjorn and Gallert 2001; Graves 2010; The New School 2010; Panken 2013; Rupp 2016; Shermer 2015). What is significant about Harris’ comments is that he has stated that the musicians, including himself, would follow the moving tassels attached to Baby Scruggs’ breasts, hips and buttocks as a means of inspiration and, as a means to fuel their own musical phrases as they played (Bjorn and Gallert 2001; Graves 2010; The New School 2010; Shermer 2015; Panken 2013; Rupp 2016). Once again, I argue this to be a crucial point because the sexual overtones of African American music cannot be discounted if one is too understood this music’s multidimensional aspect—a point that has not been considered in literature reviewed on Harris’ concept of movement.

**Poetics and the Visual Arts**

In speaking of bebop musicians, such as the young Barry Harris, I argue that outer-layered aesthetics, such as non-musical forms of expression, would also have to considered as influences upon his conception of “movement.” For example, according to musicologist Guthrie Ramsey, Jr., the African American response to the denial of social justice can be found within the artistic output of “modernity” during the bebop revolution (Ramsey, Jr. 2013, 38). These artistic endeavours delineate not just the aesthetic, but also the social, political and economic landscape of this era (Ramsey 2013). Ramsey, Jr. explains, “Afro modernism is a response to modernity…its concerns are not just aesthetic, but also social, political and economic. Expressive practices such as music, photography, visual art, poetry, and literature both reflect and shape these domains. All these factors intersect in the world of the modern” (Ramsey, Jr. 2013, 38).

This quote highlights that interrelated arts reflect the African American response to what I argue to be a form of “Whiteness,”—that is, socio-political conditions brought forward
by privileged Caucasians contributed to African Americans negotiating dialogical discourses through a multidimensional definition of dissonance. Moving forward, I argue it is crucial to pay attention to other forms of non-musical expression that must have also played a major role in shaping the parameters of bebop’s framework.

For example, if looking at the impressionistic works of Claude Debussy’s preludes, one must take into consideration the influences of Stephane Mallarme and Charles Baudelaire’s poems in shaping Debussy’s onomatopoetic compositions. Similarly, artists such as poet Langston Hughes, who wrote about both the Harlem Renaissance and the Swing Era, capture the symbolism in iconography that would make Dizzy Gillespie and his cohorts stand out from the old guard. When Hughes returned to Harlem in 1941, he heard bebop for the first time and considered it to be a “signal of growing fragmentation in African American culture, with the myth of integration and America’s social harmony jarred by a message of deep discord” (Rampersad 1988, 151).

Little cullud boys with beards
re-bop be-bop mop and stop.
Little cullud boys with fears,
frantic, kick their draftee years
into flatted fifths and flatter beers
that at a sudden change become
sparkling Oriental wines
rich and strange
silken bathrobes with gold twines and
Heilbroner, Crawford, Nat-undreamed-of Lewis combines
in silver thread and diamond notes on
trade-marks inside
Howard coats.
Little cullud boys in berets
oop pop-a-da
horse a fantasy of days
ool ya koo
and dig all plays.

68 For further listening and reading: La Demoiselle Elue (1887-8), the Cinq Poèmes de Charles Baudelaire (1890), Prélude à l'après midi d'un Faune (1892-94) and the opera, Pelléas and Mélisande (1893-95). Debussy Preludes
Another Hughes poem, “Uncle Remus, Uncle Julius and the Negro” (1961, 118), has a different take on the inception of Bebop. The irony of this heavily onomatopoetic poem is evident as it cites the police brutality as an instigator for Bebop:

“You must know where Bop comes from,” said Simple, astonished at my ignorance.
“I do not know,” I said. “Where?”
“From the Police,” said Simple.
“What do you mean from the police?”
“From the police beating Negroes’ heads,” said Simple. “Every time a cop hits a Negro with his billy club, that old club says, ‘BOP! …BE-COP! … MOP! … BOP!’ … That’s where the Bebop came from, beaten right out of some Negro’s head into them horns and saxophones and piano keys that plays it”

Thus, moving forward, I argue that in deconstructing the antecedents of Barry Harris’s concept of movement within the Bebop revolution, there must be an “unpacking” of discursive meanings embedded in all manner of artistic style, musical and otherwise, and an analysis of how these artistic “gestures” signify the world around them. For example, black male musicians of the 1940s streamed self-conscious ideas about who they were in the world through their art (Ramsey, Jr. 2013, 18). In Hughes’s “flatted fifths,” rhythmic disjunction, and sheer velocity of bebop convention, we can find the “Bebop musician” also represented in dance, photography, poetry and the visual arts (Ramsey, Jr. 2013, 18).

Langston Hughes was also among the first cultural critics to connect the musical innovations of Bebop with the sociopolitical realm of modern African American Culture (Ramsey, Jr. 2013, 56). In the forward to his poem, “Montage of a Dream Deferred,” Hughes writes,

In terms of current Afro-American popular music and the sources from which it has progressed—jazz, ragtime, swing, blues, boogie-woogie, and Bebop—this poem on contemporary Harlem, like Bebop, is marked by conflicting changes, sudden nuances, sharp and impudent interjections, broken rhythms, and passages sometimes in the manner
of the jam session, sometimes the popular song, punctuated by the riffs, runs, breaks, and distortions of the music of a community in transition. (Ramsey, Jr. 2013, 56)

Hughes’s poem is monumental in that “it places bebop at the nexus of musical innovation, local culture, and social change—with each factor contributing to the specific language of the music” (Ramsey, Jr. 2013, 56). Scholars such as W.E.B Dubois, and writers such as Langston Hughes are amongst the numerous men and women situating their literature within the historical social-political and aesthetic energies of the blues and jazz music, thereby demonstrating the intercultural influences of music on literature (Jimoh 2002, 12).

As early Bebop musicians were forging their new musical language, a community of black visual artists and writers thrived in New York at the same time. African American artists such as Norman Lewis (1909-79) sought to break through the boundaries of racial representation in their work by moving toward abstraction that oscillated between the abstract and representational styles. This was similar to the way the musicians themselves would improvise (Ramsey, Jr. 2010, 71).

An example of this improvisatory style within visual art can be found in Norman Lewis’s painting “Twilight Sounds.” Critics referred to the work as “a painting unfolding in

---

69 The response of black writers at this time was an insistence “that the improved economy, the commitment of many in the New York City government to legal equality, and the economic and artistic strides made by blacks would soon establish racial equality.” Citing James Weldon Johnson’s assertion of cordial racial relations in an urban context, Greenberg concludes that these writers represented a cultural dominant encapsulated in a vision of “hard work and perseverance... that would destroy forever the negative stereotypes many whites still held about African Americans (Greenberg 1990, 65).
real time—starting off on the blank page like a musician improvising, and as he sees a suitable motif taking shape, [he] swings into it with confidence, plays it for what it is worth, and then when satisfied [that] he has gone the whole way with it, permits it to fade softly out” (McBride 1949, 67).

I also believe that Lewis’s depiction of bebop captures the creative risk-taking within the music that emulates the sense of momentum in bebop. For example, author Ramsey Jr. purports that visual artists’ strokes denote the speed and urgency depicted within the music’s culture that refer to a call for change and reform:

Visual artists’ bold experimentations with color, form, symbolism, and abstraction found a suitable musical analogy in the disjunctive melodies, dramatic rhythmic conceptions, chromaticism, and harmonic experimentations of Bebop. In both the visual and musical realms, abstraction’s practitioners equated it with artistic and social freedom thus causing a feedback loop by influencing later Bebop musicians to move “beyond the conventions of black figuration and toward abstraction” (Ramsey, Jr. 2013, 73). Visual artists such as Charles Alston designed and illustrated the album covers for musicians such as Duke
Ellington and Coleman Hawkins, trying to capture the essence of the “New Negro” within his illustrations (Pierce 2004, 33–38). The “New Negro” is a more outspoken advocate of dignity and refuses to submit quietly to the practices and laws of Jim Crow racial segregation (Locke 1925, 66).

Finally, possibly one of the best examples of the need to learn jazz as an interrelated art comes from biographer Garry Giddins’ 1975 interview with pianist, poet, and dancer Cecil Taylor. In this interview, Taylor explains why one must learn about the socio-cultural factors that have permeated the arts before one can understand how to express oneself musically within the context of tradition. Taylor, as quoted by Giddins states the following:

Musical categories don’t mean anything unless we talk about the actual specific acts that people go through to make music, how one speaks, dances, dresses, moves, thinks, makes love...all these things. We begin with a sound and then say, what is the function of that sound, what is determining the procedures of that sound? Then we can talk about how it motivates or regenerates itself, and that’s where we have tradition. (Giddins 1975, 43)

This quotation by Taylor is significant in that it confirms my belief that to learn traditional jazz, socio-cultural narratives must be considered if individuals are to gain fluency and insight into any art tradition. By further analyzing Taylor’s quotation, I also discovered similarities within this study. For example, Taylor states, “Musical categories don’t mean anything unless we talk about the actual specific acts that people go through to make music,” within this study, I have indicated these acts that people go through to make music as being socio-cultural narratives and “texts.” Next, Taylor refers to “how one speaks” as being part of music; similarly, I have stated this point and refers to it as poetics (slang). From here, Taylor states that “dances,” within this study, I have promulgated the importance of body movement and dance. Additionally, Taylor refers to the way one “dresses, moves” and “thinks” as being part of the composite of music; similarly, I refer to this as “theatrics.” Finally, Taylor states,
“makes love,” as being intertwined in the genetics of music; I have also mentioned this sexual aspect of the music with Harris and his colleagues.

**Answering Research Question 2**

To what extent can the scope of current harmonic and improvisational literatures on movement be expanded upon—showing the concept of movement as a multidimensional tool for improvisation, and as an aid for the expansion of harmonic and rhythmic prolongation?

**Expanding Barry Harris’ Concept of Movement**

To expand upon Barry Harris’ concept of movement, I took note of the past literature on Harris’ methodologies, such as Rees (2005) that only makes a minuscule reference to Harris’ idea that all jazz phrasing should be the product of an overlap in time signatures; for example, 6 beats within a duration of 4 beats (Harris Workshops 1994-2010). Even when I heard Harris describe this concept, he had not elaborated much further than that of Rees’ published literature—stating only that he believed Charlie Parker was one of the true instigators of this concept (Harris Workshops 1994-2010). Harris did however state that “all musicians should aim to adopt Parker’s sense of phrasing”70 if they want to “swing” (Harris Workshops 1994-2010).

Unfortunately, the problem I have with this thinking of 6 quarter note triplets within a measure of 4/4 is that there is a greater tendency for phrases to start on the downbeat of either beats ‘1’ and ‘3’—the strong beats in 4/4 time—while also ending at the weak parts of the beat—beats ‘2’ and ‘4.’ If musicians were to adopt this type thinking, their rhythmical phrases would become somewhat mechanical and predictable as a result of starting on the strong parts of the measure and, most likely, ending their phrases on the weak beats of the measure.

---

70 I have coined Parker’s phrasing as “the Parker ‘6.’”
To overcome this obstacle, I have adopted a way of phrasing borrowed from the influence of West African rhythms, but, with a slight alteration—that is, instead of thinking in 4/4 with an underlining 6 quarter note triplets that starts on beats ‘1’ and ‘3,’ I am suggesting to the aspiring musician to displace where the six-quarter note triplets begin. By shifting the emphasis on quarter note triplets that would usually start on beats ‘1’ and ‘3’—the strong beats of a measure, and now displacing them to start on beats ‘2’ and ‘4’ of a measure—the weak beats of a measure, individuals would now be thinking dominantly in ‘3’ with an underlining pulse of ‘4.’ To this end, I argue that by consciously thinking of quarter note triplets that start on beats ‘2’ and ‘4’ of a measure instead of beats ‘1’ and ‘3’ of a measure, musicians gain a greater sense of how West African music emphasises the weak beats, (Iverson 2016; Nettl 2008) creating a string of unpredictable musical phrases that spill over the bar lines, as well as fostering an ultimate sense of syncopation. In this regard, there are many advantages to using this type of phrasing developed by this researcher.

First, although Harris does touch on playing “6 over 4” in his workshops within the context of “movement,” my expansion of his concept is more advantageous for aspiring musicians to gain authenticity, originality and nuance within their phrasing. Additionally, as we shall see, not only does my expansion of Harris’ concept of movement act as an aid to students in the development of musical phrasing, it also will give the aspiring student’s musical phrasing a sense of elasticity—harmonic and rhythmical dissonance.

**Rhythmical Dissonance**

According to DeVeaux (1997), “the evolution in jazz is about rhythm” (37). Thus, to first expand upon Harris concept of movement, I built upon Harris’ rhythmical concept that was originally inspired by Charlie Parker’s aforementioned sense of phrasing—a feat not realized by any of the authors that have written about Harris’ methodologies. For example, in author
Howard Rees’s publication of The Barry Harris Workshop: Part Two (2005), Rees neglects to flesh out any conceptual meaning, nor does he attempt to make an interpretation of Parker’s concept, even though he references it. In fact, Rees’s musical example (Example 9) is extremely limited in the sense that it only displays six quarter note triplets in 4/4 time, and then states to the user, “Feel ‘6’ while playing in 4/4” (Rees 2005, 72-73).

**Example 9.** Howard Rees’s explanation of “6 over 4” (Rees 2005, 72-73).

Because of this general scarcity of information about Parker’s rhythmical phrasing, I argue that there still exists a lack of understanding of Parker’s explanation of his jazz phrasing to Barry Harris. Therefore, finding information about Parker’s phrasing for my own study would be crucial not only as a key to modern jazz phrasing, but also as a precedent for understanding what Harris, his colleagues (and now by virtue of my system, me) believe to be the most important factor governing any kind of music—rhythm.

Harris explains his thoughts on the importance of rhythm within bebop to interviewer Daniele Fedele, saying,

Bebop is more than just talking about music, in Bebop you got to talk about rhythm, you have to talk about syncopation, about knowing ands and not using ands as pickups to get to the beat. It’s got to do something with drummers; they got to know rhythm and syncopation. That’s what music is about, rhythm is first. I try to make people always practice in time, try to keep the time going, and think about rhythm all the time. I think Bird changed some of the rhythm thing, some of his ideas were played before him but Bird changed rhythm, he used great drummers, he made them sound different. He had great rhythm, Bud Powell had great rhythm, and Dizzy. They make you realize that you got to be rhythmic yourself; you have to act as if you were the swingiest person in the world. (Fedele 1994, e-interview)
When students, myself included, have asked Harris in the past to go into more detail about what I have coined as the “Parker ‘6,’” Harris would only reply, “Parker thinks in 6 over 4” (Harris Workshops 1994-2010).

In hearing this response from Harris, I was inclined to think of 6-quarter note triplets over a 4/4 time signature, as shown in Example 10. Unfortunately, Harris’s answer and lack of explanation was just as vague as that of Howard Rees. To fully understand what Harris meant in relation to Parker’s thinking in ‘6 over 4,’ I had to go back to my library of recordings and transcriptions of Parker’s compositions that I compiled over the course of twenty years, as well as analyze some of the improvisations made by musicians who influenced Parker.

**Example 10.** The author’s initial interpretation of Parker’s “6 over 4” as promulgated by Harris and Rees (art courtesy of Jon70 2009).

To my dismay, after transcribing countless Charlie Parker, Art Tatum, and Lester Young solos, I have yet to see or hear any major difference between Parker or some of his well-known influences such as Tatum and Young, or from other jazz dignitaries who, in my

---

71 This question has been asked of Harris by others, but mainly by me, but met by the same arcane response.
opinion, also think in triplets. Even though I purport that triplets of any nature represent an important contributor to the feeling of syncopation (when accented appropriately within the triplet), I somehow did not feel that this rhythm of quarter note triplets—phrased by starting on beats ‘1’ and ‘3’—constituted what Parker or his colleagues had in mind. Thus, in my opinion, and after transcribing and playing along to numerous Parker solos, I argue that Parker’s accents are being placed freely on any subdivision of the beat, making for a more compelling syncopation within the musical framework. In this regard, and as we shall see, my system for phrasing also incorporates the emphasis of odd and unpredictable parts of a measure by either starting a musical phrase or “comping” pattern in this manner.

Re-interpreting the “Parker ‘6’” as a Tool for Musical Phrasing and Prolongation

To delve even deeper into expanding upon Harris “movement” and the “Parker ‘6,”’ I first examined trumpeter Wynton Marsalis interview conducted by jazz pianist Ethan Iverson on the topic of “rhythm” and playing “6 over 4.” An excerpt from this interview is transcribed below.

_Ethan Iverson (EI):_ It seems to me that there is an academy of rhythm in jazz and American music. One thing I’ve felt more and more as I’ve gotten older is that people don’t understand the basic question, “What is jazz rhythm?” Or: “What is this music that comes from the African Diaspora?” Congo Square is a very explicit message about this academy.

---

72 Some examples might be musicians such as Erroll Garner, Louis Armstrong, Thelonious Monk, and Billy Holliday.
73 Interview courtesy of _Do The Math_ (Iverson 2016) and can be found in its entirety at https://ethaniverson.com/interviews/interview-with-wynton-marsalis-part-1/)
Wynton Marsalis (WM): Mm-hmm. Well, it’s all of the musics that have a rhythm that’s a combination of 4 and 3. They are related technically. It all comes from that kind of African mother clave, then our shuffle is added in.

WM: The 3 rhythm is small and the 4 rhythm is big rhythm in the jazz language. Whereas in the African music, the 3 rhythm is the big rhythm that you hear. The 4 rhythm is the background rhythm. (Well, it’s a 6 but you know what I mean.) When they are playing, they are hearing both of the times, and they are playing both of the times. But they swing in the lower time.

EI: Barry Harris told me once that he thought Charlie Parker constantly played in 4 and 6 at the same time. That it was in there somewhere…

WM: It’s in everybody’s music. Billie Holiday is the most pronounced one…

EI: Oh, you think so?

WM: Well, that I’ve heard of the jazz musicians. If we put on a Billie Holiday record and we tap quarter note triplets, a lot of her phrasing will line exactly up with those triplets. Put her music on and tap out a quarter note triplet. She’s always in that quarter note time. “Sailboat in the moonlight with you…” With our music, it’s more playing against the ground rhythm. We set the ground rhythm up and we play with the rhythms in the context of the ground rhythm. Monk is a great example of that. Or for today, Marcus Roberts. They both set up the ground rhythm and play a lot of really inventive rhythms that will resolve in the context of the ground rhythm. And this is like African music with the exception of the fact that African musicians are playing in the two times at once. In our music, it’s kind of over here in the lower of the 4 time. We’re playing in the upper three – if you got to be technical about it – we’re not hearing it like that of course. But we’re super-imposing all these rhythms and melodies on top of it and trying to resolve them with a certain type of feeling in time.
EI: It’s certainly fascinating to listen to the recorded history of jazz and hear how the beat gets colored a little differently as people learn more information or discover what feels right to them.

WM: Right. The change is a gradual softening of the triplet. But somebody like Monk didn’t do that.

Iverson’s interview with Marsalis provides the reader with an insider lens on the contributions and influence of West African rhythm in the context of jazz phrasing. The musicians mentioned in the interview, such as Parker, Harris, Holliday and Monk, are all African American and as such, their musical ancestry is likely bound to African American slavery and the ancestral rhythms of Africa as a reoccurring theme. Furthermore, these influences were likely passed on by generations through oral histories, or, as previously mentioned in the literature reviewed—Sheldrake’s concept of “morphic resonance”—organisms inherit memories and habits from previous organisms (Nelson 1999; Sheldrake 2009).

Marsalis states that jazz musicians think in ‘4’ with an underlining feeling of ‘3’; this may be true for some jazz musicians but I argue that Marsalis’ comment may be an over-generalization, as he does not think it applies to the consensus of all jazz musicians. For example, musicians such as Charlie Parker and especially Dizzy Gillespie seemed to place emphasis on beats at any given part of the measure and as such, Marsalis’ statement becomes an over-generalization as there were a host of musicians who followed in their suit. I looked to saxophonist Steve Coleman’s seminal exposition of analysis of Charlie Parker’s improvisations in order to shed more light on this matter.

After examining Steve Coleman’s analysis of Parker improvisations, I gained an understanding of Parker’s phrasing and what others may have failed to realize in relation to
the juxtaposition of musical metres. For example, in Coleman’s analysis of Thelonious Monk’s composition, “52nd Street Theme,” Coleman makes the following observations between Max Roach on drums and Parker on alto sax.

Max sets up this hip transition with the single snare hit right after Parker's repeated blues exclamation, then two snare drum hits in between Yard's phrases, followed by one of those funky ratios, this time 4 against 6, that is Max's bass drum playing the 4 against the cut time 6 of the beat, again timed to end on the measure before the top. I tend to think of this kind of playing as targeting, a technique where you calculate (using either feel, logic or both) the destination point in time where you want to resolve your rhythm, a kind of rhythmic voice leading. I alluded to Bird doing something similar above. (Coleman 2014, E-blog)

Therefore, by following what Coleman refers to as “rhythmic voice leading,” I argue that taking the original figure in Example 11 and re-writing it in its retrograde form (backwards) casts a new light of rhythmical possibilities. By making this rhythmical alteration, one is left with the quarter-note triplets that start on the weak parts of the measure, beats ‘2’ and ‘4,’ as seen in Example 11. The dark red lines in between the grand staff represent the quarter note triplets that are now displaced, starting on the downbeats of beats ‘2’ and ‘4’ of each eighth-note triplet grouping.

**Example 11.** Retrograde of Figure 10. That is the author’s reinterpretation and expansion theory of Parker’s “6 over 4” with quarter note triplets starting on beats 2 and 4 (art courtesy of Jon70 2009).

This phrasing of displacement and feeling quarter note triplets on beats ‘2’ and ‘4’ demonstrates five distinctive characteristics of my theory. First, it yields an extremely
augmented perception of syncopation, by accenting the weak beats of a 4/4 measure with the quarter note triplets starting on beats ‘2’ and ‘4.’ Second, it acts as a tool for perceiving rhythmical prolongation, as the quarter note triplet figure never resolves to the end of the bar, nor does it start at the begging of the bar. Third, it functions as a natural aid for back phrasing for all instrumentalists during improvisation by outlining ‘6’ note groupings versus the common ‘8’ note groupings found in what I argue to be common jazz vernacular “eighth note solos” (I further propose that musicians will feel the propulsion of playing eighth notes while perpetuating the “lazy” feel of the quarter notes⁷⁴). Fourthly, it is an excellent aid for comping instruments that can now accent the odd binary groupings within a 6 over 4 feel (an example of this odd binary grouping would be an instrumentalist accenting beats ‘1’ and ‘3,’ or ‘5’ and ‘6,’ or any other combination, thinking of the 6 quarter note triplets as displaced, and starting on beats ‘2’ and ‘4’). Finally, and most importantly, it is an excellent aid for prolongation of phrasing, by acting as a catalyst to promote ideas that do not start or finish at the beginning or ending of measures, but rather start and end somewhere in the odd spots of the measure, thereby creating a natural sense of playing over the “bar-lines.”

**Harmonic Reductions of Chord Types**

To further expand upon the improvisational nature of Barry Harris’ concept of movement, I first considered the possibility of how every chord quality could be derived from or reduced to the product of either a tonic functioning (thesis) or dominant functioning chord (antithesis). For example, in the literature from Ben-Hur (2004), Bicket (2001), Kingstone (2009), Marijt (2014), and Rees (1994-2005), Harris has stated that whether improvising or comping, individuals should be thinking in terms of movement. What the previously

---

⁷⁴ I also highly recommend that students use a metronome that is set up to “click” quarter note triplets starting on beats ‘2’ and ‘4’ to further develop my technique of rhythmical prolongation.
mentioned literature neglects to identify is what exactly are the chord qualities that are being moved. To answer this question, I examined Harris’ Major 6 bebop scale and noted that it is an amalgamation of a tonic functioning chord—a Major 6, and a diminished 7th chord that is acting as a surrogate dominant functioning chord (Example 12).

**Example 12.** Harris’ Major 6 bebop scale that is a synthesis of a Major 6 chord and a diminished 7th chord. The diminished 7th chord is acting as a V7b9 constructed a major 3rd above the tonic of the dominant yielding a G7b9 (Rees 2001,48).

If one wants to move these two harmonic structures, then one must first extract the notes under the odd numbers C E G A, which will yield the tonic functioning C6 chord. Similarly, extracting the notes under the even numbers D F Ab B yields the dominant functioning diminished 7th chord which is acting as a surrogate dominant 7th b9 chord (Example 13).

**Example 13.** My depiction of Harris’s “Major 6 diminished scale.”

```
1  2  3  4  5  6  7  8  1
C  D  E  F  G  Ab  A  B  C
```

By using the facile movement of these two simple structures referred to as “tonic” and “dominant,” and moving them up and down Harris’s “Major 6 diminished” scale (Example 14), a sense of tension or dissonance will oscillate with consonance or a sense of resolution. This is what Barry Harris refers to as, and what I argue to be, one facet of movement Rees 1998, 60).

Harmonic Reductions for Improvisation

For improvisational purposes, I make the argument that since Harris’ harmonic concept of movement can be viewed as an oscillation of binaries (tension and resolution), many chord types can be reduced to being the product of a tonic functioning (thesis) or dominant functioning chord (antithesis). For example, I view all subdominant functioning chords as suspensions on the dominant chords that they precede. Thus, in the key of ‘C’ Major, a F Major or F minor chord becomes part of the dominant functioning G7 chord (synthesis)—adding the alterations of a $\flat 9$ (F minor/ G root); $\natural 9$ and a suspended 4th (F Major/ G root) to a G7 chord. I also reduces all diminished 7th chords to equating as dominant functioning chords with a $\flat 9$. Thus, in Allie Wrubel’s 1937 composition “Gone with The Wind,” there are diminished chords apparent that students may view as just “diminished chords” and as such, they might consider using the octatonic scale as a means for improvisation (sometimes referred to as a the half-whole or whole-half diminished scale).

Conversely, I have suggested to view every diminished chord as a dominant functioning chord in (Example 15).

For example, in “Gone with the Wind,” with regards to beats 3 and 4 of measure 2, the E diminished 7th chord (marked in Green box) is acting a C7b9 chord, and thus, by toniciization, the implied chord—C7b9 (antithesis) is actually approaching F minor (thesis

---

75 Tonicization is the treatment of a pitch other than the overall tonic (the "home note" of a piece) as a temporary tonic in a composition (Benward and Saker 2003).
and “temporary” tonic). Since I view all subdominant functioning chords as suspensions on the dominant chord they approach (synthesis—and in this case, the F minor is acting as a suspension on the Bb7 chord in measures 1 and 3), individuals have many options for improvisation. They can improvise over C7b9 with Harris’ “dominant 7 diminished scale” and then approach F minor as is if it was a ‘I’ minor chord—using notes from Harris’ “minor 6 diminished scale,” or they can view F minor as what I have suggested to be as a suspension on the dominant 7th chord that it is approaching in measures 1 and 3. If individuals choose to take this latter route, then measures 1 and 3 would be viewed as a full measure of Bb7, and as such, various scales that target the dominant 7th chord could be implied.\textsuperscript{76}

As the song progresses, there is a modulation to a G major at measure 4. When the G/B chord presents itself in beats 1 and 2 of measure 6, followed by a Bb diminished 7th chord (enclosed in square), I propose an alternative to how one should treat the Bb diminished 7th chord in terms of improvisation. Primarily, I view the b3 diminished chord (Bb diminished 7) as a ‘I’ diminished 7th chord (G diminished 7) and as such applies his rule that all diminished 7 chords could be viewed as a dominant 7 (b9) chords in first inversion. In this manner, the original Bb diminished 7th chord is acting as a G diminished 7th chord that, in part, is acting as a first inversion Eb dominant chord on beats 3 and 4 of measure 6 (that is a semitone away from the dominant functioning D7 chord found in measure 7). Thus, individuals would be free to choose from a selection of various scales to improvise over an Eb dominant chord—followed by the D dominant functioning chord.

Similarly, the same type of harmonic progression occurs at measure 9 as did in measure 6. In my opinion, the G minor chord acts as an Eb Major 7th chord played over G in

\textsuperscript{76} Scales such as the “altered” scale, “harmonic” minor scale of the ‘I’ chord, “whole tone” scale, Lydian b7, “bebop dominant 7\textsuperscript{th}” and “octatonic” scale as some choices.
the bass, and as such, the key has modulated back to the original key of Eb Major. The next chord is the F# diminished 7th, which, by using my rule that all diminished chords could be viewed as dominant 7 (b9) chords in first inversion, is functioning as B7 (b9). Thus, I view the original F# diminished chord as being an D# diminished 7th chord that is an inversion of a dominant functioning chord found a Major 3rd below—B7(b9). By viewing the F# diminished 7th chord in this way, individuals are free to “tweak” the harmonic chord that is being implied (B7b9) and then chose how they wish to proceed in their improvisation accordingly. For example, when measure 10 occurs in “Gone with The Wind,” the chordal instrument such as piano or guitar might play a B9 chord with no b9 and as such, the individual could play a mixolydian scale or Lydian b7. If the chordal instrument had chosen to play a ‘B’ augmented chord, then the improviser could use Harris’ dominant 7th b5 bebop scale (incorporating a ♮7, ♭7, and ♭5), or individuals could use a “wholetone” scale that also targets the augmented 5th (♭13).

**Example 15.** Allie Wrubel’s 1937 composition “Gone with the Wind,” mm 1-8.
Example 15. (continued).

Juxtaposition of Binary Oppositions for Improvisation

Another method for improvising based on Harris’ model of movement comes from tonicization—juxtaposing two binary oppositions of tonic function (thesis) and dominant functioning chords (antithesis) for improvisation. In this light, I reinterpret every chord as a surrogate tonic chord or temporary tonic, and as such, I always view the structure of a song as being comprised of only tonic functioning chords and dominant functioning chords, and any other type of chord, such as a diminished 7th, m7b5, minor 7th, and augmented, would be a taxonomy of either a tonic or dominant family.

By treating the chord of the moment as a ‘I’ chord, individuals could blend in notes from that chord’s dominant as a means for creating tension and release—a combination of thesis and antithesis resulting in synthesis.77 For example, the first chord of “Gone with The Wind” is a F minor chord. By treating this chord as a ‘I’ tonic minor chord instead of a subdominant functioning II chord, individuals could juxtapose notes from its dominant (C7b9) and use this to build tension before playing notes from F minor (that in my opinion, is acting as a suspension on Bb7 dominant functioning chord). In this manner, in the first measure, an individual would be free to improvise using C7b9 over the F minor chord. When

77 See Chapter 2 and 4 for a detailed description, or see the next sub section that follows.
the Bb7 chord appears, individuals could create even greater tension by viewing Bb7 as a temporary tonic, and as such, utilize its dominant (F7b9) for the sake of creating harmonic tension, finally resolving to Bb7 material.

Conversely, individuals could skip this step and, when they see the subdominant functioning chord Fm7, just improvise Bb7 for the entirety of measure one. I view the subdominant chords as suspensions on dominant chords, and in this case, the subdominant functioning Fm7 chord is acting as a suspension on the dominant functioning Bb7 chord.

**Synthesizing Thesis and Antithesis as an Expansion of Harris’ Harmonic Concept**

In Chapter 2 and Chapter 4, I made reference to Harris’ harmonic concept of movement as being what author Rose Rosengard Subotnik refers to as “hierarchal binary oppositions,” that is, opposing entities that can be thought of as related, and also that one entity can provisionally assume to have priority over the other (Subotnik 1996, 62). In most scenarios of functional harmony, the tonic takes precedence over the subdominant or dominant functioning chords as a result of being the point of resolution (Caplin 2013, 9–10), but in Harris’ concept of movement, I argue the hierarchal priority can be heard as reversed. By this, I am suggesting that the dominant functioning chord is prevalent throughout—incorporating what author Estelle Jorgensen refers to as synthesis—“the blending or melding of opposites, fusing thesis and antithesis into a new entity” (Jorgensen 2003, 52). By taking the dominant functioning chord (antithesis) and fusing it with the tonic functioning chord (thesis), the listener has a sense that the common progression such as a dominant resolving to a tonic—also known as a perfect cadence (V-I), has now been altered to a sonority that now incumbents unrest and turmoil (Example 16).
**Example 16.** Chords that are a synthesis of tonic and dominant functions (Rees 1998).

To summarize, Harris’s model for movement has become the fulcrum for my concept of harmonic expansion and rhythmical prolongation, and can be broken down into two different functioning tonic and dominant chords. Moreover, these chords can be simultaneously synthesized to form original-sounding harmonic structures. Additionally, my expansion of Harris’ theory rhythmically displaces where those harmonies are placed compared to Rees’ (2005) publication on Harris’ methodologies. Furthermore, my theory for rhythmical prolongation, which is built upon what Harris has claimed to be Charlie Parker’s concept, has never been deconstructed by any of the authors reviewed in the literature, and as such, has never been clearly explained. I have shown that Charlie Parker’s concept of playing in ‘6’ could be reinterpreted as a retrograde of ‘6’ triplets over 4/4 time starting on beats ‘2’ and ‘4.’ By expanding upon Harris’ concept of movement, I have given musicians an alternative perspective of phrasing that naturally targets syncopation, harmonic expansion, and rhythmical prolongation.

**Limitations: Harris Concept of Movement**

Unfortunately, the scope of this study does not touch upon the physiological nature of the human ear, as I am not an expert in this field, and researching such a scholarly endeavour would exceed the limits and parameters of this study. For example, what might be considered for future studies is the impact of how the human ear perceives dissonance—individuals from
different cultures and societies that may perceive certain dissonances as being concord sonorities or vice versa because of social conditioning.

**Answering Research Question 3**

To what extent can the mixed methodologies of quantitative and qualitative research analysis from the participants (educators in post-secondary jazz institutions across the GTA) reveal a lack of African American “narratives” in their own learning of jazz and, subsequently, their pedagogy, as compared to Harris’ learning of the music and his pedagogy?

I measured educational gaps in African American narratives across GTA post-secondary jazz curricula by turning to author and musicologist professor Christopher Small and the definition of his term musicking. In his book of the same title (1998), Small argues that music should be viewed as an action, and when referring to music, one could look at music as being a verb, as in, “to music” (Small 1998, 13). Thus, to take part in any capacity within a musical performance, whether by performing, by listening, by rehearsing or practicing, by providing material for performance or by dancing, individuals are ‘musicking’ (Small 1998, 13). In this manner, Small’s requirements for the quantification of musicking will help frame how I view the lack of African American narratives in post-secondary jazz curricula across the GTA by contrasting it with this study’s findings of what constitutes as being the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of movement.

For example, unlike Barry Harris and his colleagues, when examining the data from the interviews conducted for the purpose of this study, the high majority of all the instructors and administrators had little experience with or exposure to other non-musical art forms while learning jazz music. Also, 85.7% of the administrators, and 80% of the instructors learned jazz in a high school band where their playing might have been heavily influenced by
an Western art teaching model that is more conducive to learning classical music. Furthermore, the research data also revealed that when the majority of the instructors (93.3%) learned jazz at a more serious level, they learned it within post-secondary institutions in the GTA that specialized in jazz—and similarly, these instructors have also adopted an Western art teaching model in their pedagogical delivery. Possibly the most crucial finding from the interviews is that the overwhelming majority of all the administrators (57.1%) and instructors (83.3%) had little to no experience or exposure to African American narratives because they did not participate in interrelated arts such as dance, poetry/ scat, visual and theatrical arts while learning jazz. This is a concern because from the literature, authors Baraka (1968), Caponi (1999, Crease (2008), Malone (1996), Stearns and Stearns (1994) and Welsh-Asante (1996) have all stressed the importance of viewing music as being one and the same as other non-musical arts. For example, this quotation from ethnomusicologist John Blacking gives the reader insight into how some cultures have always viewed all the arts as being interrelated: “…there are many societies that have no word for ‘music’ and do not isolate it conceptually from dance, drama, ritual, or costume” (Blacking 1987, 3).

If Blacking’s viewpoint is to be realized, and if students are to be able to get insight and fluency into a more potent and raw form of jazz lexicon, then I argue that institutions, administrators and bureaucratic hierarchies must be willing to allow for the synthetization of all forms of the arts into their jazz curricula and pedagogy. As previously mentioned, Barry Harris and his colleagues, such as Billy Higgins, Randy Weston and Hank Jones, have stated that an exposure to and participation in all of the arts was how they and other African Americans learned jazz, that “all the arts were combined” (JALC 1992, 2010, 2011).

Another crucial factor that was apparent in the research findings is that all of the participants in the study never experiencing playing music in an African American Baptist or
“Black” church. This is an important point because the literature reviewed and the findings of Ihave shown that Barry Harris and his peers Bud Powell, Thelonious Monk, Randy Weston, Ray Bryant, and Hank Jones, were by-products of the ‘Black’ church (Bereger 2005; Berliner 1994; Graves 2010; JALC 2010; JALC 2011; Panken 2013). It is my belief that since none of the participants were exposed to the concept of “African American-ness” that is prevalent in the African American church, an Western art aesthetic would have been adopted, and thus grew into a separate form of jazz aesthetic that I have referred to as the “erasure of African American-ness.”

“African American-ness” Versus the Erasure of “African American-ness”

“African American-ness.” From his publication Blowin’ Hot and Cool (2006), John Gennari cites author and critic Amiri Baraka in his criticism of Caucasian performers, scholars and music critics—promulgating that whites tend to view the music as an act of appreciation, rather than understanding the cultural conditions that produced it…they approached the music as an “object” or artifact unrelated to society, history or the black musicians that created it (Baraka 1968, 11–20; Gennari 2006, 271). Baraka further purports that since each note meant something, “outsiders” would have to delve deeper within the lives of these black musicians to seek the music’s true intrinsic meaning before they could really begin to understand them, let alone emulate them (Baraka 1968, 11–20; Gennari 2006, 271). This statement by Baraka is crucial as I argue it sets a precedent for this study—that is, in order to understand jazz music on a deeper level, one must delve deeper into the socio-cultural factors that impacted the originators of this music.

From a “music as culture” lens, I have attempted to summarize what I argue to be the socio-cultural texts and narratives in which Barry Harris and his colleagues participated during their upbringing. By using media collected from numerous Barry Harris workshops
over a twenty-year span, observing the published video interviews, and finally, my telephone interview with Harris himself in 2014, I have come to the following conclusion and feel confident of what constitutes as the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of “movement.”

Since these antecedents are not exclusive to any race, any individual could be exposed to them. But, as noted, it is the combination of how these antecedents were cultivated and used simultaneously as a multidimensional aid in the learning and experiencing of jazz, that led to, in part, my definition of “African American-ness.” For example, Harris has always claimed that “he and others learned the music while dancing to the music” (Clasijazz TV 2014; Graves 2010; JALC 1992; The New School 2010 Panken 2013). What I found compelling is that Harris makes use of dance, visual arts, theatrical arts and poetics in his classes, workshops and performances. For example, during his workshops, Harris is very animated and uses a lot of physical gestures to get his point across—theatrics. This type of pedagogy is typical of Harris as he may have assimilated this type of theatrics while performing with players such as Dizzy Gillespie, who counted off songs with a gestural dance (Anderson 1947), or by witnessing the countless times that Thelonious Monk stomped his feet on the ground in an animated, dance-like manner to count off a song (Graves 2010), or from his performances with Lester Young during which Young counted off tempos by using only shoulder shrugs (Graves 2010).

I also strongly feel that growing up in the black church has shaped Harris’ delivery of his workshops and masterclasses. For example, I have often witnessed Harris’ theatrics firsthand. Like a church pastor, Harris is very vocal and animated, leading his disciples into a sermon that champions good (traditional jazz) over evil (non-traditional jazz). I also draw similarities between Harris’ actions—his pedagogical delivery and pontification, to that of a Christ figure. By this, I mean that his mandate is to save the world from the “sins” of non-
traditional jazz, thus Harris spreads his gospel by travelling the world and giving workshops, hoping to recruit new “disciples”.

Upon reflection, Harris’ view of traditional jazz is similar to how one would view religion; pre-bebop music acting as sacred texts, and bebop music as his gospel. As such, he is irate when his religious dogmas are challenged. For example, in the video Spirit of Bebop (Rhapsody Films 2004), Harris is seen speaking to a group who had just finished playing at his jazz club in Harlem, “The Jazz Cultural Theatre.” In his comments, Harris is very dramatic and outraged that the performers were playing forms of jazz that had no antecedents to tradition in his club. Thus, I argue that Harris’ scolding of these young musicians is similar to the manner in which Jesus Christ lost his temper when witnessing patrons selling goods in the church (Mathew 1997, 21–12).

Conversely, in examining the data from the GTA participant interviews, none of the participants had experiences connected to the black church. Thus, it is highly unlikely that any of these individuals’ musical upbringing and socio-cultural conditioning is even remotely related to Harris’ experiences, or what this researcher has referred to as “African American-ness” Thus, when contrasted with Harris’ account, the participants’ view of traditional jazz or bebop may not be as highly revered, or even considered to be that of religious or sacred music.

On personal note, and in relation to “African American-ness” and Harris’ use of theatrics on and off the bandstand, a prime example unfolded in the Netherlands in 2003 that also involved myself. For the final concert at The Hague Conservatory, Barry Harris had asked me to act out on the stage with him, portraying two men—“players”—trying to pick up women on a street corner—all while the house band on the stage played to a very fast tempo of “Cherokee.” At first, I was very embarrassed and scared to go through with this ordeal, but
then I realized this was part of the musical environment he was exposed to growing up. For example, as noted in the findings, Harris always cites in his workshops that people danced to bebop and sometimes professional “shake dancers” would have tassels over certain body parts and move them accordingly to the music—sexually (Graves 2010; JALC 1992; Panken 2013). Harris further states that the musicians were not only focused on the skimpy outfits of these women, they found that it also fuelled them to play with more vigour (Barry Harris interviewed by Aaron Graves 2010; Harris Workshops 1996-2010).

In 2004, I also observed another demonstration of Harris’ theatrics (Harlem, New York) during a Jazz Mobile concert that featured himself. The Jazz Mobile was a truck that had a band playing within the trailer and made its way through the streets of Harlem. It was popular with festivals, “drawing crowds of different artists such as poets, dancers and painters to intertwine their talents into one whole—for public display.” In the last fifty years, Harris has been a staple performer in Harlem, playing on the Jazz Mobile. The jazz mobile consists of a band playing traditional type of jazz in the back of a cut-out trailer truck. When the jazz mobile makes its way through the streets of Harlem, it draws crowds of people following it, just like children following an ice cream truck. The jazz mobile makes its final stop at Marcus Garvey Park and the concert continues at a higher intensity—drawing on all types of artists to participate—dancers, actors, visual artists and spoken word poets. This type of scenario was also akin to what author LeRoi Jones (Amiri Baraka) witnessed in the 1960s—Harlem as a “melting pot of arts that were always being expressed universally” (Baraka 2012, 308). Similarly, I argue that the interrelated arts have continued to influence Harris, as he uses all of these arts in his workshops, and in his performances.

On a personal note, I have never seen so many talented people dancing to bebop in an unconventional manner. I argue the dancing complimented the music by lending to it
anthropomorphic human characteristics that embody the “offbeat” eccentric rhythms and erratic dissonant harmonies of the musicians themselves. On a side note, I was especially moved by the rhythms of the “spoken word” beat poets that I came across in Harlem. These men and women spoke in a manner that sounded more akin to the unpredictability of bebop’s erratic rhythms from compositions such as “Evidence” (Thelonious Monk) or “Un Poco Loco” (Earl “Bud” Powell). Amiri Baraka makes a correlation between music and poetry stating that “black poetry in the main …means to show its musical origins…just as Blues is on one level, a verse form…Black poetry begins as music running into words…poetry is jazz” (Baraka 2012, 308).

I have also never witnessed anywhere else within Canada, and especially within the GTA, this type of marriage between the arts and jazz music. By blending poetry, dancing, and theatrics with the music, I argue the musical output of Harris and his colleagues takes upon the attributes of “multidimensionality”—that is, all art forms coming together as aggregates to form a gestalt—“African American-ness.” This will forever remain as one of the most powerful experiences of my life.

The Erasure of “African American-ness” (GTA Post-Secondary Jazz Curricula)

According to the findings, there were recommendations from some study participants on the topic of changing present GTA post-secondary jazz curricula. What was quite interesting was that in their experiences of learning jazz music, some of the administrators and instructors were making suggestions that were already realized by African American jazz artists such as Barry Harris. By this, I mean that the some of the GTA administrators and instructors had made suggestions similar to how African Americans originally experienced jazz before it became institutionalized. For example, the data from participants H-LB, T-RD, H-RD, and T-BD, stated that since the overwhelming percentage of professors around the
GTA are non-African American, their “frame of reference” of experiencing and learning ‘Black’ jazz music from its traditional roots is non-existent—a notion that is also reflected in the literature by authors (Baraka 1968) and Gennari (2006) on the challenges Caucasian pedagogues face in teaching jazz pedagogy. Furthermore, participants T-RD, H-RD, and T-BD, have stated there are many troubling issues that have contributed to what they believe to be defunct jazz paradigms void of African American influence. For example, participant T-H-RD, feels that unless individuals (instructors and students) are willing to learn the roots of jazz, they will miss a generous portion of the jazz nomenclature.

According to interview participant H-T-RD.

I feel that if you ignore the pre-bebop stuff, especially Louis Armstrong and especially people like Lester Young and Coleman Hawkins, then you’re missing a huge part of the equation. You have to go back with Armstrong and check out the Hot 5 and Hot 7 recordings. You got to go back and check out Bix Beiderbecke and Frankie Trambauer to understand where cool jazz came from. (GTA participant H-T-RD 2016)

Similarly, interview participant M-HD feels that individuals who do not look to the genesis of jazz from its beginnings will fail at being innovators since their innovations would be built on no foundation (GTA participant M-HD). Also, when I asked M-HD his thoughts on the importance of learning early traditional jazz, the study participant answered, “I’ll answer this with a quote from what McCoy Tyner said at a clinic: ‘The deeper the roots, the taller the tree.’ So, if you’re a blues player, you have to listen to Robert Johnson or how will you expect to get any depth in your playing if it only goes so back to the generation before you” (GTA participant M-HD 2016).

Another concern was mentioned by participant T-RD, who felt that “Canadian jazz musicians are caught in the middle of American and European culture,” and he also stated that “a lot of the time I feel that there is a non-committal feeling that I get from the Canadian culture as a whole, and it translates into the music. What it is, if I had to quantify it in a way
that I could describe it in jazz terms is—are we swinging or are we doing this sort of ECM thing? I’m not sure, I think we’re somewhere in the middle…” (GTA participant T-RD 2016).

The citation from T-RD solidifies one of the concerns of this interview that musicians in the GTA (administrators and instructors included) have a strong affinity for music that is connected to an Western art music aesthetic, or, as I have classified—a taxonomy comprised of European styled jazz that also synthesizes elements of twentieth century classical, pop, rock, groove, and free jazz music.

Another concern of this study was that the results from the interviews revealed a concerning lack of familiarity of the administrators and instructors with traditional jazz artists. For example, administrators T-RP, H-RP, and H-CD were not familiar with artists such as Bix Beiderbecke, Don Byas, James P. Johnson, Chick Webb, Jimmy Rainey, and Oscar Moore. Similarly, and possibly even more shocking was that in the interview and questionnaire portion of this study, instructors T-DT, H-DT, T-DC, and H-DC, were only familiar with less than 5% of all the artists—traditional or modern. A possible reason for this gap in knowledge could be the result of these individuals’ musical upbringing. For example, T-DT, H-DT, T-DC, and H-DC, are all instructors under the age of 40, and from the analysis of their demographic breakdown, they were all raised in Toronto and listened to pop and rock music growing up. Furthermore, participants T-DC, and H-DC, were not familiar with the works of landmark artist Louis Armstrong—and yet these individuals are professors of jazz at a post-secondary level! Additionally, these individuals posited that they were raised on video game music and regularly played video games for inspiration.

The problem I see with T-DC and H-DC as jazz instructors is that they have not learned the history and breadth of the traditional jazz canon. To make matters worse,
instructor T-DC, a faculty member at The University of Toronto’s jazz program claims. “I show my students electronic production, video games, pop music, weird music” (GTA participant T-DC 2016). Of course, the danger here is that instructors such as T-DC have created a feedback loop by encouraging these types of music in their pedagogy—likely contributing to a defunct lexicon of jazz vernacular for their students. In this manner, the data from these instructors illuminates a gap in jazz history and historiographies, and has become a taxonomy for to be classified under the umbrella of the “erasure of African American-ness.” More importantly, it also contradicts the research carried out by Kearns (2011) that proclaimed GTA instructors (names withheld, but known in this study as T-RP, and H-RP) to be “jazz specialists.” The reason why my study has contradicted Kearns (2011) is because 1.) the data from T-RP, and H-RP confirms that they did not know the majority of correct chords to the jazz standards that were being asked; 2.) my data also shows that T-RP, and H-RP do not have a vast knowledge of traditional jazz artists as they indicated in the answers from their questionnaire. 3.) These individuals are administrators, and as such, I would expect that they would be setting the example and leading their instructors from their vast pool of musical knowledge.

To conclude, by way of triangulation—synthesizing the quantitative data (questionnaire), with that of the qualitative data (long interviews), not only did the administrators such as T-RP, H-RP, and H-CD along with instructors T-DT, H-DT, T-DC, and H-DC, have an inferior knowledge of jazz history and landmark artists, and as such questions how they could be experts in teaching jazz, especially at a post-secondary level. Furthermore, from the questionnaire, the majority of all the administrators and instructors did not choose traditional jazz music as their personal favorite, but rather gravitated towards artists that were associated with a more modern aesthetic that embraces modal, free and
European music, peppered with contemporary styles such as pop, rock, fusion and funk (Table 18) that I argue has shaped their pedagogy and curricula.

**Limitations of GTA Questionnaire and Interviews**

Although I have felt that his structured questionnaire was comprehensive, their remained an unfortunate possibility of false requisition from the participants. For example, I felt that question order bias, or a bias may have emerged through the framing of individual questions in that instructors might have misrepresented their instructional practices somewhat because they knew what they were "supposed to say."

For example, in question 33 of the GTA questionnaire (Appendix A), four instructors chose Buddy Bolden as an artist they use as an example in their classroom. The problem with this data is that Buddy Bolden has never been captured on a recording.

Another problem of transparency arose once again in the GTA questionnaire. For example, participant H-BS claimed that he “always researches the correct chord changes in a song” and thus knew for certainty that the correct first chord of the Victor Young composition “Stella by Starlight” was a #4 minor7b5 chord in the key of Bb. This is incorrect as the correct first chord is a I diminished Major 7 chord; and the original key of the song is not Bb Major as H-BS has indicated, but rather G major.
CHAPTER 6: RECOMMENDATIONS

Answering Research Question 4

To what extent should the sources and structures of the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of movement, be developed into future post-secondary jazz curricula across the GTA and what are the limitations in implementing it?

Because one of the main goals of this study was to reconstruct post-secondary jazz curricula within the GTA by incorporating the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of movement, I have reached several conclusions. By contrasting the findings from Chapter 4 of this study that fleshed out antecedents from Barry Harris’ concept of movement, with that of the data collected about the musical upbringing and knowledge of traditional jazz of current instructors and administrators in the GTA, I have made the following suggestions for rebuilding a jazz curriculum that is currently lacking in African American narratives. I will also offer suggestions towards using the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of movement as a multidimensional pedagogical tool that will help individuals to become more fluent in the musical lexicon of jazz.

Jazz and Aurality

To start, I strongly believe that jazz (and all music) is an art that can only truly be learned by placing more emphasis on the human ear than the eyes (reading music). For example, one needs only to read Berliner (1994) or Richard Faulkner and Howard Becker’s (2009) expansive work on the importance of learning music as an ear based art to capture the breadth of my suggestion. For example, I discourages the use of sight reading in jazz—holding little value in ‘how to’ music manuals or workbooks that include transcribed improvisations of well-known musicians—as I argue these vehicles to be mediums that are similar to a ‘paint by numbers’ scenario that only lead to rote performances. More
importantly, from the findings of this study, it is evident that Barry Harris and his contemporaries did not use such aids; as Harris has said, he transcribed everything by ear (Panken 2013). One need only listen to Erroll Garner who apparently never learned to read music, to hear the effortless playing of the jazz lexicon—encapsulating elements of twentieth century impressionism, stride, swing, and bebop (Marshall 2016).

Conversely, the published works reviewed in the literature from Aebersold (1992), Bergonzi (2000), Coker (1997), Liebman (1991), and those specific to Harris’ concepts, such as Ben-Hur (2004), Bicket (2001), Kingstone (2009), Marijt (2014) and Rees (1994-2005) only lead to a robotic sense of phrasing and nomenclature. In this respect, I have suggested that all post-secondary institutions across the GTA follow the same learning style as Harris and his peers—that is, all jazz music that falls under the taxonomy of jazz “standards,” or from the “Great American Songbook” must only be learned by ear.

The importance of implementing such pedagogy into a new jazz curriculum is substantial in that it brings jazz music back to its urban roots—music that was made to foster a form of community while players learned and were inspired by one another through interaction (JALC 2010). To further break down this scenario, I state that when transcribing from a recording, players become active participants in the performance they are listening to. This is important because this is how African Americans such as Harris and his peers assimilated the phrasing and nuances of a melody or improvisation; this assimilation would likely not be achieved by reading a lead-sheet, regardless of the dynamics and ornamentation written in.

Possibly the most important reason that post-secondary institutions should adopt an ‘ear only’ mandate for learning repertoire is because it will cultivate musical originality. By this, I am referring to what is known as participatory discrepancies—that is, the push and pull
that gives music its ‘human’ characteristic of breathing (Keil 1987). When musicians learn
music aurally, they begin to musically interact amongst themselves and with the music. For
example, when playing in a band context, the music imbues anthropomorphic properties—
similar to verbal conversation, in that band members are ‘actively’ listening—responding to
one another’s musical cues and interjections. Conversely, reading jazz lead-sheets or using
manuals to learn jazz produces music that is predictable and boring, because the music is only
based on what the book has to offer.

Although I question the use of sight-reading in learning jazz, I do believe that reading
music serves a purpose in the context of playing another musician’s original composition for
the first time, a composition that may be dense with time signature changes, or more complex
harmonic progressions. I also feel that performances of classical repertoire that calls for
musical accuracy should first be learned by ear. Then, musicians can move on to reading the
written score as a means for ensuring accuracy. By learning in this way, predominantly by
ear, I feel that the harmonies would be better assimilated, and thus reading of the written
score would be easier. For example, as a child, I was not a strong sight-reader, but excelled in
transcribing jazz and classical repertoire by ear. Because of learning repertoire in this
manner, I have been able to get ‘inside’ of the music by following the harmony explicitly and
thus being able to re-harmonize most classical repertoire. The importance of this fact is that,
individuals would attain the ability to analyze and break down a song’s harmonic structure,
and thus sight reading becomes even easier, as your fingers can anticipate what is coming up
in the score.

Another excellent example, similar to my personal experience, that utilizes the ear as
an aid for sight-reading, is concert pianist Valentina Lasitsa’s method of learning classical
music. For example, in the YouTube video entitled “How to Start Learning a New Piece:
Addinsell Warsaw Concerto First Practice Livestream”(2013), Lisista is shown learning the Addinsell Concerto by ear and then later tries to play along with a video recording (Lasitsa 2013). In this manner, Lisitsa has absorbed the skeleton of the concerto’s harmonies by using her ear to transcribe the music and now her engagement with the sight-reading aspect of the concerto has become exponentially easier.

Although I would strongly advise musicians to use their ears to figure out all types of music, regardless of its complexity, I realize that there are some situations, such as classical performances that call for the most extreme of accuracy, and as such the ability to read music is required.

**Contrafacts Based on European Classical Repertoire**

Another suggestion by I am that all post-secondary jazz programs should use classical repertoire as vessels for contrafacts. This is because Barry Harris has stated that most of the composers of the great song book were Europeans of Jewish decent and utilized their European musical training in their compositions (including Western art music)—giving the public the “Great American Songbook” and standards (Clasijazz TV 2014). Additionally, I have suggested using classical repertoire in post-secondary jazz curricula because traditional jazz players often used their melodies in their improvisations. Players such as Nat Cole, Charlie Parker, Dizzy Gillespie and Earl ‘Bud’ Powell drew upon classical melodies to use in their improvisations and compositions (Haydon 2004). For example, Bud Powell’s composition, “Bud on Bach” (1957) is heavily indebted to the harmonic progression and melodic themes found within C.P.E Bach’s “Solfeggietto” (1766). To this end, I argue that the role of the ear, along with rhythmical expression, should be at the top of a hierarchal chain of importance for any aspiring musician.
Another impetus for developing the ear is that it plays a crucial role in visual feedback to the mind, and, in part, can develop a greater ease of sight-reading. For example, I argue that one binary—sight-reading, would also involve the requirement the second binary—the ear/aurality. I argue that developing one’s ‘ears’ would enable individuals to place their fingers on their instruments—foreshadowing what they are about to play. An example of this would be reading classical repertoire and having insight—‘hearing’ the harmony that is ahead—enabling your fingers to move into the correct position on your instrument more quickly. Conversely, I argue that having an underdeveloped ear means that musicians would only be able to read one measure at a time, with a delayed action of the fingers.

**Mandatory and Daily Jam Sessions**

Next, from the findings in Chapter 4, I took note of Barry Harris’ musical upbringing, specifically of how he and his peers sharpened their craft by way of playing every day during jam sessions, rent parties or dances (Graves 2010; JALC 1992; Panken 2013; Shermer 2015). These observations, combined with the data gathered from the participants H-LB, T-RD, H-RD, Y-FA, H-FA, M-FA, T-DB, H-DB, and T-BD, led to my opinion that academic institutions must create more performance-based opportunities for students so that they will gain proficiency in jazz. For example, as evidenced from the telephone interviews, instructors T-BD, T-RD, H-RD, T-DB, and H-DB, strongly believe that many music students who graduate from institutions in the GTA are essentially still at a novice level because they have not had enough daily playing opportunities to assimilate and develop the jazz lexicon. Thus, I have suggested that post-secondary schools implement daily jam sessions that are not weighted according to skill level, and in which include the instructors themselves participate. This type of scenario forces inexperienced players to develop more quickly from the
competitive, ‘sink or swim’ atmosphere, while the more advanced players still get opportunities to shadow and learn from faculty members.

**Mandatory Drumming and Dance for All Students**

Study participants Y-MS, H-MS, T-BD, T-RD, H-RD, T-DB, and H-DB suggested the creation of a mandatory course in which all music students learn how to play the drums and, more specifically, learn African drumming and dancing. This suggestion reveals that these participants (along with myself), believe that rhythm is the driving force behind jazz phrasing and musical expression, and therefore students should be working constantly at developing their sense of rhythm. Furthermore, participants Y-MS and H-MS, view drumming as the closest form of musical expression that mimics the actions of the human body in the act of dance. Thus, I have suggested that all first year students learn West African drumming techniques that incorporate dancing, polyrhythms and interlocking—vital aggregates found within West African American (Chernoff 1979; Nettl 2008). For example, the syncopations found within a Scott Joplin rag, the back phrasing of jazz pianist Erroll Garner, or the overlapping urban vocal rap “migos flow” that juxtaposes the time signatures 3/4 against 4/4 (Staff 2014), are all examples of West African rhythms that have been adopted into African American culture. Thus, as jazz is an urban music (Peretti 1994), I am suggesting that the rhythms from West Africa that lead to the creation of jazz (Schuller 1986) should also be part of any jazz curricula.

Finally, I have recommended that in order for aspiring students or professionals to gain greater fluency in traditional African American jazz, they must study of the socio-cultural practices experienced by the African American originators of the music. These socio-

---

78 The purpose of learning African drumming, or more specifically, West African drumming in the context of jazz, is because it has influenced some of the most notable jazz musicians such as John Coltrane, Quincy Jones, and Yusef Lateef (Pareles 2003).
cultural practices—"dissonances"—are expressions of disenfranchisement and marginalization in the lives of African Americans, and in my opinion, are essential to the comprehension of jazz.

Within this study, I have referred to these dissonances as underlying aggregates in forming the gestalt of Barry Harris' concept of movement. Furthermore, the need for this research is crucial as his concept of movement has not been examined from a socio-cultural perspective in any of the literature reviewed by authors who specialize in Harris' teachings such as (Ben-Hur 2004), Bicket (2001), Kingstone (2009), Marijt (2014), and Rees (1994-2005), or authors who have tried to explicate and codify jazz pedagogy such as Baker (2005), Bergonzi (2012), Coker (1997), Liebman (1991), and Levine (2011). Some authors, such as Galper (2004) and Longo (2010) who have been reviewed in this study, have addressed the rhythmic nature of jazz as it relates to dance and body movement. The limitation of these authors’ published works is that they do not investigate other socio-cultural dissonances that I argue were evolving during times of disenfranchisement during African American history (Nelson 1999; Stuckey 1994).

From the findings of the questionnaire, when asked if they thought any of the non-musical arts (dance, scat/ poetry, visual arts, theatrics) were an essential tool to learn jazz, the majority of the administrators (85.7%) and instructors (90.0%) replied “Yes,” or “Yes, but only a bit;” 57.1% of the administrators and 63.3% of the instructors admitted that they “sometimes, but rarely” use any of these other non-musical arts as a teaching method in the classroom. From the long interviews, the sub-theme “Participant's use of non-musical arts in the classroom” consisted of five statements reflecting little use of non-musical arts as teaching aids, four reflecting no use of non-musical arts as teaching aids, and three reflecting use of musical arts as teaching aids. The sub-theme of “Philosophy of non-musical arts as
teaching aids” was represented by 18 statements endorsing the use of non-musical arts, and only one participant who was indifferent. By triangulating both sets of quantitative and qualitative data, one can see that there is an overwhelming majority for the endorsement of using non-musical arts in a post-secondary musical curriculum. Thus, I have made his recommendation for implementing their use in all private lessons and performance-based classes as follows:

**Scat and Phrasing**

In examining the role of scat in the development of phrasing, I argue that African American jazz artists such as Louis Armstrong, Cab Calloway, Dizzy Gillespie and Slim Gaillard improvised and rhythmically phrased their improvisations based on the rhythmic nature of speech patterns that one may find in African American slang, the iambic pentameter of poetry (stressed weak beats creating syncopation), or the onstage theatrics of black minstrelsy that has an improvised nature (unlike its white counterpart that had skits that were worked out and satirized and exaggerated African American gestures [Padgett 2016]). For example, authors Frank Kofsky and Megan Sullivan both purport that African American socio-political marginalization led to the architectonic structures of black music that was derived from codified speech (Kofsky 1970, 135; Sullivan 2001, 27). Sullivan cites Kofsky work and states the following:

> African-Americans evolved a set of colloquial expressions and references that were cryptic to anyone unfamiliar with their cultural context. This cultural code extended beyond blues lyrics into the stylistic language of the music itself. Frank Kofsky proposed that the blues and early jazz hold sound patterns resembling Negro speech, a logical development from the segregated evolution of speech and music, considering that most musicians around the turn of the century were ‘self-taught’ and largely unlettered men,

---

79 Due to the expansive nature of how iambic poetry is related to the syncopations of jazz, this study cannot cover it in any length and give it the attention it deserves. Therefore, please see Albert De Genova’s (2012) in-depth article “Bop Prosody, Jazz, and the Practice of Spontaneous Poetics” that tackles this subject exhaustively.
excluded from white culture since the time of their early youth. Not only did the blues lyrics and musical speech-sound emanate from the experience of simply being African-American, but the blue harmonic construction, too, grew from that cultural source. At its best, this result of a centuries-old symbiosis between music and social environment became the musical rendering of a people’s dream denied (Kofsky 1970, 135; Sullivan 2001, 27).

Similarly, African American artists such as Barry Harris, Art Tatum, Oscar Peterson, Erroll Garner, and Bud Powell infuse a form of mumbling/ scat within their melodies and improvisations that I argue guides their musical phrases in an anthropomorphic fashion—that is, their improvisations are similar to the traits of human speech in its ebb and flow. For example, when these artists are mumbling along to their melodies or improvisations, and then stop mumbling in order to take a breath, they also stop playing their instrument—thus, giving their phrases a characteristic similar to human speech.

Therefore, to make one’s instrument replicate as closely as possible the breathing of a human being, I have suggested that instructors stress the importance for scatting all improvisations and melodies for non-brass instruments. Conversely, since brass instruments have to take a breath while they play (circular breathing excluded), they have an advantage in that their jazz phrasing has a stronger connection to the breathing humans perform during speech. My goal is to make the instrument sound as human as possible in order for listeners to better relate.

Body Movement and Dance

Finally, the data gathered from Harris’ interviews as well as the interviews from this study, revealed that much of the participants felt that dancing and physical body movement are a vital aggregate that is missing in post-secondary jazz education. With the exception of Ames (1977), Baraka (2012), Berliner (1994), Chernoff (1979), Crease (2008), Finkelstein (1997), Floyd (1993), Haskins (2000), Hazard-Gordon (1990), Kenney (1994), Welsh (2010), (Martin 2006), Nelson (1999), Peretti (1994), Stearns (1994) and Wilf (2016), the authors
found within the literature reviewed have neglected to include the importance of dance and physical movement to the learning of jazz music. What is most troubling is that all the authors who have written about Harris’ methodologies have not examined this area of pedagogy, even though from the findings, Harris strongly believes that dance or body movement should always be included in the learning process of jazz (Clasijazz TV 2014; Graves 2010; JALC 1992; Panken 2013). To this end, I have suggested that there should be classes implemented that marries music and body movement in a manner similar to Émile Jaques-Dalcroze’s “eurhythmics.” According to David Buley of Dalcroze Canada:

Dalcroze Eurhythmics is based on the premise that the human body is the source of all musical ideas. Physical awareness or kinaesthetic intelligence is one of our most powerful senses, yet it is often taken for granted. We use it in everyday situations to keep our balance, judge distances, and manipulate the objects around us. In a similar way, we must move with flexibility, fluidity, and economy in order to play a musical instrument with both passion and skill. Dalcroze Eurhythmics allows us to gain a practical, physical experience for music before we theorise and perform. This ensures that the whole person (not just the fingers and the brain) is educated in the development of musicianship and artistry. (Buley 2016)

This quotation from Buley is significant in that it elucidates how the human body is the most important instrument, and as such, it must be viewed as a vessel for rhythmical expression. Thus, musicians must work towards “feeling” rhythms through body gestures so these rhythms can be cultivated into musical expressions on one’s instrument.

**Limitations**

I can see several limitations in implementing the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of movement. For example, an overwhelmingly high number of administrators (100%) and instructors (96%) are non-African American in post-secondary jazz institutions in the GTA, and as such, their frame of reference to “African American” socio-cultural realities, or experience would be speculation or hearsay from secondary sources.
Next, implementing my suggestions for curriculum development based on African American narratives, although a vast improvement from the present GTA offering, has its own limitations. First, although my suggestion to implement the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of movement is a definite improvement to current GTA post-secondary jazz curricula, I cannot help but feel that no matter how hard individuals try to imitate their African American jazz idols of the past, they still will not attain full jazz literacy. The reason for this is because, those African American individuals were reacting and coping to socio-political factors such as marginalization and ostracism, and reacted with the expressions of socio-cultural narratives such as dance, poetics (slang), theatrics and visual arts as coping mechanisms (Baraka 1968; Heble 2000; Kofsky 1970; Nelson 1999; Sullivan 2001; Tucker and Ellington 1995).

Next, unless post-secondary institutions are willing to hire more African American men and women who can teach from the compliance of their own oral histories (such as Barry Harris does in his workshops), students will still have an incomplete understanding of the music’s nomenclature as it will not contain what this study has referred to as “African American-ness.”

Another limitation seen in implementing my curricula is that all the jazz clubs and jazz radio stations would have to be willing to change their programming so traditional African American jazz was at the forefront. Any type of programming that caters to the mainstream pop, rock, or ECM type of jazz aesthetic, would negate the holistic process needed for students to be immersed while gaining musical fluency from all available sources (community music schools, post-secondary jazz institutions, jazz clubs, and radio stations).

A final limitation is that post-secondary jazz administrators and instructors across the GTA would have to remodel and rebuild present day curricula according to my suggestions,
and then get approval from higher powered neoliberalist individuals that may have a final say about what can and cannot be implemented (Laver 2014; Heble and Laver 2016)

**Conclusion of the Study**

The purpose of this study was to develop a new treatise that would deconstruct and expand upon the antecedents of Dr. Barry Harris’ concept of movement while showing the value for its application across GTA post-secondary jazz curricula. To fulfill these goals, I created a conceptual framework that consisted of synthesis of lenses to flesh out the antecedents of Barry Harris’ concept of movement while also enabling me to expand upon it. For example, the data from Harris, his contemporaries, and the reviewed literature showed that the socio-political circumstances endured by African Americans also contributed to the development of architectonic structures of socio-cultural expressions in the urban arts through modes of signifying—in—dance, poetics (slang) and theatrics (sexuality).

Also, from the data and the reviewed literature, I noted that the marginalization and ostracising of African Americans led to the development of coping mechanisms, or what I referred to as African American narratives and texts expressing “dissonance.” Additionally, I further noted that these narratives and texts not only consisted of dance, poetics (slang) and theatrics, but were also part of everyday culture for African American musicians such as Harris and his contemporaries. Therefore, taking these points into consideration, I elucidated that these narratives were multidimensional, as they were all artistic expressions of socio-political dissonances experienced by aggrieved African American communities, while also denoting how those communities overcame persecution. I am also convinced that these socio-political events experienced by Harris and his contemporaries were seminal in the inspiration for a pallet of obscure harmonies comprised of a synthesis of binaries—antithesis (dissonance) and thesis (consonance).
Thus, in analyzing the architecture behind these binaries, I concluded that, in order to understand how African Americans such as Barry Harris and his contemporaries negotiated feelings of disenfranchisement and marginalization within their art, one would have to understand New Negro Philosopher W.E.B Dubois’ definition of *double consciousness*.

As previously mentioned, DuBois’ double consciousness signifies how African Americans view themselves as binaries—from the compliance of the Caucasians who have marginalized them, and from the compliance of overcoming that marginalization. Thus, I have concluded that Barry Harris and his contemporaries negotiate “dissonances” in their artistic expression that are polysemous and refer to an aggrieved racial past—that is, their musical harmonies and improvisations constantly make reference to a synthesis of binary oppositions—thesis and antithesis. In relation to this study, the conditions for Dubois’ double consciousness are also apparent in Barry Harris’ concept of movement. For example, as previously mentioned, I concluded that the dissonances within Harris’ harmonies are multi-layered. They are first a reflection of African American socio-political marginalization and disenfranchisement—dissonance, while also signifyin(g) the overcoming of those deplorable conditions through negotiation—consonance. To elaborate further, the disenfranchisement of African Americans signified “antithesis” as a result of slavery, while “thesis” signified the methods and negotiations that cultivated salvation and freedom from that enslavement. For example, after reflecting upon the data within this study, I have suggested that Harris and his contemporaries experienced socio-political hardships, but furthermore, channeled those hardships into socio-cultural expressions of urban art that were created within communal institutions such as the black church, jook joints, rent parties and daily jam sessions as coping mechanisms. Within these communal institutions, I have further proposed that societal “dissonances” from African American marginalization were expressed through dance
rhythms, poetics/ slang and onstage theatrics/ sexuality that, in part, led to the creation of the jazz lexicon, and what I have advocated to be “African American-ness.”

By further exploring the theme of binary oppositions, I expanded upon Barry Harris’ concept of movement by illuminating how it could be used as a multidimensional tool for improvisation, and as an aid for the expansion of harmonic and rhythmic prolongation; a task that had not been previously attempted by any of the authors who had published materials on Harris’ concepts.

By using harmonic reduction, I offered the reader a method on how to reduce all possible harmonies in a composition to either a tonic or dominant functioning chord that in part simplify voice leading and improvisation. Furthermore, I demonstrated that modulating between consonance and dissonance on any given chord creates a sense of propulsion and movement when used in an improvisational context; another point that had not been developed in any of the previous literature on his concept.

In the second half of this study, I used a mixed methodology of quantitative and qualitative research to analyze the data from the participants interviewed for this study (educators in post-secondary jazz institutions across the GTA). By triangulating the data from both the questionnaire and long interviews, I was able to reveal the gaps that were found in African American narratives when contrasted with Barry Harris’ upbringing. From here, I made recommendations to rebuild jazz curricula across the GTA while also addressing the limitations in its implementation.

Conversely, the data gathered from the interviewees also indicated a recurring theme. That is, the overwhelming majority of administrators and instructors combined the use of what they constituted to be a lexical representation of jazz with a codified Western Art teaching model. For example, the instructors’ pedagogical method was more academic than
“hands on,” with no incorporation of other non-musical arts such as dance, poetics and theatrics to provide a more holistic approach.

What was also concerning was that these non-African American individuals were influenced by musics that distorted their perception of traditional jazz. That is, an alarming number of administrators and instructors felt an affinity to modal, rock, pop and European jazz (ECM), and as such, did not know many traditional jazz artists and harmonic progressions of traditional jazz standards. If this is the case, then how can they teach jazz from the compliance of authenticity, or be referred to as experts in the field of jazz?

Furthermore, since all the interview participants had not experienced playing in the “sanctified” church, their compliance of the blues and jazz does not reflect that of Barry Harris and his colleagues who started their musical training in the church as children and used its training as a gateway into jazz. Correspondingly, the duality of the hardships and marginalization experienced by African Americans became therapeutic in the church. The harmonies of spirituals and hymns became antecedents to the harmonic and rhythmic dissonances of early African American minstrel, folk and ragtime music. I further believe it is this recurring theme of binary oppositions that separates how African Americans like Barry Harris and his contemporaries from the administrators and instructors in the GTA. The latter group cannot draw from Harris and his colleagues’ African American frames of reference. To this end, the contrasting data from both Barry Harris and his contemporaries versus that of the study participants, revealed how both parties were raised in separate socio-political and socio-cultural environments and thus, both parties drew from separate patterns of meaning that existed and operated within their own cultural system. Ultimately, the contrasting historiographies of both Harris and the study participants mean that they have different
frames of reference as to what jazz is comprised of, and thus, both parties play and teach from this compliance.

Finally, there remains some limitations after reflecting upon this study. I feel that no matter how hard individuals try to incorporate the non-musical art forms such as dance, body movement, poetics (scat) and theatrics; having fluency in the traditional jazz lexicon at the level of Barry Harris or his contemporaries may be unrealistic. I have come to this conclusion because Barry Harris and his colleagues experienced these dissonances first hand at certain epochs in history that polarized Americans into a taxonomy of binaries—“Black” and “White.”

For example, the socio-political conditions experienced by African Americans such as Harris and his colleagues were overcome by the socio-cultural narratives that they practiced (attending the black church, dance, poetics/ slang, theatrics), and thus became coping mechanisms. To this end, the dissonant harmonies exemplified in African American jazz—from bebop to free jazz, could also be viewed as political statements against the “White” establishment. If this is the case, I wonder how present-day students will gain fluency in the jazz lexicon if the socio-political narratives that marginalized African Americans and contributed towards shaping African American music are not these students’ cultural frame of reference?

So, there remains the following dichotomy: the reaction to disenfranchisement and marginalization by African Americans helped shape their socio-cultural narratives and artistic expression, while present-day students who cannot relate to these experiences of repression and emancipation may never be able to truly speak the jazz language from a similar compliance.
I have concluded that Barry Harris and his African American contemporaries learned to play jazz by using a synthesis of different art forms—drawing from their specific socio-political and socio-cultural experiences; and current jazz musicians, in general as well as in the GTA, must face the reality that they are outsiders. The music was first created and experienced by African Americans. Ultimately, the frame of reference from which non-African Americans draw upon is not of the same compliance and thus, non-African American expression of traditional jazz may come off as an act of appreciation, rather than understanding the cultural conditions that produced it. What I coined “the erasure of African American-ness” within GTA post-secondary institutions that specialized in jazz has also led me to conclude, that these educators and their students approached African American music as an “object” or artifact unrelated to its history or the African American musicians that created it. Thus, I argue there is a barrier that will always be apparent for outsiders when trying to find the intrinsic meaning of this music, let alone emulate its creators. Thus, reflecting on this study in a cognitive post-mortem, I have come to the several conclusions that may have also been the result of personal biases.

Considering the zeitgeist of contemporary music education within the GTA (and possibly all of Canada), I cannot help but feel that that there has been a tendency in much of Western art culture to prioritize the creative object (codified jazz) over the creative act (learning jazz from the “streets”)—an approach that has been adopted by the majority of the administrators and instructors mentioned within this study. Unfortunately, this type of mindset has all too often led to discussions that seldom consider the collaborative and social practices, the belief systems, and the historical contexts that have shaped music making. For example, I also believe that the participants and their methods of teaching jazz rely heavily on stagnant pedagogies that fail to incorporate the social dimensions of music. Unfortunately, I
also believe there exists an important reason why these social dimensions were never realized by non-African American instructors of jazz. That is, the dissonances expressed within African Americans’ socio-cultural narratives during and after times of enslavement gave rise to a juxtaposition of artistic expressions—dissonance (slavery) and consonance (overcoming that oppression). I further believe that these expressions of dissonances are in constant flux with one another and cannot be realized by cultures that were never subjected to this socio-historical marginalization.

To this end, I argue that non-African Americans that have not experienced these socio-historical events, will not attain full fluency in the traditional lexicon of jazz from an African American lens. Thus, I argue that these non-African American administrators and instructors have adopted an ethnocentric lens. By ethnocentric, I am suggesting that the non-African American administrators and instructors developed what they believe to be “jazz” - according to preconceptions originating in the standards and customs of their own culture— their frame of reference. The dichotomy once again is that many of these administrators and instructors were educated in academic environments that had codified jazz into a rote structure and were taught using an Western art music archetype.

Finally, the artistic narratives that I have suggested for implementation in post-secondary institutions are only what I argue to be an improvement to current conventional pedagogy, and as such, cannot fix the ultimate issue of gaining jazz fluency; as I argue this is an issue that is deeply rooted in the experiencing and overcoming of disenfranchisement by African Americans.

Brian Jude de Lima
BIBLIOGRAPHY


-----. 2013. *Artists House Master Class Interview with Barry Harris*. Video. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=UNfg5zQI0EI&t=312s.


Creswell, John W. 2013. Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods


DeLuke, R. J. 2003. “George Coleman: This Gentleman can PLAY.”


----- 2013. “All the Things You Are.” Video. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iCsw0NjXY1U.


https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RLCfw9tqGmA.


Fautley, Martin. 2010. Assessment in Music Education. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 21


/subscriber/article/grove/music/20126?q=David+fuller+notes+inegales&search=quick  
&pos=3&_start=1#firsthit.

Interviewed by Chris Funkhouser.

Encyclopedia.com Articles about Barry Harris.” http://www.encyclopedia.com  
/topic/Barry_Harris.aspx#1.


Amazon.ca*. Duke University Press. https://www.amazon.ca/Representing-Jazz-Krin-
Gabbard/dp/0822315947/ref=sr_1_5?s=books&ie=UTF8&qid=1492204289&sr=1-5.


Music Co.

Criticism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Gillespie, Dizzy, and Al Fraser. 1985. *To Be or Not To Bop. Minneapolis, MN: University Of  
Minnesota Press.*


Hardie, Daniel. 2013. *Jazz Historiography: The Story of Jazz History Writing*. n.l.: iuniverse LLC.


doi:10.1017/S0261143004000121.


Jaques-Dalcroze, Émile. 1921. Rhythm, Music & Education. n.l.: theclassics.us


Jon70. 2009. *Timing and Duration of Quarter Note Triplets.*

http://shelf3d.com/_9aUKEmT_cA#Timing%20And%20Duration%20Op%20Quarter %20Note%20Triplets%203.


Critical Studies in Improvisation / Études Critiques En Improvisation 3 (2).

https://www.researchcatalogue.net/view/31695/31696.


Meadows, Craig. 2016. *Beyond Harmony: Jazz and Harlem, 1925-1933*. Ottawa, ON: Library and Archives Canada.


http://andrewsolomon.com/articles/questions-of-genius/.


Staff, DX. 2014. “Special Delivery: 11 Unique Hip Hop Flows | HipHopDX.”


APPENDIX A

GTA Participant Questionnaire: Reanimating Dissonance

Principal Researcher: Brian Jude de Lima PhD (ABD)

York University Graduate studies in music

Name:

Gender:

Date of Birth:

Country of Birth:

Part 1

1. What was the first type of music you were exposed to as a kid? (choices include all styles and decades)
   a.) Jazz   b.) Classical   c.) Popular Contemporary   d.) Soul/ RnB
   e.) Funk   f.) Rock   g.) Country
   h.) Electronic   i.) Urban Black (Rap, Hip-Hop, House, Jungle/ Drum and Bass)
   j.) 20th century/ minimalist   k) Black Gospel/ Spirituals

2. If you choose a non-jazz genre, at what age did you start listening to this type of music? (If participant had chosen Jazz as first music, then NA- not applicable)
   a.) < 10   b.) ≥ 10 -20   c.) ≥ 20   d.) NA

3. If jazz was or was not the first music you listened too, when you finally listened to it, what kind of jazz music was it stylistically/ genre?
   a.) Ragtime/ Stride   b.) Swing/ Big-band   c.) New Orleans
   d.) Bebop e.) Westcoast/ Cool   f.) Hard-bop
g.) Modal  h.) Free/ Avant-garde  i.) Folk Blues

J.) Black Gospel/ Spirituals  k.) Third Stream  l.) post- bop/ modern

m.) Funk jazz  n.) Fusion  o.) ECM

p.) Smooth jazz

4. At what age did you start listening to this type of jazz music?
   b.) < 10  b.) ≥ 10 - 20  c.) ≥ 20

5. At what age did you start learning jazz on your instrument?
   a.) < 10  b.) ≥ 10 - 20  c.) ≥ 20

6. What kind of jazz were you learning and playing on your instrument?
   a.) Ragtime/ Stride  b.) Swing/ Big-band  c.) New Orleans
   d.) Bebop  e.) Westcoast/ Cool  f.) Hard-bop
   g.) Modal  h.) Free/ Avant-garde  i.) Latin
   J.) Black Gospel/ Spirituals  k.) Third Stream  l.) post- bop/ modern
   m.) Funk jazz  n.) Fusion  o.) ECM
   p.) Smooth jazz

7. Do you have any post-secondary education in jazz, and if so, where?
   a.) Post-secondary jazz institutions within the GTA (Mohawk College, Humber College, York University, University of Toronto)
   b.) Post-secondary jazz education not within the GTA but within Canada.
   c.) Post-secondary jazz education in a different country.
   d.) No post-secondary jazz education.
8. Please choose from one or more of the following: When you started to learn jazz, which method(s) were implemented?
   a.) Only oral tradition       b.) Some oral tradition       c.) No oral tradition
   d.) Always used method books  e.) Some method books       f.) No method books
   g.) Only ‘lifted’ and transcribed recordings       h.) Some ‘lifting’ and transcription of recordings
   i.) No lifting and transcription of recordings       j.) just listened, no transcribing

9. In thinking of your favorite jazz artist(s) when you first started to learn jazz, choose where you would place this artist’s style and era (*NB-regardless if your artist choice has played in many different jazz genres or styles, choose the era and style that you like of this particular artist).
   a.) Ragtime/ Stride       b.) Swing/ Big-band       c.) New Orleans
   d.) Bebop       e.) Westcoast/ Cool       f.) Hard-bop
   g.) Modal       h.) Free/ Avant-garde       i.) Latin
   j.) Black Gospel/ Spirituals       k.) Third Stream       l.) post- bop/ modern
   m.) Funk jazz       n.) Fusion       o.) ECM
   p.) Smooth jazz

10. Did you transcribe this artist’s solos or phrasing when you first started to learn jazz?
    a.) Yes, a lot       b.) A little bit       c.) No       d.) Just listened

11. Did your musical taste deviate from this artist’s style/ genre as you began to become more interested in jazz music?
    a.) Yes       b.) No

12. If ‘Yes,’ please name artistic deviations in style/ genre (if no deviation, choose NA).
a.) Ragtime/ Stride  b.) Swing/ Big-band  c.) New Orleans  
  d.) Bebop  e.) Westcoast/ Cool  f.) Hard-bop  
  g.) Modal  h.) Free/ Avant-garde  i.) Latin  
  J.) Black Gospel/ Spirituals  k.) Third Stream  l.) post- bop/ modern  
  m.) Funk jazz  n.) Fusion  o.) ECM  
  p.) Smooth jazz  q.) pop/ rock  r.) NA  

Part 2

13. Were your original jazz influence(s) artists from the pre bebop era?
    a.) Yes  b.) No  

14. If not, at what age in your education (formal/ non formal) did you familiarize yourself with early jazz from the pre bebop era? (NA=not applicable)
    a.) <10  b.) >10 -20  c.) >20  d.) NA  

15. If you currently do not play in the style of early jazz, do you see any relevance in studying and playing it?
    a.) Yes  b.) Yes, but only a bit  c.) No  d.) Not Sure  

16. Since you are an educator in jazz music, do you teach it extensively from a diachronic trajectory, that is, its inception from slave music hollers, spirituals, early folk blues, ragtime and stride with your students?
    a.) Yes  b.) Yes, but only a bit  c.) No  d.) Not Sure  

17. Did you ever familiarize yourself with other arts as a youth such as Dance, Poetics, Theatre or visual arts?
    a.) Yes  b.) Yes, but only a bit  c.) No  d.) Not Sure
18. Do you think any of these other non-musical arts are an essential tool to learn jazz?
   a.) Yes  b.) Yes, but only a bit  c.) No  d.) Not Sure

19. Do you use any of these other non-musical arts as a teaching method in your classroom?
   a.) Yes  b.) Sometimes, but rarely  c.) No  d.) Not Sure

20. Do you think vocal scat is an essential tool for students to learn phrasing and if so, are you using it in your classroom as a teaching method?
   a.) Yes  b.) Sometimes, but rarely  c.) No  d.) Not Sure

21. Please choose the group below that best describes how you would classify yourself stylistically as a jazz artist as of right now.
   a.) Traditional—hard bop, cool, bebop, swing, big band, ragtime/stride, New Orleans, folk blues, Black Gospel/Spirituals.
   b.) Modern—modal, free jazz, avant-garde, soul jazz, fusion, ECM, post-bop/modern, smooth jazz.
   c.) A combination of both ‘a’ and ‘b’ with heavier emphasis in ‘a’—Traditional.
   d.) A combination of both ‘a’ and ‘b’ with heavier emphasis in ‘b’—Modern.

22. Would this be the type of music you primarily teach new jazz students?
   a.) Yes  b.) Yes, but only a bit  c.) No, I ask them what they want to learn
d.) I don’t recall exactly what I teach as it always changes

23. As an artist, have you familiarized yourself with the narrative of how jazz music had been created starting with the great migration of African Americans and the slave trade that gave
rise to minstrel music, the blues, spirituals, early gospel, New Orleans music, and Ragtime and Stride?

a.) Yes  b.) Yes, but only a bit  c.) No  d.) Not Sure

24. Do you think it is important to teach jazz from the trajectory mentioned in the previous question?

a.) Yes, I strongly agree  b.) Yes, I somewhat agree  c.) No  d.) Not Sure

25. Do you think it is an essential tool at post-Secondary Schools to have daily jam sessions run by students with the participation of the instructors?

a.) Yes, I strongly agree  b.) Yes, I somewhat agree  c.) No I don’t think this is an essential tool to learn jazz  d.) Not Sure

26. If so, are daily jam sessions taking place at your institution?

a.) Yes  b.) Sometimes, but not daily  c.) No  d.) Not Sure

27. Please choose one or more from the following list. As an artist and educator, what would you like to see implemented in GTA post-secondary Jazz curricula?

a) Teach jazz as an African American oral/aural tradition that should be learned from its roots.

b) More performance mandated vehicles such as mandated jam sessions where professors and students play together, not just the students.

c) Have more African American instructors on staff who can teach the oral tradition.

d) Less emphasis on reading as to develop a musicians aurality.

e) Since jazz is always evolving, I don’t place such a deep emphasis on learning the history and thus pay more attention to current and popular developing styles.
f) All students should have African drumming as a mandatory first year course.

g) Jazz should NOT be viewed and taught as a codified European classical music aesthetic.

The very act of teaching jazz in this manner is a result of whiteness in GTA post-secondary curricula. Thus, jazz as an African American oral tradition must have an alternative method of teaching that embraces its African American urban narratives—Blackness.

28. Please answer the following for questions 26-30 (no introductions, verses, or re-harmonization of chord qualities). In a traditional jazz context, what is the first chord in *Stella By Starlight*?

   a.) #4 m7b5     b.) II7     c.) I diminished Major7  d.) No idea

29. What is the second chord in *The Song Is You*?

   a.) vi minor    b.) VI7    c.) bIII diminished    d.) No idea

30. What are the chords at bars 17 and 21 of *All The Things You Are (Ab)*?

   a.) IIm    b.) IIm7    c.) IIm7b5    d.) No Idea

31. What is the first chord in *But Not For Me*?

   a.) II7    b.) #4 m7b5    c.) I    d.) No Idea

32. What is the second chord in *Embraceable You*?

   a.) vi minor    b.) #4m7b5—VII7b9    c.) bIII diminished    d.) No Idea

b.)

Part 3

Questions 28-50.

Please choose only ONE of the choices that you have interest in and would use as an artist of importance in the classroom. (*NB-If you don’t know the artist in column ‘A’ please select
‘C.’ If you don’t know the artist in column ‘B’ please select ‘D.’ If you don’t know either artist, please select ‘F’). All the artists in the left column are classified as traditional.

33. a.) Buddy Bolden or b.) Freddie Hubbard (hard bop, funk, fusion)
34. a.) Louis Armstrong or b.) Miles Davis (modal, cool, rock-jazz)
35. a.) Bix Beiderbecke or b.) Chet Baker (cool)
36. a.) Roy Eldridge or b.) Kenny Wheeler (ECM)
37. a.) Lester Young or b.) John Coltrane (modal, free)
38. a.) Don Byas or b.) Dave Liebman (modal, free)
39. a.) Charlie Parker or b.) Chris Potter (modal, post modern)
40. a.) James P. Johnson or b.) Keith Jarrett (free, ECM)
41. a.) Teddy Wilson or b.) John Taylor (ECM)
42. a.) Bud Powell or b.) Chick Corea (hard bop, funk, free, ECM, fusion)
43. a.) Nat Cole (Piano) or b.) Brad Mehldau (post-bop/ modern)
44. a.) Thelonious Monk or b.) Bill Evans (modern, cool)
45. a.) Art Tatum or b.) Herbie Hancock (hard bop, funk, free, fusion)
46. a.) J.J. Johnson or b.) Bob Brookmeyer (cool)
47. a.) Chick Webb or b.) Tony Williams (hard bop, funk, fusion)
48. a.) Kenny Clarke or b.) Paul Motion (modern)
49. a.) Oscar Moore or b.) Jim Hall (modern)
50. a.) Jimmy Rainey or b.) Bill Frisell (free, ECM)
51. a.) Oscar Pettiford or b.) Scott La Faro (modern)
52. a.) Slam Stewart or b.) Eddie Gomez (modern)
53. a.) Billie Holliday or b.) Norma Winston (ECM)
54. a.) Erroll Garner or b.) McCoy Tyner (modal)
55. a.) Barry Harris or b.) Kenny Kirkland (post-bop/ modern)
56. Did you ever study jazz with an African American at any point in your classroom or private education? (*NB- this does NOT include playing with an African American(s) on the bandstand).

a.) Yes  b.) Yes, but only a bit  c.) No  d.) Not Sure

57. Do you think having African American instructors teaching jazz would give students a greater ability to assimilate and understand the breadth of the music’s DNA by way of these individuals own experiences and learned oral traditions?

a.) Yes  b.) Yes, but it will still be limited as a result of historical circumstances  c.) No  d.) Not Sure

Thank you greatly for your contribution for participating in my PhD study. Your input as a GTA performer and educator is crucial for myself to formulate suggestions on how the jazz ecosystem (that is an amalgamation of variables ranging from performing to education) in the GTA might benefit.

Best

Brian Jude de Lima

York University
APPENDIX B

Informed Consent Form

**Study Name:** Reanimating Dissonance

**Principal Researcher:** Brian Jude de Lima PhD (ABD)

York University

Graduate Studies in Music

**Purpose of the Research:**

The purpose of this research is to bring awareness to a void that I argue exists in the post-secondary jazz curricula across the GTA. Students may not be aware of the genealogy of how this African American folk art was originally learned. By drawing upon interdisciplinary subjects such as dance, visual and the literal arts, a more holistic model for the assimilation of jazz music may be attained. After deconstructing Barry Harris’ concept of movement, the principle researcher found certain aggregates that would support his theory of cultural dissonances.

I will interview persons either by phone, email, Skype or in person and offer them an opportunity to hopefully speak candidly about the state of jazz education in relation to its historical beginnings. The research will be presented in confidentiality and all participants shall remain anonymous, unless they chose otherwise.

**What you will be asked to do in the research:**
Thank you for taking time from your busy schedule to participate in my study. Please take the
time to answer to the best of your knowledge the landscape of jazz education today as you see it in post-
secondary institutions across the GTA.

**Risks and discomforts:**

None... You may be asked to (anonymously) voice your opinion about other jazz educators’
teaching methodologies.

**Benefits of the research and benefits to you:**

By participating in my research, you have the opportunity to add to the current pedagogy of
jazz curricula across North America and other parts of the world. In doing so, you will also have an
opportunity to bring authenticity back to jazz curricula in the GTA, an authenticity that I argue has been
missing for quite sometime, since the closing of Oscar Petersons *Advanced School of Contemporary
Music*

**Voluntary participation:**

Your participation in this research is completely voluntary and participants may choose to stop
participating at any time. A participant’s decision to discontinue participating will not influence their
relationship or the nature of their relationship with researchers or with staff of York University, either
now or in the future.

**Withdrawal from the study:**

You may stop participating in the study at any time, for any reason, if you so decide. Your
decision to stop participating, or to refuse to answer particular questions, will not affect your
relationship with the researcher, York University, or any other group associated with this project. In the
event that you withdraw from the study, all associated data collected will be immediately destroyed
wherever possible.

**Confidentiality:**
Your interview will be used to support a qualitative study of post-secondary jazz curricula. Electronic media, such as a computer or hard disc recorder for qualitative research, will record the interview. After the interview is completed, the media recorded will be stored on an electronic device for future reference or future studies unless you request for it to be destroyed. **Confidentiality will be provided to the fullest extent possible.**

**Questions about the research**

If you have any questions about the research in general, please feel to contact myself, my supervisor, or the graduate office in music.

**Disclaimer:**

This research has been reviewed and approved by the Human Participants Review Subcommittee; York University’s Ethics Review Board and conforms to the standards of the Canadian Tri-Council Research Ethics guidelines. If you have any questions about this process, or about your rights as a participant in the study, you may contact the Senior Manager and Policy Advisor for the Office of Research Ethics, 5th Floor, York Research Tower, York University.

**Legal Rights and Signatures:**

I ____________________ consent to participate in **Reanimating Dissonance** conducted by Brian Jude de Lima. I have understood the nature of this project and wish to participate. I am not waiving any of my legal rights by signing this form. My signature below indicates my consent.

I ____________________ DO NOT consent to participate in **Reanimating Dissonance** conducted by Brian Jude de Lima. I have understood the nature of this project and DO NOT wish to participate. I am not waiving any of my legal rights by signing this form. My signature below indicates my consent.

I, the undersigned, confirm that (please check box as appropriate):
1. I have read and understood the information about the project, as provided in the Purpose of the research section.

2. I have been given the opportunity to ask questions about the project and my participation.

3. I voluntarily agree to participate in the project.

4. I understand I can withdraw at any time without giving reasons and that I will not be penalized for withdrawing, nor will I be questioned about why I have withdrawn.

5. The procedures regarding confidentiality have been clearly explained (e.g. use of names, pseudonyms, anonymisation of data, etc.) to me.

6. The use of the data in research, publications, sharing and archiving has been explained to me.

7. I understand that my participation in this study is purely voluntary with NO monetary compensation.

8. Select only one of the following:
   - I would like my name used and understand what I have said or written, as part of this study will be used in reports, publications and other research outputs so that anything I have contributed to this project can be recognised.
   - I do not want my name used in this project.
10. I ______________________agree to have the data from my interview used for future related research studies. This data will be anonymized for any future use. I further acknowledge that the date when this data will be archived for future studies will commence after the interviewer has passed his dissertation defense. I also acknowledge that the interviewer will NOT destroy the data but it will be password protected on the interviewer’s computer for future studies.

11. I ______________________ DO NOT agree to have the data from my interview used for future related research studies and want my data destroyed at the end of the interviewer’s study.

Participant:

_________________ ________________ ____________
Name of Participant Signature Date

Principal Researcher:

Brian J. de Lima

_________________ ________________ ____________
Name of Researcher Signature Date