# INVITED TO THE FEAST?: PROBLEMS OF HOSPITALITY, COLONIALITY AND IDENTITY IN THE MUSIC CLASSROOM.

ELEANOR M. JOHNSTON

A Dissertation submitted to the Faculty of Graduate Studies in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Graduate Program in Education

York University

Toronto, Ontario

July 2020

© Eleanor M. Johnston, 2020

## Abstract

This study sought to understand the complicated interactions of student, teacher, curriculum and curricular objects in one junior music classroom in Ontario. This work was taken up under Derrida's call for cities of refuge in *On Cosmopolitanism and Forgiveness* while mindful of the ways in which colonial structures can appear cosmopolitan, as in the trope of music as universal language. It explored how changing the music that was studied might affect their perception of their own and others' belonging in the music room. This in turn, asks us to consider how curricular choices affect behavior, engagement and success in our students. Through ethnographically informed methods including interviews and observations, surveys and a curricular intervention using global pop music, student and teacher attitudes and engagement with diverse musics and cultures were examined. Three major themes emerged in the analysis; complex and conflicted identities in students who believed much of their tastes and selves did not belong at school, a rapid fluidity in musical taste, and the omnipresent shadow of a Western cultural framework of music curriculum, academic success, and schooling behavior and expectations. Several pedagogical and curricular implications were explored, including engaging students through academic approaches to music, student belonging and hospitality practices, and the difficulties of reception of multicultural approaches within the school.

## Dedication

For my parents, who gave me music, my husband, who makes my music, and my daughters, who are my music.

**Acknowledgements**

This dissertation would not be what it is without the steadfast and generous nurturance of Dr. Karen Krasny; throughout luxuriously discursive afternoons enriched with Bakhtin, Dewey, coffee cake (with sour cream), in frantic drafts, exchanged past bedtime, with introductions to colleagues, and the occasional reminder to take an afternoon to smell the roses, she steadily guided me through the last five years, keeping me on course, and bringing the fun too! My committee members, Dr. Aparna Tarc and Dr. Jen Jenson were also prompt and generous in their emails, comments and conversations with me, offering further readings and frameworks and viewpoints when I was in a jam. Thanks are also due to Dr. Lisa Farley and Dr. Dan Yon, who introduced me to Derrida, and provided comments on an early draft. Dr. Laura Weisman in her duties as internal examiner has asked me questions which will resonate for some time to come. Dr. Rena Upitis was a most rigorous, yet encouraging external examiner, and her comments have not only clarified this work, but inspired work to come.

To my family and friends, who have fed me, listened to me, argued with me, mothered my children when I was at conferences and generally made sure I had a home to come back to, Thank you! Scott and Grace, for reminding me that a good dissertation is a finished dissertation, and help with excel, Rosanna for help understanding some neurobiological papers, Daphne Maurer for reading through my survey and suggesting a few tweaks which made all the difference, Stacey Bliss, for the dreaming coffees, Josefina and Taru, for the 'mom's rock their dissertation' support group, Derek Tu and Fara Yassin for keeping it real.

Finally, Chad Martin, for proofreading, cooking, laundry and parenting, for being my soft place, and our two amazing girls, Josephine and Charlotte; yes we can get ice cream, I love you and am endlessly proud of you.

# Table of Contents

Abstract ..... i

Dedication ..... ii

Acknowledgements ..... iii

Table of Contents ..... iv

List of Tables ..... ix

Chapter 1: Introduction ..... 1

Research Questions ..... 2

Theoretical Framework ..... 4

Significance of the Study ..... 5

Methodology ..... 8

Limitations of the Study ..... 9

Definition of Terms ..... 10

Music ..... 10

Appropriation ..... 12

Diversity ..... 13

Culture ..... 13

Cultural Object ..... 15

Curricular/ Study Object ..... 15

Repertoire ... 16

Colonialism/Post-Colonialism/Decolonizing ... 16

Conclusion ... 17

Chapter 2: Review of Relevant Literature and Theoretical Framework ... 19

Review of Relevant Literature ... 19

History and Western Pedagogy ... 19

Teacher Training, Preference and Other Barriers ... 21

Approaches to Multicultural Music Teaching ... 24

Popular Music in Education ... 29

Music, Identity and Difference with Children ... 32

Available Research on Multicultural Music Education in Ontario ... 33

Theoretical Framework ... 41

Derrida ... 43

The Problem of Cosmopolitanism on Land with Imperial Legacies ... 48

Chapter 3: Methodology ... 51

Paradigm ... 51

Participants ... 52

Data Collection ... 54

Methods ... 60

Ethnographically Informed Research ... 60

Analysis ... 62

Sharing the Results ... 63

Considerations ... 63

Chapter 4: Findings ... 65

Observations on Part I: Pre-Survey ... 66

Question 1: How Do You Use Music in your Life? ... 66

Question 2: What Are Some Ways Other People Use Music in their Lives? ... 67

Question 3: What Are Some Ways You Use Music in School? ... 69

Question 4: What Are your 5 Favourite Songs? ... 69

Question 5: On a Scale of 5 How Much do You Enjoy your Time in Music Class? Why? 1 dislike 2 3 ok 4 5 love ... 70

Observations on Part II: Jigsaw Research Project ... 72

Question 1: What Are Some Interesting Facts About the Singer/Song and Video? ... 79

Question 2: What Is the Purpose of this Song? ... 81

Question 3: What Do You Think is the Most Important Line in the Song? Why? ... 84

Question 4: What Do You See in the Music Video? What Does this Tell You About the Song/Singer/Country? ... 86

Questions 5 and 6: What Do You Hear in this Song? (Dynamics, Rhythm, Pitch/Melody?) Give Examples of What You Hear. B) Why Are those Elements Important in the Song? How Are They Used in the Song? ... 89

Observation on Part III: You be the DJ ... 93

Group 1: Saturn, Muhammed and Harnish ........ 94

Group 2: Jordan and Sadit ........ 95

Group 3: Anne, Ranya, Aisha ........ 95

Group 4: Ramona, Abisha, Brighton ........ 96

Group 5: Samar, Adiv, Vyan ........ 97

Group 6: Catalina, Ivy ........ 97

Group 7: Pushpa, Hala ........ 98

Independents ........ 99

Observations on Phase IV: Post-Intervention Survey ........ 100

Question 1: What Did You Learn about Music and Musical Cultures Around the World? ........ 101

Question 2: On a Scale of 5 Did You Enjoy this Music Unit More or Less than your Regular Music Class? Why? What Did You Find Challenging and Enjoyable About this Unit? ........ 101

Question 3: Which of the Songs You Learned About in Class Would You Add to your Playlists? Why or Why Not? ........ 104

Question 4: If You Were Given a $10 Gift Certificate to iTunes and an iPod, What Songs Would You Buy? ........ 105

Question 5: Is there Anything Else You Would Like to Tell your Classroom Teacher or the Researcher? ........ 106

Question 6: Using Symbols, Words, and Pictures, Draw a Self-Portrait of how You Felt in Music Class During this Project. ... 106

Conclusion ... 106

Chapter 5: Analysis of Findings ... 108

How Does One Junior Division Music Teacher and her Students Navigate the Tensions between Cosmopolitan Identities in Culturally Diverse Classrooms on the One Hand, and Colonial Understandings of Music and its Purpose within the Curriculum on the Other? ... 110

How is the introduction of study objects from pop music around the world helpful in addressing these tensions? ... 114

How Does Offering Curricular Objects (I.E. Music Videos) from Multiple Cultures Affect Students' Professed Identities/Choices in Music? ... 119

Multiculturalism, Cosmopolitanism and the Limits of the Theoretical Framework ... 122

Pedagogical Implications ... 125

Students' Understanding of Music and the Preparation of Music Teachers ... 125

Pedagogical Challenges and Rewards of Jigsaw Design ... 127

The Challenges of "Enjoyment" as a Pedagogical Goal ... 132

Conclusion ... 134

Chapter 6: Conclusion ... 137

Methodological Implications ... 138

Implications for Researchers and Practitioners ... 141

Lockdown: Cosmopolitanisms in the Time of Covid-19 ........ 144

Conclusion ........ 150

References: ........ 153

Appendix A: Demographic Chart of Participants ........ 170

Appendix B: Global Pop Songs compiled for the study ........ 171

**List of Tables**

**Table 1** ........ 71

**Table 2** ........ 71

**Table 3:** ........ 74

**Table 4** ........ 75

**Table 5** ........ 76

**Table 6** ........ 76

**Table 7** ........ 77

**Table 8** ........ 78

**Table 9** ........ 78

**Table 10** ........ 102

**Table 11** ........ 103

**Table 12** ........ 104

## Chapter 1: Introduction

"Finally, a Black composer!" said Enrico, slapping his thigh for emphasis. He had just caught sight of February's revamped "Composer of the Month" bulletin board. It now featured 'the Black Mozart' Joseph Boulogne, Chevalier de St. George in the iconic white wig and ornate jacket of former occupants such as Bach, Handel and Mozart. While there are several stories that I tell about my journey into the academy, this is the most succinct. In a single statement we find the themes which have continued to entwine themselves throughout my work. Themes which have been my cherished companions one moment and intrusive 'earworm' the next. The desire to belong, or find a mirror, within the music classroom, the importance of very specific representation of culture and self and the rewards to the music teacher of hearing these longings, beckon and haunt me on my way.

This work describes, not only the curricular intervention of the study, but also my own experience and reflections as a teacher, scholar, and researcher. As I speak at times from the authority of my experience, it may be helpful to know more about it. I entered the classroom having studied classical music starting with violin at 6, or a harpsichord concert in utero, adding piano, Flamenco dance, and operatic vocal training along the way. I did a Master's degree in Musicology and Ethnomusicology before turning to teaching. Enrico's exclamation occurred sometime in the spring term of 2012, in a keyboard and vocal-based music class which I shared with another, more senior teacher. This was my third of five long term occasional placements, and the second in which I taught music exclusively, in a large, suburban board which was rapidly becoming much more racially, culturally, and linguistically diverse. In elementary schools, I have most usually taught a vocal and Orff-based program, with some influence from Kodaly. I have addressed diversity through listening and research projects, and transcriptions of pop and

folk music I found through the students or community. I had previously taught music history and drama in a private high school in Toronto, and worked in the education department of the Buffalo Philharmonic Orchestra. I completed my teacher training in Buffalo from 2005-2006, and had the opportunity to observe music and general education pedagogy and practices both in the training institutions, and public schools there. After my acceptance full time to York University, and with two small children at home, I chose to work only as an occasional teacher in two boards in the Greater Toronto Area. This experience, which has taken me into urban, suburban, and semi-rural music and general classrooms, inner city and wealthy neighbourhoods from Scarborough to Caledon, informs my reception and discussion of policy and implementation around the Ontario curriculum.

**Research Questions**

> "…when all students are respected and see themselves reflected in their learning and their environment."(Wynne, K. in Ontario Ministry of Education, 2009)

As a relatively new teacher I was struggling to reconcile what and how I had been taught with the brand new diversity-focused Arts curriculum (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2009b). I was limited by the resources I had to hand and yet pushed forward by the desires of my students. I found a partial solution in using popular music from regions with which the students had affiliations, largely bollywood and soca songs. Although cobbled together from a chapter in Sarazzin's (2009) excellent book, YouTube and Wikipedia, these lessons were some of my most successful. I began to wonder what the risks and rewards were here, what I might be missing or messing up, and what others were doing. Off to the academy I went, where my 'modest proposal' turned out to require some major thinking.

What could be more innocuous than popular music? After all, by its commodified design, it is pleasurable, not overtly political, meant to be hummed idly and forgotten. Immersed as I was

in Western classical music, it was always a secret and guilty pleasure. My ‘best of the 50s’, Stan Rogers and Beach Boys cassettes were hidden behind Elgar’s cello concerto and La Bohème. However, I argue, the music we enjoy, the music we will admit to enjoying, and the music we teach, are intricately linked to our identities and agencies in the broader world. And if this is true for adults, it is even more urgent for young people, who must navigate the complex social relationships of school, defining themselves from their parents, and envisioning, as Arendt (2006) puts it, a future we cannot. The music we use in school matters, music in school matters. And I found in the music classroom a place where there was at once unity, as we sing in unison, and plurality. Students and teachers had multiple and complex identifications of place, gender and its roles, culture, and religion.

While the identities of its intended recipients are not, the music curriculum in Ontario is based in a Western classical conception of what music is, the skills needed to ‘do’ music and the purposes for which music is used. Although it includes gestures towards a more generous definition such as curriculum prompts about “aboriginal drumming practices” and “steel pan drums” these felt like late additions to the draft rather than purposeful inclusions. My study, therefore, sought to explore these tensions between identity, colonial remains and practice through the inclusion of pop music songs from a variety of continents and cultures. It was guided by the following three questions.

1) How does a junior division music teacher in Ontario navigate the tensions between cosmopolitan identities in culturally diverse classrooms on the one hand, and colonial understandings of music and its purpose within the curriculum on the other.

2) How is the introduction of study objects from pop music around the world helpful in addressing these tensions?

3) How does offering curricular objects (i.e. music videos) from multiple cultures affect students' professed identities/choices in music?

**Theoretical Framework**

These were the questions that I was asking but to ask them I needed to wonder about other things; what is the root of these cosmopolitan identities; what are the investments of music education in colonial projects; what grounds my study? I found the beginnings of an answer in the second verse of our national anthem, itself a fraught object, our home "on native land" (Shatner). "Thou land of hope for all who toil, the true north strong and free". Though we don't sing this verse regularly in school, the underlying sentiment, that Canada is a refuge from and protector of the world is seen in textbooks which document our contributions to World War 1 and 2 and stress the peacekeeping work we have undertaken since, and school charity projects to send money to nations lacking water, and Remembrance Day assemblies which document conflict in other areas of the world (in my own time at school Iraq and Rwanda, and during my career as a teacher: Syria, Chechnya, Israel/Palestine, Colombia, and Russia/Ukraine).

Canada prefers to view itself as the good guy (Regan, 2011). In this view, Canada is a refuge of the world and has an obligation towards other parts of the world less fortunate than itself. Consider, not only the words of our national anthem, quoted above, but also our traditional role within the UN peacekeepers, and the outcry when Harper chose to send troops to Afghanistan, reducing our peacekeeping contributions elsewhere (Hancey, 2017). Both the concern with justice and quality of life for those in other countries, and the desire to provide place to those displaced elsewhere can be embraced within cosmopolitanism. In *On Cosmopolitanism and Forgiveness*, Derrida (2001) imagines cities of refuge which require of the cosmopolitan a hospitality without limits. The aporetic space he creates is difficult for a country

state to enact given that their existence is generally predicated upon producing and enforcing the limits of law. However, within the complicated relationships of the classroom, this ideal of hospitality is helpful and relevant to the role of the teacher, who acts as host within the power structure of the room. If you doubt this positioning, let me remind you of the North American tradition of the first day gift of an apple, the students bring with them a hostess gift for their teacher as they enter his/her territory.

If I take up this view of the teacher as host, then I must ask; how do I make students feel at home in the music room? What should I provide to be a good host? Legend has it that when Queen Victoria gave a state dinner for the Shah of Persia he picked up his finger bowl and drank it. Victoria immediately followed suit to spare the Shah embarrassment (Martin, 2005). He might well have been embarrassed for the Queen that she was serving *zerbet* in bowls! As a music teacher, I can select repertoire which is nourishing, and which encourages my students to feel welcome. To invite them, I will have to extend my own musical habits to include music from a diversity of cultures and genres. This choice benefits students who might otherwise feel excluded from the school curriculum and might/might not choose to invest effort therein. Identification with the curriculum is often a concern of diversity programming. It may also benefit each child in the classroom by expanding what Nussbaum (2012) calls circles of concern -- their identification and responsibility for “the other” from home and family out into the wider community and the world.

**Significance of the Study**

A sense of belonging, expanded responsiveness to the other and the world, and a new skill is rather a lot to hope for from an hour or so a week. Nevertheless, music is rather miraculous stuff, activating and affecting memory, the circulatory system (Trimble &

Hesdorffer, 2017), cooperation, discipline, and pleasure. And yet, despite more than a century of slow progress towards inclusive music repertoires (Quesada & Volk, 1997; Volk, 1993, 1997), academy, curriculum and many teachers treat as exotic music which is not Western art music. Multiple dissertations and journal articles in the US have explored teacher-candidates' perceptions and anxieties around "multicultural" music (Castagno, 2012; Cavitt, 2013; Kahn et al., 2014; Kelly-McHale, 2013; Laird, 2011; J. A. Moore, 1993; Quesada & Volk, 1997; Richardson, 2004; Teicher, 1997). Even these well-intentioned studies betray a perception of "music" as Western art music, anything else requires the qualifier multicultural. Cultural change may be hard and slow, but it is moving very slowly indeed in the music education world. This study aims to nudge the conversation forward by suggesting an inclusive route which does not require extensive and immersive study, expensive instruments and resources. Global pop music is readily available through the internet and has enough roots in Western musical traditions to accommodate current curricular demands.

Volk (1997) describes the publishing of Egon Kraus's 1967 speech to the International Society of Music Educators (ISME) as a watershed moment for multicultural music education. In this speech, he challenged music educators to open their and their students' ears as a pathway to open minds. He outlined eight challenges that lay before the community, notably inclusion of global musics at all levels of education and the development of proper pedagogical materials for said teaching. The professional conversation around music teaching in schools has acknowledged the need for a more diverse, multicultural pedagogical literature from at least this point (McKoy, 2017). Four decades on, I still find a lack of resources, community members who feel left out in school music concerts (Duffus, personal communications) and teachers trained predominantly in Western art music and its pedagogies.

In turning to literature on diversity in the music classroom in Ontario, one finds a paucity of ethnographic data, and few serious attempts to grapple with the euro-centric curricular and performance practices problematized by Cohen (1994), Bradley (2006), and Hess (2013). Furthermore, apart from Hess, few scholars looked at the use of popular music with which, in my experience, many teachers in the Greater Toronto Area (GTA) enliven their programmes. This study is able to provide insight into current diversity and hospitality practices in an elementary music classroom in the GTA and concludes with instructional and policy recommendations.

Recent longitudinal studies have demonstrated the broad positive effects of music education on educational outcomes. Jaschke, Honing and Scherder (2018) in a randomized trial of arts-based interventions on 147 preschoolers found increases in executive and cognitive performance amongst those receiving music education versus those receiving visual art or the control group. Piro and Ortiz (2009) using a quasi-experimental design in two cohorts of second-graders, found improved reading skills in those who received piano instruction versus those who did not. Guhn, Emerson and Gouzouasis (2020) found through an analysis of the academic records of 4 cohorts in Grades 7-12 in British Columbia that high school students who participated in formal music courses at school showed greater academic gains in English, Mathematics and Science than their peers. Importantly, he found this was true regardless of socio-economic and other factors.

Furthermore, the Ontario Ministry of Education commissioned a monograph on the link between music education and literacy for a 2009 Research into Practice series and the National Center for Bio-Technology Information has made available several meta-analyses of research on academic and music outcomes which suggest that music may be an important factor in student academic success and should be a priority for further study. Given the long-term positive

correlations between music and academic achievement, it can be argued that making school music classes inclusive and inviting is crucial to the success of students often labeled 'at-risk' because of socio-economic and/or cultural factors. For example, in the most recent available data from the Toronto District School Board ( *High School* > *Graduation Rate*, n.d.), students who identified as Black, Eastern European, LGBTQ, or had single parent households, all graduated at lower rates than the board average. Ensuring that already mandatory music classes were appealing and laid the groundwork for participation in high school music, particularly some kind of instrumental music, would seem like a relatively easy way to boost other equity measures within a school board.

**Methodology**

The study was designed using qualitative methodologies appropriate to questions of perception, identity and attitude. These concepts are difficult to measure quantitatively as their meaning and interpretation shift from subject to subject. Ethnographic research studies people as they go about their every-day lives (Emerson, Shaw, & Fretz, 2011). School is a part of the elementary student's everyday life; involving the researcher in the classroom (participant observation) makes them part of the quotidian. As Emerson et al. note, ethnography allows the researcher to see how others and themselves respond to "events and the circumstances which caused them" (Emerson, Shaw, & Fretz, 2011, p. 7). The data collection took place during all 8 of the 50-minute periods the students were in music with their music teacher over a 9 week period in late April through June 2019. The study was divided into three parts: pre-survey, classroom intervention, and post-survey. Participants were an interested music specialist teacher and her thirty-one Grades 4 and 5 students in a large public school board in Ontario. The teacher interviews were triangulated with in-class observation of student-teacher interactions, teacher

planning documents, the Ontario Arts Curriculum and school concert programs. Student experience as documented in their pre- and post-questionnaires (structured as inquiry and reflection sheets) and their paperwork during the unit was triangulated with in-class observation, discussion with their homeroom teacher and by two group interviews with eight students at the end of the unit. Those students were selected based on their in-class responses with additional consideration to their demographic representation and gender. Additionally, a follow up discussion with students on an individual basis a year later yielded important insights into the ripple effect of curriculum and identity.

Ongoing qualitative data analysis was twofold. The open coding phase identified emerging themes from interview and field-notes, suggesting questions for the exit interviews and final student self-reflection, while fine-grained analysis in the focused-coding phase generated a list of categories for the final work (Emerson, Shaw, & Fretz, 2011).

## Limitations of the Study

The major limitations of this study were the constraints of geography, number of participants, thirty-one students were in the classroom activities but only twenty-seven were included, and time. The study took place over 9 weeks between April and June 2019. It was conducted in one music class, in one school with only one participating teacher. It was not controlled, therefore, for changes in weather, individual class character, or the existing relationship between teacher and class. I would be cautious, therefore, of making sweeping recommendations or policy change on its findings. It can confidently suggest areas for further research, trouble certain assumptions of our current educational framework and make some suggestions towards best practice.

## Definition of Terms

### *Music*

What is the difference between music and noise? In my music classroom and for the purpose of this study I have drawn on Blacking's (1973/2000) helpful definition to operationally define music as organized sound. Specifically, Blacking calls music: "humanly organized sound" (1973/2000, p. 10). While this definition is so broad as to be almost nonsensical, for what is speech if not organized sound, my students seem to have been able to understand it as broad enough to incorporate rap and not so broad as to include the rhythmic aspects of speeches by Martin Luther King Jr. Another important facet of the definition of music, indeed the *raison d'etre* of ethnomusicology, is articulated by Alan Merriam in his book, *The Anthropology of Music* (1964/2006). Music is a social behavior, and within a given society, sounds will be classified as music/not music based on the accepted limits defining such boundaries. As his later discussion makes clear, even within a single culture, there is often a great deal of sound which an individual listener may/may not call music based on personal preference, context and intent. So that amongst the Basongye of Africa an ocarina is a musical instrument when accompanying dances but when used to make hunting calls either in hunting or in the performance of a hunting song, it is a tool. It is important to this study that human beings produce and organize sound for a variety of purposes and that there is no universally precise definition possible as to what is/is not music nor its purpose. In summation, drawing on the work of Blacking and Merriam, musical behavior is found amongst all peoples throughout the world and in each society it has specific functions, purposes and place.

One use of music, in many cultures, is as a mnemonic aid. Counting songs and rhymes, alphabet songs, songs which tell a culturally important story, such as Irish ballads, songs which

describe important places and practices and people, such as the memorial songs composed by the Kaluli are examples of this use of music as memory aid. Thus, in a monocultural context (one in which only one culture is found), music easily finds its place within the daily life of the child. But what happens when we move into a multicultural setting? Huis Schippers (2010) describes music education as happening along a continuum moving from monocultural through multicultural, to intercultural and ending at transcultural. In transcultural music education multiple musics and perspectives thereof are taught in such depth that new fused genres and criteria result. I would identify the current Ontario curriculum as being largely multicultural, that is, multiple musics are acknowledged and taught yet the overwhelming aesthetic/structural guides, that which Schippers calls "quality," remain those of Western classical music. In other words, though the curriculum is multicultural in material it maintains a monocultural approach to quality and pedagogy. I advocate moving towards a music education that is intercultural, where multiple musics are taught with reference to each other, fusion or mixing may occur, and "quality is assessed from multiple cultural perspectives" (Schippers, 2010, p. 123). The final stage, transcultural, is not, in my opinion, a goal which is appropriate to the classroom. Within the colonial context of education in North America and the very difficult history of indigenous education in Canada particularly, there are places in which settler/immigrant music teachers must tread carefully if at all. Such teachers as have access and resources to learn directly from an elder and have permission to engage in instruction from them might begin to approach music of traditional caretakers in a transcultural fashion. The spectacular fusion of hip hop/ electronic music and pow wow music of Tribe Called Red, for example, ought, in my opinion, to be listened to but not emulated by non-indigenous students and teachers, at this time. One of my proudest moments as a teacher, was when a small group of students came up with and performed

for me a Hip-Hop/Bollywood fusion of “Sumer is Icumen in” complete with beatboxing. This was after they had performed it in a flawless round with dance. They demonstrated to me that with mastery comes belonging and with belonging comes fusion. Students will seek to refract the unfamiliar through their own cultural mediums. However, the history of colonial power and appropriation in Canada render this step difficult in a public school context as was seen in the 2018 fracas when a teacher led her music class in a performance of “Land of the Silver Birch” in Toronto (*Toronto Music Teacher Sues Principal, VP Who Criticized Use of ‘Racist’ Land of the Silver Birch in Play | National Post*, n.d.).

***Appropriation***

Appropriation happens in the liminal spaces where cosmopolitanism, at least as Kant and Derrida envision it, fails. If there is a universal right to the surface of the earth, then many of the questions of power which inflect the use and abuse of music disappear under this imperative. Throughout a graduate course on cosmopolitanism and education, I engaged in a search for music which would demonstrate a cosmopolitan ethos. This proved impossible, despite fruitful discussion, and I eventually settled on hybridity to describe these works. I have continued to work with both hybridity and fusion but have yet to find a satisfactory description of the complex undercurrents engendered by the mixing of musical traditions. Though the term appropriation is widely applied to describe any use of cultural heritage material by those not born into a specific culture, this seems too rigid to me. Appropriation occurs when a person within a power role claims as their own the property of another. Appropriation implies a legal theft, for example land can be appropriated by the government. In music, appropriation often describes the decontextualized use of traditional musics in pop songs by White men and women for profit (Kennedy & Laczniak, 2014). One particularly egregious example is the hit “Sweet Lullaby” by

Deep Forest, released in 1992 (Feld, 2000). This ambient dance track misattributes a field recording of a lullaby from the Solomon Islands to the African Pygmy people. Although the performer of the lullaby, Afunakwa, is credited in the original recording, the CD credits the African Pygmy. The entire project is controversial; neither Indigenous group was consulted in the use of their music, via historical recordings, and the small portion of the profits they do receive is given to a foundation in their name, as though they were children. It would be quite easy for a public school classroom to end up in a similar, albeit less profitable situation, if musics are taught without reference to context or embedded values. This is a danger which the common elements approach can fail to recognize. However, to take the attitude that all use of another's culture is appropriation risks denying the complex ways in which people build identity.

***Diversity***

In education, we more often see diversity used to refer to learning styles and issues, as in the phrase "diverse learners." This conception of diversity was not the focus of the study. The greater Toronto area (GTA) is a place enlivened by many languages, music genres, foods, styles of dress and religions and it is this diversity of culture, contained by law and policy, that centers our study.

***Culture***

While it is often used as a code word for race/ethnicity, this study works with culture as the complex meeting space of family origins, language, religion and musical traditions. What we mean by culture is a complex, and often contested term. As one student said, "*it's not just where you're born or where you live.*" Both students and the researcher struggled to define this word in our conversations, agreeing that it was not the same as nationality, nor where your family came

from “heritage” and yet both those things can play a part in culture. The students were content to know it when they saw it but for the purposes of this dissertation it is helpful to be more precise.

I therefore situate my discussion of culture within Taylor and Kymlicka. Taylor (1994) takes up the communal aspects of culture, the need to be recognized for oneself and the devastation of living in a society which reflects back to a minority group a caricatured or reduced version of this self. Drawing on Hegel, Rousseau and Herder, he argues that we have moved from definition of the self through hierarchy to an essential me, which is characterized both my internal moral impulses and the dialogue of the self with “significant others” (p. 32). In the music classroom misrecognition can be the assumption that one can guess a person’s music preferences by the colour of their skin, or, conversely, the exclusion of culturally important music from the room for subject or difficulty or language concerns. In the second case, by failing to provide cultural objects of identification, I would argue that we are suppressing the students’ dialogical possibilities. How can they come to a place of the self, if that self is not welcome at school?

The problem of a self unwelcome in society brings us to our second author. Kymlicka (1996) is interested in the ways in which cultural claims interact with individual rights. Kymlicka sees culture as a place in which to ground one’s identity, a source of support in the pursuit of individual goals. He argues for the conception of a societal culture, that is one that “provides its members with meaningful ways of life across the full range of human activities, including social, educational, religious, recreational, and economic life, encompassing both public and private spheres” (p. 2). This societal culture is supported by language and institutions. The problem, then, for a person who is from a minority culture is that the institutional support of culture is lost. The framework within which they judge actions and ideas as good or bad is abrogated, leading to

a loss of personal freedom. The conception of culture as a place of beginning for the self, and Taylor's problematization of tensions between minority and majority culture both are important to this study. Their claims support the study's interest in student belonging through music repertoire.

In GTA schools, however, many students have multiple ethnic and religious identities within their households and themselves. Children may identify deeply with a dual-national identity, as in the student I encountered dancing *banghra* in his Leaf's jersey, or not very much, as in my confusion when he told me that as someone of Eastern European descent, I must be so very proud of Alex Ovechkin, the excellent hockey player from Russia. In widening the multiculturalism debate to include pluri-culturalism, the study builds its foundations in cosmopolitanisms to work with culture as a shifting, fluid, omnivorous thing which more often adopts/adapts/transforms than rejects the ideas, sounds and flavours with which it comes in contact.

***Cultural Object***

A thing in which people locate and express their cultural identity. This could be, for example, a place, language or word, prayer, poem, story. It could also be a song, a culturally specific form of dress or ornament, a tool or a particular style of food. There are any number of objects through study of which we can come to a greater understanding of our own and others culture/identity.

***Curricular/ Study Object***

I have used the terms curricular object, study object and object of study to delineate what we use to accomplish the curriculum from curriculum itself. Curriculum is used in two ways in this study. The first is the Ontario Arts Curriculum, a ministry-issued document which public

school teachers are obligated to follow; in this context, curriculum outlines what skills and topics must be taught. I also consider curriculum under the much broader definition of Pinar (1995), which encompasses what is taught, how it is approached, and the types of relationality it engenders. A curricular object, then is the song, book, historical event, chestnut tree, or music video through which we seek understanding. It is the poem of a classmate with which we interrogate personal knowings. It is that which grounds our exploration, motivates our questions, and moves us to wonder, sadness or joy. Curricular objects are often chosen in a rush, or from habit, and they deserve more care. For, in my experience, it is in resonating, "in the deep hearts core" (Yeats,1892) or not, that curricular objects invite or block the student from the conversation of curriculum.

***Repertoire***

I use repertoire in the music specific sense of the compositions we learn for performance, whether informally in class, or for a public presentation such as a school concert or competitive festival such as Kiwanis. This study was not oriented towards repertoire expansion but could certainly be a step towards doing so.

***Colonialism/Post-Colonialism/Decolonizing***

I didn't set out to overthrow the Empire/s but I did notice the absurdity of teaching Western European history to racialized children as 'our glorious past'. Edward Said (1979), whose contrapuntal perspective (2002) I take up in the conclusion of my work, noted the ways in which American and English literature and art reduced Middle Eastern and Eastern culture to the eroticized (harems, sarabandes) or terrible (Turandot, terrorists). In this fantasy of the other, Said argues that we see the perpetuation of Colonialism. Willinsky (1998) takes up these ideas in tracing the ways in which Empire shaped and used public education and institutions, such as the

museum, to harness colonized peoples to its own aims and purposes. I see some of these undercurrents in claims that music, particularly Western classical music, is 'universal' while ignoring the ways in which racism and colonialism have shaped who performs for whom and how their performance is received.

**Conclusion**

I have sketched for the reader the journey which I undertook to arrive at this writing; The ways in which I recognized the importance of my students' identities in the classroom and in music, the complicated theoretical underpinnings of music and of identity, and some of the conversation in the academy around expanding the music curriculum. In the chapters to follow, I will broaden and deepen this conversation.

In Chapter 2, I situate the reader within the existing academic discussion by providing a brief overview of the development of formal music pedagogy and then highlighting relevant themes within the academic literature. While I have occasionally drawn from literature dating to the 1960s, this literature review is largely drawn from work after 2000 as both the global context of education, and the discussion around the meaning of multicultural education has shifted over time. It by no means offers an exhaustive exploration of literature around themes important to this study, such as music and identity-building, the use of music in education, and popular music, but aims, rather to choose those particular articles of most relevance to our inquiry. The topics covered include: barriers to broader cultural representation in music, particularly teacher training and preference, the arguments for including popular music in education, music as signifier and locus of identity, and a survey of writing on multiculturalism in music education in Ontario. I follow a similar structure in exploring the roots of Cosmopolitanism in Western philosophy,

particularly Derrida, its application in the classroom in Ontario, and the tensions of hospitality and colonialism.

In Chapter 3 the particulars of the study are laid out including paradigm, participants, data collection and analysis. I detail what I collected, who was involved in that collection, how I collected it, and how I sought to understand it.

In Chapter 4, I describe the experiences of researcher, students, and teacher during the project. Weaving together written responses, researcher observations and teacher interview to present the collected data in coherent and understandable form.

In Chapter 5, I describe the collected data in terms of theme and outlier. I organized this discussion first by revisiting my three research questions and then by moving into implications and challenges such as pedagogy, class size and curriculum which relate to, but were not covered by the research questions.

In Chapter 6, I turn to technical considerations of research in elementary schools, recommendations arising from the study and a reflection on cosmopolitanisms in the age of Covid-19. I end our discussion, as I began, with a specific student encounter, from the final interview of the study, which poignantly illustrates the themes and challenges of the work.

# Chapter 2: Review of Relevant Literature and Theoretical Framework

## Review of Relevant Literature

### *History and Western Pedagogy*

Music has been integral to education from the earliest written records to the present day. While formal education in the West has tended to focus on art musics, the boundary between art and folk music has always been fluid. In Western Art Music, we find use of folk melodies in Mass arrangements in the medieval period, arrangements of folk melodies by Mozart and Beethoven, Bartok's interest in collecting and cataloguing Hungarian folk melodies, and many compositions "in the style of" in every European nation towards the end of the 19th and early 20th century (Grout and Palisca., 2014). Like fine art and cooking, music is a place of mixture and experimentation with styles; some examples of Western composers exploring idioms from cultures other than their own (though not without issues) are Mozart's (k331) "Rondo a la Turca", Debussy's (1901) "Nuages", and Gershwin's (1924) *Rhapsody in Blue*.

Early pedagogy focused largely on techniques and skills to be acquired and sources range from philosophical treatises such as Xunxi's defence of music as joy and Plato's view of music as developing discipline and knowing right (beautiful) from wrong (Mark, 2013), to music theory works from al Farabi (Sawa, 1989), Guido of Arezzo and others, to books of technical studies and small pieces such as Vaccai's 1832 work, "Practical Method of Italian Singing" (Vaccai & Paton, 2013) and *Notenbuechlein Fuer Anna Magdalena Bach* (Heinemann, 1983). Most source works do not differentiate between adult and child students. Development of formal pedagogies around *how*, rather than *what* to teach rises in the late 19th and early 20th century.

The best known methodologies in Western music education are Zoltan Kodaly (1882-1967) a singing method based on language acquisition, rhythm and pitch; Carl Orff (1895-1982)

known as *schulwerk,* a method incorporating simple instruments and movement to encourage improvisation, and Emile Jacques-Dalcroze (1865-1950) whose theories about rhythm and movement, crystallized in the concept of eurythmics, have influenced most Western pedagogues. Many music educators in Ontario, and indeed the curriculum itself, draw from Kodaly's method of teaching music notation and ear training and Orff's approach to encouraging musical creativity in children through simple instruments and music composition tasks. Music teacher programs often are situated within conservatory style programs which tend to privilege Western classical music techniques and pedagogies, though increasing attention is being paid, at least in the literature, to preparing teacher candidates to teach "multiculturally" (Adderley, 2000; Basu, 2011; Hargreaves & Marshall, 2003).

Interest by music educators in including music from many cultures has been catalogued at least from the 1920s. However, the motivations behind this interest and approaches within it have been quite varied. Little research on the Canadian context is available but Volk traces the gradual widening of American music curriculums to include at first Southern and Eastern European folk musics, coinciding with increased immigration from these countries, Native and African American musics in the early 1900s (Tuley, 1980; Volk, 1997), to Latin American music in the 50s, African and Asian musics in the 70s, up to the quite varied offerings of the current day albeit still rooted in the pedagogy and music of the German Western classical tradition (Quesada & Volk, 1997; Volk, 1993). Initially this enriched curriculum was viewed as important to the successful assimilation of immigrants and later aims included better international relations (in the 40s) and concerns with civil rights, educational success, equity and social justice from the 1970s on (Edwards, 1998).

***Teacher Training, Preference and Other Barriers***

A known barrier to music teachers teaching music outside the Western canon is their preparation as teachers in the academy (Adderley, 2000; Allsup, 2011; Anderson, 1992; Castagno, 2012; Kahn et al., 2014; Kantorski & Stegman, 2006; Sands, 1991; Sands, 1996; Teicher, 1997). Teachers are more likely to choose music with which they are familiar or in which they have formal training (Cavitt, 2013; Klocko, 1989; Laird, 2011). University music programs, professional bodies, such as the Ontario Music Educators' Association (OMEA), and various individuals have attempted to redress this through additional course offerings, workshops and professional development but a divide between what teacher candidates are taught, Western classical music, and what they are expected to teach, all musics, is perpetuated in the conservatory system (Campbell, 2002; Hargreaves & Marshall, 2003; Teicher, 1997). The conservatory system can refer to the pipeline of private instruction through to professional music schools, or to post-secondary departments which specialize in music teacher education. A frustrated Wicks (1998), notes that nearly 98 percent of course offerings in music departments were focused on Western art music and traditions. She laments that in no other history field would such specialization focused on the elite be imaginable. Wang and Humphreys' (2009) study of American conservatory programs found ninety-three percent of course and ensemble time was devoted to the Western art tradition. Furthermore, they observe that even when traditional American music was performed, it was generally done through the filter of such practice in four-part harmonized choral settings rather than in the improvisatory campfire style of origin. A similar study in the Canadian context found only 9% of undergraduate music courses had any multicultural content (Madrazo, 2017). Despite a lively academic debate ranging from Campbell's (2002) desire to incorporate traditional musics from around the world, Elliott's

(1990; 2014) suggestion for a shift to praxis-focused music education (shifting teachers towards the uses of music in human community), to Bradley's (2006) anti-racist work, change is very slow in the academy. Even focused interventions by Allsup (2010) and Burton (2011) have failed to produce noticeable effects. Norman (1999) and Wang and Humphreys (2009) suggest that many professors are skeptical of the need for multicultural music education for their students. Even if they were not skeptical, they themselves lack the expertise to teach multiple musics. It is unclear whether this skepticism stems from undervaluing the othered musics or feeling that the skills to access these musics should be transferable from what is explicitly taught.

A partial answer to this problem, in the US, is found in Wilkinson's (1996) description of redesigning the usual historical survey course on (Western art) music to incorporate Black American music. He uses Jazz, including a section on North African music (the source of blue notes in the blues scale and the driving, syncopated rhythms typical to rhythm and blues, jazz and contemporary pop music) and classical American composers (Black and White) who created fusion pieces as part of the soundscape of America. This bold and time-intensive endeavour, he writes, has been largely successful, though individual students report feeling alienated orlacking enough time to properly grapple with the themes of the course. I would add that he does not reference the Hispanic portion of America's history, a population which is being insufficiently served by music education in the United States at present (Graham, 2009; Kelly-McHale, 2013).

Another challenge for music teachers in the classroom is finding sufficient time and resources to teach several traditions effectively. Pressed to teach the core of the music curriculum, they revert to the traditions in which they were taught, which continues predominantly to be Western European folk songs and art music. The colonial project of education (Willinsky, 1998b), including music education, has been so successful that when I ask

students to bring music from home, it is not unusual to find new words inserted into familiar nursery rhymes (as in the moment when one of my students proudly presented a cassette tape with the important days of Ramadan set to “Mary had a Little Lamb”). Cohen (1994) vividly describes her ethical dilemma when she set out to collect traditional songs from her daughter’s school community and was invariably offered a translation of “Twinkle, Twinkle Little Star.” Many fine performers on the international stage come from China, Hong Kong and Korea, are of African descent or otherwise seem to uphold the idea that Western classical music is a universal language. In other words, while many school boards in Ontario are working to address the Whiteness of teaching, there is no guarantee that hiring a racialized teacher will substantially change the material content of music class if that teacher has come through a conservatory system. The Ontario qualification process for music teachers does not require such a background but my informal experience suggests that classroom teachers are intimidated and mystified by music teaching, particularly standard notation, and are unlikely to pursue the qualification. What does seem to be happening is the rise of lunchtime clubs, such as Bollywood or African dance or the Rap Club, where teachers are using their own knowledge and interests to carve out spaces for cultural expression outside of the formal curriculum.

Curricular resources are also a challenge. Ontario doesn’t provide a music textbook, leaving recommendation of resources and curriculum implementation up to the Ontario Music Educators’ Association. Surveys of existing resources show a paucity of examples of art musics from around the world (Belz, 2005; Mason, 2010; Rowland Woody, 1999; Tuley, 1980). Many multicultural collections either privilege European folk musics (with one or two examples from each country and then one example per continent elsewhere) or are designed to assist with the holiday concert which can lead to an over concentration of Christmas-based repertoire.

Routledge has begun publishing university-level textbooks focused on Global Popular Music (2020), but here too, they are focusing on European and Asian musics. There is an entire book dedicated to the popular music of Greece, one for Brazil and one for "Latin-American countries" but not one for Jamaica or Trinidad or Afghanistan, Syria nor any nation in Africa. I note that they do have an upcoming volume for Turkey,

As in other fields of study, the curricular objects, particularly for elementary students in general music programs, are a possible locus of belonging. In rejecting/accepting the music modeled for them, and in finding it reflects or is foreign to home culture and values, the student decides if music class is for them. For the teacher, especially if venturing beyond a purchased curriculum, there are questions of authority, authenticity and suitability (Abril, 2006a). If I am teaching a song in another language, am I pronouncing it correctly (Kelly-McHale, 2013)? How can I be sure the music is appropriate to a secular, teaching context (Drummond, 2014; Ghosh, 2013)? What if there are inappropriate words and I don't know? I used to play "Saj Daj Khe" for my students. This popular Bollywood song was recommended to me, and translated for me, by a colleague of South Asian descent who spoke Punjabi as a second language. I could always tell which students had fluent Punjabi in the class because they would giggle at a certain point. One of these students later explained that the character said a "bad word, not a swear, but not a nice name, sort of like idiot." I continued to use the song as a teaching example, in part because I didn't have anything to replace it with, but largely because it is a great song. I remained a little uneasy, however, about allowing such language in the room even confined to a song lyric.

### ***Approaches to Multicultural Music Teaching***

One importance of repertoire collections and teaching materials is that they can shape the teacher's approach or pedagogical choices. Hess (2015), drawing on feminist work by Mohanty

(2003), suggests three basic orientations to music from other' cultures: musician as tourist, musician as explorer, and finally comparative musics model, which one might argue was musician as scholar. She argues that the first two approaches perpetuate a racist centering of Western classical music in the classroom. Unfortunately, she continues, the curriculum, and our collective ideas of multiculturalism, shape these approaches as obvious and right. In stopping off at 'other' music, we continue to hold it, often derogatorily, to the standards and norms of Western classical music, a music she finds irrelevant to the average student in Canada. However, Hess reports that we can discover relevance with our students if we approach music relationally, that is in exploring the places and sounds in which musics cross (or borrow), concur and clash. Though she does not extend her argument to Schippers's continuum, I suggest that her relational approach is a possible way into an intercultural perspective of music (recognizing multiple definitions of quality).

In the following paragraphs, I will examine several possible ways to address the "tourist" problem: common elements with or without contextualization, immersion in specific musical cultures, collaborative community works, and the relational approach through material culture. Woven into the discussion of these approaches, I have argued that Global pop music has the potential to contain much of what makes these approaches attractive while being accessible, cheap and practical in many contexts.

If the teacher's goal is to welcome diversity in the classroom, it is not enough to simply provide examples from multiple musics. Abril and Ortloff (Abril, 2005, 2006b; Ortloff, 2013) find that simply playing music from another culture increases musical but not social acceptance. It is important to include contextual information about where/when the music is played and other aspects of that society if the goal is social tolerance. Tolerance is a troublesome

concept, in that it implies there is something to tolerate, and is difficult to measure. I prefer to use terms like understanding, empathy, identification, and acceptance but use here the term found in other studies. Contextualization can also help to avoid what Morton (1994, 2001) calls the "add and stir" approach, where teachers simply add in a little music of "other" origin or genre and hope it will suffice. Even Allsup's (2010) proposal of what I have dubbed thoughtful inclusion, where teachers are encouraged to think deeply about their reasons for choosing certain music and make more inclusive choices tends not to address the continued reliance on Western understandings of music's structure and purposes. In literature focused on the general music classroom teacher, a common elements structure is often proposed. In this case, the teacher uses multiple examples from different cultures focusing on timbre, rhythm, pitch, melody, form and dynamics (volume). This practically based approach can be effective musically but does not, as Abril discovered, necessarily lead to any gains in social appreciation of diversity. In these cases, even if the music is appreciated, the knowledge doesn't necessarily transfer to a wider appreciation of the culture or persons involved in its creation. In using popular music with video content, the approach of this study, I was able to combine the practical ease of an elements-based approach while introducing through video and biographical sources, some of the context which Abril, Campbell, Burton, and Dunbar-Hall find important. This contextual approach is also aligned with the Ontario curriculum, which tells us that:

> It is important, therefore, that students see and understand the arts in their wider context – as endeavours with important ideas for people – and that they learn to connect their knowledge of the arts to the world beyond the school. (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2009, p. 5.)

Another possible approach is that of immersion, as far as possible, in a specific traditional music culture. Known as global music pedagogy, this is the tack pursued by Patricia Shehan

Campbell, one of the foremost authorities on multicultural music education. Towards this end, she now oversees a music teacher professional development conference where teachers train intensively in one of several traditions for a week. This one week of study earns a certificate of accreditation through Smithsonian Folkways World Music Pedagogy. The 2018 conference offered participatory performance opportunities in Indonesian Gamelan and Zimbabwean Marimbas, as well as lectures on a wide variety of world and ethnic musics: African American Gospel Choir, pedagogy in India and Bulgaria etc. (Upcoming Courses for Teachers, n.d.). Sarrazin (2009), in her sourcebook for teaching Indian music, and Hennessy (2005), in her report on the Taiko Southwest project in England also favour this immersive approach. Immersive teaching of music, based in ethnomusicological practices and theories, is quite attractive in that it encourages contextual research, and experiential learning which are emerging as standards of practice within the literature, and indeed the curriculum, which encourages performance and creation as separate strands of assessment. It, nevertheless, faces two major barriers to implementation: the first is what Olsen (1995) calls ethnographic truth, a selection of issues I might also term authenticity. For example, Gamelan is tied to a spiritual practice and there are important rules of respectful behavior towards the instruments themselves. The second barrier is the material issue of both outfitting a school for such studies and not having time to study more than one or two music traditions in such a manner, leaving many students once again on the outside. These two barriers were substantial enough, in my opinion, to pursue a different approach for my study.

Another promising direction which I want to mention here was a collaborative, community-academy-institutional approach undertaken in Alberta recently. Wasiak (2005) describes how the local symphony, teacher education department, composers and First Nations

performers and elders from a local reserve collaborated on a concert-based experience of both Western art music and traditional legends, music, and musical techniques. The project had mixed success both artistically and in reception but does show that such collaboration is possible and can increase student engagement with material that might not have attracted them in, for example, a library display. Like ethnomusicological approaches, this offers a very rich experience, but is also heavily dependent on a rich reserve of communal and material resources which may/may not be available throughout Ontario, particularly in rural districts which often lack even a teacher with music qualifications (Measuring What Matters, n.d.).

Carolin (2006) suggests a relational approach through the study of material culture, in this case musical instruments. He argues that musical instruments as artifacts are ideal objects for study; they are tangible and intriguing and contain in themselves the seeds of many contemporary concerns. For example, the history of the ukulele and the banjo open the possibility of addressing the spread of Portuguese colonialism and the origin of the banjo in the forced movement of enslaved persons from Africa. The difficulty here, and what is not entirely clear in Carolin's paper, is the distinction between tourism and relational approaches. Carolin roots his approach in Dunbar-Halls' (2005) discussion of power relations in cultural studies -- who has the power and how does this define the terms. However, Carolin does not address the need for teachers within this approach to remain alert to the complexities of their practice. It is easy, on the ground, to shy away from the controversial moment, or rush into the practice because the kids are restless that day or upset or there is a concert to prepare for, or a fire drill. This myriad of complicating factors may lead the teacher to skip the context that complicates enriches and equalizes the narrative. One advantage of using music videos is that the issues become unavoidable. The context and its issues are embedded in the object of study.

***Popular Music in Education***

Regardless of origins, is popular music really an appropriate curricular object? What do we gain, and lose, by bringing these songs into the classroom? I have, at times, resisted popular music in the school room for three reasons. We do not practice what I would consider proper vocal technique; we spend already limited classroom instruction resources on something which students would likely find on their own time, and pop music often brings into the room a variety of things which are not considered school- appropriate: sex, sexism, racism, violence, and bad language. Furthermore, learning pop songs by rote does little to further the development of musical literacy, understood as the ability to read and write standard musical notation, which forms an important part of the curriculum in Grades 4 and 5. This was when I viewed myself as part of the line of cultural transmission of Western classical music, which remains an important place of belonging for me. While I still hope to share this pleasure with my students, I now see my role differently which makes it possible to hear the following arguments for popular music in the classroom: belonging, pleasure, and the necessity of addressing difficult subjects in the classroom.

Many students find belonging in popular music and it is important they identify as someone who can belong at school (Diamond, 2001; Ho, 2007, 2014; Kallio, 2015; North & Hargreaves, 1999; Yon, 2000). The difficult knowledge contained in popular music can be contained and wrestled with at school, it will be in their lives whether I acknowledge it or not (Bretthauer et al., 2007; Morrison, 2008). Furthermore, popular music can be used to enliven topics in social studies and environmental studies, bridging the divide between “academic” ideas and their lived experience at home (Hoffman & Carter, 2013; Moore, J.R., 2007; Tobias, 2015).

Popular music can be an important part of creative expression in music through performance and composition experiences (Tobias, 2013). It is an effective way for students to experience "real music-making" in an enjoyable context (Lindgren & Ericsson, 2010). Our current neoliberal environment ensures that music in schools requires near-constant advocacy (Allsup, 2012; Bryant, 2014; Orford, 2007). Music teachers are under tremendous pressure to deliver enjoyment and performance and popular music offers both (Ho, 2007, 2014). When asked what they wanted from their music program in my (successful) job interviews, principals typically replied with some variation of "I want them to have fun in music, to love it." This was my cue to discuss active listening, literacy and other academic skills which music fosters, and it always irritated me. What about delayed gratification, the rewards of work, the possibility of a hundred risks and failures to get to success—no one ever told me they wanted math to be fun nor questioned its utility in the school regardless! Nonetheless, if we are looking for pleasure in school, pop music appreciation and performance is certainly one way to get there.

Popular music, of the new country, is often an entry point for immigrants into social belonging (Burnard et al., 2008; Karlsen, 2014; Marsh, 2012). In fact, Karlsen reports that some of his subjects stopped attempting to incorporate music from other traditions because their students preferred to engage with the popular music which their peers were listening to, viewing it as vital to their successful assimilation. I had the privilege of attending a downtown model school's talent show recently and this ability of students to find common ground in pop music was showcased by several students' renditions of songs by popular singers. These students performed to karaoke tracks or simplified arrangements for beginning band, occasioning wild applause and cheers from their peers while teachers circulated shushing (enforcing Western art norms of audience behavior as we went). I was disappointed to find little musical diversity in a

tremendously culturally diverse school. The attendance roll shows students with names traditional to Tibet, China, Africa, Sikh India, Pakistan and [Hungarian] Roma yet there were no performances of *Bharatanatyam* or *Bhangra*, little alternative pop, no traditional instruments, dances or songs, except a few pianists performing repertoire from their Royal Conservatory exams and a ballet piece. I was heartened to find so much camaraderie in a music context regardless of the music itself. Music is fun, even if its study can be less so. Furthermore, though we may denigrate the content of the lyrics, rehearsal of these songs provides contextualized vocabulary and language structure practice. In contrast to this school, the talent show that I attended a few years ago in Brampton, showcased pop music karaoke, but also *Bharatanatyam*, *tabla*, harmonium, rap, standup comedy and beatboxing in a school where popular music making was less supported but cultural expression was advocated through lunchtime clubs, bulletin board music displays, fundraising activities, a diverse library and a staff that sought opportunities to celebrate days of cultural importance. In other words, students may be motivated to express their identity in music differently based on a variety of environmental factors.

As Kallio (2015) points out, which music and subjects we deem acceptable for school can be based as much on hegemonic power as on legitimate concern for our students, and the consistent othering of popular music by the establishment of which public schools are de facto, a part, may mask less comfortable motives than clean language (Hess, 2017b; Kallio, 2015). For example, “Fuck tha Police” by N.W.A. would almost certainly not be taught in a classroom today, and was definitely prohibited in my schools when it was first released in 1988, and yet its message that police unfairly target and are violent to young Black men is finally being heard by White folk in the wake of Black Lives Matter three decades later. I wonder what my students need me to hear that can’t be expressed in “school appropriate” language?

***Music, Identity and Difference with Children***

We sense intuitively that music is a place of belonging. Popular music singers' images are branded, found on everything from clothing to school lunch boxes and this is not a new trend. Tensions between fans of two beloved sopranos in eighteenth century London ran so high that there was a public riot (LaRue, 1995). The work of cultural centres in diaspora communities, and diaspora popular music such as desi-pop show the complicated work of cultural heritage within identity (Asher, 1999). Yon (2000) and Richards (1999) have shown the ways in which young people use music as a signifier of identity and also to indicate mobility within social and class structures. In Richards O-level English class, one young man used his enjoyment of [Western] classical music as a signifier of his ability to attain a higher class status through education and wealth attainment. In "inside/outside: school music on the line", Brewer (2010) used narrative inquiry to show the ways in which band class became a locus of belonging and a signifier of social class and educational aspirations for his students and himself. This same paper also raises questions about who is left out, and not finding belonging in music class. In Brewer's school, the majority of the school population were Hispanic and spoke English as a second language, often struggling in school. These students rarely made their way to the band room. This sense of belonging in music is important. A study commissioned by the National Association of Music Educators (Bryant, 2014) found that schools with strong music programs, regardless of socio-economic factors, had better school attendance and higher graduation rates, and their students experienced greater success later in life. Marsh (2012) discovers, in speaking to children who are refugees, that when they found belonging in music class, through inclusion of home musics, the effect was powerful. Or, as one young West African informant put it: "We like the music. We

like all types of music because even you don’t listen it, the beat will make you be courage[sic]” (p. 108).

Many teachers, policymakers, and researchers, including this one, believe that in exposing children to music from many cultures, they will build greater respect and empathy for all people/s in their students. While widely believed, the small amount of research available on this effect is relatively inconclusive. It does suggest that teaching music within its social context can create some openness or empathy towards difference (Abril, 2006b; Burton, 2011; Campbell, 2002). It is in part this importance of context, also mentioned by Burton, that encourages my interest in pop music videos which place the musicians most usually within in a contemporary context. Graham finds that music education leads to greater omnivorousness (enjoyment of many different genres) which he views as a part of cultural openness. He warns that inequities in funding schools can mean that this becomes another value which children in richer districts are supported to develop -- widening inequities rather than addressing them

Several researchers (Karlsen, 2014; Norman Long, 2013; Russell, 2006; Woloshyn, 2017) understand multicultural music education, or music more generally, as building agency for teachers and students. Agency, the ability to act upon something, is intimately connected to identity and is a concept which recurs in my work. As a guiding framework however, agency was too confining a concept. It was important to me to move teacher and student beyond a narrow identification of culture as racial heritage, which might restrict both agency and identity and it is this complicated act of identification which I find seated in Cosmopolitanism.

***Available Research on Multicultural Music Education in Ontario***

You will have noticed a preponderance of references from contexts outside of Ontario, largely the United States, but also Great Britain, Finland and Sweden, China, Singapore,

Australia, New Zealand and India throughout this literature review. There were enough similarities in context to make this research useful to our subject, and too few studies in the Ontario or Canadian context to create a robust picture of the difficulties and possible approaches to multicultural music education. There has been enough discussion in the Canadian context (and troubles in my own lived experience) to suggest that the challenges we face in Ontario are similar to those in other countries. However, in a province in which nearly 60 percent of elementary schools lack a music education teacher, research in this particular context is slim. While other contexts can help to illuminate our specific area, we have not been as successful in sharing our perspectives and experience with the world. As I have mentioned above, our de-conservatoried music qualification path, the particularity of Canadian views of multiculturalism, and the diversity -- urban/rural, cultural and academic, of our schools and students all are worthy of study. Much of this context is beyond the scope of this study, but in raising questions, celebrating successes and provoking discussion of these issues in an Ontario context, I hope to encourage further scholarship and discussion around the question of what teaching with cosmopolitanism can do in the music classroom in Ontario. Particularly worthy of further investigation, given the large scholarship available about the ways in which conservatory training of music teachers perpetuates the Western classical canon, is the qualification pathway through Additional Qualifications courses, single term classwork undertaken outside the school day. In concert with a revised curriculum, it might open music classrooms to specialists in a variety of musics.

**A critical reading of the Ontario Arts Curriculum: music 2009, and its policy context.** Education in Canada is left entirely under Provincial control. In Ontario, it is structured hierarchically, moving from student, parent, and teacher to principal, to superintendent, trustee,

school board and finally Ministry of Education responsibilities (Sattler, 2012). The Education Act, and amendments, curriculum documents, and other bills and working papers, as well as teacher contracts, parent councils, resource providers and board and school-level policies and practices structure student-teacher interaction in the daily setting of the classroom. Of particular interest to this study are four documents; the *Ontario Human Rights Code* [OHRC] (R.S.O H.19, 1990), *Reach Every Student: Energizing Ontario Education* (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2008); *Ontario's Equity and Inclusive Education Strategy* (2009a) and the *Ontario Arts Curriculum, Grades 1-8*, (2009b).

In 2008, the newly re-elected Liberals released *Reach Every Student: Energizing Ontario Education*. This manifesto-style document turns the neoliberal language of education as good business towards addressing diversity to strengthen Ontario's economy. It highlighted the soon-to-be-released revised Arts curriculum as central to addressing diversity. It also lays out a hierarchy of policy texts under which this move will occur, mentioning the Ontario Human Rights Code, The Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, and the Ontario Education Act. It commits the government to including specific language about diversity and inclusion in all "curriculum and assessment policy documents and all learning resource documents as appropriate"(Ontario Ministry of Education, 2008. p. 18). It is of note that *Reach Every Student* specifically argues for Arts education, offering several justifications for its inclusion in school and specifically as an ideal subject within which to address both creativity (producing better problem solvers for the economy) and inclusion (a diverse workforce who can act in harmony).

In accordance with the promises of *Reach Every Student*, the ministry released both a revised arts curriculum and an equity and inclusion strategy in 2009. The strategy defines sources of diversity as: "ancestry, culture, ethnicity, gender, gender identity, language, physical

and intellectual ability, race, religion, sex, sexual orientation, and socio-economic status" (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2009. p. 4). These are all protected areas under the OHRC (including gender identity *Equity and Inclusion in Ontario Schools* surpassed the code which didn't include gender identity as a protected category until 2012). Furthermore, the strategy commits to creating inclusive education, defined as:

> Education that is based on the principles of acceptance and inclusion of all students. Students see themselves reflected in their curriculum, their physical surroundings, and the broader environment, in which diversity is honoured and all individuals are respected. (p. 4).

The Ontario Arts Curriculum (2009) also includes language which encompasses inclusion such as " variety of cultures" " cultures around the world" and "cultural context" and sentences such as this: "[the arts] help us understand what it is that makes us human by validating our commonalities and celebrating our differences" (p. 6). In description of the creative process and critical analysis, considered foundational skills in this document, I also see language recognizing cultural/ancestral diversity.

> Where students are investigating a traditional work of art, use of cross-cultural studies may be appropriate. It is important for teachers and students to carefully and critically assess the cultural information sources to determine their merit and to consult a range of reputable authorities where possible. *(*p. 28).

And this: Teachers should also be models for lifelong learning in the arts, showing a willingness to participate in the arts, to appreciate unfamiliar art forms, to attempt new approaches, and to engage in new experiences (p. 37).

Furthermore, it explicitly states:

> When exploring the cultural contexts of the arts, teachers need to avoid marginalizing groups or following stereotypes when planning lessons. For example, teachers should avoid focusing on art forms from only one place or that reflect only one style; avoid judging some art forms as "better" than others; avoid teaching by artistic movement or period; and avoid choosing only male artists' work or only European works for study. (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2009. p. 38).

It is surprising, therefore, to read the following expectations for music Grades 4-6:

> In Grade 4, students begin to read *standard notation* in the *treble clef* and sing or play music in two parts. They continue to create simple rhythms and melodies as accompaniments and to discover how music is organized. In Grade 5, students sing and/or play *from standard music notation and other forms of notation*, learn to use *key signatures*, and create compositions in a variety of forms using notational software [emphasis added]. (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2009b, p. 97).

The specific expectations do include a diversity of cultures and identities in their examples (female songwriters, pop music, Indian classical music, troubadours, voyageurs and north American aboriginal music are mentioned in Grade 4). However, the Fundamental Concepts for each grade are drawn largely from Eurocentric music and pedagogies. The revised curriculum contains sections on the accommodation of a variety of diverse students (English Language Learners, Special Education students) as well as discussion of anti-discrimination education in the arts. It directs teachers to include a variety of cultures and performers so that students will "see themselves reflected in their curriculum" (p. 6).

It is troubling then, that the teacher prompts mention specific pieces only by composers in the Western classical tradition (Benjamin Britten, Antonio Vivaldi, medieval troubadours) and forms specific to Western classical music (theme and variations, rondo form) as opposed to much more general prompts for non-Western cultures (e.g. drums in some countries in Africa today, a rhythmic accompaniment to a First Nation's legend). The governments' expectation may be that this is merely a framework of understanding, or that it is understood that teachers (themselves being drawn from diverse backgrounds) will diversify the curriculum, easily seeking out specific examples from the general prompts.

There is little available on the ministry website to assist music teachers in accessing non-Western musical examples and, as noted above, the fundamental concepts and clearest prompts in the curriculum itself are drawn from Western examples. A critical view of the Ontario Arts

Curriculum reveals a construction of diversity as being not-European, not-Christian, not-male, and a construction of music, and music teachers which privileges the constructions and values of Western classical music and its pedagogical leaders

In "The Educational Mission", Willinsky (1998) demonstrates how public education was used by colonial powers to control and subdue the populations they over-ran. Elements of that project can still be seen in the claim of *Reach Every Student* that public education creates students who "develop into *highly skilled*, knowledgeable, caring citizens who contribute to our *strong economy* and a *cohesive society*[emphasis added]"(Ontario Ministry of Education, 2008. p. 2). Public Education, in dividing the world into civilized and savage, and in 'civilizing the savage' created and maintained a hierarchy in which White men dominated and everyone else served. Willinsky argues that many of those assumptions remain in education today, whether in failing to address the collusion of science in race theory, or our continued valorization of Shakespeare, Keats etc. at the expense of Langston Hughes, Toni Morrisson, V.S. Naipaul and others. Other scholars have shown how colonial and multicultural interests clash in curricula in New Zealand, the United States, and Canada (Bazzul, 2014; Burns et al., 2016; Dion et al., 2010; Whitburn & Yemoh, 2012). Close examination of the language and categories of the music curriculum from Grades 4-6 shows this same difficulty, that is the normalization of Westernclassical music as the standard from which everything is measured.

In its emphasis on teaching standard music notation, indeed the very idea that Western notation is standard betrays a certain colonial orientation, the Ontario Arts Curriculum constructs music as pitch-centric, episodic and linear. Western classical music also contains European cultural expectations with emphasis on an extraordinary individual who is allowed certain powers (the soloist or conductor), and a larger supporting segment which is not so privileged (the

orchestra). Emphasis on concepts such as unison singing, singing at pitch and expected symphony behavior also value certain colonial expectations of students rather than a more collaborative approach shown, for example in North Indian classical music or jazz. Many examples of the centering of Western classical music can be found in the glossary. I will examine one in depth.

The glossary which accompanies the Ontario Arts Curriculum (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2009b) offers separate entries for standard notation, tablature and solfege while the notation traditions of "othered" musics are mentioned only in passing, with not even enough information to offer a sample of such in class.

> Notation. A way of indicating pitch and rhythm in written form; for example, standard notation, tablature, and percussion notation, as well as written forms of oral syllables, such as the syllables used in the Indian tabla tradition and the Griot tradition of Africa. See also nontraditional notation; oral prompts; solfège (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2009 p. 179).

Consider the difference of a revised definition (my own) below.

> Notation. A method of indicating pitch and rhythm together which can be written down using symbols and/or oral syllables. Music cultures around the world have developed a variety of such aids for passing on sound traditions from the Bols (rhythmic syllables) and Sargam (pitch names) of North India, to the Griot tradition of Africa, Sakuhashi and Taiko notation in Japan, *Gu qin* notation in China and the 5-line notation system developed in Europe and used broadly in popular and Western classical music today.

The first version gives three examples from the European tradition, which are also given separate entries in the glossary, before offering un-named examples from two other traditions. The second takes up the inclusive language of the introduction (music cultures around the world) and names a variety of traditions in different areas of the world. Even here, in avoiding calling Western notation Standard, it is given more explanation than others.

**Music education in Ontario, past to present.**

This Eurocentric view of music is, perhaps, less surprising when one considers the history of school music in Ontario. Green and Vogan (1991) and McGee (1985) offer a historical perspective on the inclusion of music in parochial schooling in Canada. They draw on church and civic documents which show music coming into public schooling through the Catholic and Protestant priests who came to Canada to convert/minister to indigenous and settler peoples, and its later use in schools to support national unity through the use of selected repertoire. Yerichuck (2016) looks at the ways in which Settlement House used music to acculturate immigrants within an English, and Protestant, view of being Canadian, but also often became a place of informal musicking around the settlers' home cultures. Diamond (2001) offers a critical view of music scholarship in the Yukon with an eye to the stories and voices that are not being recorded in "official" academic scholarship. Within the sphere of music educators, a brief survey of the Canadian Music Educator shows a lively discussion of the problem of other and Western music for educators dating back to at least the 1970s. Montgomery (1991), Trans-Adams (2001), Walden (2014) and Morrison (2008) trouble the curriculum around the "whiteness" of its content and document their own experiences with attempting to venture outside the sphere of Western music. Trans-Adams goes so far as to mount a Kabuki-influenced spectacular to move past the high school musical stereotype. Within the academy, Hess has drawn on her research in Ontario to ask larger questions within the lens of anti-racist and radical pedagogy (Hess, 2010, 2015, 2017a, 2017b). Though I am indebted to her work, it focuses largely on questions of Blackness, social class and hip hop and I hope to expand our inquiry of music in Ontario to ask not only who is excluded, but how we might all be included.

Cohen (1994) describes the difficult process of creating a "multicultural concert" in a Toronto school. She envisioned a community-sourced and produced school concert celebrating the tapestry of cultures at her daughter's school. Yet even with the cooperation of the school music teacher, and her own funded position as a researcher, Cohen reports a very bumpy road to repertoire collection and many compromises in the final programme. She also touches on her disagreement with the singing technique preferred by elementary school choir directors in the context of folk music, a challenge that I experience in introducing pop music as well. Bradley (2006) asks how we construct multiculturalism in the context of a choir. She goes on to suggest that simply presenting multicultural music may only perpetuate racist stereotypes and constructions of "other" versus Canadian which in this context meant white, preferably of British descent. Bradley finds her answer to this problem in anti-racist pedagogy. While it is an important criticism of multiculturalism as practiced in Canada to date, I prefer to use cosmopolitanism for reasons explained in the following section which outlines my critical framework.

## Theoretical Framework

What is cosmopolitanism? In "Four cosmopolitan moments" (Fine & Cohen, 2002), the authors encourage us to attend to four philosophical uses of cosmopolitanism, two of which are important to this study: Zeno and Arendt. Zeno (whose name translates as "foreign" or stranger) used the term to claim personhood for those born outside of Athens (as he was). In his radical vision, the state disappears within a widening circle of concern moving from self to family to city to the world: kosmos—the world, and polis, a city, a world city, a citizen of the world, responsible to the world. Diogenes extended these ideas to a community of thinking men[sic] bounded by moral responsibility and wisdom rather than geography. The word and the concept

has had a complex history from there: militarized by Alexander the Great, revived by Kant in response to a rising nationalism which troubled him and later used by both Nazis and Marxist-Leninists as an anti-semitic slur. In contemporary parlance, cosmopolitan is synonymous with a certain type of wealth and ennui. However, cosmopolitanism was philosophically re-energized by Arendt and Derrida as inherent within “crime against humanity” and vital to the concept of “refuge”. Cosmopolitanism has also been taken up by anthropologists as in opposition to the capitalist globalization (Werbner, 2008). In these modern iterations, it seems an idea tailor-made for our challenging, exciting, globalized world.

In music teaching, cosmopolitanism can be helpful in recognizing that my own and my students’ identities may or may not be rooted in a visible cultural heritage. Furthermore, that identity can come not only through blood but by study. Finally, cosmopolitanism urges me to use my privilege as teacher/host to extend equal welcome to each student whether native to this country or newly arrived, of any identity, colour or religion, neuro-typical or diverse.

As a white, upper-middle class, educated female I have struggled with whether using cosmopolitanism as a theoretical framework for this study merely sustains a certain colonial comfort in my place in the world. Post-colonial studies, anti-racist work, and culturally responsive pedagogy all have many (often critical) things to say to me, who have mostly enjoyed hegemonic privilege. I inflect that privilege with my lived experience as a short, plump and curly-haired brunette Jew. I do have a very English last name, which has meant that I have most usually had access to many white privileges. Post-Colonial studies remind me that public education as it exists in Canada presently bears the marks of its founders’ intention to solidify British rule in Canada. Willinsky (1998) has skillfully traced the ways in which education and its institutions: museum, art gallery, zoological and botanical gardens, were erected to provide able

and loyal administrators for the empire, whilst encouraging white subjects to feel they had dominion over the entire natural world. The idea that one can acquire ownership of a music through study (and love) could be viewed as just one more expression of this attitude, which warns me to go slowly and listen carefully when I venture into new musical territories. Anti-racist work, such as Gilborn's (2005) insightful discussion of the ways in which white supremacy shapes policy decisions in school allocations in England, remind me to examine my own prejudices. I really struggle to understand or appreciate hip hop music and used to refuse to teach it because I felt, or really had absorbed the idea, that it was sexist. Anti-racist pedagogy also motivates me to consider carefully how the lionization of (white) Western classical and folk music perpetuates white power. Culturally responsive pedagogy informs my practice, recognizing that the ways in which I am accustomed to teach and learn are not natural or obvious; I will need both to adjust what I do, and be prepared to explain my expectations where I don't. However, at their roots, these frameworks seem often to trap people within a cultural heritage by blood/race.  I am the daughter of a father who was adopted, and also a Jew who doesn't speak Hebrew, and an American citizen with pretty good French. I was born and raised in Canada. On both a personal and academic level, this fallacy of identity by appearance/nationality troubles me. Cosmopolitanism allows students the importance of home culture AND the multiple other sites of identity which most of us possess AND the possibility of larger identifications with humanity, the environment, and the world.

***Derrida***

In "On Cosmopolitanism" (Derrida, 2001), which originated as a talk for the international conference of writers, Derrida traces the idea of asylum through Western thought, situating it within the moral imperative of cosmopolitanism. He argues that this tradition of asylum contains

within it both Greek stoicism containing the idea that what are now considered human rights should extend to the stranger (*xeno*) and Hebraic thought which commands the extension of sanctuary from vengeance to the outsider. It is in fact, the old testament, via Levinas and Payot, from which Derrida draws the term "cities of refuge" (p. 4). Responding to the problem of the "stateless", an issue which childhood experience made very personal, Derrida uses cosmopolitan ideas to argue for Cities of Refuge a "place for reflection" on the problems of hospitality and forgiveness (p. 20). He is particularly interested in the tension between *le droit*, the absolute law of asylum/hospitality and the limits to this law without which it would become "a pious and irresponsible desire" (p. 22).

These ideas which, being Derrida, he pushes to an almost nonsensical dimension (true forgiveness forgives only the unforgiveable, true hospitality is to open the door to a stranger who has already turned away) come up, in slightly less extreme forms, every day. Students take refuge in the classroom (and seek refuge from the classroom); teachers and students forgive unforgiveable deformations of their intents; teachers extend the hospitality of the classroom to students who may or may not wish to accept the burden of their knowledge. All these acts occur in the classroom but are still a part of the larger culture of the school and society.

In the public school classroom in Ontario, I see Derrida's tension between absolute and conditional hospitality as each student is required to attend school, often public education, yet students who do not buy into the limits imposed by the rules of the classroom can be sent out to the principal's office, suspended, and even expelled. Some of this is the work of living in community, students who make it impossible for other children to learn, or to be safely in the same space, reject the relationality of the space and are, in turn, rejected. However, even in much less severe circumstances, cultural norms can clash and make refuge a very conditional offer

indeed. I am reminded of watching two young men playing soccer in a physical education class which I covered as a supply. The two boys were recently arrived from Syria via several years in a refugee camp. I had a few words from my colleague to situate myself with what was happening. I was told these two had come a long way (in behavior) but not to let them push the limits. I was told they would do better if given tasks with which to help me. It was a spectacular summer day, not too hot, blue skies, a light breeze, and the class spread out across the soccer field, some opting to sit out on the sidelines, and others (mostly boys) engaging in a somewhat disorganized game of soccer. It was immediately apparent that my two young friends were playing by different rules. Chanting to each other, organizing the team-members, but also playing a much more physical game, somewhere between soccer and football, and taunting their classmates. While the teasing was good natured, it was very rough teasing indeed for a Canadian context including minor swears and rude comments. Faced with multiple complaints, knowing they weren't playing by the rules, I offered a warning and then pulled the greater offender from the field. Effectively I invoked my host rights to enact limited hospitality.

One limit to hospitality oft invoked in political rhetoric is that of employment. Derrida (2001) raises the question of how, exactly, we are extending welcome to persons if we refuse them employment, invoking their right to a "living and durable network" (p. 12). If school is children's work than classrooms address for children the lament that "no one here knows who I am" (p. 15). The community school offers each student an opportunity to be known and appreciated by teacher, classmates, and hopefully, the extended community through friendships formed in school. Viewed this way, it becomes even more imperative that students be offered loci of identity within curricular objects.

**The Classroom as Refuge**

For students who come to Ontario as refugees, school might be viewed as an extension of the refuge offered by the larger apparatus of the social network, but for some students, regardless of country of origin, school becomes a refuge from trouble at home or in the wider world. Teachers see this phenomenon in students who come early and stay late, who find excuses to help in order to avoid recess, or in one case in my music class, a young man flat out refused to leave at the end of the day. I suspect this was less a reflection of our relationship, cemented by a shared love of jerk chicken, and rather more to do with the reintroduction of his father into his life about which he had very mixed feelings.

Like a city, which is subject to federal and provincial law but also can enact its own laws, the classroom is subject to legislation but is little surveilled in its day to day running. The Human Rights Code, provincial acts, including the curriculum, and a dizzying array of board and school policies shape our interactions but leave substantial space for a teacher to assert cosmopolitan and other values within the space. Derrida, following Arendt, says that even a world government is insufficient to address asylum as it is merely agreements between sovereign states—the massacres of Rwanda, Kosovo and Myanmar all show how poorly these agreements are enforced because of the problem of abrogating sovereignty. Derrida maintains hope that cities can act outside of sovereignty, perhaps because they have no armies, in providing refuge to those who are rendered state-less by the actions or ideology of their states of origin. Similarly, teachers can do many things to address the needs of their guests/students. They bring in objects of study not specified in the curriculum; emphasize/minimize portions of the curriculum; put apples on their desks and cheerios in their cupboards to feed the hungry; start lunchtime clubs on a variety of social justice issues; conduct letter writing campaigns and so on.

Teachers often choose to support their students in ways that may bring them into conflict with/ garner praise from elected officials, their own pocketbooks, and community members. My daughters attend a public school in the Greater Toronto Area and, in addition to fundraisers designed to enable every Grade 8 student to go on the graduating trip, the school has collected socks for the homeless, collected and recycled batteries, written to the Premier in support of tree-planting programs, provided a variety of educational programs to parents via the parent council and so on. Such actions are not without risk. Public school teachers in Ontario are subject to the Education Act (including mandated curricula) and the professional standards of the Ontario College of Teachers; if a student in your class is allergic to apples, you might be open to discipline and censure and if you absolutely abandon the curriculum, I suppose that too might lead to firing, or certainly re-education.

I am risking hyperbole here, but the argument is that, like a city within a state, the classroom unit has a good deal of flexibility in interpretation of laws and statutes that can empower it to function within Derrida's requirements for a city of refuge. Furthermore, being a very small unit in the whole, it is better equipped to address some of the hospitality demands which cities can fail. In Toronto, privately sponsored refugees were settled in housing and school, and, in many cases, taken on a variety of outings by sponsoring families, while state-sponsored refugees felt trapped in temporary hotel accommodations with no wherewithal to access a variety of necessary services, including midwifery care (Porter, 2016).

In many cases, classrooms are adapted to aid English Language Learners, with bilingual labeling of important vocabulary, designated "friends" to welcome new students, and other attempts (some misguided) to make the new classroom a home. Students othered by mainstream society so often find a space at school in clubs if not in class, that it is a Hollywood trope. Here

then is the *devoir*, the duty of hospitality for the teacher. It might be considered a moral imperative, but it is also required by both the Ontario Human Rights Code and the Arts curriculum itself.

Derrida certainly claims an impressive heritage for cosmopolitanism in Western thought, but he fails, to my disappointment, to engage with thought traditions from the Global South and East. While spending several pages engaged with Kant, who did not extend his cosmopolitan ideals to not-white, not-male humans, he neglects the Qur'an, the Sutras of the Buddha, and the multiple and complex beliefs around hospitality of Indigenous peoples in the Americas, Africa and Asia. As *Anthropology and the New Cosmopolitanism: Rooted, Feminist, and Vernacular Perspectives* (Werbner, 2008) shows, hospitality, concern for the outsider and the difficulties of limits are, like music, an aspect of human behavior and found *partout*. Herein, Graeber (2008) reminds me that parts of the U.S. constitution were based on the structures of the Iroquois Six Nation Confederacy and upheld rights that were, at its inception, denied to women, children, indentured servants, and those of African descent.

***The Problem of Cosmopolitanism on Land with Imperial Legacies***

"O Canada, our home ON native land…" (*As sung by William Shatner*, n.d.)

I would be remiss if I did not acknowledge the awkwardness of discussing hospitality and residency rights on land which was, at best, taken under false pretences and at worst outright stolen from the Indigenous peoples in Ontario. We begin our school day with an acknowledgement of the situated nature of our schools but taking up the implicit call of the acknowledgement has yet to come. Some child stumbles through the words of the official acknowledgement distributed from the board office, often covered by the sounds of twenty-eight chairs scraping back as students stand. We then proceed to the national anthem, announcements,

and inspirational quote of the character education of the day. As important as land acknowledgement is, it seems that it needs a larger context to be an effective part of reconciliation in schools. Don't rely on your school concert to manage it either. Robinson (2012), a member of the Stó lō peoples has argued that concerts, while certainly a fertile meeting ground for artists (and the fundraisers on which their organizations rely) can create a false sense of virtuous reconciliation in the audience. Investing nothing more than a few hours of their time and the price of a concert ticket, they have an emotional encounter which leads them to believe they are reconciled.

There is no monolithic Indigenous music, and many Indigenous musicians produce music which is eclectic and hybrid. For example, Tomson Highway describes himself as a playwright, novelist, and singer/songwriter. I once heard him refer to himself as Canada's only Cree-speaking classical pianist. Jeremy Dutcher fuses Wolastoq musical traditions and his training as an operatic tenor in his bid to save the musical and linguistic traditions of his people (Bliss, 2018). Tanya Tagaq (www.tanyatagaq.com) brings a pop aesthetic to her classical training as an *inuk* throat singer and Tribe Called Red (www.atribecalledred.com) fuse hip hop, pow wow and electronica music to bring not only their music but their political and social concerns to a broader audience. There is, therefore, a wide variety of pop-infused music by Indigenous creators which teachers might choose to incorporate in their music classroom through listening journals, biography projects, playlists and, carefully, performance. In the Toronto District School Board there are more specialized resources, including Elder consultants, which teachers may also access. In respectfully bringing in contemporary music by Indigenous peoples, the hosting teacher lives out the words of the land acknowledgement, a small step towards the reconciliation without which cosmopolitanism, in Canadian schools will be woefully incomplete.

Coulthard (2014) reminds us that implicit to many multicultural and political policies is the requirement of recognition. Recognition, he argues, maintains colonial power and places the intended subject at risk of misrecognition, a term coined by Fanon to summarize the problem of Hegel's master-slave dialectic in the context of colonies. The white man wants only work from the Black man, where the Black man is seeking recognition of his worth as a man. It is this cycle of recognition-misrecognition which a cosmopolitan approach hopes to interrupt. By presenting objects of study which are specific in their approach to culture but which we study because we all are citizens of the world, we step away from the power dynamics of recognition while still fostering identities in music and one's own culture.

## Chapter 3: Methodology

> Decolonization is a process which engages with imperialism and colonialism at many levels. For researchers, one of those levels is concerned with having a more critical understanding of the underlying assumptions, motivations and values which inform research practices. (Tuhiwai-Smith, 2012 p. 58)

### Paradigm

Teddlie and Tashakkori (2009) place ethnographic methods within the qualitative field of research, under the constructivist paradigm. Constructivist researchers tend to view reality as “multiple, constructed and holistic” (p. 86). This is a perspective which seems suited to cosmopolitanism in which identity is viewed as: “fluid and slippery ... contradictory, ambivalent, imbued with tension and often surprising ...” (Yon, 2000. p. 143). Furthermore, this study probed things that were felt rather than known, malleable rather than firm, and required a nuanced antithetical to yes/no questions. Qualitative research methodologies have also been identified by Tuhiwai-Smith (2012) and Kovach (2009) as potentially in sympathy with indigenous ways of knowing. While neither project nor researcher are indigenous, it felt disrespectful at this moment of ongoing reckoning and reconciliation to undertake research which precluded such knowledge or epistemologies.

Though I have positioned the teacher as host within the theoretical framework, I am aware that the majority of teachers, and students, in Ontario school boards are, in fact, guests upon the traditional lands of the First Nations. I live and work on land that is the traditional territories of the Anishinabek Nation, the Haudenosaunee Confederacy, the Mississaugas of the New Credit First Nations, and the Metis Nation. While offered extraordinary hospitality, the history of settlement has been one of abrogating both written and unwritten laws of guesthood. I therefore walked a rather fine line in choosing to use traditional ethnographic methods which

retained a hierarchy of researcher and “subject” [sic] while being attentive to opportunities for stories, for personal accountability and reliability.

**Participants**

This project was designed using purposive sampling. Teddlie and Tashakoori define purposive sampling as: the process of selecting [participants] based on specific purposes associated with answering a study’s research questions” (p. 173). They find purposive sampling is widely used in qualitative studies where there is to be a relatively small sample. The researcher therefore selects cases that are “information rich in regard to [the research] questions” (p. 173). It would be counterproductive to this study, for example, to introduce the teaching intervention in a gym classroom because it seeks to understand how music teachers and their students are responding to the challenges of diversity, identity and hospitality.

The participants were thirty-one (twenty-eight were included in the formal study) Grade 4 and 5 students in a k-8 school and their music teacher. Schools were solicited through the principal officially, but I had better response rates where I had some connection to the principal or the music teachers. Solicited schools were selected based on proximity to each other, experience level of their music teacher, their music program and the diversity of the student body. The study solicited teachers in their mid to late career for several reasons. They have established classroom cultures and routines with which they are largely happy. They are more likely to base their understandings of music and its purposes within the Western classical and folk music canon. They are at a stage of their career where they act as mentors to other beginning teachers. They are confident and generous in opening their classroom to scrutiny and a willing collaborator in exploring new areas for their teaching. Furthermore, if this approach of global music is persuasive to them, they are well situated to promote its use in schools around their

large school board both in developing curricular resources and in mentoring new teachers and teacher candidates. I chose to work with teachers in this part of their careers because it allowed me to focus more clearly on the effects of the curricular objects. While it is dangerous to take very much for granted in a study, what these teachers are already doing is viewed as effective and important. It therefore gives more credibility to any change observed during the study as being related to the study rather than, say, a more effective classroom management, which might be the case with a less experienced teacher.

I formally solicited participation from eight different elementary schools in a single district, and invited three more separately. Where schools declined to participate, they typically cited concerns with appropriateness of pop music, disrupting an instrumental program or the music teacher being too busy to add anything else to the plate. In one case, they had agreed to participate but kept pushing the start date until we ran into "work to rule" issues in late fall of 2019.

Ultimately, only one school chose to participate in the study, making it a very intimate look at one teacher and the experience of one of her classes. This was a smaller school, and they only had one class of Grade 4/5 students. I also had the opportunity to supply within this music classroom, and the school at large. I have integrated those experiences where they may serve to enrich the portrait of the school I call "Goldentree".

Goldentree Community School is a Kindergarten to Grade 8 school of approximately three hundred students. Grades 4 through 8, which are not under a classroom cap of 20, are quite large in this school as they also host three classrooms for students with developmental delays. These classrooms had, at most, six students that skewed the staffing ratios (number of teachers is allocated to schools based on the number of students enrolled), causing the general classrooms to

have more students than would be the case in a school without such programs. According to the Education Quality and Accountability website, thirty-five percent of the schools' population had a first language other than English, and fifteen percent were English Language Learners. A visual scan of the student body would suggest great cultural diversity and student-made posters throughout the school celebrated diverse cultural heritage from around the world. Indeed, "we welcome the world" was written on a variety of posters and banners.

The study investigated the relational aspects of teacher, student, curriculum, and curricular objects. The student participants were selected by grade and location but not otherwise sorted. Though a comparatively small sample size, they may be considered as representative of a typical class within the board varying significantly in neither size nor overall population from many other elementary schools in the area (that is, they do not have elective programs such as French Immersion or Gifted and Talented which draw a different 'type' of student).

**Data Collection**

There were three primary methods of data collection in this study: ethnographically informed research (observation), student questionnaires, and interviews. Each of these sources are complementary, allowing the researcher to gain greater understanding of things said, through observation, and things observed, through what is said. In addition to this important piece of complementarity, the data gathered directly were triangulated for greater reliability with student work, teacher documents including long range plans, bulletin boards and other materials in the classroom, and concert programs. The data from these interviews were transcribed and shared with participants to enhance trustworthiness through credibility. Trustworthiness is used in qualitative research as an overall indicator of the value of the research. Lincoln and Guba (1985) define it as "the extent to which an inquirer can persuade audiences that the findings are worth

paying attention to" (p. 300). Credibility refers to whether the research is found valid by the participants of the study themselves and can be affected by study design considerations such as length of engagement, persistence of observation and triangulation. Triangulation is a method of increasing data reliability by searching for agreement across, for example, multiple sources of data, or between two or more researchers. (Teddlie & Tashakkori, 2009, p. 26).

I had planned to interview the teacher participant prior to the formal commencement of the study, but scheduling difficulties placed it on the second week of the study. Ms. C, the teacher participant and I engaged in a conversation about music teaching, during which I asked about her philosophy of music pedagogy, the sorts of music she enjoyed doing with the students, as well as her own sense of how/if she has needed to adapt to increasingly diverse student bodies over time. Topics included inviting students to share music they enjoy, classroom management strategies, approaches to curriculum, classroom resources, instrument use and handling, concert programming, and choosing songs for study and for appreciation. The interview, with the participant's informed consent, was recorded and transcribed. The transcription was provided to her to check for accuracy and offered a chance to add to, clarify or reflect on what was said. It brought up a variety of feelings for me from shared frustration over the ongoing neglect of arts in school to some competitive feelings with the teacher, which I accounted for through keeping a reflective journal.

Renganathan (2009) defines reflexivity as an ongoing and active practice. Reflexitivy involves: "reflection, examination, scrutiny and interrogation of the whole research process" (p. 4). Renganathan notes that researcher-participant relations are most usually imagined where the researcher is the one in power but that this is not always the case. The power relations in this study required some careful negotiation, as the participant teacher, though similar in age to

myself, was further along in her career path but seemed to feel that my credentials, particularly my university degree in music history, outweighed hers. She seemed quite uncomfortable in being interviewed, and indeed chose to answer the post interview on paper rather than being recorded in conversation, was very careful of her words at times, and seemed to want on the one hand to laugh off her qualifications “no one else wanted the job” and at others to ensure that I recorded her bona fides “two AQs and workshops, of course.” I noted at the time that I was somewhat jealous; I would definitely have wanted the job but it wasn’t advertised to the occasional list.

This practice of reflexivity is used in conventional qualitative studies. I intended to keep a journal that allowed for what Kovach calls “inward knowing” which includes a variety of practices including dreams, nature walks, ceremonies and journaling (Kovach, 2009, p. 127). However, I found that the farthest I was able to bend from ‘professional standards’ was to allow space for reflection on my own feelings and experiences of education as student, parent and teacher.

While it was not feasible to interview each student participant individually, their thoughts were solicited in written form and through individual discussions during observations. At the beginning of the co-taught unit, students were asked to fill out a questionnaire to activate prior knowledge. The questionnaire asked:

1) How do you use music in your life?

2) What are some other ways in which people around the world use music?

3) How do you use music in school?

4) What are your five favourite songs?

5) Do you enjoy your time in music class? Why or why not? Question one solicits information about home musics as well as cultural customs related to music and aligns with curricular demands allowing the classroom teacher to use this material for assessment, if desired. Question two addressed broader knowledge of multiple musics. Question three was intended to provide an informal check of whether teacher and student perceptions of what was studied aligned but their answers here suggested other avenues of inquiry which will be taken up in the Findings and Analysis sections, Question four sought to understand their identity in music and Question 5 asked an affective question about their sense of themselves in the music class. Students had, at times, much to say during the project and this informal commentary was recorded, as far as possible, in the field log.

The curricular intervention was designed as a jigsaw project in which students became active participants in their learning. The jigsaw method has been much studied and remains an effective way to encourage students to take responsibility for their own and peers' learning (Law, 2011). It was particularly appropriate to this study because it has been shown to be effective in promoting mixing and inter-dependence between diverse cultural groups in classrooms (Santos Rego, 2005). It is also an efficient and engaging manner to present a lot of material quickly without reverting to lecture. Furthermore, it offers students the satisfaction of diving more deeply into a portion of the material.

Students were assigned by their teacher in groups of five to one of seven popular songs. I chose these songs through two different methods. The first was a snowball sampling on Facebook soliciting "your favourite pop songs from outside North America" in neighbourhood mom's groups, a social justice group, and on my personal facebook page. In the case of the K-pop and African songs (none were suggested in these groups), I searched for the number one

song in the country's pop music awards and then chose either that song, or one by the same artist. This deliberate thinking through and careful selection of curricular objects is in sympathy with Allsup's (2010) recommendations for choosing music literature. The songs were primarily selected for origin, with consideration also given to age appeal, being "school appropriate" and to representation by gender and race.

The students worked well in their groups. researching the context of the song as well as its use of musical elements. This was intended to take up the first week of the study (two 40-minute periods). However, in the participating school, students had one fifty-minute period a week. Furthermore, their period was directly following lunch, requiring the taking of attendance and, at the beginning of the study in late April 2019 removal of outdoor gear, or, as the days grew warmer, procurement of a water drink. This first section of the jigsaw project ended up taking almost three class sessions to complete as we all worked through technological issues, sources, and a structure that was less familiar than I had expected. In the end, the entire project spread out over nine weeks, but was only conducted during eight sessions. One session was skipped as I was at a conference and the classroom teacher was ill. In the second portion of the jigsaw project the groups were recombined so that each student taught the group about their song allowing everyone to have learned something about each of the seven songs. Sadit reported that this was his favourite part of the experience.

I had intended to keep them in this second grouping, to strengthen each other's knowledge of the researcher-selected songs but the students lobbied to be allowed to choose their own groups and it was now June, 2019, so they chose their own partners, or sometimes to work alone for the final portion of the project, which invited them to extend their knowledge of musical elements and purposes by creating a Global Pop Music playlist for any purpose they

chose. Because of the curricular demands of the school year, all assignments were graded by their teacher for students' demonstrated understandings of timbre and structure (in fact, she stated that she marked them based on participation). While in some ways less than ideal in terms of risk-taking, this is the reality of students and teachers in the classroom.

We finished our time together with Timbits snacks and a final reflection sheet on the second-last day of the school year. The questions were:

1) What did you learn about music and musical cultures around the world that was new? What further questions would you like to explore?

2) On a scale of five did you enjoy this music unit more or less than your regular music class? Why, what did you find challenging and/or enjoyable?

3) Which of the songs you learned about in class would you add to your playlists, why or why not?

4) If you were given an iPod and certificate for iTunes, what songs would you buy?

5) Is there anything else you want to tell your classroom teacher or the researcher?

Students were also given an opportunity to respond with "words, symbols or pictures" to how they felt during the global pop music project.

Three exit interviews were conducted. Two were conducted in person in the hallway; one with a selected group of boys and another with a group of girls. The children were selected on the basis of informal interactions which indicated that they particularly enjoyed/did not like, the project and/or identified with its content. An exit interview with the participating teacher was conducted via google docs at her request as she was very busy with end of year duties, coordinating Grade 8 graduation ceremonies, finishing final reports, preparing her classroom to be closed over the summer, and selling her house! The questions explored the experience of

working together, and that of teaching in this way while offering opportunities to refine the particulars of the unit. When I categorized the data from the final interview I wondered about the following: did this experience encourage the participant teacher to explore further outside their own comfort zone? Was it satisfying to her own views of the Ontario curriculum; what surprised her? Would she teach this unit again? Or use this type of curricular object in other ways?

Although not originally part of the study design, I ended up doing a follow up, check in with the students (the teacher was not available) the following March, 2020. The last in-school day, as it turned out of 2019/20. I had intended to stop by the office to gather some demographic data, which I hadn't anticipated wanting in my original study. The principal had, instead, arranged for me to interview the students one-on-one, sitting at a spare desk, in the hallway outside the classroom. In this quieter setting, removed from the rush, and the pressure of peer interactions, students told me, often in moving terms, of their cultural, religious, racial and musical identities. I have included these, as applicable, in the "Analysis" and "Conclusion" chapters.

## Methods

### *Ethnographically Informed Research*

Ethnographic research is based in narrative. It endeavours to construct, through immersion, a picture or story of a particular social world (Petschler, 2012). The rotary nature of music-teaching in elementary school, and the relatively short time in which I had access to the classroom, limited the depth of immersion more typical to ethnography. However, in dwelling with the class and their teacher, in using ethnographic techniques and in taking up the orientation of ethnographer, of seeking to understand a social world, this study was ethnographically informed. An important method of collecting data during this immersive experience was through

jot notes, extended field notes constructed from these jottings and reflective journaling which combined to source a completed ethnography, the writing up of such a social world. Emerson, Fretz, and Shaw (2011) define field notes as: "written accounts that filter members' experiences and concerns through the person and perspectives of the ethnographer" (p. 37). This is their strength, providing the researcher rich records of what is said, enacted, and expressed. The potential weakness of relying so strongly on the researcher-as-participant, that they might miss or misinterpret important data, can be mitigated through the process of triangulation. That is, in engaging in analysis of additional data which is less dependent on the researcher and seeking through this analysis to confirm or question emergent themes and categories. In the case of this study, written pre-and post- statements by the students, long range plans and concert programs from the teacher, and recorded and transcribed interviews with the participant teacher, and selected students from the class, provided rich sources from which to conduct cross analysis or triangulate the data.

Emerson, Fretz and Shaw (2011) find that ethnography is especially effective in "grasp[ing] the active "doing" of social life" (p. 41). Particularly in participant observation, the act of taking field notes can help the researcher to retain a sense of their role rather than being caught up in the social behaviors occurring around them. It is worth noting that many of the habits which teachers are encouraged to develop (a reflective journal at day's end, ongoing observations of both social and academic behavior in the classroom) mimic the attitudes of an ethnographer as described by Emerson, Fretz and Shaw (2011). In theory, this allows the researcher to take jot notes within the classroom without much disrupting the normal flow of activity. It is quite usual, particularly in music classrooms where time is limited, to see an adult with a clipboard taking notes. Unfortunately, in this particular location, I found that students

were very aware of adults in their vicinity, and I was only able to observe their discussions, unless participating directly, by standing facing away from them.

Tickle (2017) notes that ethnography is particularly well suited to work with young people as its participatory nature allows children to "say what they think...and have their opinions taken into account" [UN convention, 1989, the rights of the child]. Thomson (2008) and Abebe (2009) argue that it centers children in research as experts in their own worlds. In keeping with this argument, I have treated the children's worksheets, as primary observation data, which I triangulated and enriched through my field notes, informal observations, and the music teacher's exit interview.

***Analysis***

The interviews, field notes, researcher journal and paper artifact data were thematically analyzed through categorical strategies as suggested by Teddlie and Tashakkori. "Categorical Strategies break down narrative data and rearrange those data to produce categories that facilitate comparisons" (2009, p. 253) and also by Emerson Fretz, and Shaw (2011, Chapter 6). Categorical analysis was appropriate for this study because I sought to understand the interaction of several constructs on student identity and teacher hospitality within the music classroom.

The initial reflection sheets were transcribed into Excel files with identifying details replaced with aliases. These worksheets were then coded for emergent themes using categorical analysis. For example, active and passive use of music, elision of dance and music, mentions of cultural heritage and identifying/distancing or othering techniques were noted and numerated throughout the data. Particularly poignant or illustrative examples were pulled for narrative use.

Kovach (2009) notes that within indigenous epistemologies, reliability is most often based on personal relationships and reputation, so that naming informants is important.

Unfortunately, the age of the majority of my participants makes this impossible to do ethically. Where possible the students' words as a whole, in order to honour the personal and situated nature of each students' experience and interrogate where my own experiences and thoughts are shaping the retelling of the students'.

### *Sharing the Results*

Informal sharing of what had been observed/learned were offered in wrap-up discussions after the project was completed. Because several of my findings were less positive for the current music program. I have chosen not to share the findings with the parent community at this time. It was already a very complicated year for education with labor disruptions, including strike days and work to rule, and now Covid-19 closures, and even if I could figure out how to meet with the community, it might put the music teacher in a very awkward position. However, an anonymized summary report will be submitted to the school board from whence the pedagogical and content recommendations might flow in a supportive fashion.

## Considerations

Tri-Council guidelines specify that vulnerable groups should not be excluded from study: "Researchers should not exclude children from research unless there is a valid reason for doing so. Participation of children in research is justifiable when the research objective cannot be achieved with adult participants only." (Tri-Council Research Policy 2, 2014). While special care should be taken with minor students, who may not fully grasp the implications of consenting to participate, it should not preclude their receiving attention to the challenges and concerns they experience in schooling. The following steps were taken to ensure their safety. Parental/guardian consent was obtained at the outset of the study. The study was designed to flow into student's experience of schooling as something slightly special but not out of the norm. The questions

asked were in line with things they might encounter in a reflective piece, a normal practice within the curriculum of not only music but other areas as well. The data were anonymized at the site of collection where possible (written work and field notes), and in all cases, including interviews or records of classes, were kept on a data key in a locked cabinet in my private office. The project was described in simple and concrete terms to guardians, students, the teacher, and community. It was important to have access to audio recordings because students of this age are often able to express themselves more eloquently and fully verbally while they can still be reluctant writers.

Ethnography, specifically participant observation, allowed me to use my insider-outsider status to access the private-public space of the classroom. I am an insider in that I have taught and run music classrooms and programs prior to undertaking graduate work and continue to work as a supply teacher. These qualifications mean that teachers with whom I discuss my work often feel comfortable in commenting on curriculum and music in ways that they might not to an "outsider." Despite this experience, I entered the classroom as an outsider. I was not a paid teacher for the board in that time period, nor did I have grading or behavior responsibilities to the students. In working as a volunteer in the classroom to co-teach a global pop music unit, I entered a space of relationality subtly different to my usual role as teacher.

This chapter described the paradigmatic and practical considerations of study design, participant solicitation, data collection and analysis. In the next chapter, Findings, I will describe the data that was collected and its significance, whereas the fifth chapter will turn to broader understandings of the data in the context of other studies and in answering the research questions.

# Chapter 4: Findings

This chapter presents the findings from observational field notes, students' in-class written work and interviews with participants. The findings are reported chronologically and sorted by phase of the study, question and group. Answers to the questions were typically quite short and often point form.

Although my intention was to use the written work to triangulate my observations, I found that the responses were generative. Some students tended to shut down discussion if they noticed I was listening to them and the size of the class meant that capturing everyone's responses within a single session was impractical. Fortunately, much was to be gleaned from their written work. I have, therefore focused the findings through the questionnaires and written classwork, treating them somewhat like transcriptions of an interview, and included field notes and observation where they confirm/contradict or enrich what students wrote.

Students participated in two questionnaires individually and were grouped three times: twice by the teacher for the jigsaw activity and once, choosing their own groups, for the DJ playlist activity. At the start of each section, I have provided charts of the individual groups. All names used in this study are assigned pseudonyms; I have attempted to preserve the linguistic or cultural heritage of students' names where possible.

Throughout the findings, I observed several themes.

1) Conflicted identities between school and home.

2) Western framework of music curriculum and public education, including definitions of expertise and success shaped student discussion and expression in music, particularly, the differentiation of school music versus "my music," language, religion, culture/place and essentialization of others

3) "Just because"--difficulty in articulating: how music works, why they like the music they like, and the ways in which they and others use music throughout their lives.

4) Cosmopolitanisms: there was greater fluidity in musical tastes, influences and identities than the students' themselves acknowledged or I expected.

**Observations on Part I: Pre-Survey**

The first questionnaire was structured to solicit information about students' current taste in music, understandings of the ways in which they and others make and consume music, and their feelings around music in school. It asked for written answers to the sort of information a teacher might more usually collect in a Know-Wonder-Learn chart. The questions were drawn from the larger themes of C2 (Reflecting, Responding and Analyzing) and C3 (exploring cultural forms and contexts) of the Ontario Arts Curriculum (2009).

Overall, the children set to their task with good will but not all students were equally engaged by this part of the project. Indeed, it seemed that my cosmopolitan invitation to the class was likely to be rejected by some. One small group of boys were so disengaged from music class in general and the "*no freedom*" [Jordan – field notes, April 28] study that they answered the questions with comments about a star basketball player, LeBron James. The Toronto Raptors were unexpectedly in the play-offs and the entire country was caught up in 'Raptor Mania'. However, these same boys showed a marked difference in engagement as the project progressed. Their journey will be discussed in the pedagogical implications in the next chapter.

***Question 1: How Do You Use Music in your Life?***

"*Music makes you happy, music makes you dance." (Hannah, 11 years old).*

Students referred throughout the questionnaire to passive consumption of music in their own lives rather than music-making activities. Asked how they use music in their lives,

participants focused quite strongly on the self. The participant teacher had said that she used music to relax when she was modeling filling out the questionnaire. Of twenty-eight participants included in the study, sixteen said that they used music to calm down, 'chillax' or go to sleep. Students also responded that they used it to "*calm my anger*." Although I saw them engage in discussion of favored music with each other, including recommending songs, and singing portions of songs to or with the other, their reports focused on music as a solitary experience. Only one student, Kai, mentioned a "party." Five students, three of them female, reported using music to dance to, and only two for *"practicing singing."* Seven students reported using it when they were bored, either to change their mood or for something to do. Eight students used it to 'hype me up' or energize themselves, and seven to focus or to keep going on less preferred tasks such as schoolwork or housework: *"when I clean, when I do work in school"* (Abisha). Three students, all male, reported using or hearing music *"in video games."* Six students associated music with pleasure: *"to have fun" "to feel good" "to make me happy."*

***Question 2: What Are Some Ways Other People Use Music in their Lives?***

The second question about music in other people's lives was designed to elicit background knowledge and attitudes to music and society. It also invited sharing knowledge of cultural uses of music. In the responses to this question, I saw that students can conceptualize music-making and listening as a sphere of human activity. They bring in some of the social and communal aspects of music which were often missing from their answers to the first question. However, out of twenty-eight surveys included, six left the question blank and two wrote "I don't know," which is surprising in a school that had recently hosted a multicultural night at which students described music and dance performances as well as food sharing. This defensive behavior of "I don't know" or skipping questions continued throughout the project and I find it

curious that they take the time to write out “I don’t know.” There’s something deliberate about it, somehow both a plea for help and a turning away, putting the teacher/host in that uncomfortable position of wondering if they failed to deliver an invitation, or if that invitation/help was spurned. It is a strategy specific to racialized boys in this classroom; Samar, Muhammed, Saturn and Harnish all used it at various points.

Of the twenty-one students who wrote something, twelve mentioned the use of music for enjoyment: ‘entertainment’, ‘fun’, or ‘parties’ were prominently listed as activities for/in which music was used. The second most popular answer involved dance, nine students mentioned dance videos, for dancing or dance parties. Seven students explicitly discussed music making through mention of instruments *“to make a band for fun,” “with drums, with technology, with singing,”* and performance/concert. Two students wrote entertainment which could be interpreted as either amusement or performance. In these cases, I included their answer under enjoyment rather than making music. Similarly, six students wrote about “self-expression” which could be interpreted as the music one chose to listen to, or that they chose to make, or a message one was trying to spread either through music choice or production. Four students explicitly said other people use music to spread a message or tell a story. For those reporting music use for self-expression, I left it as its own category unless there was a specific context clue to suggest otherwise. The music teacher had identified that a few students in the class sang in church choirs, but in response to the first question none of them identified religious practice as a place they used music. However, in thinking about “other” people, six students mentioned ritual use of music: funerals, ceremonies, religion, birthdays and *‘making kings’*. And the idea of music soothing the savage beast, as in the participant teacher’s example of listening to music to “chillax” gained 6 mentions. Speaking of teacher influence, only one child mentioned using

music to work out, which is surprising given the students were aware of and mentioned frequently the teacher's own expertise and interest in Zumba. She is a certified instructor, mentioned in interview that she often plays music from her exercise class lists for the students, and it was clear in post-interviews that students are quite aware of her hobby.

***Question 3: What Are Some Ways You Use Music in School?***

This questions solicits information about music activities outside of music class and the ways in which music can often be used in schools to shape the day: "O Canada", mnemonics for remembering facts, calls for attention, tracking time (as in my high school where the William Tell Overture played through the five minutes before attendance/"O Canada") and keeping children moving in gym class are often accomplished through music. Students responded with only two mentions of "O Canada", the largest category of ten was 'in music class'. Of these comments, the most interesting was from Ramona: "*for music class, to learn about beats."* Six students identified that they used music in school for performance (plays, assemblies, concerts). No one mentioned the widespread practice of using YouTube dance videos for Daily Physical Activity, only two mentioned "O Canada", and only three students mentioned dance. This categorization of music in school, as being only school music, reminded me of Cohen's (1994) difficulty in collecting community music. The framework of Western schooling and conceptions of music, with separated and siloed subjects is evident in this group of answers.

***Question 4: What Are your 5 Favourite Songs?***

Of all the questions that I asked, what are your five favourite songs seemed to cause the most anxiety…what if I have more than five, what if I can't think of five, what if I don't know what it's called? The responses reveal a paucity of genres but an extraordinarily eclectic and diverse group of artists; over 100 songs and more than 50 different artists were listed. The genres

were fairly static, with only 3 students diverging from Western pop/hip-hop artists. Twenty-eight respondents were categorized. Harnish left it blank and Muhammed, whose family treats music as haram, said "*I don't like any songs, I don't know any.*" There were 100 different songs mentioned. The most cross mentions of any one song or group was 10.

The songs were most strongly divided by individual preference, but only five of 100 songs made the list of both a boy and a girl. I categorized genders by the attendance sheet. Overall, the boys trended towards more aggressive styles of music, trap versus other styles of hip-hop, metal and rock styles versus the indie/alt/pop bands favored by some of the girls. For example, of thirty-one pop songs, only five were chosen by boys. Only one of those pop songs was also chosen by a girl, 'Love Me Less'. Conversely, of the ten hip-hop songs chosen by girls, four featured Cardi B. This artist has in part built her brand on female empowerment. Another four of these hip hop songs were chosen by the same female participant, Catalina, who clearly presented a particular taste in music.

***Question 5: On a Scale of 5 How Much do You Enjoy your Time in Music Class? Why?***

***1 dislike 2 3 ok 4 5 love***

The majority of students responded to a Likert-scale five-point rating of their enjoyment in music class with three or higher. When asked what they liked about music, four female students mentioned dance; this is significant as the teacher/participant mentioned that she structures the class around dance. Other terms that came up were fun, energizing, and "*a break from math.*" In retrospect, a four-point rating might have been more helpful as some students who rated it a three were quite negative in their comments: "*Personally, I don't enjoy music class and the type of music we use is not my music*" (Sadit). This suggests that a certain number of students just circled the one in the middle. When I separate their ratings by gender, I see that

female students rated the class higher, overall, than their male colleagues, a situation which changes somewhat in the Post- survey (See Table 11).

**Table 1**

*Enjoyment of Music Class by Gender*

| Rating<br>1(dislike)-5 (love) | Total<br>N=28 | Male<br>N=14 | Female<br>N=14 |
|---|---|---|---|
| 5 | 7 | 2 | 5 |
| 4 | 4 | 0 | 4 |
| 3 | 8 | 7 | 1 |
| 2 | 1 | 1 | 0 |
| 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 |
| Unrated | 8 | 4 | 4 |

If I look at the further breakdown by race, Table 2, and religion, Table 3, I see that students were most likely to rate the class 5 if they were a female or Christian, and they felt considerably less positive the further away we got from that identity. A small group of racialized boys responded to the question of why they do/do not enjoy music with uncontextualized comments about LeBron James and basketball: "lebron james is not a goat like any other basketball player"(Harnish).

**Table 2**
*Enjoyment of Music Class by Race*

| Rating<br>1(less)-5(more) | Total<br>N=28 | Black<br>N=11 | South Asian<br>N=10 | White<br>N=7 |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 5 | 7 | 3 | 1 | 3 |
| 4 | 4 | 0 | 2 | 2 |
| 3 | 8 | 3 | 3 | 2 |
| 2 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 |
| 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| Unrated | 7 | 4 | 3 | 0 |

The one student of Muslim faith who rated music a 5 is Ranya, whose family also celebrates Christmas as a secular holiday with pizza and hot dogs, and has a parent of Jamaican

heritage. On the other end of the spectrum, Harnish, a first-generation Somali-Canadian of Muslim faith rated his enjoyment of music a 1.

**Table 3**
*Enjoyment of Music Class by Religion*

| Rated 1(dislike)-5 (love) | Total N=28 | Muslim N=7 | Hindu N=4 | Christian N=12 | Unknown N=5 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 5 | 7 | 1 | 0 | 3 | 3 |
| 4 | 4 | 2 | 0 | 2 | 0 |
| 3 | 8 | 3 | 1 | 3 | 1 |
| 2 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Unrated | 7 | 0 | 2 | 4 | 1 |

Students were also given the opportunity to respond to this question by filling in a blank box with words, images or pictures depicting how they feel in music class. They most often responded with stick figure or emoji-like illustrations depicting a stylized version of themselves with a smiley, straight line, or frown line for the mouth.

**Observations on Part II: Jigsaw Research Project**

The classwork was divided into three tasks: research, sharing what we learned, and applying what we learned in a 'real life' context. The first task, which took prompts from C1, C2 and C3 in the music curriculum was designed to increase both musical and contextual knowledge in the students. The second was observed but not assessed. It gave them an authentic purpose for research and allowed the students to share and expand their learning. The third task encouraged students to synthesize their new knowledge and offered the opportunity to expand their musical tastes in their own lives. In terms of curricular expectations, it asked students to think of the use of musical elements (timbre, duration, pitch, dynamics, form) across multiple songs in justifying how the songs they listed made a "playlist for a specific purpose."

The initial groups were chosen by the teacher-participant with some input from myself. Ms. C began by choosing seven academically strong students with the idea that they could be unofficial group leaders. It is worth noting that all the group leaders she chose were female. She then made groups of four or five by going down the attendance list, avoiding certain combinations of students who, in her experience, didn't work well together. I assigned each group to a song at random by taking Ms. C's list of groups and writing in the names of the songs from my playlist in the order they appear. No attempt was made to match student ethnicity to the songs given. The study assumes that all students can find some meaning in any pop song. Furthermore, they would have the opportunity to share their songs with each other at the end of phase one.

For this part of the study, students were engaged in group talk to prepare for presenting their assigned songs to others. Students were largely exhibiting on-task behaviors: remaining in their groups, eyes on the screen with few interruptions, or eruptions, and a range of reactions from nodding along to the beat, to pointing and exclaiming over images on the video. At the time, and in the post interview, Ms. C commented how engaged they were*: "students engaged in video presentations, excitement when explaining which was their favourite videos*" (post-interview with Ms. C). Although the teacher and I had suggested that they could divide the work amongst the group members, they usually preferred to collaborate on answering one question at a time. The students were provided a double-sided sheet of paper containing guided questions and space to record their responses. The teacher and I specified that jot notes or point form was allowed.

One of the following songs were assigned to each of the groups: "Papaoutai", "Stadium Pow Wow", "Sen Olsan Bari", "Believe in You", "African Sunrise", "Sola", and "Just

Right"(Appendix B). I thought of these songs as my invitation to students, designed with some element that I hoped would help students feel more comfortable in the music room through representation through geography or race or religion, or familiarity of genre or form. A demographic chart for each group, brief description of the song and justification for its selection appears below. For those readers interested in the songs which I compiled for the study, a complete accounting including a YouTube playlist is included in Appendix B. I have also included a demographic chart of study participants in Appendix A.

**Table 3:**

*Group 1: "Papaoutai",Stromae.*

| Name | Gender | Grade | ELL | Heritage | Race | Religion |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| K'deejah | Female | 5 | No | Jamaica | Black | Christian |
| Aisha | Female | 4 | No | Jamaica | Black | Christian |
| William | Male | 5 | Yes | Vietnamese | Asian | ? |
| Pietro | Excluded | | | | | |

"Papaoutai" was chosen primarily because it was in French. Due to the bilingual framework of Ontario schooling, music teachers often include French and Quebecois folk songs in solidarity with the French as a Second Language rotary teachers, or to connect to the homeroom curriculum for French Immersion students. I therefore chose to present something in the French language in a modern context. "Papaoutai" had recently been covered by the Pentatonix, who are often popular with this age group, so I thought it might be somewhat familiar. In terms of the hospitality aims of the project, it is written by, and features, Stromae, a Rwandan refugee to Belgium whose father was killed in the massacre. The lyrics reference his pain and confusion at growing up with an absent father who later died. The video is somewhat surreal, set in a picture-perfect suburb with a child whose plasticized father sits immobile in various settings in the house

and car. The child witnesses other children dancing and playing with their fathers, and attempts to entice his own father to play with him. When he fails to do so, he eventually sits on the couch next to his father and assumes the same, immobile stance.

**Table 4**
*Group 2: "Stadium Pow-Wow",A Tribe Called Red*

| Name | Gender | Grade | Languages | ELL | Heritage | Race | Religion |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Brighton | Female | 4 | English | No | Korea/Bangladesh | South/Asian | Muslim |
| Abisha | Female | 5 | Understands some Gujurati | No | India (but never been) | South-Asian | Muslim |
| Vyan | Male | 5 | Tamil | No | Tamil/ Sri Lanka | South-Asian | Hindu |
| Kai | Male | 4 | Portuguese | Yes | Brazil | Latinx | ? |

"Stadium Pow Wow" was the most overtly political choice on the play list. I was choosing one song per continent (more or less). In a nod to the awkwardness of settlers enacting hospitality on indigenous territories, this song by an indigenous rock group was chosen to represent North America. The song itself is also political with a blend of traditional chanting, heavy drum beats and images of resistance from Wet'suwet'en to the east coast. It shows indigenous people in modern contexts such as protesting pipelines or in skate parks and engaged in heritage activities such as jingle dress and hoop dancers. I was surprised that the students didn't seem to have the context to understand the political implications of the video. The Wet'suwet'en protest of 2019 was in the news and widely discussed in other schools I was in at the time.

**Table 5**

*Group 3: "Sen Olsan Bari", Aleyna Tilki*

| Name | Gender | Grade | Languages | ELL | Heritage | Race | Religion |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Anne | Female | 4 | English (Albanian and Spanish step-parents) | No | Europe (Hungary, French-Canadian) | White | Christian-ish |
| Ivy | Female | 5 | English | No | Jamaica | Black | Christian |
| Elijah | Male | 4 | Dad speaks Nigerian | No | Nigeria/Canada | Black | Nigerian Church |
| Tipper | Male | 5 | Mother – Creole | No | St. Lucia/ Jamaica | Black | Christian |
| Muhammed | Male | 5 | Afrikaans | No | South Africa | Black | Muslim |

"Sen Olsan Bari" is by Turkish artist Aleyna Tilki. It incorporates traditional instruments and riffs from the middle east, belly dance, hip-hop dance, and a pop singing style. The video has a somewhat confusing narrative with a large pink teddy bear whom she embraces and dives into a pool to save, interspersed with a chorus in which she dances with back up dancers in a desert setting. This song was chosen because the video is full of bright colours and images I thought would appeal to the children and blends dance, instruments and vocal techniques traditional to Turkey, with synthesizer riffs, hip hop dance moves, and contemporary dress.

**Table 6**

*Group 4: "Believe In You" , Raja Kumari*

| Name | Gender | Grade | Languages | ELL | Heritage | Race | Religion |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ranya | Female | 4 | Grandparents speak Hindi | No | Jamaica/ Sri-Lanka/India | South-Asian | Muslim + Christmas |
| Hala | Female | 5 | Gujurati - fluent | Yes | India | South-Asian | Muslim |
| Harnish | Male | 5 | Somali (some) | No | Somalia | Black | Muslim |
| Nartan | Male | 5 | Tamil (some) | No | Sri Lanka | South-Asian | Hindu |

Raja Kumari is an American artist strongly connected to her South Asian heritage. It was a bit of a stretch to include “Believe in You” in the study, as it is technically North American pop. I found it irresistible to include an artist who so embodied the concepts of the project. She blends rap, hip-hop beats, and Indian classical music in her songs, and has also collaborated with a variety of other North American artists. The video blends footage of childhood dance competitions with the adult Raja at various Hindu-American landmarks. Although I didn’t consider this in selecting it, the fact that it was in English may have made this group’s task a little easier.

**Table 7**

*Group 5: “African Sunrise”, Nsoki*

| Name | Gender | Grade | Languages | ELL | Heritage | Race | Religion |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Sienna | Female | 5 | | No | Jamaica | Black | Christian |
| Keesha | Female | 4 | Patois/ Creole (some) | No | Grenada Jamaica | Black | Christian (5th United Ministry) |
| Sadit | Male | 5 | Urdu? | No | Bangladesh Pakistan | South Asian | Islam |
| Samar | Male | 4 | Tamil | No | Sri Lanka | South Asian | ? |
| Iago | Male | 5 | Portuguese | No | Portugal | White | Catholic –not baptized |

“African Sunrise” was chosen because the artist, Nsoki, won best artist in the 2017 AFRIMA music awards. This song was a later collaboration with the same artists. It is, in my opinion, particularly lovely. The content and video was “appropriate” to school, no close-ups of shaking ‘booties’ or ‘playa’ tropes, no religious content. It promoted a narrative of Africa rising from its difficult past, featuring beautiful vocals and complex drumming, with both traditional and modern dance and costume. However, the students in this group didn’t particularly care for it. They commented on the difficulty of the multiple unfamiliar languages used in the song, thought the visuals were a bit “strange”, and said they preferred “rap”. In retrospect, ‘Africa Unite’ which

had somewhat skimpy, futuristic costumes but was more beat driven, might have been a better choice.

**Table 8**

*Group 6: "Sola" – Luis Fonsi*

| Name | Gender | Grade | Languages | ELL | Heritage | Race | Religion |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Hannah | Female | 5 | Spanish/ Portuguese | No | Argentina | White | N/A |
| Pushpa | Female | 5 | Tamil | Yes | India/ Sri Lanka | South-Asian | Tamil Temple |
| Jordan | Male | 5 | Somali -some | No | Somalia | Black | Muslim |
| Evan | Male | | Excluded | | | | |

Fonsi is a Puerto Rican artist who has recorded in Spanish and English. He has collaborated with Demi Lovato, among others. I chose the Spanish version of the song for the class; the English version featured a revolving door of different women in an outdoor market, which wasn't a trope I was keen to perpetuate. The Spanish version is set in a bar but has just one love interest. They meet in a bar during a storm. I wondered if this was a reference to the terrible flooding Puerto Rico experienced after a recent hurricane, but the students read it as a metaphor for the relationship that develops between Fonsi and the blonde inconnu.

**Table 9**

*Group 7: "Just Right" – GOT7*

| Name | Gender | Grade | Languages | ELL | Heritage | Race | Religion |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ramona | Female | 4 | | No | Canada (Irish settlers) | White | Christian |
| Catalina – reported by Ivy | Female | 5 | Portuguese a bit | No | Portugal | White | N/A |
| Adiv | Male | 5 | Tamil | No | Sri Lanka | South Asian | Hindu |
| Saturn | Male | 5 | | No | Barbados | Black | Christian—a bit |

"Just Right" features bright colours and just enough of the ridiculous to be quite appealing; The band at one point, serenades the girl from her cereal bowl, using her fruit loops as flotation devices. It has an earworm chorus which is upbeat and infectious even if you don't speak Korean at all. When we got further into the project and everyone got to hear the song, this was the one that I heard most often in the hallway before and after class. And it had clearly become quite pervasive because when I did the focus interview, one boy went to hum the chorus to illustrate a point and his classmate said "*don't you dare, I just got it outta my head!* "

***Question 1: What Are Some Interesting Facts About the Singer/Song and Video?***

This question was meant to solicit research about the singer/s' background as well as what students were noticing most strongly in the music or accompanying video. 'What were some interesting facts about' is a common prompt for research tasks in elementary schools and many responded with the familiar response of biography, like a cereal box book report. Other groups referenced the song's subject, a response often repeated for a later question about the most important words of the song.

**"Papaoutai".** Of the four children who were assigned to this song, only three handed-in/completed this sheet. All three mentioned the same facts:

1) The title of the song means "papa where are you?";

2) Stromae is 34 years old;

3) He is married to Coralie Barber.

In conversation, students were very struck by the music video, saying it was "creepy," but they don't mention anything about it or, indeed, Stromae's difficult and interesting personal history here.

**"Stadium Pow Wow".** All four students in this group recorded answers that were variations on the same thing. The students wrote that it takes place in Canada, in B.C. and that it shows aboriginal culture. Abisha expanded her answer to say "*cause the costume*" referencing the dancers in regalia.

**"Sen Olsan Bari".** The meaning of the song itself is a bit mysterious and the students have responded either by choosing an overall theme or by looking further afield, perhaps Wikipedia or Instragram for facts. Ivy left it blank and the other three responses were quite varied. Muhammed: "*the song is about love."* Anne: "*It is about love. Why does she make that weird face in the video?*" Tipper: "*The video has reached 4 hundred million views. "Sen Olsan Bari" means wish it were you. She has a sister. She is 19 years old. She is muslim. Also, if you translate the song to english, it's a love story*." It's interesting that Muhammed, who is Muslim, doesn't choose to comment on Ms. Tilki' faith, but Tipper, for whom it is a difference, or novel, records it in his answer.

**"Believe in You"**. Three students in this group responded to this question. In conversation, Hala mentioned that it was nice because it was "*sort of like her culture, well not exactly, but like the music and the dancing, we dance like that.*" Hala came to Canada from the Surat region of India and was very proud of and connected to this heritage. "*I speak Gujurati—Fluently!*" She wore a hijab, took two different classes in Islam on Fridays and her favourite songs were by an English pop star named Harry J, who seems to be being positioned as the Muslim answer to early Justin Bieber. On paper, the students each found different things to be of interest. Harnish: "*she is famous and speaks 2 languages.*" Hala: "*she starts the song with hop"* [maybe hope or hip hop?]. Ranya has clearly consulted the Wikipedia link I provided: "*She is*

*best known for her collaburations[sic] with famous singers. She mixes classic indian music with hip hop music.*"

**"African Sunrise"** Two students in this group left their pages blank, Samar simply wrote "none." Sienna and Keesha noted that the song was "translated" in Swahili, Akombo, and English. Keesha seems to have found an entry on an all-female dance troupe in Cape Town. This is one of the challenges of student inquiry in a large class size. It was difficult to get around the groups efficiently enough to make sure that students who were off-track were guided to more useful information. I felt that choosing a song by this artist gave the study more credibility in selecting an artist who was so valued within the African music community. The students, however, didn't note her awards.

**"Sola".** Only two students filled out this section. This group had lively discussions but struggled to get much down on paper. They talked to me about the hurricane being like he was destroyed by love, and more generally about "Spanish music" but didn't seem interested in the singer, or the country he was from. Jordan wrote that the song was about "*a woman he loves*" and Pushpa that it was set "*in a bar with a hurricane, fireworks, rain.*"

**"Just Right".** Out of four group members, one turned in a blank here. The other three noticed that it was a Korean group, were quite struck by the "miniature" or tiny dancers and said it had funny, interesting dance moves.

***Question 2: What Is the Purpose of this Song?***

I had intended this question to be about the use of this song, as in for dancing, for protests, to chillax. However, the students largely took this to mean what is it about. Several of the selected songs had political or moral messages which may have influenced students'

interpretations. Students knew or learned that the message can often be found in the chorus, so this question and the following one, which asks the most important line in the song, are often answered in very similar ways.

**“Papaoutai”**. These students answered with slight variations on: “*he made this song because during his childhood he didn’t have a dad.*” This fact clearly had a large impact on them but why wasn’t clear; they didn’t share (and I didn’t ask) if it was because of their own relationships with their dads. It’s quite a catchy song and the dancing in the video is very good which they commented on while viewing, “*they have mad skillz, miss, mad skillz”* but not in their papers.

**“Stadium Pow Wow”.** All four students wrote that the purpose of the song was “*to fight for your beliefs/dreams.”* It is certainly a very energizing song, with a strong ostinato sampled from traditional drumming practices, overlaid with electronic beats, sampled chants and effects. It is quite clearly, to me, a combination rallying cry and statement on the “enduring presence” and land claims of indigenous nations in Canada. The students recognize this particularity in other parts of the assignment but globalize the purpose to a generic “fight for your beliefs” rather than the specific: indigenous peoples are here, loud and proud, and fighting for their rights.

**“Sen Olsan Bari”.** Two group members left this question blank. Anne said it was “*a love song*” and Ivy that it was “about saving a pink teddy bear”. This was not a clear message song in the way that some others on the list were. It didn’t occur to them to suggest something from their previous survey categories such as to dance to or to tell a story.

**“Believe in You”.** The answers varied widely from Harnish’s “*to listen to”* to Hala’s *“It’s abawt life*” to Ranya’s *“to inspire you”*. This group had very lively discussions but as soon as I got close enough to hear would only talk to me directly. They didn’t reach consensus, so

either they ran out of time or each student was determined to have their own say. They were not required to have the same answers, and their willingness to turn in variant answers might point to a more hospitable or cosmopolitan stance in the group which had quite divergent backgrounds and faiths but worked together happily.

**"African Sunrise".** One student left this blank. There seems to have been a divide along gender lines here and this was obvious even in observation, the two girls tended to sit in front of the boys with their bodies angled away. Both girls state that the song is about "*how beautiful Africa is".* Samar notes that the song is "*to dance to, nothing else*" while Iago says it is "*to sing and dance to*".

**"Sola"**. Only two of the five students in the group assigned *"Sola"* turned in their paperwork. Pushpa said the purpose of the song is *"singing about he loves with"* whereas Jordan said it's "*to send a message".* Given that the chorus of the song is: "you don't have to be alone," either is a reasonable response. This song was chosen more for musical quality and appropriateness than for a specific message within it. It is a salsa beat and quite slow, so I would say it was for partner-dancing. These students are not yet at the school dance age, however, and may/may not have had experience with partner-dancing.

**"Just Right"**. Saturn effectively captures the meaning of this song when he says: "*they are tryna tell people you are beautiful just the way you are."* The other boy in this group agrees with him but the girls diverge. Ramona notes that the purpose of the song is to *"spread positivity"* while Catalina writes that it is about *"who he loves with."* I chose this song because it was by a popular group and appealing musically and visually, but most of all, as a woman and a mother of girls, I really liked the message that you are "Just Right" as you are. Interesting that the two boys picked up on that right away and the girls less so.

***Question 3: What Do You Think is the Most Important Line in the Song? Why?***

The goal with this question was to get them listening intently and thinking about both the musical structure (the most important line is often repeated in a chorus) and the meaning of the song. It also gave students who were not confident in their musical ear an invitation to talk about the song using lyrics, as the earlier question gave them the opportunity to talk about the visual content of the video. In most cases, students gave a line from the chorus as their answer, a few struggled with the fact that the songs were in a foreign language. I had made sure there were translations available to them in the links but they may not have been able to map the meaning from translation to lyric, or felt that it wasn't the correct thing to do.

**"Papaoutai".** This group must have discussed their answers thoroughly or designated answers to certain individuals because they have the most agreement across the answers, and the song is not entirely straightforward. "*I think the most important line is 'papa where are you' because of his past."*

**"Stadium Pow Wow".** There were no available translations for this video and as it is chant based, the only discernible text is a chant motif sounding like "hey-a, now, now." The students asked me what to do and I said they could either use text from the video or the overall meaning of the song. Although they note "no pipelines on stolen land" elsewhere, here they stuck to variations on "they are trying their hardest to fight for their beliefs." It occurred to neither the students nor myself to ask why the group chose not to use lyrics ...was it a metaphor, a genre choice?

**"Sen Olsan Bari".** This group most clearly illustrates one of the challenges of working with multiple languages in an English context. This question, which was supposed to be a pathway into the song, was a barrier for them. Only Tipper answered this question: *"the chorus*

*because it's the part that always repeats."* Which is almost a perfect reproduction of the definition I had given them when we analyzed "Wrap my Hijab" together. He avoids the problem of translation by choosing a technical answer which demonstrates his musical knowledge.

**"Believe in You".** This group had quite diverse answers. Harnish answered: *"she dances and sings in the song*" which is typical of his very literal answers throughout the project. For example, his answer to how you use music at school was: "speakers, headphones, laptop." Hala said: *we are the party of life, because it talks about life a lot.* Ranya gave the answer closest to what I might have expected with *"'as long as you believe in you' because it tells you why the song is important."*

**"African Sunrise".** I continue to see that Nsoki's song failed to capture the imagination of this group. Although I had helped them find a translation of most of the lyrics, some students were not inspired to identify a line they felt was most important. *"it is a problem for me to understand."* Iago states that "*africa, africa hmmm hmm, is the most important because it is repeated.*" Listening more closely, Keesha finds: *"*... 'I am an African' *I think that because it is the most repeating line."* The biography I provided talks about one of Nsoki's interests being a Pan-African identity building. "African Sunrise" has an Africa rising theme featuring present day Africa with dancers in modern dress.

**"Sola".** Once again, only two of the five students in this group completed the question sheet. I was somewhat surprised that Pushpa, who spoke to me about how hard it was to understand this song because it wasn't English, transcribed the Spanish directly. She writes that the most important line is "*Dime que estas "Sola" y que nadie te ve como you[sic]."* This translates as: tell me that you are here alone and that no one sees you as I see you. I wondered what inspired her to write out the Spanish but realised that when you google "Sola" and Fonsi,

that is the line of text that comes up repeatedly. Jordan writes that the most important line is "*you don't have to be here alone"* which is certainly one part of the subtext of the song.

**"Just Right".** The group working on "Just Right" didn't find concordance on the most important line. Nonetheless, their choices were in harmony with the overall theme of being beautiful just as you are, but they each chose different specific lines. They could have been working from different translations, but I suspect that each chose a line that resonated with them. Catalina, the trap fan, chose *"so you don't change a thing –because it means that you are "Just Right"."* This is a very direct, almost confrontational line from the song. Ramona, who was much more interested in conventional femininity and a fan of Little Mix, a Spice Girls style pop group, chose the line: "*you can't find a flaw that doesn't exist –because that is the most inspiring line."* She finds a line that buys into the convention of "flawless beauty;" the heroine of the song is beautiful because she has no flaws, whereas Catalina found inspiration in the idea that you shouldn't change yourself to fit a conventional standard, you are beautiful as you are. Adiv and Saturn, on the other hand, both gravitate to the male gaze *"you look perfect just the way you are."* I doubt very much that this was in their minds, but I do notice that they chose a line which suggests their identification with the author rather than the subject of the song. The power of judgement rests with the --male-- singer here; he tells the subject she looks perfect, not has a great personality or is really smart but looks perfect just as you are.

***Question 4: What Do You See in the Music Video? What Does this Tell You About the Song/Singer/Country?***

Building on previous research by Abril (2006b) and Shehan-Campbell (1992) which suggested that if the goal of including "other" music was cultural competency then it was important to contextualize the music, this question was encouraging students to bring in/seek out

knowledge of specifics of the singer and country involved in the video. It gave students a place to discuss the video if there was something that bothered/excited them while creating space for critical reflection on multi-media messaging. Ms C., the participating music teacher, didn't discuss this question with the students, and they have tended to offer visual observations or commentaries on the emotional content of the song.

**"Papaoutai".** "*The boy is jealous that everyone has a dad and he does not. This happened in Stromae's past."* This group had a story and they keep telling it. There is a lot going on in the video that they could point to in order to support this story but they don't do so. In order to accommodate the scheduling of music in this school, I had shortened the unit, but we were still very conscious of feeling rushed. I find that many questions are raised by this music video such as: is this what a suburb looks like in Belgium? In Africa? Why is everyone dressed in such old-fashioned clothes? Why does it look like a doll house? The students' discussions about the video with me, for example that it was 'creepy,' suggest that they noticed this too but didn't feel confident to write it down here.

**"Stadium Pow Wow".** This was an especially relevant question for this politically charged song, particularly as it lacks discernible lyrics. The students answer the first part of the question, but not the second. This is really a shame as this song speaks to an urgent contemporary issue in Canada. Indeed, as I write this, there is once again a stand-off between land protectors of the Wet'suwet'en nation and the RCMP. Abisha distanced herself from the content of the video when she wrote: *We saw signs "no access to stolen land without consent" On some dude's arm there's something that said 'no pipelines'. Another sign said victory.*

**"Sen Olsan Bari"**. Three of the students in the group didn't choose to answer this question. Ivy didn't fill in several earlier questions but chose to answer this one: "*She is saving a*

*pink bear and she look like a kid with her pigtail and bunny pj."* It was, in part, the playful presentation that made me think this would be an attractive song for students. Ivy doesn't address the media awareness piece of the question.

**"Believe in You".** Three students in this group answered the question. Although the video accompanying the song explicitly thanks, in text, the temple in California where it was shot, students read it as being in India. Hala: *I see a dancing competition. This tells me that you should try your best. [smiley face].* Harnish: *Raja Kumari always dances and sings in this song and she is tell stuff about her past.* Ranya on the other hand is very focused on the singer's ethnicity, which she reads as her nationality. Ranya: *She is indian and she says in the song that she never gave up so you don't give up. It is shot in India to show where she grew up.*

**"African Sunrise"**. In contrast with other groups, all four group members filled out this section of the assignment. Iago was the only student who offered interpretation along with what he saw. He says: *The video tells me about what people were in Africa, about Africa, and the singer, how she likes to sing.* Keesha notes various categories of the natural world and "chains" which is a recurring motif in the video of Black men, bodies covered in white clay, in chains and loincloths, walking across the landscape in which the contemporary performers appear at other points dancing and singing. It is interesting to me that she is the only member of the group to note this recurring motif and that none of the students mention Africa's decimation by the slave trade. Sienna mentions "*African jewelry*" and "*tribes*" and "*dirt*". Samar says that *in this music there are always African people*.

**"Sola".** Two students, Pushpa and Jordan, responded to this question. Both narrate the story of the music video and do not comment on any of the social, cultural or political possibilities of the video. Things that I noted were the bar is very weathered, the style of dancing

involves partner moves and shimmy, whereas many of the other videos they discuss in their personal survey contained large group number dancing. Pushpa writes*: There is a bar. Tells about that guy, talk about his [girlfriend?]. It is a sad [song/story].* Jordan gives more detail*: In the music video the woman that he likes and is dating got lost because of the hurricane but then they found [each other].*

**"Just Right".** All of the members of this group responded to this question. Some of them even responded to the second part of the question. Catalina: "*It has a cute, miniature theme. This tells me that the country was most likely filmed in Japan, because Japan is known for the cute theme (stuffies, food, pink and cute colours)".* One of Catalina's classmates is a big fan of anime and J-pop, so she may have taken those ideas and imposed them here. It is true that the video has lots of pink, cute stuffed animals, the female lead has freckles and pig tails. However, the YouTube video and biography that I provided both note the Korean origin of the group. Adiv went with rather cryptic point form: "*country: Korean (little people) everyone messy room."* The female protagonist had lots of objects in her room but it didn't strike me as particularly messy. Like the rest of his group, Saturn was much struck by the miniaturized band writing: *Korean people, little people."*

***Questions 5 and 6: What Do You Hear in this Song? (Dynamics, Rhythm, Pitch/Melody?) Give Examples of What You Hear. B) Why Are those Elements Important in the Song? How Are They Used in the Song?***

Students seem to really struggle to break out music in this fashion. Knowing that this particular task was less familiar than I intended when designing the unit, I had scaffolded the activity by providing an example two weeks before, and a reference sheet with musical terms and related adjectives. Approximately a third of the class didn't fill out this part. They may have run

out of time or they may not have felt confident in approaching it without more support. Many students approached myself or Ms. C. to ask for help with this question. Ms. C. would talk them through it one element at a time.

**"Papaoutai".** The two students who answered in this group, Aisha and K'deejah, identify a timbral aspect, but do not use the term "*I hear the piano.*" They identify the driving beat which gives the song its intensity *"drum"* and *"steady beat."* K'deejah also notices that the music becomes more complex after the introduction *"then the instruments get really hard."*

**"Stadium Pow Wow".** All four group members, Brighton, Abisha, Vyan and Kai wrote that they heard medium pitch, and two added that they heard drums. This is a song I might use as a first exercise in this kind of listening, because the sections are so clearly delineated, so I was surprised to get so little detail here. The video which alternates between several types of images or stories but cycles each story through the full gamut of the rhythmic material, may have made this more challenging for them. Their frustration with this exercise is further demonstrated in their answer to why these elements are important: "*the lines in the song are hey now, hey now, hey hey."*

**"Sen Olsan Bari"**. Only Tipper responded to this question: *I hear rhythm and a chorus.* The majority of the song alternates between chorus A: wish it could be you and chorus B: Put that heart back that you stole, so this is a fair observation. There are only two verses in the three-minute song, but there is a lot to discuss from the use of traditional drums and rhythms, rather than the more expected drum set and 1.2 beat, to traditional microtonal ornamentation in the chorus. Once again, no answer was attempted to the importance of these details in the overall effect of the song.

**"Believe in You".** Describing music, even when one is comfortable with analysis, is a difficult task requiring a lot of practice. And, to some extent, in the ear of the beholder. This group struggled to connect to the vocabulary. *"I hear melody and pitch and rhythm."* When I asked Harnish if he could provide more detail or describe the melody and so on, he added: *"it is smooth."* If one compares Harnish' description to Ranya's they sound like two different songs: *"Different dynamics, a strong rhythm and high and low pitch."* Even if the ease of description isn't here, the task succeeded in getting them to think about how the musician manipulated the elements of music to produce an effect. *I hear melody in the song. I hear "look at what you do."*

However, when I move to the second question, which asks why those elements are important, I see that they are not quite ready to put it together. *So when she sings the pitch goes with the rhythm of her song* is Ranya's contribution. She isn't taking the final step of explaining what this effect does. This strong ostinato does create a very smooth effect because it unifies the verse and chorus. *These elements are important because [without them] it would not sound that good. These are used in the back melody.* Hala is beginning to appreciate how the different elements combine to make the whole. The vocabulary is still not habitual for her [does she mean harmony when she says back melody?] but she is experimenting with how to use it and appreciating that the parts combine to make a whole.

**"African Sunrise".** The consensus description for the boys in this group uses tempo to describe the intro-verse-chorus-verse-chorus structure of the song. "*For the first 50 sec the song is slow and high to low pitch. Then the speed of the song picks up and then it slows down and repeats."* Having demonstrated how elements combine to create structure, the boys in the group

ran out of steam. Two group members didn't attempt an answer and Samar must have been feeling rushed: *Elements are important because I don't know."*

The two girls in the group often collaborated on their answers but they diverged here. Sienna said: *the pitch/melody goes 1,2 -1,2,3. Rhythm.* It is not immediately apparent when listening what she means, but it does fit with the boys' understanding that it starts out more slowly and then speeds up. The outlier is Keesha who says: "*I hear pitch, beat, melody, Unique and low."* She was an outspoken advocate for dance in music class throughout the project (and an excellent dancer). In her follow up response, I see how this lens on the music classroom influences her view of musical elements. "*The elements are important because they have to move to the beat and rhythm*."

**"Sola".** The two answers for this group are quite divergent. Jordan offers a detailed, if somewhat idiosyncratic attempt to describe the song using elements: *"Smooth, bass, guitar, drums and piano. The rhythm and melody are really sharp but also smooth the pitch is high."* Pushpa, on the other hand only states: *I hear rhythm*. That she understood the song but not how to analyse it is clear in her answer to the second question: *it's a sad song, like try to get his girl back. It's a smooth beat."*

**"Just Right".** This group, overall, had the highest participation in the sense of attempting to answer every question on the sheet. However, only two members attempted this one. These two seem to have more comfort with some of the musical terms as well, even if not always used correctly.

Ramona hears: *Pitch (singing at different loudnesses for different lines) melody ( a good beat and it fits with the lyrics) Rhythm(when they sing 11111).* In keeping with this developing understanding, she offers a generalized assessment of the role of each element in the song's

creation. “*Because without Rhythm the song would just be the beat and that would just be words. Or without melody it would just be talking.”*

Adiv, who is less familiar with music overall and less keen on it, offers less specifics. “*low pitch, high pitch, core, medium rhythm.”* I am not quite sure what he means by core, perhaps the drum ostinato or loop? “*If there was no core* [chorus? Tempo?] *the beat would be messed up and the song will be bad and messed up.”*

**Observation on Part III: You be the DJ**

At this point, due to administrative delays in starting the study, we were well into June, 2019. Students and staff were generally restless and less engaged; there were many interruptions and competing demands on my participant teacher’s time; she was on the graduation committee while also expected to be contributing to the Funfair which is the school’s primary fundraising activity. I had included this activity to give students an opportunity to engage with the music studied and other music in what I thought might be a familiar activity. I was really hoping the participant teacher would take the lead with expanding this into dance, a subject she is comfortable with and in which I only dabble. As noted above, however, her health, classroom logistics and time combined to make this less manageable. It was particularly too bad as it led to another pen and paper task and a more active and creating approach would have been appreciated. Indeed, I felt a little like I was offering brussels sprouts for dessert. Students were given the option of creating a web-based YouTube playlist, but I had to work from the paper forms due to access and privacy issues. From a pedagogical standpoint, this assignment asked for synthesis of a number of related ideas: uses of music, varieties of music, a cosmopolitan approach to music.

I did notice that in this assignment, more than in the final survey, students seemed to bring in a wider variety of music. Whether this is because there was a direct ask (include music from at least three different regions/cultures of the world) or because they were feeling more comfortable including less known genres is hard to say. Some students were quite annoyed by the request to spread their choice across different regions. Anne asked me if she could count a North American pop song of her choice as a different culture, because she was of Hungarian descent. She decided not on the basis of the following answers to questions I asked her: didn't speak Hungarian, eat Hungarian food, or attend religious services within that community; she had never been to Hungary; she didn't have living family members who spoke Hungarian; she didn't participate in any other cultural activities associated with Hungary.

***Group 1: Saturn, Muhammed and Harnish***

Although this group didn't complete the assignment, Muhammed and Harnish had not even written their favourite songs in the pre-survey, *"I don't like songs, I don't know any*" so for them to have chosen and written down songs is a large step forward. They don't say why they chose these songs for their playlist but three are feel-good tunes, they probably learned at school: "Old Town Road", "Waka Waka" and "Just Right". The full playlist reads: "Old Town Road", "Waka Waka"**, "**I Shot the Sherriff", "Just Right", "God's Plan"[Saturn substituted "Congratulations Pewdiepie"]**.** "Old Town Road" was pulled from Saturn's favourites and would be familiar to the group from in-class study. "Just Right" was the song that Saturn studied in the previous portion of the project, but "God's Plan" must have come from one of the other two boys, as Saturn substituted a Pewdiepie song for it.

***Group 2: Jordan and Sadit***

Jordan and Sadit seem to have taken the common ground from their pre-survey as a purpose for which to build a playlist*: To relax, to calm down, slow songs to listen to in your sleep because they aren't too fast and it's calming*. I wouldn't want to go to sleep to a song called "murder on my mind" but it is incongruously slow. Their playlist is: "Murder on my Mind", "Chiisaana Boksana", "Ahead By a Century", "Hide," "Perfect"

They gave their criteria as: "*They're all slow songs*." But I also see that they are influenced by music from media they consume: *"I choose it because I remember it from a movie I enjoy".* Discussing his enjoyment of J-Pop, Sadit says he chose Chiisana Bokana *"because it's in a different language than the usual English".* Sadit's musical preferences were rather interesting as they were more static than that of other students in the class and bounded by his interest in anime and J-pop. And what a contrast we have, just in the first two groups, with no overlap in songs, and a completely different purpose and feeling to the playlist.

**Group 3*: Anne, Ranya, Aisha***

Anne, Ranya and Aisha, in keeping with the tendency of girls in the class to associate music with dance, have created a dancing playlist: "New Rules", "Yalla", "Summer Days" (Marten Ganx –clean version), "Old Town Road", "Light it Up". I can see in this group's answers that they had discussed and come to a consensus on the theme of the playlist and chosen songs, but each child inflects their answer differently, bringing in different experiences. Anne offers a variety of expensive or vacation venues where one might hear this music. She is envisioning a very exciting adult life here: *I would play it at a beach party, a night club or at a pool party.* Ranya, on the other hand suggests a rather solitary child's experience: *To dance to*

*when I feel like dancing or am bored in my room.* Aisha doesn't give enough detail to imagine a party, but dancing is a social activity to her: *To dance to: I would dance to it at a party.*

When asked what they had in common, the group concurred that they were dance songs and by famous/different artists. Aisha mentions that they all have the same beat and I wonder if she means tempo or a specific drum pattern? Aisha was often seen in company with K'deejah, and though they chose different songs, Aisha has some ideas about the contrasts between Lil Nas X and Billy Ray Cyrus which speak to K'deejah's point about few pop songs speaking to country life.

> *because it was a fast beat. I like the song and it was from the countryside, not somewhere we did one of the others songs were from. it's about the country and it's interesting lil nas x and billy ray cyrus are both singers and songwriters. While Lil nasx is a rapper and billy ray cyrus are both american and were born there.* [Aisha].

**Group 4**: ***Ramona, Abisha, Brighton***

Continuing with the theme of music to move to, Ramona, Abisha and Brighton make a playlist to "*get pumped up for activities*" or for *"a car ride":* "Dream Glow" (BTS, Seoul, South Korea), "Drag Me Down" (UK), "7 Rings" (Ariana Grande, Florida, US), "If I Can't Have You" (Shawn Mendes, Canada), "Hello Darkness" (Simon & Garfunkel). When asked what they have in common, Brighton says they are all "*bops*", meaning songs you nod your head to. Ramona says that these songs have in common that "*they are all on my playlist*" and, indeed, when I compare the pre-surveys of this group with the song choices here, I see that they seem to have each chosen some new songs from favourite bands: Shawn Mendes, BTS, One Direction, and added a few others they found appealing. I do wonder what video they found for Simon & Garfunkel's "Hello Darkness"; they said they chose it because it was funny! They managed to

limit the cosmopolitan aims of the project in choosing only songs with which they are already familiar (BTS is on Brighton's favourite song's list, and the UK group on Ramona's).

***Group 5: Samar, Adiv, Vyan***

Similarly to Brighton's group, Samar, Adiv and Vyan made a playlist to" *keep you going*": "Cradles", "Centric", "Believer", "Stressed Out" form the core of their playlist. However, the aesthetic is quite different here. "Cradles" has a very disturbing accompanying video, and these songs, excepting "Old Town Road", have an energetic, driving rhythm. Adiv says these are songs that he would play when was "*stressed out*". "*They have a powerful beat and an energetic chorus and they make me get up!*' Vyan says he has chosen: "*songs that make me jump. I would play it when I'm driving or bored*." Samar writes: "*I don't know and I don't know*" but then adds that "*they all have an energetic beat*". He both stakes a claim that he isn't belonging here and then makes a gesture for inclusion. Interestingly, for a student who often seems to feel powerless, he responds to the question of why he has chosen these particular songs with "*because I can*". Continuing this theme of inclusion on one's own terms each member chose a different fifth song: "Rooftops", "Blaco Brown", "Old Town Road".

***Group 6: Catalina, Ivy***

Catalina and Ivy assembled the most eclectic list, one which returned my invitation with one of their own. They each chose a song expressing their heritage (Jamaica and Portugal) and expanded the list with songs which fit their expressed purpose of feeling lively: "Hurtin' Me" (Stefflon Don, Jamaican), "X" (Nicky Jam and J Balvin, Spanish), "Quem  Me Dera" (Maritza, Portuguese), "Tourner dans la Vide" (Indila, French). "Trust Fund Baby" (Why Don't We, English [American]).

According to Catalina: "*You play it when you want to dance and feel lively*". The rationale for song inclusion was: "*most of them has drums and beats as well as instruments like violins*". Ivy is focused on the dancing which may influence her focus on the beat of the song. "*I chose it [no shot] because it has good reyt [rhythm? Rate?] and beats."* It is hard to recognize the same taste running between Catalina's pre-survey list which was mostly hard-edged rap and this melodically driven list. Catalina says: "*I like the instruments they used, and I love Spanish music, it's so slow and calming".* Several of the other groups attempted to negotiate fewer songs from other continents or ignored that portion of the assignment until prompted, but Catalina and Ivy are visibly expanding their thinking about culture and language in their inclusion of not only the artist but also language/country in their notes to me.

***Group 7: Pushpa, Hala***

Pushpa and Hala didn't complete the section explaining their choices which is a shame, as I am curious about their inclusion of K-pop here. Their playlist has two K-pop songs, one Indian and one they didn't categorize: "Jungkook" (BTS, K-pop), "Twice TT" (K-pop), "Break [up] Song" (Indian), "Euphoria" (Pushpa only). It appears that they began with the instruction to include different cultures and ran out of time. K-pop wasn't in their pre-survey nor did either of them study the K-pop song in depth. Pushpa immigrated from Sri Lanka, and Hala from India. In the follow up interview, a year later, Pushpa described herself as a "*big K-pop fan"*. This finding of identity outside of one's music/culture/ethnic or racial origin is one of the strongest arguments for cosmopolitanisms in schools. It allows students to imagine futures more complex than we can imagine, and to anchor their sense of self in musics they find more expressive than those they would be confined to if we assigned music as narrowly as we assign demographic boxes.

***Independents***

Tipper organized his playlist based on the idea of remixes. This resulted in a rather eclectic grouping of ironic/nostalgic childhood shows (Caillou theme mix, Sponge Bob remix), video games (Fortnite remix), and outsider music (breakbot, baby I'm yours, Eiffel 65, blue). He seems to have a lovely, silly sense of humour which he indulges through music videos. He particularly likes videos with a bright watercolour-wash effect. There is no obvious identity of place, or even music type within his list. Sienna, however, chose to make a list of songs that she liked. Her list is *"to listen to anytime, anywhere."* She notes that she includes a Soca song because she is from the Caribbean as is Soca and she likes it. Keesha, working on her own, inflects a list of favourite songs as being those which *"support me in my emotions."* She includes works by Stefflon Don among others. Interestingly, none of the songs in this list were written on her pre-survey and only one "baby mama" is included in her post-survey. As we will see in the conclusion, Keesha had a very strong sense of pride and pleasure tied to being from the Carribean, where she returns every summer, and she seems to be enjoying bringing this piece of her self into the later class work.

Nartan in addition to some popular North American songs, chooses to include "Just Right" which was not his group song and "*Asian Parody of Old Town Road*". "Oak Tree Road" jokingly highlights some of the challenges of "multicultural" living. The protagonist attempts to "learn about my culture" by visiting Oak Tree Road, a predominantly South Asian area of New Jersey. In the video Omi Vaidya eats Gujurati food, dresses in Kurtha Pyjamas, browses the Bollywood selection of the grocery store, asking "haven't they heard of streaming" and basically plays tourist in "his" culture. The song ends with him saying that he will have to come back because he still has a lot to learn.

K'deejah was one of the few students who seemed familiar with the concept of a playlist. *"This playlist helps me to relax and sing and dance. I usually play it after school or in the car."* Something about the format of this assignment seems to have caught her attention because she writes a good deal more than she had at any other point in the project. She writes a brief description of the purpose of each of her chosen songs and their origin. She makes an argument for "country" being considered a different culture to allow for the inclusion of 'Old Town Road' and includes 'Toast' as a Caribbean song with a good beat.

Our time together was nearly at an end, and I am just beginning to see, and often only in retrospect, that an ethos of hospitality, that is one in which students were willing to risk venturing other opinions, felt comfortable moving in and out of group work, and could bring into school assignments music which fell outside the framework of "school music," is beginning to emerge.

**Observations on Phase IV: Post-Intervention Survey**

*I arrived with Timbits in hand to find that the music teacher and homeroom teacher had planned a pizza/movie party (Grade 8 graduation was happening as well). The homeroom teacher stepped up and said the exit survey had to be done first as well, but I had a group of fairly annoyed students… In order to facilitate student participation, I ended up scribing for some students, so there was more oversight in this phase than previously. I found a disconnect between what they circled and what they reported in terms of enjoyment overall. It also doesn't jibe with their levels of on- task behavior in the unit versus what other students in the school did when given dance (the reported preference) assignments.* [field journal, June 26, 2019].

The Post-Survey was designed to solicit information about participating students' understandings of the project and its aims, their enjoyment of the task and it re-visited the question of favourite songs to see whether there was some shift in tastes that might be attributed to the project.

***Question 1: What Did You Learn about Music and Musical Cultures Around the World?***

When asked about what they learned about musical cultures around the world, sixteen students used the word "different." They mentioned different languages, different styles and harmonies, different beats and different messages. Saturn evoked hospitality when he wrote: "*It's good to learn about different cultures. So you know about other cultures for example if there's a new kid that is African."* Three students expressed something about the universality of music as human expression. *I learned that all cultures are different and the same in many ways. Like some are all instruments, some are slow, some are fast, but they are all music [Jordan].* Tipper took it a step further in wondering what it is about music that is so appealing: *I learned that any culture can listen to (celebrate) music. I would like to explore more. Why do people love music, what makes it appeal a lot?*

Six students discussed genre or mentioned specific places they would like to see music from including Jamaica, Germany and "Hip Hop and other genres." Aisha evoked the fluidity of musical genres across culture, mixing and flow. "*What I learned about music and musical cultures is some people put into their music different kind of themes like an indian song can turn into a rap song."* K'deejah on the other hand, notices the ways in which there are particularities in each culture: *I learned that there are different beats to different cultures*. Catalina furthers this theme: *every culture has songs that express them.*

***Question 2: On a Scale of 5 Did You Enjoy this Music Unit More or Less than your Regular Music Class? Why? What Did You Find Challenging and Enjoyable About this Unit?***

As part of the exit survey, students were asked to rate their enjoyment of this project in comparison to their usual music class. It is important to remember in comparing the pre and post ratings which I have organized in tables 11, 12 and 13 below, that students were asked if they

enjoyed it more or less than their regular class. This makes comparison slightly tricky. However, I see that students who reported, and demonstrated that they weren't engaged in music such as Harnish, who rates music class a 1 and this project a 5 generally rate this project higher than their regular music class. Nineteen students rate it equally (3) or more enjoyable compared to their regular music/dance studies. When I look at Table 11, I see that male students rate the project more highly than females, in contrast to the pre-survey where females rated music more highly.

**Table 10**

*Pre and Post-project Rating by Gender.*

| Rating 1(less) -5 (more) | Total N=28 | | Male N=14 | | Female N=14 | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | *Pre* | Post | *Pre* | Post | *Pre* | Post |
| **5** | *7* | 1 | *2* | 1 | *5* | 0 |
| **4** | *4* | 8 | *0* | 4 | *4* | 4 |
| **3** | *8* | 10 | *7* | 6 | *1* | 4 |
| **2** | *1* | 4 | *1* | 1 | *0* | 3 |
| **1** | *1* | 2 | *1* | 0 | *0* | 2 |
| **Unrated** | *8* | 4 | *4* | 3 | *4* | 1 |

In comparing the pre and post Likert-scale ratings shown in Table 12, I note that Black males and South Asian students appear to be more engaged by this project, both in fewer unrated answers and more male students giving ratings of 3s and 4s. The numbers do fall for White students during this project. Hannah was quite upset to find herself unsettled in a class that she felt secure previously. In the small group interview, she asked if I was going to cry if she told the truth: that she didn't care for the project. White students were not the majority in this class, and the socio-economic status of the school overall may have muted discussions of White privilege to the extent that Hannah merely noticed that she felt left out rather than stopping to think about who was feeling included here. When I encouraged Hala to talk about the ways in which she enjoyed "I Believe in You" which represented her culture in school, Anne was

uncharacteristically quiet as she thought it over, but Hannah remained rather defiant. She was absent when I returned the following year for a follow up, so I was unable to see if time had brought her a different perspective.

**Table 11**

*Pre and Post-project Rating by Race*

| Rating 1(less)-5(more) | Total N=28 | | Black N=11 | | South Asian N=10 | | White N=7 | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | Pre | Post | Pre | Post | Pre | Post | Pre | Post |
| **5** | 7 | 1 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 |
| **4** | 4 | 8 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 6 | 2 | 2 |
| **3** | 8 | 10 | 3 | 7 | 4 | 1 | 2 | 2 |
| **2** | 1 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| **1** | 1 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| **Unrated** | 8 | 4 | 4 | 1 | 4 | 2 | 0 | 1 |

I hesitated over whether to include a breakdown by religious affiliation. Religion was only addressed in this project in the example song of “Wrap my Hijab.” However, it is an important part of many student’s identities and I wanted to honour the ways in which this section of identity is part of students’ experience of music class. When asked what holidays their family celebrated, many of the Black students firmly stated that they were Christian, often naming specific churches or denominations. Iago told me that he was baptized Catholic but didn’t attend church, some students were unsure. Ranya celebrated Christmas as a secular holiday and observed Ramadan and Eid, whereas Hala attended two different religious classes on Fridays and wore Hijab. I noticed that Hindu students were unsure what to call their faith but readily identified that they celebrated Diwali when prompted with a list such as “Channukah, Diwali, Christmas, Eid or Ramadan?” In Table 13, I see that Muslim students felt more positive about the Global Pop Music Project than their regular music classes, Hindu students were quite diffident overall but slightly keener on the project, and Christian students didn’t rate it as highly

as the usual, but this may have been skewed by the larger number of female students in this section.

**Table 12**

*Pre and Post-project Rating by Religion*

| Rating 1(less)-5(more) | Total N=28 | | Muslim N=7 | | Hindu N=4 | | Christian N=12 | | Unknown N=5 | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | Pre | Post | Pre | Post | Pre | Post | Pre | Post | Pre | Post |
| **5** | *7* | 1 | *1* | 1 | *0* | 0 | *5* | 0 | *3* | 0 |
| **4** | *4* | 8 | *2* | 4 | *0* | 1 | *2* | 0 | *0* | 1 |
| **3** | *8* | 10 | *3* | 0 | *1* | 1 | *3* | 8 | *1* | 1 |
| **2** | *1* | 4 | *0* | 1 | *1* | 1 | *0* | 1 | *0* | 1 |
| **1** | *1* | 2 | *1* | 0 | *0* | 0 | *1* | 2 | *0* | 0 |
| **Unrated** | *8* | 4 | *0* | 1 | *2* | 1 | *4* | 1 | *1* | 2 |

In terms of the challenges and rewards the students talked about in the written portion, students reported that they found the different languages and unfamiliar cultures a challenge at times: *the songs are interesting it was kind of challenging because it was different cultures and I don't listen to different cultures (Saturn). I found it challenging to do the "Papaoutai" cause its in french it's hard to understand (K'deejah). I found it challenging because I had to understand different languages. (Adiv)* They also found the preponderance of pen and pencil tasks onerous: *I enjoyed this unit less because I rather to get up and dance than write about it*. (Aisha). On the other hand, there were students who enjoyed the change of pace from dance-based tasks*: I liked getting information about different songs* (Muhammed*); finding facts and knowing great music from other culture* (Sienna).

***Question 3: Which of the Songs You Learned About in Class Would You Add to your Playlists? Why or Why Not?***

In responding to the question of which global pop songs they would add to their playlists, eleven students said they would add "Just Right." Their reasons were quite varied from because

it was funny, to it had a good beat or they liked k-pop. Four students said they would add 'Wrap My Hijab' but their reason varied from enjoying the genre "*because I love rap and I love the music beat*" (Keesha) "*the flow is catchy and really good* " (Catalina) to liking the message "*because of the verses*"(Catalina) "*because it had a powerful message*"(Adiv). Anne and K'deejah said they would include "Papaoutai" because it has a fast/good beat. Ranya said that she would include "Sola" because "*it was the only one that I really enjoyed*." Kai said the songs were "not cool" and William that they didn't fit his theme. The other students either listed unrelated songs or left this question blank.

***Question 4: If You Were Given a $10 Gift Certificate to iTunes and an iPod, What Songs Would You Buy?***

When asked what songs they would buy, a concept they found rather funny in this age of streaming, most students add one or two songs to their list by the same artists as the first, or which were mentioned by other students previously, so perhaps they shared their choices with their friends. Catalina has changed her answers so much that I went back to make sure the sheets weren't confused. Although the subject matter remains quite violent, the music she now lists is in Spanish and the musical style has changed from the hardest core hip hop (trap) to Latin pop ballads and fusion hip hop, specifically "Corazon", by Sebastian Jatra, and "Felices Los 4" by Maluma. She characterizes Spanish music as very calming, so I think she probably isn't watching the videos which accompany the songs. In a very short time, either her musical tastes have shifted radically, or she has made the decision that, at least in music class, her home and school selves can be allowed to mingle, that Spanish can be allowed at school.

***Question 5: Is there Anything Else You Would Like to Tell your Classroom Teacher or the Researcher?***

What a relief it must have been to the students to have a yes/no answer, because they were mostly just writing no! I asked them to add anything they would like to do in music class in future. Four students mentioned they would like to do dance. Only two students were interested in instruments, or drumming. Hala wrote: "*please let it not be more writing on paper.*" Four students mentioned other genres, often specifying rap music. Nartan and Iago mentioned that they would like to play Freeze Dance more. Five students mentioned continuing with music from other cultures, including "*American and more cultures.*"

***Question 6: Using Symbols, Words, and Pictures, Draw a Self-Portrait of how You Felt in Music Class During this Project.***

As in the pre-survey, children mostly drew stick figures with emoji style faces. In the twenty-five responses categorized, thirteen were entirely positive with smiley faces or "yay" written in, six were negative using bored or frowning or sleeping symbols, and three were mixed by using two figures, one smiling and the other with a wiggle-line for the mouth or zzzz. While one would prefer to see an entirely happy class, I would like to remind the reader that the most concordance on any one song or artist in the project was ten.

**Conclusion**

Overall, students were cooperative with the project: a few wrote very little and one student had to be excluded because he left all the pages blank. When I asked Ms. C. about this she said that was typical of his behaviour throughout the year and that he was "on the spectrum." The surveys and classroom work build a portrait of a music class that enjoys music for dancing, or to listen, but struggle to analyse or perform it. They are positive about the teacher, but some complain about classroom behavior or that it's not their music. The project engaged many of the

students, particularly boys, who were disengaged, but lost some goodwill amongst students who were happy with the status quo. In the next chapter, I will turn to how the findings help to understand the interactions of global pop music, students and teacher, and cosmopolitanisms in the classroom.

## Chapter 5: Analysis of Findings

This chapter reflects upon what students and teachers reported to me. It returns to our guiding questions, theoretical framework, emergent themes and the broader literature to understand how localized responses confirm, inflect and enlarge the conversation of scholars in the fields of music education and diversity studies in education.

It was evident that the dominant discourses of colonial education and commodified music production, two aspects of the Western framework of Canadian society and schooling, were very much at play within Goldentree Community School's walls. Though the student body was ethnically and linguistically diverse, containing students with Asian, South Asian (both directly arrived and via the Caribbean diaspora), Caribbean, Latin American and European heritages, the musical preferences of the students were, with few exceptions, drawn from English-language culture. Students commented often, and at times negatively, on the novelty and challenges of receiving curricular materials in a language other than English. Though several songs were chosen for character education themes such as perseverance, self-confidence, and standing up for what's right, students struggled to fit their own music, and the music they studied in this unit, into their school life. Finding ways to include their whole identities, music included, in school merits attention as both this study and that by Ho (2014) show increased engagement with and enthusiasm for learning when there is a link between school music and students' identity music.

Students' understanding of how and why we perform and seek to understand music, and culture more broadly, were confined by the school's hospitality approach which emphasized "foreign" cultures as something we "welcome" rather than an abiding and embedded part of our community, an approach which seemed to put students in a place of conflict between their "Canadian student" and their "at home" identities. This was poignantly discussed by Sadit, who

felt it would be selfish to expect his class to study the music he preferred, anime influenced J-pop, and Hala, who was so excited to be able to draw a self-to-text connection that she uncharacteristically spoke out of turn in class. The difficulties of this framework were also evident in the varying response of students in the pre and post surveys (see Tables 11 through 13) who were more firmly established within the Western framework through race or religion to those who had stronger ties to particularly South Asia, or the Muslim faith. Students of Hindu faith were more diffident, which may be a cultural expression, or may show that this particular unit didn't have quite the right invitation for them.

Despite the short timeframe of the study, I saw movement in students' described musical preferences; some students felt confident to include music from their home cultures in the post-survey who did not do so in the pre-survey. Students expression in music was fluid throughout the project, so that while genres remained relatively static, favored songs and artists, professed ambitions and even close friendships shifted from day to day. I also saw that the music given intensive study in class was more likely to be widely included by students, as in "Old Town Road" and "Just Right." This finding aligns with previous studies by Shehan (1985) and Abril and Flowers (2007).

The findings also suggest several important implications for pedagogical practice. Offering a variety of musical genres and practices, opportunities for both performance and listening-based approaches to music study, and attention to gendered preferences and expression all emerge as possible standards of practice. These pedagogical and curricular findings will be the focus of the final portion of this chapter.

**How Does One Junior Division Music Teacher and her Students Navigate the Tensions between Cosmopolitan Identities in Culturally Diverse Classrooms on the One Hand, and Colonial Understandings of Music and its Purpose within the Curriculum on the Other?**

In my pre-project interview with the participant music teacher, Ms. C, she spoke about the complications of delivering a large curriculum in a very short, indeed being shortened time period, the difficulties of engaging her students, particularly boys, and her own path into music teaching: "*no one else wanted the job, and I was already doing art."* She stepped up to take it on because of the ways in which she believes the arts in general, and music particularly, are important for student "growth." Throughout my time at the school, she was facing significant health issues, struggling to keep her classes and other obligations within the school on track. Furthermore, though we never discussed it directly, provincial negotiations over cuts to education funding were going poorly and there was a general feeling throughout the board of preparing for battle.

I spent a great deal of time in the literature review on the language of the Ontario Arts Curriculum. The importance this has to everyday classroom teaching is seen in Ms C.'s answer to what she considers when planning her teaching: "*I look at the curriculum, number 1."* Not a surprising answer as it is both a standard of the profession and Ontario law. However, a recent court challenge to the re-revised Health curriculum clarified that teachers may expand upon but not ignore the government provided curriculum (Alphonso & Gray, 2019). Ms. C. doesn't find it restrictive to base her lessons on the provided framework*: "Well I just try to cover everything that's in there …which is easy because everything overlaps and one assignment can cover a LOT."* She does mention, however, that it can be challenging to cover everything needed. She is

particularly concerned that next year, when she will only see students once a week, she will not be able to do everything.

She thinks about both multicultural and cosmopolitan tastes when she says that: "*I take into consideration what the kids like listening to, just to* pique *interest, and also I like to look at, like this project, global-type music just for exposure and to represent our community which is multicultural.*" I saw this attention to representation when she chose a clip from *So You Think You Can Dance* which featured a dancer with Latin-American roots, Gaby Diaz, a 10-year-old girl, Emma Hellencamp, and a song by Lil Mix, who appears on several girls' "five favourite songs" list. However, in a continued reliance on dance and pop music to bridge the gap she felt existed between students and material, boys who didn't care to dance, such as Harnish ("*I feel like dance isn't too much for me" [interview])*, and students with a longing for a different style of music, such as Catalina or Hala, were left behind. Students also didn't seem to catch on to Ms. C's inclusion of multiple cultures and ethnicities, as seen in Adiv's comment: "*But one thing I would like is, if she wants us to do dance, is more different kinds of dance, like not always Zumba."*

Another challenge Ms. C comments upon is one which the curriculum traditionally dealt with by introducing recorder and band: as students approach puberty they often become reluctant to engage in singing activities. *"If the kids are not into it, they just sit there. They don't like singing; the boys don't like to sing after like Grade 4."* If they don't like singing, and many of them don't care to dance, as I saw in the pre-survey and interview, and they don't have support at home for learning an instrument, then engaging students in music is quite challenging. Ms. C has introduced a greater variety of music to overcome this difficulty. The wide popularity in the class of *Old Town Road*, taught that year, suggests that she has been at least partially successful. Even

students who said that they did not care for music often reported that she was a "good" teacher, or as Brighton put it "*we have an expert teacher.*"

As I have said before, I initially refused to teach pop music at all, and then hip hop and so I cannot fault Ms. C for having the same blind spot, or prejudice. However, over and over, I see in students' song choices and comments that they would like to listen to and study more "rap". This can be a difficult genre to teach in elementary music class for three reasons: the musical content, cultural norms around the subject matter, and its verbal content.

The curriculum, like the Western music it is drawn from, is melodically and pitch centered, which is a barrier to studying the rhythmic and lyric centered genre of hip hop. Certainly, every unit need not teach to all elements, but I have already heard from Ms. C that she covers the curriculum by combining multiple learning goals in one activity. *"I know it will be frustrating next year when I only see them once a week, trying to cover curriculum…It's a huge curriculum.*"

When I consider the types of language and subject often found in the class lists, I also come up against schoolroom norms. Classrooms are a place of what Beck termed forced mixing (2006), putting the music teacher in a rather difficult position. There is substantial disagreement in scholarship on whether there is a relationship between hip hop music and violence (Fearing et al., 2018; Kindall-Smith et al., 2011; Patton et al., 2013). When I look specifically at the song-lists provided by students, songs in multiple genres featured violent, sometimes racist or misogynistic, images and language. I could certainly find operas with equally disturbing content but I wouldn't teach them either. The love ballad which Catalina suggested in the post-survey, for example, involved a video in which the singer went on a crime spree with his girlfriend and ended up killing her, accidentally, in a lover's quarrel. However, other students proffered play

lists which showed a careful avoidance of such themes, as in Hala's Harry-centered list. One could take the view that teachers should critically discuss such content, as do Bretthauer (2007) and Morrison (2008). What then do we do with students, and their parents, who are more sheltered? At least two students in this class, Hala and Muhammed, live in homes in which music is *haram* for the adults, and carefully censored, somewhat tolerated, for the children. What might happen in this situation if music were less censored at school? It might open spaces for their own beliefs and genres in music, or it might have more students opting out altogether. Or it might cause conflict between home and school.

One approach to this dilemma of competing identities and needs is that advocated by Khan (2019) in her article "When Does Free Speech Become Offensive Speech?". Khan narrates her son's frustration when his high-school Psychology teacher initiated a discussion of free speech in the context of the Hebdo massacre, a topic much in the news then where members of Al-Quaeda open fired in the newsroom of Hebdo, a French satirical magazine, in retribution for the Islamophobic caricature(s) of the prophet Muhammed which they (and subsequently many newspapers in the Western world) had published. She argues that the teacher negated the religious identities of his Muslim students in shutting down a discussion which became contentious when one such student pointed out that the killers were wrong within Islamic morality, but also how offensive she found Hebdo's caricature. Khan acknowledges that the teacher was acting to protect his students, but details the harm wrought by the continued denial of students' spiritual identities in secular schools. She suggests mitigating actions such as bringing in community knowledge holders while dismissing the complications of doing so, from unpaid labor to police checks to scheduling challenges. And the complications extend further. There is no consensus within the community of Islam as to the position of music as Berglund

(2008) discusses at greater length than is applicable here. When I played "Wrap My Hijab" for the students, Hala kept pulling at her own hijab. I had deliberately chosen this piece because I have seen girls at this grade level begin wearing hijab and fielding intrusive or uncomfortable glances and questions. When I later asked Hala why she had been pulling at her hijab during the song, she said it was strange to see an adult hijabi singing as this is not allowed. She liked the song, indeed discussed it during their religious instruction with a friend who had heard it as well, but they were shushed: "*we can chat but not about music".*

One advantage of the "You Be the DJ" assignment was that it did allow such content to come from the students, so it was not imposed on any child by the teacher. This portion of the project made space for students to advocate for and reflect upon the ways in which their music is structured and the subjects it covers. When Nartan includes "Oak Tree Road", K'deejah and Aisha discuss the representation of rural and urban communities in popular music, and Anne attempts to argue that North American music is a "different" culture from her own, they are engaging in the complex negotiation and discussion of identity and difference which Rizvi and Beech (2017) and Yon (2000) argue are central to cosmopolitanism in education.

**How is the introduction of study objects from pop music around the world helpful in addressing these tensions?**

The songs selected for this study opened interesting spaces for discussion about cultural identity, migration, musical taste, language, and nationality. However, without a framework that intentionally raised such ideas, and in a very large class, these discussions happened in a somewhat fragmented fashion, as in my conversation with Anne of her Hungarian DNA, or Hala, the dancing in her assigned song. I had been warned when beginning this project that a cosmopolitan curriculum was something of a contradiction in terms. A curriculum necessarily

chooses some things and not others whereas cosmopolitanism is a moral value rather than a set of objects, or series of laws. What I found was that a diverse curriculum, offered without a pedagogical approach designed to raise these larger questions, didn't necessarily challenge students to broaden their taste horizons or confront the inequities reinforced by commodified musical culture. In other words, a curriculum grounded in cosmopolitan principles can open space both for complicated conversations and belongings if the pedagogy allows. While the focus of this study was not on pedagogy, I would suggest that cosmopolitanisms in education can occur at an intersection of a student-centered, pedagogy with much space for Pinar's (1995) "complicated conversations" and a curriculum which steadfastly and deliberately offers multiple view points and assessors of quality (Schippers, 2010). Pinar is speaking directly about curriculum, and I argue that the role of the curricular objects is to bring enough viewpoints into the classroom to enrich and support the students in developing a more nuanced view of the subject. Or as Krasny and Slattery (in Press) suggest, postmodernisms, certainly Derrida's deconstructions of Hospitality and the cosmopolitan may claim to be such, can function as aesthetic disruptors, philosophical and moral questioners and inclusive frameworks in the curriculum. However, the very fluidity and playfulness of these resistances require time to take root, and to blossom. Lacking time for those complicated conversations, students absorbed some but not all of these ideals, commenting in the post- survey that they enjoyed learning about and listening to a wider variety of music. Though the study worked hard to avoid Hess' (2015) criticisms of a "tourism approach", students' commentary remains grounded in a self-other perspective. They identified their project's importance as being "*so that you know about other cultures, for example if a new kid is African".* This echoes the school's multicultural discourse which included slogans and events such as "we welcome the world at Goldentree" and

"multicultural night", a community event in which members were encouraged to dress up and bring their heritage foods to share. This approach may be trickling down from the neoliberal language of the Ministry of Education's equity and inclusion policy which imagines students as a future workforce prepared for the globalized economy by an inclusive and diversified curriculum.

In keeping with the Ministry directive that students find themselves mirrored in the curriculum, I had carefully chosen songs with which I thought students might identify. I also chose songs which I liked and found enjoyable and hoped students would, too. These songs were deliberately chosen for showing the performers in contemporary dress and settings, in some cases in addition to engaging in culturally traditional activities and dress. However, students managed to find a variety of ways with which to distance themselves from the presented content including othering language, focusing on visual innovations of the videos and feeling barred from participation in the song by its foreign language (though to speak of a foreign language in Toronto seems absurd). Some example of terms students used to hold the performers away from them were: *"some dudes' arm", "tribes"* and specific naming of other nations i.e. Korean people, African people, Indian people. Students at times discussed the novel content of the videos rather than the emotional or political implications of the songs using words like: *"creepy", "little people", "pink teddy bear", "hurricane"*. I would like to focus on one example in which I see these strategies as well as the one I found most baffling -- the "foreign language" defense.

> "*I see a korean girl…tells me they're korean. I see that the singers are small, tells me they like animation. I see a mirror that tells me the song is sort of about looks. I see barbie dolls, tells me they're funny. I think the country is very creative, their language is different and they like animation" (Ramona, Global Song Project)*

This is a thoughtful response. She's considering metaphor, camera techniques, race and song messaging. I continue to be surprised by how much students notice and find a barrier in language differences. Instruction in the French language is mandated starting at Grade 4 Three students in their class, and many in the school, speak noticeably accented English themselves, and seven students had at some point been designated as English Language Learners. At pick-up time one could hear Hindi, Korean, Gujurati, and Urdu or Persian as well as Portuguese spoken by caregivers to the children. When asked what languages they knew or heard spoken at home, only seven students lived entirely in English. If it is part of their quotidian, and translations are provided, why is it so bothersome to be confronted with a foreign language in curricular materials? It reminds me of my surprise on old census forms that my grandparents were listed as speaking Russian and Yiddish before school age. My grandfather would occasionally sing snatches of old songs in Yiddish or Russian, most poignantly "Ein Yiddishe Madle" to my husband, a covert request for a pledge of loyalty, but insisted that he spoke only English. My mother tells a different version of this story, that he once got lost in Russia during a union trip and realized to his consternation that he could in fact speak, and understand rudimentary Russian and was ashamed of how hurtful his insistence that he did not must have been to his parents and extended family. Having had "English, please" drilled into them at school, (Miles, 2019, p. 488) the students have internalized a colonial expectation of the appropriate language for learning, or as Cohen (1994) put it, "the twinkle effect". Derrida (2005) refers to this demand that help be requested and received in a language foreign to the applicant the first violence of conditional hospitality. The underlying expectations of the Western framework are working against cosmopolitan and hospitality aims because they have created a shared expectation that schooling happens in the dominant language.

Although language was noted to be the primary barrier to understanding the song throughout the responses, I also see students absorbing meaning differently based on their own cultural background. When I look at the group responses to Raja Kumari's "Believe in You", I see less defensive language in the two group members with South Asian connections. Hala, particularly, noticed elsewhere the cultural references she shared, but not the similarity of a North American citizenship. Hala writes:*" I see a dance competition, this tells me that you should try your best,"* showing how the familiarity of the context, regardless of assumed place, allows Hala to move beyond the particularity of the location to the ways in which the images support the song's message, whereas her group mate is stuck in the ways in which the song represents India, in fact assuming that it was shot there and that the singer is Indian, when she is American.

Another example of context and experience inflecting reception of the music was found in the group studying Nsoki's "African Sunrise". There was a division between the two students of Afro-Caribbean heritage and the other group members in their interpretation of the song*'s* meaning. These two girls wrote that the song was about "*how beautiful Africa is*". The music teacher, Ms. C, told me that she tried to take a more Afro-centric approach, often leaving movies for the class to watch which featured African stories. Her tendency not to pre-screen these films disturbed me as they often contained violent and deficit narratives that might work against her aims. In a discussion with another class in this school, one student said to me "*My family is from Jamaica for two hundred years… I'm a Black Jamaican, what does Africa have to do with me!*". It is therefore worth noting that the two girls produce the expected identification with Africa while the two boys insisted that there was no message to the song. Both girls are of Caribbean descent and told me they didn't care for or identify with the song and yet their experience of

Afro-centric education, and of the identities pushed on them by society as hyphenated Canadians who must be taught that Africa is their heritage and one to take pride in, readily identify the central theme of the song. These imposed identities placed students in conflict with education and with the Western success framework which tells them their culture, their music, their role models are the wrong ones. It is in these places of conflict that the unconditional welcome, hospitality without limits, should remind us not to impose identities but rather to offer multiple ideas and ways and musics of being.

**How Does Offering Curricular Objects (I.E. Music Videos) from Multiple Cultures Affect Students' Professed Identities/Choices in Music?**

Students were powerfully attuned to the ways in which music can alter atmosphere and affect, and quite sophisticated in 'searching up' music that would suit their needs and desires. Lacking in this classroom was a sense of what 'doing music' can do even more powerfully than listening to it. Making music was not a goal of this study, one of its limitations, but it is a focus of the music curriculum, and an important component of music learning. Indeed, much of the cognitive effects of music study have focused on singing or instrument studies rather than listening based programmes such as this one.

As I listened to students tell me about their families' celebrations, and the music the students enjoyed, I was reminded of Appiah's (1997, p. 619) discussion of local inflections and creations of culture within homogenizing forces. Ranya identifies herself easily as Muslim but her father was born in Jamaica. There are family celebrations of Christmas, which they celebrate as a secular holiday with a tree, presents and a meal, and at Eid, they eat "hamburgers and hot dogs and stuff like that". I would much prefer the curries of either parent's home country, but a family bbq or take-away pizza allows greater time for family conversation and, I imagine, allows

mothers who traditionally bear the burden of meal preparation, the opportunity to also put their feet up. Appiah begins his article with a reference to Gertrude Stein's allusion to Paris and America as her places. Similarly, students in this study had multiple loci of identity, by heritage and also personal taste, Pushpa speaks Gujurati at home, and was at one time identified as an English Language Learner in school, but is a *"huge K-pop fan"* a genre she seems to have discovered during our project. Brighton is another K-pop fan in the class. She doesn't present as Korean with darker, freckled skin and fabulously curly hair but it turns out that her father is Korean and her mother Carribean. She is one of two students in the class who claim both Caribbean and Muslim identities, the other seven students with Caribbean heritage all told me of the churches they attend. Rizvi and Beech (2009) called these lived connections and experiences "empirical cosmopolitanisms" (p. 126) and Goldentree's community and students are particularly rich in these interconnected and at times contradictory, conflicted connections and identities.

I find these empirical cosmopolitanisms in shops and restaurants in the school's environs as well. Empirical cosmopolitans are, in much of urban Canada, simply part of life. The local bodegas offer cilantro, parsley, basil and lemongrass side by side. The students live in a neighborhood in which the main street, about three blocks north of the school, has a Jamaican jerk restaurant, a Chinese restaurant, and a Middle Eastern Kebab stand side-by-side; if one were to walk south instead, a *churrasqueira* and a pizza place offer other cheap and cheerful lunch specials to take away. And a few blocks east, a Vietnamese café makes a most delicious cà phê sữa nóng, French espresso over condensed milk. In a very simple, lived way, cosmopolitanisms are their everyday experiences, but the students need opportunities for conversation and deep thought in order to understand the rich complexities which underly these experiences. Appadurai

(2008) thinks of this phenomenon slightly differently. He argues that the flow of production, i.e., people and goods, creates a production of flow in an endless and expanding loop. The importance of this idea to our circumstance is the ways in which this creates a fluidity in localities. The students' identities and expression in music were fluid, in flux, as they encountered, were changed by, and changed, new experiences, songs and ideas.

Although there are more upscale chain stores coming in to the east and west, for now this neighbourhood remains low enough on the socio-economic scale to preserve the small mom and pop places which populated the city in my childhood (some of them haven't been redecorated since, in fact). These "hole in the wall" restaurants might be read as evidence of a successful 'city of refuge' (Derrida, 2001, p. 4). These businesses are supporting, in concert with the school and places of worship, a "living and durable network" (Derrida, 2001, p. 12) where people are named and known. Ranya's comment about hamburgers, considering the fact that McDonald's feeds one percent of the world's population a day (*Chicago Tribune*, 2015), and the gradual incursion of big box stores on either side of their neighborhood, raises a concern which Appiah (p. 635) dismisses. He appears unconcerned about global economic, colonial and majority factors in his assessment of "choice". It reminds me of the conversation I had with the participant students' classroom teacher, Mr. X. He asked me if I thought that "things were getting better" because race just didn't seem to be an issue for his kids: "*they all listen to the same stuff, and they don't seem to think about this stuff, like it's just not an issue for them*". Until students no longer do a double take when I say that I love spicy food, I would argue that it is very much an issue for them.

In this study, diverse curricular objects seem to be more important to students who felt excluded from the traditional curriculum. The participants listened to a tremendous variety of

music, and as the project progressed, some started to find opportunities to bring in other genres which they enjoyed. Sienna, Keesha and K'Deejah all added Jamaican, Reggae and Soca artists to their lists, and Catalina brought in a variety of genres by Spanish-language artists. Other students didn't shift their musical tastes dramatically during the project. Their post-survey song lists do show how quickly they move between favored songs which is another pedagogical challenge. For example, "Believer" was chosen by three students in the pre-survey and three students in the post-survey, but only once by the same student. "Cradles" is beginning to rise in popularity when I leave the class but was not mentioned at all in the beginning. When I directly asked the students in the focus group whether they felt more/less/ the same comfort with advocating for the inclusion of music they listened to at home, they said the same, or they didn't expect to have their music included. However, students did seem to feel empowered in the latter half to negotiate for songs that are meaningful to them. I see students choosing to work in the same space, but coming up with their own lists, as well as students who substitute a preferred song in place of one they don't like. Furthermore, the widespread popularity of ""Just Right"" in the post-survey and enduring popularity of "Old Town Road" would appear to indicate that particularly appealing songs, when presented in class, will be adopted by students regardless of origin.

**Multiculturalism, Cosmopolitanism and the Limits of the Theoretical Framework.**

*"We had a mutually comfortable chat about the incoming board-wide dress code, and our concerns about hats/hoodies/behavior. Spaghetti straps, crop tops, baseball caps and hoodies, as well as religious headgear are permitted. This is part of an ongoing effort in the schoolboard to create more equitable and inclusive policies. Goldentree upper level students, especially boys, exhibit quite challenging behavior and hats/hoods off had been an easy way to establish chain of command in the school."* (Excerpt from field notes, June 19, 2019.)

One danger of the conflation of cosmopolitanism and hospitality in education, the view of teacher as host, is seen on a practical level in the conversation above. This conversation, which

focused on the challenges to classroom management of changes to dress codes, betrays to me, the researcher, the ways in which Ms. C and I enact limited hospitality to disruptive students. The changes to the dress code had provoked a broad discussion in staffrooms, media and living rooms across the city. Concerns about the inordinate sexualization of female students' bodies in un-air-conditioned buildings, the statistically unbalanced citing of racialized students for dress code violations, versus the social good of teaching children and young adults certain colonial and class norms of business attire and/or enforcing certain social norms in class were being hotly debated.

Todd (2016) has pointed out previously the ways in which cosmopolitanism can be co-opted to a universalizing, colonizing agenda in her exploration of the debate in France on Hijab in public schools. Less drastic, but more insidiously, in this music classroom, and in the music videos selected for my study, Western framework views of appropriate school room, and musical, behavior were privileged. In the music room at Goldentree, the teacher's preferences for Zumba music, and dance forms more generally, were shaping students' sense of what was appropriate to school. I have spoken earlier of my struggle within certain global genres to find videos I felt confident would be acceptable to my teacher participants. These strictures, the norms of an elementary classroom, made the acceptance of students' music and identities conditional. Derrida refers to these limits as violence; while recognizing that absolute unconditionality is impossible and dangerous, he asks us to consider the ways in which the limits necessary to safety, without which hospitality is meaningless, work against the law of hospitality itself. The hoods/hats off norm of previous school-board policies had also made student acceptance conditional, and had placed additional stress on students who were using hoodies both for warmth and as a physical manifestation of a psychic defense." I don't want to be here"

was eloquently expressed by a flip of the hood and crossed arms. Rap music, for many of these children, seems to be the musical equivalent of the hoody. Indeed, many of the styles of dress popularized by hip hop artists are echoed in the student body, and often dismissed or cited by teachers and administrators who are socialized to enforce certain colonial and class expressions such as removing head and face coverings, direct eye contact, and deference to civil authorities.

Although it would be difficult to assert that there is not a transgressive or aggressive side to much of the hip hop genre, Fearing, Konkle, Laitsch, Pierce and Rater (2018) present several compelling studies that using it can increase subject success in a variety of areas. As Low (2011) and Dmitriadis (2009) have shown, hip hop isn't necessarily incompatible with schooling and can offer many benefits to educators and students. Nevertheless, much of the repertoire participating students listed contains subject matter and language not traditionally acceptable in school. Students knew this and seemed at times to enjoy it, as in Adiv's note to me "*Don't listen, has swerring in it*". This annotation amused me at the time because of its upending of whose ears were considered too delicate for the language mentioned. When I spoke with Elijah about this problem of language in my demographic follow up a year later, he told me somewhat hesitantly that he was thinking of starting his own rap channel. As I responded positively, he expanded into the possibility of sharing his work with classmates or helping them write their own. In this way, the perceived limitation of the material (content) might become an encouragement of student creation. If you want to study it, you will have to create it. Inviting students to do hip hop covers of teacher selected songs, trusting students to bring in appropriate music (many songs have "clean" versions), and encouraging student creation of hip hop material to be studied in class are all possibilities here.

Thoughtful discussion of the differences between hip hop, Global Pop Music, and a variety of traditional musics might tease out some of the following thoughts. Most Western traditions of music are episodic, that is they contain discrete sections which build towards a climactic conclusion. There has been much debate over how to understand this construction; McClary's (1994a, 1994b) tongue in cheek representation of Beethoven's symphonies as related to the male climax caused quite a reverberation throughout the musicology world in the 1980s and 90s. On the other hand, Indian Classical Music and, Rose (2008) argues, hip hop via African musical traditions, relies on cyclical construction and subtle embellishment thereof for its interest. This frank discussion and inclusion would allow for students to work in Schipper's continuum, bringing in, contrasting and comparing definitions of quality between a variety of works while understanding the different foundations on which certain musics are built, or indeed the cultural particularities of who/where/when/what music is permissible, as in Berglund's (2008) discussion of the concept of non-music in framing religious use of chanting in Islam. In being able to articulate, analyze and explain the ways in which their music, and that of others, is constructed, students might gain understanding and appreciation of the pluralism in which music thrives.

## Pedagogical Implications

### *Students' Understanding of Music and the Preparation of Music Teachers*

When asked about how they used music in school, students gave answers which didn't match the ways in which I observed music being used throughout the day, to structure routines, as enrichment classes through an itinerant violin teacher, to get people moving in gym class and for Daily Physical Activity. Ramona and several other students mentioned using music in music class. Specifically, Ramona said: "*for music class, to learn about beats".* This colloquial use of

beats to mean ostinato shows both the strength of the teacher in using language accessible to her students, and the difficulty of this approach as students in the post interview felt that music performance required specialized skills that were beyond their reach. This attitude puzzled me as they had at various times throughout the year done instrumental activities including Orff instruments such as xylophones, Boomwhackers (n.d.), a pitched plastic tube, played by hitting it on the floor, and recorders. They may have mirrored their teacher's diffidence. Ms C. apologetically mentioned that she didn't have a conservatory background but was also at times defensive, mentioning that she had taken two advanced qualifications courses and many workshops. This strange mix of apology and defense was very familiar to me in the ways in which music teachers throughout the system must simultaneously advocate for their subject while being appropriately deferential to so-called real subjects: reading, writing, math, and now STEM. Her perceived lack of conservatory training, which currently reinforces the Western framework of music and its uses, may help her to be more open to both this study in particular, and a greater variety of genres and approaches. She did not come through the music educator curricula which concerned Wang and Humphreys (2009), Madrazo (2017), Allsup (2011) and Teicher (1997). However, her avoidance of continued, structured practical music, which may also stem from a lack of sustained pedagogical study, seems to have meant that students are barred from the very skills she most hopes they will have:

> "*Not everyone, their strong suit is not music, but they have to be exposed. If they're not exposed now, then chances are when they have the chance to choose music in high school, then they won't choose it if they're not exposed now… I think it's important for growth too…"* [Ms. C. From the pre-interview].

In contrast, at my children's school, where the music teachers have either come through a music-teacher training program, such as that offered at University of Toronto, or are professional musicians, the teachers have made a practice of arranging a variety of genres for Orff

instruments and drums, sometimes with dance. In younger grades, students either sing and play, or sometimes one class plays and another sings, and in older grades a few students sing with microphones while the majority play more complex arrangements on the Orff instruments and/or sing backup vocals, sometimes with dance as well. Another school, a little south of Goldentree, rented an adapted-for-schools version of *Beauty and the Beast*, an extra-curricular approach which I know Ms. C has taken in the past. However, when reliant on extra-curricular activity for a rich musical education, as I saw in Ms. C's room, it is vulnerable to the individual conditions of the teachers leading it, depending on a robust and resilient staff able to devote many extra hours to practice and planning, and subject to labor conditions. The work-to-rule during protracted negotiations in 2019-2020 saw the cancellation of field trips, lunch-time clubs and evening performances. In addition to the practical and pedagogical implications of such actions, teachers' enactments of hospitality to those needing nourishment outside the official curriculum/framework were interrupted by the strictures of work-to-rule. An action which was motivated by a fight against the increasingly limited welcome the government was offering to students with special education needs through defunding existing programs.

***Pedagogical Challenges and Rewards of Jigsaw Design***

As I read through my own notes and student work, I noticed several challenges which arose from a combination of pedagogical design, class size, and the limited time which the music teacher had with this group of students, seeing them for only 50 minutes in a 5-day cycle. As I discussed in the methodology section, the jigsaw design, where students work in groups to become experts on one skill or subject and then recombine to teach each other what they learned, seemed both practical and epistemically aligned with cosmopolitanism, allowing room for student thought, ownership and discussion, while encouraging relationship-building across the

student body. The Jigsaw design was immediately engaging to students and two mentioned in the focus group that it was their favourite part of the project. However, it can be a challenge to support students in expanding shaky skills or mitigate confirmation bias as in Saturn's comment *"Spanish music always has sick beats and sucky lyrics*". Having multiple groups work on fewer songs, or more time in this section of the unit, might have led to better pedagogical outcomes as the teacher could have discussed each group's findings with them individually before moving to the presentation to other groups. This would have preserved the engaging aspects of the pedagogical design while limiting the problem of surface engagement with the elements of the song. In order to explore these issues more fully, I would like to focus on three examples: the students' comments on what they learned about Korea from "Just Right", and their discussion of musical aspects of "Stadium Pow Wow" and "Believe in You".

"Just Right" was chosen for its engaging melody and video and the strong character message which encourages the heroine to view herself as beautiful just as she is. While it contains modern-life references such as the girl's bedroom and breakfast cereal, this one song didn't give the group enough data to infer very much about Korea. Furthermore, the novelty of one innovation within the video distracted them from larger questions about the aesthetic demands on Korean girls which the video hints at, or the overall much younger, but still sexualized presentation of people in the video. The fruit loops in which the band appears might also give us opportunities to discuss commercialized food and its globalization. Though some of their responses are quite stereotypical, it is possible that the ways in which it fit their expectations made it easier to respond to the question. Students commented on the cute aspects of the filming, the race of the singers and the miniaturized singers. *"I see a korean girl…tells me they're korean. I see that the singers are small, tells me they like animation. I see a mirror that*

*tells me the song is sort of about looks. I see barbie dolls, tells me they're funny." "I think the country is very creative, their language is different and they like animation. It has a cute, miniature theme. This tells me that the country was most likely filmed in Japan, because Japan is know for the cute theme (stuffies, food, pink and cute colours)"*. It was clear from their post-surveys and comments during the focus group interview that the video did spark interest in listening to, and finding out more about Korean pop songs and Korea. That's a pretty exciting result for approximately four hours of in-class time.

Many of the skills activated and extended for this project were as appropriately practiced in the regular classroom as the music room. Reading and writing for information are as easily assessed from the song project as any musical learning. Had Mr. X., the classroom teacher been able to offer some time in his schedule to the research portion, I could have focused more specifically on the last two questions of the project which would have allowed for more targeted application of musical vocabulary and even time to explore performance. If we are to explore music in all its diversity, we will need to nourish and build capacity in classroom teachers for supporting the music curriculum as much as we support math and science learning in music when we explain notation or acoustics. In fact, every year, I would have one or two students who would suddenly get very excited about understanding fractions after I taught time signatures and notation, and the ways in which a time signature is NOT a fraction. This fluidity of learning across subjects and the need to build robust cross-curricular units is supported in discussions of the use of pop and folk music to support history and social justice themes in the classroom by Lawton (2019), Morrison (2008) and Moore (2007).

When asked to describe what elements they heard in the song and why are they important, students visibly struggled, both in the room, and in the quality of their finished work.

The questions were intended to break down a listening and analyzing process for them. Without the analysis question of part two, the first question seems arbitrary. However, without first describing what we hear, it is difficult to *address* analysis. From the perspective of the music curriculum, this was the only “music” skill targeted in the project. It was also a listening practice these students did not have enough experience in. The classroom teacher and I hoped that their classroom work in learning and choreographing dances to music would give them embodied ways to approach the question of musical elements. However, they often struggled to make that connection. Abed, Sameer, Kasim and Othman (2019) found greater gains in acquiring and understanding math concepts in a Jigsaw design. They hypothesized that the engagement and independence fostered by Jigsaw design, as well as the experience of teaching others, enhanced students’ academic achievement. However, in this project, while I do see greater engagement, particularly amongst students who were disengaged previously, I do not see the same academic achievement. Students seemed to be lacking foundational material. To return to our example of student responses to “Stadium Pow Wow”, they do not extend what they are noticing into analysis of what and how the elements they hear contribute to the musical effects of the song. Indeed, neither student Brighton, nor Abisha attempted the second part of the question which asks why those elements are significant in the song. Students noted only that they heard drums and medium pitch; I would have added that the song uses timbre and instrumentation as an organizational tool, alternating between drum and vocally dominant sections. Furthermore, although it has only male voices, the pitch rises substantially in the middle section as the tempo increases.

This project asked the students to apply a series of concepts it assumed they had learnt and understood in early stages by playing music themselves. A child’s understanding of the

subtleties of timbre, rhythm, tempo and pitch are easily taught and assessed in a hands-on task where they alter one element and describe how they have done so. Many children will choose first to alter tempo, then rhythm, then pitch. Unfortunately, this class was quite intimidated by the idea of playing instruments. In the focus group, they were intrigued by the idea of using drums and pitched percussion but didn't feel they could be successful with piano or guitar. They often equated good songs with fast or difficult sounds. Experimenting with polyrhythms and harmonies, where each person plays a single pattern which overlaps with others to make a complex sound, using boomwhackers or Orff instruments, might be an approachable and successful project for this group of students. Gamelan, which has been a successful cross-cultural tool in both educational and correctional settings (Mendonca, 2010) is one example of the use of polyrhythms to build both confidence and competence with complex music in relatively novice musicians.

Despite their own doubts about their musical abilities, students show that they are capable of hearing and thinking about the construction of music. But when I move to the second question, why those elements are important, I see that students are not quite ready to put it together. Speaking of "Believe in You", Ranya says: *So when she sings the pitch goes with the rhythm of her song*. While composers do use juxtaposition to create certain effects, as in Dolly Parton's "Coat of Many Colors", the rhythm and pitch will most usually go together because they are the two parts of a melody. It is possible that Ranya is using rhythm to mean ostinato; The --1 and a 2 and 3 and 4 -- pattern which anchors most of the song and around which the singer's verses and chorus wind. If this is what she means, she isn't taking the final step of explaining what this effect does. This strong ostinato does create a very smooth effect because it unifies the verse and chorus.

Adiv, who is less familiar with music overall and less keen on it, struggles to understand what he hears: "*low pitch, high pitch, core, medium rhythm"*. He continues in response to the second question: "*If there was no core* [chorus? Tempo?] *the beat would be messed up and the song will be bad and messed up."* I am not quite sure what he means by core, perhaps the drum ostinato or loop? If so, it is not omnipresent in this song. I had initially thought he meant chorus, but that makes less sense with his discussion of the beat being 'messed up'. If he is referencing a steady beat, that is one of the core musical skills we teach in the primary years which he has just finished. It would make sense, therefore, that he would notice and comment on the facility of the performers at keeping a steady beat, but it doesn't help him to understand what makes this particular song work, which is how I had explained this question to the class.

***The Challenges of "Enjoyment" as a Pedagogical Goal***

Ms C. demonstrated several of the factors which Gurgel (2015) suggests are necessary for the success of a music teacher in a pluralistic environment. However, if she is seeking only for students to demonstrate enjoyment, I suggest that she will continue to struggle with classroom control and engagement. The wide variety of students' taste in music, and relative rigidity with which they reported their favourite songs and uses of music, will make it difficult to build a successful curriculum predicated on enjoyment. For example Sadit identified himself as a fan of J-pop and though I can hear similarities between "Just Right" and "Sola" with songs on his list, he said both that this was not "his music" and that he shouldn't expect others to study what he enjoyed. Remember that students generated a list of over 100 songs with an overlap of only about 3, that's ten songs a unit, in one class…Ms. C sees between five and seven classes a day. She has been working to engage students through songs they choose or by artists that she knows they like, however students who are already engaged in music seem more confident in sharing

their preferences which could lead to alienated students being ever more shut out. Rather than chasing the popular songs of the week, situating the songs they study within a framework of skills to achieve, perhaps even having a class checklist that mirrors her assessment chart, might help students who are less motivated by the intrinsic task to feel that they are succeeding in music. Offering more blended tasks, for example, having students arrange and perform chosen songs in addition to dances, write analytical descriptions of the music and/or reviews using formal musical and brain-stormed terminology, would build greater student competency and engagement without requiring a return to colonial "school music".

It is instructive to return here to a group of boys who began the project very disaffected; Harnish, Samar, Adiv, Sadit, Jordan and Muhammed all indicated, either through disconnected answers or low ratings, that they were not "into" music. For example, Sadit mentions that it is not his type of music, and Muhammed says that he is "not a music fan", whereas Harnish rates music a 1 and offers a disconnected commentary on LeBron James, perhaps responding to Saturn's comment that he listens to music when he watches LeBron James' highlights*: "because lebron james is not a goat like any other basketball player and lebron sucks".* In contrast, in the post-survey Harnish rates the project 5 out of 5 and says "*because it is really fun and so good genres".* Muhammed says that he "*liked getting information about songs"* so the pen and paper task which I viewed as a limitation of the study, gave this student a way to participate in music that was less contradictory to his world, and self, view. In other words, in offering greater fluidity of task, music and what music study might mean, Ms. C. and I have softened the Western framework which had brought Muhammed into conflict with his desire to succeed at school and remain in harmony with his religious identity.

**Conclusion**

When I began this study, I had imagined participants who had a firmly established, Eurocentric programme like those that I encountered throughout the city in my work as a substitute teacher. Although many of these teachers were encouraging about my work, they were reluctant to participate. They had a defined program which worked for them, and in one case, despite agreeing to participate and having administrative support from the principal, backed out. This not-quite participant was concerned about disrupting her recorder program, and I think not a fan of pop music generally. Ms. C, however, was more receptive to this program which was already in sympathy with some of her aims. This experience jibes with the findings of Wicks (1998), Allsup (2011), Kahn, Lindstrom and Murray (2014) and Madrazo (2017), that teachers who come up through a classical training system are likely to be less exposed to and therefore less flexible with popular music content. I have posited that the streamlined pathway in Ontario to music teaching qualifications through Additional Qualification courses might help to mediate this issue. My experience in working with Ms. C suggests that this is true, but also that it can lead to struggles in creating a comprehensive music program, rather than "some music". Teacher education was outside of the scope of this study but, in concert with the findings mentioned above, it would seem to indicate that an ongoing and concerted effort to reckon musical skills and multiple musics in teacher education programs and continuing education is needed. Sustained work with teacher candidates on the inclusion of arts across subjects, at York University it is a single 6-week unit of study, and the ways in which arts teachers can be allies in diversifying curricula might begin to build durable networks of support allowing time for more complicated conversations to unfold across subjects and teachers.

This study took a blended approach suggested by Abril's (2006) larger study of tolerance and music study. In working to go beyond the add-and-stir approach criticized by Morton (2001), making space for learning about the performers/cultures, I found that the minimal exposure created may have reinforced rather than challenged certain stereotypes (as in the "cute" comments about "Just Right"), but did make room for curiosity about and sharing of non-Western pop genres. As I discussed at length above, bringing in extra-musical content also rushed the delivery of certain musical concepts, at times to the detriment of students' learning. This is a challenge which speaks more to the compartmentalization of arts learning in Ontario schools than to a pedagogical issue per se.

As Kallio (2015) points out, even in schools where teachers allow for popular music and culture in the schoolroom, the term "appropriate" is often used to censor uncomfortable ideas, and to maintain certain colonial ideals of schooling. The students' repeated lament that "rap" wasn't studied in class, which persisted at my follow-up a year later, suggest that this continues to be a major barrier to students', and particularly racialized boys', belonging at school. What was encouraging was the ways in which students began, in the "You Be the DJ" portion of the project, and continuing into the post-survey, to advocate for music they liked and with which they identified. Elijah's comment to me about starting his own rap channel suggests that the conversations I had had earlier with students about musicianship, practice and identity had stayed with them. Elijah also reported that Ms. C. had begun allowing them to vote on which of a selection of songs they would use for the next unit using Koodo. While she has not continued the Jigsaw design projects which had been both problematic and engaging, she is continuing to try to engage students in music class through giving them more control of what is studied.

In the concluding chapter, I will list emerging best practices and suggest further areas of study which emerged in this project. Some limitations of the project are particular to the researcher's conundrum, and I will discuss some of the challenges and rewards of the project from the view of research when it is conducted from the academy rather than the teacher. I will then move from the local to the global to explore some of the larger issues raised by this project in the context of the Covid-19 pandemic and closure of physical plants.

## Chapter 6: Conclusion

In the preceding chapters, I have guided you through the experiences which led me to pursue this research, the authors, principles, and research which guided my steps in designing and executing the study and onwards into what I and the participants learned, and the ways in which I understand that knowledge. In this final accounting, I would like to offer a condensed summary of how this journey might inform teachers and scholars, and my own future study.

I entered a music room in which the teacher had stepped up to teach a subject she viewed as important, and in which she was seeking to connect to students through what she thought they would enjoy, popular music and dance, with small units in recorders and other skill based projects. The administration, while supportive of the teacher, did not seem to prioritize music in the life of the school. Students were being scheduled with increasingly less contact with the music teacher and she was struggling to deliver music from Grades 1-8. She also delivered planning time to the developmentally delayed classes at least one or two times in a day. She talked about the multicultural context of the school and students' lives and was excited to participate in the project, so she was seeking to connect to her students' identities. However, students and teachers viewed themselves as receivers rather than makers and critics of music. The culture of the school viewed multiculturalism as something to be accommodated, or carnivalized rather than an embedded fact of their communal lives. This colonialized hospitality informed how students viewed the project. In accordance with Abril(2006b), I found that students struggled at times to contextualize and humanize the musicians in the videos they studied, retreating to essentialization and distancing techniques (little people, those guys, shitty beats). Students who reported themselves happy with the status quo in their music class, sometimes felt alienated by the changed format. However, the importance of the project to

students already feeling marginalized ranged from quite dramatic shifts into engagement, to subtler moves such as the inclusion of music from home culture into classroom projects. As Ho suggested, students were immediately engaged by the promise of "their" music in school. In this study, they were irritated when what was offered turned out not to be hip hop.

**Methodological Implications**

I mentioned some of the pedagogical challenges encountered in the study, such as the students' difficulties in analyzing music through its elements, and in discussing what they heard, these struggles were present in the classroom prior to my arrival. However, the structures which guide classroom learning, teacher assignment and student schedules did not mesh well with the ethics process, nor the timetable of doctoral studies and it is worth taking a moment to discuss these challenges as I found my practical, pedagogical, and scholarly selves often at odds.

Ideally, one would design a curricular unit moving from the learning desires of the students, to the skills needed to achieve those goals, incorporating those things which the teacher's experience, and society/ministry suggests may be outside the student's experience but should be introduced. For example, had I relied entirely on student suggestion in designing the composer of the month board, Enrico would never have encountered the Chevalier de St. Georges. In Ontario, teachers most usually begin with the ministry-mandated curriculum, designing units which deliver those skills while scaffolding gaps in achievement and working to engage students through chosen objects. In the music classroom, teachers also must reckon a lack of general understanding and support of a rigorous curriculum in the school staff with demands to provide support and enjoyment to the community through concerts, extracurricular, assembly support etc. The researcher who wishes to study through drop-in instruction adds several more layers of complexity. They must address not only the concerns outlined above, but include a

theoretical framework or purpose, find a way in which to entice participant teachers and satisfy both school board and university ethics.

In my own classroom, though there was never enough time, I had the luxury of co-creating a cosmopolitan ethos in subtle inclusions throughout my discussions with students. Before I introduced varied musics, instruments and techniques, I had signalled an interest in cultures and ideas beyond the Western framework of the curriculum through allegories which included varied cuisines, rhythmic structures such as taal, and harmonic structures such as key signatures and raga. For example, in describing melody, harmony and rhythm as the elements of music, I compared them to a feast day meal such as Eid, or harvest festival or Diwali, or Thanksgiving, alluding to the ways in which a satisfying meal is composed of multiple ingredients and flavours; jerk chicken, plantains and rice and peas, or naan, saag paneer and chana, or turkey, mashed potatoes, and gravy. It was complicated, therefore, to step into another teacher's classroom, this time as the stranger rather than the host, and work to create a new ethos which differed in subtle but important ways from the existing "we welcome the world" to,we, the world, welcome the stranger, even if it is ourselves.

The timeline of the ethics process means that researchers are designing a unit for hypothetical students. I submitted to University ethics September 20, 2018. I received approval November 12, and sent to the school board for the first available deadline of November 29. I received their approval on February 19 and began soliciting study participants through the principals, as the school board required. Fortunately, I was able to draw on existing relationships with principals and music teachers for whom I supply taught, had I delayed to the following year, I would have run into work-to-rule and strike actions.

The beginning and design of the study were complicated by Ms C's 10-day health leave just prior to starting the study. I found, therefore, that I was more actively involved in delivering the unit and had less input from the participant teacher than I had intended, often taking on the role of co-teacher. I had to draw on my decade of teaching experience as I found myself delivering a unit which was not always appropriate to the students in the room. I had very little opportunity to remediate the skills required for the study as the students had music only once a week, and there were only 9 weeks left in the school year when we began.

This sense of having little time to complete the study, and of asking the students to complete unfamiliar tasks, affected the data. In part, what was collected was a picture of the ways in which music class is forced to be conducted in an atmosphere antithetical to the cosmopolitan refuge which I have argued school can be. The participant teacher and I had to choose between teaching the skills needed for this study and doing the unit as written. We were able to offer supplemental material and teacher assistance throughout the unit. Furthermore, while the objects, and students' reception thereof, offered rich space for curricular conversations, the boundary of the fifty-minute period rushed and at times forestalled the conversations themselves.

To study cosmopolitanisms often feels like seeking to describe something seen in the corner of one's vision.  It is at once, something foundational, hospitality, the reception of the other, and something slippery, filled with complex and mutable ideas. Who really is the "other", whose land is this anyways, who am I or you? Though we have the idea of love, or friendship, at first sight, relationships take time and intentional thought and action to develop. Similarly, to move a classroom, or a school, or a society into a different realm of relations takes much more

time, and many more people, than a researcher, a class, and a month or two. Nonetheless, there is much in this study to suggest some ways forward.

The curricular intervention opened spaces for students' more complex, sometimes conflicted identities at school. Catalina claimed both Trap and Spanish ballads in her playlists; Muhammed found a place in music class that allowed his Muslim and music scholar selves to co-exist; Anne started to unpack ideas of race/heritage/identity and Keesha brought music which evoked the freedom of summer vacations, family, and self into her classroom identity. Elijah began to claim space for his identity music, "rap". These ideas and feelings took time to develop, some are barely hinted at in the project's final data, and only revealed themselves in follow-up conversations a year later. That I should see results in both a short and longer time frame speaks to the need for ongoing, intentional revision of curricular representation.

**Implications for Researchers and Practitioners**

One criticism broadly aimed at academic studies and recommendations is a sort of "come over here and say that again", that they do not appreciate the realities under which teachers operate. This lament has provoked everything from entire dissociation in the 1980s to an increasing interest in practitioner inquiry. For the researcher who wishes to enact an intervention into the classroom, this study elucidates some of the practical challenges to doing so from participant recruitment, to scheduling, to pedagogical legitimacy when one is not as familiar with students, their Individual Education Plans and their academic skills as one might wish. I was fortunate with this class, that their homeroom teacher, Mr. X was quite adept with technology and had clearly accustomed the students to a certain amount of online work. They didn't need much help with clicking on links, or searching information online. They were unfamiliar with the jigsaw format and, it seemed with dividing tasks up in a group, which slowed their progress in

the research task. Had this been a culminating task planned from earlier in the year, the classroom teacher might have taken on some practice with them in this type of work, explicitly teaching group planning skills, much as I teach students ensemble practice skills by designating and rotating: conductor, singer, instrumentalist, beat-keeper, and critic.

I noted in the analysis chapter that students struggled to understand and explain musical thinking. This analytic skill is embedded across curricula from "explain your thinking" in math, to observations of the natural world in science and descriptive writing in language arts. Music, French, Art and Physical Education teachers are rarely included in team-level curricular planning. This lost opportunity of not only curricular but analytical and skill connections is visible in this study, not only in what was forestalled by lack of time, but also kinds of thinking that students would benefit from practicing across subjects. The placing of music, and other rotary subjects, into a silo of being that "break from math" therefore makes teachers' and students' lives both more difficult and less rich than they might be.

I noted throughout the study, in the teacher interview, in the pre-survey and in the students' self-talk, that making music was felt to be out of their sphere. Students listened to, danced to, woke and slept to the music others made. It seemed that this lack of intimacy with the physical workings of music made it more difficult to understand and appreciate what they heard. This leaves us in a rather tricky spot. Having a conservatory trained teacher, who felt confident in teaching practical music would likely lead to more confidence and development in their musical thinking. However, as I have discussed extensively, such training, usually based almost entirely in Western framework conceptions of music and its practice, often leads teachers away from the sorts of music these students enjoyed and consumed outside of school. The academy,

therefore, will need to continue to infuse teacher training, and professional development with deliberate training in integrating multiple musics, particularly hip hop into the classroom.

An additional challenge for teacher education, and practitioners more broadly, is how changeable and fluid the students' musical tastes proved. This fluidity is helpful in their willingness if not to seek out, at least to hear "other" music but the rapidity with which songs are favored and then annoying can make curriculum planning around these tastes challenging. For example, I still use the folk songs and pedagogical material I learned in my university training more than ten years ago, but most popular songs from that same training would now be considered retro. In the favourite songs portion of the post survey the majority of participants repeated at most one or two songs from the pre-survey. This was after an interval of only eight weeks. Considering the amount of effort involved in finding, transcribing and arranging popular music, this fluidity will likely continue to be a barrier in classrooms where teacher-led music making is the norm. I have seen a few successful programs where teachers leave it to students to adapt and arrange their own songs, but this is generally more successful in communities where private music classes are the norm.

That it is difficult is not, however, a reason to avoid embracing the fluidity of student tastes. If I base my music classroom in hospitality, welcoming the other, than it becomes much easier to imagine a fluid practice. For example, I might structure music units to allow more improvisation, use popular music elements as ostinato; I might say: using the beat from "I believe in you" construct a so-mi pattern to accompany a spoken word piece on the environment. In a cosmopolitan classroom, we can experiment with "found" instruments which might seem more welcoming to students who don't view themselves as musically competent; I have seen students construct lummi sticks with newspaper and masking tape, turn chairs into complex

drums, using the legs as cymbals, and use vocatives to imitate guitars. And just as I wouldn't make a roast chicken for a vegetarian guest, activities which involve learning about a musician or musical style rather than playing it, can offer students an inclusive experience of the music classroom. Listening journals and morning music programs also offer relatively low-cost/effort opportunities to expand both the musical life and flavour profile of the school. Furthermore, in embracing the fluidity of [music] precepts, which migrate, are adopted in, and change with human encounters (Appadurai, 2008), we make space at the table for students, and our, complex, and conflicted identities.

**Lockdown: Cosmopolitanisms in the Time of Covid-19**

In the time since I began my doctoral journey, Trudeau declared of his gender balanced cabinet "because it's 2015", Trump was elected with chants of "lock her up" and "build that wall," Autumn Pelletier addressed the United Nations and Greta Thunberg began her school strike for climate change. As I near the completion of this dissertation, I am alternating shifts with my partner to school and care for our children during the Covid-19 stay at home orders. We are individually and personally more tied to our global vulnerabilities and humanity in ways that seemed like science-fiction months ago. Covid-19 has made my own work feel both tragically relevant and futile as governments close international travel, schools, and borders and ask citizens to stay home. Nationalist ethos have come to play as Trump appeals to patriotism, and Trudeau to the social good in asking citizens to "shelter in place" or practice "social distancing."

Even as our daily travels narrow, our widespread connections to the world continue: a neighbour has hung an Italian/Canadian flag (with one green stripe in place of a red) on his porch and I wave as I walk by every evening on my little loop. My own social circle is suddenly freed of the constrictions of 9-5 schedules and time zones and I regularly videoconference with friends

and family on the West-Coast, who before had required a great deal of schedule juggling to connect.

Despite reports of increasing Anti-Asian racism, including beatings and much online abuse, Trump has crossed out Covid-19 and written "the Chinese virus." Within the empirical cosmopolitanism of Rizvi, I had two responses, one a reaching out to affected friends, and the other a capitalist show of solidarity. I check in with my friends of Asian descent. "Hi, how are you? Sending love…Looking forward to dim sum together soon…" I order Chinese food from my local take-out place in response to reports that people are avoiding these areas and businesses. As cases skyrocket in Toronto and we make a family decision not to order in food, I wish that I had paid better attention when a homestay's mother taught me to roll, fill and pinch the dough for dumplings…I wonder if she and her family are ok but don't write, after all, what could I possibly say?

The fault lines and the strengths of our local and global communities are being tested… "why did we send millions of dollars-worth of Personal Protective Equipment to China in February a reporter asks Trudeau on March 31?" "Do you regret that decision now?" France and Britain have defied U.S. sanctions to send aid to Iran. The fragility of cosmopolitan ideals, and their intersection with capitalism can be seen here. On the one hand, our government had acted very much in line with both 'Canadian values' in extending help to China when it looked like things were under control here. On the other hand, racism appears in questions over the quality of the protective equipment China, on the other side of the curve, is now sending to Canada. China has long been perceived as a source of cheap and cheaply made items and current restrictions raise the ways in which our daily lives are dependent on global supply chains, which have now been damaged and disrupted.

On bad days, I wonder what my work could possibly mean in this new, often disastrous world unfolding outside my door. On good days, cosmopolitanisms have never felt more relevant, or urgent. Humanity is suddenly facing a defined and urgent threat. There is nothing abstract about hearing someone two tables over coughing and wondering if it's a cold or Covid. Things which were impossible a month ago are suddenly being trialled. In the hush of decreased traffic, I can hear birds in my urban backyard. Though I am suddenly more connected to absent friends and family, I am missing my Ethiopian barista, the sisters from Nova Scotia who run my favourite brunch place, the other parents at drop off. I desperately long for the snatches of other's lives that I used to craft into stories as I passed them in the street, at restaurants, in stores. Rizvi and Beech's (2017) empirical cosmopolitanisms, lived experiences of the other as part of our lives, are visible, not only in the things that I am missing, but in the ways I am suddenly more aware of everyone's connections to other places. The social nicety of "how are your family (in Italy, Ireland, China, New Zealand, the US)" has acquired a new and ominous urgency. I am poignantly aware of my many privileges as neighbours debate the relative safety of public fields, side streets and parks for their runaway toddlers, essential workers go to work, nurses post urgent pleas for PPE and the public to JUST STAY HOME. Further afield, friends post articles about access to water for handwashing in India, on First Nations reserves in Canada, in Flint and Detroit, Michigan, the difficulty of getting people to maintain quarantine when they rely on daily wage labor to eat. As the pandemic continues, the academy begins to weigh in. Cohen (2020) describes a foursquare of immobility/mobility and privileged/poor. He notes the ways in which mobility and privilege allowed people to mitigate their own risks while increasing the risk to other people. He contrasts his own relative comfort to the crisis being experienced by street children in Tehran, largely immigrants from Afghanistan, who are now without means of

sustenance, have little access to housing or hygiene, and are not at all a priority for government or social agencies. The United Nations releases a report detailing the ways in which school closures, particularly in the global south, threaten both public health and education initiatives and the disproportionate economic impact of the lockdowns on families living in poverty (United Nations, 2020).

Considerably lower on Maslow's hierarchy of needs, I watch my children's public school board struggle to address equity as they roll out "teacher-led learning." Surveys are sent out asking who has access to internet, devices (mobile phones don't count) and printers. I am confident this board will find some way to get materials to everyone but inequities of language, parent's education level, access to food, shelter, books, will all be magnified in this time.

The music we listen to, and the arts we lean on are also very much in evidence. Museums have opened their (virtual) doors to the public, Queen Rania strapped on a google-street view camera and hiked Petra (*Street View Treks*, n.d.) https://www.google.com/maps/about/behind-the-scenes/streetview/treks/petra/. Being able to access artistic expression is one way in which I see people coping, from dance challenges to Patrick Stewart reading a sonnet a day, to a variety of Corona-virus themed parodies and twenty second hand-wash songs. In the scramble to keep people fed and housed, governments are being asked to address the precarity of gig workers and artists whose showings and performances are cancelled for the foreseeable future. The personal is not only the political, it's a public health risk.

So, what do I think this has to do with schooling, cosmopolitanisms and music? We are relying on everyone to believe that public health advice applies to them, is relevant to them, and must be followed. How successful we will be is yet unknown. If a student's experience of schooling has suggested that government is for someone else' benefit, that they are not a priority

for this social order, how likely are they to comply with physical distancing? To continue learning at home? Inequities of socio-economic status are also magnified. Who has a stay at home parent who can act as pedagogue in loco? Is there a device and internet access available? Students who relied on school snack programs may be hungrier and grocery shortages caused by panic buying will cause greater inequity for those who cannot afford delivery services and cannot "stock up" for space and budgetary reasons.

There is an opportunity here, if we can get past our sense of impending doom and scramble. The bells of the factory school are quiet, children will perforce learn or not, in times and places more of their choice than before. Parents, for better or worse, suddenly have much more control over their children's curriculum. Teachers are freed from many of the resource challenges of outdated texts, and multiple copies. I wonder how many will choose or create culturally relevant materials…and how many will be relying on colonial era worksheets.

The Western framework of music education, and society much more broadly imagined, often constrains students and teacher's self-expressions. As Cohen discovered when the "twinkle effect" stymied her attempt to collect repertoire from the diverse community for a concert, and as I saw in students who told me they couldn't expect others to like or study what they liked, the ideal of an assimilated success is pervasive throughout the schooling system. It is particularly pernicious in areas with high numbers of racialized and immigrant community members. In these schools, students are often compelled to speak like little English lords, to comply with dress and mannerisms more appropriate to the nineteenth century, and success is measured in diligence, worksheet and homework completion (or scales, technical exercises and repertoire lists), rather than innovation.

Covid-19 has put us all in the position of Said's (2002) exile, whose peculiar consolation is the contrapuntal perspective. Our experiences of the now are inflected with the perspective of how it was. While we are longing to hug our elders, or adult children, and chat with our baristas, and return to the schoolroom, we are also noting the small pleasures of nurturing yeast, gardens, bird song, the rhythm of knuckles on the counter as we knead bread. Our challenge will be to take these rediscovered rhythms and goods with us into the new world. Cosmopolitanisms offer the music teacher the possibility of escaping the universalist arguments of their own classical educations, the singular perspective, through entry to the multiple assessors of quality of Schippers' (2010) intracultural classroom. In Derrida, we find the moral imperative, the classroom as refuge which drives our work, in Rizvi' empirical cosmopolitanisms, the grounding of our enterprise in the banal encounters of the quotidian. For many of Goldentree's students, my exotic was their daily bread, and it was in that shared pleasure of the banal that we began to expand our conversations, to extend hospitality to each other in exchanging thoughts on *jollof* rice, naan, or their mother's best jerk chicken. Students were also generous in suggesting other music I might listen to and warning me away from music that wasn't school appropriate. We didn't always have time to extend or challenge our thinking, so Saturn's assertion that *"Spanish music always have sick beats and sh**tty lyrics*" went unchallenged but you have to start somewhere. What I found hopeful in talking to the students, particularly when I returned a year later to collect some demographic information, were the ways in which they were beginning to think about both the specificities and universal of music, and their comfort in claiming their music preferences to me, from Pushpa's "I'm a huge K-pop fan" to Elijah's "I'm thinking of starting a rap channel." They hadn't seen me in almost a year, but for many the ethos of curiosity

and pleasure in sharing the known and unfamiliar which we had co-created during the project, remained.

**Conclusion**

It was clear at the conclusion of the study that students who heard my invitation to what was designed as a sort of musical potluck, such as Catalina and Hala, were pleased by it. I was surprised by how specifically aligned to their own interests or culture students needed the invitation to be at the time. In designing a study around pop music, the fluidity of genre in contemporary music, and the steadfast perception of students that their music was rap, were a missed opportunity. While the principles of "appropriate" body and verbal language in school will likely continue to bar certain musicians from school, cosmopolitanisms offer teachers a way to engage in candid exploration of these genres via parody, in the medieval sense of variations or novel incorporations, innovation and discussion. As I found in my discussion with Elijah, even making space to acknowledge and talk about identity music can open the door to participation in the "school-appropriate" musics.

Interwoven throughout my teaching practice, in the title of this dissertation and in the design of this study was the precept of knowledge as food, in particular, of music as that which nourishes the mind and soul, as food nourishes the heart and body. I thought of the music teacher as the host of a glorious repast, and the invitation as being problematic in that it was aimed not within the unlimited hospitality of Derrida and Dufourmantelle (2000) to all students but rather to those who were able to conceive themselves within the Western framework of colonial music and schooling. These limitations reduced who was invited to nourishment and the ways in which they might be nourished; it negated Appiah's rooted cosmopolitans, where students' might find refreshment in both the artificial orange sherbet of my childhood and the miraculous zerbet, a

cooling drink of lemons, honey and apple, in favour of a confined list of what music was acceptable. Though schools and classrooms can operate as miniature cities of refuge, providing "living and durable networks" (Derrida, 2001, p. 9) careful attention to the limitations we place on our hospitality are necessary to ensure they do so. Hospitality, in the Derridean sense, as unlimited, is necessarily impossible. It would negate itself in that without limits, the refuge would fail to be a refuge. However, within the push-pull of offering without limits yet seeking safety for host as well as stranger, it pushes us to risk self, to defy hegemonic order that we might seek the human in the other. To create an established cosmopolitan ethos in a class where I was the stranger, over only 9 weeks, was impossible. Like the stranger in *Stone Soup* ("Stone Soup Story," 2016), I could only set out a feast that I hoped would tempt them to bring their own goodies to the table. I could only model through continuing invitations, and risking of my non-school self at school, that this classroom could be both a refuge from the Western framework and a learning thereof. The journey we took, at first together, but which continued after that last June day, looped back upon itself, generated new readings, and continues to do so even now. This looping experience is reminiscent of the ways in which Krasny and Slattery (in press) discuss the post-modern in curriculum.  Hospitality, as it was enacted in this study, allowed for the fluid, iterative emergence of identity, one of ten facets they identify as central to postmodernisms in curriculum. In blurring the definitions between "high and low art" (p. 6) and resisting the linear development of knowledge and self typical to what they term the Modern and I have called the Western framework, cosmopolitanisms and hospitality became motivators of a resistant, playful, postmodern curriculum which offered rather than demanded identification. In order to illustrate how these looping iterations and reverberations can enrich and not only confound the shared life of school, student, teacher and researcher, I would like to close with an anecdote from my final

visit to Goldentree; Keesha's story illumines the slipperiness of identity and the ways in which processes begun in one place may continue to work, out of site, until an invitation beckons them to bloom.

When I returned to my study site nearly a year later, intending to collect demographic data from their records, the principal had instead arranged for me to speak to students individually. Some students were clearly struggling to place me or remember who I was, some were enthusiastic to speak with me, perhaps also enjoying a reprieve from class time. Three students mentioned in passing that while they didn't feel the study had changed things for them at the end of the year, they now felt it had made it easier to talk to the teacher about music they enjoyed. My final interview was with Keesha. She came into the hall quietly, with a slight smile, and timid voice. She was happy to see me again, though she had previously told me she had not enjoyed the music in our global music unit. She noted that she likes listening to different kinds of music and rap. Her pre-survey list was drawn from north American artists such as Billie Eilish and Heavyweight, but her post-survey shifts to include music from the Caribbean such as Butter Pecan. I had been concerned about asking students about their race and heritage and yet, in this moment, Keesha's answer enriched both our lives; eyes shining and smilingly broadly, she told me her family came from "the most beautiful place there is on earth, the Caribbean." Keesha proceeded to tell me about the "five generation tree" under which her family rests after African dance lessons at her Granny's place in Grenada. She had come to sit down shy, and soft spoken, and left upright and humming. The pleasure and belonging evoked in her story, shared with me, and now radiating into her school self, is a powerful argument for the importance of risking the uncomfortable to invite students to truly belong, to take a seat at the feast of knowledge that could be school.

**References:**

A Tribe Called Red. (n.d.). *Press Kit*. http://atribecalledred.com/bio/

Abebe, T. (2009). Multiple methods, complex dilemmas: Negotiating socio-ethical spaces in participatory research with disadvantaged children. *Children's Geographies*, *7*(4), 451–465. https://doi.org/10.1080/14733280903234519

Abril, C. R. (2005). Multicultural Dimensions and Their Effect on Children's Responses to Pop Songs Performed in Various Languages. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, *165*, 37–51.

Abril, C. R. (2006a). Music That Represents Culture: Selecting Music with Integrity. *Music Educators Journal*, *93*(1), 38–45. https://doi.org/10.2307/3693429

Abril, C. R. (2006b). Learning outcomes of two approaches to multicultural music education. *International Journal of Music Education*, *24*(1), 30–42. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761406063103

Adderley, C. (2000). Preparation of Future K-4 Music Teachers Relative To The National Standards—Goals 2000. *Contributions to Music Education*, *27*(2), 59–70.

Allsup, R. E. (2011). Popular Music and Classical Musicians: Strategies and Perspectives. *Music Educators Journal*, *97*(3), 30–34. https://doi.org/10.1177/0027432110391810

Allsup, R. E. (2012). Music education and human flourishing: A meditation on democratic origins. *British Journal of Music Education*, *29*(02), 171–179. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0265051712000034

Allsup, Randall Everett. (2010). Choosing Music Literature. In H. F. Abeles & L. A. Custodero (Eds.), *Critical issues in music education: Contemporary theory and practice*. Oxford University Press.

Anderson, W. M. (1992). Rethinking Teacher Education: The Multicultural Imperative. *Music Educators Journal*, *78*(9), 52–55. https://doi.org/10.2307/3398431

Appadurai, A. (2008). How Histories Make Geographies: Circulation and Context in a Global Perspective. *The Journal of Transcultural Studies*. https://heiup.uni-heidelberg.de/journals/index.php/transcultural/article/view/6129/1760

Arendt, H. (2006). The Crisis in Education. In *Between past and future: Eight exercises in political thought* (pp. 173–195). Penguin Books.

Asher, N. (1999). Apache Indian's syncretic music and the re-presentation of South Asian identities: A case study of a minority artist. In *Collected Work: Sound identities: Popular music and the cultural politics of education. Series: Counterpoints: Studies in the postmodern theory of education, No. 96 Published by: New York, NY, USA: Peter Lang, 1999. ISSN: 1058-1634. Pages: 195-213. (AN: 1999-20085).* Peter Lang.

Basu, R. (2011). Multiculturalism Through Multilingualism in Schools: Emerging Places of "Integration" in Toronto. *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*, *101*(6), 1307–1330.

Bazzul, J. (2014). Critical Discourse Analysis and Science Education Texts: Employing Foucauldian Notions of Discourse and Subjectivity. *Review of Education, Pedagogy, and Cultural Studies*, *36*(5), 422–437. https://doi.org/10.1080/10714413.2014.958381

Belz, M. J. (2005). Inclusion of Native American Music in "Silver Burdett Making Music K-8." *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, *164*, 19–34.

Berglund, J. (2008). Teaching Islam with music. *Ethnography and Education*, *3*(2), 161–175. https://doi.org/10.1080/17457820802062409

Blacking, J. (1973). *How musical is man?* (6. printing). University of Washington Press.

Bliss, K. (2018, April 5). Jeremy Dutcher Aims to Disrupt "Anglo-Centric Music Narrative" With Wolastoq-Language Album. *Billboard*. https://www.billboard.com/articles/news/8290094/jeremy-dutcher-wolastoqiyuk-lintuwakonaw

*Boomwhackers*. (n.d.). Boomwhackers. https://boomwhackers.com/

Bradley, D. (2006). *Global song, global citizens? Multicultural choral music education and the community youth choir: Constituting the multicultural human subject* [Ph.D., University of Toronto (Canada)]. https://search.proquest.com/pqdtglobal/docview/304931126/abstract/ACE53EF325AC400EPQ/1

Bretthauer, B., Zimmerman, T. S., & Banning, J. H. (2007). A Feminist Analysis of Popular Music: Power Over, Objectification of, and Violence Against Women. *Journal of Feminist Family Therapy*, *18*(4), 29–51. https://doi.org/10.1300/J086v18n04_02

Bryant, S. (2014). *How Children Benefit from Music Education in Schools*. National Association of Music Merchants Foundation. https://www.nammfoundation.org/articles/2014-06-09/how-children-benefit-music-education-schOols

Burnard, P., Dillon, S., Rusinek, G., & Sæther, E. (2008). Inclusive pedagogies in music education: A comparative study of music teachers' perspectives from four countries. *International Journal of Music Education*, *26*(2), 109–126. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761407088489

Burns, J., Nolan, J., Weston, E. Jr., & Malcolm, A. (2016). Indigenous education, colonization, neoliberal schools, and narratives of survivance. *Journal of Critical Education Policy Studies*, *14*(2), 100–129.

Burton, S. L. (2011). Perspective Consciousness and Cultural Relevancy: Partnership Considerations for the Re-Conceptualization of Music Teacher Preparation. *Arts Education Policy Review*, *112*(3), 122–129. https://doi.org/10.1080/10632913.2011.566082

Campbell, P. S. (1992). Cultural Consciousness in Teaching General Music. *Music Educators Journal*, *78*(9), 30–36. https://doi.org/10.2307/3398427

Campbell, P. S. (2002). Music Education in a Time of Cultural Transformation. *Music Educators Journal*, *89*(1), 27–54. https://doi.org/10.2307/3399881

Carolin, M. (2006). An Instrumental Approach to Culture Study in General Music. *Music Educators Journal*, *92*(5), 38–41. https://doi.org/10.2307/3878500

Castagno, A. E. (2012). “They Prepared Me to Be a Teacher, But Not a Culturally Responsive Navajo Teacher for Navajo Kids”: A Tribal Critical Race Theory Analysis of an Indigenous Teacher Preparation Program. *Journal of American Indian Education*, *51*(1), 3–21.

Cavitt, M. E. (2013). COLLEGE OF FINE ARTS AND COMMUNICATIONS: Integrating Multicultural Education into an Instrumental Music Teacher Preparation Course. *Counterpoints*, *391*, 155–166.

Cohen, J. R. (Canadian ethnomusicologist). (1994). “Community concert”: A multicultural event in a Toronto elementary school. *Canadian Folk Music Journal / Revue De Musique Folklorique Canadienne*, *22*, 3–7.

Cohen, R. (n.d.). *The Virus Class dimensions of mobility and immobility*. www.academia.edu/42589852/The_Virus_Class_dimensions_of_mobility_and_immobility

Coulthard, G. S. (2014). *Red skin, white masks: Rejecting the colonial politics of recognition*. University of Minnesota Press.

David. G. Klocko. (1989). Multicultural Music in the College Curriculum. *Music Educators Journal*, *75*(5), 39–41. https://doi.org/10.2307/3398091

Derrida, J. (2001). *On cosmopolitanism and forgiveness*. Routledge.

Derrida, J. (2005). The Principle of Hospitality. *Parallax*, *11*(1), 6–9. https://doi.org/10.1080/1353464052000321056

Derrida, J., & Dufourmantelle, A. (2000). *Of hospitality*. Stanford University Press.

Diamond, B. (2001). Re-placing Performance: A case study of the Yukon music scene in the Canadian north. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, *22*(2), 211–224. https://doi.org/10.1080/07256860120069611

Dion, S., Johnston, K., & Rice, C. M. (2010). *Decolonizing our Schools: Aboriginal Education in the Toronto District School Board* (p. 114). York University.

http://www.tdsb.on.ca/Portals/0/Community/docs/Decolonizing%20Our%20Schools%203.pdf

Drummond, T. (2014). Singing over the Wall: Legal and Ethical Considerations for Sacred Music in the Public Schools. *Music Educators Journal*, *101*(2), 27–31. https://doi.org/10.1177/0027432114547083

Dunbar-Hall, P. (2005). Colliding Perspectives? Music Curriculum as Cultural Studies. *Music Educators Journal*, *91*(4), 33–37. https://doi.org/10.2307/3400156

Edwards, K. L. (1998). Multicultural Music Instruction in the Elementary School: What Can Be Achieved? *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, *138*, 62–82.

Emerson, R. M., Fretz, R. I., & Shaw, L. L. (2011). *Writing ethnographic fieldnotes* (2nd ed). The University of Chicago Press.

Fearing, A., Konkle, T. R., Laitsch, J., Pierce, H., Rater, C., Reece, K., Stoecker, R., & Varelis, T. (2018). Is Hip-Hop Violent? Analyzing the Relationship Between Live Music Performances and Violence. *Journal of Black Studies*, *49*(3), 235–255. https://doi.org/10.1177/0021934718754313

Feld, S. (2000). A Sweet Lullaby for World Music. *Public Culture*, *12*(1), 145–171.

Fine, R., & Cohen. (2002). Four cosmopolitan moments. In S. Vertovec & R. Cohen (Eds.), *Conceiving cosmopolitanism: Theory, context and practice*. Oxford University Press.

Gershwin, G. (1976). *Rhapsody in blue*. Warner Bros. Publications.

Ghosh, R. (2013). Education in Secular Democratic Societies: The Challenge of Religious Diversity. *India International Centre Quarterly*, *40*(3/4), 86–101.

Gilborn, D. (2005). Education policy as an act of white supremacy: Whiteness, critical race theory and education reform. *Journal of Education Policy*, *20*(4), 485–505.

Graeber, D. (2008). On Cosmopolitan and (Vernacular) Democratic Creativity, or: There Never Was a West. In *Anthropology and the new cosmopolitanism: Rooted, feminist and vernacular perspectives*. Bloomsbury.

Graham, R. (2009). The function of music education in the growth of cultural openness in the USA. *Music Education Research*, *11*(3), 283–302. https://doi.org/10.1080/14613800903144296

Grout, D. J., Grout, D. J., & Palisca, C. V. (2014). *A history of western music* (Ninth edition). W. W. Norton & Company.

Guhn, M., Emerson, S. D., & Gouzouasis, P. (2020). A population-level analysis of associations between school music participation and academic achievement. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, *112*(2), 308–328. https://doi.org/10.1037/edu0000376

Hancey, C. (2017, December 11). The International Myth of Canada As a Peacekeeping Nation. *The Walrus*. https://thewalrus.ca/the-international-myth-of-canada-as-a-peacekeeping-nation/

Hargreaves, D. J., & Marshall, N. A. (2003). Developing identities in music education. *Music Education Research*, *5*(3), 263–273. https://doi.org/10.1080/1461380032000126355

Heinemann, E.-G. (Ed.). (1983). *Notenbuechlein fuer Anna Magdalena Bach*. G. Henle Verlag.

Hennessy, S. (2005). 'Taiko SouthWest': Developing a 'new' musical tradition in English schools. *International Journal of Music Education*, *23*(3), 217–226. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761405060122

Hess, J. (2010). The Sankofa Drum and Dance Ensemble: Motivations for student participation in a school world music ensemble. *Research Studies in Music Education*, *32*(1), 23–42. https://doi.org/10.1177/1321103X10370093

Hess, J. (2013). Performing Tolerance and Curriculum: The Politics of Self-Congratulation, Identity Formation, and Pedagogy in World Music Education. *Philosophy of Music Education Review; Bloomington*, *21*(1), 66–91.

Hess, J. (2015). Decolonizing music education: Moving beyond tokenism. *International Journal of Music Education*, *33*(3), 336–347.

Hess, J. (2017a). Troubling Whiteness: Music education and the "messiness" of equity work. *International Journal of Music Education*, *36*(2), 128–144. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761417703781

Hess, J. (2017b). Equity and Music Education: Euphemisms, Terminal Naivety, and Whiteness. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education*, *16*(3), 15–47. https://doi.org/10.22176/act16.3.15

Ho, W.-C. (2007). Students' experience of music learning in Hong Kong's secondary schools. *International Journal of Music Education*, *25*(1), 31–47. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761407074890

Ho, W.-C. (2014). Music education curriculum and social change: A study of popular music in secondary schools in Beijing, China. *Music Education Research*, *16*(3), 267–289. https://doi.org/10.1080/14613808.2014.910182

Hoffman, A. R., & Carter, B. A. (2013). Representin' and disrespectin': African-American wind band students' meanings of a composition-based secondary music curriculum and classroom power structures. *Music Education Research*, *15*(2), 135–150. https://doi.org/10.1080/14613808.2012.685458

Jaschke, A. C., Honing, H., & Scherder, E. J. A. (2018). Longitudinal Analysis of Music Education on Executive Functions in Primary School Children. *Frontiers in Neuroscience*, *12*. https://doi.org/10.3389/fnins.2018.00103

Kahn, L. G., Lindstrom, L., & Murray, C. (2014). Factors Contributing to Preservice Teachers' Beliefs about Diversity. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, *41*(4), 53–70.

Kallio, A. A. (2015). Drawing a line in water: Constructing the school censorship frame in popular music education. *International Journal of Music Education*, *33*(2), 195–209.

Kantorski, V. J., & Stegman, S. F. (2006). A Content Analysis of Qualitative Research Dissertations in Music Education, 1998-2002. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, *168*, 63–73.

Karlsen, S. (2014). Exploring democracy: Nordic music teachers' approaches to the development of immigrant students' musical agency. *International Journal of Music Education*, *32*(4), 422–436. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761413515806

Kelly-McHale, J. (2013). The Influence of Music Teacher Beliefs and Practices on the Expression of Musical Identity in an Elementary General Music Classroom. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, *61*(2), 195–216.

Kennedy, A.-M., & Laczniak, G. R. (2014). Indigenous intellectual property rights: Ethical insights for marketers. *Australasian Marketing Journal (AMJ)*, *22*(4), 307–313. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ausmj.2014.09.004

Kovach, M. (2009). *Indigenous methodologies: Characteristics, conversations, and contexts*. University of Toronto Press.

Krasny, K., & Slattery, P. (In Press). Postmodern Curriculum. In Schubert, W. & He, M.F. (Eds.), *Oxford Encyclopedia of Curriculum Studies*.

Kymlicka, W. (1996). *Freedom and Culture*. Oxford University Press. https://www-oxfordscholarship-com.ezproxy.library.yorku.ca/view/10.1093/0198290918.001.0001/acprof-9780198290919-chapter-5

Laird, T. F. N. (2011). Measuring the Diversity Inclusivity of College Courses. *Research in Higher Education*, *52*(6), 572–588.

LaRue, C. S. (1995). *Handel and his singers: The creation of the Royal Academy operas, 1720-1728*. Clarendon Press ; Oxford University Press.

Lawton, R. (2019). The Efficacy of Cool: Using Popular Music as an Instructional Framework. *Orff Echo*, *51*(2), 28–34.

Lindgren, M., & Ericsson, C. (2010). The rock band context as discursive governance in music education in Swedish schools. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education*, *9*(3), 35–41.

Madrazo, L. (2017). Surveying Multicultural Courses in Canadian Music Teacher Education Programs: A Theme Calling for Future Variations. *The Canadian Music Educator; Edmonton*, *59*(1), 17–22.

Mark, M. L. (Ed.). (2013). *Music education: Source readings from ancient Greece to today* (Fourth edition). Routledge.

Marsh, K. (2012). "The beat will make you be courage": The role of a secondary school music program in supporting young refugees and newly arrived immigrants in Australia. *Research Studies in Music Education*, *34*(2), 93–111. https://doi.org/10.1177/1321103X12466138

Martin, J. (2005). *Miss Manners' guide to excruciatingly correct behavior* (Freshly updated). W.W. Norton & Co.

Mason, E. (2010). Multicultural Music Represented in Current Elementary Music Textbooks: A Comparative Study of Two Published Music Series. *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education*, *28*(2), 29–41. https://doi.org/10.1177/8755123310361767

*McDonald's: 60 years, billions served—Chicago Tribune*. (2015, April 15). https://www.chicagotribune.com/business/chi-mcdonalds-60-years-20150415-story.html

McGee, T. J. (1985). *Music of Canada*. W.W. Norton.

McKoy, C. L. (2017). On the 50th Anniversary of the Tanglewood Symposium. *Journal of Music Teacher Education*, *27*(1), 3–6. https://doi.org/10.1177/1057083717719073

Mendonca, M. (2010). Gamelan in Prisons in England and Scotland: Narratives of Transformation and the "Good Vibrations" of Educational Rhetoric. *Ethnomusicology*, *54*(3), 369–394.

Miles, J. (2019). Seeing and feeling difficult history: A case study of how Canadian students make sense of photographs of Indian Residential Schools. *Theory & Research in Social Education*, *47*(4), 472–496. https://doi.org/10.1080/00933104.2019.1626783

Mohanty, C. T. (2003). *Feminism without borders: Decolonizing theory, practicing solidarity*. Duke University Press.

Montgomery, A. P. (1991). Music in the elementary grades: A multicultural perspective. *Canadian Music Educator / Musicien Educateur Au Canada*, *32*(5), 11.

Moore, J. A. (1993). *An assessment of attitude and practice of General Music teachers regarding global awareness and the teaching of music from a multicultural perspective in American schools* [Ph.D., Kent State University]. https://search.proquest.com/docview/304067166/abstract/F751BF26B9DF4B21PQ/1

Moore, J. R. (2007). Popular music helps students focus on important social issues. *Middle School Journal*, *38*(4), 21–29.

Morrison, S. (2008). Music Makers: Popular Culture in Music Education - Can Pop Be Relevant? Using Popular Music to Address Issues of Racism. *Canadian Music Educator; Etobicoke, Ont.*, *49*(3), 52–54.

Morton, C. (1994). Feminist Theory and the Displaced Music Curriculum: Beyond the “Add and Stir” Projects. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, *2*(2), 106–121.

Morton, C. (2001). Boom Diddy Boom Boom: Critical Multiculturalism and Music Education. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, *9*(1), 32–41.

Norman, K. (1999). Music Faculty Perceptions of Multicultural Music Education. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, *139*, 37–49.

Norman Long. (2013). The Power of Music: Issues of Agency and Social Practice. *Social Analysis*, *57*(2), 21–40.

North, A. C., & Hargreaves, D. J. (1999). Music and adolescent identity. *Music Education Research*, *1*(1), 75–92.

*O Canada—As “Sung” By William Shatner*. (n.d.). Retrieved May 1, 2020, from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vKbqlyxQ-Y0

Olsen, D. A. (1995). Multicultural Music Education, Cultural Sensitivity, and the Ethnographie Truth: A Response to Cornelius. *College Music Symposium*, *35*, 33–34.

Human Rights Code, R.S.O. H. 19 (1990).

Ontario Ministry of Education. (2008). *Reach Every Student: Energizing Ontario Education*. Ministry of Education. http://www.edu.gov.on.ca/eng/document/energize/energize.pdf

Ontario Ministry of Education. (2009a). *Realizing the Promise of Diversity: Ontario's Equity and Inclusive Education Strategy*. Ontario Ministry of Education. http://www.edu.gov.on.ca/eng/policyfunding/equity.pdf

Ontario Ministry of Education. (2009b). *The Ontario curriculum, grades 1-8: The arts, 2009*. Ministry of Education.

Orford, E.-J. H. (2007). Principal Themes: CMEA Undergraduate Essay Winner - A Place for Music: The Importance of Music Education in the Public School System (Elementary Grades 1-6). *Canadian Music Educator; Etobicoke, Ont.*, *48*(4), 38–41.

Ortloff, J. D. H. (2013). Chapter seventeen: Citizenship, Diversity, and Education: What a Structural Analysis of Textbooks Can Tell Us About State Intentions. *Counterpoints*, *354*, 358–369.

Petschler, J. (2012). Priorities and flexibility, trust and transparency: Conducting educational research from inside the school. *Qualitative Research Journal*, *12*(2), 165–172.

Pinar, W. F., Reynolds, W. M., Slattery, P., & Taubman, P. M. (1995). Chapter 15: Understanding Curriculum: A Postscript for the Next Generation. *Counterpoints*, *17*, 847–868.

Piro, J. M., & Ortiz, C. (2009). The effect of piano lessons on the vocabulary and verbal sequencing skills of primary grade students. *Psychology of Music*, *37*(3), 325–347. https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735608097248

Porter, C. (2016, February 12). Midwife finds big need for services at GTA refugee hotel: Porter. *The Toronto Star*. https://www.thestar.com/news/insight/2016/02/12/midwife-finds-big-need-for-services-at-gta-refugee-hotel-porter.html

Quesada, M. A., & Volk, T. M. (1997). World Musics and Music Education: A Review of Research, 1973-1993. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, *131*, 44–66.

Renganathan, S. (2009). Exploring the Researcher-Participant Relationship in a Multiethnic, Multicultural and Multilingual Context Through Reflexivity. *Qualitative Research Journal*, *9*(2), 3–17.

Richards, Chris. (1999). *Live through this: Music, adolescence, and autobiography: EBSCOhost*. http://web.b.ebscohost.com.ezproxy.library.yorku.ca/ehost/detail/detail?vid=17&sid=fda3ca77-5c52-4c90-88ac-799a95a918ea%40sessionmgr104&bdata=JnNpdGU9ZWhvc3QtbGl2ZQ%3d%3d

Richardson, C. P. (2004). Multimusical Competency for Music Educators: Problems and Possibilities. *College Music Symposium*, *44*, 68–73.

Rizvi, F., & Beech, J. (2017). Global mobilities and the possibilities of a cosmopolitan curriculum. *Curriculum Inquiry*, *47*(1), 125–134. https://doi.org/10.1080/03626784.2016.1254500

Robinson, D. (2012). Intercultural Art Music and the Sensory Veracity of Reconciliation: Brent Michael Davids' Powwow Symphony on the Dakota Music Tour. *MUSICultures; Calgary*, *39*(1), 111–IX.

*Routledge & CRC Press Series: Routledge Global Popular Music Series*. (n.d.). Retrieved April 27, 2020, from https://www.routledge.com/Routledge-Global-Popular-Music-Series/book-series/RGPMS

Rowland Woody, L. R. (1999). *Resources for the practice of Native American songs and dances in the elementary classroom* [Ph.D., The University of Oklahoma]. https://search.proquest.com/pqdtglobal/docview/304517049/abstract/9B78585B53A24F6EPQ/4

Russell, J. (2006). Inuit student teachers' agency, positioning and symbolic action: Reflections from a *qallunaat* on music teaching in the Canadian Arctic. *International Journal of Music Education*, *24*(3), 231–242. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761406069659

Said, E. W. (1979). *Orientalism* (1st Vintage Books ed). Vintage Books.

Said, E. W. (2002). *Reflections on exile and other essays* (3. print). Harvard Univ. Press.

Sands, P. (1991). An analysis of attitudes and behaviors of metropolitan Kansas City elementary music educators regarding multicultural music education. *Missouri Journal of Research in Music Education*, *28*, 82–83.

Sands, R. M. (1996). What Prospective Music Teachers Need to Know about Black Music. *Black Music Research Journal*, *16*(2), 225–238. https://doi.org/10.2307/779329

Sarrazin, N. R. (2009). *Indian music in the classroom*. Rowman & Littlefield Education.

Sawa, G. (1989). *Music performance practice in the early ʻAbbāsid era, 132-320 AH/750-932 AD*. Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies.

Schippers, H. (2010). *Facing the music: Shaping music education from a global perspective*. Oxford University Press.

Smith, L. T. (2012). *Decolonizing methodologies: Research and indigenous peoples* (Second edition). Zed Books.

Stone Soup Story. (2016, November 15). *Bedtimeshortstories*. https://www.bedtimeshortstories.com/stone-soup-story

*Street View Treks: Petra*. (n.d.). Google Maps: Petra Street View. Retrieved May 27, 2020, from http://www.google.com/maps/about/behind-the-scenes/streetview/treks/petra

*Tanya Tagaq—Online home of celebrated Canadian (Inuk) throat singer, composer, visual artist, advocate, writer and public speaker.* (n.d.). Retrieved June 18, 2018, from http://tanyatagaq.com/

Taylor, C. (1994). The Politics of Recognition. In A. Guttmann (Ed.), *Multiculturalism: Examining the Politics of Recognition* (2nd ed., pp. 25–75). Princeton University Press. http://web.a.ebscohost.com/ehost/ebookviewer/ebook?sid=29650348-7361-49f8-b501-8188700fcb7e%40sdc-v-sessmgr02&vid=0&format=EB

Teddlie, C., & Tashakkori, A. (2009). *Foundations of mixed methods research: Integrating quantitative and qualitative approaches in the social and behavioral sciences*. SAGE.

Teicher, J. M. (1997). Effect of Multicultural Music Experience on Preservice Elementary Teachers' Attitudes. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, *45*(3), 415–427. https://doi.org/10.2307/3345536

Thomson, P. (Ed.). (2008). *Doing visual research with children and young people*. Routledge.

Tickle, S. (2017). Ethnographic research with young people: Methods and rapport. *Qualitative Research Journal*, *17*(2), 66–76.

Tobias, E. S. (2013). Composing, songwriting, and producing: Informing popular music pedagogy. *Research Studies in Music Education*, *35*(2), 213–237.

Tobias, E. S. (2015). Crossfading music education: Connections between secondary students' in- and out-of-school music experience. *International Journal of Music Education*, *33*(1), 18–35.

*Topics Arts education | People for Education*. (n.d.). Retrieved March 23, 2018, from https://peopleforeducation.ca/topics/the-arts/

*Toronto District School Board > High School > Graduation Rate*. (n.d.). Retrieved July 28, 2020, from https://www.tdsb.on.ca/High-School/Graduation-Rate

*Toronto music teacher sues principal, VP who criticized use of 'racist' Land of the Silver Birch in play | National Post*. (n.d.). Retrieved December 14, 2018, from https://nationalpost.com/news/toronto/toronto-music-teacher-sues-principal-vp-for-calling-song-in-school-play-racist

Trans-Adam, Matthew. (2001). Anti-racism: Challenging oppression in the music curriculum. *Canadian Music Educator / Musicien Educateur Au Canada*, *43*, 24–27.

Trimble, M., & Hesdorffer, D. (2017). Music and the brain: The neuroscience of music and musical appreciation. *BJPsych International*, *14*(2), 28–31. https://doi.org/10.1192/s2056474000001720

Tuley, R. J. (1980). Review of Multicultural Music Education: An Analysis of Afro-American and Native American Folk Songs in Selected Elementary Music Textbooks of the Periods 1928-1955 and 1965-1975 [Review of *Review of Multicultural Music Education: An*

*Analysis of Afro-American and Native American Folk Songs in Selected Elementary Music Textbooks of the Periods 1928-1955 and 1965-1975*, by M. C. Moore]. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, *62*, 59–61.

United Nations. (2020). *Policy_brief_on_covid_impact_on_children_16_april_2020.pdf*. https://www.un.org/sites/un2.un.org/files/policy_brief_on_covid_impact_on_children_16_april_2020.pdf

*Upcoming Courses for Teachers*. (n.d.). Smithsonian Folkways Recordings. Retrieved March 13, 2018, from https://folkways.si.edu/folkways-courses-university-washington-2018

Vaccai, N., & Paton, J. G. (2013). *Practical method of Italian singing: For high soprano*. G. Schirmer, Inc.

Vogan, N. F., & Green, J. P. (1991). *Music education in Canada: A historical account*. University of Toronto Press.

Volk, T. M. (1993). The History and Development of Multicultural Music Education as Evidenced in the "Music Educators Journal," 1967-1992. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, *41*(2), 137–155. https://doi.org/10.2307/3345404

Volk, T. M. (1997). "Music Speaks to the Hearts of All Men:" The International Movement in American Music Education: 1930-1954. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, *133*, 143–152.

Walden, J. (2014). What we Have Works ... or Does It? Cultural Diversity in Canadian Music Curricula and Resistance to Change. *Canadian Music Educator; Etobicoke, Ont.*, *56*(2), 9–12.

Wang, J.-C., & Humphreys, J. T. (2009). Multicultural and popular music content in an American music teacher education program. *International Journal of Music Education*, *27*(1), 19–36.

Wasiak, E. B. (2005). Iitaohkanao'pi - The Meeting Place Project: An alternative approach to young people's concerts. *International Journal of Music Education*, *23*(1), 73–88. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761405050932

Werbner, P. (Ed.). (2008). *Anthropology and the new cosmopolitanism: Rooted, feminist and vernacular perspectives*. Berg.

Wesley D. Brewer. (2010). inside/outside: School music on the line. In L. K. Thompson & M. R. Campbell (Eds.), *Issues of identity in music education: Narratives and practices*. Information Age Pub.

Whitburn, R., & Yemoh, S. (2012). ′My people struggled too′: Hidden histories and heroism - a school-designed, post-14 course on multi-cultural Britain since 1945. *Teaching History*, *147*, 16–25.

Wicks, S. A. (1998). America's popular music traditions as "Canon-Fodder." *Popular Music & Society*, *22*(1), 55–89.

Wilkinson, C. (1996). Deforming/Reforming the Canon: Challenges of a Multicultural Music History Course. *Black Music Research Journal*, *16*(2), 259–277. https://doi.org/10.2307/779331

Willinsky, J. (1998a). *Learning to divide the world: Education at empire's end*. University of Minnesota Press.

Willinsky, J. (1998b). *Learning to divide the world: Education at empire's end*. University of Minnesota Press.

Woloshyn, A. (2017). "Welcome to the Tundra": Tanya Tagaq's creative and communicative agency as political strategy. *Journal of Popular Music Studies*, *29*(4), e12254. https://doi.org/10.1111/jpms.12254

Yeats, William Butler. (1892). The Lake Isle of Innisfree. In *The Countess Kathleen and Various Legends and Lyrics*. T. Fisher Unwin.

Yerichuk, D. (2016). The Construction of Citizenship Through Musical Performance in Toronto's Settlement Houses, 1930-1939. *MUSICultures; Athabasca, Alta*, *43*(1), 41–XIV.

Yon, D. A. (2000). Urban portraits of identity: On the problem of knowing culture and identity in intercultural studies. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, *21*(2), 143–157.

**Appendix A: Demographic Chart of Participants**

| Name | Grade | Heritage | Race | Religion | Languages |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Saturn | 5 | Barbados | Black | Christian | English |
| Hannah | 5 | Argentina | White | ? | Spanish/Portuguese |
| William | 5 | Vietnam | Asian | ? | English |
| Kai | 4 | Brazil | White | ? | Portuguese (ELL) |
| Tipper | 5 | St. Lucia/Jamaica | Black | Christian | French/Creole (mom) |
| Anne | 4 | Hungary/Quebec | White | Christian | Spanish/Albanian spoken by step parents |
| Elijah | 4 | Nigeria/ Toronto | Black | Christian | Dad speaks Nigerian |
| Harnish | 5 | Somalia | Black | Muslim | Somali and English |
| Pushpa | 5 | Sri Lanka/India | South Asian | Hindu | Tamil (previously designated ELL) |
| Muhammed | 5 | South Africa | Black | Muslim | Afrikaans |
| Adiv | 5 | Sri Lanka | South Asian | Hindu | Some Tamil |
| Jordan | 5 | Jamaica/Canada | Black (mixed) | Baptist? Christian | English |
| Sienna | 5 | Jamaica | Black | Christian | English |
| Ivy | 5 | Jamaica | Black | Christian | English |
| Vyan | 5 | Sri Lanka | South Asian | Hindu | Tamil |
| K'deejah | 5 | Jamaica | Black | Christian | English |
| Sadit | 5 | Bangladesh/Pakistan | South Asian | Muslim | Urdu? |
| Nartan | 5 | Sri Lanka | South Asian | Hindu | Tamil (some) |
| Abisha | 5 | India | South Asian | Muslim | Gujurati |
| Keesha | 4 | Grenada/Jamaica | Black | Christian | Patois |
| Hala | 5 | India | South Asia | Muslim | Gujurati (previously ELL) |
| Ranya | 4 | Jamaica/Sri Lanka/ India | South Asian | Muslim plus Christmas | Hindi |
| Aisha | 4 | Jamaica | Black | Christian | English |
| Samar | 4 | Sri Lanka | South Asian | ? | Tamil (some) |
| Ramona | 4 | Canada (Irish settlers) | White | Christian | French but not at home |
| Brighton | 4 | Korea, Bangladesh | South/ Asian | Muslim | English |
| Iago | 5 | Portugal | White | Catholic | Portuguese (some) |
| Catalina | 5 | Portugal | White | ? | Portuguese (some) |

**Appendix B: Global Pop Songs compiled for the study**

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=JLQ4by3lUJo&list=PLCIt5E3QzkSuVlGhGeMu_aGx79Gv7ZEKP

Mojo Juju "Native Tongue"

Aleyna Tilki "Sen Olsan Bari"

Armenchik "Eghek Bari"

Armenchik "Hayastan Jan"

Mona Haydar "Hijabi (wrap my hijab)"

Raja Kumari "Believe in You"

Stromae "Papoutai"

The Jerry Cans "Ukiuq"

Luis Fonsi "Sola" English and Spanish versions

A Tribe Called Red "Stadium Pow Wow"

GOT7 "Lullaby"

GOT7 "Just Right"

Sabastian Magacha "mweya mutsevene"

Nsoki "African Sunrise"

Nsoki "Africa Unite"