# “WI HAB CUM AH LANG WAY, AN WI STILL HAB FUR FI GUH”: THE EXPERIENCES OF BLACK JAMAICAN WOMEN WITH PRE- AND POST-MIGRATION POST-SECONDARY EDUCATION IN THE ACADEMY

SHELLEANNE MARY-KAYE HARDIAL

A DISSERTATION SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

GRADUATE PROGRAM IN Education: Language, Culture and Teaching

Faculty of Education

York University

Toronto, Ontario

August 2020

## Abstract

Many Black female immigrants with pre- and post-migration post-secondary education arrive in Canada with the desire to pursue faculty teaching jobs. However, despite great gains by feminist movements in the 1960s and 80s discrimination against Black women in the academy persists. With the theoretical framework of Critical Race Theory, Critical Race Feminism, and Post-colonial Theory, this dissertation draws attention to the lived realities of Black female academics, specifically Black Jamaican women, with pre- and post-migration education who hope to access the professoriate in Ontario, and have faced obstacles in post-migration higher education. In order to understand the barriers that Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration post-secondary education navigate in Ontario post-secondary institutions, it is imperative to examine: What are the lived experiences of Black Jamaican women with pre-migration post-secondary education as they enter into post-migration forums of higher education? What are the complexities of Black Jamaican women experiences in Ontario who desired to teach in Canadian post-secondary institutions during, and after obtaining Canadian higher education credential? How are challenges faced by Black women who take post-migration education (in addition to their pre-migration graduate/post-graduate education) in order to gain Canadian credentials to work in their field of study?

This study is a qualitative research that employs a phenomenological methodology. The data reveals that Black Jamaican women experienced racism when they arrived in Canada. Significantly, racism manifested in the discounting of their pre-migration post-secondary education, denied access to graduate programs and teaching jobs at post-secondary institutions which influenced the occupational routes and academic decisions of Black Jamaican women. Despite the barriers that many Black Jamaican women face in academia, my findings show that

they are resilient, and employ agency and strategies in their resistance to racism in the academy. As such, they remain hopeful as they continue to knock at the closed doors of faculty teaching jobs. It is my hope that this dissertation will contribute to a deeper understanding of Black Jamaican women's experiences in academia; expose the facade of equitable post-secondary institutions in Ontario (that continues in the twenty-first century), and enhance post-secondary institutions' policy changes to achieve real inclusiveness.

## Dedication

To my children – Malachi, Abigail and Sarah Hardial.

"[You] can do all things through Christ which strengthen[s] [you]". (Philippians 4:13, King James Version)

And to my beloved grandmother – Mary Latham (Meam), in loving memory.

**Acknowledgements**

I give thanks to Jehovah Elohim for seeing me through the completion of this dissertation. Dr. Aparna Mishra Tarc, your unwavering support, words of encouragement, and critical advice have helped me to grow into the scholar I am today. Thank you for your mentorship throughout my academic journey.

I would like to thank Dr. Carl James and Dr. Roopa Desai Trilokekar – my committee members, for their guidance and scholarly insight during the process of my dissertation. To Dr. Andrew Allen (my external examiner) and Dr. Shamette Hepburn (my internal examiner), thank you for your invaluable contribution that aided the completion of my dissertation.

To all the participants that made this dissertation a reality, I am indebted to you. Thank you for letting me into your lives, and for sharing your stories with me. Your courage is a strong reminder that as Black Jamaican women we cannot give up, especially for the sake of our Black children.

Thank you to three special women, Derma Nugent (mother), Rosetta Mcmorris (spiritual mother), and Gloria Hardial (mother-in-law). Thank you mommy for your countless sacrifices for my family and I during my studies. Rosetta and Gloria, thank you for your continued support. I would like to thank my children – Malachi, Abigail, and Sarah Hardial for being patient with me. Dwayne Hardial, my love, thank you for always understanding. I am forever grateful for the words of encouragement, and ceaseless prayers from my extended family, and dear friends.

Finally, I would like to thank my church family - Covenant of Promise Ministries Inc., for their prayers, words of wisdom, and for their confidence in me to complete this milestone. Your love, warmth and support motivated me to endure to the end.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

## List of Tables

## Chapter One: Introduction

Leaving the shores of Jamaica in 2006 as a trained and experienced primary school teacher, I had high hopes of continuing my pre-migration profession in Ontario, Canada. I was always given the impression in Jamaica by immigration agencies and people who visited Canada, that Canada was family oriented, accepting of Jamaican teachers, and friendlier than the United States of America (USA) in its promotion of racial and cultural diversity and a just society. Upon my arrival, to my dismay, I was advised by the Ontario College of Teachers (OCT) that I had to obtain a four-year undergraduate degree from a Canadian university in order to receive my teaching license despite my pre-migration post-secondary (PS) qualification in elementary education – a barrier that many Black immigrants experience in Canada. Hence my dissertation title "Wi Hab Cum Ah Lang Way, An Wi Still Hab Fur Fi Guh[1]: The Experiences of Black Jamaican Women with Pre- and Post-migration Post-secondary Education in the Academy".

Although I was distraught in finding that my certification and experience were not sufficient to teach in Canadian elementary schools, I remained positive about my passion for teaching. Still, my first years in Canada found me working in jobs unrelated to my pre-migration profession. To provide for my family and secure partial finances for my studies I took these jobs. Surprisingly, when I applied for the undergraduate degree and provided all my pre-migration transcripts, I did not receive any credit or exemption from courses already completed. It was during my undergraduate years in Canada that I realized that academia is a problematic space for Black female professors and students. This realization informed my decision to pursue a teaching job at the post-secondary level rather than the elementary level as a form of resistance to disrupt the sea of Whiteness (Ahmed, 2007; Arday, 2018) in academia with my physical and

[1] The Jamaican patois in the dissertation title captures the general sentiment of the participants in their (creole) language and comes from the Jamaican diaspora community.

intellectual Black presence (Daniel, 2019). With the desire for true inclusiveness in the academy, and staying true to my passion for teaching, my continued pursuit of higher education and faculty teaching job are oriented to contributing valuable knowledge and practices that can assist with shaping an equitable university that values the pre-migration credentials of women like me. Despite the struggles, I am glad I stayed within post-secondary education (PSE). Being a post-graduate student has afforded me the opportunity, skills, and resources for this study to interact with other Black female academics. It is with this history in mind that I bring to the forefront Black women's experiences in the academy in the twenty-first century.

My aim for this study is to make examinable the narrative journey of Black women with pre-migration PSE in academia. Engaging their migration stories is critical to showing how universities continue to bar Black immigrant female students from gaining access to higher education and opportunity in Canadian universities. Most importantly, the experiences of the Black Jamaican women in this study will contribute new stories of the lived realities of Black female academics as they navigate challenges they encounter in Ontario universities. These stories, I find, should be considered by university stakeholders, particularly university policy makers, in their continued work to materialize equitable academic institutions. Moreover, policy makers are the enforcers with authority to ensure PS institutions work towards being authentic inclusive spaces (Arday, 2017, 2018; Hiraldo, 2010; Tamtik & Guenter, 2019).

Despite great gains by feminist movements in the 1960s and 80s discrimination against Black women in the academy persists. Various studies show that racism is prevalent in many North American Universities (Abawi, 2018; Bannerji, 2000; Chawla, 2000; Collins, 1998/2000; Daniel, 2018, 2019; Davis, 2018; Guinier, 1997/2000; Henry, 2015, 2018; Henry et al., 2017a, 2017b; Henry & Kobayashi, 2017; Henry & Tator, 2007, 2009a, 2009b, 2012; Hirshfield &

Joseph, 2012; Hooks, 1989/2000; James, 2009b, 2011, 2012, 2017; James & Chapman-Nyaho, 2017; Mills, 2008; Nicol, 2000; Rich, 1979/2000; Smith, 1998/2000; Waterfield et al., 2019). The prevalence of discrimination against Black women in higher education highlights the ongoing struggle against racism in the Canadian society – a country riddled with white settler colonial history (Gibbs, 1997; Razack et al., 2010; Smith, 2017). Although there is increased representation of women in Canadian Universities in tenure and contract professorial positions (Academic Women's Association [AWA], 2016; Acker & Armenti, 2004; Boxer, 1998/2000; Hirshfield & Joseph, 2012; Katchanovski et al., 2015; Rich, 1977, 1979/2000; Skelton, 2005), these statistics never include the ethnicities of the women which is problematic because it masks the underrepresentation of Black women in the collegiate (Dua & Bhanji, 2012; Henry et al., 2017a, 2017b; Henry & Kobayashi, 2017; Henry et al., 2012, 2017; Henry & Tator, 2012; Katchanovski et al., 2015; Perry, 2012; Smith, 2010, 2017; Spafford et al., 2006). According to Dua and Bhanji's (2012) study, "[they] did not find a University that disaggregated the data on women by race, disability, gender and sexual orientation [in Canada]" (p. 68). Similarly, Smith (2017) pinpoints that there is a challenge in answering questions related to diversity, representation, power, social inclusion – to name a few, due to scarcity of reliable data in Canada.

Winkle-Wagner (2015) highlights that "people of colour, and specifically women of colour, are members of two groups that have been historically marginalized in the larger society and in higher education" (p. 171). In addition, Henry and Tator (2009a) state that " . . . access and equity are often denied to both racialized faculty and students through everyday values and norms, discourses, and practices within a dominant White Anglocentric, Eurocentric, and racialized culture" (p. 3). Hence it is important to understand the history of Canadian

universities in order to recognize the camouflage of racism in many university structures, and policies.

Black women are notablely unseen in Canadian academia (Henry, 2015; Henry & Tator, 2012; Kobayashi, 2009) and perceived as second class citizens in Canadian universities (Armenti, 2004). In fact, the lived experiences of many Black women who encounter racialization and discrimination as they try to access academic faculty jobs are taken for granted in Canada's race relations offices, diversity initiatives, and discourses of equity in terms of the limited or no data on the racial diversity of post-secondary institutions (Henry, 2015; James, 2012; Universities Canada, 2019) as well as "hav[ing] virtually no authority to decide on penalties" (Henry & Tator, 2009a, p. 15); thus, "at times rendering their objectivity questionable" (Daniel, 2019, p. 31). In addition, the perception that equity offices are the sole spaces responsible for garnering an inclusive campus is problematic in that "other academic and administrative departments might deflect addressing issues of diversity" (McGrath, 2010, p. 163). Even in the twenty-first century, the discourse of denial of racism in Canadian universities is still largely evident (Daniel, 2018, 2019; Henry et al., 2017a, 2017b; Henry & Tator, 2009a; James, 2012, 2017; James & Chapman-Nyaho, 2017).

This research emerges out of my interest in understanding how and why migrant's pre-educational experience and credentials are not valued in many Canadian professions and job sectors. Engaging the educational experiences of Black Jamaican women, I examine how women negotiate this inequity when pursing post-migration experiences in institutes of higher education in Canada.

**Research Problem**

According to Augustine (2015a), "based on [the] 2011 NHS (National Household

Survey) data, internationally educated immigrant teachers tend to have higher levels of education, with 34 percent holding a master's degree" (p. 39). Augustine (2015a) purports that "while some immigrant teachers also hold these roles [- principal or post-secondary instructor], additional support is needed to improve representation in the higher echelons of the educational system" such as the professoriate (p. 40). Moreover, "immigrants who received their professional education abroad were considerably less likely to work in their field than their Canadian-born and –educated counterparts" (Augustine, 2015a, p. 29). As such, it is crucial for one to explore and understand the social qualities of systemic barriers that impede and obstruct many Black immigrants from working in their field of study in the twenty-first century. In addition, "post-secondary institutions [. . .] have critical roles to play in advancing the fair access agenda", and my research assists with shedding light on the complexities and narratives of Black Jamaican women who labour towards the hope of working in their desired field of study (Augustine, 2015a, p. 43).

Hernandez-Ramdwar (2009) highlights that "the university experience has proven to be less than pleasant" for many Caribbean students in Canada (p. 109). As an internationally trained Black Jamaican female teacher, one of my main goals in academia is to unearth the nuances surrounding 'blackness' and representation in spaces of authorities, and contribute to changes that prevent internationally trained professionals from being ostracized from working in their desired field of study. Although "barriers to licensing and employment in the regulated professions have received particular attention" (Augustine, 2015a, p. 28), "there is, in fact, a void in the literature containing the stories of immigrant teachers in Canada" (Janusch, 2015, p. 302).

To address the dearth of scholarship on Black Caribbean immigrant's post-migration education, my research explores the role and influences of post-migration education in the lives

of Black Jamaican women in Canada. Furthermore, "the difficulty in having their foreign credentials recognized by regulatory bodies probably prompts many immigrants of colour to further their education once in Canada" (Girard, 2010, p. 89) despite the fact that they are already highly educated and experienced international professionals (Augustine, 2015b; Lum et al., 2011; Wayne, 2009). Importantly, "internationally educated immigrants experience less disadvantage when seeking to practise their profession in Ontario than they do in the ROC (rest of Canada)" (Augustine, 2015a, p. 31). Nonetheless, Dua and Bhanji (2012) conclude that "there is a pressing need to gather and assess data on the status of equity-seeking groups in Canadian universities" (p. 49). As such, I argue that to understand the experiences of Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration graduate/post-graduate education who desired to work in the Canadian professoriate, is to critically examine how barriers are experienced in the Canadian society, particularly in the academy; how they navigate these barriers; and how these barriers impact their decision to work in the academy.

**Research Questions**

My research questions are as follows:

1. What are the lived experiences of Black Jamaican women with pre-migration post-secondary education as they enter into post-migration forums of higher education?
2. What are the complexities of Black Jamaican women experiences in Ontario who desired to teach in Canadian post-secondary institutions during, and after obtaining Canadian higher education credential?
3. How are challenges faced by Black women who take post-migration education (in addition to their pre-migration graduate/post-graduate education) in order to gain

Canadian credentials to work in their field of study?

**Purpose of the Study**

The purpose of my research is to draw attention to the stories of Black Jamaican women who desired to teach in Canadian PS institutions, and the complexities surrounding the employment and representation of Black female immigrants in academia. In so doing, my research serves as a tool of change in policies representing how Black Jamaican women are (to a lesser extent) not considered employable in Canadian higher education institutions. As a narrative and thematic study, my research not only represents the voices of Black Jamaican women but also empowers them through their critical participation (James, 2009a, 2012); it adds to our understanding of context for equity-seeking groups. This is done with the guided framework of Critical Race Theory (CRT), Critical Race Feminism (CRF), and Post-colonial Theory (PCT) to tease out the intersections from which Black Jamaican women experience racism in Canadian PS institutions. In fact, racism does not operate in isolation but is interlocked with other forms of oppression (Henry, 2015; Henry & Tator, 2009b; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019; James et al., 2010). The study also contributes new knowledge with which post-secondary institutions' administration can consider and reform existing policies that have detrimental impact on the livelihood and employment of Black Caribbean female immigrants. Karaian and Mitchell (2010) argue that "no one can deny that the law is an important tool for change" (p. 67). That is, policies do contribute to the making of law over a period of time that results in changes to the society (Barnes & Virgint, 2019).

**Overview of the Research**

I briefly shared my Jamaican Canadian experience that has shaped my lens to pursue this research with Black Jamaican women who obtained post migration education with the desire to

teach at Canadian PS institutions. A succinct discussion on feminist movements in relation to employment of Black women in Canadian PS institutions in the twenty-first century was emphasized. A list of my research questions, and the importance for my study were also stated. The research problem regarding the prevalence of racism in many North American universities was established.

In chapter two, literature on racism in North America's higher education is reviewed in detail. Importantly, attention is drawn to the role of the Canadian points system, and the devaluation of foreign credentials to reveal their impact on the lives of Black immigrants, and their influence on how many Black Caribbean immigrants with pre-migration graduate/post-graduate education pursue post-migration education in Canada. Subtopics such as: deconstruction of immigration policy in relation to Black women; multiculturalism on trial; who are allowed access in Canadian academia; Black students in Canadian PSE; and post-slavery impact on Jamaica's education and society are discussed in detail to exemplify the significance for my study in the fields of education and immigration.

The history and importance of Critical Race Theory (CRT), Critical Race Feminism (CRF), and Post-colonial Theory (PCT) in education are discussed in chapter three. The relevance of CRT, CRF, and PCT for my research is highlighted to show the suitability of these frameworks for my qualitative study. In that, the experiences of the participants shed light on the importance of counter-stories which are core to these theoretical frameworks and well needed in the education field.

In chapter four, the methodology employed for my research is discussed in details. I emphasize the significance and suitability of using a phenomenological approach. Additionally, the data collection and analysis are explained to show the steps that were taken to interpret the

data. The limitations of the study are also mentioned in this chapter.

Chapter five focuses on the narratives of the participants. The voices of the participants are situated and discussed in relation to the main themes such as: Who are we; Departure from Jamaica with PSE fundamentals, to Canada – a land of promise; Navigating turbulent terrains in Canadian PS institutions; and (Re)Completed PSE, and its impact.

Chapter six provides an analysis on the participants' experiences in relation to the theoretical frameworks guiding the research. Recommendations are suggested in light of this analysis.

Throughout chapter seven, a summary of the dissertation and findings are provided to highlight what new knowledge my research has contributed to the areas of higher education, race, diversity, Black studies, Caribbean Studies, Black graduate/post-graduate student experiences, women's studies, and immigration.

**Significance of the Study**

Many Black graduate/post-graduate students yearn for more scholarship and courses on 'blackness' and lived experiences of Black people in education (Davis, 2018; Henry & Kobayashi, 2017; Henry & Tator, 2009b; Smith et al., 2017). According to Sleeter (2016), "It is very difficult to shift the center of gravity of a program in which the center is defined by White interests, and any proposed change must align with White interests to gain support" (p. 4). With particular focus on immigrant lives pertaining to academia, my research not only sheds light on the experiences of Black Jamaican women with post migration education in Canada but also provides substantial and current qualitative data on Black Caribbean women that is limited in Canadian university programs. My study also aims to influence immigration and academic policy changes by demonstrating the importance of considering Black Jamaica women narratives

in relation to their upward mobility in Canada.

## Chapter Two: Literature Review

### Introduction

As the diversity of the Canadian labour market population continues to increase, "the question remains as to whether [immigrants] would enjoy the same opportunities as other Canadians" (Li, 2012, p. 40). As such, this chapter is divided into three sections: post-slavery impact on Jamaica's education and society; experience within immigration and employment in the Canadian society with subheadings – multiculturalism on trial, immigration policy in relation to Black women, and employment in Canadian academia; and, experience as students and academics within Canadian higher education with subheadings – globalization and Canadian higher education, Black students in Canadian PSE, who are allowed access in Canadian academia, and the impact of gender, race and class as barriers for Black female academics.

This literature review draws attention to the educational and occupational experiences of Black immigrants with PSE as well as draw attention to the significance for my research (that adds to the sparse literature) that examined the lived experiences of Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration education in Canada. In addition, the literature review supports the theoretical framework that frames this paper by illustrating their importance in shaping my analysis of Black female immigrant voices. Henry and Tator (2009a) reveal that "there are significant problems in society that remain unresearched or under-explored because of the lack of recognition and funding" (p. 7). They further find that racialized scholars have "historically found and currently find little support for research that focuses on . . . racism in systems of cultural production . . . and employment systems" (Henry & Tator, 2009a, p. 7). Therefore, there is a need for research such as this study that specifically contributes data on Black Jamaican women's experiences in the Canadian academy to topple systems of cultural production.

Many Canadian universities are increasingly depending on private funding for research which strongly influences what gets studied (Henry et al., 2017a; Henry & Tator, 2009a). With a growing dependence on private funding, attention is somewhat limited to shedding light on how racism operates in subtle ways such as systemic structures that seem to inadvertently discriminate against Black women. This lack of attention on the demographic makeup of the professoriate creates another extension of power. Thus, creating another extension of power imbalance in academia that maintains institutional powers that oppress or limit funding for research that seeks to unpack challenges surrounding Black women's access to academic faculty jobs. Scholars such as Davis (2018), Dua and Bhanji (2012), Henry (2015), Henry et al. (2017a), Henry et al. (2012, 2017), James (2009b, 2011), Ornstein et al. (2007), Ryan et al. (2009), and Smith (2017) emphasize the absence or limited scholarship/data regarding the racial breakdown of faculty workforce in Canada which reinforces the fact that "the case for equitable racial representation in education is not new" (Ryan et al., 2009, p. 593).

Weiner (2008) states that "successful integration [of excluded populations] includes the ability to find work that uses one's education, training and experience and provides compensation commensurate with one's human capital" (p. 3). Notably, there is a gap between the state's discourse of promoting an inclusive society for the integration of racialized immigrants in the labour market and the realities of many Black people who experience systemic barriers in the Canadian society that impedes their integration in the labour market. In fact, the Canadian immigration points system proliferates a misbalance in the labour market as a result of immigrants not working in occupations that commensurate with their pre-migration education and skills (James, 2009a; Sapeha, 2015). Girard (2010) points out that "there is a lack of evidence in the literature concerning the link between pre-migration and post-migration

education" (p. 82). Banerjee and Verma (2012) write that "while the value of pre-migration education has been well studied in the immigrant integration literature, the topic of post-migration education has not received much attention" (p. 60). Additionally, scholars such as Adamuti-Trache et al. (2013), and Maximova and Krahn (2005) echo similar concerns that there is a significant chasm in the literature relating to adult immigrant post-migration education.

Xue (2008) highlights that a "lack of job experience in Canada was the most cited serious problem for newcomers when looking for jobs throughout the first years in Canada" (p. 5). This suggests that many newcomers face challenges to entering the Canadian labour market despite the existence of labour market policies such as the Employment Equity Act. The Employment Equity Act was not only designed and implemented in response to systemic employment discrimination (Agocs, 2002; James, 2011; James et al., 2010), but was also created to promote the representation of diversity and racialized people's "particular perspective . . . a valuable additional resource" in various corporations (James, 2010, p. 247). Wilton and Ross (2017) highlight that "while more women in Canada are gaining degrees and doctoral education and more women are now working in demanding academic positions than has ever been the case in the past, equity has not yet been achieved" in terms of gender and especially race (p. 68). Hence the need for my research that unpacks the lived experiences of Black women, particularly Black Jamaican women, who obtained post migration education to reveal the tensions surrounding employment in academia in a presupposed post-colonial state[2].

Sadeghi (2008) expounds "from institutionalized racism to resistance from family to cultural conflicts and language problems, immigrant women's experiences in higher education are marked by adversity and exclusion as well as resilience and commitment" (p. 218).

[2] The notion of Canada as a post-colonial state is problematic. See Besner (2003), Clarke (2003), and Moss (2003) regarding the question of and complexities surrounding Canada as a post-colonial country.

Sadeghi's (2008) study highlights that racialized immigrant women encounter barriers with multiple layers not only at the institutional level but also at the cultural and familial level that impacts their experiences obtaining post-migration education. In particular, "Caribbean family structures have been tenuous due to histories of slavery, . . . [and] economic hardships" (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019, p. 179). In other words, the experiences of Black women in multiple roles such as being a mother, and a wife in relation to obtaining post-migration education is of particular importance. In addition, Sadeghi (2008) points out that "immigrant women's learning contexts are shaped by the multiple roles they play as women within their own families and cultural communities and also as immigrants within the host society" (p. 218). Thus, encountering multiple dimensions influences their academic and occupational decisions.

**Post-slavery Impact on Jamaica's Education and Society**

James (2009a) pinpoints that "Caribbean people are racially and ethnically diverse" (p. 103). The majority of the Jamaican population is Black, and there is a Jewish, White, Chinese, Indian, and Arab minorities (Ari, 2019; Charles, 2009; Nettleford, 1978; Robotham, 2000). As such, it is essential to understand that the experiences of Black Jamaicans are different from White Jamaicans (Chambers, 2012), Chinese Jamaicans (Taylor, 2012), and Indian Jamaicans (Plaza, 2004). Hence my focus on Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration PSE to reveal the nuances and complexities surrounding how our bodies are perceived and subjugated. In so doing, "a more meaningful understanding of Caribbean migration experience [particular to Black Jamaican women] can develop" (Plaza, 2004, p. 261); thus, limiting or eliminating the risk of over-generalizing or under-generalizing when everyone is grouped as Caribbean (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019; Plaza, 2004).

Although Jamaica received its independence in 1962 from the "economic oppression of

the British and the class colour exploitation" (Campbell, 1973, p. 17), racial tension continued throughout the Jamaican society (Campbell, 1973; Charles, 2009; Nettleford, 1965; Smith, 1990). This racial tension was premise on colourism (Charles, 2009; Henry, 1994; James et al., 2010; Nettleford, 1978; Robotham, 2000), and interlocked with classism (Campbell, 1973; Henry, 1994; Keith, 1978; E. Miller, 2000; Petgrave, 2011). During slavery, "light skin complexion was a pre-requisite for working in the plantation great house" (Charles, 2009, p. 157). In addition:

> European standards of beauty set by the white upper class made light skin and European features a status symbol. To have kinky hair was to have 'bad hair'. An African with money was socially acceptable, but only if he hated himself completely. (Campbell, 1973, p. 18)

Thus light skin in Jamaican is perceived as socially desirable, whereas dark skin is not (Ari, 2019; Bobb-Smith, 2003; Charles, 2009). That said, the lingering effects of colonialism not only impacted how Jamaicans perceived themselves but also influenced all levels of their education system (Kean, 2000; Lewis & Simmons, 2010; Nettleford, 1978, 2000; Petgrave, 2011; Warrican, 2015).

Many Caribbean citizens remain suspicious of their home grown education as a result of a colonial past, and still prize "higher education acquired abroad" as the benchmark (Warrican, 2015, p. 211). Petgrave (2011) attests that the Jamaican education system was "a bifurcated system organised along class lines – a legacy of colonialism – defined Jamaican education on the eve of 1972" (p. 26). In fact, the Jamaican education system, particularly its tertiary education, is complex (see Cobley, 2000), and fraught with inferior and superior legacy from slavery in that more value was placed on Eurocentric curricula than Jamaican-Caribbean curriculum (Charles,

2009; Marshall, 2000; Nettleford, 1978; Petgrave, 2011; Warrican, 2015). In addition, Jamaicans from the working-class had difficulty accessing education (E. Miller, 2000; Nettleford, 1978; Petgrave, 2011). Importantly, what is often taken for granted in Jamaica and Canada is that the experiences of Black people – particularly Caribbean peoples (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019 – are the same which negates the different experiences within the Black population(s) (Ari, 2019; Henry, 1998; James, 2010, 2011; James et al., 2010; McIntyre & Hamilton-Hinch, 2016; Plaza, 2004); notwithstanding the "forge[d] solidarities" that exist across Black population(s) (Mullings et al., 2012, p. 295), and the similar effects of them being marginalized, racialized, and oppressed in Canada (McIntyre & Hamilton-Hinch, 2016).

According to Fearon (2012):

> Jamaica has struggled to find a reasonable balance between private and public sector involvement in the economy. . . . [T]he social consensus to focus on fundamental drivers of economic growth (e.g., labour productivity, capital formation and knowledge acquisition and its application) remains elusive. (p. 320)

As a result of this elusiveness, many Black Jamaican women with pre-migration PSE migrate to Canada (Davis, 2018; Mullings et al., 2012). Significantly, there is a deep historical, and a continued history making relationship between Canada and Jamaica in terms of Canada's reliance on immigration from the Global South to enhance its economy (Davis & James, 2010; Walker, 2012). Walker (2012) highlights that "the earliest bonds between Canada and Jamaica were a product of each region's role in a British imperial world built in large on the backs of African descended peoples" (p. 23). Based on this historical, and ongoing relationship, Senior (2012) emphasizes "we might learn that many skills and much knowledge are, after all, transferable and do not require Canadian experience" in light of the similarities of having a

British education system (p. 16). However, employing a post-colonial lens, Nelson and Nelson (2004) illustrate that:

> much Euro-Canadian complacency on issues of race is based on ignorance – a literal obliviousness to our complex colonial legacies; our diverse racial, ethnic, linguistic and religious populations; and how these factors have affected the regulation and meanings of whiteness as the unquestioned normative Western and Canadian identity, which, until recently has not been fully understood or scrutinized as a racialized position. (p. 3)

As such, imperialism is maintained by the dominant group in Canada over developing countries such as Jamaica which impacts the ways in which Canada interacts with Black Jamaican women.

## Experience within Immigration and Employment in the Canadian Society

### *Multiculturalism on Trial*

Canadian society is diverse and complex (Pandolfi & James, 2017). Consequently, since the inception of the Canadian multiculturalism policy in 1971 (Guo & Guo, 2015; James, 1995, 2010; Kymlicka, 2015), in response to concerns of a skewed discourse of biculturalism and bilingualism (Guo & Guo, 2015; Kymlicka, 2015; Moss, 2003), multiculturalism has proved problematic (see Chapra & Chatterjee, 2009); and dismissive of Indigenous peoples in relation to the history of Canada (James, 2010; Pandolfi & James, 2017). Davis (2017) writes that the "perceived link between immigration and multiculturalism - the idea that Canada's reliance on and openness to immigration is a 'natural' consequence of its growing self-identification as a tolerant multicultural nation - is not only misleading but dangerous" (p. 727). Importantly, various studies (Daniel, 2010; Desai Trilokekar & El Masri, 2017; Chapra & Chatterjee, 2009; Davis, 2017; Gaztambide-Fernandez, 2012; Henry, 1994; Henry & Tator, 2009a; James, 1995, 2009a, 2010; James et al., 2010; Pandolfi & James, 2017; Wayne, 2009) disrupt the façade of

multiculturalism in Canada to reveal its adverse effects of maintaining a colonial cycle that privileges Whiteness, and racializes or penalizes non-white people. Furthermore, multiculturalism lacks real structure to assist the full integration and entitlement of Black Caribbean immigrants in the Canadian society (Bobb-Smith, 2003); and is commodified by government, corporations, and universities through portrayed images and discourses of Canada as being inclusive and accepting of diversity (Ahmed, 2012; Bobb-Smith, 2003; Gaztambide-Fernandez, 2012).

Wayne (2009) attests that multiculturalism operates with a dual intent where immigrants are welcomed to Canada but doors to success remain closed on their efforts. In the midst of Canada's discourse of multiculturalism, many Black immigrants with post-graduate credentials are working in underpaid employment or unemployed (Block & Galabuzi, 2011; Canadian Race Relations Foundation, 2015-2016; James, 2009a; Wayne, 2009) which operates as a barrier to Black immigrants' integration in the Canadian society (James, 2009a). The plethora of underemployment in the Black immigrant community demonstrates the inherent cycle of oppression and imperialism that continues to operate in Canada.

Wayne's (2009) work at a Canadian college with adult immigrants with pre-migration PSE and partnerships with various reputable organizations revealed "the complexities of emotions around immigrants and multiculturalism in Canada" ( p. 29). Wayne (2009) emphasized that as funding increased from the federal and provincial government to sustain the one year transitional college program for immigrants with graduate credentials, systemic barriers increased as well in the form of higher standards of English testing to hamper admission; and prejudice discourse that promoted the idea that the racialized immigrant students were receiving special treatment over the predominantly White Canadian students. Thus, bridging policies are

theoretically sound but yields little fruition in reality for many racialized immigrants (Wayne, 2009).

A qualitative study of African-Caribbean Canadians found that many Black Caribbean immigrants migrate to Canada with the perception that they would experience educational and occupational opportunities (James, 2009a). Employing critical race theory (CRT) and critical hope theory (CHT), James (2009a) reveals how the process of racialization impedes many African-Caribbean immigrants from attaining their immigrant dream or aspirations despite their high value and confidence for PSE. From the African-Caribbean immigrants' perspectives, education attainment was imperative for facilitating upward mobility but they also recognized that they had to work harder than their White counterparts (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019; James, 2009a; Pitter, 2012); and they were denied job positions commensurable with their skills as a result of systemic racism (James, 2009a).

Notably, racism negatively impacts the health of many Black people in Canada (Daniel, 2018, 2019; Henry & Kobayashi, 2017; Henry & Tator, 2010, 2012; James, 2009a, 2012; James, 2010; James et al., 2010; Paradies, 2006). To that end, many Black immigrants internalize the pain, and effects of racism under the guise of remaining strong (Daniel, 2018; James, 2009a; James et al., 2010) which is a complex mechanism – internalized racism – that further hurts oneself while attempting to cope in a racist society. However, many African-Caribbean immigrants "cling to hope and the belief that education – the more the better – is key to their attainment of the economic and social ideal that is their immigrant dream" (James, 2009a, p. 104). Therefore, it is my hope that my research will contribute to the literature on how African-Caribbean immigrants, specifically Black female Jamaican immigrants, actualize their immigrant dream of working in a faculty teaching job in Canada.

### *Immigration Policy in Relation to Black Women*

According to Reece (2010), "one area in which institutional racism can be examined is our immigration policies and the racialized pattern of immigration connected to citizenship and belonging in Canadian society" in that "racist immigration policies curtail the movement of women of colour entering this country" (p. 92). In the mid 1950s, Canada enacted a Domestic Worker Program that brought many Caribbean women to work as domestics in Canada (Calliste, 1991; Henry, 1998; James, 2009a; Macklin, 1992; Silvera, 1983; Plaza, 2004; Reece, 2010; Silvera, 1989). Thus forming class in Canada through the organization of race as a fundamental contribution to racial hierarchy (Bannerji, 1995) or social stratification (James, 2010). The Caribbean women, predominantly from Jamaica, Trinidad, and Barbados, experienced racism and exploitation (Bakan & Stasiulis, 1994, 1995; Bobb-Smith, 2003; Calliste, 1991; MacKenzie, 1988; Macklin, 1992; Silvera, 1983; Reece, 2010). Hsiung and Nichol (2010) highlight that "highly racialized practices were deployed as the [Caribbean] domestic caregivers were admitted into Canada" (p. 767). Racialized practices such as invasive gynecological examinations and unequal treatment of Caribbean domestics in Canada (Bakan & Stasiulis, 1994; Calliste, 1991; Macklin, 1992) are concrete examples of Canada's racist history and how racial prejudice becomes embedded in systematic and discriminatory policies and practices (Bakan & Stasiulis, 1994, 1995; Stasiulis & Bakan, 2005; Hsiung & Nichol, 2010).

Bakan and Stasiulis (1994) argue that "during the 1970s, the citizenship rights of foreign, and especially Caribbean, domestics thus deteriorated further" where the state and employer had maximum control over the working and living conditions of Black women working domestics who entered Canada on temporary employment visas (p. 13). Even though the federal government included domestic workers in Unemployment Insurance (EI), and Canada Pension

Plans (CPP) during the late 1970s, domestic workers are still at a disadvantage based on the fact that entitlement to EI and CPP is tied to permanent residency and citizenship (Bakan & Stasiulis, 1994). That is, many domestic workers are on temporary work visas and are expected to maintain employment during their stay in Canada (Bakan & Stasiulis, 1994). Importantly, although the Canadian government introduced a new Foreign Domestic Movement (FDM) program in 1981 (Bakan & Stasiulis, 1994; Macklin, 1994) as an attempt to address the humanitarian complaints of the Caribbean domestic program, the FDM program still maintained "many of the exploitative features of the previous [domestic worker] policy" (Hsiung & Nichol, 2010, p. 768). That is, "domestic workers are highly vulnerable to abusive conditions as a result of live-in requirement and the ambiguity of the social space constructed out of relations between live-in domestic workers and their employers" (Bakan & Stasiulis, 1994, p. 16).

In 1992, the FDM was replaced with the Live-in Caregiver Program (LCP) (Bakan & Stasiulis, 1994; Macklin, 1994) as a response to the backlash of the FDM program (Hsiung & Nichol, 2010; Macklin, 1994). The LCP relied on foreign labour and "involve[d] long hours, low remuneration, and little control over one's work or conditions" (Bakan & Stasiulis, 1995, p. 312). Despite the challenges of the LCP such as racializing women from Third World countries (Bakan & Stasiulis, 1995; Stasiulis and Bakan, 2005), the program "is currently in effect" in the twenty-first century (Hsiung & Nichol, 2010, p. 768)[3]. Macklin (1994) denotes that a domestic worker is "admitted into Canada but barred from political membership, employed in a workplace but excluded from worker-protection laws, resident in a household but not a part of the family" (p. 13). Aligned with these policies is the instituted point system structuring immigration policy in Canada today. In addition to the LCP, the Federal Skilled Trades Program instituted in 2013

[3] There is an extensive historical account of how racism was embedded in the policies of the FDM and LCP programs, and the challenges Black female migrant domestic workers experienced, see Bakan and Stasiulis (1994, 1995), A. Henry (1998), F. Henry (1968), Calliste (1991), Hsiung and Nichol (2010), and Silvera (1983, 1989).

is one such policy designed to focus Canadian immigration on economic prosperity. This program is based on points given to would be immigrants based on their educational and employment experiences. The points system has negatively impacted the educational opportunity of immigrants. On the one hand, the system attracted highly qualified migrants (Augustine, 2015b; Aydemir & Borjas, 2006; Ngo & Este, 2006; Sapeha, 2015; Wayne, 2009). On the other hand, they attracted these immigrants for the purposes of service jobs, jobs that often did not use their educational qualifications appropriately and to their best advantage (Augustine, 2015a; Janusch, 2015; Lum et al., 2011; Suto, 2009; Wayne, 2009).

Aydemir and Borjas (2006) highlight that "in 1967 Canada introduced the point system that aimed explicitly at selecting immigrants with desirable skills" (p. 5). Points systems have long been used in Canada to admit new immigrants. Even though Mullings et al. (2012) imply that "there is no guarantee that Jamaicans will find work commensurate with their level of skill and education" in light of the fact that economic class immigrants no longer require employer sponsorship in Canada (p. 302); it is noteworthy that systemic structures such as the immigration point system is a tool that the Canadian government uses to lure high-skilled Black immigrants into the assumption that they will have full access to jobs in the labour market based on the points that they have been awarded by the immigration program for their credentials and skills earned aboard. McDonald et al. (2015) attest that "the points are an index of the characteristics associated with immigrants who are expected to be successful in the Canadian economy based on objective criteria at the time of application" (p. 117). Thus, the points system distorts the notion of shared power (Sapeha, 2015) in that the racialized agenda of the Canadian immigration policy gives many Black immigrants false hope.

Oreopoulos (2009) argues that in the contemporary moment "what is particularly

noteworthy in the Canadian case is the fact that their immigration policy focuses on attracting immigrants with superior levels of education, experience, and industry demand" (p. 2). Evidently, the Canadian government hand picks many racialized immigrants who it perceives as suitable to the economic interest of the state in order to maintain a dual labour market that reflects the dominate group in the primary labour market while forcing many racialized immigrants in the secondary labour market to not only maintain a hierarchal structure but to also exploit the labour of many racialized immigrants (Colic-Peisker & Tilbury, 2006; Galabuzi, 2001; Lusis & Bauder, 2010; Reich et al., 1973).

### *Employment in Canadian Academia*

Regarding the immigrant status of employed university teachers in Canada for 2006, the Canadian Association of University Teachers [CAUT] (2014) purports that 40% are immigrants and non-permanent residents. Importantly, there is little or no further statistical data pertaining to the immigrant status of employed university teachers in Canada beyond 2006 (CAUT, 2014). Although "Canadian universities do take race and gender into account in their hiring and admission decisions" (Katchanovski et al., 2015, p. 24), many racialized faculty members at Canadian universities have contingent employment status and are underrepresented in positions of authority (Dua & Bhanji, 2012). Dua and Bhanji (2012) argue that:

> Part-timers are now a permanent and low-cost academic workforce. The over-representation of equity-seeking groups among contract faculty raises concerns as contract work is characterized by the degradation of work processes, the professionalizing of certain academic functions, differential pay, lack of work security and lower job satisfaction. (p.52)

By streaming many faculty of colour into contract employment, Canadian universities limit

many Black faculty's access to benefits and wage increase which is a form of organized poverty that further marginalize them as lower ranking faculty members - thus maintaining a dual labour market in many Canadian universities. Dua and Bhanji (2012) research "does confirm that visible minority and Aboriginal faculty tend to be clustered in certain faculties. . . . Such clustering does hide the extreme under-representation in other faculties of visible minorities in the Faculty of Arts . . ." (p. 69).

Ghabrial (2012) denotes that meritocracy "operates by promising mobility even as it regulates and structures social difference" (p. 39). In other words, meritocracy doesn't consider social capital or class of Black immigrants who may experience financial constraints and have limited access to enrol in educational institutions to assist their mobility in education and the labour market. Moreover, research confirms the fallacy of meritocracy in the Canadian society in that it privileges the dominant group while masking its' exclusion of many Black students and academics from succeeding in the academy (Heer, 2012; Henry, 1998, 2015; James, 1995, 2008, 2017; James & Chapman-Nyaho, 2017; James et al., 2010; James & Taylor, 2008; Ramos & Wijesingha, 2017). Meritocracy ignores the merits that could be achieved by Black immigrants who do not have the resources and network to advance their studies in Canada, and gain meaningful employment that reflects their occupational prestige from their home country. For meritocracy to be truly effective in Canada for all ethnicities, the education system needs to "acknowledge that 'differences' are differently valued, [and affected]" which is an integral part to understanding and addressing "how these differences act as barriers" to the lives of racial minorities (James, 1995, p. 32).

The literature shows that adult immigrants who pursue post-migration education in Canada (Adamuti-Trache et al., 2013; Banerjee & Verma, 2012; Girard, 2010) and employ social

network strategies (Grenier & Xue, 2011; Ngo & Este, 2006; Sapeha, 2015) are more likely to have jobs than immigrants who did not obtain post-migration education. However, jobs attained by racialized immigrants (Li, 2001), particularly African-Caribbean immigrants (James, 2009a, 2011), with post-migration PSE in Canada are problematic in that "Caribbean immigrants are not experiencing the same kind of integration into the Canadian society as [d]o European immigrants" (James, 2009a, p. 92). Many educated immigrants work in survival jobs (Wayne, 2009; Zietsma, 2010). In addition, racialized immigrant women encounter economic disparity in the Canadian labour market (Grenier & Xue, 2011; Hou & Picot, 2014; James, 2009a; Li, 2000; Picot & Sweetman, 2012). Adamuti-Trache et al. (2013) points out that "the majority of highly educated immigrants failed to gain entry to the professions" (p. 179). As such, employment in Canada does not reflect many immigrants' pre-migration occupational experiences in their country of origin (Adamuti-Trache et al., 2013; Anderson et al., 2010; Anwar, 2014; Grant & Nadin, 2007; Suto, 2009).

Tannock (2011) suggests that, "with the rise and spread of skill-selecting systems of immigration, education instead is turned – as has happened in other fields of policy and practice as well – into a tool of exclusion and division, offering empowerment and well-being for some, but decidedly not for all" (p. 1332). Furthermore, scholars such as Duleep and Regets (1999) reveal that immigrants from Third World countries make greater investment in post-migration education than European immigrants. Thus education is used to perpetuate a cycle of privilege for the dominate group in society while subjugating other groups such as Black immigrants through the systemic denial of the existence of pre-migration education and credentials that results in many of them re-entering higher education in order to attain education that is perceived by the dominant group as valid – Canadian education. It is of critical importance to analyze the

experiences of Black Jamaican women who have attained pre- and post-secondary education in Canada in order to reveal how a cycle of privileging continues to exist in the area of post-migration education.

Grenier and Xue (2011) cited that immigrants' first year in Canada was crucial for finding a job in that after the one year period it took a longer time to secure a job. In addition, whether immigrants of colour enrolled in the same field or different field from their pre-migration education, Anisef et al. (2008) found that the opportunities of being employed four years after arrival were significantly reduced. It is imperative to note that the pursuit of taking (post-migration) education takes time (Anisef et al., 2008), and is a factor as to why some Black female immigrants may or may not pursue higher education in Canada. On the other hand, enrolment in Canadian educational institutions, whether or not in their trained field prior to migration, is a strategy that many Black Jamaican women use to "find quality employment and to facilitate recognition of their foreign credentials" (Girard, 2010, p. 82). Although the economic outcome (Bonikowska et al., 2011; Buzdugan & Halli, 2009; Grenier & Xue, 2011; Hou & Picot, 2014; Li, 2000, 2001, 2012; Picot & Sweetman, 2012; Ramos & Li, 2017), and barriers (Anderson et al., 2010; Banerjee & Phan, 2014; Banerjee & Verma, 2012; Girard & Smith, 2013; Hawthorne, 2008; James, 2009a; Wayne, 2009) are well-documented that many racialized immigrants experience when entering the Canadian labour market, my research specifically explores the impact of Black Jamaican women obtaining post-migration education in Canada with the aspiration of teaching in academia.

## Experience as Students and Academics within Canadian Higher Education

### *Globalization and Canadian Higher Education*

According to Hazelkorn (2018), "higher education is a global game" (p. 4). As such,

Canadian PS institutions compete globally for the attention, and enrolment of students. The success or failure of globally attracting students and academics is integral to how nations are perceived and positioned on a global scale (Hazelkorn, 2018). Canada touted as a multicultural society is a powerful indicator of its "talent-attracting capacity" as a nation (Hazelkorn, 2018, p. 4). Hazelkorn (2018) emphasizes that "globali[z]ation has facilitated increasing concentrations of wealth and resources, leading to an intensification of hierarchical differentiation and social stratification" that maintains disparity between PS institutions in the Global North, and the Global South (p. 10).

Over the past decade, in an attempt to bolster Ontario's higher education global competitiveness, the government of Ontario adopted a differentiation policy (Milian, 2018; Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities [MTCU], 2013; Young et al., 2020). This differentiation policy framework "account[s] for [PSE] institutional progress toward government priorities and the alignment of institutional strengths and institutional priorities" (Young et al., 2020, p. 26). As a result, Canadian PS institutions are competing nationally and globally for highly talented students, academic staff, and for (limited) funding from the government (Young et al., 2020). However, "little scholarly attention has been devoted to an analysis of [the differentiation policy's] implementation" (Milian, 2018, p. 85).

Significantly, Young et al. (2020) highlight that:

> MTCU recently started the next round of SMA [Strategic Mandate Agreements] (2017-2020) discussions with [PSE] institutions that is expected to coincide with the implementation of the new funding mechanisms with potentially more competitive performance-based funding while at the same time minimising the funding distribution among institutions. (p. 35)

This SMA is problematic in that one type of funding that PS institutions receive from the government of Ontario is grant for enrolment level/growth (Young et al., 2020). Thus creating a vicious market driven competition to attract students which inadvertently excludes many Black immigrant PSE students with a low socio-economic status from attending colleges and universities. Furthermore, unlike domestic student fees, "international student fees, some professional and all graduate programme fees are deregulated" in Ontario which gives PS institutions the opportunity to "determine their fee levels" (Young et al., 2020, p. 34). To that end, PS institutions' liberty to determine and charge fees not only puts a financial burden on international students, and Black immigrant PSE students who pursue graduate and/or post-graduate education in Ontario but also uses that liberty to exploit international students and Black immigrants in graduate programs to fill the financial shortcomings of limited funding distributions from the government. As such, my study highlights some of the ways in which some Black Jamaican women with pre-migration PSE are attracted to Canadian PS institutions, and the financial hardship that they endured.

### *Black Students in Canadian PSE*

According to Aguiar et al. (2010), "culture has not only replaced biology as the new and most common form of racist expression, it has itself been biologized" (p. 70). In that, stereotypes are ascribed to Black Jamaican people (Ari, 2019; Bobb-Smith, 2003; Henry, 1994; James, 2010; Plaza, 2004; Silvera, 1989) via cultural terms (Balibar, 1991) as if they were part of their biological makeup (Aguiar et al., 2010). With reference to the arrival of temporary Jamaican migrants, and college students in the Okanagan community in Canada, Aguiar et al. (2010) emphasized that "because the long history of racializing [B]lack bodies puts the black body under suspicion, the racialization of Jamaicans in the Okanagan media began before their

arrival in [Canada]" (p. 71). Thus, Black Jamaican college students were "confronted with newspaper articles reminding them that they were '[B]lack'" (Aguiar et al., 2010p. 72). Similarly, Ari (2019), James (2004), and James et al. (2010) drew attention to the Canadian media's hyper-visibility/sensitivity of Black people as violent and insubordinate.

Interestingly, Wayne (2009) debunks the myth that college is easier for immigrants to access than universities. In fact, Black female immigrant students experience discrimination in many Canadian PS institutions (Davis, 2018; Gibbs, 1996; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019; Shenaz-Hossein, 2017) even though some students may not even recognize it (Daniel, 2018) or acknowledge it - as is the case of some racialized academics (James, 2012). Importantly, high levels of stress, and anxiety are associated with students who choose to complete graduate studies (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019; Scott et al., 2015), particularly doctoral studies (Siltanen et al., 2019). Although many Canadian universities have professional development programs to assist doctoral students, and mitigate stress; these initiatives are not mandatory and "are available to interested doctoral candidates" (Maldonado et al., 2013, p. 28). Such voluntary base initiatives may appear straightforward and helpful; but in fact, are fraught with complexities for many Black Jamaican women who have multiple responsibilities. For instance, financial constraints (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019; Siltanen et al., 2019) and childcare needs (Milan et al., 2011; Wilton & Ross, 2017) may inadvertently make an interested Black Jamaican woman unavailable to access professional development programs at a Canadian university. Moreover, the intersectionality of race, class, gender, age, parenthood and being an immigrant complicates the situation for many Jamaican graduate students in that they face additional barriers in the academy. Daniel (2018), Henry (2015), Henry et al. (2017a), Hernandez-Ramdwar (2009, 2019), and Waterfield et al. (2019) exemplified that there is difficulty involved in teasing out the

intersections of race, gender, and class to reveal the spaces from which Black female students are racialized and/or marginalized in Canadian universities. As such, there is a need for a flexible approach that "must be rooted in an understanding of how student needs differ by circumstance and change over time during the [PSE] experience" (Strange & Hardy Cox, 2016, p. 173).

Guided by a CRT analysis, Hiraldo (2010) highlights that increasing enrolment of racialized students in universities is not enough in tackling systemic racism. Similarly, Hernandez-Ramdwar's (2009) study examined the impact of increased enrolment of Caribbean students in Canadian PS institutions. Using a qualitative approach, her study affirms that "the increased presence of Caribbean students on the university campus has neither eradicated nor decreased racism" (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, p. 125). In fact, Caribbean students experience "pressures of structural racism" even more when they pursue graduate studies in Canada (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, p. 125). Notably, Henry et al. (2017) highlight that "numerical representation does not in itself tell us anything about experiences" (p. 30); hence, the critical importance for qualitative studies. As such, Hernandez-Ramdwar (2009) advocates for qualitative research that sheds light on the occupational outcomes of Caribbean students who have completed Canadian PS graduate education in order to reveal if they are moving into decision making positions such as the professoriate. On the other hand, many Black graduate students experience marginalization that positions them as outsiders in academia (Waterfield et al., 2019) which may inadvertently affect their completion of their education due to additional work and teaching responsibilities to meet their financial needs (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019; Maldonado et al., 2013). A decade later, with a follow-up study, Hernandez-Ramdwar (2019) demonstrates that Caribbean students still experience racism in Canadian universities pertaining to their accessibility to such spaces, retention, and successful completion of their

programs.

Siltanen et al. (2019) emphasized that as a result of unproductive supervision relations; increase pressure on graduate students to meet their completion time; and having to take on additional paid work due to lack of funding, there are "ongoing serious concerns with mental health issues among students" in Canada (p. 276). Notably, many Black students experience racism as a result of some faculty members denying their intelligence, and coding their Black bodies as troubling (Aguiar et al., 2010; Daniel, 2018). According to Davis (2018), "[her] experiences as a graduate student brought into sharp focus what it meant to be a Black/African Jamaican woman living in Canada" (p. 72). In addition, Daniel (2018) sheds light on how White students openly "vilif[y] Blacks, both in the context of the classrooms and in the hallways of the ivory towers of academia" that re-inscribes Whiteness in Canadian PS institutions (p. 59); and further exacerbates the process of racialization at the micro level. Moreover, Hooks (1989) argues that "if [B]lack students resisted in any way, the situation worsened" (p. 387); and as such, they may not be inclined to speak out against racism in the academy due to the "insensitivity of some faculty members and students from the dominant group" (Henry & Tator, 2009b, p. 48). However, it is noteworthy that African Caribbean PSE students employ critical hope and critical participation (Gibbs, 1996; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019; James, 2009a, 2012; James et al., 2010; James & Taylor, 2008) as tools of resistance to counteract racism in the Canadian society.

The interrogation of policy and practice is valuable to contextualize the experiences of Black Jamaican women who migrate to Canada as international students. To date, literature on the experiences of international students in North American universities focuses on the students' integration in the host society, language acquisition, and identity issues (J. Miller, 2000;

Montgomery, 2010; Phan, 2008; Poteet & Gomez, 2015; Zhang & Beck, 2014; Zhou & Zhang, 2014). Despite the large increase of international students in Canada in the twenty-first century (Association of Universities and Colleges of Canada [AUCC], 2011; Citizenship and Immigration Canada [CIC], 2013; Zhou & Zhang, 2014), few scholarships take up the mantle of empowering the narratives of international students which leaves a gap in the literature regarding international students' preferences, experiences and understanding their choices (Calder et al., 2016; de Wit, 2013; Hoare, 2012; Leary et al., 2016; Lee, 2010; Li & Tierney, 2013). As such, the experiences of international students are limited in the Canadian scholarship (Arthur & Flynn, 2011; El Masri et al., 2015; Li & Tierney, 2013; Lin & Liu, 2019; Nunes & Arthur, 2013). In fact, many international students experience loneliness and isolation in the host societies (Leary et al., 2016; Marginson, 2012; McIntyre & Hamilton-Hinch, 2016; Poteet & Gomez, 2015; Stein & Andreotti, 2016; Zhou & Zhang, 2014). That said, it is imperative to understand that the absence of international student voices is not a coincidence in Canadian scholarship; rather, it is a deliberate strategy in a Western society to place emphasis on literature that reinforces its dominant image of benevolence instead of presenting both sides of the story that may at times challenge the values of Canada.

Importantly, international students not only offer economic benefits to Canada (Aguiar et al., 2010; Hawthorne, 2008; Kunin & Associates, 2012; Maldonado et al., 2013; Neiterman, Atanackovic, Covell, & Bourgeault, 2018; Scott et al., 2015; Stein & Andreotti, 2016) but also offer multiple ways of knowing the world from their perspectives (Desai Trilokekar et al., 2019; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019; Leary et al., 2016; Lee, 2010; Li & Tierney, 2013). However, many international students with post-migration PSE experience difficulties to successful integration and getting jobs in the Canadian labour force (Desai Trilokekar et al., 2019; El Masri et al.,

2015; McIntyre & Hamilton-Hinch, 2016; Nunes & Arthur, 2013; Poteet & Gomez, 2015) despite having Canadian education (Desai Trilokekar & El Masri, 2017; Neiterman et al., 2018; Oreopoulos, 2009; Scott et al., 2015). Scholars such as Desai Trilokekar and El Masri (2017), Desai Trilokekar et al. (2019), and Scott et al.'s (2015) illustrate that there is a gap between policy makers' assumptions that international students are ideal immigrants in Canada, and the actual experiences of international students.

With a cross-cultural adaptation lens, Scott et al. (2015) exemplified that international students encountered discrimination in accessing off-campus employment in their field of study despite obtaining a work permit, and little or no support with securing internships that could have resulted in permanent employment after the completion of their studies. In addition, Desai Trilokekar and El Masri (2017) interrogated "the rhetoric of [Canadian recruiting and retaining] policy and its practice" in light of international student experiences to reveal the hidden discourses and practices that perpetuate processes of marginalization, racialization, and discrimination in the Canadian society (p. 674). Furthermore, Desai Trilokekar et al. (2019) questioned the global readiness of Ontario employers with regards to the employment of international students despite Canada's rhetoric of promoting an open border to reveal the "reluctanc[y] of Canadian employers to hire international candidates" (p. 114).

***Who are Allowed Access in Canadian Academia?***

In reviewing the literature on the experiences of Black Jamaican women in academia (as students, and academics), there is a stark absence in the scholarship. Although there is some literature on the experiences of racialized academics (Henry & Kobayashi, 2017; Henry & Tator, 2012; James, 2012, 2017; James & Chapmen-Nyaho, 2017; Kobayashi, 2009; Mohamed & Beagan, 2018; Monture, 2009; Smith et al., 2017), particularly Black academics (Daniel, 2019;

Davis, 2018; Henry, 1998, 2015; James, 2009b), and Black PSE students (Daniel, 2018; Gibbs, 1996; Henry & Tator, 2009b; James & Taylor, 2008) who are African-Caribbean (Aguiar et al., 2010; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019; James, 2009a); the scholarship is lacking on Black immigrant experiences with pre- and post-migration PSE in the Canadian academy.

Importantly, Canadian PS institutions endorse the idea of intellectual inclusivity; yet, many Black female academics continue to experience a precarious vulnerability in telling one's academic journey (Davis, 2018) that interrupts the dominant literature (Henry, 2015); and are predisposed to internalized racism (Daniel, 2018); gendered racism (Henry, 2015); as well as attitudinal, institutional and structural racism (Henry et al., 2017a, 2017b; Henry & Kobayashi, 2017; Henry & Tator, 2009a; James, 2000b, 2011, 2012, 2017; James & Chapman-Nyaho, 2017; Smith et al., 2017; Waterfield et al., 2019) in the professoriate. Scholars such as Daniel (2018), Henry (2015), and Mohamed and Beagan (2018), with a critical race feminism (CRF) lens, affirm the importance of understanding that the process of racialization is manifested when White academics and students are intimidated by Blackness.

Daniel's (2018) research offered "support [to Black female students/academics] in maintaining their sanity in spaces of higher learning that, at times, appear to produce more mental instability than intelligent thought" (p. 60). Her study not only argues for Blacks to equip themselves with "transformative resistance" to challenge racism in Canadian universities but also offers alternatives in which Blacks can survive in academia and embody "self-preservation" as they continue to resist racist structures and attitudes at the micro and macro level in the academy (Daniel, 2018, p. 59). According to Daniel (2018):

> No amount of appeals to the inherent goodness of the oppressor will result in the type of change we need to see in a perceptible time period. Instead [we] have to change the way

[we] deal with those who oppress [us]. (p. 62)

As such, Daniel (2018) writes from the perspective of Black women changing their outlook on racism in that the oppressors are not willing to change a system that privileges them, and so, Black women need to protect themselves. Thus, many Black immigrants experience Canadian universities as volatile spaces (Daniel, 2018, 2019; Henry & Tator, 2009a; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019; James, 2012, 2017; James & Chapman-Nyaho, 2017) where they (specifically Black female immigrants) have to trend softly (Henry, 2015, 2018), and know who they are, and their purpose in the academy in order to remain true to themselves (Daniel, 2018, 2019; Davis, 2018; Stockfelt, 2018). Significantly, it is this type of protection and self preservation that are critical to the decisions that many Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration PSE make when faced with challenges to attain their desire to work in a faculty teaching job.

Rich (1979/2000) emphasizes that the university is "a hierarchy built on exploitation" (p. 9). Despite the "progress [that] has been made in some areas such as . . . new faculty hires" (AWA, 2016, p. 1); extensive research illustrate that many Black women are token hires (Abawi, 2018; Ahmed, 2012; Daniel, 2019; Henry, 2015; Henry et al., 2017b; Henry & Kobayashi, 2017; James, 2009b, 2012, 2017; James & Chapman-Nyaho, 2017; Kanter, 1993); and lag behind their male counterparts in terms of academic achievement such as delayed appointment to tenure-track positions and promotion (AWA, 2016; Henry et al., 2017b; Henry et al., 2012, 2017; Ornstein et al., 2007; Ramos & Li, 2017). In addition, "Androcentric and Eurocentric values, supported by the power of 'old white boys' networks, have kept women of colour out of the academy very effectively" (Kobayashi, 2009, p. 60). Thus, Black female experience of limited accessibility to academic faculty jobs is not a new phenomena. White people, particularly White men, were historically and currently perceived as the right fit for Canadian universities. Ornstein et al.

(2007) argue that:

> one persistent difference that might explain a gender difference in promotion is greater research productivity by men, argued to be a result of having more time to allocate to research, earlier and more consistent mentoring, and uninterrupted career paths compared to women. (p. 7)

Thus the subliminal discourse of many Eurocentric Canadian universities is that [White] men are committed to the task of research whereas African-Caribbean women are perceived as not having adequate time to commit to research due to childbearing and child/ren caring (Serna-Martinez, 2016). Another point to note is that PS institution departments and disciplines are gatekeepers for reproducing white dominance in the Canadian academy (Daniel, 2018, 2019; Dua & Bhanji, 2017a; Henry & Kobayashi, 2017; James, 2009b, 2012, 2017; James & Chapman-Nyaho, 2017; Smith, 2017). Such a gate-keeping and self-reproducing role discounts the realities of Black immigrant women by not taking into consideration that women, particularly Black Jamaican women, have multiple roles, and education, and work that can contribute extensively to academia.

### *Impact of Gender, Race and Class as Barriers for Black Female Academics*

Ornstein et al. (2007) purport that "since women need greater flexibility in their work lives than men to meet the demands of family, pregnancy, and childcare, their ability to invest in the male model of academic success is constrained" (p. 7). As such, Canadian universities continue to privilege [male] whiteness, and limit Black women's access to academic faculty jobs with the notion of commitment to research and publications. Hence, much has not changed regarding the representation of Black faculty in academia. According to Spafford et al.'s (2006) study, "the most telling experience regarding support occurred around promotion and tenure

decisions suggesting racially minoritized faculty were welcome in the Canadian academy as long as they did not seek places with greater power, prestige, and permanence" (p. 18). Through subtle systemic structures, many Canadian universities hinder Black women's access to academic faculty jobs in order to limit and avoid challenges to its Eurocentric prestige – the ivory tower. In addition, Henry and Tator (2009a) emphasize that "the [Canadian] university institution was created and controlled largely by White males of Anglo-Saxon ethnicity who reflected their European origins and experience" (p. 5). Consequently, Canadian "university continues to be a place where various overt and covert forms of racism and other forms of oppression are practiced" (Henry & Tator, 2009a, p. 8); as well as "rising publication expectations [in the twenty-first century that] may aggravate inequalities" in academia (Warren, 2019, p. 173). To that end, many female academics who are parents or desiring to experience motherhood, make additional sacrifices in light of these oppressive structures (Ketcham, 2017; Milan, Keown, & Urquijo, 2011; Pitts, 2017; Wilton & Ross, 2017).

The "concerns about gaps in one's academic record due to taking time off to have a child is a distinctive concern for academic women" (Ward & Wolf-Wendel, 2004, p. 246). Such concerns as taking time off for family reasons is a concrete example that "racism and sexism, particularly on the graduate level, shape and influence both academic performance and employment of Black female academics" (Hooks, 1998, p.389). Although all female faculty members face challenges in various disciplines, racialized female faculty members experience more challenges in relation to the intersectionality of race and gender regardless of the departments that they are in (Crenshaw, 1989; Daniel, 2019; Hirshfield & Joseph, 2012). In addition, racialized female academics' immigration status and foreign credentials act as an additional barrier in academia (Henry, 2015).

In their research, Hirshfield and Joseph (2012) demonstrated a strong correlation between "gendered identity taxation" and departments with "under-represented" women faculty, specifically racialized women faculty (p. 217). Furthermore, Hirshfield and Joseph (2012) highlighted that "due to their double minority status, racialized female faculty experience a large burden of identity taxation in academia" (p. 220). This correlation illustrates that at oftentimes many racialized women faculty are perceived as maternalistic by the dominant faculty members (Collins, 1998/2000; Hirshfield & Joseph, 2012) and as such are overburdened with departmental services such as advising more students than their male counterparts in addition to being tokenized as the face of diversity in their departments (Hirshfield & Joseph, 2012). However, Rich (1979/2000) argues the importance to consider the flip side of racialized women faculty being tokenized in that "even where staffed largely by tokenists, [women faculty] very existence will make possible some rising consciousness in students" (p. 14).

Acker and Armenti (2004) shed light on the fact that university structures do not "take much account for family dilemmas" (p. 9). Many women in academia are perceived by the dominant society as the ones responsible for dealing with family dilemmas, and not their male colleagues. This perception of gender responsibility continues to reveal the sexist structures of academia, and of the society as a whole. Maher et al. (2004) emphasize that "women typically bear more of the responsibility for home and child care" (p. 388). As a result of bearing more responsibility in the private sphere, in addition to their workload in academia, many racialized women faculty experience fatigue, burnt-out, and health concerns (Acker & Armenti, 2004; Ward & Wolf-Wendel, 2004).

Importantly, it is not only the dominant male faculty members who create a hostile environment in higher education for racialized women faculty but that some women faculty,

particularly White women (Daniel, 2019), also contribute to an unsupportive environment in many universities. Skelton (2005) highlights that tension and power struggles "might, and do occur between" faculty women (p. 320). An example of this power struggle is when some women faculty become successful, and have seemingly forgotten about the struggles of their female colleagues, and have stopped giving their support to other women (Chawla, 2000; Rich, 1979/2000). In addition, Daniel (2019) exposes the subtle robustness of racism in the academy by drawing attention to White faculty members' "failure or refusal to acknowledge our [Black female academic] presence on the campus except in specific contexts like meetings" which fuels an oppressive environment (p. 30). In fact, Daniel (2019) argues that:

> As increasing numbers of White women adopt leadership roles in the academy and have benefited from multiculturalism and inclusion policies, . . . [m]any of them have simply replaced White males as the power brokers and gatekeepers of the academy and there can be no presumption that their racist ideations are not present. The racist and exclusionary practices of White women are simply akin to patriarchy in dresses, pantsuits, and pumps. They can recognize that other women are marginalized or excluded, but they seldom explore the intersectional oppressions that, when layered, affect everyday life. As a result, their sentiments, concerns, and understanding of the processes and practices of marginalization seldom truly reflect the experiences of those who are racially marginalized and experience life in liminal spaces. (p. 32)

Daniel (2019) problematizes the relationship between White female academics and Black female academics to reveal the nuances, and multilayered challenges (which are additional hurdles) that are often taken for granted in academia based on the stance that both groups share a commonality of womanhood. This shared assumption of womanhood in the academy – without deconstructive

lens – masks the process of racializing female Blackness, and further undermines the Black female presence in this (presupposed) post-colonial era; while continuing to position White women as innocent in the discourse and practice of racism (Daniel, 2019).

Henry and Tator (2009a) highlight that "it is the inability or unwillingness to change the fundamental values and norms on which academia has traditionally been based that is at the heart of the continued disadvantage of racialized and aboriginal students and faculty" (p. 16). Thus racism is interwoven in the structures, values and policies of many Canadian universities (Abawi, 2018; Daniel, 2019; Dua & Bhanji, 2017a; Henry, 2015; Henry et al., 2017a, 2017b; Henry & Tator, 2009a; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019; James, 2009b, 2017; Smith et al., 2017). Hernandez-Ramdwar (2019), and Tamtik and Guenter (2019) demonstrate that Canadian universities are superficial and lacking in their response to support equity, diversity and inclusion (EDI) initiatives. According to Tamtik and Guenter (2019), "it is evident that policy decisions are still largely made by the university leadership, consisting of a privileged racial group [White Canadians]" (p. 47). As such, there are racial embedded issues associated with the hiring decisions in the academy such as focus on meeting the federal criteria as it relates to equity rather than a radical approach that seeks to subvert systemic structures (Tamtik & Guenter, 2019; Universities Canada, 2019). However, as the Canadian society becomes more diverse and pluralistic, the Eurocentric dominant learnings are challenged by different ways of knowing by the voices, experiences, and practices of racialized and Indigenous academics (Daniel, 2019; Henry & Tator, 2009a, 2012; Henry et al., 2017a) and racialized students (Hardy Cox & Strange, 2016), particularly Caribbean students (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019).

The critical examining of academic faculty job accessibility of Black women in Canadian universities is significant and essential in decloaking the discourse and structures of an

Eurocentric society. Ryan et al. (2009) emphasize that "countering the marginalization that people of colour face is for racialized people to occupy positions of influence, like teaching" (p. 595). However, Waterfield et al.'s (2019) study demonstrated that some Black academics from a working-class background "remained cultural outsiders in possession of the 'wrong' cultural capital – an otherness [that] intensified when class intersected with racialization" despite securing a tenured position in the Canadian professoriate (p. 385).

Waterfield et al. (2019) illustrate that "discourses around social mobility do little to trouble the structures of academia" in that many racialized academics from working class background still experience challenges integrating in the culture of academia despite being granted access in the academy (p. 370). Challenges such as lack of social capital, and how one's culture and class are perceived as insignificant to the dominant academic culture, position many racialized academics as outsiders (Bhopal et al., 2016; Waterfield et al., 2019) which complicates how racialized academics respond when in positions of influence; as well as, interrupt the idea of smooth transition or integration of racialized faculty members. In addition, James (2012) writes of the complexities involved in the experiences of racialized faculty members who are in seats of authority by virtue of their employment in academia. James (2012) identified compliance as one of the three strategies (compliance, pragmatism, and critical participation) that many racialized faculty members used to "establish themselves as part of their university faculty" (p. 138). Such compliance by some racialized faculty members were based on the "idea of their culture being a weakness (such as not knowing how to sell themselves)", and "downplaying any perceived differences between them and their colleagues" (James, 2012, p. 141). Thus, the value of cultural capital in Canadian academia "is embedded with notions of whiteness" (Waterfield et al., 2019, p. 370) – a barrier that restrains a sense of belonging for many Black academics; and is

exacerbated when “many academics of colour are so afraid of unsettling the illusory and fleeting moments of inclusion, that they dare not challenge [Whiteness]” (Daniel, 2018, p. 64). In other words, many racialized academics “simply [do] not want to rock the boat” because of concern for their tenure and promotion status (James, 2012, p. 150).

**Conclusion**

The review of the literature shows that the reception of racialized immigrants, particularly Black immigrants, in Canada is problematic. Importantly, the Canadian immigration point system which is used as one of the strategic tools to determine who is accepted into Canada negatively impacts the lives of many Black female immigrants in Canada. In particular, the lives of many African-Caribbean women with pre-migration PSE encounter racism in the Canadian academy, thus limiting or denying their access to seats of authority in the educational and labour market spheres (Senior, 2012). In addition, Black female immigrants who eventually access the professoriate are penalized by not only institutional and systemic racism but also individual racism (Daniel, 2018, 2019; Davis, 2018; Henry, 2015; Henry & Kobayashi, 2017; Henry et al., 2017a, 2017b; James, 2017; James & Chapman-Nyaho, 2017). Hence, the health of many Black academics and students are at risk (Daniel, 2018, 2019; Henry & Kobayashi, 2017; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019; James, 2017; James et al., 2010). Furthermore, the scholarship alludes to a lingering colonial effect of how Jamaicans perceive themselves, and how they are perceived by the Canadian society. This colonial cycle is maintained in various ways such as policies (Desai Trilokekar & El Masri, 2017; Dua & Bhanji, 2017a, 2017b; Henry et al., 2017a, 2017b; Henry & Tator, 2009a, 2009b; Hsiung & Nichol, 2010; James, 1995, 2008, 2009b, 2010, 2011, 2017; Scott et al., 2015); whose stories are told (Bobb-Smith, 2003; Davis, 2018; Henry, 1998, 2015; Hiraldo, 2010; James et al, 2010; Silvera, 1989); underrepresentation of Black people in

academia (Henry et al., 2017a, 2017b; James, 2017; James & Chapman-Nyaho, 2017; Ramos & Li, 2017; Smith, 2017); and inadequate support structures for Black immigrants (Daniel, 2018; Henry, 1994; Henry & Kobayashi, 2017; Scott et al., 2015; Waterfield et al., 2019; Wilton & Ross, 2017). Despite the given facts that racism continues to exist in Canada, the discourse of multiculturalism is used to camouflage the processes of racism. Nevertheless, many Black immigrants resist racism with the ideology of critical hope (James, 2009a, 2010; James et al., 2010). As such, my research is committed to filling the gap on the experiences of Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration graduate/post-graduate education in Canada to contribute to the voices and facts that call for significant changes in Canada for racialized people.

## Chapter Three: Theoretical Framework

### Introduction

Canada "operat[es] under a national myth of racial tolerance and inclusivity" (Nelson & Nelson, 2004, p. 3). As such, critical engagement of how "power is implicated" in Canadian history, institutions, and structures in this modern era is pivotal for Black women protecting themselves (Daniel, 2018, p. 62). Through the lens of Critical Race Theory (CRT), Critical Race Feminism (CRF), and Post-colonial Theory (PCT) my research deconstructs the complexities surrounding the experiences of resistance versus integration of adults seeking to legitimize their pre-migration credentials through post-migration education in Canada. Scholars such as Childers-McKee and Hytten (2015), Henry (2015), Henry et al. (2017a), James (2009a, 2017), and Ladson-Billings (1998, 2009) denote the importance of understanding the structures that influence the realities of Black women in education. Significantly, this research contributes Black immigrant women voices to the limited scholarship in Social Sciences; and the strengths of CRT, CRF, and PCT that not only theorize colonization in the academy (based on Black immigrant women's experiences) but also deconstruct the experiences of Black women students who are Jamaican immigrants and Jamaican Canadians by virtue of 'naturalized' citizenship to distinguish their pre- and post-migration PSE experience from those of Black women students who were either born in Canada or immigrated with no pre-migration PSE; thus, producing knowledge and providing advocacy for the participants.

Black women's bodies experience "gendered and racial violence and discrimination" in Canada, and is perceived as a disruption in (or threat to) a predominantly White professoriate (Daniel, 2018, p. 59). In order to expose how Black Jamaican women are coded and treated differently in academia, I draw on CRT, CRF, and PCT to penetrate the intersections of race,

gender, class, colonialism and immigration status to tease out the locations from which Black Jamaican women experience marginalization and/or racialization. Furthermore, the convergence of CRT, CRF, and PCT in this paper offers a deconstructive framework that disrupts the dominant discourse by unmasking systemic oppressions in the lives of Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration PSE. In this chapter, I highlight the suitability of CRT, CRF, and PCT for my research by situating the centrality of race and racism, storytelling, history and decolonization in relation to each theory, respectively; in that, "racism is not a fixed or static phenomenon[;] history and context are critically important to understanding racism's nuances and permutations" in the academy (Ledesma & Calderon, 2015, p. 215).

**Critical Race Theory**

CRT offers understanding of the roles of systemic institutional practices that impact educational decisions of many Black immigrant women. Having its roots in law, CRT not only posits to interrogate the perceived neutrality of social experiences of Black immigrant women but also theorizes the experiences of Black immigrant women as subordinate to the experiences of White experiences (Lazos Vargas, 2003). Parker and Lynn (2002) state that "Critical race theory, as a discourse of liberation, can be used as a methodological tool as well as a greater ontological and epistemological understanding of how race and racism affect the education and lives of the racially disenfranchised" (p. 7). With the use of CRT as one of the underpinning theoretical frameworks for my research, the lived experiences of Black Jamaican women are analyzed to unpack the impact of obtaining post-migration education in Canada. CRT supports me to analytically expose subtleties of racism, and the process of racialization that are taken for granted in the dominant group of society's discourse around equal employment. Furthermore, the history of racism in Canadian society continues to impact many Black immigrants,

particularly Black immigrant women, "because of pervasive denial of the very existence of racism in Canadian society" by the dominant group (Aylward, 1999, p. 40). CRT allows us to understand that although racism is a social construct, it has real negative consequences for people of African descent (Daniel, 2019; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019; James et al., 2010).

Katchanovski et al. (2015) emphasize that the data on issues of racism in Canada are "somewhat mixed" (p. 22), in that some scholars argue that racism is not persistent in Canada and that discrimination is not frequently experienced by many Canadian students and racialized academics (Bercusion et al., 1997; Grayson, 1995). Katchanovski et al.'s (2015) study demonstrates that "most Canadian respondents, regardless of their race, think that racial discrimination is not a problem" (p. 29). Similarly, James's (2012) study reveals that some racialized faculty members emphasize that "their race had nothing to do with their experiences" in academia (p. 138). However, the challenge of the persistent denial of racism in higher education, gives the illusion that when racism or discrimination does occur, it is an isolated incident. Isolating racism to individual takes away the attention from the processes of systemic racism.

Importantly, Henry and Tator (2009b) assert that:

> Critical race theory rejects the notion that racism is perpetuated by isolated and aberrant individuals and argues that racism is an endemic aspect of life in our [Canadian] society and that neutrality, objectivity, colour blindness, and meritocracy are all questionable constructs. (p. 39)

Through CRT lens, the process of racialization is exposed and named as a societal or institutional problem and not merely a remote incident of racism. CRT sheds light on the covert forms of systemic racism and the contributing impact of historical race in subordinating Black people in

Canada (Aylward, 1999; Daniel, 2019; Henry, 1998, 2015; Henry et al., 2017a; Henry & Kobayashi, 2017; James, 2012, 2017). Parker and Lynn (2002) demonstrate that CRT "serves an important role [in education] because the storytelling constitutes an integral part of historical and current legal evidence gathering and findings of fact in racial discrimination litigation" (p. 10). As such, CRT not only empowers the voices of the participants but it also values the experiences of Black immigrant women. Counter-storytelling – one of the five tenets of CRT, exposes the dominant discourse and racial trajectories in higher education (Arday, 2018; DeCuir & Dixson, 2004; Hiraldo, 2010) that maintain an oppressive environment for many Black women. Parker and Lynn (2002) also highlight that "linking CRT to education can indeed foster the connections of theory to practice and activism on issues related to race" (p. 18). Thus not only interrogating and theorizing the role of racism pertaining to the lived experiences of many Black immigrant women but also creating a space for solutions and advantageous impact. Essentially, race is at the centre of a research that employs a CRT framework (Arday, 2018; Childers-McKee & Hytten, 2015; Henry, 2015; James, 2017; Lazos Vargas, 2003) which is intricately woven with an intersectionality lens (Crenshaw, 1989; Delgado, 2011).

It is noteworthy to understand that "critical race theory narratives and storytelling provide readers with a challenging account of preconceived notions of race, and the stories are sometimes integral to developing cases that consist of legal narratives of racial discrimination" (Parker & Lynn, 2002, p. 11). Thus, counter-narratives "support the permanence of racism" in the Canadian society (Hiraldo, 2010, p. 54). In particular, the permanence of racism - "which is the second tenet of CRT" is illuminated in academia in light of Black immigrant female academics and students sharing their stories of racial encounters (Hiraldo, 2010, p. 54). Furthermore, the permanence of racism in higher education demonstrates that racism is inherent

in educational structures that influence how the curricula is created, how policies are made and enacted, and who is privileged (Arday, 2017, 2018; Daniel, 2019; DeCuir & Dixson, 2004; Hiraldo, 2010; Ladson-Billings, 1998; Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995).

As the third tenet of CRT – "Whiteness as property" (Hiraldo, 2010, p. 55) – exposes the historical and current trends of privilege and access that the predominant group in the academy is allotted (DeCuir & Dixson, 2004; Hiraldo, 2010; Ladson-Billings, 1998; Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995). That is, higher education is perceived by the dominant group as their right to have access and control over education, thereby, excluding or limiting entry to non-White people in PS institutions which positions them as less valuable (Arday, 2018; Daniel, 2019; Henry et al., 2017a; Henry & Tator, 2009a, 2009b; Hiraldo, 2010; Ladson-Billings, 1998). As such, "interest convergence" – the fourth tenet of CRT (Hiraldo, 2010, p. 56) reveals how the dominant group in the academy continues to benefit more than others through accessing positions of authority, funding, and dissemination of Eurocentric programs (Arday, 2018; Bell, 1980; Daniel, 2019; Ladson-Billings, 1998). In addition, the role of meritocracy is created in the interest of White academics and students (Bhopal et al., 2016; Gillborn, 2015; Shain, 2012; Stockfelt, 2018); in that, CRT sheds light on the fact that Western academic standards are not fixed to result in equal treatment for everyone (Turner, 2015). So, the expectation for the predominant group in academia is different from those that are anticipated for racialized academics and students.

The "critique of liberalism" – the fifth tenet of CRT, disrupts the notion of colour-blindness (Hiraldo, 2010, p. 56). According to James (2009a), CRT is:

> grounded in the realities of racial minorities' lived experiences with racism and as such rejects the colour-blind approach to politics and legal regulations which on the one hand are expected to address oppressive situations of people of colour, but on the other hand

simultaneously function to oppress. (p. 93)

Most importantly, CRT examines and deconstructs systemic structures in the Canadian labour market by identifying and analyzing the social and economic conditions that impact the lives of Black immigrant women. CRT helps to deconstruct racism on multiple levels such as individually, institutionally and structurally (Henry et al., 2017a; James, 2017; James et al., 2010) to examine taken for granted notions to expose how these ideologies reinforce social injustices (Daniel, 2019; James, 2008; James et al., 2010). With incorporating the voices of some Black Jamaican women, this research demonstrates the various impacts of attaining post-migration education in Canada. Hence "connections [are] made in educational research through the use of narratives in critical race theory" to deconstruct the lived experiences of Black immigrant women (Parker & Lynn, 2002, p. 18).

Aylward (1999) pinpoints deconstruction as a core component of CRT, one that supports the research to critically analyze legal rules, principles and policies in addition to "challeng[ing] the so-called neutrality and objectivity of laws that oppress people of colour" (p. 34). Analyzing the experiences of Black Jamaican women with post migration education in Canada in relation to reviewed scholarship on educational based immigration law and policy such as the Canadian points system and the regulatory of foreign credentials is of utmost importance to understanding subtle systemic structures that aim to further marginalize many Black immigrant women. Banerjee (2008) reveals that "examining individuals' perceptions allows us to explore the subjective side of discrimination [and that] perceptions do characterize reality for those who report it and therefore have real consequences for workers and employers" (p. 381). As a useful theoretical tool, CRT also employs reconstruction as its final methodological stage that advocates for solutions that advance the cause of people of colour (Aylward, 1999). As such, the

role of CRT in this research seeks to identify and analyze hidden systemic structures in addition to providing alternatives and solutions to enhance the cause of Black Jamaican women with pre- and post migration education in Canada.

**Critical Race Feminism**

As a race-based epistemology, CRT also partially relies on other interpretive frameworks such as critical race feminism (CRF) to unveil the objective nature of systemic structures (Berry, 2005, 2009; Childers-McKee & Hytten, 2015; Clark & Saleb, 2019; Henry et al., 2017a; Parker, 2003). CRF emerges as an imperative theoretical framework "because mainstream feminism has overlooked the fact that White supremacy and dominance affects women of colour" (Aylward, 1999, p. 35). Emerging specifically out of legal studies and CRT, CRF demonstrates the intersectionality of race, gender and class at work in the lives of many Black women (Annamma & Winn, 2019; Berry, 2005, 2009; Childers-McKee & Hytten, 2015; Clark & Saleb, 2019; Collins, 2008; Crenshaw, 1991; Daniel, 2018; Henry, 2015; Henry et al., 2017a; Few, 2007; James et al., 2010). The dominant group's construction of Black women as "the angry Black woman; as the welfare queen . . . and always as the strong Black woman" juxtapose with "seldom[ly] regarded as brilliant, beautiful, engaging, caring, warm or vulnerable" (Daniel, 2018, p. 59) in the academy serves as a vicious oppressive cycle. Hence the relevance for a CRF lens to examine Black women's experiences in PSE.

With focus on the subordination of women, CRF unpacks the experiences of immigrant Black women (Lazos Vargas, 2003). In other words, CRF puts the experiences of women of colour at the forefront rather than the outskirts as well as acknowledges the distinctiveness of their experience from those of men of colour and White women (Berry, 2005, 2009; Clark & Saleb, 2019; Wing, 1997). Furthermore, understanding the multiple roles of Black Jamaican

women also sheds light on how decisions are influenced regarding pursuit of post-migration education in Canada. Scholars such as Crenshaw (1991, 1993), DeReus et al. (2005), and Few (2007) reveal that the interest of critical race feminists is how domestic and international legal and social policies such as education and welfare in addition to immigration, assist or oppress racial women and their families.

According to Razack et al. (2010):

> Critical race feminism . . . interrogates questions about race and gender through a critical-emancipatory lens, posing fundamental questions about the persistence . . . of race . . . in the twenty-first century about racialized gendered relations in ostensibly race- and gender- neutral liberal state. (pp. 9-10)

Through critical-emancipatory lens, CRF seeks to decode the intersectionality of race and gender by revealing the interlocking systems of asymmetrical power and racial oppression experienced by many Indigenous peoples and Black people in Canada – a white settler society (Razack et al., 2010). Importantly, Razack et al. (2010) emphasize that "a feminism that failed to recognize the impact of settler colonialism, one that focused on equality without addressing issues of sovereignty, for example, was not a useful solution" (p. 4). Thus CRF offers more than just a feministic conceptual framework that allows scholars to consciously interrogate a white settler society such as Canada - that seemingly portrays itself as diverse and inclusive - to draw attention to the ongoing cycle of racism in order to reveal how Canada's colonial history continues to negatively impact the lives of many Indigenous peoples and Black people.

Monture (2010) highlights that "the way race knowledge is organized in Canadian educational systems makes us realize that the right race knowledge is white and white is normal" (p. 24). CRF is not only systemic in disrupting the rhetoric of race neutrality in Canada but it

also provides a transformative mechanism that "offers [counter] narratives of cultural wealth and assets that can be drawn on to transform communities" (Childers-McKee & Hytten, 2015, p. 396). That said, CRF offers an emancipatory lens to not only understand the experiences of Black Jamaican women in a white settler society but that it also empowers the participants' narratives as they talk back (Hooks, 1989/2000) to the dominant stories of Canadian history and break the silence as they "reclaim humanity in a system that gains part of its strength by objectifying Black women" (Collins, 1998/2000, p. 36).

**Post-colonial Theory**

Post-colonial lens draw attention to the fact that racism still lingers, and is practiced in Canada through various forms such as institutional racism, structural racism and informal racism (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019; Kerner, 2017; Nelson & Nelson, 2004). Crossley and Tikly (2004) attest that PCT investigates the "colonial legacy and its aftermath" between formerly colonized countries such as Jamaica, and Western countries such as Canada to expose the continuing impact of colonialism on the lives of Black Jamaican women (p. 148). Furthermore, Nelson and Nelson (2004) argue that "post-colonialism [. . .] functions dominantly as a theoretical and conceptual description of a set of practice or means of engagement that are consciously politicized and antagonistic to the colonial" (p. 7). As such, PCT stresses the multiple dimensions through which Black women experience social injustices, and imbalance power relations to reveal the hypocrisy of a white settler society (Kerner, 2017). Importantly, PCT is critical to the understanding that the ways in which Western societies such as Canada perceives Black women as inferior influence the ways in which Black women are constructed and treated 'differently' from the dominant group (Ashcroft et al., 2000, 2007, 2013; Bakan & Stasiulis, 1995; Fanon, 1961; Henry, 1998).

Loomba (1998) highlights the necessity to understand post-colonialism as flexible to contesting of and legacies of national domination and not just a literal state of being after colonialism. According to Nelson and Nelson (2004), "post-colonialism describes a type of critical intervention and location that focuses on issues of racial identity and is engaged in the scrutiny and understanding of colonialism as the governing structure of racial marginalization and oppression" (p. 8). Thus the importance of integrating post-colonial concerns throughout Canadian PS institution structures to not only disrupt the dominance of Eurocentric knowledge and oppressive structures but also to call upon Canadian academia to listen to the voices of Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration education in order to achieve the goal of "fostering meaningful communication" and real inclusivity in the Canadian society (McLeod, 2011, p. 186).

Stein and Andreotti (2016) illustrate that "the West is understood to be at the top of a global hierarchy of humanity with the rest of the world trailing behind. This hierarchy positions Western higher education as a desirable product in the global higher education market" that undermines education from the Global South to be perceived as less desirable and less potent (p. 226). Employing a PCT lens in this study helps to analyze and make known the "legacy of colonialism [that] continues to frame the practices and characteristics" of Western PS institutions (Arday, 2018, p. 141). In addition, PCT unearth the nuances surrounding how Black immigrant women experience and perceive higher education from the Global North versus the Global South to contextualize and reveal the tensions of a shared post-colonial history between Jamaica and Canada as "former colonies of the United Kingdom" (Hepburn & Coloma, 2019, p. 51); yet resulting in different experiences that highlight how Black Jamaican women are recomposed in a white settler nation-state. That is, "postcolonial countries and their contexts are not all the same.

When postcolonial racialized diasporic subjects move or migrate to a white settler colonial state like Canada, they enter new colonial systems of prejudices which they have to navigate" (Hepburn & Coloma, 2019, p. 52).

**Conclusion**

It is imperative for stakeholders in higher education to acknowledge systemic racism within educational institutions in order to make diversity action plans effective (Arday, 2018; Childers-McKee & Hytten, 2015; Henry et al., 2017a; Hiraldo, 2010; Iverson, 2007; James, 2012, 2017; Ladson-Billings, 1998, 2009; McLeod, 2011). Through the narratives of Black Jamaican women for this research, the analytical framework of CRT, CRF, and PCT sheds light on the unequal practices of hiring, and the overt and covert barriers that confront Black Jamaican women in their efforts to gain access to higher education and professoriate jobs in academia. Based on the fact that CRT examines patterns of exclusion (Hiraldo, 2010; Parker & Villalpando, 2007), my research critically examines the experiences of Black Jamaican women from their perspective in order to reveal the impact that higher education institutions have on the lives of African-Caribbean women in Ontario; and the post-colonial impact of immigration. Additionally, "the various tenets of CRT [counter-storytelling; the permanence of racism; Whiteness as property; interest conversion; and the critique of liberalism are] used to uncover the ingrained societal disparities that support a system of privilege and oppression" (Hiraldo, 2010, p. 54). As such, my research contributes to the dearth of qualitative data on the intersectionality of racism and the experiences of Black Jamaican women who desired to work in Canadian PS institutions. Furthermore, Hiraldo (2010) attests that "the use of counter-stories in analyzing higher education's climate provides faculty, staff, and students of colo[u]r a voice to tell their narratives involving marginalized experiences" (p. 54). As aforementioned, counter-narrative is

integral to the theoretical frameworks that inform this study.

# Chapter Four: Methodology

## Research Design

Research can have positive or negative implications on marginalized populations. Thus, one's research methodology should be carefully chosen and assessed in order to eliminate or minimize any adverse effects. My study uses phenomenological qualitative research with these ethical considerations in mind.

Lichtman (2013) emphasizes that the purpose of phenomenological qualitative research is to "describe and understand the essence of lived experiences of individuals who have experienced a particular phenomenon" (p. 83). This study used a phenomenological methodology to investigate with care, attention and understanding, the profound experiences of a small sample of Black Jamaican women who attained graduate and post-graduate education in Ontario despite having either their pre-migration graduate or post-graduate education. The theoretical lenses used in this study endorsed a phenomenological research in that Black female immigrant experiences and historical relations were compulsory components for a deeper understanding of how racism, classism, sexism and colonialism manifest in the twenty-first century. In fact, Critical race theory (CRT), and Critical race feminism (CRF) were "especially appropriate to the conduct" of a phenomenological qualitative research with the researcher as an insider (Breen, 2007, p. 164). The methodological approach I have taken to the collection, synthesis and analysis of data involved an overlapping with narrative analysis (Roulston, 2014) in order to enhance my interpretation and representation of the participants' narratives with transparency and nuance.

Eberle (2014) claims that phenomenology is a complex philosophy that contributes to not just data interpretation but is intrinsically interwoven throughout the entire research process.

Furthermore, "qualitative research is based on fundamental assumptions of phenomenology . . . in that research examines the life world as experienced by humans" (Roulston, 2014, p. 302). I chose a phenomenological qualitative research design because the lived experiences of many Black Jamaican women who have pre-migration and post-migration post-graduate education in Canada are complex and need to be heard and well-represented, in addition to contributing to social justice in Canadian PS institutions (Roulston, 2014). That is to say, their narratives call for a positive change that intervenes in and erodes racist structures, attitudes, and processes in academia. Thus, reinforcing the core tenants of CRT, CRF, and Post-colonial theory (PCT). These narratives interrogate the possibilities for greater accessibility of Black Jamaican women when choosing to work in the Canadian professoriate.

Flood (2010) states that "the epistemology of phenomenology focuses on revealing meaning rather than on arguing a point or developing abstract theory" (p. 2). Framed through CRT, CRF, and PCT, I point to structural and social barriers as complicity with Black Jamaican women's experiences of pursuing post-migration education in Canada (Creswell, 2013; Eberle, 2014). Understanding the barriers is not enough. What is needed is more engagement with how these barriers are experienced in the educational lives of women and how they impact on their future desires to pursue work in the university. These lenses also support me to understand how Canadian society contributes to maintaining of structural and social inequity particularly when marginalized groups obtain high levels of education by preventing them from entering into their chosen professions post-migration or by denying the significance and credentialism of their pre-migration education (Creswell, 2013; Denzin & Lincoln, 2011; Eberle, 2014; Kim, 2016).

With a phenomenological qualitative research design underpinned with CRT and CRF theoretical frameworks, I was keenly sensitized to the power imbalances that exist between the

researcher and the participants (Breen, 2007; Creswell, 2013). Critical frameworks attuned me to shifts in power and to achieve a sense of shared power between myself and the participants during the research process. My respect for the voices and values of the participants' stories regardless if the participants' stories were not necessarily focused on the phenomenon of interest for this study was critical to eliciting women's voices (Creswell, 2013; Roulston, 2014). In doing this, I acknowledged the complexities in eliciting narratives for this research (Scheurich, 1995; Watson, 2012) and that power struggles contribute to the shaping of one's reality (Creswell, 2013; Denzin & Lincoln, 2011). Thus the epistemological stance of a phenomenological qualitative research allows me to understand the lived experiences (Creswell, 2013; Denzin & Lincoln, 2011; Eberle, 2014) of many racialized immigrant women in Canada.

According to Willig (2014), "all forms of phenomenological research are committed to staying very close to the text that is being analyzed, ensuring that it is the participant's account (rather than the researcher's theoretical framework or hypotheses) which drives the interpretation" (p. 143). Hence the suitability of using a phenomenological qualitative research for my study in that it allowed me to understand from the participants' perspective (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000) how racism impacted their lives, and how they navigated (and continue to navigate) this challenge.

My critical reflexivity during the process (Creswell, 2013; Denzin & Lincoln, 2011) enforces the methodological soundness of my representations of the women's voices. Eberle (2014) suggests that reflexivity and methodology go hand in hand in a phenomenological research. In keeping with a phenomenological qualitative research design, I engaged in a reflexive practice by constantly putting my ideological, theoretical and methodological assumptions (Cornish et al., 2014), such as my presupposition of racism in Canadian PS

institutions, under investigation (May & Perry, 2014; Patton, 2002). I felt it was important to question any taken for granted perspectives (Cornish et al., 2007, 2014) to ensure transparency and openness to unexpected findings (Cornish et al., 2014) throughout the research process (Roulston, 2014).

The remainder of this chapter is organized into seven sections to provide a detailed account about: participants; recruitment methods; research methods; data collection; data analysis and findings; limitations of methods; ethical concerns; and conclusion.

**Participants**

I sought consent from nine eligible Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration education in the Greater Toronto Area within the age range of 30 – 55 years. This age group was of particular interest because "nearly half of recent immigrants are in the prime working age group of 25 – 44 years" when they arrive in Canada (Orme, 2007, p. 75). Girard (2010) defines pre-migration education as the highest form of formal education received outside Canada; and post-migration education as enrolment in the first educational program that leads to a diploma or degree.

For the purpose of this study, I interviewed nine Black Jamaican women who had completed and obtained post-migration post-graduate qualifications at various Canadian PS institutions despite their pre-migration PSE. These women either held or did not hold a faculty teaching job. Interviewing participants who are teaching and not teaching in academia was critical importance for my research in order to draw attention to the complexities surrounding their desire to work in their field of study, particularly in the professoriate role. By examining the phenomenon of Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration post-graduate education with desires to work to obtain a faculty position in the Canadian university, I was able

to stay close to the phenomenon of wanting to work in the academy from various standpoints (Willig, 2014). My interviews thus provide a holistic study of the journey of some Black Jamaican women who obtained post-migration PSE in Canada.

Consistent with many research studies, nine participants fall within the recommended number of participants that one might use for a phenomenological research (Creswell, 1998; Guest, Bunce, & Johnson, 2006; Morse, 1994; Sandelowski, 1995). This research was locally conducted in the Greater Toronto Area to capture the stories of lived experiences of a demographic living with a particular geographical location within Canada.

Participants were recruited through snowball sampling – a technique that allows research to connect with "participants' social networks to access specific populations" (Browne, 2005, p. 47). Notably, as a current Black Jamaican female graduate student attending one of the prominent universities in Toronto with a diverse student population that is uniquely located in a multicultural urban immigrant community, this particular university was an ideal starting place for me to find potential participants for this research by locating and asking information-rich key informants (Creswell, 2007; Patton, 1990, 2002). To mitigate "position of power over or conflict of interest" (Petillion et al., 2017, p. 144) pertaining to professors and student associations getting in contact with former graduate students for my study, a flyer with my research participant criteria was circulated electronically with emphasis that there was no obligation for former graduate students to respond if they did not want to participate.

CRT endorses a narrative or storytelling approach (Aylward, 1999), that gives the participants power to share their voices throughout the research process. Each participant and I agreed on a suitable time and date that we could meet for one individual interview - a dominant process of a qualitative study (Farber, 2006) - in a public space such as the community library.

However, there were some interviews that were done via telephone for the participants' convenience in light of the fact that they had extremely hectic schedules but wanted to participate. As mentioned, consent was received from all participants before I proceeded with conducting the interviews. The process of getting and securing the consent of the participants and the data are further explained in the procedure section.

**Instrumentation**

Interviews – the most often used tool for collecting data for the social sciences (Al-Yateem, 2012; Elliot, 2012; Holstein & Gubrium, 1995), are useful instruments to gather descriptions of how participants construct meaning of their lived experiences, and their interpretation of how they perceive the society and how the society perceives them (Esin et al., 2014; Mishler, 1986; Roulston, 2014). Archer and Berdahl (2011) emphasize that "qualitative analyses employ open-ended questionnaires, interviews, and coding techniques" (p. 131).

I conducted in-depth interviews to give space and time to participants to share (Elliot, 2012). These interviews lasted anywhere between forty-five to ninety minutes – an appropriate length of time (Elliot, 2012; Hermanowicz, 2002; Seidman, 1998), for participants to provide concrete examples of their experience. Although "interviewing as a context is a rich source for narrative analysis" (Esin et al., 2014, p. 210), it is imperative to recognize the complexities involved between the interviewer and the interviewee's interaction (Elliott, 2012; Esin et al., 2014; Mishler, 1986) that results in a co-construction of meaning-making between the researcher and the respondents (Esin et al., 2014; Mishler, 1986; Phoenix, 2008; Roulston, 2014). With this in mind, I did not "impose a rigid structure on the interview" (Elliot, 2012, p. 286) but instead, opted to use simple open-ended questions. These questions related to their lived experiences (Chase, 1995; Elliot, 2012; Patton, 2002; Petillion et al., 2017), and encouraged the participants

to freely share their stories. Significantly, asking the participants to feel at liberty to speak their voice (whether in Jamaican English or Jamaican Patois or both languages) created a shift in power (Cortazzi & Jin, 2012; Mishler, 1986) allowing the participants' "to hold the floor" (Cortazzi & Jin, 2012, p. 477) with little to no interruption from me (Elliot, 2012; Mishler, 1986; Thompson, 1978).

Archer and Berdahl (2011) explain that "qualitative research is less structured than quantitative research, which allows the researcher to explore the subtleties of individual beliefs or group dynamics" (p. 125). Through the lens of a qualitative approach, infused with relatable interview questions (see Appendix A), I was able to further examine additional dynamics and beliefs of the participants that were not anticipated yet relevant to the research topic. Thus, in addition to me asking the right questions (Elliot, 2012), and being a good listener which helps with producing narratives (Elliot, 2012; Mishler, 1986; Thompson, 1978) in order to have an effective interview outcome, I also ensured that the interview questions were not overly centered on my research interest (Elliot, 2012; Hollway & Jefferson, 2000). This gave me the opportunity to examine, respect and value the participants' beliefs as they spoke at length on some topics relating to their social and family interest that spun off from some of the interview questions.

The infusing of theoretical frameworks - CRT, CRF, and PCT, in my questioning helped me to unpack the experiences of the racialized participants in this study. I was able to lift up through my questioning systemic and underlining nuances that contribute to racial discrimination. Through my open ended yet informed questioning, interviews provided a kind of forum for participants to share their stories about the impact of obtaining post-migration education in Canada, and the accessibility of faculty teaching jobs.

To collect and document interview data, I used a digital audio recorder. Scholars such as

Al-Yateem (2012) and Farber (2006) attest to the usefulness of recording interviews in a qualitative research - an important part of the interview process, to capture as much data as possible. Moreover, a digital recorder is not only valuable for collecting data but also for providing a basis for validity and credibility (Al-Yateem, 2012; Groenewald, 2004). Thus contributing to the truth-value (Groenewald, 2004; Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Schurink et al., 1998) and rigor (Breen, 2007) of my phenomenological study. During the recording of the interviews, I had the opportunity to give the participants my undivided attention that would have otherwise been distracted by constant note taking (Elliot, 2012; Hermanowicz, 2002).

**Procedure**

Research ethics boards at Canadian PS institutions are responsible to review and approve research projects involving humans to minimize harm to participants, and promote inclusivity (Petillion et al., 2017; Ralefala, Ali, Kass, & Hyder, 2018). As a mandatory and essential procedure, I applied to my respective educational institution for approval for my research project before eliciting consent from interested participants. In adhering to the institutionalized questioning about the ethical procedure of my research (Giraud, Cioffo, de Lettenhove, & Chaves, 2019), I used the publicly available informed consent template (Curran et al., 2019) from my educational institution's website to construct my informed consent letter – an integral part of research ethics (Colnerud, 2015; Walby & Luscombe, 2018) that details "respect for privacy and confidentiality" (Petillion et al., 2017, p. 140) for the participants (see Appendix B for the informed consent letter). My research ethics application was approved in March 2018.

After the approval, I emailed a few professors from my former and current educational institutions, and two associations - a graduate student association and the Jamaican Canadian association, requesting their assistance to circulate my research flyer within their networks. In

addition to the snowballing technique, I used social media – an effective strategy – for recruiting hard to reach participants for my study (Kapp, Peters, & Oliver, 2013; O'Connor, Jackson, Goldsmith, & Skirton, 2014; Petillion et al., 2017; Ryan, 2013). Social media was helpful as many Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration post-graduate education would have limited to no contact with their former academic institutions (Petillion et al., 2017) and associations. As such, for three months, the research flyer was shared on my Whatsapp and Facebook platforms to reach potential candidates. Ten participants showed interest in participating in my research. However, one of the ten candidates did not proceed with participating in my research due to ineligibility of not meeting the criteria of arriving in Canada with a pre-migration PSE.

The nine Black Jamaican women were given informed consent letters, and "had the opportunity to withdraw at any time without consequence or to choose not to answer any of the interview questions" (Petillion et al., 2017, p. 145). Notably, obtaining informed consent from these Black Jamaican women is another tangible evidence of dismantling power imbalance between the researcher and the participants. Refusal to participate also tells researchers much about the effects that research can have on some groups (Gray et al., 2017). Through informed consent, the nine participants were assured of privacy and confidentiality (Cragoe, 2019). Participants were assured that their identity would remain anonymous throughout the research process (Petillion et al., 2017).

Once the informed consent letters were signed and returned to me, each participant and I met either in person or by telephone on an agreed time and date in the venue of the participant's choice. The interviews consisted of nineteen questions. They ranged in length from 45 to 90 minutes. I anticipated this range in times because as, Elliot (2012) confirms, "it is unlikely that

every participant will produce the same number or quality of narratives in response to the same research interview" (p. 295). With the participants' informed consent, each interview was recorded. Engaging in a reflexive practice, I remained open and flexible to the participants' stories throughout the interview process (Thornberg & Charmaz, 2014).

**Data Analysis**

As this research is primarily interested in the content of the participants' narratives (Willig, 2014) my analytical focus was on the "experiences that lies behind the talk" (Elliot, 2012, p. 294). Scholars such as Cortazzi and Jin (2012), Esin et al. (2014), and Roulston (2014) encourage researchers to understand that there is no one size fit all method and analysis for research; rather, one should flirt with the data (Kim, 2016) in order to arrive with the most suitable analysis and interpretation approach to make meaning of the narratives. Furthermore, when analyzing the data, one has to keep in mind that the content is theoretically informed through the lens in which it is viewed (Roulston, 2014; Willig, 2014). Although it is necessary to have a theoretical lens or perspective on the data, I was mindful as I engaged with the data that my "initial perspective may [have] prove[n] to be inadequate to making sense of the account and [that] it w[ould] then be the account itself which w[ould] continue to challenge and shape [my] research's interpretation of it" (Willig, 2014, p. 143). Additionally, the analysis and the interpretation of the data are important to understand how participants perceive "themselves, to their surroundings, to their lives and lived experiences" (Kim, 2016, p. 189). Thus the importance of me having an open and attentive approach (Riessman & Quinney, 2005; Watson, 2012) while summoning and analyzing the data.

Of the three voices – the researcher's authoritative voice, the researcher's supportive voice, and the researcher's interactive voice – that are used in a narrative analysis (Chase, 2005;

Esin et al., 2014), my research employed a researcher's supportive voice and a researcher's interactive voice. My intent was to lift up the voices in the narratives of these nine Black Jamaican women, as well as to acknowledge and examine the complexities surrounding my own voice in relation to that of the research respondents. In order to analyse the content of the narratives, the interviews were transcribed (Kowal & O'Connell, 2014) and each participant was assigned a pseudonym. As I repeatedly listened to the recording to transcribe the interviews, I not only paid close attention to the ways the participants shared their stories but also examined their sarcastic laughs, long pauses and frustrations – a technique that goes beyond "basic content analysis" (Cortazzi & Jin, 2012, p. 477) to capture the realities of their lived experiences.

Interview transcription is an integral part of a narrative analysis (Esin et al., 2014; Roulston, 2014). Riessman (2002) cautions that it should not be the only focus of analysis. Transcribing involves multiple processes (Esin et al., 2014; Riessman, 1993) to open up the data to multiple viewpoints and interpretation. I completed the initial draft of the entire interviews (Riessman, 1993), then re-transcribed the interviews (Esin et al., 2014; Riessman, 1993) to narrow the gaze – a co-construction – on utterances deemed essential for the research (Roulston, 2014; Watson, 2012). Importantly, how the transcribed text is structured based on what is included or excluded, impacts how the research findings are analyzed (Esin et al., 2014; Roulston, 2014) and perceived by the reader (Esin et al., 2014; Riessman, 1993). To ensure the integrity of the interviews, Roulston (2014) demonstrates that "by transcribing sequences of interview interaction in detail, it is possible to examine how speakers accomplish mutual understanding, and manage disagreement and interactional problems" (p. 300).

Narrative analysis involves interpretation, in that, they work together (Kim, 2016; Watson, 2012). As such, my research employed an empathic approach (Wiilig, 2014), also

called an interpretation of faith (see Kim, 2016), to make sense of the participants' narratives. In doing that, I " . . . illuminat[ed] that which present[ed] itself by paying special attention to its features and qualities, by making connections between [narratives] and by noticing patterns and relationships" (Willig, 2014, p. 138) to highlight the intersectionalities of race, class and gender that impacted the decision of these Black Jamaican women to obtain post-migration PSE in Canada. With an empathic interpretative approach that "benefits from being carried out collaboratively" (Willig, 2014, p. 139), I was neither complacent nor ignorant of the differences between myself and the participants (Watson, 2009, 2012) as I engaged with the data. In other words, I did not take it for granted that my engagement in the co-construction of the narratives simply implied that there was a shared meaning or interpretation between myself and the respondents (Watson, 2012). Hence the significance of involving the participants in getting their feedback pertaining to the respective research results (Curran et al., 2019) to ensure the validity and authenticity of the interpretation of the data.

Cortazzi and Jin (2012) write that researchers ought to choose methods that are well suited for the particular needs of their respective researches which may involve the combination of two or more methods of analyses. In conjunction with a narrative analysis, I also drew on a thematic analysis in this study. Significantly, the use of a thematic analysis – a categorizing strategy to capture meaning and demonstrates relationships between concepts (Archer & Berdahl, 2011; Ayres, 2008; Maxwell & Chmiel, 2013; Willig, 2014), and a narrative analysis that illustrates "how people story their lives" (Esin et al., 2014, p. 203), helped my research to contextualize the participants' experiences in migration and work histories from Jamaica to other parts of the world before arriving to Canada. Thus aiding a comprehensive transnational understanding of the participant-journeys' of work. Finally, the stories of the participants were

analyzed in relation to the concepts/tenants of CRT, CRF and PCT to reveal the (limited) changes that took place regarding the social and economical mobilities of Black Jamaican women who obtained post migration post-graduate education with the desire to teach in Canadian higher education institutions.

Notwithstanding the tensions surrounding how themes are taken up and the implications of those decisions, that is to say, the multiplicity involved concerning how the researcher approaches the analysis of the themes (Willig, 2014), I stayed reflexively aware (Cortazzi & Jin, 2012; Patton, 2002; Watson, 2012) while analyzing the data as an insider (Bonner & Tolhurst, 2002; Breen, 2007). As also a Black Jamaican woman with pre-and post-migration post-graduate education in Canada. I wanted to avoid, as much as possible projection on or exploitation of the data (Hendry, 2007; Watson, 2012). In doing that, I not only acknowledged that my researcher social and cultural positioning (Esin et al., 2014), and theoretical positioning (Elliot, 2012) as contributing to my interpretation of the narratives, but I also take into account the power relations that existed between the narratives, the data and the researcher (Chase, 2005; Breen, 2007; Esin et al., 2014; Watson, 2012). With a hyper-reflexive approach I strove to keep my interpretation in check to maintain research rigor (Breen, 2007).

The stages through which I analyzed my data were data reduction, data reorganization, and interpretation and representation (Roulston, 2014). Roulston (2014) attests that "in phenomenological traditions, researchers reduce data by eliminating repetitive statements and data irrelevant to the phenomenon being examined" (p. 304). During the data reduction phase - I searched the initial transcription for terms that the participants commonly used in the interviews. I used codes to classify and label events/narratives into pertinent categories (Charmaz, 2006; Kowal & O'Connell, 2014; Roulston, 2014; Thornberg & Charmaz, 2014) such as *pull factors to*

*Canada*, *classism*, *sexism*, *inequitable experience*, *silencing*, *and hopefulness* that assisted me in the re-transcribing of the data – reducing the narratives from my initial transcription. Notably, "by coding, researchers scrutinize and interact with the data as well as ask analytical questions of the data" (Thornberg & Charmaz, 2014, p. 156). Engaging in reflexivity, and questioning (Breen, 2007) my preconceive assumptions about racism in Canadian PS institutions aided my openness to what the data was revealing (Charmaz, 2006; Roulston, 2014). This key component of qualitative research assisted me with creating codes to fit what was happening in the data, rather than coercing the data to fit the (preconceive) codes (Glaser, 1978; Thornberg & Charmaz, 2014).

In the data reorganization phase – an iterative process – I used focus coding (Roulston, 2014; Thornberg & Charmaz, 2014) to decipher the content that was meaningful to present the phenomenon of interest. I read and reread all the codes in order to become overly familiar with the content (Charmaz, 2006; Roulston, 2014; Watson, 2012) and collapse compatible codes accordingly. While doing focus coding and reflecting on the narratives, I employed a thematic analysis approach to help with identifying patterns and making meaning across the nine interviews (Archer & Berdahl, 2011; Petillion et al., 2017; Vaismoradi, Turunen, & Bondas, 2013).

Themes such as *Tailoring Plans to Fit*, *Racism*, and *Spirituality* emerged from the data as a signifier of particular headings and sub-headings to be analyzed and interpreted in depth. This reinforced my approach to systematically identify and group data information (on a Microsoft Word table) based on the common terms and themes that emerged (Kim, 2016) as well as group the information that did not have any commonality in order to present a holistic finding of my research. Importantly, in this stage, I checked for any discrepancy between my "preliminary

ideas about the topic of study" and what the data was showing (Roulston, 2014, p. 304).

In the interpretation and representation stage, I decided on the themes and narratives that would be taken directly from the interview transcripts (Roulston, 2014). Kim (2016) exemplifies that "as qualitative researchers go through this data analysis process several times, they will . . . provide an interpretation of the findings in light of the literature and their theoretical perspectives" (p. 188). Throughout the process, I was cognizant of the fact that through analyzing and interpreting the data, in addition to representing the findings, another narrative was produced (Cortazzi & Jin, 2012; Smith & Sparkes, 2008; Watson, 2012) which was generated from my interpretation of the data in relation to what the participants told me (Currie, 1998). To address the nuances surrounding shared understanding of narratives and interactions (Kim, 2016; Polkinghorne, 1988; Scheurich, 1995; Watson, 2012), I sought for clarification and feedback from the participants (Breen, 2007; Clandinin & Connelly, 2000; Cortazzi & Jin, 2012; Groenewald, 2004; Lincoln & Guba, 1985) to enforce credibility and confirmability of the research.

Curran et al. (2019) establish that distributing "individual research results" to the respective participants is one of the various ways in which feedback is shared between the researcher and the informants (p. 24). As such, my research findings were shared accordingly with the respective participants for their feedback and insight which endorsed a transparent retelling process of the data before I proceeded with the discussion chapter of this research. Whereby, I did a follow up email with the participants regarding their transcript and also discussed our understanding of what their stories were telling. Importantly, the participants confirmed by email that there were no discrepancies in the research findings. However, one participant requested that I change the specific illness of her parent in order to further ensure her

anonymity in this study. As such, I made the required change.

**Limitation of Qualitative Research**

According to Willig (2014), "every interpretation is underpinned by assumptions which the interpreter makes about what is important and what is worth paying attention to, as well as what can be known about and through the data" (p. 136). That said, from a phenomenological perspective, recognizing that my own values were not distant from the experience of the research (Creswell, 1994) were essential for me to discuss my "own biases and the implications for findings" (Farber, 2006, p. 368) in light of me being a Black Jamaican female student with pre- and post-migration post-graduate education in Canada. Nonetheless, to avoid agendas of the researcher that could have influenced the data collected, co-creation of the research took place between myself and the participants (Wimpenny & Gass, 2000).

Scholars such as Willig (2014) and Elliot (2012) emphasize that the representation of the data is influenced and shaped by the interpreter who decides what gets told or known about the participants' experiences. Thus the original material is somewhat molded by the researcher and can present a limitation on the overall scope of the narratives of the participants. Likewise, the ability to make generalizations is more limited in qualitative research because of the small size of the group being studied (Archer & Berdahl, 2011). However, employing a CRT framework legitimizes the voices (Hiraldo, 2010; Ladson-Billings, 1998, 2009; Parker & Villalpando, 2007) of the nine Black Jamaican women in this study; whereby, grounding their counter-storytelling in a "meaning-making process" (Stockfelt, 2018, p. 1018) of race which "represent[s] overt and covert examples of how racism insidiously transpires within academic spaces, and how existing, institutionalized systems function to maintain racially discriminatory cultures" (Arday, 2018, p. 149). Thus, forming a generalization about the racialized experiences of many Black Jamaican

women with pre- and post-migration PSE in Ontario.

Notably, based on the limited number of Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration PSE in the (GTA) academy, "I had to severely generalize some of the examples to maintain anonymity" (Stockfelt, 2018, p. 1025). For example, omitting the name of the actual Asian country where the participant visited before migrating to Canada, and the generalized post-migration job positions that some of the participants occupied in non-profit organizations. Another limitation that I considered was that while I focused analytical attention on the narratives of the participants, I "r[a]n the risk of failing to ask questions about that which [was] not narrated" (Elliot, 2012, p. 296). That is, some participants produced more narrative accounts than other participants which garnered greater analytic attention than the silence of what was not narrated by some participants. Hence the names and stories of some participants were mentioned more frequently than others in the data.

**Ethical Considerations**

Ethical considerations are of utmost importance in qualitative research that focuses on the narratives of the participants (Elliot, 2012; Esin et al., 2014; Mishler, 1986). As such, care was taken via informed consent forms to assure the participants that identity markers were removed from the research data and analysis (Esin et al., 2014). In addition, the analysis and presentation of the research were shared with the participants for feedback which enabled a balanced power of unlimited co-constructed interpretation of the data (Esin et al., 2014; Mertens, 2014; Mishler, 1986) that further legitimatized the research (Esin et al., 2014) and allowed the participants to contribute to a particular area of research (Elliot, 2012). Above all, the Black Jamaican women who participated in this study experienced minor psychological risk (Hardial, 2013; James et al., 2010) such as feeling perturbed and/or uncomfortable as they shared and reflected on particular

parts of their stories in response to some of the interview questions. However, participants were reminded and assured that they could decline from answering any or all of the interview questions.

**Conclusion**

My study seeks to generate participant autonomy, and demonstrates through self-reflexivity the researcher's value and respect for Black Jamaican women's lived experiences. As such, my phenomenological qualitative research employed a phenomenological methodological approach to understand the phenomenon of Black Jamaican women who obtained post-migration post-graduate education in Canada despite having pre-migration graduate and post-graduate education. To that end, deconstructing the role of devaluation of foreign credentials in Canada has shed light on how many decisions of Black Jamaican women are influenced regarding the attainment or hindrance of pursuing PSE in the Greater Toronto Area as well as exposing the (limited) accessibility of faculty teaching jobs for Jamaican Black women who hope to teach in academia.

I used two analytical methods – narrative, and thematic, to make sense of the narratives through a systematical phase of reduction, reorganization and interpretation, which also involved a co-construction of narratives between the participants and I. This co-construction of narratives reflected a dialogical process with questions that allowed the participants to share with me what they deemed as important, and relevant. Notably, using an empathic interpretation approach – a valid marker of a phenomenological research (Willig, 2014), reinforced the creditability and confirmability of my study. Hence, my role as an insider was not taken for granted in that the experiences of a group of similar people (who are Black and females) to that of the researcher (who is also Black and female) does not always share the notion of sameness (Pitman, 2002),

which allowed me to remain reflexive throughout the research process beyond the conclusion of the interviews to the retelling of the narratives (Roulston, 2014) through the critical lens of CRT, CRF and PCT.

## Chapter Five: Presentation of Interview Findings

### Overview

In this Chapter I present findings from my dissertation. Some of these findings are unsurprising given the recent research on racism in the Canadian university (Abawi, 2018; AWA, 2016; Daniel, 2018, 2019; Henry et al., 2017a, 2017b; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019; Mohamed & Beagan, 2018), it was disturbing and appalling that the university has yet to seriously address the racism in the ranks in this modern era despite the implementation of equity polices for the past four decades (Henry et al., 2017b). Hence the academy and equity offices have a far way to go in breaking the pervasive colonial structures in higher education.

The method used to lift participant voices in this study was through (counter) storytelling (Davis, 2018; Elliot, 2012; Henry, 2015; Mishler, 1986). Storytelling is central to CRT (Aylward, 1999; Hiraldo, 2010) that advances research methods and findings that center participants' narratives (Henry, 1998) and interpretative analysis (Eatough & Smith, 2008; Willig, 2014). This chapter is divided into three main sections to examine participant stories produced from their responses to questions. I first present Black Jamaican women's motivations for attaining post-migration PSE in Canada despite holding credentials in PSE elsewhere. Second, I present the experiences of participants in Canadian PS institutions and analyze how those experiences influenced their career decisions. Third, I ask them to discuss their views and experiences of the possibilities of employment in the Canadian professoriate after attaining post-migration graduate/post-graduate education in Canada. In addition to the scarce literature on the experiences of racialized scholars in Canada (Henry, 2015; Henry et al., 2017a, 2017b), and committed to "shattering this silence" (Silvera, 1989, p. 105), my research sheds light on the experiences of some racialized scholars, specifically Black Jamaican women, who continue to

strive for educational excellence with the hope of finding positions in Canadian institutions of higher education. Further to this, my research exposed an under-representation of Black Jamaican women in the GTA professoriate, and the complexities of gaining access to the academy based on factors such as meritocracy and equity.

**Who are we?**

Nine Black Jamaican women, given the pseudonyms – Gabriella, Geraldine, Diane, Kimone, Althea, Careen, Toni, Oneisha and Mary, and living in the Greater Toronto Area, expressed their interest to participate in this study. Their ages ranged from early thirties to mid fifties. Three of the women were in their thirties, four were in their forties, and two were in their fifties. These women migrated to Canada between 2001 and 2014. Of the nine participants, eight completed PSE in Jamaica, and one completed PSE in the United Kingdom (UK) – England. Four of the women had master's degrees from Jamaica, three had undergraduate degrees from Jamaica, one had a blended undergraduate degree from Jamaica and the United States of America, and one had a master's degree from the UK. Their fields of study were from the Liberal Arts discipline. Before migrating to Canada, one participant was a senior level manager in Jamaica, and eight of the participants were educators whose teaching careers spanned across elementary education to PSE in Jamaica, Trinidad, Cayman Island and the UK. All the participants aspired to teach at a university or college in Canada, which was one of the eligibility factors to participate in this research. Of the nine participants, before migrating to Canada, three were professors at the University of the West Indies (UWI) and one participant was a professor at a PS institution in the UK.

The participants' status of immigration varied as Canada has three main immigration categories for permanent residency: "the economic class, family class and refugees" (Picot &

Sweetman, 2012, p. 30). Five participants entered Canada under the Skilled Worker program, currently known as Express Entry (Government of Canada, n.d.) and introduced as such in January 2015 (Desai Trilokekar et al., 2019), one entered under the Live in Caregiver program, one entered as an international student, another entered through family sponsorship, and one entered as an independent professional applicant. The following Tables show a summary of the participants' pre- and post-migration highest achieved credentials and occupations.

Table 1. Participants' pre-migration highest credential and occupation

| **Pre-Migration** | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| ***Participants*** | ***Country in which PSE was obtained.*** | ***Highest credential earned.*** | ***Occupation/Job placement*** |
| Diane | Jamaica | Bachelor of Arts | Language Teacher |
| Althea | Jamaica | Bachelor of Arts | Professor |
| Kimone | United Kingdom | Master of Business Administration, Post-graduate Diploma in Education | Professor |
| Gabriella | Jamaica & U.S.A. | Bachelor of Arts | Teacher |
| Geraldine | Jamaica | Master of Arts | General Manager |
| Toni | Jamaica | Bachelor of Arts | Teacher |
| Mary | Jamaica | Master of Science | Professor |
| Careen | Jamaica | Master of Education | Teacher |
| Oneisha | Jamaica | Master of Education | Professor |

Table 2. Participants' post-migration credential and occupation/job placement

| **Post-Migration (Canada)** | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| ***Participants*** | ***Immigration Entry*** | ***Credentials obtained*** | ***Occupation*** |
| Diane | International Student | Master of Education, Doctor of Philosophy | Research Associate |
| Althea | Independent Professional | Master of Arts | Professor |
| Kimone | Skilled Worker | Bachelor of Education | Teacher |
| Gabriella | Skilled Worker | Master of Education | Senior managerial level at a nonprofit organization |
| Geraldine | Skilled Worker | Post-graduate Certificate | Recruitment Agent |
| Toni | Live-in Caregiver | Master of Education | Teacher |
| Mary | Family Sponsorship | Post-graduate Diploma | Managerial level at a nonprofit organization |
| Careen | Skilled Worker | Professional courses | Teacher |
| Oneisha | Skilled Worker | Professional courses | Teacher |

## Departure from Jamaica with PSE Fundamentals, to Canada - a Land of Promise

### *The push and pull factors at play*

Many Caribbean people migrate to Canada for various reasons such as educational and economic opportunities (Carrington & Detragiache, 1999; Crawford, 2004; Davis, 2012, 2018; Gooden, 2008; Henry, 1998; James, 2009a; Lofters, 2012; Pitter, 2012; Plaza, 2004; Senior,

2012; Silvera, 1989). Understanding the push-pull factors that continue to fuel colonialism resulting in many people feeling forced to leave Global South countries such as Jamaica to work and live in Northern or Western countries such as Canada (Anderson, 1993; Bobb-Smith, 2003) are imperative to deconstructing the pervasive cycle of racism in Canada. The reasons many Black Jamaican women obtain post-migration graduate/post-graduate education in Canada exemplify the racialization of Third world education, and the ongoing struggles of the devaluation of foreign credentials in Canada (Anwar, 2014; Augustine, 2015a; Bauder, 2003; Buzdugan & Halli, 2009; Li, 2000, 2001, 2008; Pendakur, 2000; Ramos & Li, 2017; Suto, 2009).

The push and pull factors that influenced the decisions of these nine Black Jamaican women to emigrate from Jamaica to Canada, and the complexities surrounding their arrival reveal some of the idiosyncrasies of Canadian immigration policy – a 'supposed' multicultural society (Anwar, 2014; Davis, 2018; Davis & James, 2012; Gaztambide-Fernandez, 2012; James, 1995, 2009a; Pandolfi & James, 2017; Saloojee, 2004; Suto, 2009). Significantly, Stein and Andreotti (2016) highlight that "Western education is understood to be universally valuable, while education from other traditions is understood to be of limited value" (p. 228). Two participants emphasized that their pull factor to Canada was to obtain additional PSE that was internationally recognized (Li & Tierney, 2013; Stein & Andreotti, 2016) as well as giving them the educational authority to shape the minds of students. As a language teacher from Jamaica, Diane stated:

> I found that experience [as a teacher] to be very eye-opening for me because it was my first time being in the inner city and teaching in an inner city school. I was very exposed to different realities in the inner city and the working poor. And I think there I learned the need for educational equity and language policies and principles that really honour

> students' lived experiences. And I knew going abroad [to developed countries] would help me to get that social capital to make a difference in education. (Interview 8, p. 1)

Gabriella explained that while living in Jamaica:

> I went back to teachers' college to get my diploma. I wanted to get my masters, and because I did so much work in the community. I wanted to teach it or consult in it. So I started to look it up anywhere in the world and I found that Glory University had a master's program in community development and adult education. I have taught the guys [male students at the community centre]; teach about teenage pregnancies in the community, church and school. And so I found this course. . . . In looking for the course I realize that you could migrate to Canada. (Interview 1, p. 4)

Diane and Gabriella had high hopes that obtaining post-migration post-graduate education in Canada that would guarantee their desire and access to work in education. Anwar (2014) emphasizes that such experiences of great expectancy "are sometimes raised in the immigration literature provided by CIC [Citizenship and Immigration Canada], which, through the use of PBAs [Points Based Assessment system], may raise expectations for job prospects to unreasonable levels" (p. 176). Geraldine who has worked in the Human Resource field (HR) for many years in Jamaica also echoed similar expectations to continue on with this work in Canada: "[I] would love to do it [teach HR] in a Canadian PS institution. I think that's where I would be most useful to carving young minds and passing on knowledge to other people" (Interview 2, p. 5).

The push factors from Jamaica varied among the participants though all expressed great desires to teach in Canada. Mary, a post-graduate from Jamaica who taught at UWI, cited the need for medical services in Canada that influenced her decision to accept the family sponsorship

opportunity. For Oneisha, Althea and Toni, economic reasons drove their migration, whereas Careen sought better opportunities for her children. Kimone's push from the UK to Canada was based on multiple reasons such as family and academic opportunity (Bhopal et al., 2016). Although each Black Jamaican women expressed different reasons for migrating to Canada, it is important to note that all were highly educated in their home country (Adamuti-Trache et al., 2013; Augustine, 2015b; Gooden, 2008; Janusch, 2015; Lum, Bradley, & Rasheed, 2011; Wayne, 2009). They envisioned Canada as presenting them with better opportunities to put their educations to good use (Anderson et al., 2010) in helping them to attain their career and family goals. Their perception of Canada took its basis on dominant representations of the country, Canadian government and university websites when they sought information pertaining to migration, and occupational enhancement.

Five participants entered Canada through the Express Entry Program, and one entered as an Independent Professional. The point of entry implied (Suto, 2009) to these Black Jamaican women by the Canadian government that upon acceptance of their applications for permanent residency in Canada, they would have opportunities to put their educational and professional experience to good use. McDonald et al. (2015) find:

> The nature of a country's immigrant selection process determines whether a foreign-trained individual is even able to gain access to the receiving country [such as Canada]. In this way, immigrant selection policies and professional credential recognition policies act as a double hurdle that potential immigrants must clear before they are able to work in their intended occupations in the receiving country. (p. 116)

Racialized immigrants, specifically Black Jamaican immigrants face multiple hurdles when they arrive in Canada because the immigration system gives them a false idea that their past

educational experience is valued in Canadian academic and employment settings. Furthermore, when the participants arrive in Canada, they do with the understanding that the process to transition into teaching or completing the requirements to teach in academia will be straightforward. As having received their pre-migration graduate/post-graduate qualifications from an English-speaking country under the commonwealth system that resembles that of the Canadian system, these women do not anticipate difficulty carrying on with academic and employment goals in Canada. For example, Oneisha, who held post-graduate education from UWI, shared:

> I was excited, very excited to come to Canada to live and teach. I taught for three years at UWI. Teaching is my passion so I wanted to continue with teaching in the university but to my surprise it was a different story when I got here with my family. There were so many closed doors to teaching in PSE that I really had to reconsider if I wanted to teach in Canada. I just couldn't understand how is it that I had my degrees from Jamaica, we speak English, yet no university or not even colleges responded to my [teaching] job applications. (Interview 3, p. 5)

After a few years of unsuccessful attempts to gain access to teach at PS institutions in the Greater Toronto Area, Oneisha was forced to abort her desire (McDonald et al., 2015) to teach in the academy, and repositioned (Anderson et al., 2010) herself based on the challenges she encountered. Further analysis of Oneisha's experience on pursuing education at the elementary level rather than her original desire to teach at a Canadian university is discussed in Chapter 6.

### *Classism*

Many Black Jamaicans who migrate to Canada are from the middle, and upper class society. Scholars such as Carrington and Detragiache (1999), and Lofters (2012) highlight that

regardless of the field of study, majority of Jamaicans with PSE migrate to North America. Thus many Jamaicans achieve at least their first degrees, and are exposed to a comfortable lifestyle before leaving their country of origin. Gabriella shared: "I grew up playing the piano" (Interview 1, p. 2). Mary remarked: "I grew up in a middle-class family. My mother was a principal and my father was a dentist so class was not much of an issue" (Interview 6, p. 1). Others leave Jamaica to seek a better life. In "The Black Woman Native Speaking Subject: Reflections of a Black Female Professor in Canada" Andrea Davis (2018) describes her childhood and youth in a working class family in Jamaica before entering Canada as a graduate student. As with many immigrants, Jamaican Canadians arrive from diverse socio-economic situations and circumstances.

My participants are from middle and upper class families in Jamaica, and their expectations that they would live a similar or better standard of living in Canada. However, upon arrival, eight of the nine participants recognized that racism, and classism played a main factor in the devaluation of their foreign credentials. Toni explained:

> When I arrived in Canada with my degree, I had this preconceived idea that I was in a marketable position to get a similar [teaching] job in Canada. I was wrong. I realized I was faced with several road blocks. My Jamaican education was not valued, and I was not going to let that stop me from achieving my goals. (Interview 9, p. 2)

Scholars such as Bauder (2003), Buzdugan and Halli (2009), Suto (2009), and Li (2000, 2001, 2008) attest that Canadian employers and regulatory agencies are reluctant to recognize racialized immigrants' foreign credentials. Interestingly, Geraldine drew attention to:

> In Jamaica it's very different; everybody is almost the same skin colour. It's more classism in Jamaica. You know, it's about those who have the money to go to school and

> get the job versus who can't afford their schooling. (Interview 2, p. 4)

On the other hand, Mary argued that colourism does influence how some jobs are accessed in Jamaica:

> When I started high school in the city, it became quickly evident to me that there is a whole different racial profiling aside from classism. [As a Black female] I did not fit the colour code. Some jobs were just for the brown people [light skin Jamaicans]. I don't know if we are open to admitting it. Whether through music or poetry, you hear the brown skin girl is always glamorized but not necessarily in the literature. (Interview 6, p. 1)

Although participants acknowledged class divisions in the Jamaican society, it is interesting to note that "colour prejudice" (Davis, 2018, p. 75) – acted as a barrier to some accessing jobs in Jamaica. According to Charles (2009), "the source of light skin as a socially desired object in Jamaica lies in the past" (p. 165). Thus, colourism in Jamaica is grounded in histories of Trans-Atlantic slavery reinforced by British colonialization. Obstacles to employment and colourism in Jamaica are beyond the scope of this study. But it is interesting to note that colourism and racism migrate with some participants as they arrive in Canada. That is, Mary and Toni were able to recognize from the onset that racism transcends physical and cultural boundaries irrespective of class. For instance, Mary's high school experience had predisposed her to what racism could look like (McIntyre & Hamilton-Hinch, 2016); as well as, Toni's determination to achieve her goal in Canada despite her shattered preconceived expectation of being marketable in Canada reflects a type of motivation that stems from a "heritage of slavery and oppression" that pushes one to "succeed in what may be expected to be an uphill struggle" (McIntyre & Hamilton-Hinch, 2016, p. 39). For others racism is a new experience (McIntyre & Hamilton-

Hinch, 2016) in that in their home countries it was not a factor for preventing employment.

In particular, Gabriella and Geraldine did not perceive classism or racism as an issue to their pre-migration employment – a contrast to their post-migration experiences. While the participants were not overly concerned by classism or colourism in Jamaica (although they did acknowledge its existence) they were often shocked at racism in Canada in that they did not anticipate such challenges based on the perceived value placed on Canada as a developed country. In other words, they bought in to the presupposed post-colonial image of Canada as being receptive of diversity – a "colonial legacy [that] has shaped [their] sense of place and culture" (McIntyre & Hamilton-Hinch, 2016, p. 39). Moreover, "the impact of personal history, culture, norms, and socialization processes influence how people define, express, or explain perspectives on various issues and experiences" such as these participants' perspective on classism and colourism/racism in Jamaica to that of Canada (McIntyre & Hamilton-Hinch, 2016, p. 40).

***The brightest are welcome: Canadian immigration system***

Participants reveal that biased Canadian immigration policies contribute to some of the reasons they obtained post-migration education. Anwar (2014) purports:

> The Canadian PBA approach is fundamentally problematic at both the micro level, in terms of the validity of the constructs it seeks to measure, and at the macro level, where it masks the systemic biases against foreign trained workers that persist in Canada. (p. 170)

Significantly, seven of the nine participants were awarded points for their education, a known strategic measure to ensure that applicants are suitable for Canada during the immigration process (Anwar, 2014; Buzdugan & Halli, 2009; Davis, 2012; Lum et al., 2011). Despite meeting this threshold, when they applied for teaching jobs at PS institutions, the majority of the

participants encountered challenges. Only one, Althea, did not. Oneisha, Gabriella and Kimone echoed similar experiences of receiving maximum points based on their education, and that they felt assured that they would get the opportunity to teach in academia. Oneisha stated:

> At the time when I applied, it was the points system and we [herself and her husband] had exceeded the points that would qualify us so I did not have any doubts of teaching at a university because I got points for my education and I was a lecturer at UWI. (Interview 3, p. 3)

In addition, Gabriella acknowledged the role of the point system (Anwar, 2014) in qualifying her and her partner's application for immigration: "My husband too had a bachelor's degree, both of us had bachelors' degree at that time and we got a lot of points for that. We were happy for that; we thought that was a good thing" (Interview 1, p. 5). Because they scored high for the point system, Kimone anticipated a smooth process to teaching in the university:

> So when I submitted my application forms to come here (Canada), it was fine. They said everything was fine. So I was under the understanding that I could teach at any level here in Canada, but obviously at the high school and graduate level. But after being here, I got a non- teaching job. (Interview 5, p. 4)

Bhopal et al. (2016) write that many Black academics in the UK emigrate overseas based on recognition of Black academics' potential contribution to the academy, and the value that is placed on diversity and inclusion. Despite obtaining her pre-migration post-graduate degree and teaching in the university in the UK, Kimone's credentials and prior experience were undervalued in Canada. By contrast, Althea was the only participant who felt that her qualifications were valued when she arrived in Canada:

> Yes, so I came in on the point system. I applied and went through the process of

> interviews, police record, medical record and so forth. It was about seven or eight months I got my application approved. They [the Canadian PS institutions] looked at my credentials and my experience; so when I applied for all of the jobs I went through the process of applying for my transcripts and they assess me and I got the jobs. In the meantime I had also applied for my OCT [Ontario College of Teachers]. So all this time I was certified by OCT, however, I've never taught in the public school system because I left Jamaica teaching adults so naturally I applied to teach adults when I came here [Canada]. I do renew my OCT but have not taught at the elementary level here or High School. (Interview 7, p. 3)

As these participants demonstrate that although their skills are deemed worthy for immigration, their credentials and experience are not accepted by the institutions in which they desire to find work. Many end up finding employment in areas outside of their expertise and level of education because they have to provide for themselves and families.

Henry (1998) pinpoints that "Black labo[u]r, commodified, has been essential to maintain the state machinery, but the Black presence has been undesirable" (p. 77). Despite having credentials to work in the professional classes, these women find themselves working in jobs that Black women are historically expected to fill such as clerical positions and caregiving jobs for White families (Bakan & Stasiulis, 1995; Bobb-Smith, 2003; Calliste, 1991; Henry, 1998). As other researchers find, black labour is used to fill gaps in other areas of the economy that are precarious (Access Alliance, 2013; Anwar, 2014; Galabuzi, 2001; Suto, 2009; Teelucksingh & Galabuzi, 2005) to maintain a hierarchal production of organized wealth and poverty (Abawi, 2018; Pollock, 2010). However, over time, majority of the participants were able to climb the promotional and economic ladder in their various jobs with sheer perseverance which can be

considered as success stories in their own rights; notwithstanding, the fact that this economic mobility was not in their desired occupation – the professoriate.

Henry (1998) indicates that:

> Immigration policies and practices . . . depict the ideological climate of that period. They also reveal the power of dominant ideologies to be routinized in everyday practices by revealing a tenuous and tendentious set of legal conditions regarding African Caribbeans. (p. 75).

Three of the participants drew attention to their understanding of the Canadian immigration policies as gatekeepers. Geraldine noted:

> They [Canadian immigration] know how to open it or tweak it to let us know who they want. HR was always on that list and so that was our plan to apply in 2013. Then they took HR off the list and so there was no HR intake for that year but my husband incidentally does IT [Information technology] and they had IT on the list. So we applied under IT; they had an intake under that. Both of us have our masters and our first degrees, we pretty much got a lot of points. We applied and we got the documentation relatively quickly to proceed to do the medical. (Interview 2, p. 2)

Similarly, Kimone sought the opportunity to migrate to Canada in response to the presupposed need for teachers: "I did the skilled worker program back in 2007. I started the process as a qualified teacher. They had it opened up for teachers" (Interview 5, p. 3). In addition, Diane concluded:

> It [immigration process] was pretty straightforward and I didn't have to do a medical nor did I have to do a police check and that kind of stuff [that are required when you are in Jamaica]. I think that the fact that I was working in [a developed country in Asia] and I

> was a professional there, plus I had a first degree that helped. But I don't know to what extent the degree played a role because I know that the priority was or the most important thing was I was in [a developed Asian country], and that made it much easier for me to get through [to Canada] versus if I were in Jamaica; then it would have been harder because you know I think the process in Jamaica is different where you have to take your documents to the Embassy. So I think being in a developed country really helped the process than from home [Jamaica]. (Interview 8, p. 2)

Diane's experience illustrates how Black women are given or denied access to Canada in relation to their geographical location before migrating. She questions the value of her post-secondary degree from Jamaica as having a limited impact on aiding her life prospects in Canada when compared to opportunities for teaching she garnered in a developed Asia. It is imperative to note that the strategies Geraldine and Kimone employed such as immigrating to Canada at a time that was seemingly beneficial for their pre-migration skills and educations, and Diane's strategic migration from a developed Asian country rather than Jamaica to Canada, are concrete examples of how many Black Jamaican women navigate their emigrational journeys. However, as a result of historical colonial legacies interwoven in the Canadian society and academia, the strategies these participants engaged can be perceived as resulting in failure in that they are yet to receive access and support to enter their desired occupations.

Participants' experience with the immigration system reveals the Canadian immigration policies are saturated in racist assumptions that gatekeep the women's access to live and work in Canada, "thereby controlling migration to Canada" (Henry, 1998, p. 77). Through discriminatory immigration policies, such as the point system (Shinnaoui & Narchal, 2010), racism continues to permeate in society, and hampers the upward mobility (Banerjee & Phan,

2014; Suto, 2009) of many ambitious Black Jamaican women who hold an illusionary view of Canada's immigration system (Anderson et al., 2010; Anwar, 2014). The illusions are created by the Canadian policy, itself, one that appears to celebrate the women's pre-migration PSE by awarding points acknowledging their experience and credentials before emigration.

***Money making business: Globalization of higher education***

The way in which Canada portrays itself "in every Canadian job advertisement" promotes the idea that it is a multicultural and equitable country (Henry, 2015, p. 591). Silvera (1989) denotes that "the misconception of Canada as the land of milk and honey" reinforced through advertisements (p. 5). Others find hidden agendas of the policy designed to proliferate the economy of Canada through a brain drain process of professionals from the Global South (Lusis & Bauder, 2010; Shinnaoui & Narchal, 2010). Canadian immigration websites also showcase an atmosphere of support and promise for professional immigrants by "allow[ing] applicants to self-assess their chances of success in Canada by assigning themselves points for different categories of eligibility like age, education and work experience" (Anwar, 2014, p. 170).

Stein and Andreotti (2016) drew attention to the fact that international students are largely framed in higher education policy and practice as cash (i.e., as economic assets)" (p. 230). Throughout the interviews, Gabriella and Diane discussed why they chose Canada to study, and make their home. Gabriella explained:

> I started to think that I was going to come [to Canada] as an international student. But when I looked at the cost of school for international students, and stumbled, literally stumbled upon the skilled worker program in Canada, I started to focus on migrating as a skilled worker rather than an international student considering the enormous amount of money I would have to pay to study as a non-resident, and then to apply for residency.

(Interview 1, p. 4)

Confronted with the various options to migrate, including the international student route (Altbach & Knight, 2007; El Masri et al., 2015; Hawthorne, 2008; Neiterman et al., 2018), Gabriella felt it was in her best interest to immigrate to Canada as a skilled worker who would further her studies in order to get the required qualifications to teach at a university. Likewise, Diane was purposeful with her decision basing her reasons to migrate to Canada in economic and professional opportunities (Li & Tierney, 2013). For Diane, migration to Canada provided her with a perception as more affordable than the rest of the Western hemisphere (Adnett, 2010; Altbach & Reisberg, 2013; Li & Tierney, 2013):

> Well to be honest, while in [a developed Asian country], I know I didn't want to stay there but I also knew that I didn't want to go back to Jamaica right away. So my friend and I were exploring different places to study and we found that Canada was the cheapest place to study and it had the most lenient immigration policies because we were looking at the UK and we also looked at Norway. In Norway, education at that time was free to study but the fact that we had to have Euro [money] we were worried about the 'what if' and if it was difficult for us to get a job because I know that they tend to privilege European citizens, employing them. Yeah so Canada would have been easier because it's closer to home [Jamaica] and based on what we heard in terms of residency, I know it's of evidence it would have been easy to get our permanent residence after we finished [studying] so those informed our decisions. So we said let's do Canada and then the tuition at Doveway[4] was cheaper, it was $6000 for the entire program. So we applied for that and we got through and started. (Interview 8, p. 2)

[4] All names of colleges and universities that participants attended in Canada are pseudonyms.

Diane and Gabriella's responses to their feelings that their teaching experience would be valued in their view of Canada as a welcoming and affordable country for one to study, live and teach in. Black (2015) attests:

> Jamaicans, like other Caribbean people, regularly consume the services and products of international tertiary education providers. This pattern is motivated by perceptions of a higher, intrinsic quality of the international product; also, the view that such consumption leads to distinct personal, professional and vocational competitive advantages. (p.171)

The women liken Canadian immigration policies to a money making business in terms of how Canada advertises itself as being open to diverse human capital in order to attract many racialized immigrants who are later disappointed by Canada's devaluation of their human capital when they arrive (see Bauder, 2003). When asked about her course route to obtain her post-migration post-graduate education, Diane narrated:

> That was a common perception, that if you did the course route [for your master's degree] you couldn't get to the PhD but I think a lot of universities, particularly in Canada, are making it easier for persons who do go to the course route do get into the PhD programs. In my perception they realized that if you can get students in and out of the University quickly then the more money they are getting, once they get a new student. Plus the opportunity is there for the student to become a resident in Canada. (Interview 8, p. 3)

Here she reveals subtle mechanisms of Canadian universities to solicit as many racialized immigrants into higher education, with expensive tuition fees, with the false promise of their obtaining a high possibility of getting jobs in their field of study. With universities being market-driven, and competing for funding, the goals to better society have shifted (Acker &

Armenti, 2004; Blackmore & Sachs, 2001; Brooks, 2001; Chawla, 2000; Hazelkorn, 2018; Stein & Andreotti, 2017) from charity base – development assistance in the Global South, to economic prosperity for Western PS institutions (Cudmore, 2005; O'Mara, 2012; Stein & Andreotti, 2016; Tierney, 2011; Trilokekar, 2010). In other words, Canadian PS institutions are economic engines in the twenty-first century as a result of globalization (Castells, 1996; Hazelkorn, 2018; Tierney, 2011).

McIntyre and Hamilton-Hinch (2016) purport that "recruitment brochures often tantalize students with promises of a welcoming community, with faces appearing to represent a diverse student population and a campus environment that presumably values, respects, and nurtures cultural differences" (p. 39); thus, camouflaging a system that propels the racialization of Black immigrant students in Canadian PS institutions. Diane also sheds light on the Canadian tendency to immediately privilege White immigrant citizens for jobs (Wiers-Jenssen, 2019) whereas racialized people are required to obtain credentials to gain access to employment. Interestingly, Diane's perception of Europe being less favourable than Canada is questioned when she struggles to find faculty teaching jobs at multiple Canadian universities.

Kimone also shared her awareness of universities operating as a money making business in tandem with the Canadian immigration system through the mask of internationalized higher education. That said, many Canadian universities make internationalization of higher education a priority (AUCC, 2014) in that their international student recruitment goals are aligned "with those of the federal/provincial government" (Trilokekar & El Masri, 2016, p. 552) which positions Canada as competitive and accepting of international education and experience (Desai Trilokekar et al., 2019; Foreign Affairs, Trade and Development Canada, 2014). Kimone was allowed access to Canada based on her education and experience but was told that she had to get

Canadian post-secondary qualifications to teach in academia. This not only cost her additional money and time but also frustration. Scholars such as Anderson et al. (2010), Anwar (2014), Malatest and Associates (2010), and Suto (2009) remark that many racialized immigrants experience frustrations, lengthy wait time and high cost associated with assessing their foreign credentials, and obtaining post-migration education due to hidden systemic issues of the points system. Kimone explained:

> I was now redoing my teaching qualification. The stuff that I was doing, I did them before. So I felt like I did not need to do this program. They could have given my situation an exemption, and I know that there are other Black women with similar situations. They could have accredited my qualification. I just felt it was very unnecessary and caused a lot of frustration. It just felt like they wanted the money. (Interview 5, p. 5)

As these experiences express, all the women were not prepared to face barriers that they might encounter in Canada. As Silvera (1989) highlights:

> What is never talked about, or made clear to many of these women is the widespread prejudice they will come up against in Canada and the racism imbedded within a system which thrives on the labour of women of colour from Third World countries. (p. 5)

As a result many of the participants felt tricked by immigration policies that purport to welcome their work credentials and experience that do not align with their actual experiences in Canada.

***Putting the pieces together***

The data reveals multiple factors contributing to the nine participants obtaining post-migration graduate/post-graduate education in Canada. These factors were imperative in understanding how many racialized immigrants experience difficulty with appropriate

employment in Canada (Banerjee & Phan, 2014). Diane and Gabriella pursued their post-migration PSE in Canada based on the perception that Canadian PSE was globally recognized, affordable compared to other developed countries, and had accessible faculty teaching jobs. Despite having many years of senior management experiences in HR, and a Jamaican master's degree, Geraldine was advised by a Canadian PS institution that she had to get Canadian post-secondary qualification in order to teach at the college or university level. While completing her HR bridging program as a means to fill the gap of her financial constraint, she had inquired about accessing a bridging program that could assist her with volunteering as a teacher/research assistant in academia and was told: "There was no such thing" (Interview 2, p. 5). It is noteworthy that the literature supports that bridging programs in Canada are either difficult to find or lacking for many occupations (Banerjee & Phan, 2014; Goldberg, 2002; Malatest & Associates, 2010). Toni who came to Canada on the Live-in Caregiver program with a Bachelor's degree in Education, was cognizant of the fact that she had to attain post-migration graduate education to make her desire for teaching at a university become a reality. Moreover, some of the participants mentioned that they were aware of White academics in faculty teaching jobs at prominent universities with their master's degrees while they pursue their PhD studies.

Oneisha, Kimone and Mary pursued post-migration post-graduate education due to the blatant discounting of their pre-migration post-graduate education when they applied for teaching jobs at various PS institutions. Althea got post-migration graduate education in accordance with her college's mandate that required all professors to upgrade to a master's degree:

> I have always wanted to [complete graduate studies]. Before I left Jamaica, I had started a Master in Abnormal Psychology but when I got here I had to focus on earning a living.

> So I forgot about going back to school and pursued a job - a career. I had walked in with my resume to a college in the GTA, and I was called for an interview a few days later. That's what I did 10 years ago. I got the job for my full-time position which I'm now in. A friend of mine who worked at another PS institution in the GTA had forwarded me that job posting. And then I got comfortable teaching at a college although it was contract. And when they started to ask for masters at the college level, and also for my own advancement, I decided to pursue the master's degree. (Interview 7, p. 3)

Careen did post-migration post-graduate education to assist with meeting the financial needs of her family. Although all nine participants desired to teach in academia, unbeknown to them were the overt and covert forms of racism that they would encounter in trying to become a professor which impacted their decision to continue or not continue their pursuit of the professoriate. In the next section I discuss the frustrations women experience when navigating the barriers they experienced when trying to gain employment appropriate to their credentials in Canada.

**Navigating Turbulent Terrains in Canadian PS Institutions**

***1st World education versus 3rd World education – Wich one betta, nuh di sameting?***

The colloquial expression - 'wich one betta, nuh di sameting' - in Jamaican patois highlights the tension that is perceived between the Jamaican English language and the Canadian English language that are basically the same with little to no difference. As aforementioned, the participants were encouraged to express themselves freely – that is, in Jamaican English and/or Jamaican Patois. From an insider stance as the researcher, and from an ontological perspective, many Jamaicans are taught and encouraged to speak Jamaican English in formal settings such as schools and workplaces. As such, it was not uncommon for the participants to speak Jamaican

English throughout the interviews with the occasional outburst of Jamaican Patois. For instance, in the case of Geraldine which is mentioned below in further details, as a way of showing her frustration with the racialization of her pre-migration post-graduate education she drew on her creole language. The foundation of Jamaica's public education is one instituted by the British in colonial outputs, or what they called, Commonwealth countries, during the colonial era (Ferguson, 1947; E. Miller, 2000). English education continues to form the base of Jamaican public education even after Jamaica received its independence (Charles, 2009; Petgrave, 2011; Rodney, 1990). Davis (2018) writes that her "schooling in Jamaica had provided [her] with a solidly British education at one of the country's top all-girl schools and the [UWI]" (p. 71). In addition, Bastick (2004) emphasizes that "like other Commonwealth universities, the UWI grading system is derived from the British system" (p. 95). As such, one can understand the bewilderment that Black Jamaican women experience when their British-based foreign qualifications are not recognized in a British settler society and sister Commonwealth country. Many women are often shocked when they find that their pre-migration education "is not considered Canadian equivalent" (Anwar, 2014). Of the nine participants, five expressed their frustration with Canadian PS institutions discounting their pre-migration PSE when they either applied to further their studies or enquired about the process to apply for faculty teaching jobs. Gabriella shared:

> I spoke with a Professor at Sparrow College and I said to him, how does one get in? I said that I really want to teach in the colleges and universities. He said maybe if you had a Master in Adult Education because you have other stuff but your qualification is not saying Adult Ed. . . . I remember going over to Wane College and the guy said to me these are the courses you need to do. Then I said to him I can teach this course –

> Introduction to psychology. The Maslow's hierarchy [theory] does not change between Jamaica and Canada. He says well that means you would get an A in my class. I said I am not asking for an A, I am asking for an exemption [from the course]. He said well you see you have to do it the Canadian way. And I said I don't know if Canada has any way of changing Maslow's hierarchy. It is what it is! And they would not give me an exemption. (Interview 1, p. 6)

Gabriella was overqualified, yet she was advised to take courses that she could actually teach – a common experience for many Caribbean women with pre-migration PSE (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009). Kimone, Toni and Geraldine echoed similar frustration when their foreign credentials were devalued. Majority of the participants experienced "dissonance – between what [they] had expected to find in Canada, and, their actual experiences" (Anderson et al., 2010, p. 102). Kimone stated:

> In the UK, I was the University Coordinator working with both college and university students. I just feel like they are not interested in hearing your experience. Especially if it's not within the qualification that they want to hear about. They don't want to hear about your experience because my experience is not just teaching; that was not the only thing that I did. When I taught in the UK, I was in contact with students for 20 hours for the week and the rest of the time I was doing a lot of things. I was wearing different hats doing programs for the institution and I was instrumental in creating two separate programs. Those two programs are still running to this day. I did all the training; I went out and did the writing for those programs and got funding for those programs. I ran a whole department and there are lots of other experiences within my teaching but I don't think no one is interested in that. They just see you as okay - she was a teacher but she's

not qualified to teach here. (Interview 5, p. 8)

In Bhopal et al.'s (2016) research, Black academics are under-represented, and have mixed experiences that are either positive or negative in PS institutions in the UK. In particular, Bhopal et al. (2016) highlight that "a small number [of Black academics] indicated that they had not experienced any discrimination in academia" (p. 250). Similarly, Kimone had a positive experience as a professor in the UK. As such, she was expecting a similar positive experience in Canada and was flabbergasted at how PS institutions in Ontario discounted her pre-migration qualification and work experiences.

Stein and Andreotti (2016) denote that Western PS institutions perceive knowledge from the Global South as "inferior and therefore lacking" (p. 234). Toni explained the coarse push she received to further her post-migration education:

> I was told that I had no Canadian experience to enter those spaces [public schools or academia] and I was told that my credentials were not the same like the Canadian credentials. Even though I went to the Ontario College of teachers, and I applied for the teacher's license which I got. I could not get any teaching job with the school board to help me with my finances while I try to get my qualification to teach at a later time at a PS institution. So I went back to school full-time to do my Master's degree in Education. (Interview 9, p. 2)

In addition, Geraldine argued that despite the rigidity of her Jamaican qualification, it was perceived as second-class in Canada:

> When I was doing my post-graduate certificate to ensure that I was covering my basis to get a job, I was told by one of my professor that if I was a PhD candidate they [academia] would be more likely to entertain me. I was so annoyed! I have worked in diverse

> businesses [in Jamaica] so if I come to a classroom bringing all that experience with me, that is informative. But my experience is seen as the unwanted distant international education which is surprising. W*ich one betta, nuh di sameting*? . . . As a matter of fact, our Jamaican education is more comprehensive and far more difficult, with far more content and everything but at the end of the day our education is seen as second-class. (Interview 2, p. 4)

The interview findings confirmed that Canadian academic institutions continue to devalue foreign credentials, which many scholars claim gives evidence of systemic racism (Buzdugan & Halli, 2009; Suto, 2009; Tastsoglou & Miedema, 2005). The participants drew attention to the obnoxiousness of the Canadian education system in that it discriminated not only against their education but also their countries of origin. Interestingly, although Tastsoglou and Miedema (2005) argue that their mobility would have been different, upward rather than downward, if their pre-migration credentials from developed countries such as the UK. Racialized immigrants' foreign credentials "can be valued differently depending on . . . the country where the degree was attained" (Buzdugan & Halli, 2009, p. 381). In other words whole countries as well as individuals can be racially or linguistically discriminated against. Such discrimination is evidence of neo-racism in that participants were not only discriminated solely by skin colour but also by how their culture, language and home country were perceived as inferior to the dominant group (Lee, 2007, 2015).

In various ways, the participants experienced turbulent terrains when navigating academia due to the discounting of their foreign credentials that resulted in excessive financial strain. Mary had to complete a post-graduate diploma in the interim to get a job. She strategized the best way to acquire her PhD when she was advised by a Canadian graduate office of the

lengthy process on how to become a part of the professoriate despite her pre-migration teaching experiences at UWI. Kimone elaborated on the financial stress she encountered as a result of the devaluation of her pre-migration PSE:

> I was applying to colleges and universities; trying to get a teaching job in PSE which was coming up with nothing. I was not getting any interviews or anything. So I tried to pursue teaching in the secondary schools to get a job in the meantime. So I submitted my application to OCT and it took them 18 months – which is crazy. It literally took them 18 months to figure out that I am not qualified for OCT qualification. It was 18 long months, and it cost me a lot of money. I had to send to the UK for everything, for every single piece of document that they required. It was just expensive. It was an expensive process, only to be told that I didn't qualify. And in the end they finally said that the best option is to do a teacher training in Canada. Get certified in Canada, and it is the quickest route to get your OCT certification. (Interview 5, p. 4)

Of the eight participants whose foreign credentials were discounted as they navigated the information from PS institutions pertaining to what it would take to get a faculty teaching job, three participants with pre-migration post-graduate education diverted their focus - "reposition[ed] how they subsequently restructured their lives" - to acquire jobs outside of academia to bypass undue financial burden (Anderson et al., 2010, p. 102). Nonetheless, Careen and Oneisha (the eldest participants) who worked with the school boards in the GTA, and Geraldine who worked in a job outside of education, still had a desire to teach in academia despite their "compromised careers" which were a result of "changed employment trajectories" in respond to the systemic barriers of resettling in Canada (Suto, 2009, p. 421). Thus revealing the complexities (Anderson et al., 2010; Suto, 2009) involved with career decision making for

many Black Jamaican women with pre-migration PSE, and the negative impact of being coerced due to financial burden to work in jobs that they are overqualified for or occupations that do not reflect their pre-migration jobs.

***If that is not the height of racism, then what is?***

The data reveals that racism was a key factor for the participants obtaining their post-migration PSE in Canada. Although Althea did not acknowledge that she encountered racism during and after her studies, she identified her experiences of racism as happening outside of academia:

> Because I was exposed to multi-cultures at a particular school in Jamaica, I see racism not from my perspective but from the perspective that the other person has a problem and so every experience I have I do not attach racism. However [In Canada] I have experienced racism in terms of going into a business place or a store and being spoken to slowly when I'm an English teacher. The other person assumes I have English as a second language. Even before I open my mouth, they see my colour before they know me. (Interview 7, p. 5)

Interestingly, further interview findings revealed glimpses of racism that Althea experienced when she was completing her master's degree in Canada. Althea stated:

> When I did my first assignment at the master's level, I had done it when I was in an Emergency room [ER] with my mom; her terminal illness had just returned. And that's where I wrote my first assignment in the ER. I sent it in the same night. I did not have time to edit, and as I told you writing was my greatest skill. My professor wrote me back to say I should reconsider whether a master's level is right for me because of my writing. She actually put me down and she characterized me as angry in my tone, and

> misinterpreted what I said. So from the beginning she looked at me negatively and I actually wrote her a letter after the assessment. I told her that she was wrong about her assessment about me as an angry black woman. That was really an empowering experience for me because it taught me to stand up for myself. I've never done that before. I was always a docile person, a timid person but I changed from that experience. I didn't know where I got the courage from but I did change where I was able to stand up for myself. I went on to achieve an A in that course which had begun negatively. (Interview 7, p. 5)

Althea's story reveals the implicit racism in the professor's characterization of her as angry, a common trope used to describe Black women (Daniel, 2018, 2019; Henry, 2015; Stockfelt, 2018), and her blatant contesting of Althea's credentials and academic experience "because of her writing."

As Althea's writing back to her professor in defence of abilities expresses Bobb-Smith (2003) finding that Caribbean women "use agency to self-define through goals of education" (p. 2). The idea of agency – negotiating for oneself – was also a common theme in the stories of Toni, Mary, Gabriella, and Kimone. Notably, these Black Jamaican women used agency as a tool to counteract racist encounters during their pursuit of their post-migration graduate/post-graduate education. Thus "inform[ing] us about their evasion of victimization and their measure of empowerment" (Bobb-Smith, 2003, p. 2). Kimone shared:

> I feel like the system is so disconnected from reality in many ways. And there is a lot of marginalization here in the education system in Canada. Let me give you an example; when it came to do our [teaching] practicum, I was the only Black female in my group. There were 11 of us in the group including a Black Canadian born male. I just felt like in

> finding a practicum placement, I was always the last person to be placed and for my last placement, I missed out on the first three weeks of placement. The practicum facilitator sent me to a school that was not taking students. . . . I called her [practicum facilitator] and, I was so mad and she said that I could not negotiate my placement, and I said that if I am to wait on you I won't be able to complete my practicum and graduate because I have to complete these hours in order to graduate. . . . She never responded to any of my emails, yet when we meet as a group with my colleagues, they can tell me about all the offers that they have been offered. I was not offered anything . . . I just felt like right throughout the process because I was not Canadian or I'm Black or whatever, you know, I am treated very differently. I was so upset. I eventually negotiated my own practicum which was so funny because the school was two minutes around the corner from where I lived. In one day, I was able to sort it out with the [practicum] school. I had to negotiate for myself. If I had not done that I would not have graduated. (Interview 5, p. 6)

The data for this study exposed the continuous difficult educational terrains of racism that the participants experienced. Many felt they had to unduly and constantly justify their credentials and their experiences to progress and complete their educational goals. Many Black Jamaican women face gendered racism in academia where they have to insist on being taking seriously (Davis, 2018; Henry, 2015). In response to racism in academia while obtaining post-migration graduate education, Toni narrated:

> I had plans to move from the master's stream to the PhD and the professor who was supervising my project at the time, I shared my idea with her; I shared my dream with her - I wanted to move on to do my PhD after. And immediately she shut me down. She said Toni you're not even done with your masters yet so why are you even thinking about

doing a PhD. I would not recommend you to do the PhD. Mark you [a colloquial expression] she is my supervisor and she said she would never recommend me. Lo and behold [a colloquial expression] I decided that I was still going to apply. I had one other professor that she was floating with and by the time I got to ask that professor, the professor was able to tell me that she said that she was not going to recommend me and if she's not going to recommend me, that professor won't be able to recommend me either. There I was. The ethnicity of my direct supervisor is White Canadian who told me that, and the other professor was Black. At the moment she [direct supervisor] said I was not finished yet; so why am I 'thinking' about the PhD. She didn't just verbally tell me, she emailed me the same information, and she copied the information to the other professor who was supposed to be on my committee. . . . So I know my doors were closed. What was interesting with that story is that, approximately one week after that professor told me that she wouldn't recommend me for the PhD program, I saw her talking to a White student who I sat in the same class with, and I heard her with my ears saying to that same student "oh you're so smart, you need to do the PhD right after you're done. Come and make an appointment with me and I'll tell you how to get in". Those were her exact words - "I will tell you how to get in" - and when she turned around and saw me having said those words, I saw her face turning purple. And I didn't say a word. I just got the answer, it's not that I wasn't done with my masters, it's because she didn't think I was qualified enough to go through the PhD program. So there and then I said to myself, if this is not discrimination to the highest level, I want to know what is. If this isn't racism to the highest level, I want to know what is. If this isn't an insult to my intellectual ability, I want to know what is. (Interview 9, pp. 3-4)

The interview findings highlighted that many White professors, through their supervision and advice, predetermine their abilities and act as gatekeepers mediating the educational value and potential of Black women (Daniel, 2018; Smith, 2017) that would qualify one to work in academia. Smith, Gamarro and Toor (2017) emphasize that "research supervision and mentoring are integral to the graduate student's experience" (p. 265). Interestingly, the relationship between Black and White professors, as it pertains to the access of Black Jamaican women to claim post-migration post-graduate education is problematic. As Toni's experience reveals a White professor can impact as well as override the decision of a Black professor (Daniel, 2018; Henry, 2015; Kobayashi, 2009) to either support or not support the educational goals of a racialized student. Importantly, although Toni engaged a strategy of perseverance to complete her master's degree in order to increase her eligibility to apply for the PhD program, this strategy led to an unsuccessful result in terms of her denied entry to the doctoral program.

Mary, Diane, Careen, Oneisha, Geraldine, and Gabriella confirmed that racism was a reality for them while studying as well as in the Canadian labour market when they had to seek jobs to assist them with their financial needs. Diane exclaimed:

> I feel like racism is very covert in Canada but it's also very tiring in the fact that it's so covert. I tend to interact with people who are open to discussing race and racial issues with me from a very open perspective. We don't always have to agree, but we can at least take the bull by its horn. (Interview 8, p. 5)

Oneisha also agreed that racism was very subtle in Canada. Significantly, Careen, Geraldine, and Mary drew attention to the stark difference in which racism is covertly expressed in Canada in contrast to the USA where it is overtly expressed, especially during the presidency of Donald Trump, but both yielding the same results of racializing Black female bodies, and denying their

access for occupational progression (Anwar, 2014; Henry, 2015).

Another form in which racism manifested itself during the educational journey of the participants in this study was through silencing. Senior (2012) denotes that crossing the border from Jamaica to Canada, there is anticipation for resonance – a home that makes one feel welcomed and not exiled. In addition, Senior (2012) imparts that "what immigrants fear most is silence" (p. 18). Oneisha and Kimone spoke about being silenced in academia by professors and classmates which created a hostile atmosphere (Daniel, 2018; Henry, 2015; Henry et al., 2017a; Henry & Tator, 2009a; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019; McIntyre & Hamilton-Hinch, 2016) that discouraged them at times. Oneisha articulated:

> I wanted to write on a particular topic that had to do with racism of Black boys in public schools and when I shared my topic and outline for the assignment with the professor, she told me that everything doesn't have to do with racism and that I should consider another topic because this was not an equity course. I was stunned! . . . I eventually changed my topic because I didn't want to fail the course. (Interview 3, p. 5)

The role of silencing by many dominant faculty members is a strategic tool of "avoidance of potentially painful topics of discussion" such as racism which promotes a false idea that racism and sexism no longer exists in higher education or the society (Braden, 2000, p. 51). Thus "prevent[ing] other students from benefitting from that knowledge" (Braden, 2000, p. 53). In order for transformative learning to take place, the onus is on professors to promote other ways of knowing by ". . . including personal experiences, and of learning that is open-ended" (Braden, 2000, p. 57) rather than shutting down the voices of Caribbean PSE students (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019).

Kimone explained her encounter with a White classmate:

> In my classes people were not open to other people's experiences or they were not receptive or respectful of other people's point of view. That is how I felt most of the time when you talk about your own experience or your own education. People got offended or their responses were just like your experience is insignificant. So there were classes that I did not get involved in the discussion because I know I have strong views in certain things. I remembered we had a discussion in one of the classes and afterwards when we were out of the class one of the White girls stopped me to really have a go at me. (Interview 5, pp. 7-8)

This inhospitable atmosphere in academia towards Black women is a covert form of racism that oppresses many Black female students to frustrate their efforts, and undermine their works in addition to indirectly telling them that they do not belong in academia. The silencing of Black female graduate students' experiences is an example of the "subtle ways that exclusion is reproduced in the classrooms" (Braden, 2000, p. 46). In addition, the challenges in knowing that "breaking silence in hierarchical power relations also generates retaliation from elite groups" sometimes cripple one's efforts to speak against the silencing (Collins, 1998/2000, p. 37). Oneisha and Kimone's experiences demonstrated how they were rendered invisible through silence, denial to write about topics of interest, and by intimidation of White students who showed their disapproval of one's opinion or experience. The tension and surveillance of Black female bodies (Daniel, 2018, 2019; Davis, 2018; Henry, 2015) discouraged many Black Jamaican women such as Oneisha and Kimone from pursuing work in Canadian universities.

***Meritocracy or What?***

James et al. (2010) exemplify that "while we live in a society that advocates race neutrality, the prevailing myths of meritocracy and colour-blindness have allowed for the

continuing exclusion of people of colour from full equality in various aspects of Canadian society" (p. 25). Five participants felt that they were not always recognized for their merit, and that many White students were pushed forward into undeserving spaces in academia. Moreover, academia gives "contradictory discourses" that it practices meritocracy when in fact many Black students are withheld from programs that would have propelled them further in attaining a faculty teaching job (Henry, 1998, p. 31). Gabriella stated that: "Sometimes academia plays with meritocracy and so the bar is always changing" (Interview 1, p. 10). In other words, Canadian PS institutions justify their reasons for denying Black students from entering graduate programs based on who they deemed as worthy or not worthy for such an opportunity.

Diane and Toni argued that meritocracy was more about who you knew. Diane explained:

> I feel like it is more social capital than merit because from my own experience, of course I got the grades, but some of the persons who you see are pushed forward, I feel its more nepotism and social capital. It is who you know in the institution or in academia. Then those persons if they see you as a star student, they're going to push you forward. So you can have persons who have the same grades but they are not getting through or you may have some institutional issues. Really it is who the institution or who the faculty prefers that is pushed ahead as well as who you know because if you have a good circle then persons might say what about this one or what about that one. It's unfortunate that that is the way how I see it. It's the persons who can play the white card; they're the ones who are pushed forward. (Interview 8, p. 4)

Scholars such as James and Valluvan (2014), and Smith et al. (2017) cite that many Canadian universities operate under a culture of white nepotism. Toni also shared:

> As an immigrant, my chance of getting my PhD and even a job as a professor at a university looks very slim. I have realized that even getting in if you don't know somebody to push you into those spaces it's almost impossible, and half the time you don't see those jobs being advertised, they're internally posted so who knows who will try and get their friends or their favourite student in. Based on what I saw and have been seeing, it's mostly White Canadians that are getting their PhD and holding those kinds of jobs. (Interview 9, p. 5)

The data showed that the notion of meritocracy was taken for granted by the universities that the participants attended for their post-migration education. Many of the participants identified their awareness that meritocracy in academia was a myth in relation to the advancement of Black students. Importantly, Kimone hinted at tokenism as being the result of meritocracy being put into action by predominantly White faculties, and departments. She stated: "It wasn't until I came to this university that I found out that Black students were actually turned away from a program because the department had already had enough representation of Black students" (Interview 5, p. 9). In addition, Hernandez-Ramdwar (2019) illustrates that some Caribbean female graduate students' efforts to secure funding through scholarships are often thwarted by professors – a "blackball" technique that bars Black PSE students from funding opportunities (p. 183).

***Tailoring plans to fit with multiple hats***

Serna-Martinez (2016) writes that Caribbean women have multiple roles in their homes, and that the complexities surrounding the experiences of Black female scholars who are mothers ought not to be taken for granted. Opal Palmer Adisa – Serna-Martinez's (2016) interviewee, emphasizes that:

> Caribbean women who want motherhood run up against the academy, which again has been, until fairly recently, an all boys camp, and those boys always had children but they never lost office time, they never lost any time because the wife was responsible for all of that. As more women - black women, Caribbean women - are entering the academy and wanting to be mothers, the issue of motherhood becomes important, and many women defer motherhood because of that. (p. 212)

A critical aspect that deserved attention in the lives of the participants in this study was how the Black Jamaican women had to manage their home, children, educational and financial lives as they pursued their post-migration education. Of the nine participants in this study, six had spouses and children to care for. Although Diane, Kimone and Gabriella were not mothers, Kimone and Diane had mortgage and rental responsibilities while Gabriella had spousal responsibilities. Althea shared how difficult it was for her while completing her studies even when there were opportunities to apply for full time positions:

> I did my masters while at Z College. I was on contract at Z College for 10 years. I have never applied for full-time because when I had just started my mom had been diagnosed with cancer and I was very busy in emergency rooms and so on and every time positions came up I was not in a position to apply, and my dad was diagnosed with Alzheimer's disease and again I was busy with him while I was doing my masters. (Interview 7, p. 3)

Althea's response to studying while working on contract illustrated the multiple hats that she wore as a caregiver to her parents, an educator and student in addition to the roles of being a spouse and mother. Althea felt that the full-time jobs at PS institutions did not lend themselves to be flexible to accommodate educators who have to tailor their career goals in response to the needs of their family.

Research shows that the balancing act of family life and school in higher education for many women is a difficult one (Acker & Armenti, 2004; Chawla, 2000; Gilbert, 2008; Ketcham, 2017; Looser, 2017; Maher, Ford, & Thompson, 2004; Maldonado et al., 2013; Massé, 2017; Mills, 2008; Pitts, 2017; Ward & Wolf-Wendel, 2004; Wilton & Ross, 2017). Mary and Careen noted that childrearing played an intricate role regarding the route (Pitts, 2017; Suto, 2009) they took in order to attain post-migration post-graduate education, and to pursue a faculty teaching job at a later time. Careen concluded: "So really my children are part of the reasons I do not pursue my PhD to teach at a PS institution at this time because it would take me a very long time" (Interview 4, p. 2). Likewise, Mary summarized her experience of deferring her PhD studies in light of motherhood:

> Fertility treatment happened first. I had applied to Glory University and to Z University for the PhD program at the same time when I had started the fertility treatment. But the reality of those competing priorities became quickly evident from a financial perspective as well from the time for the commitment to go in for treatment and the physical implications on my body. During the time of the fertility treatment, my husband went to Ryerson University to do his degree so we sort of switched around our priorities to continue with school and with fertility treatment. I went to K College to do a post diploma in Community Development in the meantime to help me get a job. Sometimes when I think about my goal [to teach in academia] and I see the years tracking and I'm not getting there I realize that navigating the nuances of the commitments of raising a family - the boys are now 15 and 12, are not easy. (Interview 6, p. 2)

The data revealed daily stresses interwoven in the lives of Black Jamaican women who had to face the reality of shifting their dreams and pursuits of the professoriate to raise and

support children. Oneisha who had pre-migration post-graduate qualifications stated that she had to change her plan from seeking a faculty teaching job to become an elementary teacher when she considered not only her age but also the expenses of going back to PS school with young children, and a spouse who was not able to get a consistent full-time job. As mentioned earlier in this chapter, when Oneisha sought information from a Canadian graduate office at a renown PS institution in the GTA regarding her pre-migration post-graduate education, and to teach in academia, her foreign qualifications were discounted. She was advised to complete a Canadian PhD before she could be considered to teach in the universities. As such, Oneisha completed a few professional courses for teachers.

***Is there hope?***

Many of the participants alluded to a tug of war of hopelessness during their academic journey. They also expressed an immense determination to remain hopeful. James et al. (2010) convey that "a sense of hope, rooted in an understanding of the history of Black people, continues to sustain those who are Black and offers a buffer against the wounds and pain of racism" (p. 28). Each of the women expressed critical understandings of the barriers while navigating them, which supported their hopefulness, even as they faced racism in educational institutions. As James et al. (2010) find, "despite the talk about and evidence of diversity and inclusion in Canada today, racism is still well-rooted throughout the society" (p. 19). After Toni's encounter with her master's degree supervisor who denied her of a recommendation for post-graduate education while encouraging White students to apply, she felt hopeless:

> There was no reprimand for my supervisor or an apology from her. My Program Director told me that it [racism] was a very touchy subject and I have to be very cautious with how I deal with it. I just felt so hopeless. Eventually, I carefully coined an email to my

> supervisor letting her know that I wasn't going to complete that project anymore. . . . I had found myself another supervisor who I was comfortable with. I felt so liberated in my spirit. (Interview 9, p. 4)

According to Bhopal et al. (2016), many Black academics who had migrated to work overseas returned to the UK due to professional reasons. At one point in Kimone's post-migration academic journey, her feeling of hopelessness was coupled with thoughts of leaving Canada to return to the UK. Kimone stated:

> Racism is real for me in the academy. Everything is so difficult to maneuver in Canada - that is my experience. Some people say that it's not and they have had a different experience but with my experiences it is as if you always have to start over. I am at the point where I am ultimately contemplating moving out of Canada. I think it would take a long time to get my doctorate and that is why I think I will migrate and go back to England because I don't think I want to wait another 10 years to teach at the university level. I can go back to England right now with my experience with the last five years and I will be snapped up in a teaching job at various PS institutions. (Interview 5, p. 9)

On the other hand, Mary noted that she had not lost hope: "That's my ultimate goal to go back into a PhD program and to teach. That's where I see myself between 45 and 55 years of age. That's my end goal" (Interview 6, p. 4).

Although some of the participants felt hopeless, they were able to draw on their inner strength, and their support systems such as their family, community and church (Anderson et al., 2010; Bobb-Smith, 2003; Este & Bernard, 2006; Henry 1998, 2015; James et al., 2010) to aid their realignment of occupational goals, and navigation of the precarious educational terrains in academia as Black female students. Such resilience illustrates the mechanisms of agency,

determination, and hopefulness used to counteract barriers that they had experienced while acquiring their post-migration graduate/post-graduate education. Furthermore, the data exposed how racism continued to manifest through forms of non-recognition of foreign education; silencing; the myth of meritocracy; and the racializing of Black female bodies as unworthy of further educational attainment; that influenced the decisions of many participants as to whether they were to continue on the path of getting a Canadian faculty teaching job or not.

## (Re)Completed PSE, and Its Impact

### *Multiculturalism*

It is imperative to note that most of the women could not find employment in the Canadian professoriate after obtaining post-migration post-graduate education. As such, obtaining a faculty teaching job was not a straightforward path for all the participants in this study. That is, of the nine participants, eight were not teaching in academia due to repositioning themselves after being faced with the enormity of expenses and time it would take to be (re)qualified to teach at a Canadian university, and systemic imposal that deferred their admission to PhD programs. Anderson et al. (2010) write that "repositioning was influenced and shaped by individual life contexts; barriers encountered; and social supports that were available or not" (p. 106).

In response to what it was like to pursue a faculty teaching job in a multicultural society, five participants pointed to the hypocrisy of academia that showcased itself as a level playing ground for all minds – "a bastion of liberal democracy that enjoys a popular image of an institution free in the pursuit of knowledge, avant-garde in thinking, and fair in practice" (Henry et al., 2017a, p. 3) when in fact these minds are predominantly White and Anglo. Kimone stated:

I don't know if the universities see us as not being as important in terms of teaching

> adults. I don't know if they see us as third rated human beings so we're not that important to pass on knowledge. I just don't think they see us as on the same level as those of their own people. I just don't understand - Canada is made up of immigrants. Why are we being segregated, why are we treated differently. How is it that after getting my teacher education again, in Canada; I still can't even get a job at the college level. That's why I am teaching in the high school now. (Interview 5, p. 7)

Kimone's comments highlight a shared feeling among many of the participants' displeasure of Canada promoting inclusivity at the expense of many Black immigrants. Her feelings of being segregated, treated differently, viewed as second rate describe roadblocks racialized immigrants face when attempting to gain access to employment and higher education in Canada (Anderson et al., 2010; Anwar, 2014; Fuller & Martin, 2012; Gibbs, 1996; Gooden, 2008; James, 2009a; Miner, 2010; Plaza, 2004; Suto, 2009).

Similar to Kimone's experience, Toni, Gabriella, Geraldine, and Mary got jobs outside of academia while obtaining post-graduate education barred to them on the basis of credentialism and gatekeeping by a dominantly White professoriate (Abawi, 2018; Henry, 2015; James, 2009b). Gabriella and Toni mentioned that they had applied multiple times for teaching jobs at the college level after completing their master's degree and they were yet to receive a response. Geraldine shared that when she was completing her post-migration post-graduate certification her professor told her that she should apply for the PhD program in order to be perceived as: "ready to adapt and integrate in the Canadian system, so that she would become more palatable" for the professoriate. The idea of being more palatable indicates how Black Jamaican women are required to perform whiteness to render them as acceptable in the supposedly diverse Canadian academy. Due to financial factors, and raising a young family, Geraldine decided to pursue her

PhD at another time, and remained hopefully.

***Barriers to accessing teaching jobs at Canadian PSE institutions***

Henry et al. (2017a) pinpoint that "many universities, particularly those in major cities, now have a very varied student body; however, diversity is poorly reflected at the level of the professoriate" (p. 5). The data findings exposed some of the reasons many Black Jamaican women are robbed of the opportunity to work in the Canadian professoriate, and substantially represent Black professor and student bodies. The interview findings have established that in order for the participants to gain access to faculty teaching jobs in Canada, they had to acquire post-migration post-graduate education irrespective of their foreign credentials. That said, accessing certain post-migration courses that would give them the educational ammunition like that of their White colleagues to gain entry into a PhD program did not guarantee easier access. Participants faced significant barriers in simply attempt to gain a higher education. Gabriella shared:

> I notice that in all the courses that I did during my master's degree, I was the only person of colour. This says something about the university. I know that they are having programs now to encourage people to come but they are more focused on gender than they are on race. (Interview 1, p. 11)

Gabriella's comment alluded to the complexities surrounding the intersectionality of gender and race in the academy simultaneously presenting to her barriers because of gender and race. Similar to Gabriella, Althea stated that she was the only Black female in all her courses for her master's program although the classes were promoted as multicultural. The absence of Black women in Canadian graduate programs, reveal how the universities engage in systemic exclusions that would limit many Jamaican women from accessing faculty teaching jobs. In

addition, Henry (2015), and Henry et al. (2017a) suggest that even when racialized students are admitted to Canadian universities, there is a dearth of expertise and materials, areas of study and curriculum that students are interested in. Smith (2017) purports that there is a "stubborn persistence of canonical knowledge derived almost exclusively from Europe and the [US]" in the Canadian academy (p. 261). This absence of diverse disciplinary and curriculum matter force racialized students to take a longer time to complete the program by taking courses and routes that are not relevant to their research interest. Smith (2017) writes that "many political science students can graduate from a degree program and never grapple with issues [or courses] of diversity and decolonization" (p. 261). Furthermore, Geraldine noted that your grades could suffer which would hamper your entry into the PhD program: "if you and your professors don't see eye to eye in the courses, that's a big problem" (Interview 2, p. 5). Such big problems racially manifest as a "disparity in grading of [one's] work" (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019, p. 182).

According to Geraldine, one of the main factors that prevented her from teaching at a Canadian PS institution was based on how her pre-migration post-graduate education was perceived:

> My Jamaican experience is being discounted for what it is. If I had the 14 plus years in HR here, in Canada, I could go into any school tomorrow to lecture and that would be fine with the Admin offices. But because it's international experience and it's not North American international experience it is somehow seen as less relevant. (Interview 2, p. 4)

Toni and Kimone echoed various ways in which they were denied access to teach in academia. Toni stated:

> I did apply for my PhD at the same university that I did my masters but I was not

> accepted and I know the reason. The same person who told me she would not give me a recommendation, she was on the acceptance committee so of course my application would not be accepted. And surprisingly this is what they told me in the letter; they could not accept me because of the GPA I came in with for the bachelor's degree; mark you, they accepted me for the masters with that GPA. My supervisor basically robbed me of time by sitting on the committee that accepted admissions. (Interview 9, p. 5)

Toni's experience drew attention to the covert forms of racism that are enacted through systemic structures that deny Black female students from pursuing their doctorate in order to facilitate their journey of accessing the professoriate. Through her faculty role, Toni's former master's degree supervisor was able to influence Toni's denied application. The committee invoked the myth of meritocracy to justify their denial despite the fact that she was previously admitted and nearly completed with her master's degree in the same faculty. In particular, "the diversity practices of different disciplines are rarely subjected to close scrutiny" (Smith, 2017, p. 239).

Kimone shared her frustration regarding the time it would take to complete her post-graduate studies before working in a position that would reflect her pre-migration job:

> The challenge is that there's just so much that you have to do. In the UK If you have a master's degree you can teach in a PS institution. And if you want to teach at the University level in the UK, you can do your PhD and still teach at the university until you have completed your PhD. Here even at the college level - Humber College, Centennial or Sheridan College you need to have a PhD. You have to have a PhD to teach at a college and I'm like hold on a lot of the courses are diploma programs; I have taught many degree programs in the past and I don't have a PhD but I have a masters and I have taught degree programs you know where I am coming from in the UK. The system is set

> up to drain us of all the dignity that we have when you come here. It's as if you have to live below your lifestyle, your previous lifestyle because nobody's giving you the opportunity for a job. (Interview 5, p. 4)

The data revealed that the length of time to complete a PhD program for many of the participants had a negative impact on the participants' decisions to pursue a job in the academy where teaching jobs are not readily available and mostly contracted for racialized applicants (Dua & Bhanji, 2012; James, 2009b; James & Chapman-Nyaho, 2017). As a result, many of the participants were strategic with the courses they chose in order to be marketable for other jobs, for example, in the social service sector, until they had the opportunity to complete their PhD and apply for a teaching job at the universities.

Of the nine participants, one obtained her PhD to date at a Canadian university with no success of a faculty teaching job as yet despite her multiple applications to the professoriate. Diane shed light on the barriers she came up against with a Canadian PhD:

> I do know racism is there, I do know that it's harder for Black people to get hired. I have not seen one Black person at the few colloquiums of potential candidates for research chair positions or associate professors that I have attended; not one Black person hired in a full-time teaching role during my years of study. Doing this [PhD] takes a lot of time. I have one article that I need to edit and I have another article, a book chapter that I also need to edit. I'm supposed to be working on a book chapter and all these things but then I said to myself these are four things that I need to work on but when I think about it, I don't have the time. Yet there are colleagues from middle-class families who have the support at home with family and household chores. Hence they have the time to be publishing and writing and doing that. The extra time that I have I have to be applying for

> jobs and that it a tedious task in itself. It's a matter of who has the chance and the time to publish; who has the support to publish? It takes time to do all this work. (Interview 8, p. 6)

Evidently, not only the length of time but also the lack of support for aspiring Black female scholars presented significant barriers for many of the participants who desired to teach in academia.

***Who has the right to teach there?***

Interestingly, on the one hand, Althea maintained that she did not encounter any barriers to accessing her job at her college:

> One thing I would like to say though is that I know a lot of people have had negative experiences in terms of getting jobs here, I did not experience that. I went straight from one to the other and I've always had that. I know their full-time positions are not opened very often. I must say though that there is a very small number of Black professors in full-time positions at the college. It's a systemic thing at the colleges - the tendencies to have 20% full-time and 80% contract. And that has been the reason for the recent rounds of strikes to get a balance in the full-time and contract workers. (Interview 7, p. 6)

Yet on the other hand, she noted:

> In the classroom, whenever I walk in every semester in a new classroom, I see surprise on some of the faces but I have learned to walk with my head high and to assert myself. And in the very first class, to show students through my interaction and through what I share with them that I have what they need and so I usually have respect from them. So I have to assert myself as the person who they need to teach them. In order to succeed, I have to be positive about myself and assertive really. Unfortunately I have to work hard

> to show them that I deserve to be in this space to teach them from the very first class and then after that it's usually okay. (Interview 7, p. 5)

The dilemma of putting on a performance to show that Black women are to be valued in the academy is another barrier (Daniel, 2019; Henry, 2015; Mukandi & Bond, 2019; Smith et al., 2017) that some Black Jamaican women face when they do access teaching jobs at PS institutions in Canada. Working in a research environment Diane shared:

> I put myself together to look a particular way, to look professional because I don't want people to think oh does she belong here. So I do find myself doing that very often, I project a lot in the terms of the way I carry myself just to counteract all of that. Interview 8, p. 5)

Some of the participants felt that few of the Black professors – who are already underrepresented in academia (Abawi, 2018; AWA, 2016; Davis, 2018; Henry, 2015; Henry et al., 2017a; Henry & Kobayashi, 2017; Smith, 2017), wore masks that displayed discomfort of having to prove that they have a right to be in the space of teaching in their respective faculties. Toni explained:

> When I go in spaces where I see the Black professors, they're very cautious with what they say, especially the Black female professors that I engage with. There are certain conversations that they don't entertain. I've realized that those Black professors tend to hold their positions in a way that says I got the position but it's not their right to be there and because of that they are so protective of the job. (Interview 9, p. 5)

Diane echoed similar observations of some Black professors:

> It's blatant in the universities. You can see the large majority of White people who occupy the higher positions and the few Black persons who are there. I think because

> they know of this racism then they protect their positions so keenly. They seem to be more willing to make alliances among White people and they rather to stick out their necks for White students than they are for Black people. (Interview 8, p. 6)

Thus, the data indicates the complexities surrounding the actions of some Black professors who were perceived as protecting their jobs at the expense of discouraging many Black students who they did not assist or encourage to pursue their educational and career goals despite the real effects of racism in academia. Performing and conforming to an academic culture of whiteness continues to prevent barriers to Black and students of colour. To that end, Henry (2015) draws attention to the complexities of Black professors' cautiousness in academia.

***There is hope***

It is no surprise that racism affects African Canadians' access to jobs (Henry, 2015; Henry et al., 2017a, 2017b; James, 2009a, 2009b; James et al., 2010). Although eight of the participants were not working in academia, and one taught at a college, many of them still had the hope of working in the professoriate. The concept of hope in the lives of these Black Jamaican women was imperative to understand the ways in which they dealt with the barriers of inaccessibility thus far in their pursuit to teach in academia after completing some type of post-migration post-graduate qualifications. James et al. (2010) attest that "hope has the power to restore, regenerate, and heal" (p. 28). Mary, Kimone, Geraldine, Toni, and Careen elaborated on the power of remaining hopeful in light of their passion to teach in spite of the hurdles that they have had to face such as not receiving any interviews or responses to their job applications to many PS institutions in Canada. Geraldine narrated:

> Yes I have always had a passion for teaching. Lecturing was always something I was interested in. I always wanted to do it. So coming here, especially with my young kids,

> online learning is a huge thing here, and it is my preference. There is a huge market for professors who are technically savvy enough to manage online classrooms and that was my desire. And that is still my desire and if I could somehow translate to that to lecture here in that capacity, that would be ideal. (Interview 2, p. 3)

In addition, Toni conferred:

> I hope one day I will get up and this whole idea of discrimination, racism is no more. Sometimes it makes you as an individual feel so uncomfortable, like you are less than even though you know you are not. But for the mere fact that people are not giving you the opportunity to excel and you know you have the potential to do so. They are not even making you feel like you are worth what they are worth by the mere fact that they are treating you the way they treat you. I hope that will disappear, I don't know when or how, but I'm just hoping. (Interview 9, p. 6)

Unlike many of the participants who were hopeful about their situation, Oneisha felt deceived and hurt. She concluded that Canadian academic institutions were "No where ready to face its skeleton of racism in its closet, let alone do a mass hiring of us Blacks. My best bet is to work at my elementary school even though I really want to teach adults" (Interview 3, p. 5). Moreover, James et al. (2010) suggest that "the process of healing can only begin when people are prepared to acknowledge racism and its impact" (p. 158) which is somewhat lacking in academia. Notably, many of the participants mentioned a sense of regeneration in relation to their participation in this study. Mary stated: "Thanks for speaking hope and giving me encouragement by doing this interview with me, it helps me not to lose sight. I believe I am ready to go at it [post-migration post-graduate education] again" (Interview 6, p. 5). Kimone echoed similar sentiments:

> Your research struck a chord with me, because I have done the research, I have worked really hard for the last 20 years or so I have done the work I have put in the time why can't they give us that opportunity to really to show what we are capable of. I feel de-motivated all the time because I feel like we have been put in that box. Nobody is there to listen to our experience, to see what we have to offer or to give us the opportunity to show what we can offer, and it's not just in education, it's just in everyday life. But I am encouraged that someone like you is making an effort to capture the stories of Black Jamaican women. (Interview 5, p. 9)

What's more was that some participants were perceived by members of the Black community as bringing restoration to the Black image by attaining post-migration education in the face of struggles and racism. Gabriella shared: "So a teacher friend from JA [Jamaica] pulled me over and said that you may not know but you are a beacon of hope for us in the Black community. You help restore our dignity" (Interview 1, p. 12). Although these Black Jamaican women were not working in academia due to systemic exclusion, many members of the Black community drew strength from the participants' determination and will power to excel even in the face of racial adversities.

Spirituality was also a theme that influenced how participants responded to the impact of racism when they were denied the opportunity to teach at PS institutions. Gabriella noted: "I know that God has a hand in my journey, even though all these things are happening; I know He will help me through" (Interview 1, p. 12). Scholars such as Barrett (1974), Boyd-Franklin (2003), Charles (2009), Cliff (1984), Grant (1989), Henry (1998), Hernandez-Ramdwar (2013), McIntyre and Hamilton-Hinch (2016), and Silvera (1989) find spirituality as an intrinsic aspect of African cultures. But less scholarship shows how spiritual is invoked in Black people in their

strong resistance to racism. Mary shared:

> I believe in praying for a change but it goes with works too. When I came here and quickly recognized that I was not going to be able to work in a similar position to that of my job at UWI, I decided that I wasn't going to fall prey to the system. I tell my [Canadian born] boys all the time that our job here in Canada is to demystify the stereotypes of what we're supposed to be. I am very passionate about that and sometimes our passion gets misread as anger. (Interview 6, p. 6)

Althea also hinted to the role of her spirituality in the success of her teaching job at the college:

> And I must say too for the most part I think for the 10 years I've only had maybe two or three semesters in the summer when I didn't have a contract. And so I give God thanks for that. And I must say too one of the reasons for my success, I think that is so different from others is my faith. Doors have been opened because of that. (Interview 7, p. 6)

**Conclusion**

The data shows that all participants experienced racism when they arrived in Canada. Employment barriers manifesting in racially-oriented discrimination towards their credentials and experiences impacted their decisions on the routes they took to obtain post-migration post-graduate education despite their pre-migration graduate/post-graduate education. Most participants felt set up by their view of Canada as open to immigrants (Anderson et al., 2010; Desai Trilokekar et al., 2019; Gooden, 2008). This view was disrupted when all but one failed to realize their potential because of the discrimination they faced at multiple levels of their efforts to obtain experience and/or access to academic institutions or the professoriate. As such, of the nine participants, eight are yet to gain access to the professoriate. Althea is the only participant to gain access and is teaching at a PS institution, and Diane is currently a PhD holder – both

faced racism and discrimination in faculty teaching jobs. Although all the participants still have a desire to teach in the academy, Oneisha decided to sacrifice her passion for teaching adults in Canada due to the additional financial burden and family care responsibility. Racism in Canada, specifically through the denial of teaching jobs at PS institutions, had influenced Kimone's contemplation of returning to the UK. Careen, Mary, and Geraldine determined that motherhood was an important part of their journey. As such, amidst the difficulty of acquiring post-migration education; and challenges to access the professoriate; they are hopeful that a faculty teaching job will become a reality for them in the future. Lastly, like the others, Michelle and Toni were determined with the use of agency and hope among other resistant tools to keep knocking at the closed doors of faculty teaching jobs.

# Chapter Six: Discussion

## Introduction

Conducting this research, "[I was] also exploring [my] own experiences" (James et al., 2010, p. 1). According to Watson (2012), "narrative integrates ways of knowing and being and is therefore intimately linked with questions of identity, currently the focus of much interest in social and educational research" (p. 460). As James et al. (2010) find in their study, the narratives of the participants in my research echoed experiences that resonated with me. I deliberately "avoid[ed] interrupting the flow of [the participants'] ideas with my own commentary" in order for the data to speak for itself (Henry, 1998, p. 5). As a powerful practice (Beverly, 2005), "narratives do have the power to subvert social norms" (Watson, 2012, p. 463). This is the first study to bring the voices of Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration PSE to the discourse and literature on Black experiences and occupational desire in the Canadian academy. As such, the data for this study has shown how many Black Jamaican women not only navigate systemic structures of the Canadian immigration system but also the social and educational barriers that they experienced in academia – navigations that also resound my own experiences.

The purpose of this study is to examine the lived experiences of Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration post-graduate education who desired to work in a faculty teaching job in Canada. In order to present a holistic journey of the participants' pursuit to teach in academia, and the occupational outcome of such pursuit, I critically analyzed the following: the lived experiences of Black Jamaican women who obtained post-migration post-graduate education despite their pre-migration graduate/post-graduate education; how their experiences with Canadian PS institutions (mainly as students) negatively impacted their decisions to pursue

work in the academy; and the challenges faced by participants in order to gain Canadian credentials to work in their field of study.

As mentioned in the previous chapter, eight of the nine participants have not obtained a faculty teaching job neither at the college level despite having master's degrees nor at the university level in the case of Diane with the only PhD in this study. Most participants are working in a job unrelated to their post-migration field of study. However, the theoretical frameworks in this study – CRT, CRF, and PCT – examine the complexities of the barriers and roadblocks steering participants to choose different jobs. These filler jobs give evidence of compromised careers (Suto, 2009). Therefore, from a long-term perspective, the majority of the participants are not teaching in their fields of study in Canadian PS institutions. The challenge of not gaining access to faculty teaching jobs at PS institutions in the GTA is symbolic of colonial structures in the academy that continue to disregard Black immigrant women's pre- and post-migration graduate/post-graduate education. This proliferation of colonialism, seemingly subtle under the guise of acknowledging and valuing Canadian education and experience, is explicitly racist in that it obstructs many Black immigrant women with pre-migration graduate/post-graduate education from future participation in their desired occupation; as well as, when many Black immigrant women do obtain post-migration graduate/post-graduate education, they are still denied access. However, it is important to note that a PhD is not the only factor that qualifies one for a faculty teaching job at a Canadian university. In fact, factors such as one's publication, research, work with the community and teaching experience in addition to a PhD credential are essential for university faculty teaching jobs. Significantly, as revealed in the lived experiences of the participants, are the challenges and complexities surrounding the ways in which they experienced limited or no support (mainly as students) that further prevented them

from accessing resources such as publishing their work.

Employing CRT, CRF, and PCT to address my research questions gave me the theoretical lenses to unearth the subjugated (PSE) experiences of Black Jamaican women who have migrated from a country with "historical influence of colonization" by the Spanish and British (Abrons et al., 2019, p. 666) to Canada – "a colonizing power" country (Moss, 2003, p. 2). Thus illuminating the power dynamics of racism, sexism, classism, and colonialism not only as hidden oppressive structures but also that these structures are manifested in barriers that yield negative influences on the process and experiences of many Black Jamaican women who desire a faculty teaching job in Canada.

From a PCT standpoint, the historical relationship between Jamaica and Canada is paramount to understand the colonial legacy that continues to permeate the Canadian society and, positions Black Jamaican women's pre- and post-migration PSE and experiences to be perceived as subordinate to that of the dominant group. On the other hand, CRT dismantles the colour-blind cloak of Canada by bringing to the forefront how racism is embedded in the Canadian society and academia (Daniel, 2019; Henry, 2015; Henry et al., 2017a; James, 2017). Likewise, CRF deconstructs how racism is perceived and its impact on the lives of Black people. Significantly, CRF takes the critique further in that it allowed me to distinguish Black Jamaican women's experiences from those of Black men as well as disrupt the assumptions of woman/sisterhood in the academy (Berry, 2005, 2009; Clark & Saleb, 2019). Therefore, the three theoretical lenses were significant, complementary (in terms of expanding my critique at various intersections) and instrumental in shaping my analysis in that the historical context, centrality of race and racism, and the distinct experiences of Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration PSE were the crux of this study; whereby affirming the voices of Black

women in Canada. Moreover, the infusion of PCT, CRT, and CRF expose the subtlety of racism and colonialism that thrive under the mask of certain policies such as multiculturalism, and EDI initiatives.

This chapter is divided into four main sections; three of which shed light on the difficulties of nine Black Jamaican women who had to pursue different career paths due to challenges they encountered in their pursuit to teach in academia. Many confronted the iron gate of employment that continues to bar Black Jamaican women from gainful employment in predominantly white academic Canadian PS institutions. The fourth section offers recommendations towards striving for equitable academic institutions and workforce that are truly inclusive.

## Departure from Jamaica with PSE Fundamentals, to Canada - a Land of Promise

### *The push and pull factors at play*

Immigrants from the Caribbean come to Canada with high hopes for a better life (Bobb-Smith, 2003; Silvera, 1989). Ramos and Wijesingha (2017) state that many racialized immigrants "likely migrated to Canada to pursue a job at a Canadian university" (p. 82). What is particularly interesting, are the reasons that many Black Jamaican women choose Canada as their destination for occupational advancement. Li and Tierney (2013) argue that "Canada has a strong pull factor such as being a developed country" that is perceived as more attractive than other developed countries (Introduction, para. 1). Such perceptions of Canada as being more appealing to Caribbean immigrants, especially with the discourse of multiculturalism (Anwar, 2014; Davis & James, 2012; James, 1995), are problematic. Canada portrays itself as receptive to immigrants, yet, when racialized immigrants such as Black Jamaican women arrive in Canada, they are disillusioned (Anderson et al., 2010; Anwar, 2014; Gooden, 2008) when they realize the

discourse of the inclusive society to be a deceptive rhetoric. Gooden (2008) denotes that "this ideology of a peaceful [and multicultural] Canada resounds and has become a permanent part of the Canadian racist and national consciousness" (p. 413). It is one that attracts immigrants who believe that Canadian society will offer them and their children opportunities worth leaving home for.

Through the lens of PCT, the relationship between Jamaica's global position as a developing country to that of Canada - a developed country, is mired with colonial and neo-colonial power (Ashcroft et al., 2000, 2007, 2013; Girvan, 2015; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019). Colonial histories of racism and sexism continue to hold adverse effects for the lives of many Black Jamaican women who migrate to Canada. With a history fraught with economic struggles (Demas, 2009; Kamugisha, 2013; Lewis & Lewis, 1985; Nettleford, 1995), and foreign dependency for trade (Abrons et al., 2019; Boyd, 1988; Dyde, Greenwood, & Hamber, 2009; Girvan, 2015; Keith & Keith, 1992), the Jamaican economy experienced stagnation at various times (Harris, 1996). This led many Black Jamaican women to seek upward mobility overseas. Jamaica's economic instability was a push factor for majority of the participants in this study. In decades past, many Black Jamaican women departed Jamaica seeking economic opportunities through the domestic labour scheme in Canada where they encountered overt and covert forms of racism throughout the Canadian society (Bakan & Stasiulis, 1994; Calliste, 1991; Macklin, 1992; Plaza, 2004; Reece, 2010; Silvera, 1983, 1989).

As a former teacher in Jamaica, Toni entered Canada via the Live-in Caregiver program before moving on with her pursuit of acquiring post-migration post-graduate education to access a faculty teaching job. Notably, Toni's route to Canada as a caregiver in the twenty-first century reveals one of the many ways in which Black Jamaican women enter Canada through colonial

routes with the intention of eventually attaining their desired occupational goals. As Toni's experience as a caregiver in Canada is not the subject of this study, I focus on her experiences of pursuing employment in the Canadian university.

PCT unpacks the fraught dynamics of relation that persist between Canada – a White settler society (Gibbs, 1996), and Jamaica – a former British colony in the post-colonial period (Sherlock & Bennett, 1998). According to Bobb-Smith (2003) "our histories [- Canada and the Caribbean] are interconnected through imperialist systems that established the Caribbean region" (p. 36). As such, many Black Jamaican women are pulled to Canada with the perception that their pre-migration PSE would be valued in Canada because Jamaica, like Canada is a former dependent British Commonwealth country (Davis & James, 2012; Lewis & Lewis, 1985; E. Miller, 2000; Plaza, 2004). Unlike other immigrants, Jamaican women are educated in English language and curriculum. Canada's glamorization of multiculturalism contributes to the allure of Canada for many Black Jamaican women. These factors of Canada as educationally similar and a country welcoming of immigrants trap many Black Jamaican women in to migrating to Canada only to experience racism and life choices that do not reflect their pre-migration careers or desired occupational goals.

The majority of the participants expressed disappointment that the high level of points that they received for their pre-migration education, language, and experience is not valued in practice by academic institutions (Anwar, 2014; McDonald et al., 2015; Sapeha, 2015). Highly educated Black Jamaican women are accepted to Canada but then prevented to pursue their pre-migration occupation and/or career advancement. This not only indicates discrimination (Reitz, 2005; Schmidt et al., 2010) but also exposes a colonial strategy that attracts Black Jamaican women to service jobs while deeming them without credentials (even though they hold them) to

hold professional or administrative positions in academia.

Many Black Jamaican women with pre-migration PSE – a fundamental component of human capital (Grenier & Xue, 2011; Saxon, Hull, Fearon, William, & Tindigarukayo, 2012) - are uprooted from Jamaica. They often give away or sell their assets in Jamaica. They leave their family support systems and previous networks of employment and community belonging. This uprootedness is overlooked by a point system that promises to acknowledge credentials only to bar access to employment. In fact, when many Black Jamaican women are uprooted, they experience "an effect known as de-skilling" (Bauder, 2003, p. 701). Such de-skilling of Black Jamaican women's credential is a concrete example of how the Canadian point system devalues their pre-educational experiences. Many Black Jamaican women find themselves locked into precarious jobs when attempting to settle in Canada. Some Black Jamaican women are unable to return to their home country to live as citizens because they no longer possess their pre-migration status in their places of employment and have lost assets such as their houses, and vehicles. They are in a sense, harnessed to Canada as highly educated racialized immigrants trapped in employment situations to survive the first years of settlement.

Notably, the participants overcame various immigration hurdles such as proving their candidacy through high levels of PSE attainment, and language skills before entering Canada. In particular, Oneisha, Mary, Althea, and Kimone taught at PS institutions in the Caribbean, and the UK. However, upon arrival, Oneisha, Mary, and Kimone experienced difficulties in accessing a Canadian faculty teaching job. Notwithstanding Jamaica's economic and political stance as "shackles of Westministerism" (Girvan, 2015, p. 105), the pull factors to Canada, specifically from the economic stream that gives the illusion that racialized immigrants will be successful, exacerbate the reasons many Black Jamaican women are pushed from their country of origin. In

particular, by way of their migration journey, Black Jamaican women are recomposed in a post-colonial society that resulted in different ways of experiencing the lingering impact of colonialism. For example, Mary expressed that racial profiling was an issue in Jamaica that created occupational barriers for some Black Jamaicans, and in Canada she experienced racism by the outright denial of her pre-migration credentials by PS institutions that barred her from accessing a similar job to that of her pre-migration career.

### *Classism*

Classism emerged in Jamaica based on the system of enslavement that used human bodies in the advancement of trade and capitalists economic systems (Campbell, 1973). The legacies of this system continue to perpetuate economic divides between White and Black people worldwide, and in Jamaica. According to Keith (1978), "the colonial state ha[d] given rise to a particular set of class conflicts throughout Jamaican society" (p. 39). This class conflict disrupts the ideology that Jamaica is racially tranquil (Campbell, 1973). Many Black Jamaican women who migrate to Canada are from the middle class who are accustomed to "a life of privilege in their own country" (Senior, 2012, p. 16). Notably, some of the participants highlighted how classism (rather than the racism experienced in Canada) was the main barrier for socio-economic opportunities in Jamaica. Nonetheless, colourism is a barrier if less pronounced in the Caribbean (Bobb-Smith, 2003).

Although there are lingering effects of colonialism in the Jamaican society that are manifested through classism and colourism, the majority of the participants shed light on how their upbringing taught them resistance to overcome barriers regardless of their economic status. That is to say, their families were sites of resistance that helped them to view challenges as opportunities (Taylor, 2012). From their Jamaican upbringing, the participants "learned to

negotiate their identities in situations of domination before their migration to Canada" (Bobb-Smith, 2003, p. 131). As such, they employed strategies to resist racial discrimination (Bobb-Smith, 2003). Strategies such as perseverance to complete their post-migration graduate/post-graduate education are noteworthy in light of the financial difficulty among other factors that the participants had to endure. For example, Gabriella, Diane, Careen, Kimone, Geraldine, Toni, Oneisha and Mary were strategic and successful with the courses and programs that they took. The home as a space that teaches resistance to discrimination in society shaped their identities and how they made meaning of themselves not only in Jamaica but also in Canada. This resistance that they have learnt from home – another fundamental component that assisted them with counteracting systemic barriers to their upward mobility in Canada. McIntyre and Hamilton-Hinch (2016) attest that:

> For students of African descent the legacy of colonization and deep appreciation for the transcontinental history they represent may result in certain value commitments and traditions that are at odds with the dominant White, Western culture they encounter in [Canadian PS] institutions. (p. 40)

As such, resistance to discrimination emerged as a driving force for the participants to pursue their occupational desires.

The participants generate strategies to resist societal and institutional racism in Canada and demonstrate that the idea of home is fluid; strategies of resistance participants learn at home transcend physical and social boundaries; and is in the mind (Bobb-Smith, 2003; Manley, 2012; Senior, 2012). Bobb-Smith (2003) argues that the home is two-fold as an "imagined construct" and a "constant site" where many Black Jamaican women learn from seeing older women in their home resisting domestic and national oppression (p. 162). Hence, "resistance is a historical

legacy through which people have accommodated or outrightly rejected systems of domination to suit their levels of comfort" (Bobb-Smith, 2003, p. 131) which is clearly displayed in the pathways that each participant took in this study as a result of the challenges they experienced in Canada.

### *The brightest are welcome: Canadian immigration system*

Ironically, "one of the principal goals of Canadian immigration policy is to fill gaps in the labour market" (Zietsma, 2010, p. 13); yet, many Black Jamaican women continue to face barriers toward their socio-economic status in Canada. A PCT framework unmasks how Canadian society, particularly through the use of its immigration points system, reflects a continuing effect of colonialism in the twenty-first century that targets highly educated Black Jamaican women but denying them access to practice their earned profession from their country of origin (Senior, 2012).

CRT, CRF, and PCT expose the power imbalance that eight of the participants experienced when they were given the perception (from immigration online sources) that Canada would be the ideal country to attain their occupational desires to pursue a faculty teaching job. On the one hand, the Canadian immigration system intentionally and scrupulously selects racialized immigrants who are educationally advanced (Davis, 2012); and on the other hand, strips them of educational and occupational advancement when they arrive in Canada. Thus, duping racialized immigrants such as Black Jamaican women to perceive Canada as a receptive country before their emigration.

Systemic racism leads to organized poverty in that resources are unequally distributed in Canadian society (Abawi, 2018; James, 2010; James et al., 2010; Jones, 2000). The Canadian immigration system is a covert imperialist tool that reproduces and maintains organized poverty

among racialized immigrants, and organized wealth for the predominant White group in a post-colonial society. For instance, the devaluation of Oneisha, Kimone, Geraldine, and Mary's foreign credential to teach at a Canadian PS institution inadvertently makes them predisposed to poverty. Scholars such as Anderson et al. (2010), Senior (2012), Suto (2009), Wayne (2009), and Zietsma (2010) write about the demoralizing effects many highly educated and professional racialized immigrants experience when forced to work in menial jobs.

Although Anwar (2014) argues that the Canadian government has made attempts to rectify the flaws of the immigration system, he also pinpoints that such attempts "are mixed in their potential effectiveness" (p. 175). An exclusionary practice of barring foreign educated racialized immigrants in the Canadian labour market still prevails. Many Black women are detoured into jobs that are sometimes precarious in order to provide and sustain their families. Therefore the Canadian immigration system – a gate-keeping process, lures many highly educated Black Jamaican women into a downward mobility which secures White dominance in a settler nation while relegating Black females to the bottom of its colonial hierarchy.

In particular, Oneisha's experience of having to teach at the elementary level in Canada rather than teaching in academia illustrates the ways in which some Black Jamaica's professional and educational credentials and experience are devalued. McDonald et al. (2015) note that faced with length of time and cost factors associated with re-training, "immigrants may instead choose, or be forced to accept, employment in alternative occupations" (p. 117). Importantly, it was not until participants arrived in Canada and started their pursuit for a faculty teaching job, that they were informed that their pre-migration post-graduate education were ineligible for access and advised to obtain a Canadian PhD. As such, Oneisha decided not to pursue her desire to work in academia when she considered multiple factors such as her family, her age, and cost. Similarly,

Mary and Kimone made alternative choices as they worked through paths to pursue post-migration post-graduate education to access faculty teaching jobs.

My participants' stories expose an immigration system that lacks transparency with racialized immigrants, particularly Black Jamaican women. Along with giving the illusion their credentials are valued in Canada, there is little to no support or information given to racialized immigrants to inform them that they will in most likelihood need Canadian educational credentials to gain access to professional employment. As such, many Black Jamaican women are hurt by a deceptive points system. The system acts like a brain drain mechanism (Shinnaoui & Narchal, 2010) enticing talented professions to leave their countries only to end up with compromised careers in Canada. Had they received information on the process of working in professions such as the academy before emigration, my participants claim, they would have had the opportunity to know what they might have to face and be able to make more informed decisions. Migrating to a White settler society, my participants were not prepared to face academic institutions that not only racialize but marginalize Black women barring to their upward mobility in a supposedly diverse and open multicultural country (Henry et al., 2017a).

***Money making business: Globalization of higher education***

Canada continues to grow economically on the backs of developing countries such as Jamaica – a "vulnerable economy" (Johnson, 2012, p. 39). Encouraging Jamaicans to leave their countries for better lives in Canada, many times my participants face more economic and social difficulties than they would at home. The participants' departure from Jamaica, the UK, and a developed Asian country to Canada was impacted by Canada's global position as a North American country. Higher education is commodified through the process of globalization, and colonial dynamics that privilege and value Western higher education (Altbach & Knight, 2007;

Dixon, 2006; Green, 2017). Although there are multiple "dimensions beyond the economic" of globalization as it pertains to higher education, for the purpose of this study, the economic dimension is discussed in light of the participants' responses (Beck, 2012, p. 135).

Diane entered Canada as an international student based on: the perception that it was affordable to study; her occupational desire to work in a faculty teaching job; her wish to attain permanent residence. However, acceptance in Canada, and completing her post-migration post-graduate education, Diane had difficulty accessing employment to the professoriate. Importantly, such difficulty was as a result of little or no support for Black female post-graduate students to build their social capital/network (McIntyre & Hamilton-Hinch, 2016) as well as not receiving opportunities for faculty teaching jobs after graduation. Canada seemingly welcomed the participants' international education; yet, they were "required to redo" their education for filler jobs (Girard & Smith, 2013, p. 221).

## Navigating Turbulent Terrains in Canadian PSE Institutions

### *1st world education vs 3rd world education – Wich one betta, nuh di sameting?*

Manley (2012) writes that "the official language of Jamaica is English" as a result of colonial domination to eliminate "imported tribal African tongues" (p. 169). Hence, Jamaicans speak one of the two official languages of Canada. Historically Jamaicans are subject to a British education and speak English and to reject Jamaican Patwa and communal teachings (Henry, 2012). Lewis and Lewis (1985) argue that the "colonial model of education has proved remarkably resilient, difficult to dislodge" in Jamaica (p. 159). As such, the medium for Jamaican education from elementary is Anglo and British. Despite this shared colonial educational past the Canadian immigration system disregards the educational experience and credentials of Jamaican women. According to Henry (2012), "the ideological biases against

Caribbean Creoles are deeply entrenched in the dominant society and in our cultural memory of shame and inferiority vis-à-vis an imposed British standard" (p. 99). Canada perpetuates the notion that a Jamaican education is inferior by rendering PS degrees from this nation null and void (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009). In doing so, Canada is exposed for its continued practice in racism of relegating the knowledge or pre-migration PSE of racialized immigrants, particularly Black Jamaican women, to the bottom of its hierarchical educational ladder. Furthermore, the devaluation of Kimone's pre-migration post-graduate education from the UK implies that race plays a critical role in this devaluation of the PS credentials of Black women. Kimone's story implies that more than even country of origin, Black women's PSE is dismissed because she is Black.

Jamaican immigrants who migrate to Canada "often [have] to endure a reduction in standard of living" (Davis, 2012, p. 232). Such reduction is often taken for granted by the Canadian society. For instance, Mary, Kimone, and Oneisha had pre-migration faculty teaching jobs that provided them with substantial economic income, and prestige. However, when they arrived in Canada, and applied for various faculty teaching jobs at colleges and universities, they were rerouted to filler jobs as a result of multiple factors such as the rejection of their job applications as well as the expenses (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019) that were involved in acquiring a doctoral degree to teach at Canadian universities. It is important to note that the requirements to teach at Canadian colleges are not entirely the same as teaching at the universities. Many faculty teaching positions at Canadian colleges require a master's degree, and to a lesser extent a doctoral degree for specific fields; whereas to teach in the universities, a doctoral degree is mandatory (Muzzin, 2013). Although Muzzin (2013) argues that "colleges are emerging as a teaching-focused employment option" in Canada (para. 16), Kimone, Geraldine,

Mary, Careen and Oneisha encountered difficulties with accessing a faculty teaching job at colleges despite their over-eligibility holding pre-migration master's degrees, and experiences. Furthermore, Muzzin (2013) confirms that "almost all of those [professors] hired by colleges were trained in Canada" (para. 2). This reveals Canada's PS institutions' bias against considering the files of immigrants with pre-migration graduate/post-graduate education.

James et al. (2010) write that:

> People in positions of power in our society and in major institutions (and they are almost entirely White people, and men at that) are able to frame questions and frame how issues are discussed in and presented to the broader society. They control how the Other [particularly Black people] is seen by the broader society. They also control the access of [Black people] to various mainstream institutions, whether they be related to politics, education, or employment. (p. 90)

The requirement that Black women with degrees from English speaking countries re-do their academic degrees and diplomas is a major mechanism of controlling their futures. While working in filler jobs to support themselves, Kimone and Toni had to redo their teacher education to teach at the high school level, all the while continuing to pursue employment in the professoriate. Similarly, Careen and Oneisha completed professional courses that assisted them with teaching employment with the school boards in the Greater Toronto Area even though their desires were to teach at PS institutions. It is noteworthy that securing teaching jobs with the Ontario school boards do not suggest that teaching jobs are easier to access for Black Jamaican women than faculty teaching jobs (Turner, 2015). In fact, research shows that there are barriers to Black immigrant teachers' job access to Ontario school boards (Agyepong, 2010; Childs et al., 2011; Henry, 1995, 1998; Kelly, 2007; McMurtry & Curling, 2008; Mogadime, 2008; Pollock,

2010; Premji et al., 2014; Ryan et al., 2009; Solomon et al., 2005); in that, such access is fraught with nepotism and racism (Turner, 2015).

As a form of resistance to being denied access to teach at PS institutions, Oneisha decided that she would remain with the school board rather than take on the additional financial burden to her family of redoing her credentials. When she considered her age and caregiving responsibilities, Oneisha felt it would be too difficult to pursue her former profession in Canada. Silvera (1989) writes that some Black Jamaican women are concerned with aging and that age impacts on their decision on what they do and do not do regarding their employment goals. However, irrespective of age, Careen intended to pursue the professoriate at a later time. The different pathways that the participants chose in response to their desire to teach in academia illustrate the various ways they navigate systemic barriers. It is also illustrative of the way Black Jamaican women use agency (which sometimes result in a sacrifice of one's true desire) to overcome systemic barriers to opportunity in Canada. Chawla (2000) reveals that "little acts of subversion are powerful" (p. 136). Little acts such as women prioritizing based on one's family or academic needs are powerful tools of agency (Acker & Armenti, 2004; Ward & Wolf-Wendel, 2004). As such, Black people employ agency in fighting racism in Canada (James et al., 2010).

The difficulty of accessing a teaching job at the college level with pre-migration post-graduate education, and the coarse push to obtain post-migration post-graduate education to teach at Canadian universities created not only financial interruption in the lives of majority of the participants but also health concerns. James et al. (2010) denote that "over time, perceived racial discrimination acts as a source of chronic stress, which has been linked to the development of health problems" (p. 121). In particular, redoing pre-migration PSE such as teacher education, and obtaining post-migration post-graduate education (whether in the form of certificates,

diplomas, master's and doctoral degrees), can lead to frustration, lost of interest for one's occupational goal, financial deprivation, marital and family stress, and stress that affects one's mental health. Ro and Goldberg (2017) emphasize that "stress can adversely impact psychological and physical health" (p. 203). These adverse effects are concrete examples that are manifested in the lives of many Black Jamaican women as a result of Canada's devaluation of a wrongly perceived or deliberately designated third world education when in fact their education is first world and colonial. The ongoing inequalities perpetuated by academic institutions inadvertently delays the accomplishments, and financial security of many Black women. And as Kimone's case stunningly reveals, racism, more than other factors, continues to affect African Canadians' access to professional jobs (James et al., 2010). Hence, racism:

> Must be understood in terms of historical and structural factors, and in terms of rules, policies, and practices that have been the prevailing norm in institutions that have operated for years in favour of those by whom and for whom they were constructed in the first place. (James, 2010, pp. 255-256)

***If that is not the height of racism, then what is?***

The post-migration educational experiences of the participants in this study are pivotal in exposing barriers to them when pursuing teaching positions in the academy. This is the main reason it is critical to hear their stories and bring them to the attention of immigration and academic policy-makers. Silvera (1989) emphasizes that the stories of Caribbean women are rarely heard and that:

> It is often heard through the words of others. It is not their lack of education and lack of writing skills that have served to silence many of these women. It is rather that their silence is the result of a society which uses power and powerlessness as weapons to

exclude non-white and poor people from any real decision-making and participation. (p. 12)

With this in mind, one can acknowledge and understand the difficulty of not being able to solicit participants for my study due to the fear - "an important sense of reality" (Silvera, 1989, p. 13) - of being identified and losing one's job when talking about their lived experiences in Canada.

With theoretical frameworks such as CRT and CRF, the individual and institutional interactions between the participants and PS institutions are debunked to reveal the covert and overt forms of racism that the participants experienced in academia – a space that academics and administrators often claim is not or strives not to be racist (Daniel, 2019; Henry, 2015; Henry et al., 2017a; Henry & Tator, 2009a; James, 2017). Althea's educational experience as a student draws attention to how Black females are assumed to be out of place (Abawi, 2018; Gibbs, 1996) and incapable of completing post-graduate education in Canada. Whether such discrimination was intentional or not, the academic and professional assumptions of the capabilities of Black people are historically used to propagate racism (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019; James et al., 2010; Jones, 2000). As the only Black female in her class, the discriminatory act of Althea's professor demonstrates how Black women are treated with disdain that not only negatively impacts their educational experiences but actively prevents them from pursuing and receiving their doctoral degrees. As such, racism damages Black people's confidence in their educational potential (James et al., 2010).

To combat racist cultures of academia, many Black Jamaican women employ resilient strategies such as speaking up for themselves. In her study, Bobb-Smith (2003) highlights that "Caribbean women brought 'home' with them to Canada, because they were prepared for the contestations they would face as immigrant women" (p. 162). Although Althea was taken by

surprise by the negative comments of her professor, her response to her professor showed that she quickly tapped into her inner strength – a Jamaican home remedy to be courageous – to talk up, and talk back to discriminatory forces (Serna-Martinez, 2016). Moreover, Bobb-Smith (2003) argues that "resistance is to be understood as a set of specific cultural or political responses to everyday life experiences when individuals, families, and the community are oppressed by dominant and exploitative systems" (p. 131).

Kimone and Toni's experiences exemplify how some Black Jamaican women experience systemic barriers at Canadian PS institutions from White professors. Despite having pre-migration post-graduate education from the UK, including teacher certification, Kimone was placed in a dubious situation with OCT that took a long time before it resulted in her redoing her education and attending a university in the GTA that is known for its diversity. Interestingly, as the only Black female student in her cohort, Kimone experienced little to no communication from her White practicum coordinator which prevented her from starting her practicum at the same time as everyone else in her group. In addition, the White practicum coordinator's irresponsible conduct towards Kimone almost prevented her from graduating on time. This type of mistreatment of many Black Jamaican women at PS institutions reveals racist cultures that are not always acknowledged by the institutions and the respective individuals. James et al. (2010) pinpoint that "both individual and institutional racism are closely intertwined with structural racism" that created a culture in which Kimone was subjected to different rules, supports, and expectations than her White counterparts (p. 89). Importantly, Kimone – a former lecturer in the UK, was demoralized and frustrated to the point of leaving Canada to return to UK rather than pursue a career in the university in Canada. James et al. (2010) states that "not only is racism pervasive, painful, stressful, and delimiting, but racism also creates and is experienced as

violence in the lives of African Canadians" (p. 20). In other words, racism is an attack on one's potential and life chances. The discounting of Kimone's foreign credentials, and the negative post-migration educational experience threaten her chance to receive teacher credentials in Canada.

Institutional racism serves as a vicious tool to control the mobility of Black people in society, manifested when Black people are met with barrier after barrier when attempting to attain their educational goals (James et al., 2010; Skillings & Dobbins, 1991). Toni's encounter with her White supervisor during her master's degree program reveals the differential treatment she received when she was denied recommendation to apply for the PhD program given to White students without vetting or question. Hence, Whiteness is reinforced in academia by White professors who deem Black female students as unworthy to occupy educational spaces held by them. The White supervisor's action was deliberate designed to thwart Toni's intention to pursue a doctoral degree. Making judgments of Toni's capability in the master's program, she deems her unworthy of pursuing a PhD program. Furthermore, when Toni insisted on the pathway of applying for the doctoral program – a "display [of] agency in acts of resistance" (Bobb-Smith, 2003, p. 131) – in order to achieve her desired goal to work in the academy, her application was denied by the admissions committee that had the said supervisor as part of the team. Importantly, the denial of Toni's PhD application signifies barriers to higher education for Black students (Gibbs, 1996) that take place in many Canadian universities.

CRF highlights the complexities surrounding the different outcomes that Black females experience as it pertains to occupying spaces of authority unlike White females that are encouraged, supported and permitted to enter those spaces. Toni's story draws attention to the intersectional complexities of being Black and female (Bobb-Smith, 2003; Mama, 1995).

Disclosing one's dream to pursue further studies to one's professor is problematic for many Black Jamaican women. For example, Toni's experience illustrates how racism was perceived and dealt with as a touchy subject by other professors (both Black, and White) where Toni – the victim – had to bear the burden of amending the situation. To refuse the supervisor's condemnation of her, Toni sent a courteous email informing the supervisor that she was no longer in need of her supervision. The supervisor received no consequences for her racist actions. As Heer (2012) finds, "privilege cloaks itself in invisibility, permitting those who invoke it to deny how it works in their favour" (p. 2).

Professors who are not called to account for their racist behaviour in academia often repeat this behaviour with other students. As such, many Black Jamaican women tread cautiously as they obtain post-migration PSE under the supervision of White professors. Gibbs (1996) emphasizes that many African-Caribbean women experience triple marginality (by ethnicity, their sex, and their immigration origins) in Canada resulting in systemic barriers in the education and employment spheres. The participants' experiences in this study exemplify triple marginality; in that, their credentials are dismissed, they are either perceived as inferior for a PhD program or outright discouraged from attaining a doctoral degree in Canada. The participation or denial of Black female immigrants in mainstream educational institutions in Canada indicates the limited socio-economic opportunities that they experience (Gibbs, 1996; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019). In addition, many professors use the educational system to prevent the admissions of Black women from actualizing their occupational goals of working in the professoriate.

The effects of internalized racism – self-doubting one's educational abilities (Bobb-Smith, 2003; Chambers, 2012; Daniel, 2018; James et al., 2010; Jones, 2000), was expressed by

some participants in this study. These doubts manifested in the participants doubting the worth of their research interest and remaining silent in certain class discussions. CRT supports me to examine institutional and individual racism to reveal its adverse effects on many Black Jamaican women who experience internalized racism as a result of systemic barriers that they encounter in academia as students. However, through a CRF lens that focuses on the "uniqueness of counterstory" (Berry, 2015, p. 430), reveals that for some Black Jamaican women internalized racism is short lived through their enactment of critical hope – a notable theme in the data – that is exhibited as a coping mechanism that encourages positive impactful changes for social justice for the Black community. Essentially, navigating the educational terrain for many Black Jamaican women have proven turbulent and fraught with racism in Canada which either impedes their pursuit to teach in the academy or derail them to unintended occupational pathways.

***Meritocracy or What?***

CRT allows researchers to unravel dynamics of racism as it operates on multiple levels, individually, institutionally and structurally to expose how ideologies such as meritocracy, accessibility and colour-blindness reinforce social injustices (James, 2008; James et al., 2010). The majority of the participants in this study identified that meritocracy was infiltrated with nepotism. Regardless of excellent grades and strong experiences (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009), many Black Jamaican women are marginalized at Canadian universities where many professors recommend non-racialized students for funding support such as scholarships, and educational advancement despite "the promise of equity" (Henry et al., 2017a, p. 3). Dua and Bhanji (2017b) attest that "while we have seen an expansion of equity initiatives, such initiatives not only obscure the ongoing racism in higher education but also help to perpetuate the neoliberal university" (p. 205).

CRT disrupts the neutrality of meritocracy in academia by shedding light on the subtle ways in which Black bodies are subordinated (Aylward, 1999) and denied access despite their eligibility for educational advancement, funding and resources (Desai Trilokekar & El Masri, 2017; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019). Significantly, the pervasiveness of White supremacy continues to permeate academia at various levels (Dua & Bhanji, 2017b; Henry et al., 2017a, 2017b; Henry & Tator, 2007; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019). Professorial racism institutes roadblocks for many Black Jamaican women who not only need the support of their professors to access post-graduate programs but also at the institutional level where supervisory or admission teams are tainted with favouritism, nepotism and discrimination. In fact, Ramos and Wijesingha (2017) illustrate that poor performance is oftentimes used to justify lack of merit for racialized students in academia. This myth of merit hides invisible factors racialized students experience in being denied opportunities to thrive and succeed. These include having limited or no support from supervisors, having little support for research interests, having few mentors in the form of Black female professors, and being constantly subjected to racist cultures of academia. Althea's experience with her master's degree professor exemplify one way in which some Black Jamaican women navigate multiple barriers while expected to be twice as excellent as their White counterparts to gain access to opportunities.

***Tailoring plans to fit with multiple hats***

Jamaicans are resilient people (Chambers, 2012) who hold strong pride in their racial identity as a form of coping and resilience in Canada (see Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019; James et al., 2010). Significantly, the participants in this study tailored their occupational desire to overcome systemic barriers they faced in Canada. Some participants prioritized motherhood over their career aspirations and took filler jobs to support their families. In particular, Mary's

lived experience exemplified how the intersectionality of race, colonialism, gender, immigration and classism operated as deterrence to her achieving her PhD. That is, her pre-migration post-graduate education was devalued by many PS institutions in the GTA as a result of inherent colonial structures that led her to pursue post-migration post-graduate education which was complicated with the impact that the fertility treatment had on her body; as well as, the need to secure financial income for her treatment and family due to their new imposed working class status as a result of their immigration to Canada whereby she had to pursue an alternate post-migration post-graduate education route that was shorter. Significantly, the implications of the fertility treatment made Mary's experience distinctive from those of (Black or White) men. Other participants chose to pursue post-migration post-graduate degrees despite carrying significant family, and financial responsibilities.

Overall, regardless of the post-migration educational path that they took, these Black Jamaican women experienced daily stress, and racialization that impacted their well being, and career decisions. For instance, Mary, Oneisha, Geraldine and Careen revealed how Black Jamaican women are intricately involved with the responsibilities of child/ren care which undoubtedly impacts how Black women students are subjugated in the academy from those of White women students in terms of dealing with race and immigration from a Third world country; and, from those of Black male students in that when access is granted to Black students, Black women students have to contend with childbearing and rearing responsibilities (as well as aging). Thus impacting when and how many Black immigrant women may decide (if at all) to purse post-migration graduate/post-graduate education. Such complexities surrounding Black immigrant women's childbearing and rearing are brought to the forefront through the lens of CRT, CRF, and PCT to reveal the messiness involved in teasing out the intersectionality of race,

gender, age, colonialism, immigration, and classism in the lived experiences of many Black Jamaican women.

Scholars using CRT and CRF not only problematize how daily stress operate as a deterrence in the lives of many Black Jamaican women in academia but also reveal the subtle ways in which these barriers, in the first place, produce this stress. Although the participants repositioned their aspirations as a way of tailoring their occupational desire, it is noteworthy to recognize that such repositioning is a form of coping and counteracting racism that stems from the difficulties of resettling in the Canadian society as well as in academia (see Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019).

***Is there hope?***

The feeling of hopelessness as consequence of experienced racism was expressed by participants. Institutional structures that exacerbate hopelessness for many Black Jamaican women students with pre-migration PSE are manifested through the denial of transferred credits or exemption for completed pre-migration educational course. The requirements to redo qualifications before proceeding to further educational advancement were particularly disheartening for many. Importantly, hopelessness is catalytic to the frustrations of many Black Jamaican women who are detoured from their original occupational desire for a faculty teaching job. For some, this frustration resulted in permanent severing of one's occupational goal.

As advocators for social justice through their active participation in this research (Gibbs, 1996; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019; James, 2009a; James et al., 2010; James & Taylor, 2008), all the participants perceived this study as one way to challenge hopelessness. The study allowed participants to share and speak back at dominant discourses of academia - that gives the perception that it is neutral (Henry et al., 2017a). Significantly, academia continues to be a

problematic site in the twenty-first century for many Black female scholars and professors (Henry, 2015) who continue to experience unlevel fields of support for pre-migration PSE from third world countries, research interests, occupational and educational advancement.

## (Re)Completed PSE, and Its Impact

### *Multiculturalism*

Canada "as an officially designated multicultural society" is an illusive rhetoric (Davis & James, 2012, p. 10). James et al. (2010) argue that "many Canadians believe that because of human rights protections and hate legislation, racism is no longer a serious issue in Canada" (p. 64). The experiences of the participants in this study illustrate how many Black Jamaican women face unspeakable racism when pursuing their goals for higher education and professional employment in the university. Although the Employment Equity Act was a response to the Abella's Royal Commission report (James, 2010; James et al., 2010), Canada's ideology and practices of multiculturalism continues to endorse conformity to Eurocentric values grounded in whiteness (Davis & James, 2012; Fleras, 2004; Foster, 2007; Kitossa, 2012; Saloojee, 2004). In this sense Canada is "sometimes ill-prepared to adapt to the [Black] immigrant" (Senior, 2012, p. 17). Both Canadian society and the Canadian university seem ill-prepared to adapt to the presence of Black women professionals. Despite their post-migration educational attainment, many Black Jamaican women are subordinated to racial and gender hierarchal reproduction by the predominant group that maintains whiteness as the bench mark to occupy certain spaces in academia.

The stories of participants expose the dominant discourse of multiculturalism in Canada to reveal the prevalence of racism – "a tool or mechanism of power" (James et al., 2010, p. 64) that operate under the guise of "advice" given to Black female students by their professors and

supervisors in academia. In particular, the advice given to Geraldine, Toni, Oneisha, Kimone, and Althea by their professors demonstrates these academics' negative perception of their Black female students who express higher educational and occupational aspirations in PS institutions. That said, despite the attainment of post-migration post-graduate education, many Black Jamaican women experience limited or no access to faculty teaching jobs in Canada which reinforces the notion of multiculturalism as hypocrisy.

***Barriers to accessing teaching jobs at Canadian PSE institutions***

On the one hand, many Black women are denied access to post-migration post-graduate programs; and on the other hand, when they are granted access, they are not only underrepresented in the student body but surveilled by White professors and students. Importantly, the denial of many Black Jamaican women in post-migration post-graduate programs is an automatic mechanism denying them access to higher education and the professoriate.

The majority of the participants drew attention to the limited or no support for their work as students in the academy. This minimal or no support for many Black Jamaican women's research interest is also a de-motivating factor that discourages some Black Jamaican women from pursuing further educational advancement on the pathway for a faculty teaching job in the universities. Scholars such as Hernandez-Ramdwar (2009), Serna-Martinez (2016), and Silvera (1989) shed light on the long process involved in producing published work by Caribbean women with family and work responsibilities. In fact, majority of the participants echoed the difficulty of balancing their studies with other areas of their lives which influenced their educational and occupational decisions. In addition, the intersectionality of race, gender, and class expose the nuances that are taken for granted regarding the length of time, and expenses of

post-migration post-graduate programs in Canada for many Black Jamaican women who have to work in filler jobs in order to manage their financial constraint.

Overall, the stagnation of faculty hiring (Phillips, 2018), specifically diversity hiring (James & Chapman-Nyaho, 2017), is also a chief barrier to many Black Jamaican women's access to the professoriate. This stagnation is systemic as it keeps Black women out of spaces of authority, and influence. DiCroce (1995) calls attention to the fact that tenured women faculty are "well positioned to make unique contributions to their institutions and society as a whole" such as doing topics of interest that may interrogate various disciplines' camouflage of inclusiveness and topple sexist structures such as the inattention to the maternal needs of many women faculty (p. 85). Accordingly, James and Chapman-Nyaho (2017) pinpoint that Canadian "universities are becoming 'less progressive' and less inclusive, despite the rhetoric of job advertisements and the glossy pictures on university websites and in recruitment brochures" (p. 85). In fact, the 2019 "first-ever comprehensive national survey" by Universities Canada on the EDI strategies, policies and action plans in Canadian universities demonstrated that challenges and inequities still prevail in academia which included the sparse recruitment of racialized academics (especially in senior leadership), and lack of resources for EDI initiatives (Universities Canada, 2019, p. 4).

In particular, Diane's experience exemplifies the difficulty of not gaining a teaching job in academia as a PhD holder. To that end, regardless of many Black women with post-migration doctoral degrees, there is limited impact of such qualification fostering access to faculty teaching jobs in Canada. However, in light of the Universities Canada's "five year action plan to support members' implementation of the *Inclusive Excellence Principles*" to advocate and make effective EDI initiatives a profound reality in Canadian universities, I look forward to what will

unfold with mixed feelings of skepticism and hopefulness (Universities Canada, 2019, p. 5). On the one hand, Canadian universities are governed by their own institutional autonomy, and participation to develop and implement the *Inclusive Excellence Principles*[5] is voluntary (Universities Canada, 2019); on the other hand, progress takes time, and a critical commitment for change by Canadian PS institutions (Hardy Cox & Strange, 2016) in the right direction for the advancement of Black women in the academy is well needed.

***Who has the right to teach there?***

The impact of (re)completing PSE for majority of the participants in this study has proved futile to some extent; in that, they were not teaching in the academy. Nelson and Nelson (2004) write that it is no surprise that Black women are not welcomed in academia when some Canadian universities are unwilling to denounce racism in Canada, and advocate for changes against racial oppression. Furthermore, the iron gate in the academy continues to stand firm with idealizing Eurocentric knowledge (Henry et al., 2017a) which subjugate the knowledge of Black women and others as inferior. Althea's yearly assertion to her students as a Black female professor who has the right to teach at her institution shows how Black female bodies are subjected to a racialized performance (Daniel, 2018, 2019), and surveillance that White professors are not subjected to. In other words, Black people always have to work twice as hard to receive recognition compared to White counterparts (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019; James, 2009a, 2012; Pitter, 2012) even when they do achieve positions of academic authority in the university.

***There is hope***

Critical hope in action is expressed by participants when advocating for and making

[5] See Universities Canada (2017) for a list of the seven *Inclusive Excellence Principles*: https://www.univcan.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/equity-diversity-inclusion-principles-universities-canada-oct-2017.pdf

social changes (Bloch, 1986; Freire, 1994; James et al., 2010; Lasch, 1991) not just for themselves, but for the society at large (James et al., 2010). Moreover, this action involves: sharing counter narratives to the dominant discourse (Acland, 2004; Silvera, 1989); engaging with communities to resist oppression (Bobb-Smith, 2003); liberate lives (Freire, 1994; James et al., 2010); and continuing the fight to gain entry into the professoriate. Despite the challenges the participants experienced in their pursuit of a faculty teaching job, their hope continues to inform their educational, family, and occupational goals. Chambers (2012) attests that many Jamaicans remain hopeful "even if only for the sake of our children and their children we must continue to believe that Canada will be good for us. . . . Jamaicans have been, and will continue to be, good for Canada" (p. 9).

The nine participants in this study have been good to Canada as good citizens, engaged parents, studious and career-oriented women interested in making a change to Canadian society and institutions. However, as shown in this study, Canada has yet to reciprocate that goodness to the participants. Bobb-Smith (2003) writes that "the use of spirituality deepens intellectual capacities that can be directed towards survival" (p. 156). As such, depending on God - an integral part of Black people's culture (Bowen Reid & Smalls, 2004) - is a coping mechanism to help deal with frustration and discrimination (Bobb-Smith, 2003; Este & Bernard, 2006; Henry, 1998; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2013; James et al., 2010; Marable, 1993; Silvera, 1989). Their faith is one of the ways in which majority of the participants survived the vicious cycle of racism in Canada even after (re)completing their PSE. That is to say that their belief in a higher power, a form of divinity, enabled them to strategize to "make reasoned and evaluative approaches to situations that threaten[ed] their stability" (Bobb-Smith, 2003, p. 159).

**Recommendations for an Equitable Canadian Academia, and Society**

It is my hope that this study will not only draw attention to the experiences of Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration graduate/post-graduate studies in Canada but also advocate for social changes that will positively impact the lives of Black students and scholars in academia. James et al. (2010) denote that "hope, then, is central to the process of transformation, because it is based on the belief in the possibility that one's circumstances and society can change" (p. 159). Thus, Canada needs to redress barriers to Black Jamaican women as they continue to do their part to contribute to the human capital of society as highly educated Black immigrants.

The following are recommendations that the Canadian society, and academia can adopt to strive to be truly inclusive for Black Jamaican women:

1) creating and implementing transparent immigration policies and processes that have an invested commitment for an equitable outcome for Black immigrants, particularly Black immigrants with pre-migration PSE;
2) alleviating expenses associated with post-migration graduate studies through PS institutions' recognition, appreciation and value for racialized immigrants' pre-migration graduate/post-graduate education and experience;
3) creating equitable higher education policies that inform healthy and productive academic relationships between Black graduate students and supervisors/professors; as well as,
4) support structures for academic resources such as making course directorship mandatory, and at least one conference presentation for all doctoral students to aid development of transferrable skills, work portfolio, and network in the working world.

In addition, consideration should be given to racialized immigrants regarding length of time for producing work; many are often the caregiver for their families. In doing, many Black Jamaican women will experience less frustration, discouragement, and anxiety (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019) that will positively influence their wellbeing. Academia must commit to supporting and investing into scholarships that value the research interest, and work of the Black academic community.

I strongly advocate, as a mandatory feature of academia, that Black students receive support with the publishing of at least one or two academic journal articles from their course work to help level the field for everyone. In doing so, academia would exemplify diversity at work in the lives of racialized graduate students. Thus, facilitating accessibility for many Black women to the professoriate.

**Conclusion**

According to James et al. (2010):

> Education, as we've seen, has failed to overcome racism and discrimination in the labour market. The data and the experience of [Black people] show that even when they survive the Canadian education system, many university-educated [Black] men and women remain unemployed or underemployed. (p. 167)

Hence, it will take more than education in Canada to address the challenges of racism in our society. The experiences of the participants in this study revealed how they were "overlook[ed]" (Senior, 2012, p. 18) in the Canadian society, and ushered on pathways that steered many of them from making their aspirational dreams a reality. The devaluation of their foreign credentials; the unsupportive advice of White professors/supervisors in graduate studies; the denial of Black female bodies in post-migration graduate/post-graduate studies, and the

professoriate; and the racialization of Black female bodies as inferior in academia, negatively impacted the lives of many Black Jamaican women with pre-migration PSE in Canada. However, employing resistant mechanisms such as agency, determination, spirituality, and hope, the participants counteracted racism.

Canada needs to face the skeletons in its colonial closet as strives to be an inclusive multicultural society which requires the address and redress of racism. Lorde (1984) emphasizes that "the master's tools will never dismantle the master's house. [A patriarchal society] may allow us temporarily to beat him at his own game, but they will never enable us to bring about genuine change" (p. 112). The findings in this study is indicative of the fact that not only the academy has a far way to go in dismantling racism but also many Black immigrant women still have a far way to go as a result of the continuous barring of their pre- and post-migration graduate/post-graduate education and experience. As such, it will take the master – the predominant group in Canada, and new and better tools – racialized people, to dismantle the house (patriarchal society) altogether. That is, a complete "overhauled [strategy] to address the insidiousness of anti-Black racism and gendered violence" in Canada (Daniel, 2018, p. 60). As a result, we the stories of Black women can contribute to policies that redress institutional prejudice, and racism to forward the aims of a just and equitable society. As such, we Black women will continue to engage in struggle for change in our Canadian society (Horton, 1990; James et al., 2010) by making real change to the Canadian systems of higher education.

# Chapter Seven: Conclusion

## Introduction

This study reveals that many Canadian universities continue to maintain a culture of whiteness that perpetuates various forms of racism towards Black women academics in the twenty-first century. Daniel (2018) emphasizes the necessity of "recogniz[ing] that the deployment of racism is not based on [Black women] or anything that is deficient in [Black women] but is instead based on a system of oppression that is attempting to sustain itself" (Daniel, 2018, p. 60). As an exploratory study, the main goal of my research was to understand the lived experiences of Black Jamaican women who obtained post-migration education in Canada – "one of the most immigrant-rich countries of all advanced industrial states" (Katchanovski et al., 2015, p. 21). The "idea of empowerment through education is a common refrain among immigrant young people" (James & Taylor, 2008, p. 581). As such, my study deconstructs how the Canadian immigration points system devalued the pre-educational experiences of Black Jamaican women of their home and former Commonwealth country and how the participants navigated their access through their pursuit of post-educational opportunities in Canadian graduate programs as well as the professoriate. Hence, the main contribution of this study as adding the complexities of the migration factor with its histories of colonization to our understandings of racism and barriers to education and opportunity.

Although the devaluation of foreign credentials and the systemic barriers of the Canadian points system are well established in the literature, understanding how decisions are influenced pertaining to the pursuit of post-migration education - despite the attainment of pre-migration credentials – was critical to engaging my first research question. The study shows that many Black Jamaican women obtain post-migration PSE in Canada for multiple reasons. These

include: their perception of Canadian PSE as valuable (Bobb-Smith, 2003; Davis, 2018; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019; James, 2009a; Plaza, 2004; Silvera, 1989); the instability of the Jamaican economy (Demas, 2009; Kamugisha, 2013; Lewis & Lewis, 1985; Nettleford, 1995); and the devaluation of pre-migration post-graduate education when accessing faculty teaching jobs (Augustine, 2015a; Li, 2000, 2001, 2008; Ramos & Li, 2017). The latter finding was shown not only to be systemic in nature but also a money making strategy that drains Black Jamaican women of their financial resources (Altbach & Knight, 2007; Bauder, 2003; Dixon, 2006; Green, 2017; Lusis & Bauder, 2010; Shinnaoui & Narchal, 2010). Desai Trilokekar et al. (2019) attest that "Canadian government policy positions international education as a tool to build human capital for a local-becoming-global marketplace" (p. 103). Canada is strategic with promoting its border as welcoming (see Desai Trilokekar et al., 2019), and as a result, Black Jamaican women come to Canada with pre-migration PSE and are faced with pathways that deny their international education. Such denial of Black Jamaican women's international education leads many of them into (further) debt to work and study towards an academic career that they once had in their country of origin. Furthermore, on the one hand securing admission at Canadian universities is problematic for many Black Jamaican women with pre-migration PSE; on the other hand, the challenges that they encounter during their post-migration studies put their completion of post-migration PSE at risk.

CRT, CRF, and PCT provided me with theoretical resources to demonstrate how the intersectionality of race, gender, class, colonialism and immigration status operate in the lived experiences of Black Jamaican women as these categories of difference arise in their concerns and issues towards barriers they faced when seeking out higher education. Katchanovski et al. (2015) emphasize that "race, gender and affirmative action remain among the most challenging

issues facing American and Canadian higher education" (p. 19). On the one hand, I find some Black Jamaican women are coerced to forfeit their career aspiration, and reposition themselves in jobs that do not commensurate with their skills, and education. On the other hand, the participants that did continue their pursuit to access employment in the professoriate encounter significant obstacles and are even denied entry to Doctoral programs. Participants reported that the dominant group of professors exhibit attitudinal racism towards their aspirations which exhibits the workings of structural racism in pedagogical relations (Henry et al., 2017a). Because, as participants report, the relationships between professors and Black women students are racially charged, discriminatory attitudes impact the educational opportunities and interests of Black Jamaican women. Many professors hold and expressed attitudes of White supremacy (Daniel, 2018; Henry, 2015; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019; James, 2012; Mukandi & Bond, 2019; Smith et al., 2017) towards Black women students. As Daniel (2018) attests:

> Blacks who immerse themselves in Whiteness seldom enter into forms of engagement that may rustle or unsettle the master's domain, thereby ensuring that they continue to be looked upon with grace and afforded the privilege of White acceptance, irrespective of how superficial and tenuous that acceptance may be. (p. 61)

As my analysis reveals, professional and educational support for Black Jamaican female graduate students and academics is fraught with bias that expose them to racism, stress, and health issues that impede their educational and occupational progress in Canada. My participants' experiences of higher education found that Black women professionals face significant and pervasive obstacles while obtaining post-migration education. In fact, macro- and micro-aggressions are evident on Ontario Canadian university campuses (Daniel, 2018, 2019; Henry, 2015; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019) despite the "universities' purported

mandate to address issues of equity, diversity, and inclusion" (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019, p. 186).

Framed through CRT, CRF, and PCT, the participants' narratives of racism and marginalization of gender are crucial to interrogating issues pertaining to employment outcomes for Black Jamaican women who obtain post-migration education.

As illustrated in this study, even after the completion of post-migration graduate/post-graduate education, Black Jamaican women continue to face barriers to access faculty teaching jobs in a country that prides itself as being multicultural, and inclusive. Likewise, James et al. (2010) echo the nuances surrounding the unemployment or underemployment of university-educated Black people in Canada. Hence the rhetoric of multiculturalism is porous yet saturated with discriminatory agendas to maintain a dominant society while seemingly appearing to promote the inclusion of diversity in Canada. This finding responds to my third research question as this dissertation finds that many Black Jamaican women are not working in their field of study as professors at a Canadian PS institution. I further find that those who have been granted access are given access based on tokenism (Abawi, 2018; Daniel, 2019; Desai Trilokekar et al., 2019; Henry, 2015; Henry et al., 2017b; Henry & Kobayashi, 2017; James, 2009b, 2012, 2017; James & Chapman-Nyaho, 2017; Kanter, 1993); that is, "minorities (numerically speaking) are so few that their presence positions them as representatives of a category" (James, 2012, p. 135). Regardless of employment or not, many Black female academics in higher education experience racialization from both students and colleagues.

My research sheds light on the fact that Black Jamaican women continue to experience little to no change in university policies towards supporting their access in academia. The interview findings reveal that amidst discourses of diversity, and policies in higher learning

institutions (Abawi, 2018; Daniel, 2018, 2019; Desai Trilokekar & El Masri, 2017; Dua & Bhanji, 2017a, 2017b; Henry et al., 2017a, 2017b; Henry & Tator, 2009a, 2009b; James, 2011, 2017; James & Chapman-Nyaho, 2017; Smith, 2017; Smith et al, 2017), and in the society (Anwar, 2014; Anderson et al., 2010; Gibbs, 1996; Henry, 1998; James, 1995; 2004, 2008, 2010; James et al., 2010), Ontario universities are not yet committed to overhauling systemic barriers that proliferate racism throughout the society (Daniel, 2018; Henry, 2015; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019). This qualitative phenomenological research brings new knowledge to the fields of higher education, and women studies by illustrating how Black Jamaican women with pre- and post migration education experience limited and barred accessibility to professoriate jobs. It also reveals how Black women's bodies are controlled and surveilled through systemic structures and social reproduction in the Canadian academy and society.

## Implications for Constructive Support for Black Female Immigrants

### *Transparent and Equitable Immigration Policies/Processes*

All the participants in this research revealed that they immigrate to Canada with the hope of seeking opportunities to enhance their educational and occupational desires based on Canada's mythical portrayal as accommodating and diverse. "Considering . . . the small size of the academic job market in Canada" (Nevin, 2019, p. 391), one way in which Canada can work towards a real inclusive society is to ensure that it creates preliminary- and post- immigration policies and processes that are transparent and equitable in nature for the advancement of Black immigrants who desire to pursue their pre-migration occupational desires. That is, the Canadian immigration has to be serious about disrupting and dismantling the monopoly of colonialism under the guise of providing points for pre-migration education, skills and experience that are devalued upon entry, and instead, as a step in an equitable direction for social justice, work

towards processes that integrate Black immigrants in the Canadian society, and their occupational desires. For instance, Canadian immigration and university websites should provide specific information of the steps and support structures in place that are invested to the successful integration of immigrants with international education as well as the estimated timeframe. It is critical for the government of Canada to endorse and financially support research, and immigration practices that will result in equitable immigration outcomes for Black immigrants, particularly Black immigrants with pre-migration graduate/post-graduate education – whereby Canada is known to open its borders wide to highly educated Black immigrants.

With such transparent and equitable immigration processes in place between the Canadian immigration system and PS institutions, true inclusiveness would not only be reflected in the society but also experienced by Black immigrants. Kimone, Oneisha, Toni, Gabriella, Geraldine, Diane, and Mary shared their frustrations on being given the impression that they would have little or no issues pursuing a faculty teaching job (by the rewarding of points for their international education). As such, Black immigrants with PSE from the Global South and elsewhere who have a desire to enter their pre-migration occupations should be supported in their endeavours in accessing their occupational desires such as faculty teaching jobs in Canada. In so doing, Canada would portray its new reality for many Black female academics with pre-migration PSE.

***Bridge the Gap***

Given the fact that many Black Jamaican women arrive in Canada with pre-migration graduate/post-graduate education (Davis, 2018; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019; James, 2009a; Mullings et al., 2012), bridging programs with the interest of Black immigrants, particularly Black immigrant women, can be created as an intermediate support for an anti-racist transition

for Black immigrants into PS institutions and the professoriate in light of the fact that the dominant society, and the academy are yet to seriously commit to social, institutional and systemic changes that are emancipated from inherent colonial histories, and structures (Daniel, 2018; Lorde, 1984). In particular, Geraldine drew attention to the fact that there was no bridging program to support her interest to access the Canadian professoriate. Significantly, scholars such as Banerjee and Phan (2014), Goldberg (2002), and Malatest and Associates (2010) affirm the lack of bridging programs for many occupations.

Most importantly, it is pertinent for Canadian PS institutions to recognize themselves as colonial institutions that exacerbate the racialization and marginalization of many Black immigrant students through the repeated denial of their pre-migration graduate/post-graduate education; the limited or no accountability of unhealthy supervisory relationships; and the maintenance of White dominance at the administrative and professorial levels. Significantly, my study contributes research that can inform higher education policies on supervisory relationships between Black graduate students and supervisors.

In order to achieve real change in Canadian PS institutions, specifically PS institutions in the GTA, recognition and appreciation for racialized immigrants' pre-migration graduate/post-graduate education and experience should be endorsed, enforced and practiced in these educational institutions. In so doing, the financial burden, and stress associated with institutional racism can be alleviated; as well as valuing education and experiences from the Global South. When the academy appreciates racialized immigrants' pre-migration graduate/post-graduate education, it embraces an epistemological position of openness to the (different) ways of knowing as well as breaks the colonial cycle and structures that privilege Eurocentric knowledge as the universal benchmark.

### *Let us Teach*

This study demonstrates that many Black Jamaican women face challenges in Canadian PS institutions. As such, they need support with their transition (Maldonado et al., 2013; Nevin, 2019; Siltanen et al., 2019) from post-migration graduate/post-graduate students to the professoriate. According to Siltanen et al., (2019), "lack of funding presses students into employment, taking time and energy away from their studies, leading to longer stays in the PhD program" (p. 277). Therefore, institutions of higher learning need to implement practical support structures that consider the multiple spheres that Black female immigrants occupy in order to aid their completion of graduate programs, and entry into faculty teaching jobs. As aforementioned, there are other factors such as one's publication, research, teaching experience, and work in the community in addition to a PhD credential that contribute to accessing the professoriate. Including course directorship and conference presentations as an integral part of completing doctoral studies can provide practical skills. However, the implementation of these initiatives as mandatory ought not to add further stress but should premise on a balanced graduate program.

## Recommendations for Further Research

This study examined the lived experiences of Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration graduate/post-graduate education who desired to work in the academy. Aforementioned, many Black Jamaican women experience racism in the Canadian university that thwarts one's efforts to pursue a faculty teaching job. Significantly, further research on the number of years in which Black Jamaican women gain access to desirable employment after obtaining post-migration PSE in Canada will also be noteworthy in that "four years in the host country may be insufficient for forming social networks that result in finding more prestigious jobs" (Adamuti-Trache et al., 2013, p. 196). Hence there is a need for "follow-up study of

university [immigrant] graduates, five or ten years after graduation, [to] shed further light on their labour market experiences as their careers progress" (Maximova & Krahn, 2005, p. 104). In so doing, factors pertaining to the length of time that it takes for Black Jamaican women who eventually access the professoriate will reveal further systemic structures that need to be dismantled to achieve full access of Black females in Canadian higher learning institutions. Moreover, it is necessary for future research to explore how university policies and procedures impede and/or promote academic faculty job accessibility (Abawi, 2018; Daniel, 2019; Henry, 2015; Henry & Tator, 2009b, 2012; Henry et al., 2017a; Henry et al., 2012, 2017; Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2009, 2019; James 2009b, 2011, 2012, 2017; James & Chapman-Nyaho, 2017; Kobayashi, 2009; Mohamed & Beagan, 2018; Ornstein et al., 2007; Smith et al., 2017) of Black immigrant women in Canadian universities in order to expose the Eurocentric gate keeping process that universities continue to use to maintain power imbalance; as well as "affect policy change in universities that could assist Caribbean students to not only enroll in university but also succeed" (Hernandez-Ramdwar, 2019, p. 186).

**My Reflection**

Interacting with the nine participants has taught me how resilient Black Jamaican women are in the pursuit of their occupational desires despite the obstacles they encountered in the Canadian universities. Importantly, Black Jamaican women remain hopeful for changes in the universities not only for themselves but also for their children. Throughout the process, I have learned the importance of sharing our experiences together as Black Jamaican women. In sharing, we encourage and empower each other which contribute to the continuation of research that seeks to deepen the understanding of Black Jamaican women with pre-migration PSE in Ontario universities.

The participants' voices can contribute to policy change in the university based on the attention drawn to the racial tension and decisions of graduate admissions committee, especially for Black immigrants with pre-migration PSE who are already in the graduate program completing their master's degree and have applied for the doctoral program. In addition, the participants' experiences reveal that Ontario universities need to credit pre-migration PSE courses that are similar. When university policy allows for accreditation of pre-migration PSE courses from developing countries such as Jamaica (that shares a similar British educational system), then value for pre-migration PSE would be recognized by the university as well as the length of time for some program completion would be shorter for many Black female immigrants.

Black Jamaican female academics bring valuable knowledge and experience to the professoriate. Althea's experience sheds light on token hires in that Black female professors are severely underrepresented in her department, and the added expectation that she is subjected to perform in order to validate her presence in academia. As such, university policy makers should work beyond tokenism and strive to include Black female academics with pre-migration graduate/post-graduate education in the professoriate. It behooves PS institution policies to learn from the experiences of Black female immigrants with pre-migration PSE to implement policies that are inclusive, and accommodating.

It is my hope that this study will draw attention to the issues surrounding Black Jamaican women's limited access to the professoriate in Ontario. In particular, the experiences of the Black Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration graduate/post-graduate education in this study revealed unsettling racial trends such as the underrepresentation of Black female post-graduate students and academics in the twenty-first century. The difficulties that many Black

Jamaican women face in pursuit of a faculty teaching job are important to understand in order to work towards an impactful change. Many Black female academics arrive in Canada to contribute to its human capital in the professoriate but are instead relegated to jobs that do not reflect their experiences and skills. Thus limiting the scope and influence of the Black diasporic academic community.

## References


Abawi, Z. E. (2018). Factors and processes of racialization in the Canadian academe. *Canadian Journal for New Scholars in Education*, 9 (1), 85-95.

Abrons, J. P., Andreas, E., Jolly, O., Parisi-Mercado, M., Daly, A., & Carr, I. (2019). Cultural sensitivity and global pharmacy engagement in the Caribbean: Dominica, Jamaica, Puerto Rico, and St. Kitts. *American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education*, 83 (4), 665-681.

Academic Women's Association [AWA]. (2016). *The diversity gap in representation*. Retrieved from https://uofaawa.wordpress.com/awa-diversity-gap-campaign/the-diversity-gap-in-representation/

Access Alliance (2013). *Where are the Good Jobs?: Ten stories of working rough, living poor.* Toronto: Access Alliance Multicultural Health and Community Services.

Acker, S., & Armenti, C. (2004). Sleepless in academia. *Gender and Education,* 16 (1), 3-24.

Acland, J. (2004). Foreword. In C. A. Nelson & C. A. Nelson (Eds.), *Racism, eh? Critical interdisciplinary anthology of race and racism in Canada* (pp. xi-xii). Concord, ON: Captus Press.

Adamuti-Trache, M., Anisef, P., & Sweet, R. (2013). Impact of Canadian postsecondary education on occupational prestige of highly educated immigrants. *Canadian Review of Sociology*, 50 (2), 178-202.

Adnett, N. (2010). The growth of international students and economic development: Friends or foes? *Journal of Education Policy*, 25 (5), 625-637.

Agocs, C. (2002). Canada's employment equity legislation and policy, 1987-2000: The gap between policy and practice. *International Journal of Manpower*, 23 (3), 256-276.

Aguiar, L., Mckinnon, A., & Sookraj, D. (2010). Repertoires of racism: Reactions to Jamaicans

in the Okanagan Valley. *BC Studies*, 168, 65-79.

Agyepong, R. (2010). Rethinking anti-racism and equity education: Issues of curriculum and development of teachers. *Our Schools/Our Selves*, 19 (3), 75-85.

Ahmed, S. (2007). A phenomenology of whiteness. *Feminist Theory*, 8 (2), 149-168.

Ahmed, S. (2012). *On being included: Racism and diversity in institutional life*. London: Duke University Press.

Altbach, P. G., & Knight, J. (2007). The internationalization of higher education: Motivations and realities. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 11 (3-4), 290-305.

Altbach, P., & Reisberg, L. (2013). The pursuit of international students in a commercialized world. *International Higher Education*, 73, 2-4.

Al-Yateem, N. (2012). The effect of interview recording on quality of data obtained: A methodological reflection. *Nurse Researcher*, 19 (4), 31-35.

Anderson, J. M., Reimer, J., Khan, K. B., Simich, L., Neufeld, A., Stewart, M., & Makwarimba, E. (2010). Narratives of dissonance and repositioning through the lens of critical humanism: Exploring the influences on immigrants' and refugees' health and well-being. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 33 (2), 101-112.

Anderson, W. W. (1993). *Canadian immigrants: A socio-demographic profile*. Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press.

Anisef, P., Sweet, R., & Adamuti-Trache, M. (2008). *Impact of Canadian post-secondary education on recent immigrants' labour market outcomes*. Ottawa: Citizenship and Immigration Canada. Retrieved from http://www.academia.edu/2886884/Impact_of_Canadian_Post-secondary_Education_on_Recent_Immigrants_Labour_Market_Outcomes

Annamma, S. A., & Winn, M. (2019). Transforming our mission: Animating teacher education through intersectional justice. Theory Into Practice, 58 (4), 318-327.

Anwar, A. (2014). Canadian immigration policy: Micro and macro issues with the points based assessment system. *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, 46 (1), 169-179.

Archer, K., & Berdahl, L. (2011). *Explorations: Conducting empirical research in Canadian political science* (2nd ed.). Canada: Oxford University Press.

Arday, J. (2017). *University and college union (UCU): Exploring Black and minority ethnic (BME) doctoral students' perceptions of a career in academia: Experiences, perceptions and career progression*. London: Creative Commons.

Arday, J. (2018). Dismantling power and privilege through reflexivity: Negotiating normative Whiteness, the Eurocentric curriculum and racial micro-aggressions within the academy. *Whiteness and Education*, 3 (2), 141-161.

Ari, E. (2019). Centering the white gaze: Identity construction among second-generation Jamaicans and Portugues. *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, 51 (2), 61-86.

Armenti, C. (2004). Gender as a barrier for women with children in academe. *Canadian Journal of Higher Education*, 34 (1),1-26.

Arthur, N., & Flynn, S. (2011). Career development influences of international students who pursue permanent immigration to Canada. *International Journal for Educational and Vocational Guidance*, 11, 221-237.

Ashcroft, B., Griffiths, G., & Tiffin, H. (2000). *Post-colonial studies: The key concepts*. London: Routledge.

Ashcroft, B., Griffiths, G., & Tiffin, H. (2007). *Post-colonial studies: The key concepts* (2nd ed.). London: Routledge.

Ashcroft, B., Griffiths, G., & Tiffin, H. (2013). *Post-colonial studies: The key concepts* (3rd ed.). London: Routledge.

Association of Universities and Colleges of Canada (AUCC). (2011). Trends in higher education. Retrieved from https://www.univcan.ca/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/trends-vol1-enrolment-june-2011.pdf

Association of Universities and Colleges of Canada (AUCC). (2014). AUCC internationalization survey. Retrieved from https://www.univcan.ca/wp-content/uploads/2015/07/internationalization-survey-2014.pdf

Augustine, J. (2015a). Employment match rates in the regulated professions: Trends and policy implications. *Canadian Public Policy*, 41 (Supplement 1), S28-S47.

Augustine, J. (2015b). Immigrant professionals and alternative routes to licensing: Policy implications for regulators and governments. *Canadian Public Policy*, 41 (Supplement 1), S14-S27.

Aydemir, A., & Borjas, G. (2006). A comparative analysis of the labour market impact of international migration: Canada, Mexico, and the United States. *NBER Working Paper No. 12327*, 1-64.

Aylward, C.A. (1999). *Canadian Race Theory: Racism and the Law*. Halifax: Fernwood Publishing.

Ayres, L. (2008). Thematic coding and analysis. In L. M. Given (Ed.), *The sage encyclopedia of qualitative research methods* (pp. 867-868). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Bakan, A. B., & Stasiulis, D. K. (1994). Foreign domestic worker policy in Canada and the social boundaries of modern citizenship. *Science and Society*, 58, 7-33.

Bakan, A. B., & Stasiulis, D. K. (1995). Making the match: Domestic placement agencies and

the racialization of women's household work. *Signs*, 20, 303-335.

Balibar, E. (1991). Is there a neo-racism? In E. Balibar & I. Wallerstein (Eds.), *Race, nation, class: Ambiguous identities* (pp. 17-28). London: Verso Books.

Banerjee, R. (2008). An examination of factors affecting perception of workplace discrimination. *Journal of Labour Research*, 29, 380-401.

Banerjee, R., & Phan, M. (2014). Licensing requirements and occupational mobility among highly skilled new immigrants in Canada. *Industrial Relations*, 69 (2), 290-315.

Banerjee, R., & Verma, A. (2012). Post-migration education among recent adult immigrant to Canada. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 13 (1), 59-82.

Bannerji, H. (1995). *Thinking through: Essays on feminism, Marxism, and anti-racism*. Toronto: Women's Press.

Bannerji, H. (2000). Faculty voices. In York Stories Collective (Eds.), *York stories: Women in higher education* (94-115). Toronto, ON: Tsar.

Barnes, A., & Virgint, E. (2019). The legislative process: From government policy to proclamation. Library of Parliament: Ottawa, Canada. Retrieved from https://lop.parl.ca/staticfiles/PublicWebsite/Home/ResearchPublications/InBriefs/PDF/2019-31-e.pdf

Barrett, L. (1974). *Soul force: African heritage in Afro-American religion*. New York: Anchor.

Bastick, T. (2004). Commonwealth degrees from class to equivalence: Changing to grade point averages in the Caribbean. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 8 (1), 86-104.

Bauder, H. (2003). Brain abuse or the devaluation of immigrant labour in Canada. *Antipode*, 35 (4), 699-717.

Beck, K. (2012). Globalization/s: Reproduction and resistance in the internationalization of

higher education. *Canadian Journal of Education*, 35 (3), 133-148.

Bell, D. A. (1980). Brown v. board of education and the interest-convergence dilemma. *Harvard Law Review*, 93 (3), 518-533.

Bercusion, D., Bothwell, R., & Granatstein, J. L. (1997). *Petrified campus: The crisis in Canada's universities*. Toronto, ON: Random House Canada.

Berry, T. R. (2005). Black on Black education: Personally engaged pedagogy for/by African American pre-service teachers. *The Urban Review*, 37 (1), 31-48.

Berry, T. R. (2009). Women of color in a bilingual/dialectal dilemma: Critical race feminism against a curriculum of oppression in teacher education. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 22 (6), 745-753.

Berry, T. R. (2015). Me and Bill: Connecting Black curriculum orientations to critical race feminism. *Educational Studies*, 51 (5), 423-433.

Besner, N. (2003). What resides in the question, is Canada postcolonial? In L. Moss (Ed.), *Is Canada Postcolonial?: Unsettling Canadian literature* (pp. 40-48). Canada: Wilfrid Laurier University Press.

Beverly, J. (2005). Testimonio, subalternity, and narrative authority. In N. Denzin & Y. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research* (3rd ed.), (pp. 547-558). London: Sage.

Bhopal, K., Brown, H., & Jackson, J. (2016). BME academic flight from UK to overseas higher education: Aspects of marginalization and exclusion. *British Educational Research Journal*, 42 (2), 240-257.

Black, D. A. (2015). Internationalization, cross-border tertiary education and the challenge for quality: A Jamaican perspective. In A. K. Perkins (Ed.), *Quality in higher education in the Caribbean* (pp. 171-180). Jamaica: The University of the West Indies Press.

Bloch, E. (1986). *The principle of hope*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Block, S., & Galabuzi, G. (2011). Canada's Colour Coded Labour Market: the Gap for Racialized workers. *Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives.* Retrieved 15 February 2018, from https://www.wellesleyinstitute.com/wp-content/uploads/2011/03/Colour_Coded_Labour_MarketFINAL.pdf

Bobb-Smith, Y. (2003). *I know who I am: Caribbean woman's identity in Canada*. Toronto, ON: Women's Press.

Bonikowska, A., Hou, F., & Picot, G. (2011). A Canada-US comparison of labour market outcomes among highly educated immigrants. *Canadian Public Policy*, 37 (1), 25-48.

Bonner, A., & Tolhurst, G. (2002). Insider-outsider perspectives of participant observation. *Nurse Researcher*, 9 (4), 7-19.

Bowen Reid, T. L., & Smalls, C. (2004). Stress, spirituality and health promoting behaviours among African American college students. The Western Journal of Black Studies, 28 (1), 283-291.

Boxer, M. J. (2000). Challenging the traditional curriculum. In J. Glazer-Raymo, B. K. Townsend & B. Ropers-Huliman (Eds.), *Women in higher education: A feminist perspective* (pp. 487-506). Boston, MA: Pearson Custom Pub. (Reprinted from *When women ask the questions: Creating women's studies in America*, by Marilyn Jacoby Boxer, 1998, Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press).

Boyd, D.A.C. (1988). *Economic management, income distribution and poverty in Jamaica*. New York: NY: Praeger Publishers.

Boyd-Franklin, N. (2003). *Black families in therapy: Understanding the African American experience* (2nd ed.). New York: The Guilford Press.

Braden, S. (2000). On hearing women's silences in the classroom. In York Stories Collective (Eds.), *York stories: Women in higher education* (44-57). Toronto, ON: Tsar.

Breen, L. J. (2007). The researcher in the middle: Negotiating the insider/outsider dichotomy. *The Australian Community Psychologist*, 19 (1), 163-174.

Browne, K. (2005). Snowball sampling: using social networks to research non-heterosexual women. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 8 (1), 47 – 60.

Buzdugan, R., & Halli, S. S. (2009). Labor market experiences of Canadian immigrants with focus on foreign education and experience. *The International Migration Review*, 43 (2), 366-386.

Calder, M., Richter, S., Mao, Y., Burns, K. K., Mogale, R. S., & Danko, M. (2016). International students attending Canadian universities: Their experiences with housing, finances, and other issues. *Canadian Journal of Higher Education*, 46 (2), 92-110.

Calliste, A. (1991). Canada's immigration policy and domestics from the Caribbean: The second domestic scheme. *Socialist Studies*, 5, 136-138.

Campbell, H. (1973). Jamaica: The myth of economic development and racial tranquility. *The Black Scholar*, 4 (5), 16 -23.

Canadian Association of University Teachers. (2014). *CAUT almanac of post-secondary education: 2013 – 2014*. Retrieved from http://www.caut.ca/docs/default-source/almanac/almanac_2013-2014_print_finalE20A5E5CA0EA6529968D1CAF86d13cf1c6ef6d389810ff00005eecd3.pdf?sfvrsn=4.pdf?sfvrsn=2

Canadian Race Relations Foundation. (2015-2016). *Annual Report.* Retrieved 15 February 2018, from https://www.crrf-fcrr.ca/images/2016AR/AnnualReport2016Digital.pdf

Carrington, W. J., & Detragiache, E. (1999, June). How extensive is the brain drain? *Finance &*

*Development*, *36*(2), 46+. Retrieved from http://link.galegroup.com.ezproxy.library.yorku.ca/apps/doc/A55106627/EAIM?u=yorku_main&sid=EAIM&xid=d8ebaa3f

Castells, M. (1996). *The rise of the network society: The information age: Economy, society, and culture*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Chambers, M. A. (2012). Foreword. In C. E. James & A. Davis (Eds.), *Jamaica in the Canadian experience: A multiculturalizing presence* (pp. 7-9). Black Point, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

Chapra, A., & Chatterjee, S. (2009). Talking race, talking colour: Racialized women, their home and belongingness in multicultural Canada. *Canadian Woman Studies*, 27 (2/3), 14-20.

Charles, C. A. D. (2009). Skin bleachers' representation of skin colo[u]r in Jamaica. *Journal of Black Studies*, 40 (2), 153-170.

Charmaz, K. (2006). *Constructing grounded theory*. London: Sage

Chase, S. E. (1995). Taking narrative seriously: Consequences for method and theory in interviews studies. In R. Josselson & A. Lieblich (Eds.), *Interpreting experiences: The narrative study of lives* Vol. 3, (pp. 1-26). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Chase, S. E. (2005). Narrative inquiry: Multiple lenses, approaches, voices. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative research* (3rd ed.), (pp. 651-679). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Chawla, S. (2000). Faculty voices. In York Stories Collective (Eds.), *York stories: Women in higher education* (116-136). Toronto, ON: Tsar.

Childers-McKee, C. D., & Hytten, K. (2015). Critical race feminism and the complex challenges of educational reform. *The Urban Review*, 47 (3), 393-412.

Childs, R. A., Broad, K., Gallagher-Mackay, K., Sher, Y., Escayg, K.-A., & McGrath, C. (2011). Pursuing equity in and through teacher education program admissions. *Education Policy Analysis Archives,* 19 (24), 1-22.

Clandinin, D. J., & Connelly, F. M. (2000). *Narrative inquiry: Experience and story in qualitative research*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, Inc.

Clark, N., & Saleb, N. (2019). Applying critical race feminism and intersectionality to narrative inquiry: A point of resistance for Muslim nurses donning a hijab. *Advances in Nursing Science,* 42 (2), 156-171.

Clarke, G. E. (2003). What was Canada? In L. Moss (Ed.), *Is Canada Postcolonial?: Unsettling Canadian literature* (pp. 27-39). Canada: Wilfrid Laurier University Press.

Cliff, M. (1984). *Abeng*. Trumansburg, New York: Crossing Press.

Cobley, A. G. (2000). The historical development of higher education in the Anglophone Caribbean. In G. D. Howe (Ed.), *Higher education in the Caribbean: Past, present and future directions* (pp. 1-23). Jamaica: The University of the West Indies Press.

Colic-Peisker, V., & Tilbury, F. (2006). Employment niches for recent refugees: Segmented labour market in twenty-first century Australia. *Journal of Refugee Studies*, 19 (2), 203 – 229.

Collins, P. (2000). Coming to voice, coming to power: Black feminist thought as critical social theory. In J. Glazer-Raymo, B. K. Townsend & B. Ropers-Huliman (Eds.), *Women in higher education: A feminist perspective* (pp. 34-52). Boston, MA: Pearson Custom Pub. (Reprinted from *Fighting words: Black women and the search for justice,* by Patricia Hill Collins, 1998, Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press).

Collins, P. H. (2008). Black feminist thought: Knowledge, consciousness, and the politics of

empowerment (1st ed.). New York, NY: Routledge.

Colnerud, G. (2015). Ethical dilemmas in research in relation to ethical review: An empirical study. *Research Ethics*, 10 (4), 238-253.

Cornish, F., Gillespie, A., & Zittoun, T. (2014). Collaboration analysis of qualitative data. In U. Flick (Ed.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative data analysis* (pp. 79-93). London: Sage.

Cornish, F., Zittoun, T., & Gillespie, A. (2007). A cultural psychological reflection on collaborative research. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 8 (3), Art. 21. Retrieved from http://www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fqs/article/view/309/678

Cortazzi, M., & Jin, L. (2012). Approaching narrative analysis with 19 questions. In S. Delamont, *Handbook of qualitative research in education (*pp. 474-488). Cheltenham, U.K.: Edward Elgar Publishing.

Cragoe, N. G. (2019). Oversight: Community vulnerabilities in the blind spot of research ethics. *Research Ethics*, 15 (2), 1-15.

Crawford, C. (2004). African-Canadian women, diaspora and transnationality. *Canadian Women Studies*, 23 (2), 97-103.

Crenshaw, K. (1989). Demarginalizing the intersection of race and sex: A Black feminist critique of antidiscrimination doctrine, feminist theory and antiracist policies. *University of Chicago Legal Forum*, 1, 139-168.

Crenshaw, K. (1991). Mapping the margins: Intersectionality, identity politics, and violence against women of color. *Stanford Law Review*, 43, 1241–1299.

Crenshaw, K. (1993). Demarginalizing the interaction of race and sex: A Black feminist critique of antidiscrimination doctrine, feminist theory, and anti-racist politics. In D. Weisberg (Ed.), *Feminist legal theory: Foundations* (pp. 383-411). Philadelphia: Temple

University Press.

Creswell, J. W. (1994). *Research design: Qualitative and quantitative approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Creswell, J. W. (1998). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five traditions*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage

Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (3rd ed.) Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Crossley, M., & Tikly, L. (2004). Postcolonial perspectives and comparative and international research in education: A critical introduction. *Comparative Education*, 40 (2), 147-156.

Cudmore, G. (2005). Globalization, internationalization, and the recruitment of international students in higher education, and in the Ontario colleges of applied arts and technology. *The Canadian Journal of Higher Education*, 35 (1), 37-60.

Curran, D., Kekewich, M., & Foreman, T. (2019). Examining the use of consent forms to promote dissemination of research results to participants. *Research Ethics*, 15 (1), 1-28.

Currie, M. (1998). *Postmodern narrative theory*. London: Macmillian Press.

Daniel, B. (2010). Reimagining the urban: A Canadian perspective. *Urban Education*, 45 (6), 822-839.

Daniel, B. (2018). Knowing the self and the reason for being: Navigating racism in the academy. *Canadian Women Studies*, 32 (1), 59-66.

Daniel, B. (2019). Teaching while Black: Racial dynamics, evaluations, and the role of White females in the Canadian academy in carrying the racism torch. Race Ethnicity and

Education, 22 (1), 21-37.

Davis, A. (2012). From Jamaica to Canada: Miss Lou and the poetics of migration. In C. E. James & A. Davis, *Jamaica in the Canadian experience: A multiculturalizing presence* (pp. 230-245). Black Point, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

Davis, A. (2017). The real Toronto: Black youth experiences and the narration of the multicultural city. *Journal of Canadian Studies*, 51 (3), 725-748.

Davis, A. (2018). The black woman native speaking subject: Reflections of a black female professor in Canada. *Atlantis Journal*, 39 (1), 70-78.

Davis, A., & James, C. E. (2012). Introduction: Changing the channel. In C. E. James & A. Davis (Eds.), *Jamaica in the Canadian experience: A multiculturalizing presence* (pp. 10-12). Black Point, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

Decuir, J., & Dixson, A. (2004). So when it comes out, they aren't that surprised that it is there: Using critical race theory as a tool of analysis of race and racism in education. *Educational Researcher*, 33, 26-31.

Delgado, R. (2011). Rodrigo's reconsideration: Intersectionality and the future of critical race theory. *Iowa Law Review*, 96, 1247-1288.

Demas, W. G. (2009). *The economics of development in small countries*. Kingston: University of the West Indies Press.

Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2011). Introduction: The discipline and practice of qualitative research. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.). The Sage handbook of qualitative research (4th ed.), (pp. 1-19). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

DeReus, L., Few, A. L., & Blume, L. B. (2005). Multicultural and critical race feminisms: Theorizing families in the third wave. In V. L. Bengtson, A. C. Acock, K. R. Allen, P.

Dilworth-Anderson & D. M. Klein (Eds.), *Sourcebook of family theory and research* (pp. 447-468). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Desai Trilokekar, R., & El Masri, A. (2017). The [h]unt for new Canadians begins in the classroom: The construction and contradictions of Canadian policy discourse on international education. Globalisation, Societies and Education, 15 (5), 666-678.

Desai Trilokekar, R., Thomson, K., & El Masri, A. (2019). Open borders, closed minds: The experiences of international students in the Ontario labour market. In R. Coelen & C. Gribble (Eds.), *Internationalization and employability in higher education* (pp. 101-115). New York, NY: Routledge.

de Wit, H. (2013). Reconsider the concept of internationalization. *International Higher education*, 70, 6-7.

Dicroce, D. M. (1995). Women and the community college presidency: challenges and possibilities. *New Directions for Community Colleges*, 89, 79-88.

Dixon, M. (2006). Globalization and international higher education: Contested positionings. *Journal of Studies in International Education,* 10 (4), 319-333.

Dua, E., & Bhanji, N. (2012). Exploring the potential of data collected under the federal contractors programme to construct a national picture of visible minority and Aboriginal faculty in Canadian universities. *Canadian Ethnic Studies Journal*, 44 (2), 49-74.

Dua, E., & Bhanji, N. (2017a). Mechanisms to address inequities in Canadian universities: The performativity of ineffectiveness. In F. Henry, E. Dua, C. E. James, A. Kobayashi, P. Li, H. Ramos & M. S. Smith, *The equity myth: Racialization and Indigeneity at Canadian universities* (pp. 206-238). Vancouver, BC: University of British Columbia Press.

Dua, E., & Bhanji, N. (2017b). Shifting terrains: A picture of the institutionalization of equity in

Canadian universities. In F. Henry, E. Dua, C. E. James, A. Kobayashi, P. Li, H. Ramos & M. S. Smith, *The equity myth: Racialization and Indigeneity at Canadian universities* (pp. 171-205). Vancouver, BC: University of British Columbia Press.

Duleep, H., & Regets, M. C. (1999). Immigrants and human-capital investment. *American Economic Review*, 89 (2), 186-191.

Dyde, B., Greenwood, R., & Hamber, S. (2009). *Decolonisation & development* (3rd ed.). Oxford, England: MacMillan Publishers.

Eatough, V., & Smith, J. A. (2008). Interpretative phenomenogical analysis. In C. Willig & W. Stainton Rogers (Eds.), *The SAGE handbook of qualitative research in psychology* (pp. 179-194). London: Sage.

Eberle, T. S. (2014). Phenomenology as a research method. In U. Flick (Ed.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative data analysis* (pp. 184-202). London: Sage.

Elliot, J. (2012). Gathering narrative data. In S. Delamont, *Handbook of qualitative research in education* (pp. 281-298). Cheltenham, U.K.: Edward Elgar Publishing.

El Masri, A., Choubak, M., & Litchmore, R. (2015). *The global competition for international students as future immigrants: The role of Ontario universities in translating government policy into institutional practice*. Toronto: Higher Education Quality Council of Ontario.

Esin, C., Fathi, M., & Squire, C. (2014). Narrative analysis: The constructionist approach. In U. Flick (Ed.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative data analysis* (pp. 203-216). London: Sage.

Este, D., & Bernard, W. T. (2006). Spirituality among African Nova Scotians: A key to survival in Canadian society. *Critical Social Work*, 7 (1), 1-22.

Fanon, F. (1961) *The Wretched of the Earth*, translated by Constance Farrington, New York: Grove.

Farber, K. (2006). Conducting qualitative research: A practical guide for school counselors. *Professional School Counseling*, 9 (5), 367 – 375.

Fearon, G. (2012). The changing Jamaican economy: From independence to now. In C. E. James & A. Davis, *Jamaica in the Canadian experience: A multiculturalizing presence* (pp. 310-323). Black Point, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

Ferguson, I. L. (1947). Education in Jamaica, British West Indies. *The Journal of Negro Education*, 16 (4), 600 - 603.

Few, A. L. (2007). Integrating black consciousness and critical race feminism into family studies research. *Journal of Family Issues*, 28 (4), 452-473.

Fleras, A. (2004). Racializing culture/culturalizing race: Multicultural racism in a multicultural Canada. In C. A. Nelson & C. A. Nelson (Eds.), *Racism, eh? Critical interdisciplinary anthology of race and racism in Canada* (pp. 429-443). Concord, ON: Captus Press.

Flood, A. (2010). Understanding phenomenology. *Nurse Researcher*, 17 (2), 7 – 15.

Foreign Affairs, Trade and Development Canada. (2014). Canada's international education strategy: Harnessing our knowledge advantage to drive innovation and prosperity. Retrieved from https://www.international.gc.ca/global-markets-marches-mondiaux/assets/pdfs/overview-apercu-eng.pdf

Foster, C. (2007). *Blackness and modernity: The colour of humanity and the quest for freedom*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Freire, P. (1994). *Pedagogy of hope: Reliving pedagogy of the oppressed*. New York: Continuum.

Fuller, S., & Martin, T. (2012). Predicting immigrant employment sequences in the first years of settlement. *IMR*, 46 (1), 138-190.

Galabuzi, G.E. (2001). *Canada's Creeping Economic Apartheid: The Economic Segregation and Social Marginalization of Racialized Groups*. Toronto: CSJ Foundation.

Gaztambide-Fernandez, R. A. (2012). Decolonization and the pedagogy of solidarity. *Decolonization: Indigeneity, Education & Society*, 1 (1), 41-67.

Ghabrial, S. (2012). Pink panics, yellow perils, and the mythology of meritocracy. In R. Gilmour, D. Bhandar, J. Heer, & M. Ma (Eds.), *Too Asian?: Racism, privilege, and post-secondary education* (pp. 38-52). Toronto: Between the Lines.

Gibbs, J. T. (1996). Triple marginality: The case of young African-Caribbean women in Toronto (Canada) and London (England). *Canadian Social Work Review*, 13 (2), 143-156.

Gilbert, J. (2008). Why I feel guilty all the time: Performing academic motherhood. *Women's Studies in Communication*, 31, 203-208.

Gillborn, D. (2015). Intersectionality, critical race theory, and the primacy of racism: Race, class, gender, and disability in education. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 21 (3), 277-287.

Girard, M. (2010). Match between pre- and postmigration education among new immigrants: Determinants and payoffs. *Canadian Journal of Higher Education*, 40 (3), 81-99.

Girard, M., & Smith, M. (2013). Working in a regulated occupation in Canada: An immigrant-native born comparison. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 14 (2), 219-244.

Giraud, C., Cioffo, G. D., de Lettenhove, M. K., & Chaves, C. R. (2019). Navigating research ethics in the absence of an ethics review board: The importance of space for sharing. *Research Ethics*, 15 (1), 1-17.

Girvan, N. (2015). Assessing Westminster in the Caribbean: Then and now. *Commonwealth & Comparative*, 53 (1), 95-107.

Glaser, B. G. (1978). *Theoretical sensitivity*. Mill Valley, CA: Sociology Press.

Goldberg, M. (2002). *The facts are in! A study of the characteristics and experiences of immigrants seeking employment in regulated professions in Ontario*. Toronto, ON: Queen's Printer for Ontario (Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities).

Gooden, A. (2008). Community organizing by African Caribbean people in Toronto, Ontario. *Journal of Black Studies*, 38 (3), 413-426.

Government of Canada. (n. d.). Eligibility to apply as a federal skilled worker (express entry). Retrieved from https://www.canada.ca/en/immigration-refugees-citizenship/services/immigrate-canada/express-entry/eligibility/federal-skilled-workers.html

Grant, J. (1989). *White women's Christ and Black women's Jesus*. Atlanta: Scholars Press.

Grant, P., & Nadin, S. (2007). The credentialing problems of foreign trained personnel from Asia and Africa intending to make their home in Canada: A social psychological perspective. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 8 (2), 141-162.

Gray, B., Hilder, J., Macdonald, L., Tester, R., Dowell, A., & Stubbe, M. (2017). Are research ethics guidelines culturally competent? *Research Ethics*, 13 (1), 23-41.

Grayson, J. P. (1995). Does race matter? Outcomes of the first experience in a Canadian university. *Canadian Journal of Higher Education*, 25 (2), 79-109.

Green, W. (2017). Engaging students as partners: Changing the way we talk about international education. *Vista*, Winter 14-19. Retrieved from https://issuu.com/ieaaustralia/docs/_online__ieaa_vista_magazine_-_wint

Grenier, G., & Xue, L. (2011). Canadian immigrants' access to a first job in their intended occupation. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 12 (3), 275-303.

Groenewald, T. (2004). A phenomenological research design illustrated. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods,* 3 (1), 42-55.

Guest, G., Bunce, A., & Johnson, L. (2006). How Many Interviews Are Enough?: An experiment with data saturation and variability. *Field Methods*, 18 (1), 59 – 82.

Guinier, L. (2000). Of gentlemen and role models. In J. Glazer-Raymo, B. K. Townsend & B. Ropers-Huliman (Eds.), *Women in higher education: A feminist perspective* (pp. 373-378). Boston, MA: Pearson Custom Pub. (Reprinted from *Critical race feminism: A reader*, by Adrien Katherine Wing, Ed., 1997, New York, NY: New York University Press).

Guo, S., & Guo, Y. (2015). Rethinking multiculturalism in Canada: Tensions between immigration, ethnicity and minority rights. In S. Guo & L. Wong (Eds.), *Revisiting multiculturalism in Canada: Theories, policies and debates* (pp. 123-139). Rotterdam, Netherlands: Sense Publishers.

Hall, K. O. (2012). The role of the church in the diaspora. In C. E. James & A. Davis, *Jamaica in the Canadian experience: A multiculturalizing presence* (pp. 161-165). Black Point, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

Hardial, S. (2013). Assessing the barriers regarding Canada's labour market policies and their impact on Caribbean immigrants in the skill-trade sector (Unpublished major research paper). Ryerson University, Canada. Retrieved from https://digital.library.ryerson.ca/islandora/search/dc.contributor_s%3A%22Hardial%2C%5C%20Shelleanne%5C%20%5C%28Author%5C%29%22

Hardy Cox, D., & Strange, C. C. (2016). Student diversity in Canadian higher education. In C. C. Strange, & D. Hardy Cox (Eds.), *Serving diverse students in Canadian higher education*

(pp. 12-18). Montreal & Kingston, Canada: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Harris, D. (1996). *National industrial policy: A strategic plan for growth and development*. Kingston, Jamaica: Government of Jamaica.

Hawthorne, L. (2008). The impact of economic selection policy on labour market outcomes for degree-qualified migrants in Canada and Australia. *IRPP Choices*, 14 (5), 1-50.

Hazelkorn, E. (2018). Reshaping the world order of higher education: The role and impact of rankings on national and global systems. *Policy Reviews in Higher Education*, 2 (1), 4-31.

Heer, J. (2012). Introduction. In R. Gilmour, D. Bhandar, J. Heer, & M. Ma (Eds.), *"Too Asian?": Racism, privilege, and post-secondary education* (pp. 1-13). Toronto: Between the Lines.

Hendry, P. M. (2007). The future of narrative. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 13 (4), 487-498.

Henry, A. (1995). Growing up Black, female, and working class: A teacher's narrative. *Anthropology & Education Quarterly*, 26 (3), 279-305.

Henry, A. (1998). *Taking back control: African Canadian women teachers' lives and practice*. New York: State University of New York Press.

Henry, A. (2012). Patwa: Its power, politics and possibilities. In C. E. James & A. Davis, *Jamaica in the Canadian experience: A multiculturalizing presence* (pp. 98-105). Black Point, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

Henry, A. (2015). We especially welcome applications from members of visible minority groups: Reflections on race, gender and life at three universities. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, 18 (5), 589-610.

Henry, A. (2018). Power, Politics, Possibilities: Thoughts toward creating a Black digital oral

history archive. *Language and Literacy*, 20 (3), 89-99.

Henry, F. (1968). The West Indian domestic scheme in Canada. *Social and Economic Studies*, 17 (1), 83-91.

Henry, F. (1994). *The Caribbean Diaspora in Toronto: Learning to Live with Racism*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Henry, F., Choi, A., & Kobayashi, A. (2012). The representation of racialized faculty at selected Canadian universities. *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, 44 (2), 1-12.

Henry, F., Dua, E., James, C., Kobayashi, A., Li, P., Ramos, H., & Smith, M. (2017a). Introduction: Setting the context. In F. Henry, E. Dua, C. E. James, A. Kobayashi, P. Li, H. Ramos & M. S. Smith, *The equity myth: Racialization and Indigeneity at Canadian universities* (pp. 3-23). Vancouver, BC: University of British Columbia Press.

Henry, F., Dua, E., Kobayashi, A., James, C., Li, P., Ramos, H., & Smith, M. (2017b). Race, racialization and Indigeneity in Canadian universities. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, 20 (3), 300-314.

Henry, F., & Kobayashi, A. (2017). The everyday world of racialized and Indigenous faculty members in Canadian universities. In F. Henry, E. Dua, C. E. James, A. Kobayashi, P. Li, H. Ramos & M. S. Smith, *The equity myth: Racialization and Indigeneity at Canadian universities* (pp. 115-154). Vancouver, BC: University of British Columbia Press.

Henry, F., Kobayashi, A., & Choi, A. (2017). Representational analysis: Comparing Canada, the United States, the United Kingdom, and Australia. In F. Henry & C. Tator (Eds.), *Racism in the Canadian University: Demanding Social Justice, Inclusion, and Equity* (pp. 24-45). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Henry, F., & Tator, C. (2007, February). Through a looking glass: Enduring racism on the university campus. *Academic Matters: The Journal of Higher Education*, 24 – 25. Retrieved from http://www.academicmatters.ca/assets/AM-Feb-2007-Issue.pdf

Henry, F., & Tator, C. (2009a). Introduction: Racism in the Canadian university. In F. Henry & C. Tator (Eds.), *Racism in the Canadian University: Demanding Social Justice, Inclusion, and Equity* (pp. 3-21). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Henry, F., & Tator, C. (2009b). Theoretical perspectives and manifestations of racism in the academy. In F. Henry & C. Tator (Eds.), *Racism in the Canadian University: Demanding Social Justice, Inclusion, and Equity* (pp. 22 – 59). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Henry, F., & Tator, C. (2010). *The colour of democracy: racism in Canadian society*. Toronto: Thomas Nelson Publishing.

Henry, F., & Tator, C. (2012). Interviews with racialized faculty members in Canadian universities. *Canadian Ethnic Studies,* 44 (2), 75-99.

Hepburn, S., & Coloma, R. S. (2019). Ageing transmigrants and the decolonization of life course. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 38 (1), 48-66.

Hermanowicz, J. C. (2002). The great interview: 25 strategies for studying people in bed. *Qualitative Sociology*, 25 (4), 479-499.

Hernandez-Ramdwar, C. (2009). Caribbean students in the Canadian academy: We've come a long way? In F. Henry & C. Tator (Eds.), *Racism in the Canadian University: Demanding Social Justice, Inclusion, and Equity* (pp. 106 – 127). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Hernandez-Ramdwar, C. (2013). African traditional religions in the Caribbean and Brazil:

Models of religious tourism and impacts of commodification. *Journal of Heritage Tourism*, 8 (1), 81-88.

Hernandez-Ramdwar, C. (2019). A notch in their belt: Racism and Caribbean university students in Canada. In C. Rose-Redwood & R. Rose-Redwood (Eds.), *International encounters: Higher education and the international student experience* (pp. 173-188). Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield.

Hinchman, L., & Hinchman, S. (Eds.). (2001). *Memory, identity, community. The idea of narrative in the human sciences*. New York: New York University Press.

Hiraldo, P. (2010). The role of critical race theory in higher education. *The Vermont Connection*, 31, 53-59.

Hirshfield, L., & Joseph, T. (2012). We need a woman. we need a Black woman: Gender, race, and identity taxation in the academy. *Gender and Education*, 24 (2), 213-227.

Hoare, L. (2012). Transnational student voices: Reflections on a second chance. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 16 (3), 271-286.

Hollway, W., & Jefferson, T. (2000). *Doing qualitative research differently: Free association, narrative and the interview method*. London: Sage.

Holstein, J., & Gubrium, J. (1995). *The active interview*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Hooks, B. (2000). Black and female: Reflections on graduate school. In J. Glazer-Raymo, B. K. Townsend & B. Ropers-Huliman (Eds.), *Women in higher education: A feminist perspective* (pp. 386-390). Boston, MA: Pearson Custom Pub. (Reprinted from *Talking back: Thinking feminist, thinking Black*, by Bell Hooks, 1989, Brooklyn, NY: South End Press).

Horton, M. (1990). *The long haul: An autobiography*. New York: Doubleday.

Hou, F., & Picot, G. (2014). Annual levels of immigration and immigrant entry earnings in Canada. *Canadian Public Policy*, 40 (2), 166-181.

Hsiung, P., & Nichol, K. (2010). Policies on and experiences of foreign domestic workers in Canada. *Sociology Compass*, 4 (9), 766-778.

Iverson, S. V. (2007). Camouflaging power and privilege: A critical race analysis of university diversity polices. *Education Administration Quarterly,* 43 (5), 586-611.

James, C. E. (1995). Multicultural and anti-racism education in Canada. *Race, Gender & Class*, 2 (3), 31-48.

James, C. E. (2004). Urban education: An approach to community-base education. *Intercultural Education*, 15 (1), 15-32.

James, C. E. (2008). Re/presentation of race and racism in the multicultural discourse of Canada. In A. A. Abdi and L. Shutz (Eds.), *Educating for Human rights and global citizenship*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.

James, C. (2009a). African-Caribbean Canadians working "harder" to attain their immigrant dreams: Context, strategies, and consequences. *Wadabagei*, 12 (1), 92-108.

James, C. E. (2009b). It will happen without putting in place special measures: Racially diversifying universities. In F. Henry & C. Tator (Eds.), *Racism in the Canadian University: Demanding Social Justice, Inclusion, and Equity* (pp. 128-159). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

James, C. E. (2010). *Seeing ourselves: Exploring race, ethnicity and culture* (4th ed.). Toronto: Thompson Educational Publishing, Inc.

James, C. E. (2011). Welcoming visible minorities: Paradoxes of equity hiring in Canadian universities. *Canadian Federation for the Humanities and Social Sciences*. Retrieved

from https://www.ideas-idees.ca/blog/welcoming-visible-minorities-paradoxes-equity-hiring-canadian-universities

James, C. E. (2012). Strategies of engagement: how racialized faculty negotiate the university system. *Canadian Ethnic Studies Journal*, 44 (2), 133 – 152.

James, C. E. (2017). You know why you were hired, don't you?: Expectations and challenges in university appointments. In F. Henry, E. Dua, C. E. James, A. Kobayashi, P. Li, H. Ramos & M. S. Smith, *The equity myth: Racialization and Indigeneity at Canadian universities* (pp. 155-170). Vancouver, BC: University of British Columbia Press.

James, C. E., & Chapman-Nyaho, S. (2017). Would never be hired these days: The precarious work situation of racialized and Indigenous faculty members. In F. Henry, E. Dua, C. E. James, A. Kobayashi, P. Li, H. Ramos & M. S. Smith, *The equity myth: Racialization and Indigeneity at Canadian universities* (pp. 84-114). Vancouver, BC: University of British Columbia Press.

James, C., Este, D., Thomas Bernard, W., Benjamin, A., Lloyd, B., & Turner, T. (2010). *Race and well being: The lives, hopes, and activism of African Canadians*. Black Point, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

James, C. E., & Taylor, L. (2008). Education will get you to the station: Marginalized students' experiences and perceptions of merit in accessing university. *Canadian Journal of Education*, 31 (3), 567 – 590.

James, M., & Valluvan, S. (2014). Higher education: A market for racism? *DarkMatter*, April 25. Retrieved from http://www.darkmatter101.org/site/2014/04/25/higher-education-a-market-for-racism/

Janusch, S. (2015). Voices unheard: Stories of immigrant teachers in Alberta. *Journal of*

*International Migration and Integration*, 16 (2), 299-315.

Johnson, M. A. (2012). To ensure that only suitable persons are sent: Screening Jamaican women for the West Indian domestic scheme. In C. E. James & A. Davis, *Jamaica in the Canadian experience: A multiculturalizing presence* (pp. 36-53). Black Point, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

Jones, C. (2000). Levels of racism: A theoretical framework and a gardener's tale. *American Journal of Public Health*, 90 (8), 1212-1215.

Kamugisha, A. (2013). *Theories of the Post-Colonial State: Caribbean Political Thought*. Kingston, Jamaica: Ian Randle Publishers.

Kanter, R. M. (1993). *Men and women of the corporation*. New York: Basic Books.

Kapp, J. M., Peters, C., & Oliver, D. P. (2013). Research recruitment using Facebook advertising: Big potential, big challenges. *Journal of Cancer Education*, 28 (1), 134-137.

Karaian, L., & Mitchell, A. (2010). Third-wave feminism. In N. Mandell (Ed.), *Feminist issues: Race, class, and sexuality* (pp. 63-86). Toronto: ON: Pearson Prentice Hall.

Katchanovski, I., Nevitte, N., & Rothman, S. (2015). Race, gender, and affirmative action attitudes in American and Canadian universities. *Canadian Journal of Higher Education*, 45 (4), 18-41.

Kean, O. (2000). Higher education and Caribbean identity. In G. D. Howe (Ed.), *Higher education in the Caribbean: Past, present and future directions* (pp. 45-58). Jamaica: The University of the West Indies Press.

Keith, N., & Keith, N. (1992). *The social origins of democratic socialism in Jamaica.* Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press.

Keith, S. (1978). An historical overview of the state and educational policy in Jamaica. *Latin*

*American Perspectives*, 5 (2), 37 – 52.

Kelly, H. (2007). Racial tokenism in the school workplace: An exploratory study of Black teachers in overwhelmingly White schools. *Educational Studies,* 41 (3), 230-254.

Kerner, I. (2017). Relations of difference: Power and inequality in intersectional and postcolonial feminist theories. *Current Sociology Review*, 65 (6), 846-866.

Ketcham, J. (2017). The chaos of Kairos: Conflicting discourses of timing, mothering, and flexibility. In M. A. Massé & N. Bauer-Maglin (Eds.), *Staging women's lives in academia: Gendered life stages in language and literature workplaces* (pp. 53-65). Albany, New York: State University of New York Press.

Kim, J.H. (2016). *Understanding narrative inquiry: The crafting and analysis of stories as research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Kitossa, T. (2012). Odyssey home to a place within: An autobiography of one Jamaica's lost children. In C. E. James & A. Davis, *Jamaica in the Canadian experience: A multiculturalizing presence* (pp. 54-66). Black Point, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

Kobayashi, A. (2009). Now you see them, how you see them: Women of colour in Canadian academia. In F. Henry & C. Tator (Eds.), *Racism in the Canadian University: Demanding Social Justice, Inclusion, and Equity* (pp. 60-75). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Kowal, S., & O'Connell, D. C. (2014). Transcription as a crucial step of data analysis. In U. Flick (Ed.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative data analysis* (pp. 64-78). London: Sage.

Kunin, R., & Associates. (2012). *Impact of international education in Canada – An update*. Ottawa: Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade.

Kymlicka, W. (2015). The three lives of multiculturalism. In S. Guo & L. Wong (Eds.),

*Revisiting multiculturalism in Canada: Theories, policies and debates* (pp. 17-35). Rotterdam, Netherlands: Sense Publishers.

Ladson-Billings, G. (1998). Just what is critical race theory and what's it doing in a nice field like education? *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 11(1), 7–24.

Ladson-Billings, G. (2009). Race still matters: Critical race theory in education. In M. Apple, W. Au, & L. A. Gandin (Eds.), *The Routledge international handbook of critical education* (pp. 110–122). New York and London: Routledge.

Ladson-Billings, G., & Tate, W. (1995). Toward a critical race theory of education. *Teachers College Record*, 97 (1), 47-68.

Lasch, C. (1991). *The true and only heaven: Progress and its critics*. New York: W.W. Norton.

Lazos Vargas, S. (2003). Introduction: Critical Race Theory in Education: Theory, Praxis, and Recommendations. *Counterpoints*, 195, 1-18.

Leary, T., Hotchkiss, K., & Robb, A. (2016). International students. In C. C. Strange, & D. Hardy Cox (Eds.), *Serving diverse students in Canadian higher education* (pp. 82-101). Montreal & Kingston, Canada: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Ledesma, M. C., & Calderon, D. (2015). Critical race theory in education: A review of past literature and a look to the future. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 21 (3), 206-222.

Lee, J. J. (2007). Neo-racism toward international students. *About Campus*, 11 (6), 28-30.

Lee, J. J. (2010). International students' experiences and attitudes at an US host institution: Self-reports and future recommendations. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 9 (1), 66-84.

Lee, J. J. (2015). International student experiences of neo-racism and discrimination. *International Higher Education*, 44.

Lewis, T., & Lewis, M. V. (1985). Vocational education in the commonwealth Caribbean and the United States. *Comparative Education*, 21 (2), 157-171.

Lewis, T., & Simmons, L. (2010). Creating research culture in Caribbean universities. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 30, 337-344.

Li, P. S., (2000). Earning disparities between immigrants and native-born Canadians. *Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology*, 37(3), 289-311.

Li, P. S. (2001). The market worth of immigrants' educational credentials. *Canadian Public Policy*, 27 (1), 23-38.

Li, P. S. (2008). The role of foreign credentials and ethnic ties in immigrants' economic performance. *Canadian Journal of Sociology*, 33 (2), 291-310.

Li, P. S. (2012). Differences in employment income of university professors. *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, 44 (2), 39-48.

Li, X., & Tierney, P. (2013). Internationalization in Canadian higher education: Experiences of international students in a master's program. *Canadian and International Education*, 42 (2), 1-16.

Lichtman, M. (2013). *Qualitative research in education: A user's guide*. USA: Sage Publications, Inc.

Lin, X., & Liu, W. (2019). Intercultural advising for Chinese international students: A reflective inquiry. *Globalisation, Societies and Education*, 17 (2), 220-230.

Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Lofters, A. K. (2012). The brain drain of health care workers: Causes, solutions and the example of Jamaica. *Canadian Journal of Public Health*, 103 (5), 376 – 378.

Loomba, A. (1998). *Colonialism/postcolonialism*. London, UK: Routledge.

Looser, D. The good enough academic mother at midcareer. In M. A. Massé & N. Bauer-Maglin (Eds.), *Staging women's lives in academia: Gendered life stages in language and literature workplaces* (pp. 161-173). Albany, New York: State University of New York Press.

Lorde, A. (1984). *Sister outsider: Essays and speeches*. Trumansburg, NY: The Crossing Press.

Lum, L., Bradley, P., & Rasheed, N. (2011). Accommodating learning styles in international bridging education programs. *Higher Education, Skills and Work-Based Learning, 1*(2), 147–168.

Lusis, T., & Bauder, H. (2010). Immigrants in the labour market: Transnationalism and segmentation. *Geography Compass*, 4 (1), 28 – 44.

Mackenzie, I. R. (1988). Early movements of domestics from the Caribbean and Canadian immigration policy: A research note. *Alternate Routes*, 8, 124-143.

Macklin, A. (1992). Foreign domestic worker: Surrogate housewife or mail order servant? *McGill Law Journal*, 37 (3), 681-760.

Macklin, A. (1994). On the inside looking in: Foreign domestic workers in Canada. In W. Giles & S. Arat-Koc (Eds.), *Maid in the market: Women's paid domestic labour* (pp. 13-39). Halifax, NS: Fernwood.

Maher, M. A., Ford, M. E., & Thompson, C. M. (2004). Degree progress of women doctoral students: Factors that constrain, facilitate, and differentiate. *The Review of Higher Education*, 27(3), 385-408.

Malatest, R. A., & Associates Ltd. (2010). *Getting your professional license in Ontario: The experiences of international and Canadian applicants*. Ontario Office of the Fairness Commissioner. Retrieved from https://www.cccie.org/reports/getting-professional-

license-ontario-experiences-international-canadian-applicants/

Maldonado, V., Wiggers, R., & Arnold, C. (2013). *So you want to earn a phd? The attraction, realities, and outcomes of pursuing a doctorate*. Toronto: Higher Education Quality Council of Ontario.

Mama, A. (1995). *Beyond the masks: Race, gender and subjectivity*. London: Routledge.

Manley, R. (2012). A caravan of words. In C. E. James & A. Davis, *Jamaica in the Canadian experience: A multiculturalizing presence* (pp. 168-176). Black Point, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

Marable, M. (1993). *Blackwater: Historical studies in race, class consciousness, and revolution*. Niwot, CO: University Press of Colorado.

Marginson, S. (2012). Including the other: Regulation of the human rights of mobile students in a nation-bound world. *Higher Education*, 63 (4), 497-512.

Marshall, D. D. (2000). Academic travails and a crisis-of-mission of the University of the West Indies' social sciences: From history and critique to anti-politics. In G. D. Howe (Ed.), *Higher education in the Caribbean: Past, present and future directions* (pp. 59-84). Jamaica: The University of the West Indies Press.

Massé, M. A. (2017). Introduction. In M. A. Massé & N. Bauer-Maglin (Eds.), *Staging women's lives in academia: Gendered life stages in language and literature workplaces* (pp. xiii-xxviii). Albany, New York: State University of New York Press.

Maximova, K., & Krahn, H. (2005). Does race matter? Earnings of visible minority graduates from Alberta universities. *The Canadian Journal of Higher Education*, 35 (1), 85-110.

Maxwell, J. A., & Chmiel, M. (2013). Notes toward a theory of qualitative data analysis. In U. Flick (Ed.), *The sage handbook of qualitative data analysis*, (pp. 21-34). Los Angeles:

Sage Publications.

May, T., & Perry, B. (2014). Reflexivity and the practice of qualitative research. In U. Flick (Ed.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative data analysis* (pp. 109-122). London: Sage.

McDonald, J. T., Warman, C., & Worswick, C. (2015). Immigrant selection systems and occupational outcomes of international medical graduates in Canada and the United States. *Canadian Public Policy*, 41 (s1), 116-137.

McGrath, C. (2010). Services for diverse students. In D. G. Hardy Cox, & C. C. Strange (Eds.), *Achieving student success: Effective student services in Canadian higher education* (pp. 153-164). Montreal & Kingston, Canada: McGill-Queen's University Press.

McIntyre, S., & Hamilton-Hinch, B. (2016). Serving Black students. In C. C. Strange, & D. Hardy Cox (Eds.), *Serving diverse students in Canadian higher education* (pp. 38-50). Montreal & Kingston, Canada: McGill-Queen's University Press.

McLeod, J. (2011). Student voice and the politics of listening in higher education. *Critical Studies in Education*, 52 (2), 179-189.

McMurtry, R., & Curling, A. (2008). *A Review of the Roots of Violence.* Queen's Printer for Ontario. Retrieved from http://www.children.gov.on.ca/htdocs/English/documents/youthandthelaw/rootsofyouthviolence-vol1.pdf

Mertens, D. M. (2014). Ethical use of qualitative data and findings. In U. Flick (Ed.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative data analysis* (pp. 510-523). London: SAGE Publications Ltd.

Milan, A., Keown, L. A., & Urquijo, C. R. (2011). Families, living arrangements and unpaid work. *Women in Canada: A gender-based statistical report* (Statistics Canada, Cat. No. 89-503-X). Retrieved from https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/89-503-

x/2010001/article/11546-eng.pdf

Milian, R. P. (2018). Differentiating universities: Some insights from organization studies. *Policy Reviews in Higher Education*, 2 (1), 79-104.

Miller, E. (2000). Access to tertiary education in the Commonwealth Caribbean in the 1990s. In G. D. Howe (Ed.), *Higher education in the Caribbean: Past, present and future directions* (pp. 117-141). Jamaica: The University of the West Indies Press.

Miller, J. (2000). Language use, identity, and social interaction: Migrant students in Australia. *Research on Language and Social Interaction*, 33 (1), 69-100.

Mills, M. B. (2008). Intersections between work and family: When a playpen can be office furniture. *Women's Studies in Communication*, 31 (2), 213-217.

Miner, R. (2010). People without jobs. Retrieved from http://www.workforcecoalition.ca/downloads/people-witout-jobs-jobs-without-people-final.pdf

Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities. (2013). *Ontario's differentiation policy framework for postsecondary education*. Toronto, ON: Queen's Printer for Ontario. Retrieved from http://www.tcu.gov.on.ca/pepg/publications/PolicyFramework_PostSec.pdf

Mishler, E. (1986). *Research interviewing: Context and narrative*. Cambridge, MA: Havard University Press.

Mishler, E. G. (1995). Models of narrative analysis: A typology. *Journal of Narrative & Life History*, 5 (2), 87-123.

Mogadime, D. (2008). Racial differential experiences of employment equity for women teachers: One teacher's narrative of resistance and struggle. *Journal of Black Studies*, 39 (1), 85-

108.

Mohamed, T., & Beagan, B. L. (2018). Strange faces in the academy: Experiences of racialized and Indigenous faculty in Canadian universities. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, 22 (3), 338-354.

Montgomery, C. (2010). *Understanding the international student experience*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Monture, P. (2009). Doing academia differently: Confronting whiteness in the university. In F. Henry & C. Tator (Eds.), *Racism in the Canadian university: Demanding social justice, inclusion, and equity* (pp. 76-105). Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Monture, P. (2010). Race, gender, and the university: Strategies for survival. In S. Razack, M. Smith, & S. Thobani (Eds.), *States of race: Critical race feminism for the 21st century* (pp. 23-35). Toronto: Between the lines.

Morse, J. M. (1994). Designing funded qualitative research. In N. Denzin & Y. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook for qualitative research* (pp. 220- 235). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications Ltd.

Moss, L. (2003). Is Canada postcolonial?: Introducing the question. In L. Moss (Ed.), *Is Canada Postcolonial?: Unsettling Canadian literature* (pp. 1-23). Canada: Wilfrid Laurier University Press.

Mukandi, B., & Bond, C. (2019). Good in the hood or burn it down?: Reconciling Black presence in the academy. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 40 (2), 254-268.

Mullings, B., Williams, K., & Lovell, A. (2012). Myths and realities: The challenge of social transformation through Canada/Jamaica diasporic exchange. In C. E. James & A. Davis (Eds.), *Jamaica in the Canadian experience: A multiculturalizing presence* (pp. 294-309).

Black Point, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

Muzzin, L. (2013, November). Deciding on a career in the college sector. *Academic Matters: OCUFA's Journal of Higher Education*. Retrieved from https://academicmatters.ca/deciding-on-a-career-in-the-college-sector/

Neiterman, E., Atanackovic, J., Covell, C., & Bourgeault, I. L. (2018). We want to be seen as partners, not vultures of the world: perspectives of Canadian stakeholders on migration of international students studying in health professions in Canada. *Globalisation, Societies and Education*, 16 (4), 395-408.

Nelson, C. A., & Nelson, C. A. (2004). Introduction. In C. A. Nelson & C. A. Nelson (Eds.), *Racism, eh? Critical interdisciplinary anthology of race and racism in Canada* (pp.1-29). Concord, ON: Captus Press.

Nettleford, R. (1965). National identity and attitudes to race in Jamaica. *Race,* 7, 59-72.

Nettleford, R. (1978). *Caribbean cultural identity: The case of Jamaica*. Kingston: Institute of Jamaica.

Nettleford, R. (1995). *Inward stretch outward reach: A voice from the Caribbean* (2nd ed.). Brooklyn, NY: Caribbean Diaspora Press.

Nettleford, R. (2000). Contrasting problems facing universities in the developed and developing worlds: The same difference. In G. D. Howe (Ed.), *Higher education in the Caribbean: Past, present and future directions* (pp. 24-44). Jamaica: The University of the West Indies Press.

Nevin, A. D. (2019). Academic hiring networks and institutional prestige: A case study of Canadian sociology. *Canadian Review of Sociology*, 56 (3), 389-420.

Ngo, H. V., & Este, D. (2006). Professional re-entry for foreign-trained immigrants. *Journal of*

*International Migration and Integration*, 7 (1), 27-50.

Nicol, N. (2000). Faculty voices. In York Stories Collective (Eds.), *York stories: Women in higher education* (pp. 168-180). Toronto, ON: Tsar.

Nunes, S., & Arthur, N. (2013). International students' experiences of integrating into the workforce. *Journal of Employment Counseling*, 50, 34-45.

O'Connor, A., Jackson, L., Goldsmith, L., & Skirton, H. (2014). Can I get a retweet please? Health research recruitment and the Twittersphere. *Journal of Advance Nursing*, 70 (3), 599-609.

O'Mara, M. (2012). The uses of the foreign student. *Social Science History*, 36 (4), 583-615.

Oreopoulos, P. (2009). Why do skilled immigrants struggle in the labour market? A field experiment with six thousand résumés. *Metropolis British Columbia*, 1-33.

Orme, L. (2007). Immigrant workforce integration: The Hamilton experience. *Canadian Issues*, 75 – 78.

Ornstein, M., Stewart, P., & Drakich, J. (2007). Promotion at Canadian universities: The intersection of gender, discipline, and institution. *Canadian Journal of Higher Education*, 37 (3), 1 – 25.

Pandolfi, K., & James, C. E. (2017). Creating Canada: Education for inclusion or different versions of colonial stories? *Journal of Canadian Studies*, 51 (1), 90-111.

Paradies, Y. (2006). A systemic review of empirical research on self-reported racism and health. *International Journal of Epidemiology*, 1-14.

Parker, L. (2003). Critical race theory in education: Possibilities and problems. *Counterpoints*, 168, 184-198.

Parker, L. & Lynn, M. (2002). What's race got to do with it? Critical race theory's conflicts with

and connections to qualitative research methodology and epistemology. *Qualitative Inquiry,* 8 (1), 7-22.

Parker, L., & Villalpando, O. (2007). A racialized perspective on education leadership: Critical race theory in educational administration. *Education Administration Quarterly*, 43 (5), 519-524.

Patton, M. Q. (1990). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Patton, M. Q. (2002). *Qualitative research and evaluation methods* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Pendakur, R. (2000). *Immigrants and the labour force: Policy, regulation, and impact*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Perry, A. (2012). Graduating photos: Race, colonization, and the university of Manitoba. In R. Gilmour, D. Bhandar, J. Heer, & M. Ma (Eds.), *"Too Asian?": Racism, privilege, and post-secondary education* (pp. 55-66). Toronto: Between the Lines.

Petgrave, K. (2011). Equality in education? A study of Jamaican schools under Michael Manley, 1972 – 80. *Caribbean Quarterly*, 57 (2), 24-50.

Petillion, W., Melrose, S., Moore, S. L., & Nuttgens, S. (2017). Graduate students' experiences with research ethics in conducting health research. *Research Ethics*, 13 (3-4), 139-154.

Phan, L. (2008). *Teaching English as an international language: Identity, resistance and negotiation*. Toronto: Multilingual Matters.

Phillips, G. (2018, May). It's time to invest in a faculty renewal strategy for Ontario's universities. *Academic Matters*. Retrieved from https://academicmatters.ca/its-time-to-invest-in-a-faculty-renewal-strategy-for-ontarios-universities/

Phoenix, A. (2008). Analyzing narrative contexts. In M. Andrews, C. Squire, & M. Tamboukou (Eds.), *Doing narrative research* (pp. 64-77). London: Sage.

Picot, G., & Sweetman, A. (2012). Making it in Canada: Immigration outcomes and policies. *IRPP Study*, 29, 1-42.

Pitman, G. E. (2002). Oustider/insider: The politics of shifting identities in the research process. *Feminism and Psychology*, 12, 282-288.

Pitter, R. (2012). Always have to be twice as good: Reflections of an athlete, coach and academic. In C. E. James & A. Davis, *Jamaica in the Canadian experience: A multiculturalizing presence* (pp. 155-160). Black Point, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

Pitts, M. Uses of my anger: Negotiating mothering, feminism, and graduate school. In M. A. Massé & N. Bauer-Maglin (Eds.), *Staging women's lives in academia: Gendered life stages in language and literature workplaces* (pp. 41-51). Albany, New York: State University of New York Press.

Plaza, D. (2004). Disaggregating the Indo- and African-Caribbean migration and settlement experience in Canada. Canadian Journal of Latin American and Caribbean Studies, 29 (57/58), 241-266).

Polkinghorne, D. E. (1988). *Narrative knowing and the human sciences*. Albany: State University of New York Press.

Polkinghorne, D. E. (1995). Narrative configuration in qualitative analysis. *Qualitative Studies in Education*, 8 (1), 5-23.

Pollock, K. (2010). Marginalization and the occasional teacher workforce in Ontario: The case of internationally educated teachers (IETs). *Canadian Journal of Educational Administration and Policy*, 100, 1-21.

Poteet, M., & Gomez, B. (2015). "It's both ways": How international students negotiate belonging in local and global contexts. *Journal of New Brunswick Studies*, 6 (1), 83-102.

Premji, S., Shakya, Y., Spasevski, M., Merolli, J., & Athar, S. (2014). Precarious work experiences of racialized immigrant women in Toronto: A Community-based study. *Just Labour: A Canadian Journal of Work and Society, 22*, 122-143.

Ralefala, D., Ali, J., Kass, N., & Hyder, A. (2018). A case study of researchers' knowledge and opinions about the ethical review process for research in Botswana. *Research Ethics*, 14 (1), 1-14.

Ramos, H., & Li, P. S. (2017). Differences in representation and employment income of racialized university professors in Canada. In F. Henry, E. Dua, C. E. James, A. Kobayashi, P. Li, H. Ramos & M. S. Smith, *The equity myth: Racialization and Indigeneity at Canadian universities* (pp. 46-64). Vancouver, BC: University of British Columbia Press.

Ramos, H., & Wijesingha, R. (2017). Academic production, reward, and perceptions of racialized faculty members. In F. Henry, E. Dua, C. E. James, A. Kobayashi, P. Li, H. Ramos & M. S. Smith, *The equity myth: Racialization and Indigeneity at Canadian universities* (pp. 65-83). Vancouver, BC: University of British Columbia Press.

Razack, S., Smith, M., & Thobani, S. (2010). Introduction. In S. Razack, M. Smith, & S. Thobani (Eds.), *States of race: Critical race feminism for the 21st century* (pp. 1-19). Toronto: Between the lines.

Reece, R. (2010). Feminist theorizing on race and racism. In N. Mandell (Ed.), *Feminist issues: Race, class, and sexuality* (pp. 87-109). Toronto: ON: Pearson Prentice Hall.

Reich, M., Gordon, D., & Edwards, R. (1973). A theory of labour market segmentation. *The*

*American Economic Review*, 63 (2), 359 – 365.

Reitz, J. (2005). Tapping immigrants' skills: New directions for Canadian immigration policy in the knowledge economy. *IRPP Choices*, 11 (1), 1-11.

Rich, A. (1977, September). Claiming an Education. Speech to Douglas College. Retrieved from http://isites.harvard.edu/fs/docs/icb.topic469725.files/Rich-Claiming%20an%20Education-1.pdf

Rich, A. (2000). Toward a women-centred university, 1973-74. In J. Glazer-Raymo, B. K. Townsend & B. Ropers-Huliman (Eds.), *Women in higher education: A feminist perspective* (pp. 3-15). Boston, MA: Pearson Custom Pub. (Reprinted from *On lies, secrets and silence: Selected prose, 1966-1978*, by Adrienne Rich, 1979, New York, NY: W. W. Norton & Company).

Riessman, C. K. (1993). *Narrative analysis*. London: Sage.

Riessman, C. K. (2002). Analysis of personal narratives. In J. F. Gubrium & J. A. Holstein (Eds.), *Handbook of Interview Research* (pp. 695-710). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Riessman, C. K., & Quinney, L. (2005). Narrative in social work: A critical review. *Qualitative Social Work*, 4 (4), 391-412.

Robotham, D. (2000). Blackening the Jamaican nation: The travails of a Black bourgeoisie in a globalized world. *Identities*, 7, 1-37.

Ro, A., & Goldberg, R. E. (2017). Post-migration employment changes and health: A dyadic spousal analysis. Social Science & Medicine, 191, 202-211.

Rodney, W. (1990). *The groundings with my brothers*. London: Bogle L'Ouverture.

Roulston, K. (2014). Analysing interviews. In U. Flick (Ed.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative data analysis* (pp. 297-312). London: Sage.

Ryan, G. (2013). Online social networks for patient involvement and recruitment in clinical research. *Nurse Researcher*, 21 (1), 35-39.

Ryan, J., Pollock, K., & Antonelli, F. (2009). Teacher diversity in Canada: Leaky pipelines, bottlenecks, and glass ceilings. Canadian Journal of Education, 32 (3), 591-617.

Sadeghi, S. (2008). Gender, culture and learning: Iranian immigrant women in Canadian higher education. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 27 (2), 217-234.

Saloojee, A. (2004). Social cohesion and the limits of multiculturalism in Canada. In C. A. Nelson & C. A. Nelson (Eds.), *Racism, eh? Critical interdisciplinary anthology of race and racism in Canada* (pp. 410-428). Concord, ON: Captus Press.

Sandelowski, M. (1995). Sample size in qualitative research. *Research in Nursing and Health*, 18 (2), 179-183.

Sapeha, H. (2015). Explaining variations in immigrants' satisfaction with their settlement experience. *Journal of International Migration and Integration,* 16 (4), 871-890.

Saxon, T. F., Hull, M. D., Fearon, D. D., William, L. O., & Tindigarukayo, J. K. (2012). How do Jamaica's unattended youth view their career prospects and life skills? *Comparative Education Review*, 56 (3), 421-447.

Scheurich, J. (1995). A postmodernist critique of research interviewing. *Qualitative Studies in Education*, 8 (3), 239-252.

Schurink, W. J., Schurink, E. M., & Poggenpoel, M. (1998). Focus group interviewing and audio-visual methodology in qualitative research. In A. S. De Vos (Ed.), *Research at grass roots, a primer in care professions* (pp. 313-333). Pretoria, South Africa: Van Schaik.

Scott, C., Safdar, S., Desai Trilokekar, R., & El Masri, A. (2015). International students as ideal

immigrants' in Canada: A disconnect between policy makers' assumptions and the lived experiences of international students. *Comparative and International Education*, 43 (3), Article 5.

Seidman, I. (1998). *Interviewing as qualitative research*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Senior, O. (2012). Crossing borders and negotiating boundaries. In C. E. James & A. Davis, *Jamaica in the Canadian experience: A multiculturalizing presence* (pp. 14-22). Black Point, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

Serna-Martinez, E. (2016). Rewriting the Caribbean Female Body: A Conversation with Opal Palmer Adisa. *Atlantis*, 38 (1), 203 - 220.

Shain, F. (2012). Getting on rather than getting by: Ethnicity, class and success against the odds. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 33 (1), 153-163.

Sherlock, P., & Bennett, H. (1998). *The story of the Jamaican people*. Kingston, Jamaica: Ian Randle.

Shinnaoui, D. & Narchal, R. (2010). Brain gain to brain waste: Individual biases, prejudices, and discounting of migrant skills. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 423-437.

Siltanen, J., Chen, X., Doyle, A., & Shotwell, A. (2019). Teaching, supervising, and supporting phd students: Identifying issues, addressing challenges, sharing strategies. *Canadian Review of Sociology*, 56 (2), 274-291.

Silvera, M. (1983). *Silenced*. Toronto: Williams-Wallace.

Silvera, M. (1989). *Silenced: Makeda Silvera talks with working class West Indian women about their lives and struggles as domestic workers in Canada*. Toronto: Sister Vision Press.

Skelton, C. (2005). The individualized (woman) in the academy: Ulrich Beck, gender and power.

*Gender and Education*, 17 (3), 319-332.

Skillings, J. H., & Dobbins, J. E. (1991). Racism as a disease: Etiology and treatment implications. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 70 (1), 206-212.

Sleeter, C. E. (2016). Critical race theory and the whiteness of teacher education. *Urban Education*, 1-15.

Smith, B., & Sparkes, A. C. (2008). Narrative and its potential contribution to disability studies. *Disability & Society*, 23 (1), 17-28.

Smith, D. (2000). Texts and repression: Hazards for feminists in the academy. In J. Glazer-Raymo, B. K. Townsend & B. Ropers-Huliman (Eds.), *Women in higher education: A feminist perspective* (pp. 221-237). Boston, MA: Pearson Custom Pub. (Reprinted from *Writing the social: Critique, theory, and investigations*, by Dorothy Smith, 1998, Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press).

Smith, M. G. (1990). *Culture, race and class in the commonwealth Caribbean*. Kingston, Jamaica: University of the West Indies.

Smith, M. S. (2010). Gender, whiteness, and "other Others" in the academy. In S. Razack, M. Smith, & S. Thobani (Eds.), *States of race: Critical race feminism for the 21st century* (pp. 37-58). Toronto: Between the lines.

Smith, M. S. (2017). Disciplinary silences: Race, Indigeneity, and gender in the social sciences. In F. Henry, E. Dua, C. E. James, A. Kobayashi, P. Li, H. Ramos & M. S. Smith, *The equity myth: Racialization and Indigeneity at Canadian universities* (pp. 239-262). Vancouver, BC: University of British Columbia Press.

Smith, M. S., Gamarro, K., & Toor, M. (2017). A dirty dozen: Unconscious race and gender biases in the academy. In F. Henry, E. Dua, C. E. James, A. Kobayashi, P. Li, H. Ramos

& M. S. Smith, *The equity myth: Racialization and Indigeneity at Canadian universities* (pp. 263-296). Vancouver, BC: University of British Columbia Press.

Solomon, R. P., Portelli, J. P., Daniel, B. J., & Campbell, A. (2005). The discourse of denial: How White teacher candidates construct race, racism and White privilege. *Race, Ethnicity and Education*, 8 (2), 147-169.

Spafford, M. M., Nygaard, V. L., & Gregor, F. (2006). Navigating the different spaces: Experiences of inclusion and isolation among racially minoritized faculty in Canada. *Canadian Journal of Higher Education*, 36 (1), 1-27.

Stasiulis, D. K., & Bakan, A. B. (2005). *Negotiating citizenship: Migrant women in Canada and the global system*. Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.

Stein, S., & Andreotti, V. (2016). Cash, competition, or charity: International students and the global imaginary. *Higher Education*, 72, 225-239.

Stein, S., & Andreotti, V. (2017). Higher education and the modern/colonial global imaginary. *Cultural Studies Critical Methodologies*, 17 (3), 173-181.

Stockfelt, S. (2018). We the minority-of-minorities: a narrative inquiry of black female academics in the United Kingdom. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 39 (7), 1012-1029.

Strange, C. C., & Hardy Cox, D. (2016). Serving diverse students: A conclusion. In C. C. Strange, & D. Hardy Cox (Eds.), *Serving diverse students in Canadian higher education* (pp. 166-174). Montreal & Kingston, Canada: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Suto, M. (2009). Compromised careers: The occupational transition of immigration and resettlement. *Work*, 32 (4), 417-429.

Tamtik, M., & Guenter, M. (2019). Policy analysis of equity, diversity and inclusion strategies in

Canadian universities: How far have we come? *Canadian Journal of Higher Education*, 49 (3), 42-56.

Tannock, S. (2011). Points of prejudice: Education-based discrimination in Canada's immigration system. *Antipode*, 43, 1330-1356.

Tastsoglou, E., & Miedema, B. (2005). Working much harder and always having to prove yourself: Immigrant women's labour force experiences in the Canadian Maritimes. *Advances in Gender Research,* 9, 201–233.

Taylor, L. (2012). A conversation with a Chinese yardie about life as a Jamaican Canadian. In C. E. James & A. Davis, *Jamaica in the Canadian experience: A multiculturalizing presence* (pp. 191-207). Black Point, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

Teelucksingh, C., & Galabuzi, G. E. (2005). Working precariously: The impact of race and immigrants status on employment opportunities and outcomes in Canada. *Canadian Race relations Foundation*, 1-38.

Thompson, P. (1978). *The voice of the past: Oral history*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Thornberg, R., & Charmaz, K. (2014). Grounded theory and theoretical coding. In U. Flick (Ed.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative data analysis* (pp. 153-169). London: Sage.

Tierney, W. G. (2011). The role of tertiary education in fixing failed states: Globalization and public goods. *Journal of Peace Education*, 8 (2), 127-142.

Trilokekar, R. D. (2010). International education as soft power? The contributions and challenges of Canadian foreign policy to the internationalization of higher education. *Higher Education*, 59 (2), 131-147.

Trilokekar, R., & El Masri, A. (2016). Canada's international education strategy: Implications of a new policy landscape for synergy between government policy and institutional strategy.

*Higher Education Policy*, 29, 539-563.

Turner, T. (2015). Voices of Ontario Black educators: An Experiential report. *Ontario Alliance of Black School Educators* [ONABSE]. Turner Consulting Group. Retrieved from http://onabse.org/ONABSE_VOICES_OF_BLACK_EDUCATORS_Final_Repot.pdf

Universities Canada. (2017). Universities Canada: Inclusive excellence principles. Retrieved from https://www.univcan.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/equity-diversity-inclusion-principles-universities-canada-oct-2017.pdf

Universities Canada. (2019). Equity, diversity and inclusion at Canadian universities: Report on the 2019 national survey. Retrieved from https://www.univcan.ca/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/Equity-diversity-and-inclusion-at-Canadian-universities-report-on-the-2019-national-survey-Nov-2019-1.pdf

Vaismoradi, M., Turunen, H., & Bondas, T. (2013). Content analysis and thematic analysis: Implications for conducting a qualitative descriptive study. *Nursing and Health Sciences*, 15 (3), 398-405.

Walby, K., & Luscombe, A. (2018). Ethics review and freedom of information requests in qualitative research. *Research Ethics*, 14 (4), 1-15.

Walker, B. (2012). Jamaicans and the making of modern Canada. In C. E. James & A. Davis, *Jamaica in the Canadian experience: A multiculturalizing presence* (pp. 23-34). Black Point, NS: Fernwood Publishing.

Ward, K., & Wolf-Wendel. (2004). Academic motherhood: Managing complex roles in research universities. *The Review of Higher Education*, 27 (2), 233-257.

Warren, J.R. (2019). How much do you have to publish to get a job in a top sociology department? Or to get tenure? Trends over a generation. *Sociological Science*, 6, 172–

196.

Warrican, S. J. (2015). Building a quality institution of higher learning in a small state: Issues, considerations and challenges. In A. K. Perkins (Ed.), *Quality in higher education in the Caribbean* (pp. 209-223). Jamaica: The University of the West Indies Press.

Waterfield, B., Beagan, B. L., & Mohamed, T. (2019). You always remain slightly an outsider: Workplace experiences of academics from working-class or impoverished backgrounds. *Canadian Review of Sociology*, 56 (3), 368-388.

Watson, C. (2009). The impossible vanity: uses and abuses of empathy in qualitative inquiry. *Qualitative Research*, 9 (1), 105-117.

Watson, C. (2012). Analysing narratives: The narrative construction of identity. In S. Delamont, *Handbook of qualitative research in education (*pp. 460-473). Cheltenham, U.K.: Edward Elgar Publishing.

Wayne, J. (2009). The sounds of doors slamming: Does immigration policy fight racism in the workplace? *Canadian Woman Studies*, 27(2/3), p. 27-31.

Weiner, N. (2008). Breaking down barriers to labour market integration of newcomers in Toronto. *IRPP Choices*, 14 (10), 1-42.

Wiers-Jenssen, J. (2019). Paradoxical attraction? Why an increasing number of international students choose Norway. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 23 (2), 281-298.

Willig, C. (2014). Interpretation and analysis. In U. Flick (Ed.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative data analysis* (pp.136 – 149). London: Sage.

Wilton, S., & Ross, L. (2017). Flexibility, sacrifice and insecurity: A Canadian study assessing the challenges of balancing work and family in academia. *Journal of Feminist Family Therapy*, 29 (1/2), 66-87.

Wimpenny, P., & Gass, J. (2000). Interviewing in phenomenology and grounded theory: is there a difference? *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 31 (6), 1485 – 1492.

Wing, A. K. (1997). Brief reflections toward a multiplicative theory and praxis of being. In A. K. Wing (Ed.), *Critical race feminism: A reader* (pp. 27-34). NY: New York University Press.

Winkle-Wagner, R. (2015). Having their lives narrowed down? The state of Black Women's college success. *Review of Educational Research,* 85 (2), 171-204.

Xue, L. (2008). Initial labour market outcomes: A comprehensive look at the employment experience of recent immigrants during the first four years in Canada. *Citizenship and Immigration Canada*. Retrieved from http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/pdf/research-stats/LSIC-employment-outcome.pdf

Young, S. J., Piché, P. G., & Jones, G. A. (2020). Student pathways and differentiation policies in Ontario: Are they compatible? *Policy Reviews in Higher Education*, 4 (1), 25-44.

Zhang, Z., & Beck, K. (2014). I came, but I'm lost: Learning stories of three Chinese international students in Canada. *Canadian and International Education,* 43 (2), 1-14.

Zhou, G., & Zhang, Z. (2014). A study of the first year international students at a Canadian university: Challenges and experiences with social integration. *Canadian and International Education*, 43 (2), 1-17.

Zietsma, Danielle. (2010). Immigrants Working in Regulated Occupations. *Perspectives on Labour and Income,* 11 (2), 13-28.

## Appendix A: Interview Questions

**1. What is your country of origin?**

**2. What is your age range.**

a. 25 – 29 b. 30 – 34 c. 35 – 39

d. 40 – 44 e. 45 – 49 f. 50 and up

**3. Did you complete post-secondary education in your country of origin?**

a. Yes

b. No (*Where did you complete PSE?*)

**4**. **What was the highest degree you received in your country of origin (*AND/OR elsewhere before Canada*)?**

a. PhD b. Master

c. Bachelor d. Other:

**5**. **What is the name of the educational institution in your country of origin (*OR elsewhere before Canada*) where you received the highest degree?**

**6**. **What was your field of study in your country of origin (*OR elsewhere before Canada*)?**

**7**. **Tell me about your work experiences in your country of origin (*AND/OR elsewhere*) before migrating to Canada?**

**8**. **Which of the following entry into Canada best describes you?**

a. Family Sponsorship

b. Refugee

c. Caregiver

d. Express Entry (Federal Skilled Worker Program/Federal Skilled Trades Program/Canadian Experience Class)

**9. Describe your immigration process to Canada.**

**10**. **Did you pursue post-secondary (PS) education in Canada?**

a. Yes (Why did you pursue PS education in Canada?)

b. No (Why not?)

**11**. **What was your highest degree completed in Canada?**

**12**. **Describe your post-migration educational experiences in Canada.**

**13**. **Are you working in your field of study?**

a. Yes (Describe the process of attaining your job.)

b. No (Why not?)

**14**. **Do you have a desire/hope to teach at a PS institution in Canada?**

a. Yes (What influences you to have that desire to teach at a PS institution in Canada?)

b. No (What has influenced you not to have a desire to teach at a PS institution in Canada?)

**15**. **Are you currently teaching at a Canadian PS institution?**

a. **Yes** (Is the institution in the Greater Toronto Area (GTA)? Or outside the GTA – where?)

i. How long (in years, e.g. 0-4, 5-10, 11-15) did it take to achieve your teaching job at a Canadian PS institution?

ii. Please state the faculty that you are working with, and describe your work environment.

b. **No** (Why not? Where are you currently working? Do you plan to teach at a PS institution?)

i. How long (in years, e.g. 0-4, 5-10, 11-15) do you think it will take to achieve your teaching job at a PS institution?

**16**. **What are your perceptions of meritocracy in Canadian higher education institutions?**

**17. What are your perceptions of racism in Canada?**

**18. What are your perceptions of racism in Canadian higher education institutions?**

**19. Is there anything else that you would like to share?**

## Appendix B: Informed Consent Letter

**Date**:

**Study Name**: Wi a Cum a Long Way, and Wi Still Hav Far Fi Guh: The Journey of Black Jamaican Women With Pre- and Post-migration Post-secondary Education in Canadian Academia.

**Researcher name**: Shelleanne Hardial (Principal Investigator), Education Graduate Program in Culture, Language and Teaching, Doctoral Candidate, York University.

Contact: shelleanne_hardial@edu.yorku.ca, Faculty of Education, York University, 113 Winters College, 4700 Keele Street, Toronto, Ontario, M3J 1P3.

**Purpose of the Research:** This research emerges out of my interest in understanding how and why migrant's pre-educational experience and credentials are not valued in many Canadian professions and job sectors. Engaging the educational experiences of English speaking Caribbean females, specifically Black Jamaican women, in Ontario, I seek to examine how women negotiate this inequity when pursing post-migration experiences in institutes of higher education in Canada. As such, the objective of my research is to collect stories via interviews with 6 - 8 Jamaican women with pre- and post-migration post-secondary education in Canada who desire to teach in Canadian universities. The goal of this research is to highlight whether or not these Jamaican women are working in their desired fields of study - education after completing the process (whatever that may look like) in order to access and teach at Canadian universities.

The research will be conducted by me – Shelleanne Hardial, via interview with immigrant women of colour who have completed and obtained post-migration degree at a Canadian university despite their pre-migration education, and are working or not working in a faculty teaching job. Interviewing participants who are teaching and not teaching in academia are of critical importance for my research in order to draw attention to the complexities surrounding one's desire to work in his/her field of study. The data from the interview will be coded according to themes and analyzed. Throughout the process of making sense of the data, the respective information will be shared with the respective participant to ensure accurate interpretation of the interview, and then presented in written papers and my dissertation.

**What You Will Be Asked to Do in the Research**: The role of the participant is to meet with the principal investigator for an interview for an estimated time of 45 minutes in a public space such as an agreed study space at the York University library or in one of the meeting rooms at the Covenant of Promise Ministries Inc.

**Risks and Discomforts**: It is important to note that one or more questions during the interview may cause emotional discomfort as a result of reflecting on one's pre- and post- migration post-secondary education journey, and accessibility to teaching jobs at Canadian universities. The participant is not obligated to answer any question that may result in such potential discomfort.

**Benefits of the Research and Benefits to You**: The potential benefits of this research to the scholarly community is that this study will not only shed light on the experiences of English speaking Caribbean women with post migration education in Canada but it will also provide substantial and current qualitative data on Caribbean women that is limited in the York University Education Graduate Program in Culture, Language and Teaching. In addition to other educational scholarships, this study aims to influence immigration and academic policy changes by demonstrating the importance of considering Caribbean women narratives in relation to their upward mobility in Canada. In addition, the completion of this research will assist me in completing my PhD program and obtaining my doctoral degree in Education.

The main benefit to the participant who will participate in this study is that he/she will have the opportunity to share his/her story, a type of empowerment that provides one to give their perspective and reality among the predominant stories of Canada pertaining to race, post-secondary education and immigration. Additional benefits for the research participant include understanding one's journey through pre- and post migration experiences, and education about research methods.

**Voluntary Participation and Withdrawal**: Your participation in the study is completely voluntary and you may choose to stop participating at any time. Your decision not to volunteer, to stop participating, or to refuse to answer particular questions will not influence the nature of the ongoing relationship you may have with the researchers or study staff, or the nature of your relationship with York University either now, or in the future.

In the event you withdraw from the study, all associated data collected will be immediately destroyed wherever possible. Should you wish to withdraw after the study, you will have the option to also withdraw your data up until the analysis is complete.

**Confidentiality**: The methods of documentation for the interview by the interviewer (Shelleanne Hardial) are handwritten notes, tape recording, and transcribing information from the audio recording. Handwritten notes, audio recording and hard copy transcribed information will be securely stored in a locked filing cabinet. The data will be safely stored for two years from the date of the respective interview, i.e. March 2018 – March 2020. After two years of storage, the hard copy data – handwritten and transcribed notes will be destroyed by a cross cut shredder and the electronic data - audio recording will be deleted. Unless you choose otherwise, all information you supply during the research will be held in confidence and unless you specifically indicate your consent, your name will not appear in any report or publication of the research. Your data will be safely stored in a locked facility and only the researcher will have access to this information.

Confidentiality will be provided to the fullest extent possible by law.

**Questions About the Research?** If you have questions about the research in general or about your role in the study, please feel free to contact me at shelleanne_hardial@edu.yorku.ca or my supervisor, Dr. Aparna Mishra Tarc at amishratarc@edu.yorku.ca and/or 416 736 2100 ext. 20048. You may also contact the Graduate Program in Education: Culture, Language and Teaching at gradprogram@edu.yorku.ca and/or 416-736 5018.

This research has received ethics review and approval by the Delegated Ethics Review Committee, which is delegated authority to review research ethics protocols by the Human Participants Review Sub-Committee, York University's Ethics Review Board, and conforms to the standards of the Canadian Tri-Council Research Ethics guidelines. If you have any questions about this process, or about your rights as a participant in the study, please contact the Sr. Manager & Policy Advisor for the Office of Research Ethics, 5th Floor, Kaneff Tower, York University (telephone 416-736-5914 or e-mail ore@yorku.ca).

**Legal Rights and Signatures**:

I _____, consent to participate in "We've Done Our Part, Can We Work There Now?": The Journey Of Caribbean Women In Canadian Universities With Post-Migration Education conducted by Shelleanne Hardial. I have understood the nature of this project and wish to participate. I am not waiving any of my legal rights by signing this form. My signature below indicates my consent.

**Signature** _____ **Date** _____
Participant

**Signature** _____ **Date** _____
Principal Investigator

**Additional consent (where applicable)**

1. **Audio recording**

☐ I consent to the audio-recording of my interview(s).

**Signature: _____** Date:_____

_____
Participant: (name)